An interdisciplinary intervention: the potential of the Orff-Schulwerk approach as a pedagogical tool for the effective teaching of Italian to upper primary students in Western Australia

Annamaria Paolino
Edith Cowan University

Follow this and additional works at: https://ro.ecu.edu.au/theses

Part of the Curriculum and Instruction Commons, and the Educational Methods Commons

Recommended Citation

This Thesis is posted at Research Online.
https://ro.ecu.edu.au/theses/557
Edith Cowan University

Copyright Warning

You may print or download ONE copy of this document for the purpose of your own research or study.

The University does not authorize you to copy, communicate or otherwise make available electronically to any other person any copyright material contained on this site.

You are reminded of the following:

- Copyright owners are entitled to take legal action against persons who infringe their copyright.

- A reproduction of material that is protected by copyright may be a copyright infringement. Where the reproduction of such material is done without attribution of authorship, with false attribution of authorship or the authorship is treated in a derogatory manner, this may be a breach of the author’s moral rights contained in Part IX of the Copyright Act 1968 (Cth).

- Courts have the power to impose a wide range of civil and criminal sanctions for infringement of copyright, infringement of moral rights and other offences under the Copyright Act 1968 (Cth). Higher penalties may apply, and higher damages may be awarded, for offences and infringements involving the conversion of material into digital or electronic form.
USE OF THESIS

The Use of Thesis statement is not included in this version of the thesis.
An interdisciplinary intervention: The potential of the Orff-Schulwerk approach as a pedagogical tool for the effective teaching of Italian to upper primary students in Western Australia

By

Annamaria Paolino
BA (Ed)
BEd

This thesis is presented in fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of
Doctor of Philosophy
Faculty of Education and Arts
Edith Cowan University

2012
DEDICATION

This thesis is dedicated to the memory of two much loved and dearly missed family members who had and will forever have a tremendous impact and influence on my life and work.

In loving memory of my brother, Luigi Paolino
4/07/1977 – 22/01/2010

Words cannot express what you mean to me or how much I miss you. You are and forever will be my rock and inspiration. It is for you that I completed this study. The courage and strength with which you fought your illness has given me the will to go on. Your brave example kept me working and encouraged me to fulfil my promise when all I wanted to do was give up. You lived your life to the fullest. You lived well, loved much and laughed each day. In fact, I can’t remember a day that I didn’t see a smile on your face. Luigi, the world is a poorer place without you but you leave an everlasting legacy from which I draw inspiration and purpose. Everything that is you - Your drumming and musical talents are dearly missed. You touched and influenced the lives of many as you brightened the day of everyone you met. You befriended and embraced everyone. You loved everyone and everyone loved you. Thank you for always supporting me and having faith in me. I am blessed, honoured and privileged to have been gifted you as my brother. You represent all that a man and a brother should be. Even though we no longer walk side by side physically, I know that you and I will “Never Walk Alone”.

Alla cara memoria della mia Nonna, Spina Cinquina
24/09/1919 – 21/01/2010

Grazie Nonna per tutto che hai fatto per me. Per tutto che mi hai insegnata, per la tua patienza, per tutta la gioia, per tutto l’amore che mi hai data e per tutte le memorie. Sei veramente una donna molto speciale, coraggiosa e forta. Sei la migliore Nonna dappertutto il mondo. Mi manchi ma sei sempre con me e nel mio cuore. Ti amo e non mi dimentica mai la tua sfida di essere immigrante in Australia.
ABSTRACT

Since the second half of the twentieth century, Italian has been the second language spoken in Western Australia. In the primary school sector, there are over two hundred Italian teachers engaged with primary students. Many Italian teachers also use music/song as a pedagogical tool. The first part of the research examines the extent that music/song is used in primary Italian classes, as well as how and why they are used. The second part of the research centres on the use of the Orff-Schulwerk approach as an integrated music approach to teaching Italian. The research examines the success of a trialled intervention with a group of upper primary Italian language teachers, as well as exploring the support that is required to support Italian as a second language specific to upper primary contexts.

The research findings conclude that the novelty of the Orff-Schulwerk approach is considered effective in the teaching and learning of Italian. However, the research also highlights a number of constraints, which need to be addressed if teachers are to provide students with a rich and engaging curriculum.
DECLARATION

I certify that this thesis does not, to the best of my knowledge and belief:

(i) incorporate without acknowledgement any material previously submitted for a degree or diploma in any institution of higher education;

(ii) contain any material previously published or written by another person except where due reference is made in the text; or

(iii) contain any defamatory material.

I also grant permission for the Library at Edith Cowan University to make duplicate copies of my thesis as required.

Signed:

Date:
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

Travelling the road to completing a thesis is a long and difficult one. Along the way one encounters many bumps, blocks and possible breakdowns. I know that I encountered these along my journey, particularly in 2009 and 2010. I would like to take this opportunity to thank those who helped me to complete and achieve this significant milestone.

I would sincerely like to thank my principal supervisor Dr Geoffrey W. Lummis for sharing his knowledge and wisdom with me. Throughout this journey you have always been there to offer advice, support, encouragement, guidance and most of all, your time. I have learned so much from you. “Thanks Boss.”

Thanks to my associate supervisor Dr Geoffrey M. Lowe. Your knowledgeable input and guidance is very much appreciated.

Thanks also to Associate Professor Jan Gray for encouraging me to follow the research road from the very start of my postgraduate journey.

I wish to thank my Nonno, Luigi Cinquina for paving the path upon which I am now able to walk upon.

Most importantly I would like to thank my Mum, Elia Paolino for her continual support, encouragement, inspiration and love. Even when times were difficult, you were always there for me. Thanks Mum for making me who I am, for believing in me and for helping me to achieve this and all else that I have.

Finally, thanks to Riley and Genghis for their unconditional love.
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>DEDICATION</td>
<td>I</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ABSTRACT</td>
<td>II</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DECLARATION</td>
<td>III</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS</td>
<td>IV</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TABLE OF CONTENTS</td>
<td>V</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LIST OF FIGURES</td>
<td>XII</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LIST OF TABLES</td>
<td>XIII</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PREFACE</td>
<td>XIV</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Purpose of the Research</td>
<td>xiv</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Research Development</td>
<td>xiv</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Writing Style</td>
<td>xiv</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Features</td>
<td>xv</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GLOSSARY</td>
<td>XVII</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CHAPTER I INTRODUCTION</td>
<td>I</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>An Introduction to the Research</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Personal background and pedagogy</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Context of the Research</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Curriculum change in Australia</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Curriculum change in Western Australia</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>National values in education</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Recent Political Pressures that are Marginalising Languages and Music</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Languages and music not included</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Languages and arts education in Australia is eroding away</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Towards a pragmatic interdisciplinary approach</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Research: To Inform Primary Italian Language Teachers</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Support for music and song as a tool for second language enhancement</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Songs and language</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Research Design</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Action research</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Research Cycles and Questions</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Action Cycle One</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Scope and Organisation of the Research</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mixed methods</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Data collection tools</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Finding participants</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Coding</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Piloting of data collection tools</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Orff-Schulwerk intervention</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Outline of the Thesis</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter II: Literature Review</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter III: Theoretical Framework</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter IV: Research Processes and Methodology</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter V: Interpretation of Data</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter VI: Discussion, Implications and Recommendations</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter VII: Conclusion</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Summary</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The Brain, Language and Singing .......................................................... 82
The human brain and song ................................................................. 83
The Contemporary Language Classroom ............................................. 85
Second Language Acquisition Theory .................................................... 86
Total physical response ....................................................................... 88
Multiple intelligences .......................................................................... 89
Contemporary Music Approach (CMA) ................................................. 90
The Din Phenomenon .......................................................................... 90
Intercultural learning .......................................................................... 90
The Use of Music and Song in Contemporary Second Language Practice ........ 92
Music and teacher confidence ............................................................. 94
Societal pressures, educational reform and loss of subject status .......... 97
Benefits of Music/Song in the Contemporary Second Language Classroom .................................................. 98
Pedagogical Applications for Music/Songs ........................................... 99
Objective Knowledge, Disciplines and the Interdisciplinary Curriculum .... 102
Objective knowledge ......................................................................... 102
What is a discipline? .......................................................................... 102
Benefits of an interdisciplinary curriculum ....................................... 103
CHAPTER II: SECTION THREE .................................................................. 106
The Orff-Schulwerk Approach to Teaching Italian through Music .......... 106
What is Orff-Schulwerk? ................................................................... 106
The importance of speech in Orff-Schulwerk and in language learning .... 109
The importance of singing in Orff-Schulwerk and in language learning ... 110
The importance of moving in Orff-Schulwerk and in language learning ... 110
The importance of literacy in Orff-Schulwerk and in language learning ... 111
The importance of playing instruments in Orff-Schulwerk and in language learning ........................................ 111
The importance of authentic music in Orff-Schulwerk and in language learning ........................................ 112
Orff-Schulwerk in the Contemporary Second Language Room ............ 112
Orff-Schulwerk and Intercultural Learning .......................................... 116
Summary ......................................................................................... 118
Conclusion ........................................................................................ 120
CHAPTER III THE CONCEPTUAL AND THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK .......... 122
Introduction ..................................................................................... 122
The Naturalistic Research Paradigm ..................................................... 124
Axioms of Naturalistic Inquiry ............................................................ 124
Knowledge as a phenomenon ............................................................ 125
Knowledge as a construction ............................................................. 126
Knowledge as a life-world ................................................................. 126
Mixed Methods ................................................................................. 128
Qualitative Research ......................................................................... 129
Elements of qualitative research ......................................................... 131
Strengths of qualitative research ......................................................... 131
Limitations of qualitative research ...................................................... 132
The Issue of Trustworthiness ............................................................... 133
Credibility (Internal Validity) ................................................................. 133
Transferability (External Validity) ......................................................... 133
Dependability (Reliability) ................................................................. 133
Confirmability (Objectivity) ............................................................... 134
Action Research ............................................................................... 136
Limitations of action research ............................................................ 139
The Role of Action Research in the Current Educational Climate ........ 139
Applying the Action Research Methodology for the Purpose of this Research .................................................. 140
Action Cycle One: Knowing in Action ................................................. 140
Action Cycle Two: Reflecting in Action .............................................. 141
Answering Action Cycle Two research question ................................................................. 190
Action Cycle Two summary .............................................................................................. 190
Action Cycle Three ............................................................................................................ 191
Introduction .......................................................................................................................... 191
Pre-intervention student attitude questionnaire ................................................................. 192
Pre-Intervention Student Attitude Questionnaire Results .................................................. 192
Construct One: Student demographics .............................................................................. 192
Construct Two: Students attitudes towards Italian – pre-intervention .............................. 192
Construct Three: Students attitudes towards music/song use in Italian class – pre-intervention.. 192
Post-intervention student attitude questionnaire ............................................................... 193
Post-Intervention Student Attitude Questionnaire Results .................................................. 193
Construct Two: Students attitudes towards Italian ............................................................. 193
Construct Three: Students attitudes towards music/song use in Italian class ...................... 193
Summary of student attitude questionnaire data ............................................................... 193
Pre-intervention student interview data .......................................................................... 194
Summary of the student pre-intervention interview data ................................................... 196
Post-intervention student interview data ........................................................................ 196
Other student themes ....................................................................................................... 198
Summary of the student post-intervention interview data .................................................. 199
Analysis of teacher post-intervention exit interview and focus group responses .............. 201
Emergent Theme and Construct Analysis ......................................................................... 201
Theme One: Teachers on teaching practice ...................................................................... 201
Theme Two: Teachers on student learning ........................................................................ 201
Theme Three: Support structures needed .......................................................................... 201
Theme One: Teachers on teaching practice ...................................................................... 202
Theme Two: Teachers on student learning ...................................................................... 205
Theme Three: Support structures required ........................................................................ 210
Answering Action Cycle Three research questions .......................................................... 215
Action Cycle Three summary ............................................................................................ 216
Conclusion ............................................................................................................................ 217

CHAPTER VI DISCUSSION, IMPLICATIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS ....................... 219
Introduction ........................................................................................................................ 219
SECTION ONE: DISCUSSION OF THE FINDINGS ............................................................ 220
Researcher's Personal Self-reflection .................................................................................. 220
Action Cycle One ................................................................................................................. 220
Action Cycle Two ............................................................................................................... 220
Action Cycle Three ............................................................................................................ 220
Understanding the life-worlds of teachers ....................................................................... 220
Action Cycle One: Knowing in action .............................................................................. 221
Action Cycle Two: Reflecting in action ........................................................................... 222
Action Cycle Three: Reflection on action ....................................................................... 225
Implications of the Data on the Current Australian Situation ........................................ 229
National and State agendas .............................................................................................. 230
Primary school setting ..................................................................................................... 233
Old prejudices .................................................................................................................... 234
The Curriculum Mirrors Society Values .......................................................................... 236
Languages in Australia ..................................................................................................... 237
The European Situation ..................................................................................................... 237
The Interconnectedness of Language and Music ............................................................. 240
SECTION TWO: IMPLICATIONS OF THE FINDINGS AND THE AUSTRALIAN
curriculum ............................................................................................................................ 242
Educational policy and stakeholders ................................................................................ 243
The Australian Curriculum ............................................................................................... 247
SECTION THREE: FUTURE RECOMMENDATIONS ................................. 257

Summary ......................................................................................... 264
Conclusion........................................................................................ 265

CHAPTER VII CONCLUSIONS ............................................................. 267

Introduction ...................................................................................... 267
The Research and New Knowledge ...................................................... 268
The Limitations of this Research ............................................................ 269
Areas for Future Research .................................................................. 273
Conclusion ......................................................................................... 275

REFERENCES .................................................................................. 279

APPENDICES .................................................................................. 308

Appendix A: The Structure and Function of the Human Brain ................. 308
Appendix B: Tonic-Clonic Seizures ......................................................... 310
Appendix C: Comparisons of Primary Teaching Courses Offered at Universities in Western Australia ................................................. 311
Appendix D: Language Practice Task Using Orff-Schulwerk ....................... 312
Appendix E: Timeline of Research .......................................................... 313
Appendix F: Action Cycle One and Two Letter to Research and Planning Unit .............................. 314
Appendix G: Action Cycle One and Two Letter to Principals ....................... 315
Appendix H: Action Cycle One and Two Principal Consent Form ................. 316
Appendix I: Action Cycle One and Two Letter to Teacher Participants .......... 317
Appendix J: Action Cycle One and Two Consent Form For Teacher Participants .... 318
Appendix K: Action Cycle One Teacher Questionnaire ............................. 319
Appendix L: Action Cycle Two Teacher Interview Questions ....................... 324
Appendix M: Action Cycle Three Research and Planning Unit Letter .......... 325
Appendix N: Action Cycle Three Principal Letter of Consent ....................... 327
Appendix O: Action Cycle Three Principal Consent Form .......................... 329
Appendix P: Action Cycle Three Letter to Teacher Participants ................... 330
Appendix Q: Action Cycle Three Consent form for Teacher Participants ..... 332
Appendix R: Action Cycle Three Letter To Parents/Guardians and Students .... 333
Appendix S: Action Cycle Three Consent Form for Parents/Caregivers and Students ............................... 334
Appendix T: Action Cycle Three Student Attitude Questionnaire ................. 335
Appendix U: Action Cycle Three Student Telephone Interview Record Sheet .......... 339
Appendix V: Action Cycle Three Student Attitude Questionnaire ................. 340
Appendix W: Action Cycle Three Student Telephone Interview Record Sheet .......... 342
Appendix X: Action Cycle Three Teacher Weekly Intervention Evaluation Form .... 343
Appendix Y: Action Cycle Three Teacher Exit Interviews: Post-Intervention .......... 344
Appendix Z: Action Cycle Three Letter to Teacher Participants Providing Information Regarding Orff-Schulwerk Professional Learning ................................. 346

Appendix AA: Action Cycle Three The Orff-Schulwerk Approach Professional Learning .............................................................................. 347
Appendix BB: Action Cycle Three Orff Schulwerk for Italian Teachers Professional Learning Evaluation ........................................................................ 348
Appendix CC: Action Cycle Three: Letter to Principal - Focus Group .............. 350
Appendix DD: Action Cycle Three Focus Group Consent Form for Principals .......... 351
Appendix EE: Action Cycle Three Focus Group Questions ............................ 352
Appendix FF: Action Cycle Three Focus Group Meeting Reflection Sheet ......... 353
Appendix GG: Action Cycle One Teacher Questionnaire Construct One Questionnaire Frequency Table ........................................................................ 354
Appendix HH: Action Cycle One Teacher Questionnaire Construct Two Questionnaire Frequency Table ........................................................................ 355
| Appendix II: | Action Cycle One Teacher Questionnaire Construct Three Questionnaire Frequency Table. ................................................................. 356 |
| Appendix JJ: | Action Cycle Two Teacher Interviews: Response Analysis. .................. 357 |
| Appendix KK: | Action Cycle Three Pre and Post Intervention Student Attitude Questionnaire Analysis: Item Comparison Table ........................................ 363 |
| Appendix LL: | Action Cycle Three Construct Comparison Table Students v Teachers Interview Responses ............................................................... 365 |
| Appendix MM: | Action Cycle Three: Teacher Vignettes ................................................................. 367 |
LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 2.1: Main Regions of the Human Brain ...................................................... 71

Figure 2.2: Schematic diagram of the functional relationship between linguistic and musical syntactic processing. (Adapted from Patel, 2008, cited in Fodorenko, Patel, Casasanto, Winawer & Gibson, 2009, p. 2) ........ 78

Figure 2.3: a) The linguistic and harmonic (red line) ERP associated with syntactic processing in language (black line) is also elicited by syntactic processing in music (red line) (Patel, Gibson, Ratner, Besson and Holcombe, 1998, cited in Patel, 2003b, p. 676). b) MEG scan data represented in blue) showing localisation of harmonic processing areas in the brain (Maess, Koelsch, Gunter, Friedici, 2001 cited in Patel, 2003b, p. 676). ........................................................................................................ 79

Figure 2.4: Interaction between teaching attitudes, teaching competencies, schooland society. ........................................................................................................ 96

Figure 3.1: Mixed Methods balance employed in this research ....................... 128

Figure 3.2: Karl Popper’s Three Worlds of Knowledge ................................. 130

Figure 3.3: McKernan’s action research model (1996, p.29) ......................... 140

Figure 5.1: Example of student song ............................................................... 179

Figure 5.2: Example of a student’s rap ............................................................ 182

Figure 5.3: Example of whole class poem written by students ..................... 188

Figure 5.4: Example of whole class poem written by students with actions..... 189

Figure 6.1: Model for reflection in action (Schon, 1983) ............................... 221
LIST OF TABLES

Table 2.1: Languages in Australia ................................................................. 30
Table 2.2: General capabilities and cross-curricula dimensions of the National Curriculum ......................................................... 43
Table 2.3: Phases and Learning Areas of the National Curriculum ........................................ 44
Table 2.4: Phase One ..................................................................................... 47
Table 2.5a: Phase Two .................................................................................. 47
Table 2.5b: Phase Two .................................................................................. 47
Table 2.5c: Phase Two .................................................................................. 47
Table 2.6: Structural and Functional Features of Music and Language ................. 62
Table 2.7: Brain regions and associated musical skills ........................................ 71
Table 2.8: Whole Brain Model ....................................................................... 74
Table 2.9: Songs and their Cognitive Benefits .................................................. 84
Table 3.1: Verification strategies and evidence of their employment to ensure ‘trustworthiness’ ......................................................................................... 135
Table 4.1: Teacher questionnaire constructs and their related questionnaire items ..... 154
Table 4.2: Pre-Intervention Student Attitude Questionnaire Items and Constructs ..... 163
Table 4.3: Post-Intervention Student Attitude Questionnaire Items and Constructs .... 166
PREFACE

The Purpose of the Research

This research was an outcome of the researcher’s teaching experience and self-reflection upon their pedagogy. It is a result of a personal belief held by the researcher that Music and Languages are essential in today’s curriculum. As the researcher sees the teaching of Music and Languages as a means of providing proactive interdisciplinary opportunities in a crowded curriculum, the research sought to answer whether other teachers of primary Italian would consider the Orff-Schulwerk approach as a potential pedagogical tool for the teaching of Italian to upper primary students in Western Australia (WA).

Research Development

The research was conducted in three action phases following the McKernan’s action research model (1996). It involved teachers of primary Italian and upper primary students in WA. The research data was collected via the use of questionnaires and interviews. The thesis is divided into seven chapters. These are as follows:

- Chapter I: Introduction
- Chapter II: Literature review
- Chapter III: Theoretical framework
- Chapter IV: Research processes and methodology
- Chapter V: Interpretation of the data
- Chapter VI: Discussion, Implications and Recommendations
- Chapter VII: Conclusion

Writing Style

The thesis is written predominately in the third person. However, when providing information on personal background and pedagogy in Chapter I and when presenting their self-reflections in Chapter V, the researcher has taken the liberty to write in the first person.

This thesis is referenced according to APA 6th referencing style as required by Edith Cowan University. However, for aesthetic reasons, selected key quotes have been indented and single spaced for added emphasis. A selection of educational goals from The Melbourne Declaration (MCEETYA, 2008) are presented on pages 244 – 246. These are italised and bolded for emphasis rather than indented as they are subheadings for the section.
Following this referencing style, when citing a translated book where the translator is named in addition to the author, it is referenced in-text as (Plato, 360 B.C./2004). Both the year of the original work and translation are presented. When citing newspaper articles in-text, the first two words in the title appear between inverted commas, together with the year of publication, for example, (“AD/BC rock”, 2011).

Features

Within this thesis the words ‘music and song’ are presented as music/song. They are used and presented interchangeably as one can have music without words but songs cannot exist without music, as songs without music are poems. Capital letters are used when discussing Music and Languages in an educational context. Lower case letters are used when discussing music and languages in general terms.

As this research advocates that novelty is an essential component to cognitive development and that music/song facilitates learning and understanding, song lyrics and YouTube links are used throughout the thesis. These are centred and single spaced with the active YouTube link below. It is anticipated that these tools will provide some structure and context for the reader.

When referencing the musicians, the researcher wishes to note that within the text, Bono Vox, lead singer of the band U2 is referenced as Vox and John Butler from the John Butler Trio is referenced as Wilshire-Butler. Another point of note is Marshall Mathers III, is better known as the artist Eminem. Within the text, this artist is referred to as Eminem, however, in the reference list, he is referenced as Mathers.

Throughout the thesis, the researcher uses the time honoured terms of B.C. and A.D. The Latin term A.D. (Anno Domini), which means in the year of the Lord is used to reinforce the historical role of Christianity in shaping Western Culture. B.C. (Before Christ) is used to reinforce that cultures and societies existed and flourish before the time of Christ. It is acknowledged that “religiously neutral terms” (“AD/BC rock”, 2011) BCE (Before Common Era), CE (Common Era) and BP (Before Present) exist however, the researcher has adhered to the directive given to the Senate by ACARA (2011) that “B.C. and A.D. will continue to be used” (“AD/BC rock”, 2011) in the National Curriculum.

The term ‘Celtic’ is a recent construction that has occurred with the rise of Irish and Scottish nationalism. Originally, the Celts were Basque invaders (James, 1999). In response to this the researcher has decided to use the term ‘Irish’.
Roman numerals and the term Romano-Britannia are used throughout this thesis. This has been done to reinforce and advocate the importance of Italians and the Italian language in Western history and Australian society.

Pages xii-xvii contains a glossary for this thesis. The first time the words in the glossary are presented in the body of the thesis they are presented as follows: active participation.

Examples of the researcher’s self-reflections will appear in Chapter V. These self-reflections provide links to those of the teacher participants and to the Australian Curriculum and Reporting Authority (ACARA) documents. These self-reflections are written in italics and are accompanied by samples of students work from the researcher’s own classroom. These are presented as follows; Red text presents Italian text written by the students. Green text provides the English translation of the text. Purple text highlights actions/gestures students placed with the text written. These examples were presented and discussed with the participating teachers at the professional learning session on 20th June 2009.

Within Chapter II, the researcher presents detailed information about the White Australia Policy. This has been done to provide background information for the reader so that they have a context of the prejudice, which existed in Australian society. This prejudice resurfaced during the period of this research as it was found that the attitudes of primary school principals and their prejudice towards Music and Languages provided blocks to the data gathering process.

Teacher and student vignettes are presented in Chapters V, VI and VII. These vignettes provide supporting detail to the evidence presented. They are written in italics and embedded within the text. Teacher vignettes are defined with a capital ‘TP’ and presented as follows (TP-Amelia, September, 2009). Student vignettes are defined with a capital ‘SP’ and presented as follows (SP-Glen, September, 2009).

Annamaria Paolino
## GLOSSARY

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Term</th>
<th>Definition</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Abandon</td>
<td>To give up. To abandon solid pedagogical practice as defined by Medina (1993a).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Active participation</td>
<td>Student is actively participating in activities to facilitate learning (Krashen, 1982).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Anglo-Australian</td>
<td>Australians with British or Irish ancestry.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Assimilation</td>
<td>Where the minority group adopts the customs and attitudes of the dominant culture in favour of their own.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Audiation</td>
<td>A cognitive process where music is mentally heard and understood even when it is no longer present (Gordon, 2001).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Australian Curriculum Assessment and Reporting Authority (ACARA)</td>
<td>ACARA is responsible for the Australian Curriculum which sets out the core knowledge, understandings, skills and general capabilities for all Australian students.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Australian Curriculum</td>
<td>Throughout the education documents the Australian Curriculum was referred to as the National Curriculum, Australia’s National Curriculum or/and The Australian Curriculum. For this research, Australian Curriculum is used.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Australian Institute for Teacher and School Leadership (AITSL)</td>
<td>Established in 2012, AITSL provides national leadership for the Commonwealth, states and territory governments in promoting excellence in the profession of teaching and school leadership.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Australian Primary Principal’s Association (APPA)</td>
<td>The APPA is the national voice for all primary principals in Australia. Established in 2007.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Babyese</td>
<td>The vocabulary and speech patterns used by babies/infants to communicate (Gandini, 2002).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bordun/Drone</td>
<td>A repeated harmony based on the first and fifth interval of the scale</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Child/Children</td>
<td>A child under the age of five. Not of school age.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cloze/Gap activities</td>
<td>Fill in the gap activities used to develop vocabulary</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Compose</td>
<td>To create an original piece of music.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Constructs</td>
<td>Devised on the basis of and relating to an observation. Used to systematically arrange ideas in order to construct an argument.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Contadini</strong></td>
<td>Italian peasant farmers.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Critical Realism</strong></td>
<td>The process of knowing that acknowledges that knowing is based upon reality. Accessing that known reality is dependent upon cyclical processes facilitated by dialogue with the knower of the reality (Bhaskar, 1998).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Cultural identity</strong></td>
<td>The culture to which one identifies (The Social Report, 2003).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Curriculum Council</strong></td>
<td>In March 2012 the Curriculum Council became the School Curriculum and Standards Authority.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Curriculum Framework (CFWA)</strong></td>
<td>Introduced in 1998, the CFWA was a major step in school curriculum reform in WA. It set learning outcomes expected for all students in WA from K-12.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Data/Findings</strong></td>
<td>Facts, observations, images, results, recordings, measurements, experiences on which an argument, theory, test, hypothesis or further research is based. It may be numerical, descriptive, visual or tactile. It may be raw, cleaned, processed and held in any format or media (Australian National Data Service, 2011).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Department of Education of Western Australia (DoE WA)</strong></td>
<td>The current Department of Education of Western Australia (DoE WA) is also referred to as The Department of Education and Training of Western Australia (DETWA). This was DoE WA official title prior to 2009.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Dialect</strong></td>
<td>Form of speech distinct to a group or class (Oxford dictionary, 6th Ed. 1979).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Effective [teaching]</strong></td>
<td>Provides maximum opportunities for all students to learn in a supportive environment where students are engaged, successful, receive feedback and have their needs catered for (Hook, 2006).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Electroencephalograph (EEG)</strong></td>
<td>Records the sum electrical activity of the cortex by placing electrodes on the scalp (Davidmann, 2006).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Engagement</strong></td>
<td>Students who are engaged show sustained involvement in learning activities. They show positive emotions during ongoing action, including enthusiasm, optimism, curiosity, and interest (Skinner &amp; Belmont, 1993).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Epistemology</strong></td>
<td>The philosophy of the nature of knowledge, how it is acquired and how we come to know (Lehrer, 2000).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>European Union (EU)</strong></td>
<td>The political union between European countries, regardless of currency.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------------------------</td>
<td>--------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Eurozone</strong></td>
<td>The fiscal union between the European countries, which have the Euro as their common currency.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Filarstrocche</strong></td>
<td>Italian word for nursery rhymes.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Form</strong></td>
<td>All the elements, which distinguishes music from a haphazard combination of sounds (Apel &amp; Daniel, 1960).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Formulaic Language</strong></td>
<td>Language segments taught via repetitive drills and used in highly structured, language practice activities.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Functional Magnetic Resonance Imaging (fMRI)</strong></td>
<td>Creates a 3D image using powerful magnets not radioactivity. Detects brain activity change via blood flow. Useful for learning about which brain regions are involved in a given behaviour. Non-evasive and can readily be used on humans. PET and SPECT are predecessors to fMRI (Davidmann, 2006).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Harmony</strong></td>
<td>The simultaneous occurrence of musical tones (Apel &amp; Daniel, 1960).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Immigrant</strong></td>
<td>One who relocates to another country on a permanent basis.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Improvise</strong></td>
<td>Spontaneous composition.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Informal voice</strong></td>
<td>Exploration of the phonetic possibilities of the voice and understanding that gestural expression helps to produce the sound (Sangiorgio, 2012).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Intercultural</strong></td>
<td>Relating to, involving and representing different cultures as well as one’s own (McLaughlin &amp; Liddicoat, 2005).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Intracultural</strong></td>
<td>Relating to, involving and representing differences within one’s own culture (McLaughlin &amp; Liddicoat, 2005).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Interdisciplinary</strong></td>
<td>The integration of concepts from different disciplines resulting in a synthesised or coordinated coherent whole (Harvey, 2005).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Interdiscipinarian</strong></td>
<td>One who uses a number of disciplines when teaching to achieve a synthesised or coordinated whole.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Italo – Australian</strong></td>
<td>Australian born to Italian parents and raised in the Italian way and according to the Italian culture.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Term</td>
<td>Definition</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------</td>
<td>------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>‘i+1’</td>
<td>Described by Krashen as comprehensible input. This is the result of the addition of new knowledge (+1) to the learner’s current knowledge (i). This allows learning to occur (Krashen, 1982; Vygotsky, 1978).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kanakas</td>
<td>Australian and New Zealander South Sea Islanders brought into Australia during the nineteenth/twentieth centuries and used as labourers.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Language</td>
<td>System of verbal representation and communication. Language is defined as a learned, symbolic, coded system used for communication. It is the foundation of all human relationships, which all students can learn (Clivio &amp; Danesi, 2000; O’Neil, 2006).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lateralisation</td>
<td>Cross hemisphere connections. Localization of a specific function within the brain (Sperry, 1975).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lexicon</td>
<td>Set of morphemes in a language (Clivio &amp; Danesi, 2000).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Linguistics</td>
<td>The study of languages (Clivio &amp; Danesi, 2000).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Magneto encephalograph (MEG)</td>
<td>Used to measure the electric field of activity directly in the skull (Davidmann, 2006).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Meaningful chunks of text</td>
<td>A meaningful unit or phrase of language.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Melbourne Declaration</td>
<td>Released in 2008 it is the national declaration which commits all educational stakeholders to the Educational Goals for Young Australians.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Melody</td>
<td>An organised sequence of tones.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Metacognitive/Metacognition</td>
<td>Ones knowledge about their cognitive processes and knowledge about how they know (Lovett, 2008).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Meta-history</td>
<td>The over-arching historical narrative or construction, which is intended to give order and meaning to societal and cultural records.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Meta-linguistics</td>
<td>The interrelationship between the cognitive information processes of language and cultural behaviour (Bialystok &amp; Ryan, 1985).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Metalophone</td>
<td>A percussion instrument played with mallets consisting of graduated metal bars over a resonance chamber.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Term</td>
<td>Definition</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Metaphysics/Metaphysical</td>
<td>A type of philosophy using broad concepts to define and understand inherent realities not easily discovered or experienced in our everyday life. It is concerned with explaining the features of reality beyond the physical world and our immediate senses by using logic based on the meaning of human terms, rather than on a logic tied to human sense perception of the objective world (Stanford Encyclopaedia of Philosophy, 2007).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mind maps</td>
<td>A method of effective note-taking which helps to organise information via the use of key words and images.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ministerial Council on Education, Employment, Training and Youth Affairs (MCEETYA)</td>
<td>MCEETYA was established in 1993. In 2009, it became the Ministerial Council Education, Early Childhood Development and Youth Affairs (MCEEDYA) with the amalgamation of MCEETYA and the Ministerial Council for Territory and Employment (MCTEE).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Morphemes</td>
<td>The smallest meaningful language unit (Clivio &amp; Danesi, 2000).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Motherese</td>
<td>The vocabulary and speech patterns used by mothers to communicate with their babies (Gandini, 2002).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Music</td>
<td>A form of inter-human communication in which humanly organised non-verbal sound is perceived as conveying primary emotional and/or corporeal patterns of cognition. It is an art form that involves organized sounds and silences expressed in terms of pitch, rhythm, and quality of sound. However, the definition often varies according to culture and social context (Tagg, 2002).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Multiculturalism/Multicultural</td>
<td>Where several different cultures coexist peacefully and equitably in a single country.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>National Assessment Program – Literacy and Numeracy (NAPLAN)</td>
<td>NAPLAN commenced in 2008. It assesses all students in Years 3, 5, 7 and 9 on the same days in reading, writing, language conventions (spelling, grammar and punctuation) and numeracy.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Native language</td>
<td>A language spoken since early childhood.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Native speaker</td>
<td>A speaker of a particular language who has spoken that language since earliest childhood.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Network meetings</td>
<td>A supportive, informal meeting where individuals with common interests come together to share and gain information and experiences.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Term</td>
<td>Description</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>----------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Neuron</td>
<td>Nerve cells that send and receive electrical signals within the body.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ontology</td>
<td>The philosophical study of the nature of being, the concepts and relationships, which exist within that reality (Gruber, 1993).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Organisation for Economic Cooperation and Development (OECD)</td>
<td>The OECD was established in 1961. Australia became a member in 1971.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ostinato</td>
<td>A continuously repeated musical phrase or rhythm.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pentatonic scale</td>
<td>A musical scale consisting of five notes per octave rather than eight. The fourth and seventh notes are omitted.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Percussion instruments</td>
<td>Instruments, which produce sound when struck, shaken, rubbed or scraped.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Phoneme</td>
<td>The smallest unit of sound that distinguishes meaning (Clivio &amp; Danesi, 2000).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Phonology</td>
<td>Sound system of a language (Clivio &amp; Danesi, 2000).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Programme for International Student Assessment (PISA)</td>
<td>The PISA tests were first performed in 2000. It is a world-wide test of scholastic performance of 15 year old students in Mathematics, Science and Reading. Tests are conducted every three years.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Prosody/Prosodic</td>
<td>The natural aspects of speech including tone duration, meter inflexion, intonation, accentuation, beat, rhythm and periodicity (Besson &amp; Schon, 2001; Patel, 2008; Pearl, 2006; Tagg, 2002; Thompson, Miran &amp; Stewart, 2012).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pitch</td>
<td>Refers to the high-low quality of a musical sound (Apel &amp; Daniel, 1960).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Positivism</td>
<td>The philosophy that rejects metaphysics. Positivists see the purpose of science is to maintain rigour according to empirical data, which is measureable and observable. Knowledge beyond that is impossible (Trochem, 2006).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Positron Emission Tomography (PET)</td>
<td>Creates a 3D image using powerful magnets not radioactivity. Detects brain activity change via blood flow. Useful for learning about which brain regions are involved in a given behaviour. Non-evasive and can readily be used on humans. PET and SPECT are predecessors to fMRI (Davidmann, 2006).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Post-Positivism</strong></td>
<td>Philosophy based on critical realism that a reality exists which is independent of what we know. It recognises that multiple observations are needed and that all observations are fallible whilst theories are also reversible (Trochem, 2006).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Proclivities</strong></td>
<td>An innate, natural inclination.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Research</strong></td>
<td>Scholarly or scientific investigation or study (Farlex, 2012).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Rostromedial prefrontal cortex</strong></td>
<td>Anterior part of the frontal lobe responsible for the processing of auditory information (Zatorre, 2003).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Rhythm</strong></td>
<td>Everything pertaining to the duration quality of musical sounds (Apel &amp; Daniel, 1960).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Semantics</strong></td>
<td>Study of meaning in language (Clivio &amp; Danesi, 2000).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Student</strong></td>
<td>A child above the age of five. A child of school age.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Study</strong></td>
<td>The pursuit of knowledge, as by reading, observation or research (Farlex, 2012).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Synapses</strong></td>
<td>The junction at which a neuron communicates with the target cell.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Syntax</strong></td>
<td>The study of how sentences are organised (Clivio &amp; Danesi, 2000).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Theme</strong></td>
<td>A unifying or dominant idea.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Topic</strong></td>
<td>A subdivision of a theme.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Tuned instrument</strong></td>
<td>Instruments tuned to a pitch according to a tuning system.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Un-tuned instrument</strong></td>
<td>Instruments not tuned to a pitch according to a tuning system.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Xylophone</strong></td>
<td>A percussion instrument, played with mallets, consisting of graduated wooden bars over a resonance chamber.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
CHAPTER I
INTRODUCTION

Whenever someone spoke to me, I may not have grasped the words, but I grasp the rise and fall of the notes. (Leos Janacek, Czech composer, 1854 – 1928, cited in Pearl, 2001, Slide 8)

An Introduction to the Research

In Western Australia (WA), some language teachers use music/songs in the classroom to support second language acquisition. It is the intention of the researcher to inform the practice of Italian language teachers in WA’s upper primary schools by demonstrating how music/song can be a valuable teaching tool using the Orff-Schulwerk approach as an interdisciplinary intervention.

Importantly, this research occurs in a national and state curricula context continually confronted by change due to competing interests and accountability of both human and physical resources. Unfortunately, when people in power make decisions of priority their choices often present a political subjectivity rather than a well-informed educational rationale. Interdisciplinary approaches have always been encouraged, but within the context of WA’s crowded curriculum and with limited specialist support in the primary school sector, the value of interdisciplinary links becomes even more pertinent.

Personal background and pedagogy

I am both a Music and Italian primary school specialist teacher teaching in the WA context with nearly 20 years of experience. I am recognised as a lead teacher (AITSL, 2011a) and have achieved Level Three Teacher Status (DoE WA, 2009). I also consider myself to be an interdisciplinarian. In 1994 I completed my Bachelor of Education, specialising in Music at Edith Cowan University, Perth. Throughout my four years of pre-service study, I completed 12 Music education units. I am the daughter of Italian migrants to WA with a proud heritage and grew up in a bilingual and musical family with a rich awareness of both my Italian and Australian (Italo-Australian) heritage. My background has played a significant role in my teaching pedagogy, one especially influenced by my Nonna (grandmother) Spina Cinquina who migrated to Perth, Australia in 1954 with her husband and three children. In my childhood home, conversations were held in Italian or English and sometimes a mixture of both. In addition, our regional Vastese (people from the region of Vasto,
Italy) dialect was another language used. I always remember having these languages. They were never ‘taught’. They were just there.

Another contributing factor to my second language acquisition was the part that music played during my childhood. I was fortunate to have a musical family where songs and music were an essential part of our relationships. I learned songs in a naturalistic setting by listening and joining in. This pedagogy has played a significant part in my life-world and that of my brother, Luigi. Both of us are musicians, music teachers and are proficient in Italian. As a teacher, my childhood experience has led me to the Orff-Schulwerk Approach (Orff & Keetman, 1950). Orff’s belief that children learn music best when they naturally and actively participate in an environment where they speak, sing, move and play appealed to me. My life-world has reinforced the need to integrate songs and music in the teaching of Italian in my primary classroom. When teaching Italian to my students, I strive to recreate in a small way, my childhood environment. Italian and music are my passions and through my lessons I attempt to instil this passion and love into my students.

This research project is an outcome of my teaching, specifically linked to the following reflective questions that I asked myself:

- “Do other Italian teachers teach like me?”
- “Do they share a similar background?”
- “Do they have a love of music?”
- “Do they engage interdisciplinary approaches when teaching Italian?”
- “Is Music successful in my Italian room because I am both a Music and Italian specialist?”

This research comes from my personal belief that Music and Languages are essential in today’s curriculum. I see the teaching of Music and Languages together as providing an opportunity for a proactive interdisciplinary alternative in an increasingly crowded curriculum.

Self-reflections upon my teaching practice are presented in Chapter V of this thesis. These will highlight and link to teacher participant responses and to the ACARA documents.

The Context of the Research

The Australian Curriculum, Assessment and Reporting Authority (ACARA) have been commissioned to introduce the national curriculum. The foundation of the
Australia Curriculum occurred with the *Melbourne Declaration* (MCEETYA, 2008) and its ‘Goals of Education’ (MCEETYA, 2008, p. 7). Each Australian state and territory has existing curricula and is working within their old frameworks, as well as making progressive adjustment to include the national agenda. In January 2012, the *Australian Curriculum* V3.0 (ACARA) was released. Also to be noted, in July 2012, the *Australian Curriculum: The Arts Foundation to Year 10* (ACARA) was released for public consultation. It is within this context of the *Australian Curriculum V2.0* (ACARA, 2010) that this research precedes.

Curriculum change in Australia

The notion of interdisciplinary approaches is not new, as is supported by the theory of Multiple Intelligences (Gardner, 1993; 1999), which underscores the Curriculum Framework of WA, (Curriculum Council of Western Australia, 1998), as well the Australian Curriculum, Assessment and Reporting Authority (ACARA, 2011). Importantly, if carefully crafted together, the learning areas of Languages and Music provide many social, emotional, cognitive and cultural benefits to students as so often elaborated in the Australian Curriculum documents (ACARA, 2011).

ACARA (2011) underscores the importance of both Languages and Music to contemporary Australia, claiming they provide a richer context to the globalisation of our Australian life-world. For example, this importance is reinforced when the historical links, between Italian and music, are explored as an understanding of the larger Western cultural sphere. In its rationale for history ACARA (2009) states that: “The study of history is based on the evidence derived from the remains of the past... An understanding of world history enhances students’ appreciation of Australian history” (Para. 1-2, p. 24). ACARA (2009) notes:

> In learning a language, learners develop an understanding of and make informed comparisons about:
> - language and languages, as well as
> - culture and cultures.
> … learners develop and understanding of the relationship between language and culture in intercultural exchange…different ways of perceiving experience…respect for multiple perspective on the social, cultural and linguistic construction of human action. They come to understand the diverse, rich and dynamic world around them and their own ethical engagement with this diversity. (ACARA, 2011a, p. 24)

In respect to music, ACARA (2011c) reinforce both the global and cultural significance of Music education. According to ACARA (2011c, p. 14) In Music:
Students will come to understand and engage with multiple and culturally diverse practices of music, learning about Australian and international music – locally, nationally, and globally. … Learning Music is most effective when composing, performing, and listening are interconnected. (ACARA, 2011c, p. 14)

**Curriculum change in Western Australia**

The Review of School Curriculum Development Procedures and Processes in Western Australia (1995) identified a number of curriculum priorities including “a common curriculum direction aligned with curriculum change to enable schools to develop and adapt curriculum to the advantage of their students” (Western Australian Government’s Curriculum Council, 1995).

The key recommendation of the review was the creation of the Curriculum Council of WA with a responsibility for developing a Curriculum Framework for all WA schools, which set out what students (K-12) should know and value as well as be able to do. The Curriculum Framework (1998) used Gardner’s (1993, 1993) Multiple Intelligence theory as its conceptual framework. The document listed eight Learning Areas, inclusive of Languages and The Arts, of which Music was one of five areas of sub-focus. The Western Australian Curriculum Framework (1998) still comprises of eight Learning Areas: English; Mathematics; Society and Environment; Technology and Enterprise; Science, The Arts; Languages and Health and Physical Education.

Schools in WA are required to provide **students** with learning experiences that incorporate each learning area and value group. However, new initiatives and policies are constantly being introduced by the Department of Education of Western Australia (DoE WA), as well as the Commonwealth (ACARA), and schools are obliged to incorporate them into an already time constrained school curriculum. Principals are then faced with the dilemma, “What needs to give?” (Primary School Principal, personal communication, December 2007).

**National values in education**

The National Framework for Values Education in Australian Schools (DEST, 2005, p. 4) lists the nine essential values for Australian schooling. These values are:

1. Care and Compassion;
2. Doing Your Best;
3. Fair Go;
4. Freedom;
5. Honesty and Trustworthiness;
6. Integrity;
7. Respect;
8. Responsibility; as well as

These motherhood values are consistent with existing State themes, as well as those supported by ACARA (2010). In respect to the researcher’s personal pedagogy and primary teaching interest, the study of Italian (Languages) and Music has the potential to assist in developing all stated values.

Eisner (1991; 2002a; 2002b) believes that the Arts help students to make good qualitative judgments and assists them to realise that there is more than one solution to a problem. He says that the Arts allow students to consider many perspectives and interpretations, and that understanding problem solving depends on circumstances and opportunity. Importantly, like Gardner (1993; 1999), Eisner reinforces the reality that words alone do not form all of our cognitive abilities. Musical and visual ideas cannot always be accurately transposed into words (Janacek, cited in Pearl, 2001), as these modes allow for unique discovery and experimentation. ACARA (2010) is consistent with the ideas of Eisner (1991; 2002a; 2002b), Gardner (1993; 1999) and Janacek, (cited in Pearl, 2001) yet the political process of curricula change often ‘muddies the water’ of good intentions.

Recent Political Pressures that are Marginalising Languages and Music

In 2008, ACARA introduced the National Assessment Program – Literacy and Numeracy [NAPLAN] (ACARA, 2011d). These tests were the result of collaboration between all states and territories of Australia, the Australian Government and the non-government school sectors. These annual national tests in literacy and numeracy for all students in Years Three, Five, Seven and Nine are conducted in May each year over a three-day period. The testing days are uniform and predetermined by ACARA. The purpose of these tests is to provide rich and consistent data on student performance. Accountability and assessment initiatives, although well intended, have the capacity to block other educational innovations as principals react to political rhetoric, signalling preferred outcomes and priorities from the government (ACARA, 2011d).

In WA, many schools are still moving through a crisis where many teachers are suffering from problematic curriculum requirements and a lack of clarity about what
they are expected to achieve (Australian Primary Principals’ Association, [APPA], 2007).

In March 2007, the Western Australian College of Teachers (WACOT) compiled a report for the Minister of Education and Training’s Taskforce for Education Workforce Initiatives (WACOT, 2007a) identifying issues in teaching today. Of major importance was the issue of the overcrowded curriculum, with the then anticipation of the NAPLAN expectations. The introduction of the new accountability mechanisms created further tensions within schools as anticipated by the APPA in 2007. For example, given the importance of the Arts in education and the valuable contribution of a second language to students’ growth, such progressive appreciations were to be blocked by other agendas.

Languages and music not included

In July 2007, the APPA published a Draft Charter on Primary Schooling (APPA, 2007), which set out the Association’s views on the nature and purposes of primary schooling. Specifically, the APPA defined four core essential learning areas for all students. These were English literacy, Mathematics, Science and History (APPA, 2007; Crabbe, 2007a). Languages and Music were not considered essential and alarmingly many principals have stated that they would remove these two learning areas from their school curriculum so that their students received greater time learning the four core essentials. This outcome would be disadvantageous and severely impoverish the education of students (Eisner 2002a; 2002b) as well as ignore the essentialness of Gardner’s (1993; 1999) Multiple Intelligences, and a great deal of neurological science that supports music and the value of second language acquisition as reported by ACARA (2011a, 2011b & 2011c).

Potentially, students in WA’s schools could miss out on two essential aspects of the local Curriculum Framework, as well as the new Australian Curriculum. School reactions to NAPLAN through the APPA, has the potential to marginalise by default the social, cognitive and educational benefits to many students. Learning areas, often taught by non-specialist teachers, would be further slighted by the changing perceptions of educational administrators and political mandates for public accountability.

The long established benefits provided by music and second language acquisition would also be marginalised. For example; facilitated insights into other cultures, enhanced learning of native or/and first language, the development of unique thinking skills that encourage collaboration and interaction, the building of self-esteem,
building of foundations for the future, and the forming of the foundations of all human relationships as covered in detail in the Curriculum Framework (1998), as well as ACARA (2010). As underscored by Gardner (1993) all languages, as well as music, are pivotal in the development of literacy skills in both native and second language (Crabbe, 2007a; 2007b). Both are also pivotal in the extension of one’s interpersonal and intrapersonal intelligences as sense of identity and of understanding oneself as part of the wider community are also developed (Crabbe, 2007a; 2007b; Gardner, 1993).

In addition to the personal and social skills, the essential link of music to hemispheric functions of the brain and neurological bi-modality (between the two hemispheres) is diminished without appropriate inclusion of music, as explained by Danesi (1987).

Inconsistency in the educational rhetoric is a consistent dilemma in WA. In August 2007, The Department of Education and Training of Western Australia [DETWA] Director General, O’Neill issued the Classroom First Strategy (DETWA, 2007a), as a rationale for future planning. It states that:

We want our students to have a strong sense of being part of a community, students need a sense of belonging, teachers need to instil in students a sense of service and responsibility to and for others, effective teachers search for better ways of teaching those students not responding, effective schools are driven by the best long term interests of their students. (DETWA, 2007a, p. 2)

These points made in the Classroom First Strategy contradict what is happening in schools in relation to Music and Languages education. How can this strategy happen in a school without Music or Languages, or without competent teachers willing to be interdisciplinary? Pragmatism would suggest a need for teachers to become more interdisciplinary in their approach if they are to accommodate all learning areas. From a brief acknowledgement of Mandarin, and the huge role of popular commercial music alone plays in Australian society, it seems irrational for Languages and Music to be excluded in the longer term, if at all.

**Languages and arts education in Australia is eroding away**

Without Languages and Music in our WA primary schools, future generations will be deprived of many cultural and intellectual experiences and opportunities (Gattenhoff, 2009). These are further explained in Chapter II. Lo Bianco and Slaughter (2009, p. 26) believe that public consensus towards Languages education in Australian is “eroding as it is being overshadowed by History, Literacy, Numeracy and benchmark testing.”
Governments profess a commitment to literacy, culture and creating vibrant communities yet, when belts need tightening, the Arts are hit first (“Arts funding,” 2010). In 2009, the Arts contributed $10.6 billion to the WA’s economy. The 2010, Department of Culture and the Arts study (“Arts funding,” 2010) found that the WA public overwhelmingly regarded the Arts as an integral part of life. In addition, 94% of the WA public considered it important for children to be able to learn Arts and cultural activities whilst 85% regarded the Arts as helping to understand our own culture and the way of others. Inadequate funding and government support will lead to a second rate culture of “dumbed-down philistines” instead of a thinking community of engaged citizens (“Arts funding”, 2010).

This view is mirrored in the government’s view on Languages education. Over the past ten years Languages have gradually been removed from the educational agenda (McConchie Pty Ltd, 2007). Instead, the rhetoric of the Australian Federal Government has turned Australia’s focus inward through a focus on assimilation rather than outward with a view towards multiculturalism. This study also revealed that this inward focus was being evidenced in the wider Australian community. When interviewed, only 15% of Australian parents and 32% of Australian principals considered the study of Languages to be an important part of the curriculum. At the time of writing, the learning of Languages is not mandated in WA (“A nation lost”, 2011).

Towards a pragmatic interdisciplinary approach

In summary, during 2007 and 2008, time constraints and curriculum pressures, mixed messages from leadership, APPA perceptions of a crowded curriculum, as well as the commencement of NAPLAN, have seen the emergence of a frustrated educational climate in WA. However, pragmatism would suggest a need for teachers to become more interdisciplinary in their approach if they are to accommodate all learning areas.

Therefore, within the backdrop of uncertainty, the researcher still maintains that it is essential that an interdisciplinary approach be encouraged, to allow teachers to assist students to develop deep understandings across all learning areas. This not only increases student capacity to make cross-curricular connections but also increases their sense of community in a multicultural Australia. This stance, as experienced in the researcher’s own teaching of Italian using music, and vice versa, is supported by Baker’s (2007) beliefs that this approach is more akin to real-life learning, and that “an interdisciplinary curriculum reflects a multiplicity of disciplines” as “Understanding”
requires substantial interdisciplinary cooperation” (Hauser, Chomsky & Techumsch Fitch, 2002, p. 1569).

Within the context of perceptions of a crowded curriculum, the researcher sees an opportunity to share their pedagogy and professional experience with other primary Italian language teachers, despite the existing pressures and constraints.

**The Research: To Inform Primary Italian Language Teachers**

It is the intention of the researcher to inform the practice of Italian language teachers in WA’s primary schools by demonstrating how music/song can be a valuable interdisciplinary teaching tool. Currently, “common practice is to use songs in the classroom to support second language acquisition” (Medina, 1993a, p. 1). The literature abounds with positive statements concerning music as a vehicle for language acquisition with evidence demonstrating that music/song benefits attention, memorisation and retention (McElhinney & Annett, 1996; Morrongiello & Roes, 1990; Neurosciences Institute, 2005; Woodall & Ziembroski, 2002-2011).

**Support for music and song as a tool for second language enhancement**

An initial review of associated literature began to point to a lack of empirical support for music as a vehicle for second language acquisition (Medina, 1993a; Salcedo, 2002). In particular these researchers believe that there is a concern that music/song may simply be a supplemental activity with little instructional value. The researcher concurs with these concerns. From their personal teaching experience, the researcher intuitively and inductively believes that music/song could accommodate more than an embellishment role in facilitating Italian as a second language. This research was an opportunity to formally test their convictions against evidence.

**Songs and language**

Language teachers commonly use music/song in the classroom but “all too often, it has been relegated to recreation and entertainment status” (Falioni, 1993, p. 98). If music/song is to be beneficial to second language acquisition it must be meaningful and activities must actively engage the whole student (Asher 1993 cited in Lake 2002). It is anticipated that the proposed research will raise teacher awareness of the value of music/song as a pedagogical tool, which when used effectively in the classroom can promote language learning; enhance musical skills and instil a love of music/song. By triggering self-reflection among teachers, it is hoped that they reconsider how they use music/song in the classroom to help their students learn. The researcher aims to create baseline data on teacher awareness of the connection between foreign language
acquisition and music using the educative work of the German twentieth century composer Carl Orff (1895 -1982).

**Research Design**

The first research aim was to identify Italian language teachers in WA’s primary schools who use music/song as a pedagogical tool in their classrooms. The second research aim was to examine how these teachers use music/song as a pedagogical tool in their classrooms. The third research aim was then to implement a professional learning workshop to train several upper primary Italian language teachers in the Orff-Schulwerk approach for use in their respective classroom interventions of a term. These participating teachers received continual support throughout their involvement in the research.

**Action research**

Action research is a collective of complementary research methodologies that pursues “action” or change, as well as research or new informed understanding simultaneously. According to Dick (1999; 2002) these functions are achieved by:

- Using a cyclic or spiral process, alternating between action and critical reflection.
- In the later cycles, continuously refining methods, data and interpretation in the light of the understanding developed in the earlier cycles.

Action research in the context of the Orff-Schulwerk model is employed as an emergent process, which takes shape as the upper primary Italian language teacher’s increase their understandings of the value of having music/song integrated into their pedagogical strategies. The research design enhances the probability of accepting the interdisciplinary link between Languages and Music due to the repetitive process of the teaching and learning process. Direct participation leads to a convergence towards a better reflective understanding of what role music/song play within the students’ grasp of Italian. The key to this specific action research approach is that it relies on the dedication of the participants; the assumption being that proactive change is best achieved when those affected by the change are directly motivated to be involved (Grundy, 1982).

**Research Cycles and Questions**

In order to answer the questions effectively, the research was conducted in three action cycles.
**Action Cycle One**

The researcher identified and contacted all primary school principals of schools in WA that offer Italian as a second language. Upon gaining ethics approval, the researcher identified and contacted all teachers of primary Italian in WA. A mail out self-administered questionnaire was sent to all Italian language teachers in WA’s primary schools to establish:

- Whether music/song are being used in the classroom;
- Frequency of use of music/song used in the classroom;
- How music/song were used in the classroom;
- Demographic information;
- Teacher background;
- Teacher language proficiency;
- Teacher musical background; and
- Teacher music proficiency.

This stage was critical in providing contextual knowledge in order to answer the research questions thoroughly. It is from this context that the research questions for Action Cycles Two and Three were developed.

**Research questions**

**Action Cycle One**

1.1 Do Italian language teachers in Western Australian primary schools use music/songs as a pedagogical tool in their classroom?

1.2. How do Italian language teachers in Western Australian primary schools use music/songs as a pedagogical tool in their classroom?

**Action Cycle Two**

The questionnaire responses identified the teachers who used music/song in their Italian classroom. These teachers were approached to participate in an interview. The interviews were guided by the following research question and provided greater detail into how music/song were being used in primary school Italian classrooms across WA.

**Research question**

**Action Cycle Two**

2.1. Why do Italian language teachers in Western Australian primary schools use music/songs as a pedagogical tool in their classroom?
**Action Cycle Three**

Teachers from Action Cycle Two who expressed further interest in the research were approached to implement an Orff-Schulwerk intervention in one of their upper primary classes for a period of eight weeks during Term Three.

**Research questions**

**Action Cycle Three.**

3.1 Do Italian language teachers in Western Australian primary schools consider the Orff-Schulwerk approach to be an **effective** pedagogical tool when teaching Italian to their upper primary students?

3.2 Is the Orff-Schulwerk approach effective in **engaging** Western Australian upper primary students in the study of Italian as a second language?

3.3 What do Italian language teachers in Western Australian primary schools consider to be the essential knowledge or support structures needed for the Orff-Schulwerk approach to be an effective pedagogical tool in their upper primary classrooms?

**Scope and Organisation of the Research**

This research accommodates a mixed methods approach to action research with an emphasis on the qualitative. Initially, all WA primary school Italian language teachers were invited to participate. Later, selections of upper primary students were invited to participate in this research. This was a result of the contextual knowledge gathered through the data collection that identified a deficit in this area.

**Mixed methods**

Denzin (1978, cited in Quinn-Patton, 2002) believes that no single method ever adequately solves the problem of rival causal factors. As each method reveals different aspects of empirical reliability, multiple methods of observation must be used. The combining of methods assists in the triangulation of data and enhances the validity and reliability of the research.

**Data collection tools**

For the purpose of this research, questionnaires, interviews and a specific intervention were used to answer the research questions. The questionnaire aimed to find out what are the current practices among primary school Italian language teachers and demographics.

**Finding participants**

Following collation of the Action Cycle One questionnaire data, via SPSS 13, interested participants from the questionnaire sample were interviewed for Action Cycle
Two. Those participants who expressed interest in continuing further into the project were approached to participate in Action Cycle Three.

**Coding**

The researcher manually coded all interviews to identify common themes and issues raised by the participants. All research participants maintained anonymity. Action Cycle One participants received a numerical reference. Action Cycle Two and Three participants received a pseudonym.

**Piloting of data collection tools**

In order to enhance validity and reliability, data collection tools used for each Action Cycle were piloted prior to them being administered.

**The Orff-Schulwerk intervention**

Action Cycle Three involved:

- One, four-hour teacher professional development covering the Orff-Schulwerk approach as the interdisciplinary intervention;
- An eight week Orff-Schulwerk intervention;
- Teacher weekly evaluation forms;
- Teacher exit interviews and focus group; and
- Student questionnaires and interviews.

**Outline of the Thesis**

**Chapter II: Literature Review**

Chapter II presents a review of the available literature. It focuses on relevant knowledge linked to the research questions and supports the assumptions underlying the research. First, the review encompasses key assertions, which are culturally and contextually linked to a history of ideas, accommodating evidence-based links between Languages and Music education. Secondly, the literature provides scientific and educational evidence that supports the inclusiveness of both Languages and Music in the curriculum, as linked to the initial position given by the researcher in this introductory chapter. Finally, a focus is directed upon literature related to the action research centred on the Orff-Schulwerk approach.

**Chapter III: Theoretical Framework**

Chapter III focuses on the theoretical framework underpinning this research related to the detailed aspects of the action research approach as applied to research investigation.
Chapter IV: Research Processes and Methodology

Chapter IV discusses in specific detail the research processes linked to the methodology used including design, data gathering procedures, and interpretations.

Chapter V: Interpretation of Data

Chapter V includes a detailed discussion covering interpretations of the data specifically linked to the proposed research questions linked to Action Cycles One, Two and Three. Rich self-reflections by the researcher are included along with pedagogical examples, to support the evidence.

Chapter VI: Discussion, Implications and Recommendations

Chapter VI responds to the aim of the research outlined in Chapter I. It briefly reviews the findings and comments on the significance of these findings in relation to the research questions and is presented in three sections. In Section One the research data is presented and discussed. In Section Two the curriculum documents are analysed and compared with the research findings. The chapter also discusses the current situation of Music and Languages in Australia and Europe, scientific evidence supporting the perception that music and language learning enhance neural networks as well as cognitive functioning. In Section Three future recommendations will be presented and discussed. In an overall reflection it will critically review “The potential of the Orff-Schulwerk approach as a pedagogical tool for the teaching of Italian to upper primary students in Western Australia”.

Chapter VII: Conclusion

Chapter VII provides a summary of the research. This chapter will contextualise the significance of the research undertaken, provide further research questions to be investigated and suggests recommendations for the future based on the evidence gathered. The limitations of this research are also discussed.

Summary

This introductory chapter has attempted to establish the personal pedagogical and ethnic context of the researcher as an Italo-Australian identifying with a bilingual Italian family context that embraced music/song as a natural life-world experience. Secondly, the chapter has introduced the researcher as a primary teacher of both Italian as a second language as well as a Music specialist. Thirdly, the Curriculum Framework of WA was described in respect to the research focus, as this document is the context in which the researcher has based her teaching philosophy. Fourthly, the educational political climate as experienced by the APPA, the Department of Education, WA and the
Commonwealth of Australia was introduced and critiqued against authorities that supported an inclusive approach to Languages and the Arts in the curriculum. Finally, the researcher’s mixed method; action research approach was explained and linked to her research questions associated with “The potential of the Orff-Schulwerk approach as a pedagogical tool for the teaching of Italian to upper primary students in Western Australia”.

Songs bridge the hemispheres, strengthening retention as the right learns the melody and the left, the words. (Guglielmino, 1986, p. 20)
CHAPTER II
LITERATURE REVIEW

Music is a more potent instrument than any other for education. (Plato, 427 – 347 B.C., cited in Lake, 2002, p. 1)

Plato was a Greek philosopher and Pythagorean (Pythagoras circa 579 - 495 B.C.). Plato was a student of Socrates (469 – 399 B.C.) and teacher of Aristotle (384 - 322 B.C.). Plato continued the work of Socrates in the development of pedagogy for the philosopher ruler in his The Republic (Plato, 360 BC/2004). This surviving work has continued as the foundation model for much of Western society’s education and law (Lake, 2002).

Introduction

This literature review explores several important themes that support the inclusion of second languages and music in the primary curriculum. In particular, the review includes key evolutionary evidence that support the essential role of music as an ongoing part of the human experience and its essential role in the neurological development of children and older students. In addition, the relationship between language, music and song will be explored. To explain this clearly, the review is divided into three sections.

Section One: The historical context of Italians in Australia

This section encompasses key assertions and history of ideas of Western culture, as they relate to European languages and music/song in education. It is inclusive of evidence linking classical Greece and Rome, and Roman-British history into the contemporary Australian context. In addition, the section traces immigration and economic reasoning that links into the Italo-Australian context and Western global paradigm.

Section Two: The role of language, music/song in the evolution of human cognition and education

The literature reviewed in this section provides both scientific and educational evidence that supports the inclusiveness of both languages, and music/song in the curriculum as important historical devices.

Section Three: The Orff-Schulwerk approach to teaching Italian through music

This section examines the literature related to the action research linked to the Orff-Schulwerk approach.
The Essentialness of Music

Contrary to the pro-musical views of Plato and the many rich cultural exemplars of the role of music/song across civilisations, some notable authorities have challenged the role of music/song in contemporary society. In particular, Pinker (1997), a Harvard cognitive psychologist and a linguist at the Massachusetts Institute of Technology states:

As far as biological cause and effect are concerned, music is useless. It shows no sign of design for attaining a goal such as long life, grandchildren, or accurate perception and prediction of the world. Compared with language, vision, social reasoning and physical know how, music could vanish from our species and the rest of our lifestyle would be virtually unchanged. (Pinker, 1997, cited in Trehub, 2001, p. 1-2)

This literature review challenges Pinker’s claim and demonstrates that music/song has an important function in children’s learning, reinforcing the general thesis of Gardner’s (1993) Multiple Intelligence, which has greatly influenced the Western Australian Curriculum Framework. The researcher conjectures that the function of music/song supports brain development, cultural awareness, intercultural understanding, language development, as well as second language acquisition. The researcher also challenges the agenda of reducing the scope of the primary curriculum, as advocated by the Australian Primary Principals’ Association (2007).

The researcher includes the lyrics of popular Australian music to demonstrate the racial attitudes and values of mainstream Anglo-Australian society to non-Anglo citizens, in particular Italo-Australians. The novel use of popular lyrics emphasises the role of the Arts as discussed by Eisner (1991; 2002a; 2002b).
CHAPTER II: SECTION ONE

Music gives a soul to the universe, wings to the mind, flight to the imagination, a charm to sadness, gaiety and life to everything. (Plato, cited in Watson, 1991, p. 45)

A Historical Overview: Western Music and Language in Education

Like all things Western, the ancient Greeks offered a solid cultural and historical reference for so many ideas. These ideas were copied by the Romans and distributed throughout their empire. Gradually, they were re-invented in other cultures and moved into new creative outcomes of European and Western languages. For example, the English word, ‘music’ comes from the Greek word ‘mousikas’, which means “from the muses” (Stansell, 2005, p. 4). In The Homenic Hymns and Homenica, the Greek poet, Hesiod expounds how the Muses’ were born to Zeus the King of the Gods and Mnemosyne the Goddess of Memory. Zeus and Mnemosyne had nine daughters, the Muses. These divine beings used their music to preside over the Arts and Sciences (Hesiod, 725 B.C./1914).

Australia

In Australia, music/song has been part of its indigenous nations for circa 50,000 years (Columbia Encyclopaedia, 2006). Indigenous Australian music/song, prior to Western European domination, was deemed naturalistic and integral to life. In the twenty-first century music for many Australians has become a cerebral experience (George, 1991; Lowe, 2008), in contrast to its classical or ancient place in history (Stansell, 2005).

In contemporary Australian schools, the muses are separated from the other disciplines (Ewing, 2010). During the past 500 years, Western music/song has moved from being a participatory societal experience to becoming more of a spectator activity especially during the second half of the twentieth century (Laskewicz, 2008). Today, music/song and the muses (other Arts) have been split from the sciences and moved from being an aspect of everyday life to being performed in concerts by experts often to audiences greater than 50,000 people (George, 1991).

However, the primordial need to participate in music/song is seen in children’s reactions as they respond by moving and shouting (Mithen, 2006). In some Australian secondary schools, the outcome of schooling is to inhibit participative musical instincts and encourage children to become spectators. For example, research conducted by Lowe (2008) found that in WA secondary schools, Year Eight students entered high
school with positive attitudes towards music. He found by the end of Year Eight, students increasingly devalued the activities of class music despite their personal ability or their belief in music. Gradually school music becomes less attractive to most students post-Year Eight, even though students were involved with popular music outside school through electronic media (Lowe, 2008).

In Australia, Western music/song tends to be less naturalistic and in some senses separated from life, as society tends places greater value upon expression through elevated artistic means, rather than creative participation. This is in contrast to ancient societies who considered creative expression to be integral to all (Laskewicz, 2008), as still exists in Balinese society, religion, theatre, dance, design and music/song, are all aspects of culture, and are deemed homogenous and cannot exist without the other (George, 1991). This homogenous aspect of music was once fundamental to the Western experience.

**Classical Greece and Rome and its influences upon Western culture**

For over a millennium, the history of Western Music and education in many respects has been associated with the Western and Eastern orthodox churches, but there are older links back to classical Greece, Rome and other influences, well before the rise of Christianity in the late Roman period (250 -550 A.D) (Grout & Palisca, 1988).

Throughout the Middle-Ages (fifth – fifteenth century) to the present, artists and intellectuals have sourced inspiration from ancient Rome and Greece. Through literature, bas-reliefs, mosaics, paintings and sculpture, even today it is possible to see the importance that music/song played in the rituals of Roman civilisation, from military life through to religion (Grout & Palisca, 1988).

In the ancient Greece of Pythagoras and Plato, music was basic to all activities that were concerned with the pursuit of the ideals of ‘beauty or truth’ (Plato, 360 B.C./2004). Karolyi (1965) explains how the Greeks gave their musical scales the names of their tribes: Dorian, Lydian, Phrygian and Mixolydian. These principle Greek scales consisting of tones and semitones in descending order are the origin of the European scale system. Through the Middle-Ages, the Western Christian church musicians took these scales and called them modes, presenting them in ascending order.

**The Pythagorean view of music and the Doctrine of Ethos**

The Pythagoreans established the mysticism of mathematics, a philosophy that is well represented in the core structural themes of Western music. Therefore to
understand Western music of the Middle-Ages, as well as today, one must turn to the practice and philosophy of the Pythagoreans (Grout & Palisca, 1988).

The Greek Doctrine of Ethos considered music/song to have influenced moral qualities. This fitted with the Pythagorean view of music as a microcosm, a system of pitch and rhythm ruled by the same mathematical laws that operates in all the visible and invisible metaphysical dimensions of how the Greeks perceived creation. This view saw that music was not a passive image of the ordered universe, rather an ‘affecting one’ with all phenomena seen to be matched to music/song as a backdrop (Grout & Palisca, 1988).

Pythagoras reinforced his idea that spatial and musical harmony is related to universal harmony and the power of mathematics, by recognising that harmonious musical intervals (fourth, fifth and octave) are related by integer ratios (Frazer, 2010). Pythagoras devised the system of tuning based entirely on the interval of a fifth and the Pythagorean scale is constructed only from perfect fifths and octaves (Johnson, 1989). According to Frazer (2010) the pentatonic scale is created by removing the last descending and ascending fifths from the tuning system, thus removing the inharmonious sounds of the tri-tone. By discovering the importance of the fifth interval, Pythagoras created the Circle of Fifths, the foundation of Western music theory. It demonstrates the relationship between the twelve tones of the chromatic scale, corresponding key signatures and associated major and minor keys (Apel & Daniel, 1960). This is the same system that exists today across the Western world, and by extension Australia. According to the teachings of Pythagoras, Music was not separate to the teachings of Mathematics. It was part of the mysticism, one shared and propagated by Plato and his followers throughout the centuries, through to contemporary times. The role of Mathematics was essential to the Scientific Revolution (spanning from the sixteenth to the nineteenth century) and the advancement of Western Europe and North American interests (Ferguson, 2011).

**Plato and Aristotle influence upon music**

Plato also had profound influence on the role of music and its place in Western education. He considered that mathematical laws underlie both musical intervals and heavenly bodies. Music became so prolific in Greek society that Aristotle (384-322 B.C.) warned against too much professional training in Music education (Plato, 360 B.C./2004). In *Poetics* (335 B.C./2007), Aristotle explains his Doctrine of Imitation and how music directly imitates the passions or the state of mind.
In *The Republic* (Plato, 360 B.C./2004) Plato also establishes how imitation can have an adverse effect on society. If the right type of music is listened to then the right type of person will develop. Conversely, the opposite can also occur. Aristotle, together with his teacher Plato, believed that the right kind of person could be produced through a public education system that contained two principle elements: gymnastics and music, a discipline for the body and mind (Plato, 360 B.C./2004).

For the ancient Greeks, music and poetry were synonymous, where “the music of poetry” was a reality for the Greeks as lyric poetry actually meant “poems being sung to the music of the lyre” (Grout & Palisca, 1988, p. 745). The Greek idea that music is essentially one with the spoken word has reappeared in diverse forms throughout the history of music, as well as in the recitative circa the 1600’s, as well as into more recent music and drama in the nineteenth century (Grout & Palisca, 1988).

Plato believed that musical training was a more potent instrument than any other, because rhythm and harmony find their way into the inward places of the student, making them deeply educated and graceful (Plato, 360 B.C./2004). For millennia music has been part of the global society, governing what is done and by whom (Ball, 2010), therefore producing global citizens long before ACARA and the National Curriculum.

Ethnomusicologists (Frith, 1996; Merriam, 1960; Mueller, 1963) have identified many social functions for Western and other music. These include: expressing emotion, inducing pleasure, accompanying dance, ritual validation, communicating, entertaining, encouraging a sense of community and healing. Throughout history, musical stories have been passed on through song (Gandini, 2002; Larrick, 1991). Wandering minstrels informed the villagers, work songs made labouring easier, mothers spoke (and continue to speak) in motherese to their babies and lullabies helped (and continue to help) a child set musical patterns to words, which they do not yet comprehend. These lullabies eventually allow them to gain an understanding of the society in which they live (Gandini, 2002). Babies do not memorise every word they learn. However, as music and speech share many cognitive and prosodic features, music forms a way for babies to practice, apply (metacognition) and generate new speech (Harvey, 2007; Trehub, 2003, cited in Levitin, 2008).

To appreciate Western philosophy and culture, it is not possible to separate the original ideas or the epistemological linkages to Western music. The history of Western thought, epistemology and culture is incomplete without music references or participation in some level of direct expression during one’s pedagogy. This historical
fact needs to be reinforced with respect to ACARA and the current Australian educational debate on what constitutes an appropriate history for Australian children in the twenty-first century. Given that contemporary Australia historically, culturally and linguistically fits into the broad Western experience, it would seem negligent not to fully include this fact into the National Curriculum.

**English and Italian Languages Share a Common European History**

...language is a means of communication derived from the desire for unity, ... language is also a declaration of diversity derived from the desire to be different. (Kinder, 2008, p. 1)

Currently, there are two conflicting theories about the origins of language. One theory questions whether language arose from necessity through evolutionary natural selection pressures. The second theory suggests that language was invented by humans, for flexible communication. Science conjectures that a form of human language did exist as a prehistoric language or protolanguage from which all current and modern languages came from (Mithen, 2006). However, when analysing the culture and political association of peoples, linguistics provides a useful tool (van Gelderen, 2006).

Italian and English both belong to the Indo-European group of languages. However, English evolved during the centuries after post Romano-Britannia, a period that saw the end of Roman military rule in Britain circa 383 A.D. The military vacuum left by the Roman military eventually saw invasions of people belonging to the broad West Germanic linguistic sub-branch. These invaders were related to Frisian, Dutch, Flemish and Paltdeutsch language groups, which were old West Germanic regional languages spoken primarily in Northern Germany and in the eastern parts of the Netherlands. They entered the British Isles during the fifth to seventh centuries (Clivio & Danesi, 2000).

Although English is layered with many languages, it still contains strong historical Latin and even Greek references. During the Norman Conquest in the eleventh century, Latin based French was reintroduced, so the historical importance and essentialness of Roman concepts and ideas never left Britain and the lands that eventually became England. Latin remained as the language of the church and also university education across Europe until the vernacular European languages became the accepted voice (Clivio & Danesi, 2000).

Italian, like French, Spanish, Portuguese and Romanian, is part of a group called ‘The Romance Languages.’ Italian is a direct offspring of Latin, spoken by the Romans
who introduced it to many ethnic groups under their Empire. Those who did not speak the language of the Empire were denied human and civil rights (Kinder, 2008). This empire included Romano-Britannia for many centuries (Clivio & Danesi, 2000). Therefore, modern English and Italian have strong historical links to Latin and Roman culture. For example, the word ‘Britain’ originates from the Roman name Britannia. America is named after Americus Vesputius (Hurlbut, 1886). Australia is derived from the Latin words for southern land ‘Terra Australis’ and was first seen on the maps of Matthew Flinders (Flinders, 1996).

**From Latin Roman-Britain to the emergence of English**

Julius Caesar invaded Britain (including modern England) in 55 B.C. only to be overthrown by the Indigenous Britons. However, in 43 A.D. General Aulus Plautius staged a successful invasion for Rome. It saw the emergence of a stable Romano-Britannia for a period of 355 years, a period more than 130 years longer than the English speaking occupation of Australia. Similar to contemporary Australia, Romano-Britannia was a multicultural nation built around common dominant culture. Romano-Britannia was a fusion of ancient indigenous groups, classical Greek ideas, and Latin was the accepted Romano-Britannia language, across law and education (Morris, 1973; Salway, 1993).

Circa 388 and 400 A.D., the Roman Empire was under attack on several fronts by the Visigoths, Ostrogoths, Huns and Vandals. Emperor Honorius recalled soldiers from Romano-Britannia to return to Rome to repel the invaders. By 410 A.D., Romano-Britannia defences became marginalised and was no longer supported any external Roman armies (Morris, 1973; Salway, 1993).

According to Morris (1973), the fifth century saw the start of the transition of Romano-Britannia to the Germanic-Britain (the arrival of Angles and Saxons). This was a period of numerous invasions into the once stable Romano-Britannia by the Picts, Saxons, Scots, Angles (England means ‘Angle’ Land), Vikings, Jutes, Franks, Gauls, Huns, Goths and Frisians, which continued circa 650 A.D. According to Morris (1973), this was the period known as the ‘Age of Arthur’, where a Romano-Britannia General, possibly Ambrosius Aurelianus (c.465 A.D.–c.515 A.D.), attempted to unite his country and economy without military support from Rome. Morris (1973) conjectures that it was Ambrosius Aurelianus ‘Arthur’ with farming and trade interests, who briefly stabilised Romano-Britannia for 20 years, before it fell to waves of Germanic (Saxons)
and Norse warriors, in what was to become the eventual fusion of many linguistically diverse people; one that would evolve into Medieval England.

**Norman Britain and the introduction of French into English**

In 1066 the French speaking Normans (‘northern men’ originally from Scandinavia) under William I, invaded Britain and defeated England’s Saxon King Harold. This marked both the political and linguistic transition from Saxon-Britain to Norman-Britain. It marked the reintroduction of a new Romance language. French words became fused with the Germanic, Norse, Indigenous languages and what Latin that had remained (Crystal, 2008b). Yet as demonstrated by Geoffrey of Monmouth, not only was an old linguistic symbolism reintroduced, but also important stories from the former Romano-Britannia era. After several centuries, layers of the once popular narrative of a fading Roman era, was romanticised in ‘legend’ by Geoffrey of Monmouth (circa 1136). This new Norman process of interpretation is underscored in the story of Ambrosius Aurelianus, which transformed into ‘King Arthur’ and the legend of the ‘Norman knights of the round table’ (Morris, 1973).

Similar layers of Roman narratives link into the contemporary British, European, and Western mythology including the story of Saint George, (Gorgius’ from Cappadocia) whom was martyred defending Christians. Gorgius would eventually be depicted in hundreds of paintings, recalled in many European churches, but synonymous with the dragon slaying knight Saint George, who symbolises the English ideology of the crusades. This was a crucible of the diverse historical symbolism and linguistic fusion that would eventual emerged through medieval English (Crystal, 2008b). Be it the patron saint of the British, or Saint George’s Terrace, the commercial symbol of twenty-first century Perth, WA, or perhaps a rugby league team or Bank in New South Wales, the name of Saint George has an evolutionary context explored by many generations in changing contexts. Like the languages that carry the story of Gorgius, all storytellers have a history, a context, and there are stakeholders who share in part the memory of the original form as a central idea travel through various cultural twists and turns over time.

The above narrative underscores a rich historical link between all English speaking people and the influence of Roman culture, and by extension other former British colonies including the United States of America, Canada, New Zealand, Australia, South Africa, India, Hong Kong and many more, as well as the new globalisation with English becoming a major language of China (“Howard hits”, 2012;
Johnson, 2009). This linguistic fusion was common across Europe and applies to the evolution of the contemporary Italian language. New linguistic groups have fused into the existing ones and the layers of history and new languages have risen from the vernacular due to shift in military power, trade or education. However, within the reintroduction of languages or the ability of some to speak more than one language is a capacity to link to one’s history of ideas and stories. As William Shakespeare reminds his generation and ours:

Once more unto the breach, dear friends' and 'Cry ‘God for Harry, England, and Saint George! (Shakespeare, 1599)

The evolution of Italian language

Modern Italian, in keeping with the process of legends such as Ambrosius Aurelianus and Gorgius of Cappadocia, also carries an inherent history and application, similar to Shakespeare. Prior to the creation of the Unified Kingdom of Italy in 1861 (some fourteen centuries since the collapse of the Roman Empire), the Italian peninsula consisted of independent kingdoms, republics and Papal States. Its inhabitants spoke regional dialects, which were not dialects of Italian, but dialects of previously spoken languages in ancient Italy such as Latin, ‘Celtic’, Greek and Etruscan (Maiden, 1995). During the period between the third and ninth centuries various Germanic invaders such as the Goths, Lombards and Franks held power in the Italian peninsula and like in post Romano-Britannia, introduced many new words. Overwhelmingly, the Italian language emerged from its ancient Latin base, with its ancient roots in Tuscany (Maiden, 1995).

Hearder (1994) argues that the peninsula was united again by language in the eleventh century due to the writing of Saint Francis of Assisi (1181-1226) and in particular Dante Aligheri (1265-1321). In the thirteenth century Saint Francis of Assisi wrote Cantico delle Creature (Ode to Created Things). At the turn of the thirteenth and fourteenth century Dante wrote La Divina Commedia (The Devine Comedy), which became the cornerstone in the evolution of Italian as a literary language, and both of these literary works can still be read without difficulty by Italians today. Whilst the uneducated of the time conversed in Italian dialects, the educated conversed in both French and Italian. In addition, there existed a “written language common to literate Italians” (Hearder, 1994, p. 38). Importantly, Italian and its diverse cultural heritage are linked to many layers of European history including modern Britain and again by extension Australia.
Maiden (1995) argues that in the sixteenth century, due to the widening gap between spoken and written Italian, it was recognised that a *lingua volgare* (a common indigenous language) was needed to unite the people. In the nineteenth century, Manzoni (1785-1873) wrote *I Promessi Sposi* using contemporary Florentine language, which was to become Italy’s formal national language. In 1868, Manzoni was commissioned by the Ministry of Education to create modern Italian, and he proposed to have Florentine taught in all Italian schools. He also called for the creation of a modern Florentine dictionary. At the time of unification 12% of the Italian population spoke Italian. Therefore, political unification helped to promote and expand the use of Italian as unification “expanded the domains of discourse” (Maiden, 1995, p. 10).

“Dante had a greater impact on literature and establishing cultural unity than England’s Chaucer. Chaucer was born some twenty years after Dante’s death, yet no one can pretend that Chaucer’s English is readily understandable by people today” (Hearder, 1994, p. 38). However, Wheatley (2000) and Priyadarshini (2010) provide a reminder that Chaucer is known as the Father of English Literature, as he changed the course of the English language by writing in the vernacular to make it accessible to all people of the time and not only the nobility. Vernacular English is still evolving today, for example from Perth Western Australia, to Boston, Massachusetts, to Delhi India as well as Beijing China.

**Knowledge of Italian informs English speakers**

Italian is a popular choice for primary language teaching due to its relatively simple pronunciation and closeness to English phonology. (Moloney, cited in “A nation lost,” 2011)

During the Middle-Ages (476-1453), universities and the Roman Catholic Church used Latin as their common language. Latin in these two significant cultural settings still connects diverse global Western interests and Western European countries today. Therefore, with its rich Latin links, knowledge of Italian will go far in helping students, teachers and language learners to understand dimensions of the English language, as well as English history, as many English words are inclusive of Latin. Latin is the language of science. For example, in Western Australia the local Jarrah tree is known as Eucalyptus marginate; the names of the planets in the Solar System (with the exception of Earth, which has Germanic origins); as well as the names of the twelve months of the year are Latin-based and link both Roman and Greek ideas and the names of geometric shapes are derived from the Greeks (Encyclopaedia Britannica, 2011).
Internationally, Italian is also the language of music (dynamic and tempo marking), song (verse, chorus and lyric), opera (L’Orfeo, Monteverdi, 1607; Il Barbiere di Siviglia, Rossini, 1816; La Traviata, Verdi, 1853) and poetry (La Divina Commedia, Dante). Clivio and Danesi (2000) and Montagne (2007) emphasise that the syllabic structure and the fact that most words end in a vowel makes the Italian language so melodious to the ear.

The Historical Context of Italians in Australia

Boy, it make-a me sick, all the t’ing I gotta do
I can’t-a get no kicks, always got to follow the rules
Boy, it make-a me sick, just to make-a lousy bucks
Got to feel-a like a fool and mama used to say all-a time
What’s-a matter you Hey! Gotta no respect
What-a you t’ink you do? Hey! Why, you look-a so sad
It’s-a not so bad, it’s a nice-a place
Ah, shuddap-a you face

(Dolce, 1980)

Joe Dolce is an American born, Australian singer/songwriter. These lyrics are from his hit song Shaddup you face, which reached number one in 15 countries worldwide. It sold 350,000 copies in Australia and reached number one for a period of three weeks on the Australian record charts in November 1980. The song remained in the Australian Record Industry charts for eight weeks and became the most successful Australian produced song in music history for 31 years. Dolce’s song however, presents a stereotypical view of Italians and their culture as it was perceived by Anglo-Australians. It doesn’t celebrate the successes of Italy and Italians, but places prejudice upon the contadini, the working class Italians who immigrated to Australia. The song highlights the struggle Italian immigrants had with the prosody of the Australian language. The song demeaned working class Italian culture, their work ethic and family relationships, by reinforcing a tacit understanding established in the dominant Anglophone culture, how humorous their accents sounded when they attempted to speak English. It underscores the desire to have immigrants to Australia assimilate into society, rather than celebrate their positive cultural benefits and contribution to a multicultural Australia. Thirty-one year’s on, the words and perceptions of this song still ring true.

An Uncertain Australian Identity

Australia claims to be a multicultural Western nation. However, in many respects it is still uncomfortable with acknowledging its diverse origins, or greeting new people.
This denial and hesitation to welcome is a theme picked up by popular songwriters such as John Butler.

Hard working people from another land
Looking for a little more
Coming to this country for a helping hand
You know they sail their ships upon these shores
And they are lookin’ for freedom that most of us don’t appreciate
But you know man we can’t let them in
‘Cos the government’s full of racial hate

(Wiltshire-Butler, 2003, track 8) http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=r9nd3H9gkDw

John Charles Wiltshire-Butler is an American born Australian singer/songwriter and front man of the blues, roots and jam band, the John Butler Trio. Butler is an advocate of peace, environmental protection, global harmony and reconciliation. In his song *Home is where the Heart is* describes the ill treatment and prejudice immigrants face and receive from Australians and the Australian Government. While this song was written in 2003 Butler’s topic has been prevalent throughout Australia’s history.

Australia usually identifies its convict heritage with both the marginalised Irish and English classes, but in the 1800’s Italians arrested in England were also transported to the British penal colonies in New South Wales. Prior to the arrival of the first fleet (26th of January 1788), a Venetian sailor was present on Captain Cook’s *Endeavour* (1770) (Baldassar & Pesman, 2005; NSW Government, 2010; Stewart-Cristanti, 2010). In the 1840’s, Italian missionaries came to Australia (Baldassar & Pesman, 2005; Stewart-Cristanti, 2010), as well as miners such as Raffaelo Carboni who was responsible for an eyewitness account of the battle of the Eureka Stockade (Carboni, 1855). Collectively, Anglo-Australia seems to have suffered a form of cultural amnesia, especially with its long history associated with Italians, Greeks, Germans, Chinese, Afghans and others, let alone its Indigenous history. It can be conjectured that part of the poor acknowledgement of Italians, is that Australian-Italian history has been sidelined by other processes of establishing an Australian identity. The issue of identity is a factor that has not only marginalised the dimension of Italo-Australian culture at a national symbolic level, but one that has left confusion and marginalisation of their connection to Western visual art and music, therefore Australia’s denial about its classical European heritage (Merrillees, 1999).
Historical Overview of Italo-Australian Immigration and Work Culture

Had I permitted myself any innovation upon the original term, it would have been to convert it [Terra Australis] to Australia. (Flinders, 1966, p. 2)

Working the Australian landscape, and confronting the extreme of climate, floods and fire, or the emersion in the city and urban experience is a shared story of diversity. As Davies (1982) explains:

Standing at the limit of an endless ocean
Stranded like a runaway, lost at sea
City on a rainy day down in the harbour
Watching as the grey clouds shadow the bay
Looking everywhere 'cause I had to find you
This is not the way that I remember it here
Anyone will tell you it’s a prisoner island
Hidden in the summer for a million years
Great Southern Land, burned you black

So you look into the land and it will tell you a story
Story 'bout a journey ended long ago
If you listen to the motion of the wind in the mountains
Maybe you can hear them talking like I do
They’re gonna betray, they're gonna forget you
are you gonna let them take you over this way
Great Southern Land, Great Southern Land

(Davies, 1982, track 1)

The song *Great Southern Land* by Australian band Icehouse speaks of Australia as a whole, including its geographical position, its history, immigration and multiculturalism.

Kinder (2008) affirms that languages have a double-sided relationship. Languages are a means of building unity. However, they also represent difference. In order to accurately explain why foreign languages have been marginalised in the dominant English and Irish mythology as the Anglo-Australian context, the phenomenon of immigration and migration (a word derived from the Latin word *migratio*) and its role in the Australian psyche and politics, requires some historical reflection.

At the time of writing, there are 250 ancestries present in Australia, and over 200 languages (in addition to Indigenous Languages) are spoken. At the commencement of this post-graduate research in 2008, English was the most common language spoken followed by: Italian, Greek, Cantonese, Arabic, Mandarin and Vietnamese. Contemporary statistics available in 2012 indicate a shift. While English remains as the
most common Language spoken, Mandarin has surpassed Italian by .02% as Australia’s most spoken second language. However, Italian remains most common European language spoken in both Australia and WA. (Department of Immigration and Citizenship, 2009; Australian Bureau of Statistics, 2012). This data is presented comparatively below in Table 2.1

**Table 2.1: Languages in Australia**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Languages other than English</th>
<th>Australia 2011 (%)</th>
<th>Australia 2006 (%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Mandarin</td>
<td>1.6</td>
<td>1.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Italian</td>
<td>1.4</td>
<td>1.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Arabic</td>
<td>1.3</td>
<td>1.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cantonese</td>
<td>1.2</td>
<td>1.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Greek</td>
<td>1.2</td>
<td>1.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>English spoken at home</td>
<td>76.8</td>
<td>78.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Households with more than two languages spoken</td>
<td>20.4</td>
<td>17.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total Population</strong></td>
<td>21,507,717</td>
<td>19,855,287</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Languages other than English</th>
<th>Western Australia 2011 (%)</th>
<th>Western Australia 2006 (%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Italian</td>
<td>1.4</td>
<td>1.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mandarin</td>
<td>1.3</td>
<td>0.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cantonese</td>
<td>0.8</td>
<td>0.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vietnamese</td>
<td>0.7</td>
<td>0.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Arabic</td>
<td>0.5</td>
<td>0.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>English spoken at home</td>
<td>79.3</td>
<td>81.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Households with more than two languages spoken</td>
<td>17.3</td>
<td>14.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total Population</strong></td>
<td>2,239,170</td>
<td>1,959,095</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

(Department of Immigration and Citizenship, 2009; Australian Bureau of Statistics, 2012)

**Italian immigration and the ‘White Australia’ policy.**

Prior to Federation and until the middle of the twentieth century the ‘White Australia’ policy shaped Australia’s approach to immigration. The policy originated in the 1850’s when English and Irish miners in Victoria resented the industrious nature of the Chinese diggers. Later, this attention became focused on the South Sea Islanders kanakas, who were working in northern Queensland until Federation (“Al Grassby”, 2005). As Butler (2003) reinforces:
And they got the nerve to say
They be takin' our culture away
Even though our ancestors tried to do the same to the Aborigine
Seems strange to me man strange to me
Don’t it seem strange to you
That a country founded on immigration
Is so damned racist too

(Wiltshire-Butler, 2003, track 7) http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=r9nd3H9gkDw

The Immigration Act of 1901 ended the extremely exploitive practice of employment of Pacific Islanders in Australia (“Al Grassby”, 2005). However, the next source of cheap labour was found in the *contadini*, the farming peasants from Italy, who migrated to Queensland and replaced the kanakas on the sugarcane plantations (“Al Grassby”, 2005; Department of Immigration and Multicultural Affairs, 2001; Templeton, 2003).

The gold rush of the 1890’s in WA also attracted Italian labour. Due to their enterprise and austerity a willingness to work for the minimum wage, an ability to work in extreme heat and their ability to save money, Italians provided significant influence on the goldfields. However, Italians soon began to face increasing prejudice from the English and Irish workers, as they were seen as a threat to Australian union-based job descriptions (“Al Grassby”, 2005; Baldassar, 2004; Cavallaro, 2009; Iuliano, 2010; Rutland, 2006; Templeton, 2003).

The perceptual stereotype of working class Italians emphasises the southern regions of Italy. However, between 1921 and 1945 one fifth of Italian immigrants were from southern Italy, while four fifths were from the north (Baldassar, 2004; Cavallaro, 2009; Iuliano, 2010; Templeton, 2003). Italians became the subject of increased racism and prejudice due to their appearance, family nucleus, gregarious nature, cuisine and religion. Italians brought with them their ‘folk religions’ (Tolcvay, 2007; Pesman & Kevin, 1998). These celebrations of “syncretic melding of ancient pagan beliefs, magical practices and Christian liturgy” (Vecoli, cited in Tolcvay, 2007, p. 52) sustained the link with their village, values and traditions. Festivals such as saints’ days were displaced in the Australian setting, as this practice was foreign to the Australian-Catholics (Pesman & Kevin, 1998). This caused tension in the Catholic Church, as it was the first time the Anglo-Irish community had encountered such a “problem” (Tolcvay, 2007, p. 52). The Great Depression of 1929 further added to the sentiment that Italians were taking jobs away from the Australians (“Al Grassby”, 2005; Cavallaro, 2009; Department of Immigration and Multicultural Affairs, 2001; Rutland,
2006). This sentiment came to the fore in WA in the Kalgoorlie Riots of 1916, 1919 and 1934 (Iuliano, 2010).

Therefore, the early perceptions of Italian immigration was not associated with the cultural richness of opera, Renaissance visual arts or literature, but one of working class, suspicion and discounted labour, especial through the Depression Years (Baldassar, 2004; Cavallaro, 2009; Iuliano, 2010).

**Post World War II and Australian multiculturalism.**

The rise to power of Benito Mussolini in Italy (1922-1945) saw an increase in nationalistic sentiment amongst Italian immigrants in Australia (Iuliano, 2010). This continued to increase the separation between the two cultures, as language became the “instrument of division, difference…separateness, estrangement, incomprehensibility” (Kinder, 2008, p. 1). As Butler (2003) continues:

> And then they got the nerve to say
> They be takin’ our jobs away
> Even though half the jobs that were working for
> Are owned from overseas…
> And I say I don’t know what’s going on
> Don’t know what the hell to say
> The government decides on letting refugees in
> And when they get here they are detained

(Wiltshire-Butler, 2003, track 7) [http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=r9nd3H9gkDw](http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=r9nd3H9gkDw)

The entry of Italy into World War II as a member of the axis powers, which included Germany, Japan, Hungary, Romania and Bulgaria saw large scale internment of Italians in Queensland, South Australia and WA (Bosworth, 1992; Dignan, 1992; Iuliano, 2010; Peters, 2001). It was feared that Italians would join forces with the Japanese and undermine Australia from within (Gutt-Rutter, 2008; Kinder, 1992; Rutland, 2006) therefore, becoming “… the fifth column of secret Nationalist supporters operating within…” (Cresiani, 1992 in Bosworth & Ugolini, 1992, p. 11). *The Fifth Column* (Hemingway, 1937) stresses the fear and irrational behaviour, which occurs in people when they are faced with the idea of being confronted by others outside their culture.

At the outbreak of World War II, the then Prime Minister John Curtin reinforced the *White Australia policy* stating: “This country shall remain forever the home of the descendants of those people who came here…to establish…an outpost of the British race” (Department of Immigration and Citizenship, 2009). From 1945-1949, Arthur Caldwell, then Minister for Immigration used the catchphrase ‘populate or perish’ to
raise Australian awareness of the low population rate. This low rate was due to the World Wars, the decline in birth rates during the Great Depression years (1929 – early 1940’s) and the halting of the United Kingdom Assist Passage Scheme (Peters, 2001). From 1949–1966 various policies saw the government ease restrictions on the immigration of non-Europeans until finally in 1973 it was announced that ‘White Australia’ policy was to be abolished (Cavallaro, 2009).

Although World War II brought a reaction to the Italo-Australian community, just as the reaction to German-Australians was extremely severe at the outbreak of World War I (NSW Migration Heritage Centre, 2011), the Italo-Australian connection has been embedded in Australia much longer with people arriving from the Italian peninsula to Pre-Federation Australia since the late 1700’s.

Australia’s post-war concern of immigration and migrant assimilation into society also penetrated into the educational curriculum of the 1950’s where patriotism, loyalty and the history of the British Empire were the foci. The ideal Australian citizen was white, English-Irish, monocultural, monolingual and adhered to the beliefs of the dominant Catholic religion (Down, 2004).

In 1973, the Whitlam Labour Government took the gradual steps to remove race as a factor in Australia’s immigration policies (Department of Immigration and Citizenship, 2009). The minister for immigration at the time, The Honourable Albert Jamie Grassby (a Chilean Australian), began to transform the Anglo-centric Australia psyche to one that welcomed Asians and people from all parts of the globe. He initiated reforms, which encouraged multiculturalism rather than assimilation (“Al Grassby”, 2005).

With the abolition of the White Australia policy Australia began to diversify and migrants freely brought a range of religious affiliations with them (Henry, 2010). Migrants from Greece and the Middle East introduced Orthodox Christianity. Catholicism continued to grow through Italian, Polish, Hungarian and Vietnamese migrants. As a result, the panorama of cities began to change with the construction of Pentecostal and Independent Chinese churches (Henry, 2010).

Available data from the 2012 Australian census shows that across Australia:

- 3.3% of the population claim Italian ancestry.
- 0.9% of the population are Italian migrants.
- Italian is the first language spoken at home for 1.4% of the population.
Globalisation has increased immigration levels and social/cultural interactions. Citizenship requires acknowledgement of the internal diversity of contemporary society. This requires an understanding and active employment of the notions of justice and human rights (Choules & Down, 2006). At the time of writing, Australia continues to be a place of refuge for asylum seekers and immigrants. Currently, the Australian Government is reassuring the public that it will protect “us” against “them” (Choules & Down, 2006, p. 4). This highly conservative view is based upon the historic shared identity of sameness where the expectation that immigrants will “conform to the status quo and the norms of those who were the first citizens – white propertied men” (Choules & Down, 2006, p. 9).

Official education documents are constructed to “serve dominant social and political interests” (Down, 2004, p. 3). The McGaw Report (1984) and The Beazley Report (1984) are examples of this. Schooling is “a social artefact conceived of and made for deliberate human purposes” (Goodsen, 1994 cited in Down, 2004, p. 5). The Australian Curriculum (ACARA, 2010) promotes the idea that education must prepare students to be the nation’s future citizens who appreciate Australia’s cultural, social, linguistic and religious diversities. If education is to produce citizens for a globalised world then students’ need to understand and employ the notions of justice and human rights (ACARA, 2010; Crabbe, 2007b; 2008). There appears to be inconsistencies between the ‘social and political interests’ (Down, 2004, p. 3) of ACARA and the Australian Government. ACARA is promoting the global idea of multiculturalism, whilst the Australian Government remains congealed in the 1950’s idea of assimilation (Crabbe, 2007b; 2008).

Italian and Italians in Western Australia

Italians in Australia brought local or regional allegiances and loyalties with them and from them wove the fabric of their new identity in Australia. (Kinder, 1992 in Bosworth & Ugolini, 1992, p. 280)

Baldassar (2004) underscores the importance of the learning of Italian in WA’s schools by stating that Italians are one of the oldest and largest non-English speaking migrant groups in Australia. Since 1980, Italian has been Australia’s preferred second language and the most widely used community languages in WA. This is reaffirmed in the recent census data presented in Table 2.1, p. 31 (Australian Bureau of Statistics (2012).
The Australian Bureau of Statistics (2007) shows that in Perth:

- 29,509 people speak Italian as a second language.
- There are 20,934 Italian migrants.
- 83,703 people claim Italian ancestry.
- Italian is the first language spoken at home for 14,215 people.
- There are 18,700 people who were born in Italy.

Italians have contributed to the growth and development of WA in many areas including: gastronomy, entertainment, building, mining, farming, substantive gardening, viticulture and trade and commerce (Baldassar, 2004; Baldassar & Pesman, 2005; Iuliano, 2010; Peters, 1992; Stefanoni, 1992). They have made and continue to make significant contributions in both WA and Australian political, cultural, economic and social tapestries (Baldassar, 2004; Iuliano, 2010; Peters, 1992; Stefanoni, 1992). At the time of writing both The Right Honourable Lord Mayor of Perth Lisa Scaffidi and the Deputy Lord Mayor of Perth John Tognolini, have Italian ancestry. On the sporting field, names like Ron Barassi (AFL), David Campese (Rugby Union) and Mark Bresciano (Football) are famous. In the Arts, singers such as Natalie Imbruglia, Kate Ceberano and Tina Arena have contributed to the success of the Australian music industry, as have Greta Scacchi, Anthony La Paglia and Paul Mercurio in film. Anthony Albanese, Morris Iemma and Sophie Mirabella are prominent political figures. In WA, the Re, Torre, Saraceni, D’Orsogna, Princi and Terranova families have made significant contributions to gastronomy, meat and bread making industries. In Perth, restaurants and cafes, such as Pisconieri’s, La Tosca, The Romany, and Roma Restaurant have become favourite eateries of generations (Iuliano, 2010).

Italians living in Australia during the early years of Australia faced prejudice, were treated as inferiors, seen as a threat, misunderstood, ridiculed and despised by the Anglo-Australians (Dolce, 1980; Iuliano, 2010). Yet, they contributed by working hard, facing their hardships whilst always maintaining their dignity and pride (Iuliano, 2010; Kahan-Guidi & Weiss, 1989; Kinder, 1992; Stewart-Cristanti, 2010; Walsh, 1993; Zunini, 1997). The learning of Italian and of any language is not about learning how to place an order at a restaurant. It is about embracing, celebrating and exploring another language, its people and its culture. It is about gaining intra-cultural understandings of one’s own culture and an intercultural understanding of others (Scarino & Crichton, 2007).
The Cassamarca Foundation

The Cassamarca Foundation is a private philanthropist organisation based in the northern Italian city of Treviso. Its aim is to promote Italian, its culture and its neo-Latin values in countries with a high ratio of Italian immigrants. Post-World War II immigration saw a large influx of Italians to Australia and since the 1950’s Italian has been the second most spoken language in Australia after English (Hewett & Robb, 2007). This has helped develop close ties between the Cassamarca Foundation and Australia. The Cassamarca Foundation has gifted 28.5 million dollars (900,000 Euros per year) over a 13-year period to ensure that the study of Italian continued in Australia at tertiary level. Due to the forward thinking of Associate Professor Loretta Baldassar in securing this funding, the Foundation has bestowed University of Western Australia (UWA) the privilege of becoming the Australasian Centre for Italian Studies (ACIS) with Associate Professor Baldassar as its Chair. The Foundation has played an important role in the positive increase in student numbers in tertiary level study of Italian, developing Italian Studies academics, teaching and resourcing, research, and collaborative research (Robson, Baldassar & Campbell-Fraser, 2004).

Investigation into Italian language courses revealed that only two out of five universities in WA offer Italian. These are the UWA and The University of Notre Dame. Further investigation revealed that only nine out of Australia’s 39 major universities offer Italian studies. These are: the UWA; Swinburne University; the University of Melbourne; the University of Sydney; the University of the Sunshine Coast; Flinders University; Monash University; Griffith University and the University of South Australia (Hewett & Robb, 2007).

Despite the evidence of limited access, Italian language studies at tertiary level have prospered while other languages have declined (Hewett & Robb, 2007). This positive growth in Italian studies at tertiary level can be attributed to the funding of the Cassamarca Foundation. However, this example by default underscores the Australian Government’s attitude towards the study of Languages, and how funding cuts to tertiary institutions contribute to the marginalisation of a discipline. It seems that Australian universities and other educational institutions must look offshore to finance their courses as compensation for a lack of government funding (Hewett & Robb, 2007).

The healthy growth of tertiary Italian Studies clearly demonstrates the current crisis in other tertiary language studies is due to a lack funding and resources. This is a sad state of affairs. In a multicultural country like Australia, and in the current climate
of globalisation, the need for communication and understanding across cultures in more
important than at any time in our history (Baldassar, cited in Hewett & Robb, 2007).

**Australian Education and Confusion about its Western Heritage**

Since *the Melbourne Declaration* (2008) and the subsequent development of the
Australian Curriculum (ACARA, 2010), issues relating to a consensus of what is ‘the
Australian identity’ have continued to surface (“National curriculum,” 2007; “Rudd to
scrap,” 2008; “Black armband,” 2010; “Howard hits,” 2012). This was underscored
with the release of the *Asian Century White Paper* on the 29th October, 2012 (Gillard,
2012).

Issues of identity associated with colonial and post-colonial Australia are well
documented, be it the Irish, German or Italian immigrants (Baldassar, 2004; Baldassar &
Pesman, 2005; Cresiani, 1992; Dignan, 1992; Iuliano, 2010; Kinder, 1992; NSW
Migration Heritage Centre, 2011). With many diverse people entering the Australian
context, the issue of language, curriculum and its Western identity establish polemic
tensions within competing interest groups. In this research the issue of Italian identity is
emphasised, as well as the politics of identity relating to how Australia values both the
role of Italian as a second language and the role of Music in primary schools. In
contrast, former Prime Minister Rudd’s, current Prime Minister Gillard’s and current
Federal Opposition leader, Honourable Mr Tony Abbott’s preference for Mandarin and
other Asian languages, as an emerging second language option is a poignant example of
Within any language spoken there exists a historical, cultural and political value system
(Kinder, 2008). Often the understanding is tacit, but often underneath this acceptance is
a historical process of inclusion and exclusion. This researcher is not in denial of the
essential importance of Asian languages, culture, history, arts or economics, but she
reinforces the need for a more evidence-based debate with respect to languages spoken
in Australia.

From a historical perspective the identity debate is not new. It was extremely
active well prior to Australia’s Federation. For example, during the 1870s and 1880s,
British Prime Minister Benjamin Disraeli, saw the rise Australian republicanism as a
concern (less than 100 years after Britain losing its American colonies). The fiftieth
anniversary of Queen Victoria in 1887 was awash with Empire sentimentality, but it
was also a time of republican union rhetoric calling for Australian independence.
During the 1990s, then Prime Minister Keating believed strongly in an independent Australian identity removed from the symbolism of the House of Windsor. He continued the trend of turning Australia's focus away from what some saw as traditional Western ties with Britain, America and Europe towards its Asian neighbours, the new emerging economic power in the world (Holden, circa 1998-2000). Allied with Keating's focus on a new cultural shift was republicanism and strong support for the Arts, demonstrated by the "Creative Nation" statement of October 1994 (Holden, circa 1998-2000).

Through the latter years of the twentieth century with the transition from the Keating to Howard Governments, the issue of an Australian Republic persisted. At a referendum on November 6, 1999, “The republic was defeated by a national average of 54.87% of electoral votes” (“Australia votes” [Para. 1], 2012).

However, whether a perception of Keating’s estrangement of the British colonial history in Australia is an obvious political statement shared across both sides of politics today, it is important that within the Australian Curriculum (ACARA, 2010) teachers and students have the opportunity to deconstruct appreciations of what is meant by Australia, it’s obvious links to Western civilisation and the creation of the Australian identity. It is important that all students have an opportunity to explore cultural, historical and linguistic links in the construction of the sense of becoming a multifaceted Australian.

The current curriculum and political disquiet is how to acknowledge the challenges faced in reaching a consensus of a sense of Australia’s identity (“National curriculum,” 2007; “Rudd to scrap,” 2008; “Black armband,” 2010; “Howard hits,” 2012). The scope of identity in 2012 is even more complex embracing global post-modern British, American and diverse European links. In 2008, the identity debate in Australia included Rudd’s Apology to Indigenous Australia: “That today we honour the Indigenous peoples of this land, the oldest continuing cultures in human history. We reflect on their past mistreatment” (Kevin Rudd’s, 2008, p.1).

This process of Indigenous reconciliation is balanced with the diversity of a multicultural Australia, including a growing pragmatism that sees essential economic links to Asia, especially China, India, Indonesia, Korea, Malaysia, Vietnam, Japan and others in the region continues to surface in the national curriculum debate. However, in the process of constructing a more contemporary expression of identity is it necessary to audit what already exists?
Australia has obvious links to British history, alongside an essential ancient Indigenous narrative. However, these narratives will continue to confront competition in the curriculum for a British/Australian voice. Former Prime Minister Howard underscored this issue of the selective narrative when he said: “We are robbing children of their cultural heritage (Former Prime Minister, John Howard cited in “National Curriculum”, 2007). “…my fear is that if the curriculum remains unamended young Australians will be denied proper knowledge of our nation’s history” (Howard hits,” 2012, Para. 3). Former Prime Minister Howard reminds us that “the language we speak is the Lingua Franca of Asia” (“Howard hits,” 2012) and of the “historic influence the Judaeo Christian ethic has had in shaping Australian society” (Howard hits,” 2012). Others also voice a similar concern claiming that if future generations are to become global citizens; they need first to be conscious of themselves and their links to a complex Western heritage before they can become conscious of other emerging contexts and influences (Scarino and Crichton, 2007). Therefore, an authentic and healthy understanding of a diversity in Australian identity is one that includes its many historical and cultural dimensions, not one that is selective or closed, and by exclusion in political denial, or a dominance of the curriculum by powerful stakeholders.

The Western narrative is complex, but incomplete without Roman and Greek history, culture and politics. In particular, British, American, Canadian and Australian narratives are incomplete without Roman or Italian references. For example, the Australian education system, like the United States and Canada, has many links to its original British roots. But behind much of this former extension of the British Empire is also a similar history of republican rhetoric. In the case of the United States, a War of Independence and conflicts with Mexico that are still being worked through today. In the United States the second language is Spanish (U.S. Census Bureau, 2012), in Canada it is French (Lachapell & Lepage, 2006) and in contemporary Australia the most common European language spoken is Italian, although prior to World War One it was German (NSW Migration Heritage Centre, 2011). To exclude Spanish in the United States or French in Canada would create a political storm.

Curriculum and uncertainty

Currently, the Australian Primary Principals Association (APPA), as well as ACARA, espouse that Mathematics, English, Science and History are the core subjects that must be taught in Australian schools (Hall, 2012). However, each of the seven learning areas including the Arts and Languages in the new Australian Curriculum are
all equally important as one another, but the debate confuses the issues. It could be that the confusion represents a level of public **meta-history**, a tacit public sensitivity expressed as the collective uncertainty of Australian identity (Donnelly, 2010).

The teaching of foreign languages currently exists in a culture dominated by English, which does not seem to have fully realised its historical roots. In Western curricula, there is a fundamental reality, which underscores disciplines as having originated in either Latin (Roman), Greek, or German foundations (Feeman Butts, 1955; Popewitz, Franklin & Pereyra, 2001). Therefore, it is unclear why two national authorities could judge one learning area to be more important than another (APPA, 2007; ACARA, 2011). In other parts of the world, for example, Finland, France, Germany, Italy and Denmark, the issue of teaching other languages and the value of the Arts in education is not a high level political issue as both learning areas are considered to be of equal importance within the curriculum (EACEA, 2008; 2009). **OECD** assessments reveal that European countries also outperform Australia in the areas English, Mathematics and Science (Thomson, De Bortoli, Nicholas, Hillman & Buckley, 2009).

It appears that ACARA and the APPA are ignoring the classical connections of Australia to its recent British and former Romano-Britannia connections, as well as the more than twelve centuries of the Roman influence upon Western Europe (Ferguson, 2011; “Howard hits,” 2012), as well as the world as a global entity driven by part of this meta-history (“Languages boost,” 2011; “Howard hits,” 2012). It also implies uncertainty about the role of the Arts in education as an authentic connection to global, national, communal and individual identity (Ewing, 2010).

The Australian press continually reflects the lack of clarity in the National Curriculum debate. The Australian newspaper (2010) reported:

> The History Teachers Association of Australia has joined the chorus of concerns raised in recent weeks by professional and academic geographers, scientists, visual artists and principals that the rush to finish the curriculum by the end of the year is compromising the quality of courses.

> The national curriculum was originally intended to provide a broad framework, setting a common core of essential knowledge for each subject that all students should learn, no matter where they attend school.

> But in the process of consultation and writing, ACARA has struggled to determine the core knowledge and expanded the breadth of topics
covered, prompting one insider to describe the curriculum this week as a "camel" - a horse designed by committee. ("History course," 2010)

Given the current confusion, it is important to offer some perspective upon the Italo-Australian context, especially the underlying perceptions of class and working-class culture that confronts Australia’s history. Debate regarding foreign labour, skills shortages and workplace has the potential to carry over into the profession of teaching and policy.

**Economic reasons for teaching Italian**

Worldwide, Italian is spoken by 60,231,921 people in Italy, 23,000 people in the Republic of San Marino, 400,000 people in Switzerland, 1.3 million people across Europe and by six million people in North and South America (Australian Bureau of Statistics, 2007).

The Department of Foreign Affairs and Trade (2010) notes that Italy is the seventh largest economy in the world, a major member of the **European Union (EU)**, a member of the G20 and a member of the Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development (OECD) (The Department of Foreign Affairs and Trade, 2010). Italy is Australia’s fifth largest export market in the EU and Australia’s fourteenth ranked trading partner. By comparison, Australia is Italy’s fifteenth largest export market outside the European Union and its thirtieth ranked trade partner. Italy is also the fifteenth largest direct investor in Australia. Australia and Italy also have a number of bilateral agreements in areas of culture, taxation, air services, economic and commercial cooperation, reciprocal social security, health care benefits and film co-production. Italy and Australia have also signed a number of Memoranda of Understanding (MOU) in science and technology co-operation, defence material and industry, motor vehicle safety certification, sports co-operation, game meats exports and trade co-operation (The Department of Foreign Affairs and Trade, 2010).

Italy is a member of both the Eurozone and the European Union and during the Global Financial Crisis (2007-2012) Italy has fallen from being the seventh largest economy (2010) to ninth (2012) and Australia has moved up to occupy the twelfth position. It is acknowledged the European Union is the world’s largest economy, followed by the United States, China and then Japan. (Central Intelligence Agency, 2012).

ACARA (2011a) affirms, “languages benefits individual’s capacities in: business, trade, science, law, education, tourism, diplomacy international relations, health and the
arts” (ACARA, 2011a, p. 10). This statement highlights an inconsistency between the reality and what is currently occurring in education.

**Education**

Throughout the centuries, the basic educational ideologies and themes of educators and philosophers remain to the present day (Binder, 1970, Graves, 2006; Peltzman, 1998). For example, Cicero and Quintilian (Ancient Rome), Comenius (Sixteenth Century), Locke (Seventeenth Century), Rousseau and Pestalozzi (Eighteenth Century), Froebel, Herbart and Spencer (Nineteenth Century), as well as Dewey (Twentieth Century) highlight common principles, which include:

- Education is to be related to life experiences and the future;
- A well-rounded education includes the study of the liberal Arts and of second languages;
- The importance of memory and learning through the senses;
- The need to pay attention to child’s interests and needs; and,
- The importance of utilising psychology to assist the child in developing to capacity.

Ferguson (2011) calls for a return to traditional education, where the great books of Shakespeare are at the foundation. If these texts are taught in schools, it will do much to reinstate lost faith in the rich ancestries passed down through generations. This loss of faith is one of the greatest dangers, which faces the fabric of modern Western societies (Ferguson, 2011).

Perhaps relativism is a problem that beholds much of our educational discourse, a discourse that is sometimes reflected in popular music:

And I don’t know what’s going on  
Don’t know the reason why  
We live in an educated so called democracy  
Where everybody decides to believe in lies

(Wiltshire-Butler, 2003, track 7) [http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=r9nd3H9gkDw](http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=r9nd3H9gkDw)

**Australian Curriculum and Reporting Authority (ACARA) and the Melbourne Declaration**

*The Hobart Declaration* (MCEETYA, 1989) and *The Adelaide Declaration* (MCEETYA, 1999) encouraged a unified commitment by all State Education Ministers to provide a high quality curriculum that embraces the changing demands of the
globalised world. In 2008, all Australian State Governments agreed to a National Curriculum, which was to be guided by the goals of the *Melbourne Declaration*.

*The Melbourne Declaration* emphasises the importance of knowledge, skills and understanding of learning areas, general capabilities and cross-curriculum priorities as the basis for a curriculum designed to support twenty-first century learning. (ACARA, 2010, p. 4)

It is the responsibility of all educational stakeholders to ensure that these goals are achieved. These two goals are:

1. Australian schooling promotes equality and excellence.
2. All young Australian become;
   - Successful learners;
   - Confident and creative individuals; and
   - Active and informed citizens. (MCEETYA, 2008, p. 7)

The result of this national collaboration was The Australian Curriculum, Assessment and Reporting Authority (ACARA), with the role of developing a ‘National Curriculum’ for Australia. The Australian Curriculum describes what is to be taught and the expected learning outcomes at every years of schooling. It consists of ten general capabilities and three cross-curricula dimensions to be developed in each Learning Areas. These are presented below in Table 2.2.

**Table 2.2: General capabilities and cross-curricula dimensions of the National Curriculum**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>The National Curriculum’s ten general capabilities</th>
<th>The National Curriculum’s three cross-curricula dimensions</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Literacy</td>
<td>1. Indigenous history and culture</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Numeracy</td>
<td>2. Asia and Australia’s engagement with Asia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Information Communication and Technology (ICT)</td>
<td>3. Sustainability</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Thinking skills</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Ethical behaviour</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Creativity</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. Self-management</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. Team work</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9. Intercultural understanding</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10. Social competence</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The seven Learning Areas in The National Curriculum of Australia (2011) are to be introduced to schools in three phases. These are presented below in Table 2.3.
**Table 2.3: Phases and Learning Areas of the National Curriculum**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Phases of The National Curriculum of Australia</th>
<th>Learning Areas to be Introduced</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Phase One:</td>
<td>English</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Mathematics</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Science</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Humanities and Social Sciences: History</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Phase Two:</td>
<td>Arts (dance, drama, media arts, music, visual arts)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Languages</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Humanities and Social Sciences: Geography</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Phase Three:</td>
<td>Health and Physical Education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Design and Technology</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>ICT</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Humanities and Social Sciences: Economics and business, civics and citizenship</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

ACARA anticipated a complete nationwide implementation of the *K-10 Australian Curriculum* by 2013, with 2011 being a pilot year. However, the lengthy process of developing student reporting standards has resulted in WA’s then Minister for Education, Dr Elizabeth Constable stating that: “roll out is now expected to start in 2013” (“Male teachers,” 2011). On the 29th June, 2012, Mr Peter Collier was sworn in as WA’s new Minister for Education, replacing Dr Elizabeth Constable who will be retiring from politics in 2013. The *Shape of the Australian Curriculum Paper* (ACARA, 2010), states that education plays an important part in forming young people who will take the responsibility for Australia in the future. *The Shape Paper* (2010) further explains that there is a need for nurturing appreciation and respect in young people as they assist in the development of global citizenship and cultural diversity and that effective education must address the intellectual, personal, social and economic development of young Australians.

However, ACARA is continually over-extended, to the point of marginalising the notion of any shape of the intended curricula. Therefore, Australia as an enclave of the Western political sphere, traditionally influenced by Greek and Roman civilisation and Britain and America in contemporary times, tends to drown in the process of the demands of becoming a globalised society in the Asian economic transformation, as discussed by Ferguson (2011). The *History Shape Paper* (2009), states that the curriculum will focus on the history of Asia and of Australia. *The Draft Languages Shape Paper*(2011a) states that the curriculum will focus on the teaching and learning of Asian, Aboriginal and Torres Strait Island languages. European languages are not mentioned in the document. There is a suggestion that the initial languages to be ‘rolled
out’ in Australian primary schools will be Mandarin and Italian. These two languages have been chosen based on Australia’s growing economic links with China and that Italian has the largest number of enrolments (“A nation lost,” 2011; Kelly, 2012; Gillard, 2012; “Gillard’s Asia,” 2012), rather than from ACARA’s suggested list of priority languages. However, data from the 2011 census shows that Italian is the most widely used European language in Australia after English, while Mandarin is the most popular Asian language (Australian Bureau of Statistics, 2012).

The notion of drowning in the process of accommodating new economic and political demands comes at a cost. For example, ‘indicative time allocation’ for the teaching and learning of Languages is stated in ACARA documentation (2009; 2010; 2011), but how this time is to be allocated rests at school level. Lo Bianco (“Languages boost,” 2011) believes that a crisis exists in language learning if students are to become fluent in one of the four priority languages of Japanese, Mandarin, Korean and Indonesian. Following the release of the Asian Century White Paper (2012) Hindi has replaced Korean as a priority Asian language (“Teacher blow,” 2012). He states: “For a language like Chinese, you need more than 2000 hours for a beginner to attain fluency”. This supports the Liberal and National Parties’ (Federal Opposition) viewpoint that the National Curriculum overlooks Australia’s British background, as well as its European heritage in favour of Asian perspectives (“Black armband,” 2010; “Howard hits,” 2012). In a televised interview former Prime Minister John Howard (2011) reinforced that values provide the strength in any alliance. “That is why we will always be closer to the United States” (Hawke, 2011a). During U.S. President Obama’s visit to Australia in November 2011 as a guest of Prime Minister Julia Gillard, his rhetoric highlighted tacit connections of deeply rooted values forged over a 60-year alliance. In his address to the Australian Parliament, President Obama stated that the US/Australian Alliance remains strong due to the sharing of similar values between the two countries. These values include: peacekeeping, humanitarian, human rights, freedom of speech, freedom of worship and freedom of the press. “In each countries histories we see so much of ourselves… common historical tapestries” (Obama, cited in Malone, 2011). Both Prime Minister Gillard, as well as the Leader of the Opposition, The Honourable Mr Tony Abbott, endorsed the political rhetoric of the President. Both welcomed the United States’ commitment to more military personnel being stationed in Darwin. The tacit military threat of China is also Australia’s most significant export market (Hawker, 2011).
Therefore, what emerges is a contradiction in part of the competing narratives in the Australian curricula debate. For example, ACARA’s (2011a; 2011b) emphasis on Asian history and languages can be deemed counter to the significant political security rhetoric. This contradiction sees the marginalisation of European languages in favour of Asian languages (Gillard, 2012; “Gillard’s Asia,” 2012”). Ferguson (2011) would describe this as a process of civilisation in transition, where ACARA is placing the economic links to Asia above Australia’s traditional Western meta-history. The issue of what should be in the national curriculum is marginalising established narratives. Whether it be the inclusion of Indigenous Australian nations, Asian, Greco-Roman or English-Irish narratives, the curriculum (Latin for race course) is a claim for extra time for other narratives that define the tensions of what is an active Australian story (“Howard hits, “2012).

The battle for curricula time includes competition within the Arts. The Shape Paper for the Arts (2011c) states that all students will study all five Arts subjects of Dance, Drama, Media Arts, Music and Visual Arts. It acknowledges that the Arts help to improve general capabilities in Literacy, Numeracy, ICT, Critical and creative thinking, Ethical behaviour, Personal and social competence and Intercultural understanding (ACARAc, p. 19).

Like Languages, while it nominates recommended hours of Arts learning across each band of schooling, time allocation and decisions on how the Arts programmes are to be delivered still remains a school-based decision. Music makes up one fifth of the Arts curriculum and one thirty-fifth of the entire curriculum. This marginalisation is clear to see (Gattenhoff, 2009).

Currently, the Department of Education of Western Australia (DoE WA) specifies that 50% of teaching-learning time needs to be dedicated to literacy and numeracy. In addition, the DoE WA says that students must also receive two hours of Physical Education each week (Conversation with a DoE WA principal, September, 2011). The remaining time is divided amongst the other learning areas. Currently, the learning of Languages is not mandated in WA, New South Wales, Tasmania or the Northern Territory (“A nation lost,” 2011). Conversation with a DoE WA Principal (September, 2011) provided further evidence of time constraints faced and insight into the current lack of uniform timetabling, restrictions of staffing formulas, and political wrangling within DoE WA, which hinder timetabling processes.
At the time of writing, ACARA has released nominal teaching hours for Phases One and Two of the curriculum. These are presented in the Tables 2.4 and 2.5a; b; c below.

**Table 2.4: Phase One**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Years K - 2</th>
<th>Years 3-6</th>
<th>Year 7</th>
<th>Years 8-10</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>English</td>
<td>7 hours/week</td>
<td>6 hours/week</td>
<td>4 hours/week</td>
<td>4 hours/week</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mathematics</td>
<td>5 hours/week</td>
<td>5 hours/week</td>
<td>4 hours/week</td>
<td>4 hours/week</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Science</td>
<td>1 hours/week</td>
<td>2 hours/week</td>
<td>3 hours/week</td>
<td>4 hours/week</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>History</td>
<td>½ hours/week</td>
<td>1 hours/week</td>
<td>2 hours/week</td>
<td>2 hours/week</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Table 2.5a: Phase Two**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Years K-2</th>
<th>Years 3-4</th>
<th>Years 5-6</th>
<th>Years 7-8</th>
<th>Years 9-10</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>The Arts</strong></td>
<td>120 hours across bands</td>
<td>100 hours across bands</td>
<td>100 hours across bands</td>
<td>160 hours across bands</td>
<td>160 hours across bands</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1 hour/week</td>
<td>1 hour 15 minutes/week</td>
<td>1 hour 15 minutes/week</td>
<td>2 hours/week</td>
<td>2 hours/week</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Table 2.5b: Phase Two**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Years K-6</th>
<th>Years 7-8</th>
<th>Years 9-10</th>
<th>Years 11-12</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Languages</strong></td>
<td>300-400 hours across bands</td>
<td>130 – 160 hours across bands</td>
<td>130 - 160 hours across bands</td>
<td>200-240 hours across bands</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1 hour - 1 hour 10 minutes/week</td>
<td>1 hour 40 minutes - 2 hours/week</td>
<td>1 hour 40 minutes - 2 hours/week</td>
<td>2 hours 30 minutes - 3 hours/week</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Table 2.5c: Phase Two**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Years K-2</th>
<th>Years 3-4</th>
<th>Years 5-6</th>
<th>Years 7-10</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Geography</strong></td>
<td>16 – 20 hours/year</td>
<td>30 – 40 hours/year</td>
<td>30 – 40 hours/year</td>
<td>50 – 60 hours/year</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>15 minutes – 30 minutes/week</td>
<td>40 minutes – 1 hour/week</td>
<td>40 minutes – 1 hour/week</td>
<td>60 – 75 minutes/week</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The researcher questions whether ACARA is aware of the further time constraints this places on an already crowded curriculum. With Languages not being mandatory in four of Australia’s states and territories, is ACARA in denial about the future of this learning area? Does ACARA consider that these nominal time allocations will help strengthen the position of Languages in the curriculum? The researcher believes the opposite will occur. The nominal time allocated to the Arts indicates just how this learning area has been marginalised. There are five arts subjects competing for equity in one allocation of time.

Further marginalisation of the Arts and Languages is evident as indicative teaching times are given in hours across year bands rather than in specific hours per
week as in Phase One. Also, in Languages, all years of primary schooling have been grouped together. The weekly breakdown of times is evident in the Phase Two timetables and has been provided by the researcher. These are not presented in the ACARA documents. It is left to principals to solve what these nominal times look like in a weekly timetable.

Any curriculum through history would assume to reflect the dominant ideology of the day (Down, 1993). The Asia Century White Paper (Gillard, 2012) is evidence of this. Educational curriculum changes throughout the centuries are due to many factors (Russell, 2005). Western society, its philosophy, its theological transformations and political initiatives is built upon the work of many including the classical works of Pythagoras, Socrates, Plato, Archimedes and Aristotle (Ferguson, 2011). In the many centuries that followed, Dante Alighieri, Leonardo da Vinci, Michelangelo, Galileo Galilei, Alessandro Volta, Gugliemo Marconi, Giuseppe Verdi and Luciano Pavarotti, have contributed significantly in the areas of science, astronomy, mathematics, philosophy, art, music and literature (Ferguson, 2011), along with Geoffrey Chaucer and William Shakespeare. All have made significant contributions to Western society (Long, 2004). In addition, the Western legal system is based on Justinian law (Encyclopaedia Britannica, 2012).

Alongside these Roman and British contributions, the 11,000 years of dynasties and advanced culture from China cannot be ignored. Just like Rome, China has influenced and reshaped technologies throughout the centuries in many areas including science, philosophy, arts, literature and architecture. Ancient China has provided modern civilisation with four of the greatest inventions. These are paper, the printing press, gunpowder and the compass (Embassy of the People’s Republic of China in the People’s Republic of South Africa, 2004). Other contributions include porcelain, silk, tea and fireworks. This enormous cultural reality was showcased to the world in 2008 when Beijing hosted the Olympic Games. This awareness will continue as China is a significant part of the Australian and global socio-political world (Gillard, 2012; “Gillard’s Asia,” 2012).

In respect to contemporary Australia and the collective memory of essential narratives, what needs to be carefully explored is the shift in Australian identity and ideology. The contemporary Australian population is made up of a number of ethnic groups, including European (of which Italy is part of), British, Chinese, Indian, Arab, Muslim, South-East Asian, African and Australian Indigenous cultures. Each one has a
complexity that deserves to be celebrated. Each has an artistic richness that must also be acknowledged. For example:

- Indigenous Australian musician Geoffrey Gurrumul Yunupingu;  
  [http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=x8-YMpYbRqY](http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=x8-YMpYbRqY)
- Italy’s singers Luciano Pavarotti, Eros Ramazzotti and Andrea Bocelli;
- India’s Bollywood film industry;
- Saudi Arabian musician, Mohammad Abdu; and,
- Africa’s cultural performers Umoja.

All of the above artists successfully infuse diverse cultural traditions within contemporary society, whilst maintaining the integrity of a personal national heritage within that of ‘another’. The music and language of these artists has a capacity to transcend cultural boundaries. This highlights the extensive competition that faces all of Australia’s diverse cultural groups and effort required for inclusion in the contemporary Australian Curriculum.

If the Australian Curriculum debate is deconstructed as found in the ACARA documents, as well as the APPA (2007) statements, there is evidence of confusion and perhaps denial of aspects of Australia’s heritage. In previous generations, it was Indigenous culture and history that was marginalised. In respect to colonial and post-colonial narratives, it is Australian people with languages other than English such as the Italians of Queensland, the German communities of South Australia and others where the competition between stories continues. In the memory of these people Australia must recognise its cultural heritage. Often what transpires is that disciplines such as the Arts lose a voice due to the politics of status as expressed as a percentage of time in the curriculum (Eisner, 1978, cited in Lummis, 1986). The outcome is a cultural reproduction of hegemonic interests (Down, 1993), where disciplinary power is linked directly to the amount of time allocated. Therefore, the will to control the time in the curriculum often marginalises those who have contributed so much to Australian or Western society. The outcome is often the creature of a system that propagates a second-rate culture (“Arts funding,” 2010; Gattenhoff, 2009).

Garrett and Crean (2011), state that the Arts are at the heart of the new Australian Curriculum. However, whilst the Federal Government/s pledge their allegiance to The Arts, when budgets need to be cut, The Arts is the first to feel the loss of time and money (“Arts funding,” 2010). Garrett states, “It’s important that every kid in Australia...has the opportunity to engage in the Arts” (Garrett and Crean, 2011). Prior
to becoming a member of the Australian Labour Party and the Minister for Education at the time of writing, Peter Garrett was singer and songwriter of the band ‘Midnight Oil’. It would appear that what he wrote in his many song lyrics are a true and accurate reflection on what is currently happening and what needs to occur in education today.

Cos everything that’s near and dear is old and in the way. Emergency has gone, apathy rolling on. Time to take a stand. Redneck wonderland. (Hirst & Moginie, 1998, track 1) http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=LXBHRzlOGAg&ob=av2e

We follow in the steps on our ancestry and that cannot be broken. (Hirst, Moginie & Garrett, 1987, track 6) http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=16bFBzx7I_0

How can we sleep while our beds are burning? (Hirst, Moginie & Garrett, 1987, track 1) http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=ejorQVy3m8E&ob=av2e
CHAPTER II: SECTION TWO

The Role of Language and Music in the Evolution of Human Cognition and Education

I’m ahead, I’m a man
I’m the first mammal to wear pants, yeah
I’m at peace, with my lust
I can kill ‘cause in God I trust, yeah
It’s evolution baby

(Vedder & Gossard, 1998, track 7)
http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=aDaOgu2CQtI&ob=av2e

The Pearl Jam song Do the Evolution was written by Eddie Vedder (singer) and Stone Gossard (guitarist). The ideas in the novel Ishmael (Quinn, 1992) are expressed in this song. It deconstructs the idea that humans are the ‘pinnacle of biological evolution’ proposing that human supremacy is a cultural myth. In an interview with Dave Marsh (1998) Vedder states:

… you have this number line that goes like this [hands wide apart]. And that we're about to celebrate the year 2000, which is this [holds hands less than one inch apart]. So here's this number line; here's what we know and celebrate. This book is a conversation with a man and an ape. And the ape really has it all together. He kinda knows the differences between him and the man, and points out how slight they are, and it creates an easy analogy for what man has done, thinking that they were the end-all. That man is the end-all thing on this earth. That the earth was around even so much longer before the three million years. Fifty million years of sharks and all these living things. Then man comes out of the muck, and three million years later he's standing, and now he's controlling everything and killing it. Just in the last hundred! Which is just a speck on this line. So what are we doin' here? This is just a good reminder... (Marsh, 1998, p. 11)

Human Evolution and Music

Music’s interconnection with society can be seen throughout history. Every known culture on the earth has music. Music seems to be one of the most basic human actions. (O’Donnell, 1999, p. 1)

Physics explains that all matter is part of an energy and change context, displaying vibrations across all states of matter be it solid, liquid or gas. Even though humans perceive phenomena as solids, physicists state that what they are actually sensing are fluid vibrations organised in sufficiently gross frequencies to form perceptions of solid matter (Green, cited in Mannes & Smilow, 2009; Werner, 1996). Science describes an energy filled universe 13.7 billion years old (Renouf, 2011) and looking back through
time with radio telescopes, scientists are capable of seeing the history of the ‘cosmic vibration’. For example, scientists have described black holes pitched at Bb, 57 octaves lower than that audible to humans (Green, cited in Mannes and Smilow, 2009).

What underscores human auditory perception, as well as the assessment of such phenomena, is the notion of the audible spectra of ‘vibration’ (Werner, 1996). For the human ear, a range of vibrations is experienced as sound, which is also produced by the human voice or by instruments within a patterned structure. This is appreciated and communicated as music. Even in physics, the metaphor of music is used to describe the most theoretical components of matter. This theory is called the ‘String Theory’ (Greene, cited in Mannes & Simlow, 2009); a theory based on the notion that matter is composed of energy bundles of vibrational sub-atomic systems.

**Human evolution and communication**

Admire me, admire my home
Admire my son, admire my clone

(Vedder & Gossard, 1998, track 7)

http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=aDaOgu2CQtI&ob=av2e

Many species display levels of a communication, however, this level of communication differs greatly to human language. For example, simple amoebas communicate at a very basic level by releasing a chemical discharge. Many insects communicate using body language such as touch, sound and smell. Bees dance when nectar is found. Bats, whales and dolphins use echolocation to communicate (Cocroft & Rodriguez, 2005; Endler, 1993). Music and song is not unique to humans, but the extent and level of sophistication is one of the features that make humans unique (O’Neil, 2006). For example, whales use sound to communicate and from a human perspective seem to enjoy a musical capacity, but it is not the same as human language or music.

From a human evolutionary communications perspective, both science and anthropology sees music as part of the synthesis of human intelligence as it interfaces the contexts of audible vibrational energy. As noted by Levitin (2010), this occurred:

Through a process of co-evolution of brains and music, through the structures throughout the human cortex, neo cortex, brain stem, and the prefrontal cortex and from the limbic system to the cerebellum music uniquely insinuates itself in our heads. (p. 39)

In all cultures, it is natural to make music as an acknowledgement of meaning making as part of interpreting vibrations linked to the human psyche (Werner, 1996). Music is composed of vibrations that find agreement with the audible sensory receptors
of humans (Green, cited in Mannes & Smilow, 2009). In addition, humans produce vibrations from their heartbeats and other biological capacities to controlled vocal expressions, or musical expression with a range of instruments. Darwin acknowledged the musicality of human evolution noting:

I conclude that musical notes and rhythms were first acquired by...[humans] for the sake of charming the opposite sex. Thus musical tones became firmly associated with some of the strongest passions an animal is capable of feeling, and are consequently, used instinctively. (Darwin cited in Levitin, 2008, p. 251)

Levitin (2010) identifies six kinds of song, which express the dimension of human life in music. These factors are: friendship, joy, comfort, knowledge, religion and love. These musical aspects have shaped the nature of the human experience over time across diverse cultures.

**Primates and Homo sapiens**

I am ahead, I am advanced  
I am the first mammal to make plans  
I crawled the earth, but now I’m high!  
Twenty-ten, watch it go to fire  
It’s evolution baby

(Vedder & Gossard, 1998, track 7)  
[http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=aDaOgu2CQtl&ob=av2e](http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=aDaOgu2CQtl&ob=av2e)

The first major multicellular animal groups appeared for the first time 545 million years ago during the Cambrian Explosion (Renouf, 2011). However, our primate ancestors are as recent as several million years ago. Homo sapiens, Hominids (primates from the Hominidae family) and great apes position the context of human evolution. Over 100,000 – 200,000 years ago, the Old World (Africa) was occupied by diverse groups of Hominids. Homo sapiens were in Africa and the Middle East, Homo erectus was in Asia and Homo neanderthalensis was in Europe. As recently as 30,000 years ago this diversity began to vanish as modern humans, with their enhanced intellectual and linguistic behaviour dominated the earlier ancestors (Harvey, 2007; Johanson, 2001).

Importantly, throughout this process, evidence of musical instruments is found from Europe to Australia. Today, science finds evidence that underscores pre-human existence, with a close evolutionary connection with primates such as the great apes including gibbons, siamangs, chimpanzee, gorilla and orang-utans (Goodall, 2010; Johanson, 2001). All these primates have an advanced capacity to use sound to communicate with each other. Scientists (Premack & Premack, 1984) have taught
chimpanzees and orang-utans to use symbolic signage to communicate with humans. In natural settings vocalisation within troops of apes have a very important function in the social order.

**Music and speech**

Human specific behaviours such as conversation, music production, artistic ability and humour may have evolved in order to find a suitable mate (Darwin, 1876), or maybe part of a communication system to organise social groups to assist survival. As the act of seeking a mate is an *innate* quality, Darwin (cited in Levitin, 2008) believed that music preceded speech as a means of courtship. Herron (2001, cited in Levitin, 2008) says that if music is a non-adaptive pleasure seeking behaviour then it should no longer exist, as any activity that has a low adaptive value is less likely to be practiced. Blacking (1995, cited in Levitin 2008) and Cross (2001), claim music is a human characteristic, rather than a talent, and that every member of society is capable of listening to and appreciating music. The billions of dollars spent in popular music and other forms would support music’s place in the global world.

What remains significant is that no known culture lacks music (Ball, 2010; Harvey, 2007; Levitin, 2008; Mithen, 2006). Evidence found in prehistoric cave paintings emphasises the role music played in ancient life-worlds (Levitin, 2008). Human societies have existed without writing, but it seems that none have existed without music. Some of the oldest human artefacts are musical instruments, such as bone flutes dating 36,000 years discovered in a cave in southern Germany, as well as an ivory flute made from the tusk of a mammoth dating back to the European ice age found in a cave in the Pyrenees (Mithen, 2006). Therefore, to understand the interaction between brain, culture, evolution and mind, the role of music must be considered essential.

Evolutionary neuroscience suggests that before human language, some primate brains had a limited capacity to learn to construct meaning from vocal mechanisms, thus representing the very basic components of language (Mithen, 2006). As the proto-human brain became physiologically and cognitively flexible, it gave growth to neural structures that would support language (Harvey, 2007; Mithen, 2006; Thompson, Miran & Stewart, 2012). This evolution presented three cognitive abilities, which are considered to be the foundation of language and music. These are:
Perspective taking: The ability to think about our thoughts and realise that people may have thoughts, which differ from our own.

Representation: The ability to think about things that are not physically in front of us.

Rearrangement: The ability to combine and recombine and impose a hierarchical order on our world (Mithen, 2006).

Justifying the Inclusion of Music and Languages in Western Australian Schools

Why music?


The 2007 Classroom First Strategy (DETWA, 2007a) states that the rationale for education in Western Australia is to build in students a strong sense of community and responsibility to and for others. Languages and Music are pivotal in developing a sense of identity and an understanding of one’s self and the wider community, as linked to Gardner’s (1993) ‘Multiple Intelligences’ theory. Even though Music and Languages have shown to be essential components of a well-balanced curriculum, it seems their inclusion requires continual justification in Australia, and in particular Western Australia (McConchie Pty Ltd, 2007; Pascoe, Leong, MacCallum, Mackinlay, Marsh, Smith, Church, & Winterton, 2005)

For over two millennia music has established a place in Western epistemology, as emphasised by Plato (360 B.C./2004) and Aristotle (Turner, 1907). Musical intelligence is described as an essential part of being an educated person (Gardner, 1993). From the classics throughout the late Roman, Medieval, Renaissance, through to the present era, both high culture and popular culture hold music in high esteem. The USA the Goals 2000: Educate America Act (U.S Congress, 1994) reinforced music and the other creative arts areas as “core subjects of equal importance in education” as academic subjects (Bates 2000, p. 282). America’s Consortium of the National Arts Education Associations reinforced the essentialness of cultural and artistic growth, arts participation and self-expression as a fundamental readiness for American high school graduates to compete in the globalised world. In particular, music is seen to help develop relationships, auditory skills, body awareness, coordination, spatial awareness, emotions as well as develop a sense of belonging.
Music in Australian schools

Music in Australian schools has enjoyed a long and rich tradition spanning over 150 years. During the 1850s and 1860s, Music was introduced as a school subject in New South Wales and Victoria (Stevens, 1997). It was taught by singing masters from the British traditions that recognised that vocal and choral singing promoted cognitive abilities and as a consequence the music taught was purely vocal. In addition, gold discoveries in the nineteenth century brought many foreigners to Australia and vocal music was used as a means of acceptance and recognising their differences (Stevens, 1997). Between 1900-1920, music appreciation was introduced and this formed a cultural education for children by exposing them to folk songs from other countries (Stevens, 1997). Thus children gained knowledge of global geography and the different cultures of the world. Dalcroze Eurhythmics was introduced and also became popular during this time (Pope, 2009). From 1920-1950, recorders and classroom recorder programmes became common, and tuned and non-tuned percussion instruments became available (Stevens, 1997). The Orff–Schulwerk (Stevens, 1997) approach and the Kodaly method (Hoermann, n.d.) of music education were introduced to Australia in the 1960’s and 1970’s. In WA, the 1980’s saw the release of The McGaw Report (1984), to identify which disciplines should be used as tertiary entrance admissions. Whilst marginalising the Arts, it recommended Music as the preferred Arts discipline and computer based music software was made available to schools (Stevens, 1997). McGaw’s consistent theme was Pythagorean, in that he favoured disciplines that reinforced the logical exactitude found in mathematics and science.

Music in Australian schools underscores classical Greek ideology, whereby music has been considered gymnasium for the mind. It ought to be central and indispensable in a well-rounded education. If neglected, it would hinder the potential development and growth opportunities for students (Ball, 2010). Levitin (2008) agrees that music needs greater consideration in schools and not be the first programme cut due to funding problems. Music constantly has to justify its existence in terms of collateral benefits rather than letting music exist for its own rewards (Levitin, 2008). Richard–Amato (1996, cited in Facio, 2004) believes that music has a unifying effect that can extend across time, nations, races and individuals. It breaks down linguistic, as well as cultural barriers by making people feel less inhibited as it lowers what Krashen (1982) describes as the affective filter.

At the time of writing, Music is fighting to survive in an over-crowded curriculum. The pressures and uncertainty of the Australian Curriculum has resulted in
many schools adapting the Australian Curriculum to suit their needs (Stevens, 2006). Music has begun to disappear as a discrete learning area and it is assumed that it will reappear in the general classroom curriculum. If this occurs, it will ensure that Music will still hold a place in the curriculum. However, it must be remembered that it is a core curriculum subject and it is worth fighting for (Stevens, 2006).

For this to occur, a meaningful musical culture needs to be adopted across schools. Music, whilst maintaining its discreteness, must also be inclusive of all other learning areas. Generalist classroom teachers should incorporate Music into their daily programmes just as Music specialists should incorporate other learning areas into their Music programme (Crabbe, 2008).

Time takes on many forms in the human mind, such as past, present and future, but there is only the present. Whereas the future is the forgotten past, the past is indeed embedded in the present. So it is with music in society and Music education in schools. (Gordon, 2001, p.1)

**Why languages?**

The issue of why Languages should be taught in Western Australian and Australian schools has been a constant ‘thorn in the side’ of education throughout the past decade resulting in the demise of ‘languages-programs’ and teachers relinquishing their positions (Lo Bianco, 2011). The answer to this problem lies in the following statement from the Department of Education and Training:

The Curriculum Framework of Western Australia is organised around eight learning areas, one of which is Languages. This is the area of the curriculum where students develop knowledge, skills and understanding to communicate effectively and appropriately in Languages Other Than English. (Curriculum Council WA, 1998, p. 3)

Crystal (2008a) believes that English-speaking monolinguals (a person capable of speaking only a single language) have an assumption that foreigners have a gift for learning languages. This assumption is based on experiences of educational failure in a learning environment, which promoted active teaching, passive learning and student lack of achievement. However, according to Sussex (2008) knowledge of English will no longer be an advantage in the twenty-first century. It is estimated that within a generation, many countries will possess a higher level of English, resulting in others knowing more about English than English-speaking monolinguals know about others. Too frequently, second language teaching and learning programmes encounter barriers to their success due to limited resources, poor school timetable structuring and the belief
that the world is an English speaking one so why bother learning an second language (Crabbe, 2007a; 2007b). However, Crystal (2008a) reinforces that the learning of a second language is a necessity as it prepares students for citizenship in a global community. According to Scarino and Crichton (2007), it gives students a global view of the world from a cognitive, expressive, communicative and cultural viewpoint.

The values of respect, tolerance, identity and acceptance of rights are all driven through an effective second language programme. Second language learning provides insights into other cultures, develops thinking skills and helps construct new linguistic knowledge (Crabbe, 2007a; Liddicoat, Papdemetre, Scarino & Kohler, 2003; Scarino, 2010; Scarino & Crichton, 2007). It encourages interaction, collaboration and builds self-esteem. Languages support the learning of the native language, as well as building solid foundations for future learning (Baldassar, 2004; Vygotsky, 1986). In the Draft Shape of the Australian Curriculum: Languages, ACARA (2011a) affirms “languages benefits individuals capacities in: business, trade, science, law, education, tourism, diplomacy international relations, health and the arts” (ACARA, 2011a, p. 10). Therefore, speakers of a second language potentially have greater employment opportunities in an expanding globalised world.

Currently, a country’s language strategy is driven by perceptions of economic outcomes rather than ideology for educational outcomes (Lo Bianco 1990, 2009). Important concerns for a language strategy are class sizes, funding, available technology, length of course and teacher training. Already the Asia Century White Paper (2012) has been challenged in these issues. For example, how will provision be made for Hindi when “Australia has no stock of teachers of Hindi” (“Teacher blow,” 2012) and how will the Government provide $100 million per year for the next 10 years to “reverse the decline in Asian language studies” (Labor cuts,” 2012). But, before these can be resolved, a coherent national Languages policy is needed. A paradigm shift must occur to ensure transformation of the Australian monolingual mindset (Crabbe, 2007b). “The knowledge of a second language is useless if a country’s political system gives no opportunity to put it into everyday practice” (Crystal, 2008a, p. 443).

Why music and languages in schools

Music and language are ‘human universals’ which are found across all cultures and all people known to ethnography and history (Brown, 1991; Harvey, 2007). Both rely on innate, biological proclivities (Chomsky, 1972, cited in Bollons, 1996; Fitch,
Mithen (2006) suggests that music and language share three modes of expression. These are:

1. Vocal expression via speech and song;
2. Gestures via sign language and dance; and
3. That both can be written.

When compared with Hockett’s 16 design features (1960, p. 6) of human language, it was found that music and language share seven:

1. Broadcast transmission: the signal is heard and is localised;
2. Rapid fading: messages do not linger in time or space after production;
3. Total feedback: users of language/music can perceive what they are transmitting and can make corrections if they make errors;
4. Specialisation: the direct energetic consequences of linguistic/musical signals are usually biologically trivial. Only the triggering effects are important;
5. Productivity: the capacity to say/play things that have never been said or heard before and yet be understood by other speakers of the language/music;
6. Discreteness: messages in the system are made up of smaller, repeatable parts. The sounds of language/music are perceived categorically, not continuously; and
7. Cultural transmission: the conventions of a language and/or music, which are learned by interacting with more experienced users.

Language also shares some musical design features including: complexity: generative and cultural transmission and transposability. Therefore, it can be concluded that, “music is a halfway to language” (Fitch, 2005, p. 4). These attributes fit well within Brown’s system of ‘Musilanguage’ and the idea that this system was a precursor to language, as supported by Mithen (2006) and Harvey (2007). Brown (2001) and Mithen (2006) believe that music and language comprise of three common characteristics including:

1. Shared features: identical features shared by both;
2. Parallel features: similar features shared by both; and
3. Distinct features: those are specific to each and not shared or parallel to either (Brown, 2001).
Music and language are very closely related and both are important tools in transmitting knowledge with speech being heavily dependent on rhythm and pitch (Thompson et al., 2012). Both are communication systems and neither can be considered as separate. Rousseau, (cited in Besson & Schon, 2001) and Thompson et al (2012) believe that music and language share the same common ancestor. Darwin (cited in Besson & Schon, 2001) suggests that language evolved out of the musical reproductive calls of the primates. Merker, (2000, p. 5) supports this view stating, “Music is an evolutionary spin–off from patterns of sexual selection. Males who made music together attracted the females.”

Chen-Hafteck (1997, p. 86) claims, “music and language are the two ways that humans communicate and express themselves through sound. Since birth babies start to listen and produce sound without distinguishing between music, language, singing and speech”. Van Riper (1984, cited in Stansell, 2005) supports this by stating that infants begin with crying and comfort utterances. They use what Gandini (2002) describes as babyese. Then, they move to babbling, and finally they understand and acquire words. All stages develop first by sound and speech follows later. This suggests children can imitate rhythm and musical contours long before they can say the words. Therefore, language should not only be considered in a cognitive context, but in a musical one as well (Harvey, 2007; Loewy, 2004, cited in Stansell, 2005; Thompson et al., 2012).

A song is a complex human action, as it is learned and responded to as a whole (Lomax, 1959). A child begins to learn musical style from their culture as they learn their language through their traditional songs. Music provides important links between identity and culture, security, place, satisfaction, religion, pleasure and shaping of personality (Lomax, 1959). Music, like speech, is a product of both biology and social interaction. It is a cultural element that is integral to human development and evolution of the modern mind (Cross, 2001). It provides the child with a medium for social interaction and a risk free space to explore social behaviour (Brown, cited in Cross, 2001). Music is the property of the community, existing through interactions and it supports sharing, expression and human development.

Gandini (2002), states that Italian nursery rhymes filastrocche (brief and repetitive type of literature using common words) sung to the child by the mother enhances communication between infant and parents. The repetition of rhymes and the use of ‘motherese’ (language spoken by the mother or caretaker of a young child to teach them the basic structure and function of language) increase language acquisition
and demand the complete attention of the child. Therefore, motherese and rhymes improve concentration, encourage first syllables and words to be spoken, allow for the sharing of knowledge, transmit values, aid memory development and assist in the learning of the community dialect, gesturing, traditions and culture. Overall, motherese and rhyme fosters the promotion of socialisation and association of play with learning. In addition, song texts help the child overcome learning anxieties while encouraging word association, comprehension, assimilation and creativity.

Infants display an innate sensitivity to rhythms in language long before they display an ability to understand words. This is due to the neural networking of the infant being based around musical ones rather than linguistic (Harvey, 2007). The enhanced prosody used by adults when communicating with a young infant allows the infant to acquire language based on stress and pitch of the adult voice rather than the meaning of the word (Mithen, 2006). This develops awareness of intonation and of how emotion is also conveyed through speech (Thompson et al., 2012). This helps to explain why young children are able to remember and sing television commercials and songs long before they are old enough to understand their meaning. Evidence supports the idea that musical awareness precedes linguistic awareness and that music assists with language acquisition and mastery (Gfeller, 1986; Harvey, 2007; Mithen, 2006).

Arom (cited in Besson & Schon, 2001) states that music and language share many structural and functional similarities. Structurally, both:

- Have pitch and rhythm;
- Are composed of sequential events that unfold in time with a specific rhythm;
- Have phonemes (sounds) and prosody (rhythm).

“Prosody is the universal aspect of all spoken language. It is a feature that is naturally acquired by all speakers as readily as the words and syntax of a language” (Pearl, 2006, p. 135). Prosodic aspects of speech include: tone, duration, meter, inflexion, intonation, accentuation, rhythm and periodicity (Besson & Schon, 2001; Tagg, 2002; Thompson et al, 2012). Functionally, both music and language are conveyed by sound. Music and language are cultural artefacts based on systems, which are composed of basic elements (phonemes and words, notes and chords) that combine into higher structures (musical phrases and sentences) through the rules of harmony and syntax (Besson & Schon, 2001).
Table 2.6 below demonstrates this relationship further by summarising analogous comparisons of the similarities between language and music (Paolino, 2006).

### Table 2.6: Structural and Functional Features of Music and Language

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Language</th>
<th>Music</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Phoneme</td>
<td>1. Notes and Pitch</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Morpheme</td>
<td>2. Bars and Rhythm/Beat</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Pragmatics</td>
<td>5. Musical use/function</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Music and languages are curricula frills**

The benefits that Music and Languages provide are many. However, Diamond (cited in Chipongian, 2000) argues that Music and Languages are still considered a ‘curricular frill’ and peripheral subjects. This means that Music and Languages are not considered core curriculum learning areas, but as areas, which fill in the school timetable when student-learning time is not at its optimum level. Languages are viewed as being educationally unimportant and they can either be taught for fun or not at all. This statement is supported by the *Attitudes towards the study of Languages in Australian schools* (McConchie Pty. Ltd, 2007), which found that:

- 75% of Australian principals don’t see the relevance of learning a language;
- 72% of Australian principals think that learning a language is not important; and
- 60% of Australian principals are not interested in learning another language themselves.

The same study (McConchie Pty. Ltd, 2007) also found that 66% of Australian parents:

- Don’t see the relevance of learning a language and think is not important; and
- Are not interested in learning another language.

It also found that WA principals considered:

- It difficult to access language teachers;
- There to be insufficient time in the timetable for languages;
- Language teachers as “dragons” (p. 588) who train rather than nurture;
- Languages teachers as separate entities to staff;
- Languages teachers to be poor behaviour managers;
● The majority of parents in their school community see little value in Languages;
● It important for students to learn their native tongue before learning another; and
● That not enough support is given to schools to run Languages programmes.

And that WA parents considered;
● There to be inconsistencies of languages across schools;
● Language teachers to be poorly qualified;
● That there was not enough face to face Languages teachers;
● That too many students struggle with English and Mathematics and they are more important than Languages; and
● That learning a language reaps little reward.

These attitudes are due in part to the lack of “empirical evidence using song in foreign language teaching” (Salcedo, 2002, p. 8). Diamond (cited in Chipongian, 2000) advocates that these learning areas should become central to the school curriculum and failing to do so would result in ‘intellectual deprivation.’ That is to deny students intellectual stimulation, which could heighten their cognitive capacity. Three important questions linking music with language acquisition and mastery need to be explored.

These are:

1. What are their cognitive benefits?
2. How does the human brain process them and understand them both individually and simultaneously?
3. Why are they considered ‘gymnasium’ for the human brain?

**Evolution and Cognition**

The following verse from U2’s song *Pride* speaks of a significant moment in history, the assassination of Martin Luther King in 1968.

```
Early morning, April Four
Shot rings out in the Memphis sky
Free at last, they took your life
They could not take your pride
```

(Vox, 1984, track 2) [http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=LHcP4MWABGY&ob=av2e](http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=LHcP4MWABGY&ob=av2e)
Without knowledge of American history, without context, and a syntactic and semantic knowledge of the English language, the above lyrics are meaningless. A large neural capacity is required to understand and appreciate a song. Both hemispheres of the human brain must function as a network. In order to do this, the brain must have the capacity to learn, rewire and reconfigure repeatedly (Doidge, 2010a; 2010b; Merzenich, 2009a, 2009b).

**The human brain**

The human brain evolved in three stages resulting in three different but interconnected brains (Davidmann, 2006; Mithen, 2006). It is the interaction between these three brains that underlies human behaviour. Over half a billion years ago, the brain of fish, amphibians, reptiles, birds and all mammals consisted of the brain stem, cerebellum, pons and medulla. This is called the Reptilian Brain or the Hindbrain. It is the innermost, oldest, most primitive part of the human brain, which controls body functions required for sustaining life. The mammals of 300-200 million years ago competed with other reptiles and began to adapt, living nocturnally and on land. As a result, the Reptilian Brain evolved. It became the Midbrain or Mammalian Brain, consisting of the tectum, tegmentum, brain organs and the limbic system. Several million years ago, as Hominids evolved so too did the Mammalian Brain. The third part, the Homo sapien sapien Brain or Forebrain included the formation of the cerebrum, neocortex, the right hemisphere, the left hemisphere, frontal lobe (containing the Broca and Wernicke areas responsible for language processing and speech production), parietal lobe (responsible for language processing), temporal lobe (where the auditory cortex is located), occipital lobe, thalamus, hypothalamus, amygdale, hippocampus and the corpus callosum (Davidmann, 2006; Mithen, 2006). Please refer to Appendix A, for details on the structure and function of the human brain.

**The first computer**

According to Davidmann (2006), the laptop computer is analogist to the human brain. Both are approximately 2kg, comprising of a combination of hardware and operating software, which helps them to perform certain tasks, and input. If the input does not generate the right output then there is a need to update the software. By comparison, an adult human brain weighs approximately 1.5 kg and is the centre of the nervous system. Its hardware consists of one hundred billion neurons. Each neuron can make contact with tens of thousands of synapses forming a million new connections every second. The brain’s software creates patterns and the strength of these connections is constantly changing during which memories are stored, habits learned
and personalities are shaped as ‘input and output’. The brain is the most complex organ in the human body responsible for thought, action, memory feelings and experience (Davidmann, 2006).

**Neuroplasticity**

The evolution of the human brain from reptilian to mammalian to human is an example of its ability to adapt in a constantly changing world. Contemporary neurological research views the human brain as malleable or ‘plastic’. Neuroplasticity or cortical remapping is the brain’s ability to change as a result of individual experiences. This notion opposes traditional thought that the brain is mechanical and rigid and unable to change after the critical period of infancy (Doidge, 2009; 2010; Merzenich, 2009a; 2009b; Merzenich & Taub, 2008).

**Case study brain malleability**

Schwartz and Begley (2003) provide evidence of this malleability and resilience through a case study of a child who began playing the piano at age five and the violin at age nine. At the age of three and a half, the child began suffering convulsions. Eventually, the child was diagnosed with epilepsy and prescribed medication, but the convulsions continued. By age of 24-25 years as an adult, the individual had experienced four tonic-clonic (formerly called grand mal) seizures, three whilst on stage. Please refer to Appendix B for information concerning tonic-clonic seizures.

Once, surgery was the only option for seizures, and surgery came at a significant risk, as part of the right temporal lobe would be removed, the place in the brain where musical memories are stored. This meant that the individual might never be able to play their instruments again. Unexpectedly, after the operation they maintained the ability to play their instrument, but the convulsions remained. Undergoing a second operation to remove the part of the hippocampus (the part of the brain responsible for the forming, organising and storing of memory) and most of the part of the amygdala (responsible for the processing of emotions) from the right temporal lobe, the musician still maintained the ability to play, but convulsions still continued. A third operation came at the risk of paralysis and death. This time 50% of the right temporal lobe was removed including the entire hippocampus and amygdala. Following this operation, the convulsions ceased and the musician gained an enhanced musical memory, as they were able to memorise more music than before the surgeries. Later doctors discovered that the musician had contracted the measles at the age of three and this had damaged the right temporal lobe. Learning music as a child helped the brain adapt to the damage caused by the childhood
illness by moving its musical operations to other neural networks, establishing a new brain map (Schwartz & Begley, 2003).

According to Merzenich (2009a), the brain is an underutilised and unappreciated resource. It is structured for change and practicing new skills, and under the right conditions can change the billions of brain connections and produce new mind maps. If these mental skills are no longer exercised they are not only forgotten, but also overtaken by the new skills that are being practiced, therefore again changing the brain maps.

At birth, an infant displays limited evidence of cognitive ability, as they demonstrate limited responses and primitive movements. At this time the brain treats language as a type of music, developing these capacities in partnership (Gazzaniga, 2004; Harvey, 2007).

Merzenich says that by the age of four, the human brain has developed the ability to store, record, retrieve information and display a repertoire of cognitive skills. Essentially, “we are born … with limited cognitive and movement abilities” (Merzenich, 2009b). Doige, (2010a) states that historically, humans have had three fundamental views of nature relating to evolution.

1. Ancientness as nature is a living organism. “I believe that you can train the brain the same way as gymnasts train their bodies” (Plato, 360 B.C./2004).
2. Nature is a mechanical process. This is the viewpoint of Freud, and Skinner. They believed that the brain is hard-wired, like a machine and it responds to reflexes.
3. Nature evolves. The discovery and analysis of fossils provided evidence that nature evolves and has a connected history. The idea of neuroplasticity sits best in this evolutionary epistemology rather than the mechanical paradigm. Evolutionary evidence underscores that the brain is plastic and can be re-constructed.

The brain is a far more open system than imagined and nature has gone very far to help us perceive and take in the world around us. It has given us a brain that survives in a changing world by changing itself. (Doidge, 2010b, p. 26)

Just as the hard drive of a computer needs to be programmed to perform certain tasks, so too the environment of the brain need to be mapped as every section has its own important role to play in learning. The brain likes to learn, but when the brain has difficulty or becomes disengaged, it won’t learn (Doidge, 2010b). Good teachers
endeavour to provide a range of learning experiences to enhance cognitive capacity of
their students (Eisner, 1991). Providing a range of learning experiences, which
encompass the Multiple Intelligences (Gardner, 1993; 1999) unlocks the blocked neural
connections and creates new ones. Every student learns differently and has different
strengths and individual’s needs should be accommodated where possible.

Therefore, the notion of the human brain needing to be exercised in order to avoid
its map space for a particular function being replaced by new skills is important in
relation to second language learning (Doidge, 2010a).

In the crowded WA curriculum, approximately 40 minutes per week is allocated
to the learning of a second language, if at all. Under this instructional time allocation,
the brain probably does not have enough opportunity to consolidate the mind map it is
trying to establish for second language learning (Doidge, 2010a). As Doidge (2010a)
discusses, during the lesson learning progress is made. However, when the students
leave the class they use their native language for the rest of the week. Accordingly,
second language learning can be tedious and students can become despondent with the
limited progress they are making. According to Doige (2010a), the brain’s malleability
causes neurons to compete for space. This makes it hard for learners to learn a new
language and end the “tyranny of the mother tongue” (Doidge, 2010a, p.60), as the
native language dominates the linguistic map space. This is why second language
learning should commence during infancy. Immersion learning works because it out-
competes the native language, as the second language is being used throughout the
entire school day (Doidge, 2010a; 2010b). By promoting Asian languages, such as
Mandarin, which require an additional 2000 hours to achieve ‘beginner’s fluency’, both
ACARA and the Australian Government are ignoring the neuro-scientific evidence, as
well as the real instructional cost.

Brain scans illustrate that people who have learnt two languages at different time
in their lives store them in separate areas of the brain (Crabbe, 2007a; Doidge, 2010b;
Gazzaniga, 2004). This is demonstrated when bi-lingual people have strokes and lose
the ability to speak one language but not the other. Brain scans have also shown that
children raised learning two languages simultaneously develop an auditory cortex that
responds to both languages. The development of a single, large cortical library of
sounds offers the child an enhanced time for learning their native language and the
learning other languages as an adult (Crabbe, 2007a; Doidge, 2010b; Gazzaniga, 2004).
This supports the argument of commencing second language learning as early as possible.

Walker (2010) states that the brain needs challenges and feedback in order for it to grow and accommodate change. Willis (2008) states that research findings in the area of neuroplasticity allow educators and researchers to consider which strategies and environments stimulate and strengthen brain functions. One way Willis (2008) suggests this can be done is by providing and exposing students to a variety of learning styles so that repeated but varied stimulation strengthens neural networks. This allows “each type of sensory memory to be stored in the lobe that receives the input from that sensory system” (Willis, 2008, p. 426). The frontal lobe’s function is language output as it contains the Broca area, which is responsible for the production of language. The parietal lobes store memories of tactile experiences, integrates them and is responsible for movement output. The temporal lobes interpret sequences and process auditory stimuli. They accommodate auditory memories and semantic understanding of speech as it contains the Wernicke Area, which is responsible for the comprehension of language and long-term memory. The occipital lobes are responsible for recognition of objects and vision. Multi-sensory learning activates as found in The Arts, stimulates and strengthens these neural networks simultaneously creating a more efficient memory or storage network (Willis, 2008).

**Functional Magnetic Resonance Imaging**

Functional Magnetic Resonance Imaging (fMRI) has shown that neurons which respond to an attracting stimulus fire with greater efficiency. Doidge (2010b, p. 47) describes this as “neurons that fire together – wire together.” The amount of attention an individual gives to a particular stimulus is determined by the properties of the stimulus and the way it interacts with their brain circuits. In addition, the success of a stimulus is determined by its strength, or novelty association linked to a task demand (Schwartz & Begley, 2003). Therefore, without focused attention, the stimulus does not register in the brain and a memory circuit is not created.

The brain consists of approximately 100 billion axons and 100 trillion synapses, which are used for data processing. These are the equivalent bits and bytes in computer systems. The brain also consists of chemicals called neurotransmitters, which are essential for learning. The neurotransmitters essential for learning are: acetylcholine, dopamine, norepinephrine and serotonin. The first neurotransmitter pertinent to this research is dopamine, which responds to attention, working memory, motivation and
reward. The second is norepinephrine, which responds to novelty. When something is taught in a new way it triggers neurons, releasing these chemicals to assist the brain in remembering what was presented (Schwartz & Begley, 2003).

Therefore, the human brain is naturally malleable, and based upon the neuroscience literature reviewed (Schwartz & Begley, 2003) it would reinforce that a well-planned interdisciplinary curriculum will create novel opportunities for children to experience enhanced levels of neurotransmitters, thus forming new neural connections or pathways in their brain. Educators would describe as effective learning experiences, where children create new mind maps and change existing ones. If a learner has a ‘learning block in the brain’, which prevents them acquiring knowledge, then it is anticipated that an interdisciplinary curriculum that provides novelty and high interest allowing the brain to discover an alternate neuro-circuit (Doidge, 2010a; 2010b; Merzenich, 2009a; 2009b; Merzenich & Taub, 2008).

**Novel teaching increases dopamine and norepinephrine**

Eisner (1991) claims that when teachers provide their students with an interesting curriculum, the students are challenged, feel safe, have choice, collaborate, and will create and solve problems. Positive outcomes such as those described are “central to any adequate conception of education” (Eisner, 1991, p. 17). A successful interdisciplinary learning experience will increase the level of dopamine in the brain, therefore enhancing learning and working memory (Doidge, 2010a; 2010b; Merzenich, 2009a; 2009b; Merzenich & Taub, 2008). Therefore, the student's interests greatly increases the probability of the information presented being stored by the stimulated neural networks, as these types of activities also increase the level of norepinephrine. Ultimately, new memories are formed which students can process and use to construct new knowledge (Willis, 2008).

**The human brain and music**

Songs bridge the hemispheres, strengthening retention as the right learns the melody and the left, the words. (Guglielmino, 1986, p. 20)

A considerable amount of research has been invested into the effect of music on brain and cognitive development (Balter, 2007; Hodges 2000; Peretz & Coltheart, 2003; Sacks 2007; Zatorre, Belin & Penhune 2002).

According to Mithen (2006), traditional views considered music a ‘right-brain function’ and language a ‘left-brain function’. Modern neuro-imaging techniques such as fMRI, EEG, MEG and PET, indicate that both sides of the brain are involved in
processing music. Research (Harvey, 2007; Parson, Fox & Hodges 1998 cited in Hodges 2000; Sperry 1972) explains that while the left retains the language, both sides of the brain process music. This promotes ‘network thinking’ as both sides of the brain are being used at the same time, as music is both analytical and creative. Therefore, the learning of music and language together enhances ‘network thinking’. The early research conducted by Sperry, (1972) suggested that if ‘network thinking’ is not encouraged then the hemisphere region not used will remain dormant or impoverished.

Levitin (2008) believes that all humans have the innate capacity to learn any music. Zatorre and Krumhansi (2002), state that discoveries by neuroscientists provide specific and detailed information of musical structures existing in both hemispheres of the brain. Janata (2002, cited in Zatorre, 2003) states that the brain regions associated with tonal processing are the temporal lobe and frontal lobe brain regions. Those associated with perception are the temporal, parietal and frontal limbic lobes, which include the auditory cortex located in the temporal lobe, the left and right superior temporal gyrus located in the temporal lobe, the thalamus located in the limbic system and the cerebellum. Figure 2.1 below illustrates the main regions of the human brain. Refer to Appendix A for further images and information of the structure and function of the human brain.
Music also activates neural structures in the limbic and paralimbic brain, the midbrain, the basal forebrain region and the ventromedial front cortex. Table 2.7 below summarises the different brain regions associated with a variety of musical skills.

**Table 2.7: Brain regions and associated musical skills**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Music Skill</th>
<th>Brain region involved</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Listening</td>
<td>Cochlear nuclei, brain stem, cerebellum, auditory cortices</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Following a score</td>
<td>Cochlear nuclei, brain stem, cerebellum, auditory cortices,</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>hippocampus, frontal lobe</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tapping rhythm</td>
<td>cerebellum</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Performing</td>
<td>Frontal lobes, motor cortex, sensory cortex</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Score reading</td>
<td>Visual cortex</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Recalling lyrics</td>
<td>Broca area, Wernicke area, temporal lobe, frontal lobe</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Responding to</td>
<td>Cerebellar vermis, amygdala</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>music</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Neurologists (Balter, 2007; Harvey, 2007; Holz 2002; Patel, 2003a; 2003b; 2008; Patel & Daniele, 2002; Peretz & Coltheart, 2003; Zatorre, Belin & Penhue 2002; Zatorre 2003) have conducted many studies to ascertain the physical affect music has on the brain. Findings have shown; the cortex is 5% larger in expert musicians, the corpus callosum is 15% larger in musicians who started from an early age, and a professional musician’ auditory cortex has 130% more grey matter than that of a non–musician. Therefore, science claims that music physically changes the structure of the brain.

Importantly, music activates all parts of the brain. The rostromedial prefrontal cortex is the brain region responsible for processing sound. It is located in the prefrontal
lobe, which is responsible for the tracking and processing melodies. Music encompasses many aspects of human cognition (Harvey, 2007). Music includes pattern processing and the working memory, which depend on the neocortical systems in the auditory areas of the brain as well as frontal and parietal cortex. Active participation as advocated by Asher (1984; 2000; 2001) in all activities, including musical ones, alters the anatomy of the brain. The student must participate in a complete sensory experience; feel, make, hear and move. If a memory of the experience is to be created then students cannot just sit and listen, they must take part. Early musical experiences intensify the development of neurons increasing the number of interconnections between brain cells, enhancing the ability to think, learn, reason and create. Music increases spatial-temporal reasoning (the ability to visualise spatial patterns and mentally manipulate them over a time ordered sequence) and connects the motor systems of the brain.

Research by Rauscher, Shaw, Levine, Wright, Dennis and Newcombe (1997) explored the hypothesis that music and other higher cognitive functions share the same neural firing patterns. They established that music could be used to develop these neural firing patterns together with the associated behaviours relevant to spatial reasoning. The researchers found that pre-school children, after receiving four months of daily singing lessons and weekly keyboard lessons, had developed superior spatial temporal abilities when compared to pre-school children who had not received the musical instruction. Their research suggested that musical activities helped systemise the critical firing patterns of the neurons, particularly the right hemisphere task of spatial performance.

Evidence exists that music and language are emotional domain enhancers as both have a shared neural circuitry (Thompson et al, 2012). This suggests that similarities exist in the way we communicate emotion in both speech and music as emotional perception is encoded in music. This implies that those that have difficulty understanding intonation and language nuances also have difficulty with music (Thompson et al, 2012)

In addition, music enhances eyesight, coordination, hearing, concentration and memory. It trains the brain for: high-level thinking, problem solving, inferences, arriving at conclusions, comparing, contrasting, identification of similarities and differences, analysing, synthesising, organising, retaining and evaluating (Hodges 2000; Roehmann 1991; Sacks 2007; Zatorre 2003). “The human brain quite naturally possesses the mental apparatus for musicality and it will make use of these tools consciously or not” (Ball, 2010, p. 5).
The human brain and languages

It was neurophysiologist pioneer Sperry who proposed that:

…the two modes of thinking, verbal and non–verbal are represented rather separately in the left and right brain respectively, and our education system in general tends to neglect the non – verbal intellect. (Sperry, cited in Danesi, 1987, p. 378)

Historically, neurology has maintained the view that the human brain consists of a dominant, left language hemisphere and a subordinate right non–language hemisphere (Sperry, 1981). Sperry conducted split-brain research (Sperry, 1981; 1975; 1971; 1966; Sperry & Gazzaniga, 1967) with epilepsy patients to “disprove the brain hemisphere theory” (Danesi, 1987, p. 378). In the 1960’s, the ‘split-brain’ procedure was the means to cure people with severe epilepsy. It involved severing the corpus callosum, the thick band of fibres that connects the left and right brain hemispheres allowing the hemispheres to communicate with each other. This made it possible for patients to live without fits. As there no longer was any cross-hemispherical communication or lateralisation the episodes of fitting amongst patients ceased or reduced. After the procedure it was found that each hemisphere was still able to learn. However, as there was no lateral cross hemisphere communication, it meant that one hemisphere had no memory about what the other hemisphere had experienced or learned.

Sperry (1972) found that each hemisphere was responsible for different tasks therefore strengthening and extending the evidence of hemispheric and lateral specialisation. His research suggested that both hemispheres were actively involved in higher cognitive functions, not just the left, and documented that the brain worked as a unit in which the two hemispheres were complimentary, non–antagonistic components of one cerebral system (In 1981 Sperry was recognised for his split-brain research and awarded the Nobel Prize in Medicine). Table 2.8 summarises the ‘Whole Brain’ model (Danesi (1987), and represents how important both hemispheres are in the area of language learning.
Table 2.8: Whole Brain Model

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Left hemisphere traits</th>
<th>Right hemisphere traits</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Most speech functions</td>
<td>Understands figurative language</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Deciphering meaning</td>
<td>Understands visual relations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Verbal memory</td>
<td>Spatial memory</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Intellectual tasks</td>
<td>Intuitive tasks</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Convergent thinking</td>
<td>Divergent thinking</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Abstracting</td>
<td>Concretising</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Direct thinking</td>
<td>Free thinking</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Analytical thinking</td>
<td>Relational thinking</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Linear thinking</td>
<td>Multiple thinking</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Analysing parts</td>
<td>Synthesising parts</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Syntax</td>
<td>Prosodic structures</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Morphology</td>
<td>Determines whether it is an; utterance, command, statement, question etc.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Semantics</td>
<td>Figurative meaning</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stylistic variances</td>
<td>Linguistic humour</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Detects and corrects surface – structure errors</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

As the table illustrates, the left hemisphere, which contains both the Broca and Wernicke areas, is responsible for processing, comprehending and analysing the language while the right hemisphere is responsible for putting it all together. Therefore, if the left interprets language and the right comprehends it in the context in which it is presented, non-verbally, then learning is definitely bi-modal. Research by Goldberg and Costa (cited in Danesi, 1987) found that once the right has provided meaning, the left overtakes the utilisation.

Neurologist Sacks (2007) has stated that recent innovations such as melodic intonation therapy (MIT) can help retrieve language in people who have lost the ability to speak, suffer dementia or brain trauma. MIT is a procedure that involves relearning language via stimulating the music function right hemisphere of the brain. As music has rhythmic and modal qualities, it is able to penetrate the brain’s auditory cortex effectively, providing these patients with a powerful neurological trigger to retrieve language. The research argues that music and song is ‘not forgotten’, even under traumatic circumstances (Sacks, 2007). Musical memory allows songs to ‘stick in our heads’, because they mean something important. An individual’s capacity to remember and sing a favourite song is proof of this.

Humans are born with the innate capacity to understand any of the world’s languages (Chomsky, cited in Levitin, 2008). This is because the brain does not have the capacity to know what language it’s born into. It is the experience that it has with a particular language that shapes, builds and prunes its neural networks. Albert, Olber,
Krashen and Galloway (cited in Danesi, 1987, p. 381) advocate, “the right brain is directly involved in second language acquisition. It is not only driven by the left brain.” Levy (cited in Danesi, 1987, p. 383) states, “it is impossible to educate one hemisphere at a time.” Asher (1984; 2000; 2001) believes that left-brain approaches traditionally used in second language classes, such as grammar translation, do not work, as these approaches do not cater for the way the human brain is biologically wired. Having students sitting in rows, arms folded and facing one direction to receive instruction is not conducive to language acquisition either. Teachers move around the classroom when delivering lessons, but do not give students the same privilege. Movement allows the information presented to be received at a rapid speed between the two hemispheres. Classrooms conducive to language learning allows for movement and interaction between students. This ‘brain switching’ (Asher, 2001) allows the difficult or unteachable students to achieve some success in the second language classroom. It enables the student to use the second language outside of the language classroom. To tell the student something is not enough. They must experience it and apply it in order to acquire the language (Asher, 1984; 2000; 2001).

Importantly, for language teachers, brain hemisphere research suggests that teachers need to strive to provide students with a variety of experiences to activate both the left and right hemispheres that results in the ‘novelty chemistry release’ as discussed earlier. In the past, formal language teaching has aimed at activating the left hemisphere including abstract grammar structure and the study of language structure. It was assumed that ability and understanding in these areas would lead to the successful application of knowledge in communicative settings and that language would emerge spontaneously after assimilation and control of the second language had taken place. It is just as important to remember that to focus solely on right hemispherical teaching techniques would also prove to be bias, because the brain works as a complimentary unit (Danesi, 1987).

Danesi’s (1987) model of neurological bi–modality (cited in Nuessel & Cicogna, 1994, p. 522) illustrates the implications and the applications that the bi–modal perspective has for the teaching of Italian noting:

- **Contextualisation:** making sure that the learner is frequently involved and thinking about what the second language data is about.
- **Visualisation:** using visual cues to enhance a global comprehension.
- Diversification: providing diverse classroom procedures/practices/activities together with authentic text, games and problem solving opportunities.
- Personalisation: involving the students directly via role-play, simulation and ‘real life experiences’, within context.

According to Danesi (1987), bi-modality is the most essential thing for the second language teacher to remember as it is the only type of language teaching truly compatible with the research on the brain’s hemispheric functions. “Research on the brain supports what teachers have intuitively known, that students learn in many ways and that the more ways information can be presented, the better they will learn” (Williams, cited in Danesi, 1987, p. 390). This supports Gardner’s (1993) Multiple Intelligence theory (MI), the idea that intelligence is not a separate entity, but a multitude of entities. Whilst his MI theory is often conceptualised as being independent of each, Gardner’s intelligence functions are more than complementary, they are integrated (Gardner, 1993 cited in Smith, 2002).

As already noted, Gardner’s Multiple Intelligence theory (Gardner, 1993) is strongly embedded in the Curriculum Framework of Western Australian (CFWA) (DETWA, 1998). Schools acknowledge the broader range of intelligences and teachers recognise the need to tap into a number of intelligences at the same time so that they can cater for the different learning styles of their students. The CFWA encourages the use of a variety of strategies and aims for an interdisciplinary approach to education, thus supporting the neuroscientific ‘novelty chemical release process’ thesis. However, this thesis is not in synergy with the political view of primary principals (APPA, 2007) who advocate a set curriculum based upon four core-learning areas.

A study conducted by Sydney University (Hawke, 2011b) revealed a high level of student disengagement in the middle years of schooling. The University conducted a study into an interdisciplinary programme with teachers using drama to teach English and literacy. Teachers worked with a drama mentor from the Sydney Theatre Company for seven weeks. Teachers stated that at first they found the project confronting as they felt they lacked the confidence and appropriate strategies required. However, the mentoring actors commented that as the teachers acquired the new skills, their confidence in using drama as a teaching tool improved (Hawke, 2011b).

Hawke (2011b) acknowledged that students do not all learn in the same conventional ways. Results have shown that the drama programme has increased
student literacy, creating a positive effect on student willingness to learn, as it engaged and connected them to literary works. Students reported that they found the programme fun as they ‘could get up and do different things rather than sit at a desk.’ Students commented that they were thinking more about books and the characters in them. The big vision of this research is to integrate drama as a teaching tool across all learning areas of the curriculum (Hawke, 2011b). The University and the actors involved, including international actress Cate Blanchet, her partner, and the Sydney Theatre Company, aimed to impart this new knowledge to others, ultimately having theatre companies working in all universities and mentoring pre and post-service teachers across Australia (Hawke, 2011b).

If English and literacy can be enhanced through drama, then the researcher proposes that the use of music can enhance second language acquisition.

**The human brain, music and languages**

Our experience is really just a sum of our memories. And it turns out that what we remember depends on the relation between music and language. (Weinberger, 1996b, p. 4)

What makes music potent and powerful is the way in which it draws on existing brain circuits, which have been developed for other specialised functions. Cross (2001) says that research speculates that music and speech are both products of early Homo sapiens. They were anatomically modern appearing humans with a highly developed brain capable of reasoning, using languages, problem solving, thinking rationally and being self-aware. Contemporaries of modern humans, Homo sapien sapiens, appeared 195,000 years ago as a sub-set of Homo sapiens and this group includes all modern humans. Musical/vocal activity of some kind was central and integral to both the evolution of apes and proto-human/proto-language development and especially to the evolution of the human brain as it is today (Cross, 2001; Thompson et al, 2012).

**The processing of syntax**

When considering the processing of the rule bases of music and that of linguistic grammar, it is clear that they are very different (Patel, cited in Mitchell, 2007; Patel, 2008). However, neuro-imaging evidence has shown that the brain is processing these rule-based systems in a similar way. Research suggests that there is a brain area that uses music and language in parallel (Albright, 2009; Harvey, 2007; Patel, cited in Mitchell, 2007; Patel, 2008; Thompson et al, 2012). Language and music provide two instances of highly structured, rule based systems that may be learned in an incidental manner. They both consist of discrete elements, which are organised in hierarchical
structures. The combination of these structural elements into sequences is governed by a set of principles known as syntax. Patel (2008) and Albright (2009) explain syntax as the principle, which governs the combination of different elements into a sequence. Zatorre (2005) suggests that at a neural level, music and speech do not overlap. However, functions such as syntax may require some common neural resources for both. Patel (2008) agrees that a difference exists between musical and linguistic syntax. However, there also exist similarities in the syntactic architecture of music and language sequences, which are both processed by the hierarchical and logical structures in the brain.

Patel (2003a) suggests that musical and linguistic syntax share processes that apply over different domain specific and posterior brain regions. The shared syntactic integration resource hypothesis (SSIRH) (Patel, 2003b) is a non-domain specific working memory system involved in the integrating of input (incoming elements such as words in language and tones/chords in music) into evolving structures (sentences in language and melodic/harmonic sequences in music). Patel (2003b) proposes that structural integration involves rapid selection and activation of elements within associated networks and that language and music share the neural resources that provide this activation. This hypothesis is represented in the Figure 2.2 below.

![Figure 2.2: Schematic diagram of the functional relationship between linguistic and musical syntactic processing. (Adapted from Patel, 2008, cited in Fodorenko, Patel, Casasanto, Winawer & Gibson, 2009, p. 2)](image)

An investigation conducted by Fodorenko, Patel, Casasanto, Winawer & Gibson (2009) studied whether the brain shared cognitive resources for the structural processing of music and languages. Participants listened to sung sentences with varying levels of linguistic and musical structural integrated complexity. The auditory stimulus was used to investigate the relationship between syntactic processing in language and music. It was hypothesised that when both linguistic and musical integration were difficult, there would be greater difficulty in processing than if the syntactic and musical complexity
were independent. This proved to be the case but the data concluded that it is difficult to
determine the exact nature of the overlap. However, evidence suggests that it is unlikely
that a structural processing overlap exists only when information is being retrieved.
Evidence from this study is consistent with others, which demonstrate that the working
memory system underlying sentence comprehension is not domain specific (Fodorenko,
Gibson & Rhode, 2007). Studies using fmri have further demonstrated that other
language areas, such as the Broca and Wernicke areas, also process harmony (Koelsch,
Gunter, Cramon, Zysset, Lohmann & Friederici, 2002). Figure 2.3 demonstrates neural
evidence for syntactic overlap in language and music.

![Figure 2.3: a) The linguistic and harmonic (red line) ERP associated with syntactic
processing in language (black line) is also elicited by syntactic processing in music
(red line) (Patel, Gibson, Ratner, Besson and Holcombe, 1998, cited in Patel, 2003b,
p. 676). b) MEG scan data represented in blue) showing localisation of harmonic
processing areas in the brain (Maess, Koelsch, Gunter, Friedici, 2001 cited in Patel,
2003b, p. 676).](image)

Jentschke, Koelsch and Friedrici (2005) observed intricate relationships between
music and language and the processing of syntax in their studies. Their data suggests
that children can profit from musical training as the processing of musical structures by
the brain impacts on the processing of linguistic syntax. Zattore (2000) found that
phonological processing (that is the ability of the brain to identify and process the sound
components of a word), emanates from the left-brain. It is accomplished through a
processing network including the left posterior, temporal parietal regions and Broca’s
area. This research also found that pitch discrimination emanates from the right brain
network of right prefrontal cortex, right superior gyrus and the right frontal lobe. This
suggests that two aspects of language, pitch and phonemes, are processed in different
areas of the brain yet are combined harmoniously by a musical-linguistic collaboration
in the brain network. This concludes that music is so complex that it cannot be isolated in either hemisphere.

Brown, Martinez and Parsons (2006) analysed cerebral blood flow changes as subjects performed domain specific tasks of melody and sentence generation. These parallel generational tasks for music and language were compared using positron emission topography (PET). Direct comparison of the two tasks revealed activations in almost identical areas of the brain, including the primary motor cortex, supplementary motor area, Broca’s area, anterior insula, primary and secondary cortices, temporal pole, basal ganglia, ventral thalamus and posterior cerebellum. The findings conclude that music and language share resources for auditory perception and vocalisation, with ‘phonological generativity’ seen as the major point of cognitive parallelism between both.

**The processing of rhythm**

“Rhythm and tempo are important at a neural level. It is innate and accounts for why humans are moved by rhythm. It connects our reptilian and human brain” (Cross, 2001, citied in Levitin, 2008, p. 262). As music is derived from vibrations, it is natural for humans to make music. The human body has its own vibrational frequencies, making it receptive to musical vibrations. From this ability to retain rhythm comes the ability to retain language (Werner, 1996).

The frontal lobe (humans only) connects to the cerebellum (primitive brain which all vertebrates have). The cerebellum locks into the rhythm and the frontal lobe tries to predict what will happen next. Studies with dementia patients have shown that this is the reason why memory and response to music are never lost. Rhythm is a part of all human activities and may be considered as an organising principle that structures events. Neuroscientists (Albright, 2009; Harvey, 2007; Patel, 2003a; 2003b; Patel & Daniele, 2002) acknowledge that rhythm is an important feature of both music and language, and that rhythm is an important aspect of spoken language. They believe that just as languages can differ in phonemes and lexicon, they can also differ in rhythmic organisation (prosody).

Patel (2003a) defines this linguistic rhythm as “a composite of several aspects of language that influence how it is organised in time” (Patel, 2003a, p. 140). It consists of patterns and group phrasing of words including utterances and pauses, durational patterning of syllables and “configurational” patterning of stressed versus unstressed syllables. Musical rhythm is the grouping of tones into phrases, the steady beat and
musical meter (Patel, 2003a). “When listening to music we spontaneously synchronise our body movement to a rhythm beat” (Chen, Zatorre & Penhue, 2006, p. 1771). Importantly, fMRI results confirm that the metric organisation of rhythm regulates motor and neural responses in the auditory and dorsal premotor cortex.

Patel (cited in Mannes & Smilow, 2009; Patel & Daniele, 2002) discovered that music reflects the spoken language and culture of a composer. Comparing and analysing rhythms and patterns in everyday English (stress timed language) and French (syllable timed language) with the music of French composer Debussy and that of English composer Elgar, Patel (2008) discovered that the musical rhythms matched those of the composer’s native tongue. Therefore, they naturally applied the prosody (rhythm) of their native language to their music. In contemporary times, American rapper Eminem (2002 @ http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=RQ9_TKayu9s) successfully matches linguistic prosody and musical rhythm when he writes his songs. Patel (2008) believes that humans do this because the brain recruits part of our language system when we process music.


Magne et al (2005) describe how the ‘Event–Related Brain Potential Method’ was used to study perceptual and cognitive processing related to the rhythmic and semantic/harmonic incongruence of music and language. The research showed that rhythmic processing seems to be task dependent and that rhythmic structure is processed by the brain in both language and music. Stansell (2005) reaffirms that task sharing occurs and that language intonation relies heavily upon musical perception.

Recent experiments with dyslexic children (Overy, 2003, cited in Stansell, 2005) found that classroom music lessons had beneficial effects on rhythm copying, phonological and spelling abilities. Science has proven that music and speech share common neural resources as both share common cognitive hierarchies and that musical training improves the processing of linguistic syntax and prosody, phonological processing and intonation. This is accomplished by the combined use of music and language promoting network thinking in the brain. This evidence lends itself to the belief that the use of songs and singing can be beneficial in promoting and enhancing language acquisition (Overy, 2003, cited in Stansell, 2005).
The Brain, Language and Singing

Singing plays a part in tuning the mind, as songs are the medium in which children develop their knowledge of the world and their environment (Bannan, 1999). Singing releases the chemical oxytocin, which promotes relaxation (Pochmursky, 2009). Music and song synchronises people and “promotes social cohesion” (Sting, cited in Pochmursky, 2009).

Singing is an extension of speech (Humphries, n.d., WAOSA, 2001). However, too many times teacher’s state: “I can’t sing. I can’t keep a tune” (Personal communication, 2008). Ball (2010), as well as Stewart and Willamon (cited in Howard-Jones, 2010) state that adults self-diagnose themselves as having the rare clinical condition of tone deafness, which is defined by the Harvard Medical School (2007) as Amusia (the inability to identify differences in pitch or to follow a simple tune). Researchers have shown that only one in twenty people truly suffer from this condition. Interestingly, impairments associated with this condition are not limited to music as sufferers also have reduced ability in interpreting emotion and intonation (Thompson et al, 2012).

In many countries and cultures, singing is a social part of life and to say that one is not musical is to say that one is not alive. Music is not seen as separate entities of playing, moving and singing, but as a whole (Cross, 2001; Staveley, 2011). In many cultures everyone participates in it and enjoys it. Humphries (n.d. WAOSA, 2001) asks, “Are we different in Australia?” Her answer is “No”. Humphries believes that there is a vicious circle, where individuals convince themselves and others that they cannot sing.

Australians have the belief that if previous generations couldn’t sing, nor can they. Ball (2010) believes this encourages children to stop singing at an early age. Suddenly they become embarrassed about singing, having music lessons and not sounding like their rock idols. Mathews (1940, p. 25) states, “often the same persons who object to singing in English will sing in German without a murmur.” The Ramones (1976 @ http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=WMG6YRGdJ-E) were a punk band from America who taught many people around the world, including Germany, to speak English through their simple and repetitive songs (Rey, cited in True, 2005).

Mathews (1940) also argues that the Italian language is well suited to song as it has a pre-dominance of vowel sounds making it adaptable to learn through music/song.
The human brain and song

Schon, Gordon and Besson (2005) and Brown (1991) believe singing is a universal human behaviour, well suited to a study of the relationship between music and language. However, they discovered that most studies investigating the relationship between music and language have done so separately. That is the studies either focused predominately on either music or language rather both simultaneously. This they claim is problematic as it difficult to compare results and to define what is statistically significant. Their main goal was to study the nature of the relationship between the linguistic and musical dimensions of song to determine whether they are processed by separate or integrated cerebral structures. Using Functional Magnetic Resonance Imaging (fMRI) and Event Related Brain Potential (ERP), they found that, overlapping brain functions processed both linguistic and musical dimensions of songs. These findings support the hypothesis that linguistic and melodic components of songs are processed via hemispherical interactions (Schon, Gordon & Besson, 2005).

To study the brain regions involved with listening and those involved in converting production of singing relating to speech 3t – fMRI (functional magnetic resonance imaging) have been used. These studies assessed hemisphere laterality and confirmed differential laterality for speech over singing occurs in the left temporal lobe whereas singing over speech occurs in the right temporal lobe. These studies further confirm that music and language promote network thinking (Callan, Tsytsarev, Hanakawa, Callan, Katsuhara, Fukuyama & Turner, 2006; Callan, Kawato, Parsons & Turner, 2007).

Further studies in the role of the cerebellum during the perception of speech and song (Callan et. al., 2006; Callan, Kawato, Parsons & Turner, 2007) confirmed that song and spoken language share many common features such as:

- Physiology for articulation: the manner in which speech is enunciated;
- Perception: the process of recognising and interpreting;
- Phonology: the sound system of a language;
- Phonotactics: the allowed letter arrangements of a language;
- Syntax: grammatical rules of a language;
- Semantics: the principles of meaning of a language, and
- Prosody: the rhythm structure of a language.

Zatorre, Halpern, Perry, Meyer and Evens (1996) suggest that song imagery is also associated with a network of cerebral regions and that it may be specifically
associated with retrieval or generation of auditory information from the memory. Levitin (2010) suggests that the brain uses song and music to learn, encode and preserve information. He says that rhythm, accent structure, assonance and alliteration help do this. Levitin (2010) believes that songs promote cognitive economy, which helps to generate correct answers rather than just memorisation. Table 2.9 lists examples of different song types and their benefits in developing cognition.

**Table 2.9: Songs and their Cognitive Benefits**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Song Use</th>
<th>Name of Song</th>
<th>Cognitive Benefit</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Knowledge</td>
<td>99 bottles of beer</td>
<td>Counting</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>The wheels on the bus</td>
<td>World awareness</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Counting out rhymes</td>
<td>Eenie, meanine, miney, mo</td>
<td>Vocal-motor coordination</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Memory training</td>
<td>I know an old lady who swallowed a fly</td>
<td>High memory load</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Memorisation of phrases</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Rhyme</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Alliteration</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Encoding information</td>
<td>How to songs</td>
<td>Used by tribes for remembering</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>which foods are safe to eat.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Levitin (2010)

Singing promotes listening, which is an active function, rather than hearing, which is passive. Merzenich and Taub (2008) explain that the human brain fails to remember when individuals forget to listen. Skills such as rhythm, pitch discrimination, echoing, imitation and responding are also developed. Schunk (1999, cited in Stansell, 2005) supports Humphries’ argument reaffirming that singing helps prediction, group movement, promotes active learning, enhances long-term memory and helps unify the class. Singing in groups has a unifying effect, which may be caused through vocabulary recollection (Levitin, 2010). When people sing in groups and can’t remember a word, the person beside them can provide a trigger when they sing the first syllable of that word. This lowers the singer’s affective filter (Krashen, 1982) as the singer doesn’t feel threatened because, their error will be overpowered by the group. Jentschke (cited in Mannes & Smilow, 2009) conducted electroencephalograms (EEG’s) on boys in the St Thomas Boys Choir in Leipzig. He discovered that the choirboys who had musical training had an increased understanding of music and language syntax.

The tongue, teeth, lips and hard palate are responsible for diction in speech and singing, as they determine the shape of words. All of these elements are used to make up the sounds of a language. This supports Pritikin’s (2005) idea that children should be taught how the words ‘feel’ on their tongue, teeth, lips and palate. Correct pronunciation is the hardest thing to learn when learning a second language. Singing helps to tune the
ears to the intricacies of pronunciation and proper accentuation (Techmeier, 1969). Singing (Levitin, 2010) also promotes text memorisation via rote memorisation and chunking. Rote memorisation is continuous repetition (‘roting’) until the information is learnt. Chunking places emphasis on getting small parts right and being able to transfer the knowledge from one part to another and this is done by breaking the text down into bite-sized pieces. This makes the text easier to be memorised and organised by the brain, and allows for the chunks to be ‘stitched’ together later to form phrases and conversations. Musical memory allows this to occur as songs contain ‘chunked’ language, which ‘sticks’ in the brain. The Greeks used this strategy 2,500 years ago and it is represented in the Iliad (800 B.C./1991) and the Odyssey (800 B.C./2002).

The literature presented to this point strongly supports the benefit of music/song on cognitive and linguistic development. Both music and language use a variety of media for expressive means (gesture and writing), and are understood via various senses and structured embodied systems (Staveley, 2011).

The following section discusses the contemporary Language classroom and how contemporary Language theories can support the use of music and song in the learning of a second language.

The Contemporary Language Classroom

Modern language classrooms contain a diversity of learners (Scarino, 2010). All learners come with a history, which frames their reference of how and what they learn. New experiences are considered through this frame of reference, which leads students in constructing personal meaning, which leads to understanding. Scarino (2010) believes that teaching methodology and beliefs also depends on the teacher’s ‘life-worlds’.

Educators need to reconceptualise practices to move students from ‘doing’ activities (passive involvement) to ‘being’ involved in experiences (active involvement). The focus should be centred upon the meaning students gain from these experiences and how these meanings are used. Therefore, the view of curriculum as ‘fact’ needs to progress to a view of curriculum as a ‘lived experience’ (Scarino, 2010). Students learn languages best when they enjoy the experience and are able to manipulate language (Bembridge, 2010). Students enjoy learning when they feel engaged, empowered, successful and safe. Bembridge (2010) states, that to achieve this in the classroom, teachers need to provide students with explicit instruction and feedback in a supportive environment. Students must also be provided with modelled examples, opportunities for practise and strategies for improvement.
“Children lose interest if language is not taught in an interesting way” (“Teacher blow,” 2012). The researcher concurs with the Government that technology plays an important role in contemporary education however, it should not be the sole mode of delivery (Gillard’s Asia,” 2012). Students need to be actively engaged in novel learning tasks which cater for diverse learners and develop cognitive capacity and neural networks. Following are seven pedagogical theories, which support the views of Scarino (2010), and Bembridge (2010).

**Second Language Acquisition Theory**

Language acquisition in native or second language occurs when a real message is understood subconsciously and the acquirer is relaxed and open to learning. It does not require use of grammatical rules or tedious drill, but it takes time, and develops slowly. Speaking skills develop much later than listening skills, even in perfect conditions. The best methods for second language learning are those that supply ‘comprehensible input’, which is the spoken and written input necessary for someone to learn a language, in low anxiety situations and containing messages that students want to hear. These methods do not force production, but allow the acquirer to produce when they are ready, recognising that improvement comes from supplying communicative and comprehensible input, and not from forcing and correcting production (Krashen, cited in Wilson, 2000). Krashen (cited in Schultz, 2005) specialises in linguistics and language acquisition theories, and constructed his theory around Chomsky’s ideas that language and grammar acquisition is an innate process, noting learners will automatically acquire language just by being exposed to it (Chomsky, 2006). Krashen’s theory (1982) consists of five main integrated hypotheses.

**One: The Acquisition/Learning Hypothesis.**

According to Krashen (cited in Schutz, 2005, p.3) “there exist two systems in Second Language Acquisition”:

1. The Acquired system: a subconscious process requiring meaningful interaction in the second language, and;
2. The Learning system: a conscious process, which is the product of formal instruction resulting in conscious knowledge. “Learning is less important than acquisition.”

**Two: Natural Order Hypothesis.**

The acquisition of grammatical structures proceeds in a predictable order.
**Three: Monitor Hypothesis.**

Language acquired subconsciously initiates our utterances and is responsible for our fluency. Conscious learned language acts as an editor. This conscious editor is what Krashen terms the ‘monitor’. Monitor over-users always focus on correctness and this leads to poor fluency. Monitor under-users choose not to use their monitor or have not consciously learned to use it. Their error self-correction is based on a ‘feel’ for correctness, and correction by others has little effect. Teachers should aim to produce optimal monitor users (Kashen, 1982).

**Four: Input Hypothesis.**

Teachers should provide students with comprehensible input that is just beyond what they know. Krashen terms this i + 1. It is similar to the notion of “Zone of Proximal Development” (ZPD) (Vygotsky, 1987, cited in Riddle, 1999, p. 2). Developed by social constructivist, Vygotsky, the ZPD is the distance between actual and potential development levels. It is the difference between what the learner can do without help and what they can do with help. By providing scaffolds, such as guidance, the learner is assisted through the ZPD. When the learner has constructed knowledge, the scaffolds are removed. For a second language learner this means that language production emerges and is not taught. During this time there is a ‘silent period’ where the learner is familiarising themselves with the new language being presented and thus there is a period of time where nothing is produced.

**Five: Affective Filter Hypothesis.**

This is concerned with a student’s attitude towards learning a second language. The learning environment needs to be supportive and stress free and the student needs to experience success during learning. If these conditions are provided then there will be greater language acquisition as the learner’s affective filter is low. The affective filter is an impediment to learning caused by negative emotional responses to one’s environment, which causes a learning block. If positive learning conditions are not provided and the learner feels anxious, then this will cause the affective filter to be raised and therefore minimise language acquisition.

Krashen (1982) believes that grammar is not necessary in acquisition. He believes that when students are ready they will ask and enter the stage of language appreciation. Taught rules should be simple ones which are easy to apply and learn. Errors should not be corrected. The goal of second language teaching is to prepare students to be able to understand language used outside the classroom. Therefore, the second language classroom is transitional and teachers need to accept that language is of primary
importance, not grammar. They should provide comprehensible input that is slow, meaningful, interesting and not grammatically sequenced. This enhances acquisition, as the affective filter remains low. Second language is acquired when the learner is focused on something else, while they are gaining interesting or needed information, or are interacting with people who they like or like to be with (Krashen, cited in Wilson, 2000).

According to Krashen’s theory (1982), music helps language acquisition subconsciously. Music and song provide students with comprehensible input which can help bring them to their ‘i + 1’ or ZPD as explained by Riddle (1999). It allows for language production as it lowers the affective filter. It creates a relaxed and stress-free environment conducive to learning.

**Total physical response**

No genuine learning can take place until there is a brain switch from the left to the right (Asher, 1993, cited in Lake 2002; Asher, 2001). There must be an image or action attached to the mental representation, as music and word uses both brain hemispheres (Asher, 2000). Total Physical Response (Asher, 1984) introduces language to the learner through commands. Learners demonstrate their understanding through action responses. Body movements indicate how comfortable they are feeling. The more movement, the more comfortable they are. The objective of this approach is to lower the learner’s affective filter (Krashen, cited in Wilson, 2000) while building student self-confidence. As the learner advances, all the elements of the second language can be woven into the commands. Learners will spontaneously begin to speak the language and these skills will then transfer into reading and writing. The role of the teacher is to work with and encourage the learner, not to force the language upon them. Language–body (kinaesthetic) communication is a powerful principle for learning, and it is a universal principle that holds true for any language and for any age group.

Having observed studies conducted on split-brain patients, Asher (1984; 2001) like Sperry (1972) concluded that the left hemisphere of the brain controlled verbal responses while the right hemisphere controlled non-verbal responses. The right hemisphere remained mute while processing information and could express itself by touching and pointing. It was also able to express appropriate behaviour in response to commands. Both hemispheres were able to interpret language but it was the right that deciphered meaning first in association with actions. The left hemisphere accommodates this association between the language and the actions and when ready,
speech is attempted. Throughout development, the right hemisphere overshadows the left, as understanding is demonstrated first by actions and then by speech. It seems a logical starting point to teach a second language with its content structured especially for the right hemisphere of the brain as it increases retention, internalisation and motivation (Asher, 1984; 2001). Asher (cited in Lake, 2002) recommends that students of any age and level should enter second language with stress free right hemisphere instruction. As the right hemisphere stimulation increases long-term retention, it effectively helps students internalize complex structures and that through motivating and enjoyable activities the left hemisphere will gradually attach speech. Songs with movement are effective when using this approach as students are actively participating and clearly demonstrating their level of understanding. Students experience success as the music lowers their affective filter (Krashen, 1982). Total physical response and music assists brain switch (Asher, 1984; 2001), as the left hemisphere learns the language while the right learns the actions, and this helps with memorisation.

**Multiple intelligences**

Intelligence is demonstrated by an individual’s capacity to solve problems, or to fashion products that are valued in one or more cultural settings (Gardner, 1993). Gardner originally formulated a list of seven intelligences. However, later Gardner acknowledged that nine exist. These are: musical intelligence; spatial intelligence; logical intelligence; linguistic intelligence; logico–mathematical intelligence; bodily–kinaesthetic intelligence; intrapersonal intelligence; interpersonal intelligence; naturalist intelligence, and existential intelligence (Gardner, 1993). Traditionally education systems throughout the world emphasise the importance of logic and mathematics in their curricula and ignore the students who have interests in subjects like the arts and linguistics (Gardner, 1993).

Gardner (1999) claims that the intelligences rarely run independently. They are used at the same time and are generally complementary to each other. This is important in the use of music in second language learning. Gardner (1999) defines linguistic intelligence as the ability to learn language, the capacity to use language to accomplish certain goals, the ability to use language for self-expression, and as a means to remember information. Musical intelligence (Gardner, 1999) involves the skills of performance, composition and appreciation. It includes the capacity to recognise and compose musical pitches, tones and rhythms. Gardner (1999) believes that musical intelligence runs in an almost structural parallel to linguistic intelligence.
Contemporary Music Approach (CMA)

The CMA approach (Anton, 1990 cited in Salcedo, 2002) uses song as a memory prompter. Step by step, it combines active and non-verbal processes of the right hemisphere with the verbal and logic processes of the left. It reduces student inhibition and facilitates learning and recall of grammatical features. It involves students singing and memorising lyrics, then building on what they have learned and writing new lyrics for the same melody. CMA lowers the affective filter (Krashen, 1982) and combines the creative, non-verbal, emotion processes of the right brain with the specific, verbal, and logic based learning of the left, promoting network thinking (Parsons, Fox & Hodges, cited in Hodges 2000). CMA encourages non-verbal discovery first and verbalisation of findings later, helping students improve their creativity, memory and ability to imitate (Mulligan, 1975, cited in Anton, 1990). Recording the songs allows for practice of pronunciation, rhythm and intonation.

The Din Phenomenon

The ‘din phenomenon’ according to Krashen is: “an involuntary rehearsal of words, sounds and phrases” (Krashen, 1983 cited in Salcedo, 2002, p. 56). Once a comprehensible input has stimulated the Language Acquisition Device (LAD) that is, the part of the brain which functions as a device for learning and understanding language, the din is activated causing repetition in the mind. This process indicates that natural language acquisition is taking place.

Song Stuck In My Head Phenomenon (SSIMHP).

When the din occurs with music, it is known as the SSIMHP (Murphey, 1990, cited in Salcedo, 2002). The song or melody involuntarily remains audible in the learner’s head. It continues to stimulate the Language Acquisition Device (LAD) long after the singing has stopped, further stimulating mental rehearsal and enhancing learning. Sacks (2007), refers to this as “brain-worm”, noting:

Many people are set off by the theme music of a film or television show or an advertisement. This is not coincidental, for such music is designed, in terms of the music industry, to “hook” the listener, to be “catchy” or “sticky,” to bore its way, like an earwig, into the ear or mind; hence the term “earworms” – though one might be inclined to call them “brain-worms” instead. (p. 42)

Intercultural learning

Currently a paradigm shift is occurring in Language learning. Languages are not only seen as a tool for communication. Increasingly they are being seen as a tool, which provides the learner with a means to understand and identify with others. As the world
is multilingual it is important to recognise and identify with other cultures (Kinder, 2008). Intercultural learning is:

An orientation to languages teaching and learning that sees language, culture, learning and teaching in this way is what we describe as *intercultural language teaching and learning*. This orientation builds on work across a range of disciplines that have sought to understand how people make sense of themselves, their world, and other people. (Scarino & Crichton, 1997, p. 1)

The Intercultural Language Teaching and Learning Project (ILTLP) was a major direction in languages education in Australia, which underpinned the *National Statement and Plan for Languages in Australian Schools 2005-2008* (MCEETYA, 2005), which was endorsed by all state ministers. The essential starting point for ILTLP is the way in which language is understood. Language is not simply a unified concept. It can be understood in many different ways and how one understands culture is integral to intercultural language learning. Culture is also understood in many different ways. Language is culture, culture is language, and therefore, to understand the culture of another, an individual must first understand their own culture (Liddicoat, Papademetre, Scarino, & Kohler, 2003).

Hofstede (1997) refers to culture as being the cumulative deposit of knowledge, experience, beliefs, values, attitudes, emotions, meanings, hierarchies, religion, notions of time, roles, spatial relations, the concepts of the universe, material objects and possessions acquired by a group of people. It is the sum total of the represented learned behaviour that are generally considered to be the tradition of that people and are transmitted from generation to generation.

Scarino and Crichton (2007) affirm the researcher’s belief that culture is to be taught implicitly with the language and not as a separate entity. “In a globalised world, the bilingual/bicultural person is the norm” (p. 3). In today’s global society the intelligence of culture is more important than ever. “Languages have a central role in this context because they mediate the interpretation and construction of meaning among people” (p. 3).

Music is effective in the transmission of what Hendon (cited in Lottgen, 1997, p. 163) terms culture with a small “c”. This is the concept of culture that focuses on the way of life and behaviour of people and it is most important when learning a second language. For example, by using gestures and facial expressions, a second language teacher can passively instruct essential components of the second language’s non-verbal
communication system (Senior, 1998). Too often teachers focus on culture with a capital “C” (Hendon, cited in Lottgen, 1997, p. 163), which are the artefacts and products of the country. The key intercultural goal is to move culture beyond the learning of facts and towards critical engagement with the language (McLaughlin & Liddicoat, 2005, p. 5). The teaching of languages needs to be more than just the mastery of a second language. It needs to be a conscious raising experience. It should endeavour to teach the students what it must be like to be in an environment where they cannot understand the language or the culture. Ultimately, this will assist a student gain an understanding of their culture and attitudes (Senior, 1988).

Music/song can also help people of the same culture to understand the subcultures that exist within it, therefore gaining an intracultural understanding of differences within their own societal cultural diversity. In the song Cleanin’ out my closet (Mathers/Eminem, 2002 [http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=RQ9_TKayu9s]) provides an introspective reflection of his life and culture by describing his troubled childhood, marital conflicts and his dysfunctional relationship with his mother. These situations may or may not be familiar to the listener, but they do provide an insight into the life and culture of the artist. The language used may not be appropriate or significant to the listener, but they are the tools that make the song personally significant and useful in transmitting “c” culture.

Most importantly, this thesis challenges Pinker’s ‘auditory/cultural cheesecake’ notion that music could vanish from humanity and the rest of an individual’s lifestyle would be virtually unchanged (Trehub, 2001). Music and language are fundamental to all cultures. It shapes who, what, understandings, beliefs, morals and ideals. Music, language and culture fit together and form a powerful triangle, which gives validity and reliability to all cultures and its people. One cannot exist without the other.

The Use of Music and Song in Contemporary Second Language Practice

For both music and language the transference from sound to writing and back from writing to performance, permits us a unique vantage for viewing the filtering process through which approximation takes place. We can expose the elements that are deemed…by participants as most important for the behaviour at hand. (Pearl, 2006, p. 136)

Medina (1993b) states that it is common practice to use music/songs in the classroom to support second language acquisition. While the literature presented is filled with positive statements concerning music as a vehicle for first and second
language acquisition, empirical support for music as a vehicle for second language acquisition is lacking, and there is a concern that music may simply be a supplementary activity with little instructional value (Medina, 1993b). Given that modern language classrooms contain many learners with diverse backgrounds (Norris, 2010; Scarino, 2010) and considering the effectiveness with which music/song creates a relaxed and comfortable learning environment, music/song appear to be the logical tools for use in a second language classroom (Abrate, 1983; Asher, 1984; Edwards, 1997; Falioni, 1993; Jolly, 1975; Kramer, 2001; Medina 1993a; Medina 1993b; Palmer, 2000 Shtakser, 2001; Zola & Sandvoss, 1976, cited in Willis & Mason, 1994). These writers believe that language teachers may be limiting their resources by not exploiting music/songs as classroom teaching aids. If music/songs are presented together with movement and attention catching, colourful visual aids then this will enhance acquisition further.

Zola and Sandvoss (1976, cited in Willis & Mason, 1994) believe that language teachers have underestimated the value of music/song. They maintain that teachers have limited the use of music/song to simple transmission of cultural elements and reinforcement of linguistic structures. They explain;

Song and speech are both produced in some form, structure or organization, through time, with rhythm and tone, and express and communicate some content through language. Song does not materially differ from speech quantitatively, that is, linguistically, and thus, as linguistically authentic and culturally reliable text, it represents not only valid material for language study but also, a valid medium for language learning. (Zola & Sandvoss, 1976, p. 85, cited in Willis & Mason, 1994, p. 103)

A summary of fundamental problems with language teaching include: teachers failing to see the interdependence between native and second language and culture; language being taught in isolation and by fragmentation; language being seen as an ‘object’ or artefact; too much focus placed on methodology; and teacher’s failing to see connections between language and culture (Tedick & Walker, 1994, cited in Mason, 1997).

A lack of teacher confidence and experience to incorporate music/song into their lessons may be another factor limiting the use of music/song in second language classrooms.

Maybe too many of us have had the experience of being criticised by a music teacher during our school days. I have heard so many teachers tell me apologetically that they have no sense of rhythm and can’t hold a tune. (Young, 2004, p. 1)
Other factors include: how the teachers were taught themselves, how the teachers were trained, colleagues and administration, exposure to new ideas, materials available, types of students, as well as their personal views on learning. All factors combine to limit the second language teachers’ use of songs and music in their classrooms (Freeman & Freeman, 1994 cited in Crookes, 1997).

**Music and teacher confidence**

The vast majority of students who study music were introduced to musical activities, such as group singing and the use of percussive “rhythm” instruments in preschool, kindergarten and early grades, without instruction by a formally trained music teacher… Therefore, teachers should be encouraged to bring or increase music in the classroom. (Weinberger, 1996a, Para. 4)

Many Australians view music as an activity that is watched, but not participated in (Costantoura, 2000). They have a utilitarian view that the primary function of music is for entertainment at concerts, events and celebrations (Gordon, 2001). A recent report by the Australia Council for the Arts (2010) found that nearly all Australians intentionally listened to recorded music and over half attended live performances. When broken down further, statistics showed that:

- 53% of Australians participated in music on a purely receptive (listening) level;
- 15% play a musical instrument;
- 7% do not participate in or attend any musical activity;
- 5% sing; and,
- 1% of Australians stated that they participate in music on a creative (composition of their own works) level.

This data included teachers. This is the cultural background that has shaped the thoughts and attitudes of teachers and by de facto, those of their students. Lowe (2008, p. 15) when researching Year Eight students’ attitudes towards music underscores: “Attitudes are a hypothetical construct and they are difficult to assess.” However, research has relied on the basic assumption that attitudes are stable and can be measured, yet attitudes are not stable. Attitudes change rapidly and may strengthen or weaken over time, with experience and exposure to stimuli (Stahlberg & Frey, 1988). Attitudes are a predisposition to respond to some class of stimuli with certain classes of response. They consist of likes, dislikes, beliefs and behavioural outcomes (Rosenberg & Hovland, 1960, cited in Lowe, 2008). Teachers are change agents and should be
encouraged to strengthen and extend their capabilities. Their styles and attitudes are deeply rooted in their experience and are developed over time, and that attitudes can only be modified by the teacher after they become aware that the new idea would benefit them (Lowe, 2008).

Musical activities develop reading and neuroanatomical abilities, verbal learning and retention while promoting language ability and creativity, as well as creating a productive learning environment (Yim, Abd-El-Fattah & Lee, 2007). However, research indicates that between 60–70 % of pre-service primary education students enter primary teacher training having no, or minimal formal music experience. This deficit understandably leads to low confidence levels when conducting musical activities with their students (Hennessy, 2000; Lawson, Plummeridge & Swanwick, 1994; Mills, 1995-6; 1989; Russell-Bowie, 1993). The research also notes that there are insufficient teachers in the primary schools to teach musical activities confidently, as many believe that music requires ‘special gifts’ that are only attainable by a chosen few.

In addition, attitudes towards the value of music could be transmitted into educational administration, where contemporary accountability approaches favouring economic rationalisation has led to funding for Music programmes and teacher training in Australia being reduced (“Academy needs,” 2012; Alter, Hays & O’Hara, 2009; Eisner, 1991; Gordon, 2001; Munday & Smith, 2010; Pascoe, Leong, MacCallum, MacKinlay, Marsh, Smith, Church & Winterton, 2005; Russell-Bowie, 2002; 1993). Arts subject are beginning to be omitted from the school curriculum and non-specialists primary school teachers are expected to teach Music themselves with little support (Russell-Bowie, 2002, Stone, 2006). This leads to many teachers having little confidence in their own musical ability and their ability to teach it (Alter, Hays & O’Hara, 2009; Russell-Bowie, 2002). As generalist teachers are expected to teach music, they are not trained to a suitable level that could qualify as a trained specialist teacher.

Investigation into the 2011 Bachelor of Education courses in Western Australia provided by: Edith Cowan University, Curtin University, Murdoch University, The University of Notre Dame and the University of Western Australia found that Music was included as part of core integrated Arts units, which also consisted of Drama, Visual Arts, Dance and Media [See Appendix C]. These core Arts units are studied for one semester in a course taking four years to complete at Curtin, Murdoch and Notre Dame universities. At Edith Cowan University, the core Arts units are studied for two
semesters in a four year course. The University of Western Australia does not offer a Bachelor of Education. It offers a Master of Teaching (Primary), which is a two-year post-graduate course completed after the completion of any first degree. This course also offers Music as part of an integrated Arts unit for one semester. The University of Western Australia (UWA) is one of nine universities across Australia, which offers courses in Italian studies, along with The University of Notre Dame. UWA is the only university in Western Australia, which enables students to combine Italian and Music studies. Appendix C provides a breakdown course structure for each Western Australian university. The result is inadequate music education provision and poor use of Music as a teaching tool. This results in pre-service teachers entering primary school classrooms with no experience of Music education. This may explain the negative perceptions and attitudes held by primary principles (APPA, 2007). Tertiary institutions allocate insufficient time and ultimately, do little to develop the confidence of the generalist pre-service teacher (Lephard, n.d. cited in Russell-Bowie, 2002; Temmerman, 1997).

Teachers require training in how to integrate the Arts within and across all learning areas. They require a basic Arts competency before they can even consider cross-curricula Arts and more. Although interdisciplinary approaches should accommodate more effective use of a primary student’s learning time, it also assumes teacher confidence and competency, which would allow generalist primary teachers to create relevant and appropriate Arts learning experiences. Therefore, such training would facilitate the needs and abilities of their students (Russell-Bowie, 2002; 2006).

Figure 2.4 below effectively demonstrates the interaction between teaching attitudes, teaching competencies, school and society (de Souza Barros & Elia, 1998).

![Diagram](image)

**Figure 2.4: Interaction between teaching attitudes, teaching competencies, school and society.**
Education systems change in accordance to societal issues. Ideally, times of change should foster personal growth and development for teachers. In reality, during these times teachers are stressed and experience deep feelings of inadequacy. In addition, during these times of change, some learning areas fall in and out of favour, with school administration and governments, including the Arts, Second Languages and Sciences (de Souza Barros & Elia, 1998).

**Societal pressures, educational reform and loss of subject status**

The 1990’s saw many educational reforms introduced into Western Australia. These included outcomes based education, middle schooling and portfolio-based assessment. Whilst these reforms were adopted with the best intentions for the students, they became a contentious issue amongst teachers, as they felt confused about what to teach and how, and unsupported in implementing the changes. Concern was also expressed at the superficial treatment of the curriculum, subject disciplines and related essential knowledge (Berlach, 2004; Berlach & McNaught, 2007; Donnelly, 2007).

In 2000, *The Status and Quality of Teaching and Learning of Science in Australian Schools* (Goodrum, Hacking & Rennie, 2000) described the reality of Science teaching in Australian schools. The data painted a disappointing picture in the teaching of Science across primary schools, with some schools not teaching Science at all. Science teachers felt under-valued, under resourced, overloaded with non-teaching duties, lacked confidence and had low self-efficacy. This final point reflected the marginalisation of Science at the tertiary level. Despite Science being a focus in 2000, it has received the second lowest allocation of time in school timetabling (Goodrum, Hacking & Rennie, 2000). This 2000 report has implications for other learning areas.

Based on this review, it was recommended that primary teachers be given access to quality professional learning and resources that reinforce novelty, language and student interaction involving group tasks. As an outcome of (Goodrum, Hacking & Rennie, 2000) the Australian Academy of Science (2005) programme, *PrimaryConnections* was released. This primary science programme linked Science to Literacy (Hackling, 2006) and is supported by ACARA (2012). This national professional learning model includes: workshops, resources, practice, reflection and links into social-constructivist pedagogical principles (Skamp, 2012). Data reporting the impact that this programme on teachers and students involved in its’ trial found that teachers self-efficacy improved as their knowledge and confidence in science increased. As teachers felt supported by ongoing professional learning, as well as the positive
response of their students, the amount time dedicated to teaching Science also increased (Hackling, 2006). This highlights how effective change can occur in Australian schools if:

- Teachers are supported;
- Time is allowed for change to occur; and,
- Quality teaching resources are developed.

However, as a result of economic rationalisation the current Gillard government has axed the funding to the PrimaryConnections programme across Australia (“Australian Prime,” 2011).

The Melbourne Declaration (2008) underscores the importance of teacher quality. This led to the formation of the Australian Institute for Teaching and School Leadership (AITSL) (2011) and the National Professional Standards for Teachers (2011). One of the aims of these initiatives was to provide a supportive framework within which teachers can improve and develop their performance.

**Benefits of Music/Song in the Contemporary Second Language Classroom**

The role of music/song in first language acquisition is easy enough to substantiate. Speech is learnt before vocabulary. Communication is made in a range of pitches, paving the way for phoneme and morpheme formation (Lake, 2002). “If used in coordination with language lessons, songs can be of great value” (Schoepp, 2001, p. 1).

“Music should be used to provide a richer encoding of language” (Palmer & Kelly, 1992, p. 539). When music, songs and words are combined to successfully match the stress and accent of a language, the learner demonstrates benefits in comprehension of words, prosody, attention span, new text and memory. The proper pairing of rhythm and words improves the minds ability to remember them and it can determine the success level of learning new linguistic information. Having fun and letting the words come naturally has much more in common with communicative language learning. This holistic approach to language learning focuses on making meaning by learning and using language for a purpose. The ideology behind this pedagogy supports ‘Gestaltism’, where the learning of the whole is greater than the sum of parts (Koffka, 1935). Teaching meaningful language in chunks encourages the students to learn to speak by speaking. This helps to move students from using formulaic language and individual words, which are used in fabricated situations to empowering them with the skills
necessary to participate in impromptu conversations. Music/song needs to become a naturalistic way of learning language and not just “a way of getting relief from tiresome vocabulary and grammar quizzes” (Leung, 1985, cited in Stansell, 2005, p. 20). With greater experiences in music/song, students should become active learners rather than passive ones.

Music/songs contribute to language acquisition by increasing attention (Schon, Boyer, Moreno, Besson, Peretz & Kolinsky, 2007). These researchers believe that musical contours in songs increase phonemic discrepancies in words and the consistent mapping of music and linguistic structure in song, by the brain, are optimal for the operation of the learning mechanism. Their findings show that adding melodic information when learning a second language facilitates segmentation and that music and language share the same modality allowing a unique overlap of spectral and temporal information. In their study into songs as an aid for language acquisition, Schon, Boyer, Moreno, Besson, Peretz and Kolinsky (2007, p. 982) reveal, “learning a foreign language, especially when learning to segment new words, the learner may largely benefit from the motivational and structuring properties of music and song”.

**Pedagogical Applications for Music/Songs**

“With some imagination, songs can be used to teach all aspects of foreign language” (Claerr & Gargan, 1984, cited in Salcedo, 2002, p. 9). When used effectively music/song engages students and allows them to enjoy themselves in a second language classroom (Lynch, 2006; Parker, 1969; Willis & Mason, 1994). It breaks up the monotony of the everyday classroom and allows them to gain confidence and enthusiasm towards second language learning. Music/song allows for practice of pronunciation and intonation. It can stimulate conversation if question and answer melodies are used.

Given that second language teachers, aim for meaningful communication in their students, it is important to consider Mora’s (2000) research, which notes that in everyday oral interaction, 15% of communication is verbal, 70% of what is communicated is done via body language, and 15% is communicated via intonation. Therefore, face-to-face interaction is just as much a call and response as it is an exchange of words. When second language teachers use music/songs in their classrooms, the literature states that they should do so for the following three reasons:

1. Affective reasons: Affective Filter Hypothesis states that the learner needs to feel comfortable and relaxed and enjoy the experience. This lowers the affective
filter in the brain making the learner less anxious and more receptive to learning (Krashen, 1982).

2. Cognitive reasons: Second language teachers should strive for automaticity. The repetitive nature of songs allows for practice leading to automation. Children don’t need to understand what the words mean because the actions can help them work out meaning. When learning to speak, babies recognise musical contours then they have a go at the word and later meaning comes (Gantbonton & Segalowiz, 1988).

3. Linguistic reasons: Songs give meaningful chunks of language. They provide real language and colloquial language. Songs create opportunities for indirect vocabulary learning and helps with the learning of lexical patterns (Demony & Harris, 1993).

Lynch (2006) identifies nine reasons why songs should be used to teach language. They:

1. Provide authentic and natural language.
2. Expose learners to a wide variety of vocabulary.
3. Are easily obtainable.
4. Can be selected to suit the needs and interest of the students.
5. Provide opportunities for grammar and cultural aspects to be introduced or revised.
6. Have a time length that is easily controlled.
7. Expose learners to a variety of accents.
8. Help relate situations and places in the second language culture to the learners.

Le’s research (1999) also supports Lynch (2006). Le’ (1999) found that not only does music pedagogically enhance teaching and learning a second language, but it also helps students gain an intercultural insight into the culture they are studying therefore, supporting the ILTLP focus. Medina (1993a) found that more words were acquired when sung rather than spoken. However, the greatest success occurred when songs were sung and illustrated, either with drawings or actions. This finding is consistent with Gardner’s (1993) where other intelligences help build interdependent neural networks. For Medina (1993a) many educators abandon solid practice that facilitates learning when using music and do not utilise the powerful potential music has in second language learning. In order to maximise the effect of music/song, care needs to be taken.
to infuse successful instructional practices. Simply teaching a song will not succeed in helping students acquire a second language (Medina 1993a).

Following Medina’s (1993a), study Halpern and Zatorre (1999) used Positron Emission Tomography (PET) to examine cerebral patterns associated with auditory imagery of familiar tunes. They concluded that the right auditory association cortex together with the right and left frontal cortices are used in imagery. Retrieval of music semantic memory is mediated by structures in the frontal lobe. Cognitively these mental structures allow students to re-enact the experience when it is no longer there. For second language education, this means that music/song assists in the retrieval of language.

Second language acquisition is also enhanced through music/song by providing an environment that expresses emotion and conveys meaning. Music/song helps with pronunciation and understanding vocabulary out of context. It facilitates language appreciation and grammar. Music/song encourages student success ultimately improving solidarity in the classroom as students begin to learn from and understand others. Music/songs have always been closer to student’s real life experiences than textbooks (Willis & Mason, 1994). With this in mind, teachers could make greater use of music/songs as song lyrics are a text just as language books are. It is important for teachers to combine music with movement and invite the students to leave their seats and become actively engaged. When planning a curriculum, it is essential for teachers to include the ideas and interests of their students. The combining of music/song with movement not only allows fun and important learning to take place but it also is effective in recognising the whole child (Palmer, 2001).

It is crucial to remember that language is still the focus, not music or singing. Therefore, activities should provide the student with a range of language learning opportunities to improve their language skills. Music/songs selected for use in the second language classroom must do something with the language. It should not be included purely a time filler (Medina, 1993a). This allows for new knowledge to be formed through interaction rather than one being ‘handmaiden’ (Eisner, 2004) or an add-on (Medina, 1993a) to the other. For this to occur, it is important to understand what constitutes a discipline (Toulmin, 1972) and what is really meant by an interdisciplinary curriculum.
Objective Knowledge, Disciplines and the Interdisciplinary Curriculum

Objective knowledge

Popper (1972) in discussing his theory of ‘Objective Knowledge’ explained that reality is formed through interaction, experience and theory. It is consistent with the knowledge of the time and is analogous to the role of adaptation in the evolutionary context (Lummis, 1986), facing a new problem and finding a solution leads to new knowledge. If individuals or groups fail to solve problems, their survival could be threatened.

In science, in order to produce new knowledge, previously established theories must be continually tested and at some point theories may be falsified (Popper 1963). What will emerge is an improved theory that will replace the old. Critical testing of a theory in science leads to change and for Popper this allows for the expansion and betterment of knowledge (Popper, 1972).

The researcher maintains that on the basis of evidence provided, the current status of music and second language acquisition in primary schools is not serving the best interests of Australian society. In keeping with Popper’s notion of ‘Objective Knowledge’ (1972) it is important to explore the notion of a discipline and especially, during this period of establishing the Australian Curriculum (ACARA, 2012), it is important to examine the assumptions behind the notion of a discipline and curriculum.

What is a discipline?

So far the literature review has canvassed the neuroscience that underscores the ‘best’ ways to stimulate the brain through novelty and the positive causal outcomes, and this stimulation underscores an interdisciplinary approach.

A discipline is “a collective human enterprise” (Toulmin, 1972, p. 359). Practitioners and participants of the discipline are committed to and agree upon then disciplines ideals and ‘act in the name of the discipline’ (Toulmin, 1972, p. 279) in order to guard its integrity. Toulmin categorises disciplines into two fields:

1. Compact disciplines: those organised with a common set of ideals, which impose demands on its participants, such as physics.
2. Diffuse/would-be disciplines: those, which do not have an organised and common set of ideals, which impose demands on its participants such as jurisprudence.
Benefits of an interdisciplinary curriculum

Education systems are responsible for helping students develop pragmatic and specialised knowledge in each learning area. Each activity has an effect on determining the cognitive skills and/or capacities they will develop (Eisner, 2002b). Education is at a time where it needs to be transformed rather than reformed. Transforming the education paradigm from standardisation to personalisation will allow students to discover and achieve at their own talents (Berlach & Chambers, 2011; Robinson, 2010). This will help students develop socially and individually by alerting them to the inter-relationship between the human and social fabric of the physical world (Lummis, 1986). The role of education is to prepare students for the future. To do this, the system must prepare them with the skills to succeed, and imagination and creativity is the source of that achievement (Robinson, 2010).

For over thirty years, the current formal education systems such as that found within WA reflects the broad political agendas of the Anglo-sphere. Often the curriculum has been criticised for lacking relevance for the majority of students, as they are grow up in a rapidly changing technological world. In 2012, the current educational rhetoric is marginalising the curriculum and preventing students from developing specialised knowledge as the education system pulls teachers towards generalisations rather than specialisations (Down, 2006a). The hegemonic play in education systems often tends to resist student participation, because other interests dominate pedagogy or neuroscience. The current system does not adequately promote cognitive development, or thinking skills through the Arts (Eisner, 2002). Instead, it consists of “school bound hurdles” (Eisner, 2004, p. 36) which include organised disciplines and standardised tests (NAPLAN, 2012), which place premium importance on achievement of goals and targets rather than celebrating variance and differences in intelligences amongst students (Down, 2006a; Eisner, 2004; Lummis, 1986; Sahlberg, 2011). A paradigm shift must occur that will allow educational philosophy and practice to be linked with biology and neuroscience, thereby enabling different kinds of student work and accomplishments to be acknowledged (Berlach & Chambers, 2011; Down, 2006a; Eisner, 2004; Punch, 2005; Lummis, 1986). In order for this to happen, Eisner (2002) believes that the Arts need to move from the periphery to the centre of the curriculum as they make specific and unique contributions to cognitive development, which cannot be as easily achieved in other disciplines. For example, the proposition that Italian as a second language can be effectively taught using music/song.
Connecting experiences between two disciplines (Popper, 1972) allows for transference of learning, as logical structures gained from one situation can be applied to another. This is something that is supported by ACARA (2012) and the Australian Academy of Science (2005). This is a constructionist view (Skamp, 2012), and of evolving knowledge (Popper, 1972) that allows cognitive concept bridges to be built, “across the learning areas” (Eisner, cited in Brandt, 1987, p. 7).

Irwin, Gouzouasis, Grauer, Leggo and Springgay (2006), state that connections exist between academic achievement and Arts instruction. In WA, the Beazley Report (1984) supported an interdisciplinary, integrated, multidisciplinary approach to education. A poly-sensory (Lummis, 1986), or an innovative interdisciplinary curriculum strengthens all human modes of perception including: visual, auditory, taste, touch and smell (Doidge, 2010a; 2010b). This occurs when the sensory areas of the brain are able to process information from any of the senses and not just those, which they are responsible for (Doidge, 2010a; 2010b). However, what was perceived as integration/interdisciplinary (a curriculum that is structured to study a topic by gathering and relating ideas from multiple disciplines in a way that makes each one inseparable from the other) was better characterised as ‘holistic learning’, such as a curriculum based on experimental learning, where the spirit of the learner is at the centre of the curriculum and meaning is made through multiple layers of experiences which help to define possibilities.

According to Irwin, Gouzouasis, Grauer, Leggo & Springgay (2006, p. 2): “… too often curriculum integration is perceived to be a taken for granted strategy (by teachers, principals and policy makers) implemented by teachers regardless of subject matter expertise…”. Eisner has continually underscored the harm caused by the dominance of hegemonic interests in the curriculum, where by politically elevated disciplines such as English and Mathematics often marginalise the true worth of effective integration. For example, ‘The Arts’ content is often presented without integrity or expertise, making them ‘handmaiden’ (Eisner, 1972), or a facilitation tool to other learning areas, rather than in relation or parity to other learning areas, as a partner with equal intellectual integrity. The Visual Arts are often reduced to an illustration in Mathematics, Society and Environment or Science investigation. Or Music, as a subject is viewed as a support for the weekly primary school assembly item (Eisner, 2002; Eisner, 1972; Eisner, cited in Brandt, 1987).
While the integration of disciplines is valuable, each discipline must establish and maintain its own intra-field validity consisting of its own internal concepts and understandings (Toulmin, 1958, 1972). All disciplines must be treated equally, with priority, be established and understood before comparative logic can establish and link it to inter-field learning. Inter-field validity draws similarities between the different disciplines to assist understanding in a shared logic. However, this can only be done once intra-field validity has been achieved. In order to know what channels a discipline borrows from another and how disciplines interact with each other one requires a good knowledge of the validity of each discipline. A discipline must be understood before it can be applied to others. “Too often an interdisciplinary curriculum is seen as a practical way of overcoming resourcing and time limits and disciplines lose their validity and knowledge base” (Lummis, 1986, p. 67).
CHAPTER II: SECTION THREE

The Orff-Schulwerk Approach to Teaching Italian through Music

Since the beginning of time, children have not liked to study. They would much rather play, and if you have their interest at heart you will let them learn while they play, and then, eventually, they will find they have mastered child’s play. This is true of any skill, but particularly, it is true of music. (Carl Orff, cited in Smith, 1976, WAOSA, 2001)

What is Orff-Schulwerk?

Orff-Schulwerk (German for schoolwork) is a general artistic education approach developed in the 1930’s by German composer Carl Orff (Frazee, 2006). Orff-Schulwerk has been popular as a teaching approach in music education since the 1950’s (Sangiorgio, 2007). It offers an active and creative approach to music making. Its principle concept is the unity of music, movement and speech with rhythm. It is multi-dimensional, combining cognitive, kinaesthetic, emotional and affective domains, ensuring meaningful learning as learners derive satisfaction from their ability to use the acquired knowledge for a purpose. This approach supports the neuroscience literature presented in the previous section.

Orff-Schulwerk is not a method that dictates learning, but rather a ‘pedagogical tool’ to assist teachers in ‘facilitating learning’. It is a way to teach and learn music based on the activities young children and primary students like doing such as singing, chanting, clapping, creating, dancing, improvising and playing. These instincts, which are directed by hearing, prepare primary students for literacy. This learning process is the same one that is employed when language is being learned. Orff-Schulwerk takes place in a relaxed and non-competitive atmosphere using traditional and/or original poems, rhymes, games, songs, chants and dances. Activities can be spoken, sung and accompanied in a variety of ways by using the voice, body percussion, instruments and natural objects found in the environment. Without the use of set rules, Orff-Schulwerk has endless variations. Activities are used as a means to an end, not as an end in itself (Frazee, 2006).

Orff was also a passionate gardener. Observing his garden, he noticed that the parts, which he had sowed in rows, even though pleasing, did not give him as much pleasure as seeing the parts where he planted the seeds in a haphazard way (Parker, 1986). Orff perceived classrooms as learning paths, but these “paths” appeared to be rigid and generally aimed at outcomes and standardised tests, reflected in Orff’s dislike
of the row sowed garden. The Orff-Schulwerk approach is structured, disciplined, flexible and planned, but as it is not a method that can be followed step-by-step from a manual, it requires effort and imagination from the teacher. The Orff-Schulwerk approach allows teachers to explore different paths (novelty), to modify learning goals and allows students to take teachers along the learning path on which they wish to learn. It may appear haphazard, but the seeds of learning are strategically placed to ensure that each student grows and develops at their own rate.

Orff’s educational framework was based upon Pestalozzi’s educational philosophy that education should be a balance of the three elements of hands, heart and head (Binder, 1970), a ‘polysensory’ approach that is inclusive of rich affective and cognitive domains of human experience. Pestalozzi believed that children and students should not be given ready-made responses to questions, but should discover answers for themselves. In the classroom Orff-Schulwerk involves singing, chanting, playing, moving, creating and dancing. However, not all lessons need to involve each activity. Orff-Schulwerk offers variety, breath and diversity to allow students to succeed no matter of their level. It brings the students back to their primitive traditions where movement, vocalising and playing instruments reflect the total response of the individual to the need of expression. Orff-Schulwerk accommodates the neural plasticity and novelty thesis as it assists in the hormonal release of neurotransmitters accommodating enhanced learning (Doidge, 2010a; 2010b; Walker, 2010).

Smith (1976, cited in WAOSA, 2001) states that communication and aural experiences are the pillars of Orff-Schulwerk. Orff’s purpose was not to create musicians, but to make music accessible to all (Parker, 1986). He wanted individuals to reflect on their education as a positive and pleasurable experience and to continue to participate in music through their adult lives.

In a 1930’s primary school classrooms in Germany, Music and Orff-Schulwerk was done every day and integrated within other curriculum areas. Therefore, it can be used by generalist teachers who have a love of, as well as a knowledge of music. In many ways, the generalist teacher can use Orff-Schulwerk in more ways than the Music specialist as they have more opportunity in their timetable (Smith, 1976, WAOSA, 2001). However, the better the musical background of the teacher, the better the results will be. This outcome is consistent with Toulmin (1958; 1972) and Lummis (1986), in reinforcing the essentialness of a strong disciplinary base for success in teaching, as a prerequisite for interdisciplinary approaches. In the contemporary context of an
Australian primary system, it would assume a commitment to participate in ongoing professional learning. By implication music needs to be a core requirement in the pre-service training of teachers, contrary to the current situation in WA, where its status is diminished.

Orff did not want teachers to imitate his classroom practices. Instead he wanted those attracted to his philosophy to adapt his pedagogical approach to their own situation and environment. His basic idea is that students learn by imitating, comparing, altering, thinking, applying and transferring knowledge (Steen, 1992). Higher order skills such as reading and writing occur when the need arises in the learner. Orff-Schulwerk lessons consist of a focus, a level of understanding to be achieved and a performance to demonstrate understanding. The aim of an Orff-Schulwerk curriculum is to develop a self-sufficient and motivated student who is encouraged to participate in activities that enhance their skill acquisition (Steen, 1992).

The Orff-Schulwerk approach is consistent with the neuroscience-research discussed. Orff believes that just as every student can learn a language, so every child/student can learn music. Speech is a key element of this approach, because Orff believed that the transition from speech to rhythmic activities and then to song was the most natural progression for a student (Orff-Keetman, 1950).

Orff-Schulwerk can be adapted to facilitate the learning of both Music and Languages as it focuses on student development, linguistic development and on the ‘sound-before-sight-before-theory’ hypothesis. It presumes that speech, singing and playing precedes reading and writing. However, Orff-Schulwerk places most emphasis upon creative musical expression (Orff-Keetman, 1950). Perez (2009) describes creative musical expression as improvisation, which is the skill of creating music without a score or sheet music. This, the researcher maintains, makes it an effective tool in the second language classroom as the Orff-Schulwerk approach allows students to receive an extensive and broad ‘interdisciplinary’ understanding. It allows the student to learn the language and then manipulate the language to create purposeful phrases relevant to their needs.

Nurturing the spirit, creativity and imagination is vital to the high levels of novelty found in Orff-Schulwerk approach. Orff-Schulwerk teachers respond to this by “teaching students to learn by doing, through imaginative play and child centred experiences” (Warner, cited in Frazee, 2006, p. 105). It is consistent with the
assumptions behind the Australian Academy of Science (2005), *PrimaryConnections* programme.

**The importance of speech in Orff-Schulwerk and in language learning**

Humans (*Homo sapien sapiens*) are the only primates to possess a lowered larynx, therefore giving them the ability to sing. This relates directly to the evolution of language (Patel, 2010). The lowered larynx increases the range and discriminability of speech sounds. This provides more room for the tongue, allowing it to move both horizontally and vertically in the vocal tract resulting in a more distinctive palette and acoustic resonance. The human body uses a number of its parts to produce speech. These include the lungs, throat, lips, teeth, tongue, palate, uvula, larynx, glottis, mouth, nose and pharynx (Pritikin, 2005).

“Speaking fluency is not taught directly. It emerges after the acquirer has built up competence through comprehending input” (Krashen & Terrell, 1983 cited in Nuessel & Cicogna, 1991, p. 475). Speech activities are fundamental in the Orff-Schulwerk approach as they provide immediate access to sound qualities, which, is a step towards pitch and rhythm awareness. Attending to the qualities of words, students become aware of the qualities of their own language and to that of others represented in their classroom communities. This is an intercultural process and it is essential, for if students are to embrace other languages and cultures, they must first embrace their own (Scarino, 2010; Scarino & Crichton, 2007).

Patel (2008) also believes that in order to speak a language with native fluency, its phonemes, vocabulary and grammar must be mastered. Patterns of timing, flow of syllables and accentuation also need to be mastered as each language has its own rhythm, which form part of speaking competence in a language. Attentiveness to sound is the beginning of the musical development process. Young children learn speech sounds by firstly learning the sounds of vowels and consonants. Secondly, they learn to replicate them and thirdly they learn intonation.

Use of the informal voice and parametrical motifs (associations of voice and movement that represent images and sounds in the real world) allows students to find the vocal timbre to provide the sound (phonic) and therefore, say the word (Sangiorgio, 2006; 2007; 2012). As movement is connected with the voice, it helps the student to interpret and clarify vocabulary meaning (Sangiorgio, 2006). It is beneficial when teaching students how the sound feels (in their throat, face) when they produce it correctly and also cultural idiosyncrasies such as hand gestures.

The importance of singing in Orff-Schulwerk and in language learning

“Songs are the glue of cohesive culture. A room full of people singing not only makes an important personal connection but a vital cultural one as well” (Goodkin, cited in Frazee, 2006 p. 41). Songs introduce students to real life situations, vocabulary, other cultures and builds acceptance. As the voice is also an instrument it makes sense that singing is also one of the most effective methods in the development of sound awareness skills (Sangiorgio, 2012). These skills are critical if a student is to learn to read successfully. Canizares (n.d.) states that children should be allowed to play with the sounds of a language – the phonics. Pure phonics instruction can be difficult for first time readers to comprehend. As songs are both spoken and heard, it allows the first time reader to learn a song and feel the sound of the language in a sonorous mode before having to read it.

The importance of moving in Orff-Schulwerk and in language learning

Movement informs thinking as it supports neural connections and activates the learning process. Orff’s instinctive understanding of these connections led him to develop the tools necessary to practice and develop them (Staveley, 2011). Like the principles of language, music is in the body and it must be brought out and developed (Blacking, 1973). Contemporary Australian society does not encourage this, preferring spectator behaviour rather than active participation during musical experiences. This creation of the disembodied phenomenon has disassociated the body from the mind in musical experiences (Cross, 2001). Yet, movement is the pre-linguistic mode of communication. It is thought that speech evolved from gesture and assisted in the sequencing of ideas (Blacking, 1973; Brown & Parsons, 2008; Levitin, 2006; Mithen, 2006).

Orff-Schulwerk involves: folk dances, singing games and creative movement, and these types of activities not only engage students, but also reinforce language as well as
helping to promote ‘body-language communication’. Allowing students to actively participate in lessons enhances memory retention, because the associated physical movement reinforces memory recall as ‘hard memories’ in the brain (Asher, 2000; 2001; Stavely, 2012).

**The importance of literacy in Orff-Schulwerk and in language learning**

**Audiation** occurs when a phrase or piece of music is known well enough that it can be heard within the inner hearing system long after the experience has ended (Gordon, 2001). Just as the development of the student’s inner hearing is important when teaching musical literacy it is also just as important when teaching language literacy.

Language is also acquired by hearing and speaking, and it is only much later that reading and writing of language is learned (Krashen, 1981). Literacy involves much more than reading and writing. However, popular belief is that to have musical literacy then one must be proficient in reading and writing musical notation (Gordon, 2001). Attaining musical literacy, like language learning, is a process of decoding symbols in order to use them for personal reasons. Before children come to school, they have accumulated a large vocabulary of words and phrases long before they encounter the alphabet necessary to read and write them. Similarly, Orff believed that students needed countless experiences inventing and playing with sound (rich experiential prior knowledge) before being presented with musical notation (Frazee, 2006; Steen, 1992).

**The importance of playing instruments in Orff-Schulwerk and in language learning**

Research (Kraus, 2007; Rickard, Vasquez, Murphy, Gill & Toukhsati, 2010) has discovered that playing a musical instrument significantly enhances the brain’s sensitivity to spoken sounds. Playing an instrument effectively improves memory and verbal recall, facilitates literacy development, comprehension, reading and verbal memory. Parsons (cited in Mannes & Smilow, 2009) believes that performing music successfully engages a diverse number of brain parts at the same time. This, in turn, results in cognitive advantages in the areas of motor and auditory skills. There are a number of Orff instruments available, both tuned (xylophones and metalophones) and un-tuned (maracas, claves, triangles, drums). However these are not essential. Students bring with them the most obvious sound source of all – their bodies including fingers, hands, legs, feet and voice. The human body is the first musical instrument.
The importance of authentic music in Orff-Schulwerk and in language learning

Washburne and Derno (2004) define authentic music as the quality of being genuine, not corrupted from the original. The search for authentic music is an ongoing quest. Abril (2006) believes that music should represent the culture of a people. It should be typical and characteristic, therefore demonstrating cultural validity. Abril (2006) believes that when looking for authentic music, teachers should look for reputable and reliable publishers. This will help to find music that will give the students an authentic cultural and linguistic experience. Teachers should use culturally authentic performances which avoid bias or stereotypical portrayals, and which are presented in the original text and avoids translations. Material should be age and school appropriate, and use a mix of traditional and popular music from the culture (Kramer, 2001). Borrowed music/songs from other cultures should be avoided as it can “imply that other cultures have nothing to offer and only imitate” (Griffen, 1979, cited in Salcedo, 2002, p. 78). It is also recommended (Abril, 2006) that teachers use text, which stress a grammatical point, a classroom theme and has clear diction.

Orff believed that authentic folk songs help to transmit and develop an understanding of culture. The learning of folk songs also assists students in understanding the prosody of language. It is through childhood folk music, such as playground chants, singing games and rhymes, that students discover the relationship of sound and movement (Frazee, 2006; Steen, 1992).

Orff-Schulwerk in the Contemporary Second Language Room

In order for foreign language teachers to use Orff-Schulwerk principles in the classroom, they do not need to be musical; they need to be able to make their language come alive rhythmically; that is they need to have rhythm. (Pritikin, 2005, p. 4)

Orff believed that primary students needed countless experiences inventing and playing with sound before being presented with the notation. Human language is acquired by hearing and speaking it first and it is only much later that the reading and writing of language is learned. It is the orientation of hearing and making sounds and rhythms first, before learning to read and write that can transform traditional foreign language classes into engaging, fun, and effective ones (Harp, 1988, cited in Kolb, 1996; Pritikin, 2005; Martin, Brogan & Archambault, 1990, cited in Kolb, 1996). The disposition of primary students towards rhythm and melody makes music an ideal tool for the macro skills of language learning; listening, speaking, reading and writing.
tuning their ability to hear rhythm, sounds and melodies provides students with a solid scaffold for learning the language in print (Pritikin, 2005).

The Orff-Schulwerk techniques of singing, moving, saying, playing and creating are well suited to the primary language classroom. Pritikin (2005) believes that all primary second language classes should begin with an articulation phonetics unit. The focus should be on: sound, tongue and lip position; aspirated sounds (production of sound/phonetic is accompanied by the release of air); as well as non-aspirated sounds (production of sound/phonetic is unaccompanied by the release of air) before they see the language in print. This is similar to the Orff-Schulwerk principle that primary students need to ‘feel’ the music first, and notation should only be introduced when they are ready and have a need for it. Adams (1997, cited in Pritikin, 2005) believes that this results in better word recognition, spelling, vocabulary and reading comprehension in relation to language. Bragger (1975) discusses the success of this technique in the teaching of music diction in departments of foreign languages at the University of Massachusetts. A music diction course was established to assist tertiary voice students to acquire pronunciation patterns systematically rather than haphazardly as was happening in their regular voice class. The sole purpose of the course was to develop tertiary vocal student’s sensitivity to sounds and provide an opportunity to practice correct pronunciation. Eterno (1961) compared the test scores of musical aptitude and of Spanish pronunciation with sixth, seventh and eighth grade students. The findings of this research indicated a direct relationship between musical aptitude and foreign language pronunciation.

Second language teachers are foremost teachers of language. It is essential to establish sound/symbol connections, as they are critical to accuracy in speaking, reading and writing. Rhymes and rhythms help primary students identify patterns that make language predictable. Primary students also develop phonemic awareness, expand vocabulary and improve decoding skills. Hansen and Bernstorff (2002, cited in Pritikin, 2005) and Levitin, (cited in Mannes & Simlow, 2009) reveal that:

- Music education enhances reading abilities, especially at the decoding stage, where students learn echo clapping and then generate their own patterns for others to echo;
- Learning about musical symbols representing musical sounds is similar to learning that orthographic symbols represent sounds for reading; and,
Learning that words are broken into phonemes, is like learning that notes represent the part of a whole melody or song.

Orff-Schulwerk in the second language classroom helps develop automaticity in speaking and reading as the activities help to develop a firm relationship between sounds and symbols of the language. A primary student’s fluency in speech increases as they can feel the rhythm of the language. Echo clapping techniques and rhythm instruments are the best way to teach the rhythm of the language as they help primary students learn syllabification, stress, and accents. The teacher is the model and modelled usage for imitation is important for fluency. Practice is the key for success with both music and second language acquisition (Krashen, 1982; Pritikin, 2005).

As feeling precedes understanding, the multisensory approach of Orff-Schulwerk encourages primary students to feel the music. This lends itself very well to the primary second language classroom and in helping primary students feel the language they are exploring. By feeling what they say, and understanding the relationship between what they say and read, primary students ultimately understand the relationship between what they say and write (Pritikin, 2005).

The rationale for using Orff-Schulwerk in the second language room is to enable primary students to find their comfort zone and to lower affective filter, (Krashen, 1982) allowing them to speak, read and write fluently. The ultimate goal is to have students gain a ‘feel’ for the language. Orff-Schulwerk rhythm techniques can be effectively adapted in the second language classroom and can facilitate communicative competence. Research has shown that music reaches the motor system and that musical training is not a prerequisite to move to a rhythm (Mithen, 2006).

Orff-Schulwerk in the primary second language classroom also caters for differentiation among students (Scarino, 2010). Differentiated learning instruction is based on inclusivity and teachers acknowledging that each student is different, having individual levels of learning, readiness and interest which must be catered for when designing learning tasks. Differentiation lies in making the same content accessible to all students through multi/interdisciplinary approaches using a variety of resources and scaffolds. It is about accepting that the understanding of the content will be different for different students (Berlach & Chambers, 2011; Norris, 2010).

Orff-Schulwerk, through its ‘polysensory’ approach and engagement of the primary student, allows them to participate in their own learning and captures their interest. It makes the content accessible to the primary student and allows them to
represent understanding in different ways by encouraging individual creativity. Orff-Schulwerk provides primary second language teachers with an effective pedagogical tool, which assists them to cater for different learning styles and expose others who have a different learning style to something new. Primary students should be involved in music making even if they can’t read music or play a musical instrument, as it is a way of thinking about music in non-musical terms. It is not about receiving a music education, but an education through music (Barenboim, cited in Mannes & Simlow, 2010).

Lowe (2010) states that language teachers have realised that there is significant value in learning a language practically. That is, to apply the language via speech and conversation as it helps students experience the mechanics of the language. Language teachers engage the student first with the sound and get them to converse. Our world is viewed in two primary modes. Visual, which gives us objective order and sonorous which gives us subjective order. As sound is more personal and interpretive, it has a closer emotional bond with humans. This perhaps gives a small insight as to why children and students are attracted to sound. Macarthur and Trojer (1985, cited in Stansell, 2005) claim that because music and language share essential qualities of rhythm, pitch, timbre and dynamics then methods for teaching them, such as the Orff–Schulwerk approach could work for teaching them both.

Mason (2010) provides evidence of how Orff-Schulwerk can be effectively used in a primary second language classroom by using strategies including gestures, speech rhythms and spoken ostinati, to help overcome language barriers enabling students to achieve educational outcomes.

As soon as I stopped trying to speak to my students…they were enthralled…I often found that these lessons were most effective as every student was so intent on interpreting and following my instructions that they forgot about chatting to the person next to them…Speech rhymes…simple, thematic and repetitive…students who are disadvantaged in language are able to contribute first with one word, then another and then another until they can say the entire rhyme along with the class. Spoken ostinati are a good way for students to further explore their knowledge…Words can also become the subject of play in a musical context…By playing with words I allow all of my students to experience language within music and language as music, the whole time practicing both their language and their music skills. (Mason, 2010, p. 58)

A Language teacher focuses on two types of tasks: Language practice and language use tasks. Language practice tasks focus on the students’ knowledge of the
mechanics of language. The purpose of these tasks is to see what aspects of the code students can control or what they can recall. It does not gain evidence on what the student knows about the language. Language use tasks are employed to elicit information about how a student uses their language knowledge to achieve particular communicative goals by engaging students in real world tasks that require them to use the language to achieve broader educational goals. In these tasks, language is used for a real purpose and emphasise the learner as a performer (Norris, 1999).

Orff-Schulwerk activities in the primary Languages classroom support this second language pedagogy. It allows the student to perform both language practice tasks and language use tasks. It also allows the teacher to use a range of tasks in order to examine and elicit student language capabilities. For example, if students were learning the phrase: “Che cosa mangi la mattina a colazione?” (Translation: What do you eat in the morning for breakfast?), a language practice task allows the student to practice the new vocabulary being taught in a scripted way. Examples include: a structured survey or role play or rhythm activities. This task allows for practice and repetition in a meaningful context. A language use task could be conducting a survey where students decide their own survey topic; composing a song, or writing their own role play. These tasks allow for communication and application of language, therefore allowing the learner to demonstrate what they know. An example of a language practice task using the Orff-Schulwerk approach is found in Appendix D.

Hansen and Bernstorf (2002, cited in Pritikin, 2005, p. 4) believe that, “discontinuing music education programmes could deprive students of kinaesthetic, aural, oral, visual and emotional experiences that help bring texts to life.” Due to the crowded curriculum, staffing problems and other barriers, it is essential that second language teachers look to integrate music in a meaningful pedagogical way into their programmes, as an effective teaching/learning tool.

**Orff-Schulwerk and Intercultural Learning**

Music is a powerful way to enhance personality and humanity beyond a self-esteem construct of ‘being’ as described by Heidegger as *Dasein*: “a way of life shared by the members of some community” (Heidegger cited in Stanford Encyclopaedia of Philosophy, 2011. Para. 14). The Orff-Schulwerk approach uses many procedures that are common in many musical cultures around the world such as oral learning, movement and improvising. However, its focus is not the musical product. Orff-Schulwerk is a holistic approach based on the understanding that humans are made up
of more that anatomical parts and that teachers need to consider the physical, emotional, social, cultural and cognitive parts of their students as well (Frazee, 2006). Humans are social beings who live via interpersonal relationships (Gardner 1983) while also being conscious of these relationships and their role within them (metacognition). The basis of the Intercultural Language Teaching and Learning Programme (ILTLP, 2003) is the premise that one needs to be conscious of their self before they can be conscious of others. (Liddicoat, Papametre, Scarino & Kohler, 2003) Orff-Schulwerk supports this notion as it promotes musical materials coming from one’s own culture as well as other cultures.

Music is a language (Albright, 2009; Lorien, 2011). However, ethnomusicology affirms that music is not a universal language nor is it a musical universal as a certain piece of music within a certain cultural context arouses a number of feelings and meanings that may not be shared by someone not from that same context (Sangiorgio, 2007). However, music is a bridge between people. It joins people and is a dialogue among cultures. Its non-verbal structure allows humans to understand and connect. Verbal-linguistic communication can deepen and establish unwanted barriers in communication where music can break them down (Sangiorgio, 2007). The teacher, regardless of their learning area, is an active agent of culture. They should consider themselves carriers of concepts, values and beliefs of cultural and human experiences. Sangiorgio (2007) supports the ILTLP notion that every learning group should be considered a cultural group which fosters communication among people. Learning happens not only within the group, but through it as everyone brings their own experiences and story with them. Music allows students to expand their experiences, understand the syntax in oral language and communication and build new meanings.

Even though Orff-Schulwerk originated in Germany, it has been used in other cultures, most recently in Taiwan (Lee, 2011). In each case Orff-Schulwerk takes in new forms with each teacher free to adapt the approach according to their context. The use of speech, rhythms, oral learning, movement and group work make it an intercultural music approach and an ideal foundation for growing awareness of the diverse musical styles of all people. However, Sangiorgio (2007) states that it does have its limitations. The reproduction of music can lead to poor authenticity and use of non-authentic instruments can alter sounds. Some languages (such as tonal Asian languages) don’t transfer to the rhythmic elements of Orff-Schulwerk, while some cultures, such as
Japanese, Chinese and Middle Eastern cultures, don’t promote body movement and creativity. This may limit Orff-Schulwerk’s successful application across all cultures.

Anthropology means “the study of man”: to say “Orff-Schulwerk as Anthropology of Music” means to say that we not only aim to develop the musicianship of our students, but also that we use music in order to enhance their personality and humanity. (Sangiorgio, 2007, p. 1)

**Summary**

It is not coincidence that the development of ACARA/NAPLAN reinforces the perception that the Australian educational process is to enhance the potential economic outcomes in the period of the post-global financial crisis. Although ACARA, has the potential to drive meaningful intercultural learning using Music to develop Italian as second language acquisition, the dominant drive is for an economic-education nexus. Worthy cross-curriculum priorities found in ACARA: accommodating Australia’s engagement with Asia, Sustainability and Indigenous histories and culture reflect the initial Rudd/Gillard Labor Government agenda, however, these priorities can by default also reposition some of Australia’s cultural and historical parameters, including the place of Italian culture, Italian language, as well as the historical significance of Romano history in the development in the contemporary Australian condition. Priorities in any curriculum design underscore hegemonic intent and therefore allocation of associated resources, including curriculum time (Sahlberg, 2011). From a purely utilitarian perspective, the rhetoric from ACARA emphasises an economic-centred curriculum, where the ability to display constant innovation, will maintain an individual’s competitive edge in the workforce. This rhetoric is a ‘contextual’ justification disguised as ‘essential’ benefit, as explained by Eisner (1972).

Despite ACARA/MCEEDYA’s (2012) rhetoric and assumptions that creativity (that is, the embedded neuroscience that explains the process) as being beneficial for the individual, it actually positions for example, the hegemonic intent of NAPLAN (2008) with its competition for narrow outcomes, which drives the Australian Curriculum in the most traditional sense through literacy and numeracy (Sahlberg, 2011). As part of a political loop of mutual interests based on perceptions of a successful education experience, it follows that principals (APPA, 2007) as well as well-intentioned supportive parents perpetuate the same hegemonic attitudes that block the path for creativity, including novelty as found in meaningful interdisciplinary approaches as explained by (Down, 1993; 2006a; Eisner, 1972; 2002; 2004; Lowe, 2008; Lummis, 1986).
The literature surveyed, underscores the importance of developing creativity in all students. It is unequivocal according to the neuroscience that it is ‘novelty’ that stimulates the chemistry that ‘builds brains’ (Doidge, 2010a; 2010b; Merzenich, 2009a; 2009b; Walker, 2010). Therefore, what determines whether one career is pursued over another depends on a primary student’s interest and confidence to construct meaning out of rich and novel cultural experiences, rather than NAPLAN results (“Unlock the creativity,” 2011). Collard (2011) notes: “What is necessary is a systematic long-term programme which can nurture a whole cohort of schools through a change programme that puts the pupil’s creativity at the heart of their practice” (“Unlock the creativity,” 2011).

The Arts in Education, in the Australian context have experienced a process of marginalisation and in the context of this research applies to Music. Musical experience relates to human physiology. Science supports that everything in the human body has the ability to vibrate and has a sense of rhythm. The body has a natural tendency to want to vibrate and communicate through vibration. Science has proven that music serves to synchronise the brain and to trigger neurons firing. It gives a sense of unity with something bigger than one’s self. Music creates communities by allowing humans to connect with themselves and others (Orff & Keetman, 1950; Heidegger, 2005; 2011). Through science it is shown that song and music lies at the core of life (Green, cited in Mannes & Smilow, 2009; Mithen, 2006; Levitin, 2010; 2008). “If music is to be a viable vehicle for second language acquisition to the same extent as non-musical means, then songs can no longer be regarded as recreational devises, having little instructional value” (Medina, 1980, cited in Salcedo, 2002, p. 8).

The current educational climate in Australia is one of confusion and unpredictable change with an Australian Curriculum still in transition. Teachers are being led by political rhetoric, standardised testing and accountability (Down, 2006a; Sahlberg, 2011). Parallel to this, the culture of schools accommodates performance standards, accountability, outcomes, systems management, curriculum alignment, and quality control (Down, 2006a; Sahlberg, 2011). Third parties are moving primary schools and primary teachers away from providing primary students with learning opportunities which are encouraging, challenging, just, equitable, thought provoking, inquiring, inclusive, achievable, successful, exciting, significant and well resourced (Down, 2006a; Sahlberg, 2011). Instead teachers are being pressured towards a curriculum
which is marginalising learning areas and moving away from specialists and towards generalist teachers.

Ellis and Fouts (2001) believe that currently primary school is so unlike the real world that it has little meaning to many students. An interdisciplinary curriculum uses the student as its centre and places emphasis on novel, naturalistic, real life learning activities, which lead to real world outcomes and experiences. This type of curriculum would harness the energy and cultural interests in students. It would transform their attitudes, allow them to embrace their identity and create together with others (“Unlock the creativity,” 2011).

Conclusion

Students will take songs outside the classroom and will go on performing or listening to them long after the lesson has finished. Unlike drills, which usually slip from the students mind as soon as they leave the classroom, songs can last a lifetime and become part of one’s culture. (Ianterno & Salerno, cited in Kramer 2001, p. 55)

This chapter has provided scientific, historical and educational evidence which supports the essential role of music and language in the:

- Historical context of Italians in Australia;
- Evolution of humans;
- Neurological and educational development of humans;
- Support of inclusivity of both Languages and Music in the primary school curriculum; and
- Use of the Orff-Schulwerk approach to teaching Italian through music.

Patel (2008, p.401) describes music as “a transformative technology” in that it transforms human life in ways that are deeply valued. The aim of this chapter was to challenge Pinker’s (1997) suggestion that music is useless and could vanish without changing the human lifestyle. Given the review of the literature, the collective evidence presented highlights the inconsistency of Pinker’s viewpoint. The advantages of incorporating music in the primary second language classroom have been explained. These advantages include: the importance of music and language on cognitive development, the potential of the human brain, intelligence and learning potential.
People often complain that music is too ambiguous, that what they should think when they hear it is so unclear, whereas everyone understands words. With me it is exactly the opposite… (Felix Mendelssohn, composer, 1809 – 1847, cited in Pearl, 2001, p. 3)
CHAPTER III
THE CONCEPTUAL AND THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK

Music is invaluable where a person has an ear. It lasts throughout life. (Thomas Jefferson, 1817, cited in Cripe, 1974, p. 2)

Introduction

The review of the literature in the preceding chapter explained the intercultural learning benefits of songs and music in second language learning, cognitive development and linguistic acquisition as part of comprehensive link to the processes neuroscience and the extension of into the Orff-Schulwerk approach.

This chapter contextualises and elaborates the conceptual and theoretical framework, which has driven this research. It describes the researcher’s personal teaching paradigm, ideology and perception on how knowledge is created. As a mixed methods approach centred in the qualitative domain, background information is also presented to accommodate the naturalistic paradigm of a primary school, the minor application of quantitative research tools, action research linked to critical self-reflection, as well as a designed intervention to support primary second language teachers.

This qualitative/mixed methods research accommodates the researcher’s own critical self-reflection and action research, specific to her experiences as primary teacher. The researcher intended to gain an insight into the ‘life-worlds’ of primary school Italian language teachers in WA from the following stance:

- Ontological (by mapping the shared teaching experiences and perceptions of second language teachers, as an agent of communication to be used as a diagnostic intervention programme);
- Epistemological (to apply personal teaching experience, research, and Orff-Schulwerk approach to second language upper primary contexts); and,
- Phenomenological (the careful study of second language upper primary teachers lived experience and their personal interpretations of their ‘life-world’ experience).

In respect to the first stance, it is important to contextualise ontology (the nature of being and the concepts which exist within the reality) within the domain of using music to teach Italian in the upper primary school. The researcher will design a specific ‘conceptualisation as ontology’ for the purpose of enabling specialised knowledge.
sharing (of music/song), and its educational application associated with the teaching of Italian as a second language in a primary school research context (Gruber, 1993).

In respect to the stance of epistemology (how we know and how we come to know), the researcher considers it important to investigate the associated knowledge and justified beliefs associated with using music to teach Italian in the upper primary school. The knowledge systems utilised were derived from the researcher’s personal teaching experience (critical reflective practice), research into the field (language acquisition, neuroscience, and specifically the Orff-Schulwerk approach).

Therefore, this epistemology is concerned with the necessary and sufficient conditions of primary music education and primary teaching of Italian as a second language, the appropriate pedagogical theories, as covered in the literature review, the structure of the research method and its limits. As an exploration of justified belief, epistemology aims to answer questions such as:

- How the researcher aims to understand the concept of justification of the music to teach Italian as a second language?
- What makes evidence ‘justified’ by the researcher’s teaching theories as tested?

This research will explore the context of the creation and dissemination of new Music-Second language knowledge associated with upper primary children (Chisholm, 1982; Lehrer, 2000; Stanford Encyclopaedia of Philosophy, 2005).

The third stance includes the phenomenological stance (the study of the reality from the person living it) to the research. In this respect, the researcher will endeavour to identify the phenomena of the teaching of Italian as a second language, through interpreting the personal experience of a group of Western Australian primary Italian teachers. This information and perceptions will be collected from teachers. This process, as discussed by (Lester, 1999), includes:

Inductive, qualitative methods such as interviews, discussions and participant observation, and representing it from the perspective of the research participants(s). Phenomenology is concerned with the study of experience from the perspective of the individual, ‘bracketing’ taken-for-granted assumptions and usual ways of perceiving. Epistemologically, phenomenological approaches are based in a paradigm of personal knowledge and subjectivity, and emphasise the importance of personal perspective and interpretation. (Lester, 1999, p. 1)
Therefore, the three stances come together to allow the researcher to investigate whether other primary Italian language teachers in WA use music/song in their Italian language classrooms. And if so, how these teachers use them. It also allows for an understanding to be gained of the situation and beliefs held by Italian teachers and their use of music in their Italian classes.

The Naturalistic Research Paradigm

A paradigm is defined as “a set of assumptions about the social world, and about what constitutes proper techniques and topics for inquiring into that world…a set of basic beliefs … a world view for how science should be done” (Punch, 2005, p. 27). This depends upon one’s own personal subjectivity and as such offers an ontological view of the nature of knowledge. In addition, it offers an epistemological means, of how this knowledge is generated. There is ongoing debate as to whether particular knowledge is generated as a science via objective means to test a theory against data, therefore quantitatively, or generated naturally by studying the social world in its natural state rather than in conditions contrived for research, therefore qualitatively. Therefore, the research supports a paradigm (Punch, 2005) of an overarching framework, which organises a whole approach to being in the world of teaching of second language encompassing all the implications that accompany it. Although this research emphasises a qualitative methodology, the research as a justification for the Orff-Schulwerk intervention uses the broad audit of neurological science to position the benefit to students.

Axioms of Naturalistic Inquiry

Axioms are “the set of undemonstrated and undemonstratable basic beliefs accepted by convention or established by practice as the building blocks of some conceptual or theoretical structure of system” (Lincoln & Guba, 1985, p. 33). As utilised in traditional logic, an axiom is a proposition that is self-evident. A logical statement has its own coherence and is assumed to be true.

The notion of truth can be both physical and metaphysical. However, for the purpose of this research truth is a metaphysical construct (outside the phenomenal universe), and therefore cannot be tested against external norms for truthfulness. Metaphysical beliefs have the form of an empirical hypothesis, but are in fact immune from empirical testing. Therefore, in the view of the logical positivists (Ayer, 2001), they would be considered literally meaningless. However, within the paradigm used for
this research (Punch, 2005), coherence of logic is part of a process of interpretation to assess the narratives from a context-specific situation associated with the teaching of Italian in upper primary schools. Within a common teaching context, the researcher will explore the commonality of a bracketed classroom experience (Heidegger, 2005; Husserl, 1983; Reid, Flowers & Larkin, 2005). This information will be accepted at face value as the teachers’ narratives represent an expert benchmark of teaching second language and an important unit of analysis (Heidegger, 2005; Husserl, 1983; Reid, Flowers & Larkin, 2005). The logic is coherent against everything else in the limits of a specific context of upper primary second language Italian, as well as the number of participants engaged in the research (Lincoln & Guba, 1985).

Therefore, the individual school research contexts have similarity, but they are not controlled absolute copies. When schools, teachers and students are compared as an interpretation of similar classroom contexts, their beliefs become fundamentally important, as they present a commonality to gauge a degree of ‘experiential truthfulness’ of teacher perceptions (Lincoln & Guba, 1985). Within the naturalistic paradigm five axioms apply (Lincoln & Guba, 1985). These are that:

1. Realities are multiple, constructed and holistic. Each teacher and student has an individual school reality, constructed holistically via multiple realities.
2. The knower and the known are inseparable and interactive. What each teacher and student know is inseparable from their reality, however interactive with the knowledge of others.
3. Only time and context bound hypothesis are possible. The degree of truthfulness is bound by time and school context.
4. All entities are in a state of mutual and simultaneous shaping. It is impossible to distinguish cause from effect. School, teachers and students are not controlled variables and therefore in a state of constant change; and
5. Inquiry is value bound. The values held by individuals in this research will drive their inquiry and study.

These five axioms imply that within the naturalistic paradigm, knowledge is a construction of a phenomenon, which is situated in a life-world \([lebenswelt]\) as described by Husserl (1983) and Heidegger (2005).

Knowledge as a phenomenon

Traditionally, knowing is often linked to a notion of thinking formed from Platonic rationalism. It is a method or theory in which the criterion of truth is deductive
and intellectual rather than sensory and based on doing (Reason & Bradbury, 2006a; 2006b). However, attention should be drawn to knowing through doing with an emphasis placed upon the social nature of the experience and action, where knowledge is constructed and generated by interaction in a natural, social environment. This stance lends itself to what Husserl (1983) termed as phenomenology. “Phenomenology is the study of how people describe things and experience them through their senses” (Husserl, 1913, cited in Quinn-Patton, 2002, p. 105). People can be certain about things that appear in their consciousness. In order to do this, anything outside their perception of reality must be avoided, as the data is absolute from where it begins. The realities and phenomena are described from the perspectives of the people involved. “We can only know what we experience” (Husserl, 1913, cited in Quinn-Patton, 2002, p. 105).

**Knowledge as a construction**

Constructivists study the multiple realities constructed by people. (Lincoln & Guba, 1985; Guba & Lincoln, 1989; Quinn-Patton, 2002) They begin with the premise that the human world (perceived experiences within the brain as one’s mind’) is different from the natural, physical world. Therefore, the human subject must be studied differently, by making the structures of consciousness and the phenomena that appear in the ‘acts of consciousness’, as communications of these ‘objects’ of systematic reflections and analysis. The process of systematic, phenomenological reflection determines the essential properties and structures of consciousness and conscious experience. In addition, an individual cannot critically reflect on an experience whilst living it. Reflection must happen after the experience. This means that notions of truth and fact must be observed within the reality and value framework from which it was obtained. Therefore, this approach is seen to provide a solid base for all human knowledge as it attempts to create conditions for a ‘sense of objectivity’ in a given study, which could have been regarded, as interpretative and therefore subjective. With any interpretation of experience, subjectivity will apply, as interpretation always involves a perception of an event or context.

**Knowledge as a life-world**

Edmund Gustav Albrecht Husserl (1859 – 1938) was an Austrian born philosopher and mathematician. He broke with the positivist orientation of science and philosophy of his era and founded the twentieth century philosophical school of phenomenology. Accordingly, phenomenological descriptions are concerned with bracketing of common experiences to gain an understanding of the life-world reality (Husserl, 1983). For the purpose of this research, the primary Italian classroom is the
life-world reality. In order for the researcher to gain an understanding of the life-world within, commonalities occurring within each must be identified and bracketed together.

Martin Heidegger (1889–1976) was a German philosopher known for his existential and phenomenological explorations. Heidegger argued that philosophy was preoccupied with what existed and had forgotten about the ‘ground’ of being. That is the person who is actually living the reality. In the case of this research, these are the teachers and the students engaged in second language classrooms (Heidegger, 2005).

Habermas described ‘life-worlds’ as a background environment filled with competencies, practices and attitudes represented in terms of one’s cognitive horizon. It consists of social and cultural linguistic meaning, which is open-ended and informal (Carr & Kemmis, 2002; Kemmis cited in Reason and Bradbury, 2001; Kemmis & McTaggart, cited in Denzin & Lincoln, 2005).

Habermas believed that whilst constructing theory, it is important to reflect the truth in its most adequate representation with the aim of developing practices that will achieve success in the real world (Gustavsen, 2001, cited in Reason & Bradbury, 2006). ‘Life-worlds’ may be conceived as a universe of what is self-evident or given, that is the world that is lived. Interactions between individuals are socialised by a shared background and coordinated through speech, implying ‘commitment to truthfulness’ and appropriateness (O’Brien, 2004). If there were reason to claim something as valid, then everyone concerned would come to accept the claim enabling capability and opportunity for understanding (Davis, 2008). A life-world encompasses all of an individual’s experiences. It is the background upon which all things appear and gain meaning. It cannot be understood in a static manner, as it is a dynamic horizon in which one lives. Nothing can appear in an individual’s ‘life-world’, unless it is lived (O’Brien, 2004).

In the disciplinary field of phenomenology, the concept of life-world places emphasis on the world as it is directly experienced. It embraces the subjectivity of everyday life and includes all individual, social, perceptual, and practical experiences occurring within. This contrasts the positivistic objective perception of the sciences, which in part employs mathematical processes into the sciences, including those investigating nature. The human constructed so-called ‘objective sciences’ also have origins in the life-world. However, they are not directly experienced as an everyday phenomenon. Through analysis and description of the lived reality, phenomenology demonstrates how theory and science originates from life-world experiences.
Mixed Methods

Mixed methods research is a research design with philosophical assumptions as well as methods of inquiry. As a methodology, it involves philosophical assumptions that guide the direction of the collection and analysis of data and the mixture of qualitative and quantitative approaches in many phases in the research process. As a method, if focuses on collecting, analysing and mixing both quantitative and qualitative data in a single study or series of studies. Its central premise is that the use of quantitative and qualitative approaches in combination provides a better understanding of the research problems rather than either approach alone. (Creswell & Plano Clark, 2006, p. 5)

Primarily, this research is qualitative; however, it does employ a mixed method approach in data collection in order to:

1. Test agreement of findings (Caracelli & Greene, cited in Harwell, 2011, p.151).
2. Clarify and build on the results (Caracelli & Greene, cited in Harwell, 2011, p.151).
3. Demonstrate how the results from one method can impact on inferences drawn from the data (Caracelli & Greene, cited in Harwell, 2011, p.151).
4. Triangulate the data (Plano Clark & Creswell, 2008).
6. Expand the breadth and range of the research (Plano Clark & Creswell, 2008).

In Action Cycle One and Three a questionnaire (a quantitative measure) was used to gather information regarding teacher and student demographics in order to contextualise the proposed research qualitative life-worlds, as well as sampling purposes. Figure 3.1 demonstrates how the use of quantitative measures has been used to provide breadth to the research and inform this qualitative research which provides greater depth to the results.

Figure 3.1: Mixed Methods balance employed in this research
Qualitative Research

“Research is conducted to solve problems and to expand knowledge…research is a systematic way of asking questions, a systematic method of inquiry” (Drew, 1980, cited in Bell, 2005, p. 2). Denzin and Lincoln (2008, p. 4) describe the qualitative researcher as a “bricoleur”, a maker of quilts and they construct knowledge as a “bricolage”, a quilt. They further explain that an interpretive bricoleur produces a bricolage that best represents the specifics of a situation. It is an emergent construction that changes and takes new forms as the bricoleur adds different tools, methods and techniques of representation and interpretation to the puzzle. Therefore, researchers make constructions for new knowledge out of a diversity of information and experiences.

Qualitative research is also empirical (by direct perceived experience) research where complex data (personal reflection of teaching) is not collected in the form of numbers, but in narratives (Punch, 2005). Qualitative researchers reject the absolute constraints of positivism (where personal knowledge and reflections are only considered valid if they are observable and measurable) explaining a shift towards post-positivism (where knowledge is based upon perceptions and reality independent of what we know) that embraces critical realism (access to knowledge is only known through the knower and the known). This notion assumes construct of an ‘independent reality’, a complexity of intersubjectivity and existences, which is too extensive to be studied by the traditional scientific method. That is, some things are too complex to be reduced to numbers, or it is inappropriate to do so. Unlike the more easily isolated independent variable of some scientific experiences, human and cultural studies have multiple factors influencing outcomes (Punch, 2005), not one independent variable to be manipulated and a dependent variable to be observed and measured.

All observations are fallible, limited to human senses and interpretation, not without error and can be revised (Popper, 1972). Popper offered a Three Worlds of Knowledge paradigm for exploring the universe, which he referred to as Objective Knowledge. For Popper, this objective realm of the nature of reality occurs when the subjective judgment about reality matches the phenomenon. He saw all human knowledge as provisional, conjectural, hypothetical and born from human problems and human attempts to solve them. This problem-solving involves the formulation of theories which explain anomalies in existing theories and go beyond existing knowledge. Admission that knowledge is based on current knowledge and subject to
change when new knowledge becomes available, which contradicts the old knowledge, proves that objective knowledge exists (Popper, 1972). Popper as a philosopher of science, sees specific application of his ideas in the testing of scientific theories, but his conceptual modelling is useful for appreciating the complexity of what is ‘knowledge’ and ‘objective knowledge’. His was an evolving notion of knowledge that was constantly subjected to testing to find any weakness. The researcher has utilised the ‘objective knowledge’ found in neuroscience, to position her intervention project, which accommodates interpreted personal experience of both teachers and their students.

The practices of critical and self-critical thinking are important to knowledge contribution that individuals can make to World Three Objective Virtual Knowledge. This constant feedback can occur by conscious self-criticism, creating new knowledge. Within the realm of Popper’s World Three, people try to construct theories based upon the knowledge produced by World Two processes. These World Two processes emerge from World One processes of existence and perceptions of reality (Popper, 1972). This is explained diagrammatically in Figure 3.2 below.

![Karl Popper’s Three Worlds of Knowledge](image)

*Figure 3.2: Karl Popper’s Three Worlds of Knowledge*  
(Maturana & Varela, 1998)

Mindful of this, qualitative/post-positivist researchers employ multiple measures to gain a better understanding of reality. Post-positivists reject the idea that one cannot
understand another due to the diversity of experiences and cultures. Rather, post-
positivists embrace this diversity and believe knowledge is constructed on individual
world-based perceptions. This paradigm accepts the fact that humans are all biased in
their observations. Triangulation and critical reflection are tools employed to ensure an
enhanced ‘degree of objectivity’ in this research approach is achieved (Punch, 2005). As
Popper (1972) explains:

…the world of the mind – becomes on the human level, more and
more linked between the first and the third world: all our actions in the
first world are influenced by our ‘second world’ grasp of the ‘third
world’. (Popper, 1972, p. 149)

**Elements of qualitative research**

Good qualitative research (Cobb & Hagermaster, 1987; Denzin & Lincoln; 2005;
Miles & Huberman, cited in Punch, 2005) works toward:

- Intense prolonged contact in normal ‘banal’ situations reflective of
everyday life;
- Gaining a holistic view of the context under study;
- Getting an ‘insider’s viewpoint’ via interactions with participants;
- Isolating key themes;
- Describing the way people come to understand, account for, take action
and manage their everyday situations;
- Gathering many interpretations of material;
- Little use of standardised instruments, because the researcher is the main
instrument of the study;
- Use of language for the purpose of analysis and to construct knowledge;
and
- Ongoing development of instruments and materials.

As this research was concerned with Italian primary classroom life-worlds
(Husserl, 1983), the ‘grounded’ beings (Heidegger, 2005) of teachers and students, and
their constructed theories based on realities (Popper, 1972), qualitative measures were
considered appropriate.

**Strengths of qualitative research**

Lincoln and Guba (1985) consider the following to be strengths of qualitative
research:
Conducting research in a naturalistic setting allows the researcher to gain contextual and in-depth understanding of realities; Electing to use human participants as primary data gathers, the researcher is able to gain and evaluate meaning of interactions; Knowledge that is intuitive and tacit together with that which is propositional allows for the researcher to gain appreciation of multiple realities; Purposive sampling allows for an array of multiple realities to be uncovered. It allows the researcher to consider the environmental conditions, constraints, biases and locally held values increasing the external validity of the research; Using a flexible framework allows for the research to be revised as new information emerges and for the research methods to be adapted accordingly; An informal and relaxed data collection technique leads to increased participation, which engages group members, and helps raise awareness of the issue being investigated; ‘Thick descriptions’ are obtained based on observations and interactions with participants therefore, increasing validity; and Data collection is usually non-intrusive allowing participants to continue to function normally in their natural environment.

Limitations of qualitative research

“Without rigour, research becomes worthless, becomes fictional and loses its utility” (Morse, Barrett, Mayan, Olson & Spiers, 2002, p. 2). Often quantitative researchers state that the flexibility and nature of qualitative research is not conducive to the rigour of reliable and valid research. Quantitative researchers, whom are often critical of qualitative approaches, believe that rigour is difficult to maintain, assess and demonstrate, as there are too many uncontrolled variables, biases and subjectivity. They state that as data is only collected from a few cases in qualitative studies, it cannot be generalised over a large population (Morse et al, 2002).

Another potential limitation of qualitative research revolves around the personal skills of the researcher. The researcher must be disciplined and pro-active if the research is to be valid. If the researcher is not disciplined and well organised and therefore not
able to cope with the volume of data collected, then the data collected may be rendered useless (Morse et al, 2002).

Finally, qualitative research is time consuming as it focuses on natural settings and prolonged engagement. Therefore, it can lead to researcher and participant fatigue (Morse et al, 2002).

**The Issue of Trustworthiness**

Guba and Lincoln (1985) consider the basic criteria to establish in qualitative research is trustworthiness. Guba and Lincoln believe that trustworthiness consists of credibility, transferability, dependability and confirmability. They believe that the traditional criteria used to assess the rigour of research; namely internal validity; external validity; reliability and objectivity do not apply to qualitative data. They consider the idea of trustworthiness better reflects the underlying assumptions of qualitative research and offer it as an alternative to the traditional critique for quantitative research. Guba and Lincoln (1985) define trustworthiness as follows:

**Credibility (Internal Validity)**

Results are credible from the perspective of the participants in the research. The purpose of qualitative research is to understand phenomena from the participant’s viewpoint. The participants are the only ones who can legitimately judge the credibility of results (Golafshani, 2003; Lincoln & Guba, 1985).

**Transferability (External Validity)**

The degree to which results can be transferred to other contexts or settings determines transferability. This is the primary concern of the qualitative researcher. The qualitative researcher must thoroughly describe the research, context and assumptions central to the study, providing what Geertz (1973) terms a “thick description” (cited in Lincoln & Guba, 1985, p.125). The researcher must specify everything the reader needs to know to understand the findings. The person who wishes to transfer the results is responsible for making judgments upon its suitability (Golafshani, 2003; Lincoln & Guba, 1985).

**Dependability (Reliability)**

Dependability occurs when researchers account for and describe the changing context in which the research occurs and the effect that they have (Golafshani, 2003; Lincoln & Guba, 1985).
Confirmability (Objectivity)

The degree to which others confirm results determines confirmability. Researchers must check and re-check data throughout the study as well as after to examine and make judgments about potential bias or distortion (Golafshani, 2003; Lincoln & Guba, 1985).

Triangulation of data is one method that can be used to reduce bias and increase truthfulness. In qualitative research, knowledge is socially constructed and changes according to personal circumstances. Therefore, it is important to understand and value multiple realities. To acquire multiple realities in a valid and reliable way, multiple data gathering methods are needed as multiple realities enables the data to be ‘triangulated’ or cross checked against one another increasing reliability and validity (Golafshani, 2003; Lincoln & Guba, 1985).

Morse et al (2002) also believe that trustworthiness is crucial, noting that if strategies are focused upon at the end of the research and are not verified throughout it, then the researcher runs the risk of missing serious threats to validity and reliability. As research must be truthful, applicable, consistent and neutral, verification strategies throughout the research ensure this is achieved.

Verification is the process of checking, re-configuring and being certain. It refers to the interwoven mechanisms used in the research to ensure its validity and reliability. As the nature of qualitative research is iterative rather than linear, data can be systematically checked on an ongoing basis and the research focus can be maintained. It is the task of the researcher to be responsive, open, sensitive, creative and insightful to the data as it emerges. They must proactively manage threats to validity and reliability to ensure that rigour and ‘trustworthiness’ is maintained. (Morse et al, 2002). To ensure that this research is ‘trustworthy’ and verified, the researcher endeavoured to employ 12 strategies. These are explained in Table 3.1.
Table 3.1: Verification strategies and evidence of their employment to ensure ‘trustworthiness’

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Verification strategies employed to ensure ‘trustworthiness’</th>
<th>Evidence of how verification strategies were employed to ensure ‘trustworthiness’</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Prolonged engagement</td>
<td>The research was conducted over a two-year time frame and included an eight-week intervention in the field of interest (schools and classrooms) in order to gain an understanding of the phenomena of interest (teachers and students).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Persistent observations</td>
<td>Achieved by identifying the characteristics and elements in the situation (schools and classrooms) that were most relevant to the problem.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Triangulation</td>
<td>Established using multiple data collecting techniques (questionnaires, interviews, intervention) and a mixed method approach to produce understanding of the ‘life-world’ (teachers, students and classrooms) situation.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Informal member checks</td>
<td>Achieved by reviewing research conclusions and interpretations with the research participants (teachers and students) to establish validity of the research account.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Audit trails:</td>
<td>Maintained by producing and keeping raw data, data analysis tables, summaries, notes, research proposals, academic presentations, personal journal, data gathering instruments, piloting of instruments, forms, schedules and letters at all stages of data collection.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Thick description</td>
<td>Accomplished by gathering data using multiple techniques (questionnaires, interviews and intervention) that provided comprehensive detail so that conclusions could be drawn and explicit patterns of cultural and social relationships (teachers and students) could be put into context (classrooms and schools).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Coherent methodology</td>
<td>Attained by employing an iterative three cycle Action Research methodology.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appropriate sampling</td>
<td>Completed by identifying and using a representative sample from the primary teaching population so that the research could be generalised back to the population.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Concurrent collection and analysis of data</td>
<td>Realised by collecting and analysing data as it was being collected and following the iterative approach of action research.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Theoretical thinking</td>
<td>Established by adopting the theoretical thinking of phenomenology and life-worlds.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Theory development</td>
<td>Attained by believing that theory development is constructed and interpreted in ‘live’ situations (Morse et al, 2002).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Please refer to Appendix E for a Timeline of Research
Action Research

Action research is a flexible spiral process, which allows action (change, improvement) and research (understanding, knowledge) to be achieved at the same time. The understanding allows more informed change and at the same time is informed by that change. People affected by the change are usually involved in the action research. This allows the understanding to be widely shared and the change to be pursued with commitment. (Dick, 2002, p. 2)

Action research represents inquiry into how human beings design and implement practice in relation to one another, and in this sense it can be defined as “the science of practice” (Dick, 2002). It is change oriented and brings about change that has positive social value. Action research is learning by doing, allowing people to learn through the action and of adapting existing knowledge in response to their experience with others in their environment (Allen 2001). Action research is comparative research in natural conditions and considers the effects of social action. By involving people, being flexible and using spiral steps to compose a circle of planning, action and fact finding about the result of the action research is responsive to the situation and the people within it (Lewin, 1946).

An action researcher is a change agent, an interventionist and a practitioner who influences the phenomena being studied during the action research process. Action research addresses whole system issues, which are multi-variate, underdetermined and which are best approached within a qualitative, holistic framework. The constructivist perspective of action research contributes to realisation of values. Action research researchers are not value neutral, however they need to be aware of themselves and of any bias they may cause (Allen, 2001). Wadsworth (1998) explains action research as a new post-positivist paradigm of social science that grasps the value driven nature of inquiry and focuses the research in the interest of those who experience the problem. It offers a better chance of building a theory, which contributes towards better practice. This differs from the old positivist paradigm of social science where a single reality exists independently of the observer and which is only discovered by an objective and uninvolved scientist.

Action research is used to achieve understanding and change at the same time. In action research the emphasis is more on what practitioners do, rather than what they say they do (Avison, Lau, Myers & Nielsen, 1999). It achieves the research outcomes by following action with critical reflection. Action research fits action and research together by alternating between them in a tight cycle which includes stopping, raising a
question, planning ways to get answers, fieldwork, generating an imaginative idea from fieldwork answers and new action. Then it follows the cyclical research process of reflect, question, fieldwork, analysis and new action (Passmore, 2001; Wadsworth, 1998). This cyclic process includes critical reflection, which is tested in action, allowing action research to be flexible and rigorous.

“Action research is unique in the way it associates research and practice, so research informs practice and practice informs research synergistically” (Avison, Lau, Myers & Nielsen, 1999, p. 94). It is an iterative process involving researchers and practitioners acting together on a particular cycle of activities, including problem diagnosis, action intervention and reflective learning. Action research looks at the problem from the point of view of those involved and can only be validated in unconstrained dialogue (Elliot, 1985; Elliot, cited in MacIsaac, 1996). This establishes a partnership of equality, respect and of value between researcher and participant (McNiff, 2002).

Action research is not a methodology or technique, but an orientation to inquiry that shapes practice and empowers all stakeholders involved in the process. Action research accommodates a democratic process as it develops practical knowledge by bringing together ‘action and reflection’ with ‘theory and practice’. It is done in participation with others, and the pursuit of practical solutions allows individuals to develop. Action research has the means to improve the practices conducted within the educational experience because participants are knowing and active, recognising that there exist shortcomings in their field and take a stance in regard to solving the problem (Hopkins, 2008; Passmore, 2001; Reason & Bradbury, 2001; Reason & Bradbury, 2006b; Reason, 2003; Reason & McArdle, 2006; Schon, 1983).

Finally, action research is a workable technique for classroom teachers as it places problem solving in a collaborative context. Reflection generates models from a previous body of knowledge and these models reframe the problem. Data driven collaborative analysis enables future predictions about personal and organisational change. Schon’s (1983) model of reflection-in action recognises that there is little or no separation between research from practice and from knowing and doing. Schon (1983) states that there are three ways to reflect:

1. Knowing in Action. In this stage knowing is tactic and implicit. These are spontaneous and intuitive actions, which often cannot be articulated. Schon believes that “every competent practitioner can recognise phenomena for
2. Reflecting in Action. “Every teacher must … endeavour to develop in him the ability to discover new methods” (Tolstoy, 1967; cited in Schon, 1983, p. 66). At this stage the teacher is thinking about what they are doing, while they are doing it. This thought leads to action as the teacher tries to make sense by reflecting on understanding, criticising, restructuring and embodying further action.


Schon (1983, 1987) believes the practitioner’s main aim is not only to improve their practices, but to see how their goals and the way they evaluate their work is shaped by the way they understand themselves in their context. It is the process of reflection and self-evaluation that allows them to change themselves and their practice. This allows them to explore and address the connections and tensions between the system and the life-world of the participant as they are lived out in practice. Parsons and Brown (2002), agree with Schon (1983) that teachers need to reflect ‘in’ and ‘on’ their action. “Teachers must be … active participant[s] in the learning process. They need to analyse, interpret information and use this information for future planning and decision-making. This leads to reflective teaching” (Schon, 1983, p. IX). Action research methodology provides teachers with a means for acquiring valid, useful data that can be used for the development of effective professional practice strategies.

Action research has been described as a vehicle for improving pre-service teacher education, ongoing staff development, professionalism and scholarship (Letiche, van de Wolfe & Plooij, 1991). It removes the stigma that “research happens in ‘ivory towers” (Parsons & Brown, 2002, p. 7). Heron and Reason (2001, cited in Reason & Bradbury, 2006) also consider that research is usually thought of as being done by people in universities and institutes. Participants are treated as passive subjects rather than active ones. They believe that the problem with this is that there is very little connection between the researcher’s thinking and the participant’s life-world. Good research is conducted ‘with’ rather than ‘on’ people and ordinary people can conduct research (Creswell, 2009).

Finally, action research is concerned with developing new ways of bringing change, developing public knowledge and promoting learning to ensure that the change
process is sustainable. It aims to solve practical problems and contribute to knowledge at the same time as developing self-help competencies of people. It is not for the formulation of universal laws but to gain specific insights (Allen, 2001; Passmore, 2001; Susman & Evered, 1978). The focus of action research is not on ‘getting it right’ but endeavouring to make appropriate choices in different situations. It is crucial that the researcher is aware of the choices and considers them well. These choices made in the research must be clear, transparent and articulated well to all stakeholders (Reason, 2003).

**Limitations of action research**

Action research may have potential problems. For it to be successful researchers need to be explicit about their approach, criteria, management of data, problem diagnosis, action intervention and reflective learning (Avison, Lau, Myers & Nielson, 1999). If not, what is being described may be an action but not research, or research, but not action research. Researchers and practitioners need to share a mutual ethical framework. Successful action research is unlikely when there is conflict between researchers and practitioners or among practitioners themselves (Avison, Lau, Myers & Nielson, 1999).

**The Role of Action Research in the Current Educational Climate**

“The process of learning…is how we transcend our local and temporal environment by trying to think of circumstances beyond our experiences…by trying to find, construct and invent new situations” (Popper, 1972, p. 148). The current educational climate in WA requires teachers to constantly enhance their professional knowledge and skills. Initiatives such as Level Three-teacher status (DoE WA, 2009), *Professional Standards for Teaching* (WACOT, 2007b), *Professional Standards for Accomplished Teaching of Languages and Cultures Project* (DEST, 2005), *The National Professional Standards for Teachers* (AITSL, 2011a) and *The Australian Teacher Performance and Development Framework* (AITSL, 2012b) all have this as a core requirement. Each stress the importance of self-development, critical reflection and evaluation into one’s practice, high level of ongoing professional growth, enhancement and application of professional knowledge, collaboration, life-long learning, professional relationships, ethics, values, respect, commitment, and personal responsibility.

The methodology of action research is ‘value driven’. It allows evaluation of what is currently taking place. An awareness of values demonstrates a willingness to accept
responsibility for thoughts and actions. This leads to accountability and ongoing assessment, which further builds on previous knowledge and allows for transference of skills, appraisal, self-evaluation, critical conversations and collaboration (McNiff, 2002).

**Applying the Action Research Methodology for the Purpose of this Research**

“All research implicates action. Things change as a result of research. People can choose to continue as before or to change to the new initiative. To ‘not change’ is still an action” (Wadsworth (1998, p. 6). However, when done well, participation generates commitment (Dick, 2002). To address and answer the research questions effectively, the researcher adapted McKernan’s action research model (McKernan, 1996, p. 29), employed Schon’s model of reflection in action and considered Reason and Bradbury’s (2006b) three broad pathways in action research when designing this research project. McKernan’s action research model is presented in Figure 3.3.

![Figure 3.3: McKernan's action research model (1996, p.29)](image)

**Figure 3.3: McKernan’s action research model (1996, p.29)**

**Action Cycle One: Knowing in Action**

**Teacher questionnaires**

Firstly, the researcher stopped and reflected upon their personal pedagogy, background and teaching situation. This led the question being asked, “Do other primary Italian teachers teach like me?” From this question, all other questions were derived. From these questions came the planning of an action to elicit answers to these questions. Decisions were made concerning the type of fieldwork that needed to be
conducted, or whether an intervention would need to be administered to gain responses to the raised questions. The researcher decided that a qualitative approach would be utilised given the nature of the questions and the research context. Quantitative questionnaires were used to establish a baseline standard of what was occurring in primary Italian classrooms across WA especially regarding the use of music/song as a pedagogical tool.

**Action Cycle Two: Reflecting in Action**

*Teacher interviews*

In Action Cycle One, the questionnaire allowed the researcher to identify the entire population of primary Italian teachers across the state of WA, those teachers interested in participating in Action Cycle Two and to sketch a contour of their demographic. In Action Cycle Two, interviews allowed the researcher to gather data and further information on the attitudes of various primary Italian teachers in regards to the use of music/song as a pedagogical tool in the teaching of Italian. The data gathered in Action Cycles One and Two provided useful tools in increasing the validity of the findings as the combining of the qualitative with the quantitative data allowed for comparable descriptions of the occurring phenomena.

**Action Cycle Three: Reflecting on Action**

*Intervention*

Data analysis from Action Cycles One and Two highlighted the need for an intervention. In Action Cycle Three, an Orff-Schulwerk intervention was designed and then implemented in six WA primary schools by seven teachers of primary Italian.

**Action Research: Three Broad Pathways**

Reason and Bradbury (2006b) believe that there are three broad pathways in action research and the most compelling engages:

1. First person action research: the ability of the researcher to inquire into their own life and assess its effects in the outside world.
2. Second person action research: the ability of the researcher to inquire face to face with others into issues of mutual concerns.
3. Third person action research: the researcher aims to extend their small-scale project by creating a wider community of inquiry.

This research was conducted in three action cycles and engaged all three levels of action research. First person action research was engaged in Action Cycle One. Second
person action research was engaged in Action Cycle Two and third person action research was engaged in Action Cycle Three.

**Summary**

Action research is educative inquiry, which involves intervention. It is a reflective process involving progressive problem solving. It involves individuals working collaboratively in a ‘community of practice’ and as members of a social group, to facilitate improvement and to solve problems. It is problem focused, context specific and future orientated. It is cyclical research where actions and evaluations are linked (Allen, 2001; Dick, 2002; McKernan, 1996; McNiff, 2002; Parsons & Brown, 2002, Passmore, 2001; Schon, 1983).

Action research aims at improvement by having participants involved in the change process. It has the potential to generate genuine and sustainable improvement in schools as it gives educators opportunities to test, reflect and assess; their pedagogy, ideas, new initiatives, new resources, new strategies, knowledge with colleagues and to gain feedback. It helps to make decisions about what to include in curriculum, instruction and assessment plans (Allen, 2001; Letiche, van de Wolfe & Plooij, 1991; McKernan, 1996; McNiff, 2002; Passmore, 2001; Popper, 1972; Schon, 1983; Susman & Evered, 1978).

This chapter has discussed the conceptual and theoretical frameworks used in the research; ontological, epistemological and phenomenological stance of the research and researcher; the naturalistic paradigm and, action research and its application in the current educational climate.

**Conclusion**

This research employed a mixed methods approach. This approach included both quantitative and qualitative tools in which the intended action research would accommodate new knowledge in the form of interdisciplinary pedagogy, in the application of music/songs in the teaching of Italian to upper primary school students. The new knowledge involved the critical reflections and interactions of the teachers and students.

This research was approached from a post-positivist paradigm and followed an action research methodology (Allen, 2001; Dick, 2002; McKernan, 1996; McNiff, 2002; Parsons & Brown, 2002, Passmore, 2001; Schon, 1983). The researcher’s objective was to construct and interpret knowledge of upper primary Italian teachers in WA, for the
betterment of teacher practice, which could also be useful for third parties. This epistemological stance lent itself to a naturalistic ontology (Lincoln & Guba, 1985; Punch, 2005) as the researcher wished to gain a phenomenological understanding of how successful the research was from the viewpoint of those involved. This reciprocal partnership allowed for a two-way contribution, built a model for learning, and challenged, as well as assisting participants in finding new ways of doing things.

Many people often remember rhyme, rhythm or melody better than ordinary speech. (Falioni, 1993, p. 98)
CHAPTER IV
RESEARCH PROCESSES AND METHODOLOGY

Music…can name the unnameable and communicate the unknowable. (Bernstein, cited in Musica Viva flyer, 2009)

Introduction

Chapter III discussed the theoretical framework of this research. It presented information concerning the researcher’s ontological and epistemological viewpoint about the generation of knowledge, the naturalistic paradigm, qualitative research and the action research methodology. Chapter IV explains in detail how the theories and methodologies were applied during the research.

Teachers as Researchers

“The teacher needs to be a researcher…part of the research community; if not then research will not apply to education” (Stenhouse, 1983, p. 212). Teacher research can have a profound effect on those involved, as it has the power to change and transform schools. By involving teachers in research it enhances their self-esteem, critical thought, collaborative skills and awareness of student needs (Atay, 2006).

The current research paradigm is the belief that “research happens in ‘ivory towers’” (Parsons & Brown, 2002, p. 7). This is contradictory to the teachers’ life-world as it fails to have meaning in the context of the teacher’s professional world (Roberts, 1994; McBee, 2004). It is important for teachers to be involved in research as this will help to change the current psychometric research paradigm being used in educational research to one based in phenomenology (Husserl, 1983), therefore, providing research with a greater practical value for teachers (Roberts, 1994). The classroom is the teacher’s laboratory in which they are able to test educational theory (McBee, 2004). It provides research with a naturalistic perception of the teacher’s life-world both within their classroom and their school accommodating post-positivism and critical realism (Stenhouse, 1981). Action research provides teachers with the systematic scaffold for observation, evaluation and reflection on their teaching pedagogy, as it is a cyclical and reflective data gathering method. This is the core of the performance and development cycle (AITSL, 2012b).

Reason and McArdle (2006) explain that action research has five dimensions. It:
1. Is pragmatic, as it addresses practical issues and makes links between theory and practice.
2. Is democratic, as it involves people and allows them to create their own knowledge.
3. Extends epistemology, as it promotes many ways of knowing.
4. Is ‘values’ oriented by allowing people to ask, “How can we contribute?”
5. Evolves over time, it is developmental and allows for self-reflection.

This research was the result of ‘personal’ self-reflection and action research. Through this research evidence was gathered as to whether other Italian language teachers in Western Australia (WA) used music/song in their primary classrooms and if so, how were music/song used? The research generated formal research questions, which were investigated in three action research cycles (April 2008 – September 2009). (Please refer to Appendix E for a timeline of the research process).

**Ethics**

Rowan (2006, cited in Reason & Bradbury, 2006, p. 110) states: “deeply engaged qualitative research leads to many ethical challenges arising,” with personal and social ethical implications that are complex. These include principals, the APPA, and tacit societal issues and prejudices (Down, 2004). These will be described later in the chapter. It is the ethical duty of the researcher to ensure that mistakes are not made and that the people and policies involved are always respected (Rowan, 2006).

Full ethical clearance was received from the relevant research ethic committees of all stakeholders involved in the investigation: Edith Cowan University (ECU), Department of Education of Western Australia (DoE WA) and the Catholic Education Office of Western Australia (CEOWA). The Association of Independent Schools of Western Australia (AISWA) schools is an independent entity, therefore no overarching ethical committee was involved. It is the decision of the ‘independent’ school principal as to whether research will be permitted. Please refer to Appendix F for the letter to the Research and Planning Unit and Appendices G, H, I and J for letters and forms forwarded to principals and teachers. The ethic policies and documents of each stakeholder were read and strictly adhered to by the researcher. The researcher was also required to attain a Working with Children Check (WWCC) before commencing Action Cycle Three of the research. This is an Australian Federal Government requirement for working with children.
Participation in this research was voluntary. All participants were informed of their right to withdraw from the investigation at any stage of the data gathering process. Interview transcripts were made available to all interview participants, on request, should they have wished to read and edit if necessary and desired.

Storage of Research Data

All information collected was treated with the strictest confidence. All data collected will be archived for five years at ECU. At the end of this timeframe all data will be destroyed. Hard copies will be shredded and any electronic data will be deleted. No participating person or school is mentioned in this thesis in a way that they may be identified. Names mentioned within the thesis are pseudonyms. Only the researcher has access to the research data.

Piloting

It is important in reflexive social science research for the researcher to report on not only what they have found, but the research process undertaken (Sampson, 2004). As qualitative research employs a range of data collection methods, piloting helps to alleviate some of the criticisms and accusations of subjectivity in the research by employing a verification strategy to ensure trustworthiness (Sampson, 2004). The following nine checklist items were considered:

1. **Instrument design**: Is the instrument clear and easy to follow?
2. **Understanding**: Is the instrument easily understood or is clarification needed?
3. **Comfort level**: Does the instrument cause hesitation?
4. **Timing and logistics**: Is the instrument easy to administer and how much time is required?
5. **Cultural sensitivities**: Does the instrument offend or make participants uncomfortable?
6. **Ambiguity**: Is the instrument understood by all participants the same way?
7. **Gaps in research design**: Are there other things the researcher could consider?
8. **Possible researcher risk**.
9. **Bias**.
(Morse, et al, 2002; Punch, 2005; Sampson, 2004)
This research was conducted in WA primary schools with teachers and upper primary students. Therefore, it was crucial to maintain good fieldwork relations as the research explored “unknown worlds” (Sampson, 2004, p. 399). Each data collection tool used in the research was piloted on a sample group prior to administration and tested for the issues stated above. The researcher considered this to be a crucial element in the research design particularly as much of the rich data collected was gathered via interviews. It is in this situation that Sampson (2004) believes that piloting is of most use. Whilst piloting the instruments addressed the mechanical issues of tool design and administration it is acknowledged that the personality and the reactions of respondents cannot be controlled.

**Instruments Used in the Research**

The researcher used a number of instruments. These are outlined below and discussion is provided to underscore the associated perceive advantages and disadvantages. However, in the end a researcher has to make a decision based upon a perception of informed balance within the finite resources available. All research has to consider issues of organisational sustainability.

**Questionnaires**

Self-administered questionnaires are instruments used to collect information from people, for a wide variety of purposes in a wide variety of settings (Bourque & Fielder, 1995). For this research, the researcher contacted DETWA, CEOWA and AISWA and obtained lists of Italian teachers and schools that offered Italian as a second language. Teachers and student participants were asked to respond to the questionnaires using pencil and paper. The researcher provided ‘hard copies’ so they could complete it at their convenience.

**Advantages**

Bourque and Fielder (1995) and Gray (2006b) believe that advantages of self-administered questionnaires include:

- Wide geographic cover allowing access to a large sample;
- Convenient and inexpensive;
- Require minimal personnel and equipment;
- Useful for measuring attitudes;
- Have a quick turn-around;
- Maintain high participant anonymity and reliability;
- Validity is high if constructed well;
Respondents are more likely to give complete, truthful answers if a researcher is not present; and

- Closed items can provide exact information, whilst open-ended questions can provide detailed information in the respondent’s own words, which is useful for exploration and confirmation of data.

Disadvantages
Disadvantages of self-administered questionnaires include the following:

- To reach a certain sample and lists may be needed;
- The accuracy of the sample is based on having a complete, current and accurate list of the population;
- The extent to which these lists are available, complete and accurate can only be assumed (this can be one of the disadvantages of utilising self-administered questionnaires);
- The data obtained cannot always be assumed to represent the population to which the researcher wishes to generalise it to;
- The nature of self-administered questionnaires lends itself to producing a low response rate; and
- Literacy and language used in the questionnaire construction could also be a potential disadvantage.

It is important to note that a researcher has no control over who responds, or whether the questionnaire was completed in consultation with a third party (Bourque & Fielder, 1995). Other weaknesses, such as participant’s only showing socially desirable responses, which could potentially result in a high percentage of non-response to selected items, also exist (Gray, 2006b). Despite the concerns relating to questionnaires, the researcher considered their effectiveness and efficiency to be advantageous.

Interviews
For the purpose of gaining a phenomenological understanding a semi-structured interview format allows for all respondents to be exposed to the same series of pre-published questions (Fontana & Frey, 2005). The open-ended nature of these questions allows for greater flexibility of respondents answers and fluidity in the way in which the interviewer asks the questions.

Telephone interviews
Today, the telephone has altered social relationships and in particular this technology has become an extension of the individual in society. When on the
telephone, an individual is engaged in activity. However, engaging in conversation via the telephone can produce a great deal of respondent anxiety, as there are no visual cues they can utilise. To reduce this anxiety an introductory statement is crucial. Telephone interviews are more cost effective when screening highly specialised populations (Frey, 1989). For the purpose of this research telephone interviews were utilised to overcome problems associated with distance, as some participants were situated in WA country regions. Telephone interviews were also conducted with student participants (Action Cycle Three) to maintain anonymity.

**Advantages**

Frey and Oishi (1995) and Gray (2006a) list the following as advantages of interviews:

- Are good at measuring attitudes and most other content of interest;
- Allow for probing and posing of follow up questions by interviewer;
- Can provide in depth information;
- Provide a quick turn-around, especially telephone and email interviews;
- Have moderately high validity and reliability rates when interviews are well constructed;
- Have relatively high response rates; and
- Are useful for explanation and confirmation of responses.

**Disadvantages**

Problems associated with interviews include that:

- In person interviews are usually expensive and time consuming;
- Some respondents may say what they think the interviewer wants to hear;
- The investigator may distort data because of personal biases or poor interviewing techniques;
- The interviewees may not recall important information and may lack self-awareness;
- Respondent anonymity may be low; and
- Data analysis is time consuming.

(Frey & Oishi, 1995; Gray, 2006a)

Given the richness of data, which can be obtained through interviews, the researcher believed it was a worthwhile process to use.
Focus groups

Focus groups are used in research to elicit further information or to validate participants’ responses. It provides a safe and open forum where individuals can come as a collective group to share and gain knowledge. It also allows them to express issues and concerns that cannot be solved individually (Kamberlis & Dimitriadis, 2005). These carefully planned discussions among research participants allow perceptions to be obtained in a defined area of interest in an open and non-threatening environment. As qualitative research focuses on the involvement of people, disclosures in a nurturing environment allow for the development of attitudes via interactions with others. These interactions are vital in expressing reality of the research and how it was applied in the natural situations of others (Krueger & Casey, 2001; Quinn-Patton, 2002).

Krueger and Casey (2001) believe that focus group questions should grow directly from the research and should be open-ended and unstructured to allow participants to answer in a variety of ways. They also believe that questions should be ordered from general to specific with those of greater importance placed early in the discussion. The interview should not consist of more than 12 questions and ‘why’ questions should be avoided as they can make participants defensive.

Advantages

The strengths of focus groups are to:

- Explore ideas and concepts;
- Provide a window into participants internal thinking;
- Obtain in-depth information;
- Examine how participants react to each other;
- Allow probing; and
- Allow a quick turn-around in data collection (Gray, 2006c; Kamberlis & Dimitriadis, 2005).

Disadvantages

Disadvantages of focus groups include:

- Reactive and investigator effects, as participants feel they are being watched or studied;
- Domination of the discussion by one or two participants; and
- Data may be difficult to generalise if small, unrepresentative samples of participants are used (Gray, 2006c; Kamberlis & Dimitriadis, 2005).
Understanding and accepting the disadvantages, the researcher decided to use this data collection method as it could add further depth to the data.

**Research Process**

This research project is an outcome of the researcher’s primary second language teaching, specifically linked to the following five reflective questions:

1. Do other Italian teachers teach like me?
2. Do they share a similar background?
3. Do they have a love of music?
4. Do they engage interdisciplinary approaches when teaching Italian?
5. Is Music successful in my Italian classroom because I am both a Music and Italian specialist?"

**Action Cycle One**

The aim of Action Cycle One was to identify if primary Italian teachers use music/song as a pedagogical tool and how they do so. From this aim the following research questions were developed.

**Research questions**

1.1 Do Italian language teachers in Western Australian primary schools use music/songs as a pedagogical tool in their classroom?
1.2 How do Italian language teachers in Western Australian primary schools use music/songs as a pedagogical tool in their classroom?

**Action Cycle Two**

The aim of Action Cycle Two was to identify the purpose for which primary Italian teachers use music/song in their classrooms. From this aim the following research questions were developed.

**Research question**

2.1 Why do Italian language teachers in Western Australian primary schools use music/songs as a pedagogical tool in their classroom?

**Action Cycle Three**

The aim of Action Cycle Three was to evaluate the effectiveness of the Orff-Schulwerk approach as a pedagogical tool in the teaching of Italian to upper primary students. From this aim the following research questions were developed.
**Research questions**

3.1 Do Italian language teachers in Western Australian primary schools consider the Orff-Schulwerk approach to be an effective pedagogical tool in their upper primary classrooms?

3.2 How well did the Orff-Schulwerk approach engage Western Australian upper primary students in the study of Italian as a second language?

3.3 What do Italian language teachers in Western Australian primary schools consider to be the essential knowledge and support structures needed for the Orff-Schulwerk approach to be an effective pedagogical tool in their upper primary classrooms?

**Action Cycle One**

The objective of Action Cycle One, was to answer the following research questions:

1.1 Do Italian language teachers in Western Australian primary schools use music/songs as a pedagogical tool in their classroom?

1.2 How do Italian language teachers in Western Australian primary schools use music/songs as a pedagogical tool in their classroom?

The researcher located 255 WA primary schools, which offered Italian as a second language. She also found that 215 primary Italian teachers taught in these schools. All of the teachers were invited to participate in the research. A questionnaire was designed and distributed to these teachers to establish how many used ‘music/song’ in the teaching of Italian. The purpose of the questionnaire was to gather baseline data regarding whether music/songs are being used in the classroom, the preferred activities used and how they were used, teacher demographic information, teacher background information, teacher language background information and musical competency of teachers.

**Sample of participants**

If a community of good teaching practice is to be created, it is important that classroom teachers receive support from all stakeholders in the wider educational community to participate in research as classroom teachers are the only ones in the unique position able to create it (AITSL, 2011a; 2011b, 2012a, 2012b; 2012c; Stenhouse, 1975; 1981; 1983; Stenhouse & Rudduck, 1985).

Kemmis (2001, cited in Reason & Bradbury, 2006, p. 94) explains that research by practitioners should be done on something they “do, rather than something that is
done on them.” This supports Habermas’ notation of ‘life-worlds’ (Denzin & Lincoln, 2005) in that others cannot enlighten the participants. Participants can only be enlightened or emancipated on their own terms. The researcher wanted primary Italian teachers to make an independent choice as to whether they would like to be involved. The danger with this is that the research may only involve those that have a vested interest in this area and are already using music/song in their second language classrooms.

However, criterion sampling identifies cases that meet some pre-determined criteria. The criteria for this research were all primary schools in WA that have Italian as a second language and primary Italian teachers. The researcher acquired lists of schools where Italian was offered as a second language from The DoE WA (170 schools), the CEOWA (79 schools) and AISWA (6 schools). A list of 215 Italian teachers was compiled via consultation with the mentioned educational sectors.

Instruments
Action research accommodates different techniques for data and information collection including questionnaires, interviews and focus groups. The flexibility of this approach means it is designed to work with and respond to authentic teaching situations and therefore, cannot be designed in advance. The design will emerge in time. In addition, meaning develops progressively within an organic concept of design, because it often influenced by unfolding events. This interactive process also accommodates the progressive analysis of data.

Responsiveness is the virtue of action research. It is the process of reflection, which provides the basis for learning (Allen, 2001). The rigour of action research lies in the quality and interpretations of the data. Therefore, the crucial part of each action cycle in this research is to find out how primary Italian language teachers:

- Think about their teaching.
- Reflect upon their teaching processes.
- Believe that they can improve their teaching.

Doing this allows teachers to become aware of their life-world and makes research practical to their perceived reality.

Questionnaire
The researcher devised a teacher questionnaire consisting of 29 items (Please refer to Appendix K). The majority of the questions were designed to elicit demographic information with items categorised into one of three constructs that identified teacher,
classroom and school demographics. It was considered important to elicit demographic information as it could provide further insight into the respondent’s life-world. Table 4.1 presents each item in its appropriate construct.

**Table 4.1: Teacher questionnaire constructs and their related questionnaire items**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Construct</th>
<th>Questionnaire Item Number</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>School Demographics</td>
<td>3, 4, 6, 7, 19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teacher Demographics</td>
<td>1, 2, 5, 8, 9, 13, 17, 18, 26, 27, 28, 29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Classroom Demographics</td>
<td>10, 11, 12, 14, 15, 16, 20, 21, 22, 23, 24, 25</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Several of the questionnaire items utilised a simple Likert scale. Bell (2005, p. 142) explains that: “Likert scales are used to discover strength of feeling or attitude towards a given statement.” Respondents were asked to rank in order of agreement or disagreement by matching a corresponding number and by arranging items from highest to lowest. The implication of these scales sees the higher the category chosen resulting in an enhanced strength of agreement. However, the intervals between the highest object and the lowest object may not be the same. One cannot assume that the highest ranking of five is five times higher than the lowest ranking of one. Likert scales purely indicate an order. Despite these limitations, Likert scales are useful to uncover individual attitudes toward given statements. Neutral responses were not used in order to make to respondent choose a particular value level as either positive or negative.

Questionnaire items 10, 14, 17, 18, 19, 21, 22, 23, 24 and 26 employ a two, three or four point scales. These questions were used to elicit positive and negative responses, establish middle ground of responses, to sense the range of teacher sentiment and to gain an interpretive indication of confidence. Remaining items required a tick response. The questionnaire was written in simple vernacular language that was empathetic and non-threatening to teachers.

The questionnaire was piloted with 15 secondary Italian teachers experienced in teaching primary students. This was considered essential, as the questionnaire was to be self-administered by each teacher. The researcher purposely did not use primary school Italian teachers, because this would have reduced the final research quantum. Feedback from the pilot testing revealed that no changes were required as all 15 persons involved fully accepted it. Each questionnaire took approximately 10 minutes to complete. The questionnaires were posted to teacher participants through the principal.
Procedures

The researcher contacted the principals of each of the 255 schools by mail. This is essential, as no research could be conducted on any education site, without the consent of the site manager. Information packs were sent to principals containing the following:

- Letter of proposal approval;
- Edith Cowan University (ECU) ethics approval letter;
- Covering letter to principal (Appendix G);
- Principal consent form (Appendix H);
- Teacher Participant letter (Appendix I);
- Teacher consent form (Appendix J);
- Copy of the teacher questionnaire (Appendix K);
- Copy of the teacher interview questions (Appendix L);
- DoE WA or CEOWA ethics approval letter; and
- A stamped self-addressed envelope.

The principals were given three weeks to return their consent forms. Upon their return, the researcher signed, numbered and stored in a document box. The researcher was then able to contact the teachers from which approval was granted by the principal. Information packs were mailed to the teachers and contained a:

- Covering letter (Appendix I);
- Participant consent forms (Appendix J);
- Questionnaire (Appendix K); and
- A stamped self-addressed envelope.

The teachers were given three weeks to return their completed questionnaires to the researcher via the stamped, self-addressed envelope enclosed in the mail out pack. When received, the returned questionnaire and consent forms were subsequently numbered by the researcher. The consent form was detached from the questionnaire and stored in a separate box to the questionnaire to maintain anonymity.

Analysis

Questionnaire analysis

The data collected from the questionnaire was entered onto a SPSS 13 data matrix and it was analysed according to frequencies and grouped into the emergent common constructs. These frequencies and constructs will be discussed further in Chapter V. The results were entered numerically. Names of teachers and schools were not written on the
questionnaires, or on the envelopes. This numerical coding system ensured that data could be re-identified with ease should a participant have wished to withdraw from the research.

**Action Cycle Two**

The objective of Action Cycle Two was to answer the following research question:

2.1 Why do Italian language teachers in Western Australian primary schools use music/songs as a pedagogical tool in their classroom?

From the Action Cycle One questionnaire, 34 primary Italian language teachers were identified who used music/song in their classroom. It was anticipated that interviews with these teachers, as part of Action Cycle Two would provide greater detail into why music/songs were being used in primary school Italian classrooms.

**Sample and participants**

Action Cycle One participants were asked to complete an expression of interest section if they were willing to participate in individual Action Cycle Two interviews. The teachers signed an attached statement and returned it together with the completed questionnaire. Sixteen teachers expressed further interest. The researcher then contacted interested participants by either letter or phone.

**Instruments**

**Interview**

The researcher devised nine interview questions, which asked the teachers their thoughts on:

- Why they used music/song?
- How music/song may enhance language acquisition?
- Whether they considered music/song important learning tools and why?
- Criteria they look for in selecting appropriate music/songs.
- Whether they considered Italian and music/song to share similar features.
- Their thoughts on teaching resources that could increase their use of music/song in the classroom.

Interviews were semi-structured with each taking approximately thirty minutes to complete and were recorded on mini-disc. The interview questions were piloted on three teachers not included in the main research sample. Feedback from pilot testing revealed that no changes were required as all three persons involved fully accepted it.
Procedures

As the principals of each school were aware that participating teachers could choose to be involved further in Action Cycle Two of the research, the researcher was able to directly telephone the 16 teachers who expressed further interest in the research and a willingness to be interviewed. From this sample eight teachers agreed to be formally interviewed.

Interviews were scheduled at a mutually convenient time and place, for both teacher participant and researcher, to allow for maximum privacy. If there was a difficulty with significant distance between the teacher participant and the researcher, or time constraints, then the interview was conducted via telephone. Each interview was audio recorded on a mini-disc recorder. Once transcribed, each participant was presented with the opportunity to access the transcript of the interview if they desired to read it and/or to edit.

Analysis

Interview analysis

Interviews were recorded, transcribed and colour coded manually by the researcher. It was anticipated that patterns would emerge from the data. Word documents were created and coloured tags were used to highlight common themes and categories. These common themes were “chunked” (Gray, 2006a, p. 26) or ‘bracketed’ (Husserl, 1983) facilitating identification, and concept maps were created based on the emerging themes. These findings are presented in detail in Chapter V.

Action Cycle Three

The researcher anticipated that the data gathered in Action Cycle One and Two of the research would contribute to a greater understanding of how and why Italian teachers in WA primary schools used music/song in their classrooms. It was also anticipated that by gaining an understanding of what was currently happening in schools, future teaching practice would be informed, leading to improve teaching strategies.

However, preliminary data analysis in Action Cycle One and Two found that resources, teacher confidence in using music/song and the use of music and song with upper primary classes were issues of concern among teachers. As an experienced Music and Italian primary specialist, the researcher had used the Orff-Schulwerk approach effectively to teach Italian to primary school students of all year levels. When reflecting upon this and upon the findings from Action Cycle One and Two, the researcher
considered it necessary to conduct further investigation via action research to help to address some of the issues arising from the data. This gave rise to another three research questions.

**Research questions**

3.1 Do Italian language teachers in Western Australian primary schools consider the Orff-Schulwerk approach to be an effective pedagogical tool in their upper primary classrooms?

3.2 How well did the Orff-Schulwerk approach engage Western Australian upper primary students in the study of Italian as a second language?

3.3 What do Italian language teachers in Western Australian primary schools consider to be the essential knowledge and support structures needed for the Orff-Schulwerk approach to be an effective pedagogical tool in their upper primary classrooms?

**Sample of participants**

*Cohort design*

According to Gabel (1995):

> I feel that we need to make a greater effort to involve teachers in action research. Teachers already know much about teaching. … It is through joint research that instruction in schools will improve, and we need to make greater effort in this regard. (NARST Presidents Speech, 24th April, 1995, cited in MacIsaac 1996, p.1)

Action Cycle Three of the research employs a cohort design. A cohort is a group of people who share something in common, in this case, the primary Italian teachers of WA. They remain in a research project for an extended period of time with the intention of moving the inquiry forward (Fink, 1995). Even though a true cohort design generally uses two groups, the cohort and the control, this research only involved one cohort. However, within the cohort group, the participating primary teachers fell into other categories. These included years of teaching experience, age, metropolitan or rural locations, differing educational sectors and levels of self-confidence when using music/song in the classroom.

The participants for this research stage are broadly representative of the cohort of primary Italian teachers. Two of the 34 Action Cycle One questionnaires returned were from male teachers. However, none of the Action Cycle Two interview participants were male and no male teacher participants took part in Action Cycle Three. Given that teaching is a female dominated profession (“Male teachers”, 2011; Milligan, Ashenden & Quin, 1994), particularly in Languages, this was considered to be representative of
the demographic. Further, while some participants in Action Cycle Three continued from Action Cycles One and Two, others teachers were new. New participants approached the researcher directly requesting to be part of the research. They stated that they had heard about it from their colleagues already involved and had approached their principals requesting further information. This highlights evidence presented in Chapter V that teachers were requesting professional development needs and support and they identified that this research could provide it for them. In preparation, new participants to Action Cycle Three completed the initial Action Cycle One questionnaire, but did not participate in the Action Cycle Two interviews.

Cohort designs require measurements at several points in time and may be subject to biases from selection (Fink, 1995). This means that those willing to participate may inherently be different from those who do not. That is, a teacher may already have a vested interest in the purpose of the research. This could pose risks to credibility by means of maturation, history, instrumentation and possible regression due to people’s views changing. Cohort designs also pose threats to transferability in ways, which includes: interaction of selection and the intervention; reactive effects of testing and possibly the innovation/intervention (Fink 1995). This was reconciled by making the research relevant to teacher life-worlds by involving them and their students.

Action Cycle Three ultimately involved six primary school Italian teachers with non-music specialist backgrounds working across seven primary schools. From the 18 schools which expressed further interest in the researcher in Action Cycle One, only seven were willing to participate in Action Cycle Three of the research. Six were DoE WA schools and one an AISWA school. Two were regional schools and five were metropolitan.

From the 16 teachers contacted, only six were willing to participate. Five teachers worked in DoE WA schools and one worked in an AISWA school. Five teachers worked in the metropolitan area and one worked in regional WA. It is to be noted that one teacher was working in two regional schools. This action cycle also involved 164 upper primary school students, of which 21 were interviewed.

One of the researcher’s specific outcomes as a teacher-researcher was to facilitate education change among the primary Italian language teacher participants through ‘doing’. The aim was to allow the teachers to think, reflect and problem-solve Italian language teaching problems together with their upper primary students. Ultimately, this makes the experience more rewarding and valuable to both teachers and students, as
they are able to construct knowledge that is meaningful and relevant in their specific life-world of the upper primary Italian language classroom.

Fielding (2004, cited in Hopkins, 2008) recommends using students as ‘co-researchers’ as they can assist with analysis, because students have a different point of view from their teachers. Accordingly, the researcher chose to survey and interview the students. By using students as ‘co-researchers’ the researcher endeavoured to increase the trustworthiness of the research, as it provided further insight as to what had occurred during the classroom intervention. By sharing their rich and authentic experiences in the learning process, the students also could provide further validation of the data collected, as their perspective helped with the triangulation, as well as the evaluation of the intervention. This also helps to answer research question 3.2 as a teacher’s view of a successful lesson can sometimes differ from the perspective of a student. Student experiences are presented through vignettes and data described in Chapter V.

Ethics

Due to the expansion of the research, ethics clearance from all stakeholders was gained. (See Appendix M for a copy of the letter to the Research and Planning Unit).

Procedures

The researcher contacted all schools associated with the 16 teachers who had expressed further interest in Action Cycle One of the research. The number of schools grew to 18, because some teachers taught in more than one school. Upon receiving ECU, DoE WA ethics approval, information packs were sent out to the principals of the interested schools. The packs included a:

- Letter of proposal approval;
- ECU ethics approval letter;
- Covering letter to principal (Appendix N);
- Principal consent form (Appendix O);
- Copy of the teacher participant letter (Appendix P);
- Copy of the teacher participant consent form (Appendix Q);
- Copy of the parent/student consent letter (Appendix R);
- Copy of the parent/student consent form (Appendix S);
- Copy of the student pre-intervention questionnaire (Appendix T);
- Copy of the student pre-intervention interview questions (Appendix U);
- Copy of the student post-intervention questionnaire (Appendix V);
- Copy of the student post-intervention interview questions (Appendix W);
- Copy of the weekly intervention evaluation form for teachers (Appendix X);
- Copy of the teacher exit interview questions (Appendix Y);
- Copy of the researcher’s Working With Children’s Check receipt as card had not arrived;
- Copy of the ethics approval letter from the relevant educational sector; and
- A stamped self-addressed envelope.

Principals were required to return consent forms before teachers could be contacted. This required many follow up telephone calls to the principals by the researcher. The principals were given three weeks to return the documentation, however, after this time many forms had not yet been received and the researcher then had to telephone individual principals repeatedly.

Once consent from the principal was obtained, information letters/packages about the intervention were sent out to the teachers. (Please refer to Appendix Z).

Teacher research packages contained a:

- Letter to the teacher participant (Appendix P);
- Teacher participant consent form (Appendix Q);
- Copy of the parent/student consent letter (Appendix R);
- Copy of the parent/student consent form (Appendix S);
- Copy of the student pre – intervention questionnaire (Appendix T);
- Copy of the student post – intervention questionnaire (Appendix V);
- Stamped self-addressed envelope; and
- Two A4 stamped self-addressed envelopes for return of the student pre and post-intervention questionnaires and consent forms.

When the researcher received the student questionnaires, both the questionnaire and consent forms were numbered. The consent forms were detached from the questionnaire and placed in a separate document archive box to maintain anonymity. Names of teachers, schools and students were not written on the questionnaires. A numerical coding system was used to ensure that data could be re-identified with ease should a participant wish to withdraw from the study. Each teacher, school and student, were later allocated pseudonyms to ensure confidentiality.
Parent/student consent

Due to ethics policies and regulations, parent and student consent was required prior to any research being conducted in a school. Therefore, parent/student consent forms and letters were distributed to every student in every intervention classes. Parents were given the opportunity to remove their child from the Italian class for the period of the intervention and it was left to the discretion of the principal and the teacher to decide whether students who did not have parental consent to participate in the research were withdrawn from the lessons.

Instruments

Teacher Orff-Schulwerk professional learning

Successful professional development programmes engage teachers in real classroom enquiries, which are based on their contexts (Eylon & Bagno, 2006). Research findings into how teachers change confirmed that most teachers change at least minimally through gains in knowledge or actions in their classrooms (Smith, Hofer, Gillespie, Solomon & Rowe, 2003). The researcher anticipated that by involving teachers in their own action research within their life-world would give meaning to the change they were implementing and ownership of the new knowledge constructed. It would provide an opportunity for teachers to develop, reflect on and extend their professional practice, while providing an enriching context for their students (AITSL, 2011a; 2012b).

The aim of the Orff-Schulwerk professional learning was to introduce teacher participants to the basic principles of Orff-Schulwerk and how to use them effectively in the language classroom. It was directed to an audience of non-music specialists. The activities presented and trialled during the sessions were aimed for teachers of any level and included activities which could be used to isolate language patterns in vocabulary, reinforce intonation and pronunciation, allow for discovery of language and promote creativity. Gestures were also demonstrated by the researcher and tried by the participants to further reinforce the importance of movement when learning a second language. In second language learning it is important to teach students meaningful ‘chunks of text’ rather than single ‘isolated words’. The teachers were presented with strategies to help them present this to their students using Orff-Schulwerk (Bembridge, 2010; Castiglione, 1956; Parker, 1969; Pritikin, 2005).

The Orff-Schulwerk professional learning was piloted on five primary Italian teachers not involved in the research. Piloting revealed that no changes were required as the participants fully accepted what was presented. The professional learning was held
at ECU Mount Lawley Campus. It was an intensive half-day module, of four hours. Teachers were provided with stationery, handouts, morning tea and lunch. They were also informed that at the conclusion of the intervention, they would receive a Certificate of Participation that they could use as evidence of professional learning. For the readers’ convenience, please refer to Appendix AA for a sample of one of the handouts from the professional learning session and Appendix BB for a copy of the evaluation form which teachers were asked to complete at the conclusion of the session.

**Pre-intervention student questionnaire**

Prior to the commencement of the intervention classes, participant teachers were required to administer pre-intervention questionnaires to the 164 student participants. Each questionnaire item was categorised into one of three constructs that explored student demographics, attitudes towards Italian and attitudes towards music/song use in Italian class. These constructs were considered important as information gained could provide insight into how home life-worlds impact on attitudes in school life-worlds. Table 4.2 presents each item in its appropriate construct. A copy of the pre-intervention student attitude survey is attached in Appendix T.

**Table 4.2: Pre-Intervention Student Attitude Questionnaire Items and Constructs**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Construct</th>
<th>Questionnaire Item Number</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Student Demographics</td>
<td>1,2,3,4,17,18,19,20,21,22,23,24,25,29,30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Students attitudes towards Italian</td>
<td>5,6,7,8,26,27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Students attitudes towards Music/song use in Italian class</td>
<td>9,10,11,12,13,14,15,16,28</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The student questionnaire took approximately 15 minutes to complete and was returned to the researcher by the teachers via a stamped self-addressed envelope enclosed in the mail out package, together with the parent/student consent forms. Teachers were asked to distribute the parent/student consent forms to all the students in the intervention class.

The questionnaire was piloted on an upper primary Italian class not involved in the research. Student piloting revealed that no changes were required as the participants fully accepted and understood what was presented.

**Pre-intervention student telephone interview**

Prior to the intervention, the researcher conducted individual telephone interviews with three students from each intervention class to gain insight into their attitudes towards Music and Italian. Student participants were selected randomly by the teacher using a predetermined selection formula provided by the researcher in which teachers...
were asked to select the names of the first, seventh and fourteenth student on the class roll.

Each interview lasted approximately 20 minutes. To ensure duty of care each student had an adult present in the room or nearby whilst being interviewed. The researcher contacted schools in the weeks prior to the interview to establish a suitable and convenient time with the school principal. The interviews were audio recorded on a digital voice recorder.

Student interview questions were piloted via telephone on three students from the same pilot class that piloted the student pre-intervention questionnaire. Student piloting again revealed that no changes were required, as the participants fully understood what they were being asked and were able to answer without difficulty.

**Orff-Schulwerk intervention**

Upon returning to school after attending the Orff-Schulwerk professional learning module, teacher participants were required to use one small element of the Orff-Schulwerk approach which they felt confident in using and which was applicable to their programme, students and setting. The Orff-Schulwerk approach was to be implemented for a period of eight weeks during the third school term, for ten minutes each lesson in one upper primary class. *Timetabling constraints within one school resulted in a teacher conducting the intervention with middle primary students.*

The ten minute time span was decided upon because it has proven effective in previous studies. Brown and Lamb (2004) found that after exposing the students in their study to a foreign song for a period of ten minutes, during which the students participated in a number of listening and echoing activities, the students would leave the classroom singing a major portion of the song. The ten minutes intervention did not have to occur at the same time in each lesson. Teachers could decide whether they wanted to conduct the intervention at the beginning, middle or at the end of the lesson.

Ten minutes a day at the beginning or middle of the lesson, when attention span is at its lowest will do a lot to perk up the students, to create a proper climate for learning and improve pronunciation. (Techmeier, 1969, p. 96)

During the intervention, the researcher sent the teachers weekly evaluation forms via email (Please refer to Appendix X). It was initially thought that telephone interviews would be used. However after consulting with the teachers, it was decided that email was their preferred mode of contact. The aim of the weekly evaluation forms was to enable the researcher to provide support, feedback and guidance to the teachers during
the intervention phase. This was considered important in facilitating effective teacher performance and development (AITSL, 2012b). Responding to the evaluation forms allowed the teacher participants to reflect on their practice, monitor their confidence and assisted the researcher in identifying any emerging themes or trends. The researcher saved these forms and responses in her inbox.

When guiding the intervention the researcher considered Van Rooy’s (1998) intervention research strategy. Van Rooy (1998) wanted to explore and develop a phenomenological understanding of what experienced ‘A Level’ Biology teachers pertain to see as problems and possibilities for using controversial issues to teach Biology. Van Rooy (1998) considered several factors important for research designs. Those relevant to this research, include:

- The removal of surface constraints, such as level of difficulty and effort required, which may hinder implementation of the intervention;
- The importance of the intervention causing minimal disruption to both teachers and students;
- Teachers viewed as experts in their fields, with all contributions being valid;
- Collaborative, cooperative and supportive interaction between researcher and participant;
- The implementation of the intervention;
- The role of the researcher; associate, lesson planner, non-participant, colleague; and
- That the teachers are in control of the intervention, the resources used, the planning, organisation, the intervention and the researcher’s phone calls.

Van Rooy (1998) recommends that the intervention must be non-aggressive, collaborative, and flexible, causing minimal classroom disruptions. Whilst research credibility and trustworthiness was to be maintained, the researcher did not want the data collection method to be demanding and time consuming for the teacher participants. The ethical commitments of teachers including curriculum delivery, assessment, reporting and school priorities needed careful consideration, as it is important to keep the classroom in perspective. Therefore, it was essential the intervention be flexible and coherent (AITSL, 2012b).
Post-intervention questionnaire administration

At the conclusion of the intervention, teachers were asked to administer the post-intervention questionnaire to all students in their participating class. The purpose of the questionnaire was to establish if student’s attitudes towards the use of music/song in Italian lessons had changed, whether they enjoyed the Orff-Schulwerk experience and whether they considered it beneficial to their learning. Construct One regarding student demographics was not included, as this information was already gained in the pre-intervention questionnaire and likely not to have changed. Table 4.3 presents each questionnaire item in its appropriate construct. A copy of the post-intervention student attitude questionnaire is attached in Appendix V.

Table 4.3: Post-Intervention Student Attitude Questionnaire Items and Constructs

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Construct</th>
<th>Questionnaire Item Number</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Students attitudes towards Italian</td>
<td>2,3,4,16,17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Students attitudes towards Music/song use in Italian class</td>
<td>1,5,6,7,8,9,10,11,12,13,14,15,18,19,20</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The credibility and dependability of the post-intervention questionnaire items was piloted on an upper primary Italian class not involved in the research. Student piloting again revealed that no changes were required, as the participants fully understood what they were being asked and were able to answer without difficulty.

Post-intervention student telephone interview

The same three students from each intervention class were again individually re-interviewed post-intervention. Student telephone interviews were again audio-recorded on a digital voice recorder and conducted with an adult present in the room or located nearby as a duty of care precaution. Schools were contacted in the weeks prior to the interview by the researcher to establish a suitable and convenient time with the school principal.

Interview questions were again piloted via telephone with three students from the same pilot class that piloted the student pre-intervention questionnaire. Again, piloting revealed no concerns with the questions.

Teacher exit interviews

At the conclusion of the intervention, the researcher conducted exit interviews with each participating teacher. These interviews, each of approximately 30 minutes in duration were audio recorded using a Sony digital voice recorder via the telephone at a mutually convenient time to allow for maximum privacy. The researcher transcribed the interviews and forwarded them to the teachers, to read and edit, if necessary.
The teacher exit interview questions were piloted over the telephone on five primary Italian teachers not involved in the research. Piloting revealed that approximately 30 minutes was required to complete the interview.

**Teacher focus group**

At the conclusion of Action Cycle Three, the researcher considered it important to bring all teachers together for a focus group discussion. Focus groups offer insights into real world problems. They are unique and important for the formations of collective inquiry where theory, research, pedagogy, and politics converge. Focus groups provide a key role in an interpretive study, as they provide greater insight into the daily life of others, as well as ‘real world’ problems, which cannot be solved by individuals alone (Kamberelis & Dimitriadis, 2005). This need emerged from the research and the cyclical process of action research. Therefore, as it was not included in the original Action Cycle Three documentation mailed to principals, this information was mailed out later (Appendix CC and DD).

During the focus group 12 questions were discussed. Please refer to Appendix EE. These questions were structured from the general to the specific enabling each teacher to become familiar with their shared experiences and allowing teachers to build diverse and specific personal insight into the research-teaching context.

The focus group questions were given to the participants at the beginning of the meeting. Participants were given ten minutes to prepare brief individual response notes. The purpose of the handout was to reduce any tension or anxiety the teachers may have felt not knowing the questions, and to give them time to plan and reflect upon their responses (Appendix FF). Following this, the discussion commenced and continued for approximately one hour and 30 minutes. All participating teachers received a Certificate of Participation at the conclusion of the focus group discussion.

The 12 focus group questions were piloted on five primary Italian teachers not involved in the research. The pilot confirmed clarity of handouts and evaluation sheets.

**Coding, analysis and presentation**

In presenting the data, no reference was made to school or teacher names. Teacher participants, schools and students were identified by an allocated pseudonym.

**Pre and post-intervention student questionnaire analysis**

The data collected from the student questionnaires was entered onto a data matrix using SPSS 13. It was analysed according to frequencies of responses and grouped into common themes and constructs. These will be further explained in Chapter V.
**Pre and post-intervention student telephone interview analysis**

The researcher conducted, transcribed and manually coded all telephone-recorded interviews. Word documents were created and coloured tags were used to highlight common themes and categories. These common themes were ‘chunked’ (Gray, 2006a), facilitating identification and the utilisation of construct maps. All students and parents were provided with the opportunity to access and read their interview transcripts if they desired.

**Teacher exit interviews and focus group discussion analysis**

The researcher conducted, transcribed and manually coded all telephone interviews and the focus group discussion. Again, word documents were created and coloured tags were used to highlight common themes and categories using the approach outlined above. All teachers were provided with the opportunity to access and read their interview transcripts if they desired. Teacher exit interview and focus group data has been summarised and attached as vignettes throughout the following chapters and in Appendix MM.

**Summary**

In terms of validity action research seeks to construct holistic understanding of the dynamic and complex social world of classrooms and schools. It reveals people’s subjective experiences and the way they meaningfully construct and interpret events, activities, behaviours, responses and problems. Natural inquiry is situation specific that is ‘true’ only for the people, the time and the setting of that particular study. Action research looks for ‘truth in context.’ (Stringer, 2008, p. 47)

Classroom research is a means of testing curriculum and pedagogical ideas that triggers change, leading to an adoption of new teaching strategies. Action research allows the trialling of an idea in practice with a view to improve or change something. It is an approach that allows teachers to systematically inquire and to gather particular information about the way their school operates, how they teach and how their students learn. The information is gathered with the goal of gaining insight, developing reflective practice, making effective changes in the school environment and on making positive changes in educational practices, and on improving student outcomes (AITSL, 2011a; 2011b, 2012a, 2012b; 2012c; Elliot, 1985; Kemmis, 2001; Kemmis & McTaggert, 1988; 2005 Kemmis, 1986, cited in Hopkins, p.48, 2008; Stenhouse, 1975; 1980; Stenhouse & Rudduck, 1985). Action research is relevant for those who engage in a constructivist approach to pedagogy (Stringer, 2008).
Overall, this research aims to empower teachers by enabling them to see the relevance of applying theory to their specific upper primary Italian language classroom. It is anticipated that by participating in the research the teacher participants would engage in Schon’s (1983) three ways of reflection:

1. Pre-Intervention (Knowing in Action: Action Cycle One Questionnaires and Action Cycle Two Interviews).
2. During Intervention (Reflecting in Action: Action Cycle Three teacher/participant emails and telephone conversations).
3. Post-intervention (Reflection on Action: Action Cycle Three individual teacher exit interviews and focus group discussion).

**Conclusion**

It was anticipated that the research findings would provide non-music specialist primary teachers of Italian upper primary classes with:

1. Increased teacher confidence in using music/song with upper primary students.
2. An effective pedagogical tool, in the Orff-Schulwerk approach, which could enable teachers to increase upper primary student interest, participation and language acquisition.
3. Understanding of how music/song can be a valuable teaching tool, as highlighted through neuroscientific evidence and the element of novelty.
4. New information on how to use music/song in second language classes.
5. Empirical evidence for music/song as a vehicle for enhancing second language acquisition.

These will be further developed and explained in Chapter V.

As well as this, the researcher anticipates that the research will encourage third parties to see the value and the power of music, cross cultural benefits, as well as the benefits that a well-informed interdisciplinary curriculum can provide.

To learn a language means to penetrate and understand better the culture and the society represented beyond, with that language. (Ciccarelli, 1996, cited in Senior, 1998, p. 527)
CHAPTER V
INTERPRETATION OF DATA

In the context of globalisation, with the extraordinary movement of people and their ideas, it has been increasingly recognised that people need to be interculturally capable, that is, be able to negotiate meanings across all languages and cultures. (Scarino & Crichton, 2007, p.3)

Introduction

This chapter presents and interprets the results gathered following the research method described in Chapters III and IV. In addition, the researcher provides rich first person self-reflections from her interdisciplinary teaching practice to illustrate the points raised by the participating teachers, as well as to identify if other Italian teachers were using music/song the same way as she (the initial motivation for this research).

Secondly, this chapter presents teacher and student participant vignettes to provide rich contextual evidence to support the numeric data. In addition, key links to the literature and to Australian Curriculum and Reporting Authority (ACARA) have been included. The data is presented in three action cycles, identifying common themes and constructs in each.

During Action Cycle One, a quantitative questionnaire was used to gather baseline data on:

- Teacher demographics;
- Teacher awareness of the connection between Italian language acquisition and music;
- How teachers use of music/songs in the Italian second language classroom; and
- Why music/songs were being utilised in the Italian second language classroom.

During Action Cycle Two data was gathered using semi-structured teacher interviews. This data elaborated on that gathered in Action Cycle One as teachers’ self-reflected on:

- How they utilised music/song in their classroom;
- What they deemed to be the benefits of music/song;
- Resources; and
Their musical knowledge.

Action Cycle Three data was gathered through the implementation of an Orff-Schulwerk intervention. It evaluated the potential of the approach as an effective pedagogical tool for the teaching of Italian to upper primary students in WA. It was anticipated that the data gathered would contribute to a greater understanding of how primary teachers of Italian were currently using music/song in their second language classrooms and inform future practice.

**Action Cycle One**

The research invited 255 primary schools, across all educational sectors: DoE WA; Catholic CEOWA and AISWA, which offered Italian as a second language, as part of their curriculum to participate. In consultation with all school sectors the researcher confirmed that there were 216 primary Italian teachers and 256 primary schools offering Italian as a second language. From this information, 255 schools and 215 teachers were contacted. The researcher and her school were excluded from the data.

From the 255 schools contacted 64 principals indicated interest in the research (25% of the total primary school population). From this response, 54 principals were willing to have their school and their Italian teachers participate in the research (21% of the total population). This included four (7%) AISWA schools, 32 (60%) from DoE WA and 18 (30%) from CEOWA. In addition, it was found that seven schools (10%) no longer offered Italian as a second language as part of their school curriculum and three schools (5%) declined the invitation to participate.

Of the 215 teachers contacted, only 34 demonstrated a willingness to participate in the research by completing and returning the questionnaire. This represented 16% of the total teaching population. The response population included four teachers (12%) from AISWA, seven teachers (20%) from CEOWA, 20 teachers (59%) from DoE WA. Three teachers (9%) worked in a combination of both DoE WA and CEOWA schools. In addition, 26 of the responding teachers (76%) taught in the metropolitan area while eight (23%) taught in regional ones.

The questionnaire responses were analysed and collated using SPSS 13. Frequencies were recorded for each questionnaire item. The findings were analysed and categorised according to the constructs of teacher, classroom, and school demographics.
Construct One: School demographics

Analysis of the demographics of the responding schools, found that two (6%) of teachers were teaching in a female, single gender school, while 32 (94%) were in a co-educational setting. All respondents taught in the classroom setting. Twenty-eight (82%) of the schools have a music specialist. A summary table of the collated data can be found in Appendix GG.

Construct Two: Teacher demographics

Data disclosed that 32 (94%) of teacher respondents were female and two (6%) were male. Eleven (32%) were aged between 46-50 years, six (18%) between 36-40 years of age, four (12%) between 41-45 of age, four (12%) were aged more than 55 years of age, three (9%) between 51-55 years of age, three (9%) between 31-35 years of age, two (6%) between 21-25 years of age and one (3%) was aged between 26-30 years of age.

Teaching experience ranged with nine teachers (27%) having 20 years or more teaching experience while 14 (41%) had between six to fifteen years and seven (20%) had between one to five years. Eighteen (56%) teachers worked a part time work fraction and 31 (91%) taught across all primary school years. Twenty-eight (82%) respondents considered music to be a useful learning tool and 32 (94%) teachers declared they enjoyed music in their personal lives. It is worth noting that 31 (91%) teachers did not play a musical instrument and that 18 (56%) were not overly confident using music in their Language classes. Eighteen (56%) teachers indicated that they had completed a music unit as part of their pre-service training at university, whilst 11 (32%) indicated that they had studied Italian in some capacity. Only 15 (44%) stated that they had studied Italian at tertiary level while 15 (44%) indicated that they had Italo-Australian heritage.

Teachers stated that they either purchased resources commercially through bookshops or online, in Italy or at a CD shop. District resource libraries proved a common means for teachers to borrow resources. A summary table of the collated data can be found in Appendix HH.

Construct Three: Classroom demographics

Analysis of classroom demographics found that 32 (94%) teacher respondents stated that they utilised music during Italian lessons in some pedagogical way. Twenty-seven (79%) emphasised that they sometimes used music/songs in their Italian classes noting that their students responded positively to music when it was used. However, the
data also revealed that just over a third of teachers (39%) used music only with junior classes, only six (18%) teachers used music with all classes and nine (26%) used music with junior and middle classes only. Notably, only one (3%) teacher stated that they use music with their upper primary classes. A summary table of the collated data can be found in Appendix II-1.

Whilst there was a high percentage of teachers’ using music during Italian classes, the data showed that 31 (91%) frequently used music for didactic purposes only. From the data, four themes relating to music/song use in the language classroom emerged:

1. Teaching new language concepts and to supplement existing knowledge.
2. Language learning linked to the teaching of cultural themes.
3. Engaging and motivating students.
4. Creating a relaxed classroom atmosphere.

Eighteen (53%) teachers indicated that they had some sort of Music education in their pre-service training, yet the same number stated they did not feel confident using music in their language classes. When asked to select their preferred musical activities and strategies from a range of diverse options, 32 (94%) stated singing as their preferred option whilst the use of worksheets and dancing were also frequently used. Data found 76% teachers preferred the echo singing strategy to introduce music/song to students. Twenty-four (70%) stated that they taught the words needed first, then the song. Twenty-three (68%) teachers just played the CD, 14 (41%) indicated that they introduced actions to songs and 12 (35%) stated that they clapped the rhythm of the words before teaching the song to their students. A summary table of the utilisation data can be found in Appendix II-2.

Answering Action Cycle One research questions

1.1 Do Italian language teachers in Western Australian primary schools use music/songs as a pedagogical tool in their classroom?

The answer is yes, with 94% of the responding teachers stating that they use music/songs as a pedagogical tool when teaching Italian. Only the two male teachers (6%) did not use music/song.

1.2 How do Italian language teachers in Western Australian primary schools use music/songs as a pedagogical tool in their classroom?

Analysis found that 27 (79%) teachers frequently used music/song in their classrooms. Thirty-one (91%) utilised music/song in the junior and middle years and
only one (3%) teacher used music/song with their upper primary students. Music/song was primarily used for didactic purposes and 32 (94%) teachers stated that singing was their preferred teaching strategy. Thirty-two (94%) respondents emphasised that there was a lack of suitable teaching resources for upper primary years and that a specific support focus was needed.

While a high percentage of participating teachers used music/song in their classrooms, the lack of suitable resources and use of music/song with upper primary students were of concern. However, teachers’ identifying a need for a specific upper primary support focus was positive.

**Action Cycle One summary**

Teacher questionnaire responses identified 94% (32/34) of teachers used music/song in their classroom and how music/song was used. Importantly, the data underscored a lack of use of music/song with upper primary students, as well as teacher concern with a lack of second language resources relating to music/song. Also emerging from the data was the perception of low self-efficacy and confidence amongst teachers in attempting to integrate music into their Language programmes. Gender also emerged as probable issue, with only two (6%) from the 34 respondents being male and indicating that they did not use music/songs in their classroom. One male respondent indicated that he did not enjoy music on a personal level. However, further research beyond the boundaries of this research is required to determine whether there are any meaningful links to gender.

In answering the researchers own self-reflective inquiry of whether other primary Italian teachers taught like her, it was discovered that there were other teachers of primary Italian in WA that did use music/song to teach Italian. Although many shared an Italo-Australian heritage with the researcher, the researcher noted that none of the teachers had a double qualification in both Music and Italian at what would be classed as a specialist level.

Importantly, no teachers indicated confidence in using music/song when teaching Italian, and only one responding teacher used music with upper primary students. The findings in Action Cycle One suggest that the researcher’s personal academic interdisciplinary situation is unique in comparison to the participants of her research in the teaching of Italian.
**Action Cycle Two**

Thiry-four teachers participated in Action Cycle One (16% of the total potential). From that set, 16 (7% of the total potential) indicated strong interest to participate further in Action Cycle Two of the research project. Once contacted, eight (4% of the total potential) participated in Action Cycle Two interviews. All eight teachers were female, six (75% of the sample) were from the metropolitan area, two (25% of the sample) from regional areas, six taught in Doe WA schools, one taught in a CEOWA school and one in AISWA.

The transcription and analysis of the interviews, seven key themes emerged:

1. Reasons why teachers use music/song.
2. How teachers use music/song.
3. The criteria teachers employ for selecting music/song for classroom use.
4. Teacher concerns with the current resources available.
5. The professional learning needs of teachers.
6. How students respond to music/song when used during Italian lessons.
7. Teacher perceived similarities and differences between Italian and Music.

A summary table of the collated interview responses can be found in Appendix JJ.

**Construct One: Reasons why teachers use music/songs**

Teachers stated that the main reason was to achieve meaningful second language outcomes, with four important outcomes identified:

1. To engage the students by making Italian fun and therefore providing novel opportunities for language practice (Doidge, 2010a; 2010b; Schwartz & Begley, 2003; Walker, 2010). “Good for kids that aren’t so involved in other activities” (TP - Jane, June/July 2008). “Keeping children amused” (TP – Federica, June/July, 2008).

2. To provide Language practice activities which enable students to practice their vocabulary in a structured manner (Willis, 2008). “It helps them to focus on what I want them to learn” (TP - Laura, June/July, 2008). “It captures their attention and facilitates their learning (TP – Michelle, June/July, 2008).

3. To teach students ‘meaningful chunks of text’ for understanding. For a language teacher this is important when students reach this stage, because ‘chunks’ or complete phrases provide students with usable language. “I use it to
practice phrases and meaningful chunks of text (TP - Donatella, June/July, 2008).

4. To teach new concepts and vocabulary associated within specific cultural **themes** and **topics**. One participant shared her experience of how she used an Italian song about ‘transport’ to introduce the theme to her students and to teach her students the vocabulary required to complete the planned activities for the term. She also used this song to discuss cultural differences and similarities including why Venetians went to school on a boat. This led to discussions with her students about the Venetian history, geography and culture. “**Tie it into your theme. It helps them to practice what they are doing and them use it**” (TP – Ella, June/July, 2008).

The following is a reflective example from the researcher’s teaching practice, which highlights why she uses music/song in her classroom and how “language learning blends school with real life experience” (ACARA, 2011a, p. 17).

**Researcher self-reflection one: “Gelato Theme”**

When a Year 6/7 class was learning about farming I decided to conduct the same theme in my Italian classroom as it would provide a relevant context for learning. However, I wanted to focus on a farming style which would highlight intercultural links between Australia and Italy. I decided to focus on the theme of ‘gelato’ (ice cream). The students learned about the farming process involved in producing ice cream and the similarities and differences between the farming systems in Italy and Australia. Italian lessons were conducted utilising both Italian and English languages as some of the content was new. At the end of the term the Year 6/7 students were going to run the ‘Gelateria’ (ice cream shop) for the school’s Italian Day. This added to the ‘real-life’ context for learning language.

Given the appeal of ‘gelato’, I decided to make this the theme across all classes from Years 1 – 7. To buy a ‘gelato’ from the ‘Gelateria’ on Italian Day all students would be required to order their ‘gelato’ in Italian and the student shop assistants would be required to ask what their customer desired in Italian. I used the song “**Vorrei un gelato**” from the commercially produced resource “Sing and learn Italian” (ABC Melody, 2005) as a starting point as it had the required ‘meaningful chunks of text’. I taught the vocabulary in the song to the students using Orff-Schulwerk echo clapping techniques. These activities require the students to say the words and clap out the syllables following the teacher’s model. When students were confident, I introduced actions which matched the words. I asked students to interpret from the actions which I had designed what the song was about and what each phrase meant. Once the students had unpacked the song and could say and understand the text which I had targeted, I played the CD. The students were able to join in and sing as they recognised the familiar vocabulary and also performed the actions.

Once the students were confident with the vocabulary, they worked with a partner and conducted role plays, practicing the language used to order an ice cream in a shop. Each partner had a turn at being the customer and the shop keeper. Students needed to use bi-lingual dictionaries to find their favourite ‘gelato’ flavour. They were then required to place it in the sentence “**Vorrei un gelato a gusto di…, per piacere.**” (I’d
like a ... flavoured ice cream, please.) In order to learn their phrase students used xylophones and C pentatonic scale to **improvise** a melody to accompany their phrase. Students played their phrase repeatedly and when they were confident they shared it with their partner.

Next the partners moved to working in a group situation of four members. Within the group each student sang their ‘meaningful chunk of text’ as the melody over an **ostinato** and **bordun**. The group members rotated so that everyone got a turn at playing and singing their melody over the ostinato and bordun. The groups then shared their compositions with the rest of their classmates. Following this, the pairs conducted their “Gelateria” role play.

This activity enabled the Year 6/7 students to operate a “Gelateria” at the school’s Italian Day. All students at the school were able to ask for their ‘gelato’ using the language which they had learned. The Year 6/7 students remembered the ‘meaningful chunks of text’ learned and were able to order an ice cream in Italian when the class went on an Italian excursion to Il Gelato in Northbridge, Perth the following term.

The rich reflective and grounded evidence from the researcher’s practice illustrates the potential of using music/song to teach Italian in the primary school. This supports Asher’s ‘Total Physical Response’ (1984; 2000; 2001), as well as Gardner’s ‘Theory of Multiple Intelligences’ (1993; 1999), by enabling the students to learn in a relaxed environment within a low ‘affective filter’, making them more receptive to learning (Krashen, 1982). Students experienced success, worked in a variety of settings and were able to communicate their ideas with greater fluency. “Songs are a very important tool in the teaching of Italian, because music and song gives a lot of happiness” (TP-Ella, June/July, 2008).

The Melbourne Declaration (2008) commits “to supporting all young Australians to become successful learners, confident and creative individuals…” (MCEETYA, 2008, p. 7). Students need to have an active role in their learning, demonstrating creativity and resourcefulness to combine a range of disciplines to solve problems. Successful learners are able to work independently or collaboratively in groups to plan activities and the communicate ideas (ACARA, 2010). Responding teachers explained why they used music to teach Italian in their classrooms however, whether these above points are achieved is unclear

**Construct Two: How teachers use music/song**

The data identified that primarily teachers used music/songs to reinforce two teaching and learning contexts; second language acquisition and the promotion of subject integration. Foreign language acquisition included:
Reinforcing existing sounds and vocabulary as the song lyrics provided opportunities for repetition. “We try to repeat and mimic the song and sing along” (TP – Laura, June/July, 2008).

Covertly exposing students to new vocabulary by having the song/music playing in the background whilst the students worked at their desks. “It’s just background music as they’re working” (TP – Ella, June/July, 2008.)

Introducing and drilling new sounds and vocabulary. “I’ve used it either to teach vocabulary or used it to teach phrases” (TP – Donatella, June/July, 2008).

Teaching strategic meaningful chunks of texts for communicating in Italian. “If I want to teach them certain types of vocabulary” (TP – Susan, June/July, 2008).

Subject integration included:

- Preparing assembly items, stimulating visual art works, and introducing dance items. “We actually made a little spider and put it on the drainpipe” (TP – Ella, June/July, 2008).

- The engagement of students in rich cultural discussions and multicultural themes. “It gives them a bit of an insight as to what it’s like over there” (TP – Jane, June/July, 2008).


The following is a reflective example from the researcher teaching practice highlights how music/song was used in their classroom to address a new language initiative.

**Researcher self-reflection two: “Alien Theme”**

Being invited to participate in the ‘Intercultural Language and Teaching Project’ in 2007 required me to conduct an investigation into how I was exposing my students to intercultural concepts. This three stage year-long project required me to submit a final report and accompanying work samples as part of the evaluation of my action research project. I reflected upon how my teaching approach using Orff-Schulwerk allowed for intercultural opportunities. As the notion of being ‘intercultural’ requires one to be aware of themselves before they can become aware of others, I decided to focus on the theme of ‘Aliens’ (extra-terrestrial biological entity) with the Year 4/5 class. This decision was made on the basis that ‘Space’ was the home classroom theme for the term.

The ‘Alien’ project was initiated using the English language as the students had not yet acquired sufficient vocabulary to conduct conversations in Italian. I asked the students what they thought an ‘alien’ was and how they would describe one. They created mind maps of their vocabulary. They were required to choose 10 words from
their list and translate to Italian using bilingual dictionaries. Once found the students had to clap the words and find out how many beats each word had. A class bank of common words was created with each student contributing a word to a whole class list. This list was clapped out rhythmically and repeated. I wrote the rhythm beside each word as it was clapped. This vocabulary initiated discussions into whether ‘aliens’ are real. Students made the connection that ‘aliens’ are different than us but they are also similar, as they have needs, wants and families. Finally the connection was made that immigrants to Australia are different but similar to us. They are ‘aliens’ in our country, but they are not scary. They are different but similar to us. In the discussion students acknowledged that immigrant ‘aliens’ feel scared and lost in their new environment just as an Australian would if they were to migrate to the immigrants country. The students concluded that anything that is different is ‘alien’.

Later in the term, I asked the students to think about their favourite place. I asked the students “Would your pen pal in Italy have a favourite place?”, “Would it be the same as yours?” Again, they completed a mind map writing as many words as they could in English to describe their favourite place. Again, using bi-lingual dictionaries the students translated ten of these words into Italian. These words were learned using clapping and echo techniques. That is the words were clapped according to their syllables and repeated. The students used these personally significant words to write a short song. Figure 5.1 is one student’s example:

```
Mio spazio preferito e`
My favourite place is
Silenzioso, tranquilo, calma,
Quiet, tranquil, calm
Addorente con tanti fiori
Fragranced with flowers
Tante verde per gli animali
Lots of green for the animals
Mio spazio preferito e` la campagna
My favourite place is the country
```

Figure 5.1: Example of student song

Using the notes of the C pentatonic scale students composed/improvised a melody to help them describe their favourite place to their pen pal in Italy. The students were required to play their composed/improvised tune on a xylophone or metalophone and sing their song. These songs were recorded onto CD and sent to their pen pals in Italy. The students thought that this would be a good thing to do to help their pen pal understand more about them and to help their Italian pen pal to feel less ‘alien’.

This task allowed the students to drill new personally significant vocabulary for a real life purpose as well as allowing existing vocabulary to be revised. This was done via the Orff-Schulwerk strategies mentioned but also through other activities such as drama (students acted out the words), art (student drew and labelled their favourite place using their personally significant vocabulary) and creating word sleuths for their classmates to solve. This allowed students to learn more about their classmates and their favourite places. It introduced intracultural and intercultural discussions, which allowed students to reflect on themselves and others. This resulted in the Italian pen
pals producing a CD of their own which described their favourite places, which was sent to Australia.

**Developing intercultural understandings**

Active and informed citizens: “appreciate Australia’s social, cultural, linguistic and religious diversity… [and can] relate and communicate across cultures” (ACARA, 2010, p. 8).

The preceding reflection exemplifies how learning to communicate in a second language is “a rich, challenging experience…engaging with the linguistic and cultural diversity of our interconnected world” (ACARA, 2011, p. 8). While music/songs were used effectively by the teacher participants, it is clear to see in the researcher’s self-reflection the level of richness which can be achieved in regards to educational outcomes if teachers had access to professional learning opportunities and appropriate pre-service training which would assist them in developing the potential of music/song as a pedagogical learning tool.

The self-reflection provides evidence on how the interdisciplinary approach of using music/song in Italian can assist in developing intercultural awareness, in line with ACARA (2011). Using music/song to describe a place of personal significance helped develop students understanding of the role which language plays in human communication, the relationship of culture to language and vice versa. This task illustrates how a school experience was blended with ‘real life’ to create a personally significant and relevant learning experience (ACARA, 2011). It allowed students to begin forming connections with their own identities and with that of others. It demonstrates how metalinguistic and metacognitive awareness can be developed as students became aware of the difference in meaning of ‘alien’ (space creature) and alien (different). Students demonstrated this through composition of a personally significant song as they described their ‘alien’ place to their ‘Italian pen pal’. These are the key concepts to learning and understanding languages stated by ACARA (2011a). Using music/song in the teaching of Italian “provides the lens through which people reciprocally interpret and create meaning and express their individual and collective identity” (ACARA, 2011a, p. 15).

**Construct Three: The criteria teachers employ for selecting song/music for classroom use**

In order for the participating Italian teachers to consider music/songs suitable or useful for their needs they identified a set of essential criteria which they consider when selecting materials. Linguistically, the music/songs they selected needed to:
• Be age appropriate;
• Contain repetitive language which compliments their topic/theme “If there is a particular phrase that’s already in there, that’s important” (TP – Ella, June/July, 2008);
• Be at a suitable linguistic level for a second language learner; and
• Use vocabulary that is simple, easy to understand and be presented in short phrases, or ‘meaningful chunks’ “It’s got to be clear for the kids to understand what they’re saying” (TP – Federica, June/July, 2008).

Musically, the music/songs they selected needed to:

• Be ‘catchy’ (appealing) and enjoyable “I try to choose a catchy tune that they are going to be engaged in” (TP – Susan, June/July, 2008);
• Offer a good rhythm and a suitable tempo “A happy tune with a good beat” (TP – Jane, June/July, 2008); and
• Include a pleasant tune and be interesting to listen to “It’s got to be able to grab them and for them to enjoy the music” (TP – Donatella, June/July, 2008).

Teachers also stated that they prefer the music/songs to have actions and have an accompanying CD or DVD “CD’s with actions and worksheets are even better” (TP – Laura, June/July, 2008).

Following is a reflective example from the researcher’s teaching practice which highlights how the issue of criteria can be overcome by using the Orff-Schulwerk approach.

**Researcher self-reflection three: “Pizza Theme”**

It is difficult to address all the criteria stated by the participating teachers in commercially produced resource/song. However, using the Orff-Schulwerk approach it is possible. Using the learning focus of ‘food’ each student in the school made pizza. As pizza is part of the Italian culture the students learned about where pizza came from and its history. This included facts such as the Napolitano pizza comes from Naples and that the Pizza Margherita was made for Queen Margherita of Italy. Students identified that the colours of the toppings on the Margherita pizza were green (basil), white (mozzarella) and red (tomato) representing the colours of the Italian flag, that pineapple was not used on Italian pizzas and that Italian pizzas used thin bases and usually had no more than three toppings. Students also discovered that when ordering a pizza at a restaurant in Italy an individual serve is ‘intero’ (a whole pizza) and that pizza to take away can be bought in pieces ‘al taglio’ (not slices) and by the metre.

Students made their individual pizzas and were able to choose from a variety of toppings available. Students cooked and ate their pizzas. I wanted the students to remember this experience and I wanted to evaluate what they had learned however, I did not want them to produce a traditional recount of what they had done in Italian, as this would have only required students to reproduce formulaic language from a
structure which I had provided and modelled to them. From my teaching experience I knew that simple repetition helped students to remember, as this is a skill similar to drills. However, I did not intend to have my students learn vocabulary via drills, as this would not present them with a meaningful text. What is the purpose of committing content to memory if it cannot be accessed and be of benefit in the future? I wanted my students to learn to speak Italian in a manner they enjoyed and that was meaningful to them.

Instead the students wrote recipes for their individual pizzas in the genre of rap as it is a musical genre they enjoyed. Raps are repetitive and simple, describing a real-life experience. Eminem is an outstanding artist of this contemporary genre. Whilst Eminem’s music may not appeal to everyone his music does allow the listener to repeat the lyrics easily even though the listener may not comprehend the language or the context within which the songs are written. Punk is another genre that is simple, fast, repetitive and loud. Between the years of 1974-1996 The Ramones produced music, which made English accessible across the globe as everyone could sing along to their simple and catchy songs (Rey, cited in True, 2005).

This task appealed to the students immediately. Students wrote their ingredients in Italian. Then they clapped the words to find the rhythms for each. Then they arranged their significant vocabulary in a manner that they found rhythmically pleasing. When students had written their raps they worked in groups of three to learn and practice them. Two students kept an ostinato or beat while the third student recited their pizza rap over the top. Each student had a turn at reciting their rap in their group and keeping the beat. These raps were performed to the class.

This activity allowed the students to use an authentic cultural experience to learn vocabulary which was appropriate to the topic and their age but which was also personally significant and appropriate to them. This is similar to the process Eminem uses to write his raps. It provided repetition, just like the music of The Ramones, which allowed student to learn their vocabulary. The use of gestures helped students to remember what each ingredient was and provided a visual clue to help others in the group to understand what was they were putting on their pizza. One student used a grating action to represent cheese or ‘formaggio’.

This activity allowed students to use their vocabulary outside the Italian room as parents commented how their child was ‘rapping their recipe’ when they went shopping. One mother bought the ingredients and the child made the pizza for lunch on the weekend. She said that her child’s rap was teaching her Italian too. Figure 5.2 is an example of one student’s rap which was written below.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sopra alla mia pizza ho messo;</th>
<th>On my pizza I have placed</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Olio</td>
<td>Oil</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Formaggio</td>
<td>Cheese</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Basilico</td>
<td>Basil</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pomodori</td>
<td>Tomatoes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Prosciutto</td>
<td>Ham</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E’ delizioso</td>
<td>It’s delicious</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Buon appetito</td>
<td>Happy eating</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Figure 5.2: Example of a student’s rap

**Authentic and personally significant texts**

Music/songs used to teach language should be linguistically authentic, expose learners to a wide variety of vocabulary, provide opportunities for grammar aspects to
be introduced or revised as well as expose learners to a variety of accents (Lynch, 2006). They should help students to feel comfortable and enjoy the experience (Krashen, 1982), strive for cognitive automaticity through repetition and practice (Gantbonton & Segalowiz, 1988), acquire meaningful chunks of ‘real’ language that helps with the learning of lexical patterns (Demony & Harris, 1993) and gain an intercultural insight into the culture of the language being studied (Le’, 1999; Lynch, 2006).

While the interview data demonstrates some agreement with the literature, including repetition, linguistic authenticity and student interest, the researcher’s self-reflective example illustrates all of these above points without the use of a commercially produced resource. The learning experience was authentic and exposed the students to a wide range of vocabulary. As students wrote a rap it addressed grammar points if and when they arose in a situation that had personal significance to the student, for example, the need of this student, whose work is presented above in Figure 5.2, to change ‘pomodoro’ (tomato-singular) to ‘pomodori’ (tomatoes-plural). The task was appealing, engaged the students and the vocabulary catered to their needs. It provided meaningful chunks of text and opportunity for repetition in a novel way, which allowed students to recall the information they had learned efficiently. Finally, it provided an intercultural connection, as students were able to identify similarities and differences between the Italian and Australian ‘pizza’ cultures. This supports the notion that “learning languages always involves comparison and reflection” (ACARAa, 2011, p. 16).

The above example illustrates, that care needs to be taken to infuse music/song successfully into language teaching practices. The simple notion of teaching and/or using music/songs will not help students acquire a second language (Medina 1993a). This was a significant problem in the lack of self-efficacy amongst the teachers using music/songs in their upper primary classes.

**Construct Four: Teacher concerns with current resources available**

When interviewed about resources, the teachers raised nine important issues:

1. There were not enough suitable and specifically designed resources for second language learners “There’s not a great range of Italian CD’s suited to Australian children learning Italian (TP – Grazia, June/July, 2008).
2. Resources available were either too easy or too difficult for second language learners. The teachers considered that the music/songs available were not appropriate for use with the upper primary years due to their immature
nature “I’ve got great resources but they are all geared towards the little ones” (TP – Ella, June/July, 2008).

3. Due to the lack of suitable commercial resources, teachers felt that they were left with no option but to create their own poor quality resources. This highlighted the reason why many teachers use music in junior primary classes only, and not with the middle or upper primary classes “If you can’t something you have to make it up and I’m not good at that (Tarsia, June/July, 2008).

4. There were not enough resources to use ‘whole language’ in meaningful ‘chunks of text’ “They don’t use whole language and they shorten words which can be an issue (TP – Susan, June/July, 2008).

5. Increasingly, it was reported that key resources were going out of print and that with the closing of the district resource centres due to government cost cutting, it was increasingly difficult for teachers to access older but still useful resources “Sometimes it’s hard to get CD’s. Now with the resource centre closing, it’s going to get harder” (TP – Federica, June/July, 2008).

6. School-based resourcing budgets appeared biased. Teachers stated that very little of school budget funds were allocated to Languages and the minimal amount they received prevented them from buying music-based resources as they tend to be very expensive. One teacher had a budget of $500 that needed to last all year and cater for 300 students. “I find that music resources are so expensive. My budget is pretty small and if I buy a couple of CD’s it takes a huge chunk out of it” (TP – Jane, June/July, 2008).

7. Basic classroom resources were lacking for teaching second language. For example, two teachers were required to move from classroom to classroom taking their resources and teaching equipment with them. This movement limited the types of resources they purchased, as they need to be easily transportable and easy to pack and stow away as they completed the teaching activities. Without a home classroom, learning environments were never established, or evident to the school or other students “I go from class to class and I need to be careful about what I buy. It needs to be quick to pack up and easy to move” (TP – Laura, June/July, 2008).

8. Complaints’ regarding the access to a simple CD player was another resource issue. All teachers stated that at some point in their career they needed to go around the school to find a workable CD player, one not in use as there were
not enough for one in each classroom. At the time of writing portable stereo systems featuring CD player, AM/FM radio and iPod/MP3 connection are retailing for $29 (2012 pricing). If Smart boards are becoming standard items in classrooms then why can’t CD players? “A CD player that worked...a CD player in general would be great” (TP – Jane, 2008).

9. Finally, authentic resources available were suitable for native speakers rather than second language learners “There’s not much authentic stuff out there” (TP – Susan, June/July, 2008). Authentic music/song is essential in establishing and demonstrating cultural validity to students. All responding teachers stated that they tried to use authentic music/songs so that the students were presented with authentic texts. “It would be great if there was this type of resource out there that was simple and uncomplicated” (TP-Federica, June/July, 2008).

When asked for suggestions for what they would like to see in musical resources for Italian, teachers said that they would like access to appropriate songs, digital recording and educational material “Perhaps a CD or two with a range of themes and within that theme perhaps a selection of songs for junior, middle and upper with supporting books, worksheets etc...” (TP-Federica, June/July, 2008). Specifically:

- An assortment of fashionable and modern children’s songs, which were age and language appropriate.
- A CD compilation of songs, which were related to every topic studied in Italian classes across WA. It would be beneficial if the CD came with accompanying black line masters, DVD’s, flashcards, teachers guide book, posters and accompanying backing CD’s without the words, as this would be useful for concerts and assemblies.

Construct Five: The professional development needs of teachers

The following teacher comments support the literature (Russell-Bowie; 2002; 2006) that pre-service training does not adequately prepare teachers using music effectively and confidently in the classroom: “Music was my minor but you wouldn’t know it” (TP-Donatella, June/July, 2008); “Nobody taught me how to do it, I just figured it out” (TP-Laura, June/July, 2008); “I can’t sing” (TP-Jane, June/July, 2008) and “I’m not musical” (TP-Ella, June/July, 2008).

Regarding their professional development needs all teachers expressed desires to extend their knowledge and confidence in four key areas by learning how to:
1. Use music/songs effectively in the Italian classroom “Having a PD saying this is what you do with songs, try these sorts of things” (TP – Ella, June/July, 2008);

2. Play an instrument and read music “If I could read music then I’d know what the song was like” (TP – Ella, June/July, 2008);

3. Set words to music “I’d like to be able to change the words a bit” (TP – Grazia, June/July, 2008); and

4. Engage the ‘Total Physical Response’ (Asher, 1984) “TPR...I find it doesn’t come naturally to me. I think if you had a musical background it would” (Tarsia, June/July, 2008).

Teacher participants stated that they attended network meetings to try to share and gain ideas about how others are using music/song in their language classes, what activities they do and which resources they find effective and useful. However, too often they left disenchanted. All teachers stated that they wished to participate in more professional development opportunities that directly link language learning to music/songs and to be taught effective strategies on how to engage upper primary students in musical activities in the Language classroom. The researcher supports the claim that network meetings and current professional development on how to use music to teach Italian do not provide teachers with the skills they need as the activities and strategies presented are dependent on a commercially produced CD and are generally always suitable for the junior grades.

Teachers disclosed four constraints when it came to engaging in professional learning.

- **Time** “There’s so much to do...PD is just an extra thing (TP – Grazia, June/July, 2008).

- **Sacrificing of personal time** “Like this, it’s done in our own time” (TP – Donatella, June/July, 2008).

- **Lack of school funding** “No enough money is given to me to access some PD” (Jane, June/July, 2008).

- **Little or no school support** “If it were Maths, there’d be no problem with attending PD...but Languages...” (TP - Susan, June/July, 2008).

All teachers expressed that these issues hindered their ability and/or desire to attend professional learning even though it was something that they wanted to do and this is reflected in the participation rates for this research. Action Cycle One captured
only 16% of the total population. Action Cycle Two represented only 4% of the total population and Action Cycle, or three less than 3% of the total population was represented. The research process underscored the enormous workload pressures perceived by the teachers approached.

In addition, teacher participants declared that principals do not pass on information covering available professional learning opportunities “I had to go to him and question him about it before he put it in my pigeon hole” (Susan, June/July, 2008). The researcher discovered that many principals proved to be an unanticipated barrier to her research process. For example, principals stated they were not interested, had left the initial mail out information in their ‘in tray’, forgot to pass it on or had lost it. A non-participating Italian teacher stated that they had heard about the research and would have liked to be involved, but their principal had not passed the information on. ACARA wishes “All students should experience well designed and supported language programs, taught by well trained and supported languages teachers, in schools that actively support language teaching” (Lo Bianco, 2009, p.64, cited in ACARAa, 2011, p. 9) then provision needs to be made at a national level.

Construct Six: How students respond to music/song when used during Italian lessons

The success of any teaching and learning programme, initiative or resource depends on how successful it is in engaging the students. Teachers stated that when they used music/song in their language class their students appeared to:

- Feel happy and comfortable in the classroom environment. “[Students are] happier learning songs” (TP-Laura, June/July, 2008).
- Engage learning. “It doesn’t occur to them that they are learning. They suddenly discover that they are using the language” (TP-Susan, June/July, 2008).
- Become active participants. “It is a very important tool as the kids are using it. They leave the room singing. Some students come to see me during the week and tell me that they’ve been singing the song all week” (TP-Laura, June/July, 2008).
- Break down inhibitions and learning barriers. “It’s amazing what difference music makes. They are able to get their tongues around difficult phrases. They pick things up quickly” (TP-Michelle, June/July, 2008).
• Remember phrases and vocabulary. “Students didn’t realise they were using the language” (TP-Federica, June/July, 2008).

Teachers also mentioned how students were willing to repeat vocabulary without becoming bored when presented in a musical form. While this was prominent in junior classes, senior students were reluctant to sing as it is seen to be ‘uncool’. Following is an example from the researcher teaching practice that highlights how her students responded to using the Orff-Schulwerk approach.

**Researcher self-reflection four: “Pasta Theme”**

I held a Pasta Day with the Year 6/7 class. On this day my Mum, Zia (Aunty) and Nonna (Grandmother) came to school to help the students make ‘tagliatelle’ (flat ribbon-type pasta). Prior to this, the students and I worked together to plan the day and to identify the vocabulary required. One student suggested that it would be appropriate to thank our helpers by performing a musical item for them as music plays a large role in Italian culture and this was a cultural day. As a class we discussed what vocabulary needed to be in our song if we were going to convey our sentiments effectively. Using the vocabulary the students came up with together we wrote a simple poem. This is presented in Figure 5.3.

**Figure 5.3: Example of whole class poem written by students**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Grazie Nonna</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Grazie Zia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Grazie Mamma della Signorina</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Le tagliatelle erano molto buoni</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stomaci pieni e visi sorridenti</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Grazie tante per una giornata divertente</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Speriamo che ritornate a presto</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

In the next lesson the students unpacked the poem, deciphering the meaning of it. Then, using echoing, clapping, beat and repetition I taught the poem to the students. Spontaneously, the students began performing actions as they repeated the verse. This is represented in Figure 5.4.
Together the class decided which actions fit the poem best. When this poem was performed the class was divided into three groups. The first time it was sung it was in unison (together) with the beat being kept by the students in their feet. Then it was performed as a round where one group kept the beat, the second group did the actions and the final group recited the poem. This was repeated twice so that each group had a turn at doing all parts. For the final time the poem was performed in unison.

My students always responded positively to music/song. They continued to sing this rap for the remainder of the school year. They thoroughly enjoyed writing and performing it as they were actively involved and had ownership over its composition. The students saw a purpose for learning it and thought that it was ‘pretty cool’ that they had written a song for ‘real Italians’ and they understood it.

The self-reflective example highlights how music/song can provide essential communication skills as well as intercultural capabilities. Together with their teacher, the students were able to create a text that required higher order skills including noticing, decoding and discovering patterns. Students demonstrated an ability to interpret the text and understandings by including and performing their own actions, therefore supporting Asher’s theory of Total Physical Response (1984; 2000; 2001). The action of putting the index finger to the cheek demonstrates understanding of an Italian cultural gesture, as this is what Italians do to show when something is good.

“…Languages are like few other learning areas…in that they combine instruction and application, and become performance” (Lo Bianco, 2009, p.64, cited in ACARAa, 2011, p. 11). Music is another learning area that combines instruction, application and performance and it seems logical to use music/song as a tool to facilitate language learning. However, the data continues to highlight how the lack of music in teacher pre-
Construct Seven: Teacher perceived similarities and differences between Italian and music

When asked to consider whether music and Italian shared similarities and/or differences, teachers stated that they hadn’t really considered the connection between the two. “I haven’t really thought about it too much but there’s a lot of rhythm in the Italian language so it lends itself to it. Like when I use music in Italian I don’t actually think about the musical characteristics of the song, you know” (TP-Donatella, June/July, 2008).

However, they did believe that the two areas lend well to each other as Italian sounds musical when spoken. “I think so because they say that Italian is a very musical language and it probably links itself to singing it as well” (TP-Federica, June/July, 2008). This comment was common to all participants. They shared the view that if Italian is the language of opera then music and Italian must go together. One teacher did make the connection that music is also a language and that the two could possibly complement each other. “The rhythm in Italian lends itself to music and speaking Italian is like singing so it must lend itself well” (TP-Ella, June/July, 2008).

Answering Action Cycle Two research question

2.1 Why do Italian language teachers in Western Australian primary schools use music/songs as a pedagogical tool in their classroom?

All interviewed teachers stated that they used music/song to assist students’ memorisation as music/song provides engaging repetitious drill that allows students to revise existing and new vocabulary in a fun way. Music/song was also considered useful in facilitating ‘intercultural’ and ‘intracultural’ discussions, preparation for assembly items and to engage students in desk activities.

Action Cycle Two summary

In summary, Action Cycle Two allowed for deeper investigation into the Action Cycle One questionnaire constructs. Data highlighted dependence on commercial resources, due a lack of musical confidence, which do not meet teacher criteria or meet the needs of students. Resource costs are a problem as teachers stated that they could not afford to buy them due to their meagre learning area budgets. Upper primary emerged as an area of need for an appropriate, affordable, useful and adaptable
resource, along with teacher professional learning in how to effectively use music/song to teach Italian.

When reflecting upon her own practice, the researcher identified many Orff-Schulwerk principles in her teaching. The researcher believes that an Orff-Schulwerk intervention may be of benefit to other Italian teachers and their students. Teachers have a preconception that to be musical, one needs to sing and if one can’t sing then their musical ability is compromised. The rhythm and movement focus of the Orff-Schulwerk approach may help move teachers away from this misconception.

**Action Cycle Three**

**Introduction**

The purpose of Action Cycle Three was to gather teacher and student opinion on the effectiveness of the Orff-Schulwerk approach when teaching Italian to upper primary students. Data from Action Cycle One and Two established that 94% of all participating teachers of Italian used music/song frequently in their classes. However, use was limited in the upper primary years as a result of poor self-efficacy and a lack of suitable teaching resources.

In response to this finding, a musical intervention, using the Orff-Schulwerk approach, was conducted. The researcher believed teachers in their Italian classrooms could use this approach effectively. She believed the flexible, adaptable and novel approach of Orff-Schulwerk may lead to an increase in the use of music/song as in upper primary classes and ultimately in second language acquisition among upper primary students.

The findings of the intervention are presented in what follows. A complete item comparison table from the pre and post-intervention student attitude is attached (Please refer to Appendix KK.) The data was gathered from the six teachers involved and their classes (7 classes with an average of 23 students in each, totalling 164 students). All teachers were female and taught in co-educational schools, with five employed by the DoE WA and one by AISWA. Five teachers taught in metropolitan schools, one in regional WA. All have studied Italian at some level and enjoy music. Teachers were aged between 30–55 years of age with a teaching experience of between three to more than 20 years. Twenty-one students (5 boys and 16 girls) of the 164 involved participated in pre and post-intervention interviews.
Pre-intervention student attitude questionnaire

Prior to the intervention a quantitative student attitude questionnaire was administered to all 164 students involved to establish a contextual understanding of the students ‘life-worlds’ according to the three constructs of student demographics, attitudes towards Italian and attitudes towards music/song use in Italian class.

Pre-Intervention Student Attitude Questionnaire Results

Construct One: Student demographics

The questionnaire data revealed that 85 (59%) of the 164 students who took part in the intervention were male and 79 (48%) were female. Their average age was 12 years, had attended their school for an average of eight years and had studied Italian for an average of four years. One hundred and fifty five (94%) students enjoyed music, 70 (43%) played a musical instrument and 67 (41%) did not enjoy singing. None of the parents of the students surveyed were Italian and all students were born in Australia. None of the students involved in the intervention could speak a second language fluently. However, 86 (52%) thought it was important to learn another language. One hundred and twenty one (74%) students stated that they liked to learn by combining a number of different Learning Areas, such as Physical Education, Art and Drama (interdisciplinary learning experiences). One hundred and forty-four (88%) students stated that they liked to work independently and with others. In addition, the students self-identified preferences for new and fun approaches acknowledging that that’s how they learn best (Gardner, 1993).

Construct Two: Students attitudes towards Italian – pre-intervention

Pre-intervention data revealed that 49 (30%) students sometimes liked Italian and 48 (29%) thought they were generally capable at it. Fifty-five (33%) stated that they felt happy and comfortable in class. One hundred and twenty-three (75%) stated that they preferred activities that promoted interdisciplinary learning. Students also prefer to work in a variety of ways including: individually, with a partner and in groups.

Construct Three: Students attitudes towards music/song use in Italian class – pre-intervention

Pre-intervention data indicated that 133 (81%) students believed their teacher sometimes used music/song during Italian lessons. However, they considered music/song was used only when important work had been finished or when there was nothing else to do. Seventy (43%) stated that they sometimes enjoyed the experience. Seventy-four (45%) stated that sometimes the song/music helped them to learn,
(24%) stated it helped them to remember and 35 (21%) students stated that music/song helped them to speak Italian.

**Post-intervention student attitude questionnaire**

At the conclusion of the intervention the student attitude questionnaire was re-administered to all 164 students to establish whether student attitudes had changed, whether they enjoyed the Orff-Schulwerk experience and considered it beneficial to their learning. Responses frequencies were collated according to the two constructs of student’s attitudes towards Italian and towards music/song use in Italian class.

**Post-Intervention Student Attitude Questionnaire Results**

**Construct Two: Students attitudes towards Italian**

Findings revealed that 91 (55%) students sometimes liked Italian during the intervention term. This demonstrated an improvement of 25% between pre and post-intervention. Seventy-nine (48%) sometimes felt happy in Italian. This demonstrated an improvement of 19% between pre and post-intervention. Eighty-eight (54%) enjoyed completing and participating in a range of Orff-Schulwerk activities, in particular playing instruments and clapping rhythms.

**Construct Three: Students attitudes towards music/song use in Italian class**

One hundred and forty five students (88%) confirmed that their teacher had used music/song in their class during the intervention term and 124 (77%) expressed that they felt they had learnt something new. Forty-two (26%) explained that they enjoyed it when music/songs was used, 47 (29%) stated that they enjoyed the musical activities and 101 (61%) considered the music/songs used appropriate. Sixty-two (38%) students did not enjoy singing however they did believe that the Orff-Schulwerk musical activities helped them to learn. Fifty-seven (35%) students indicated that the Orff-Schulwerk activities helped them to remember vocabulary and helped them to speak Italian. Fifty-nine (36%) students stated that they enjoyed playing the instruments and 106 (65%) indicated that they enjoyed the Orff-Schulwerk activities. While 35 (21%) students were unsure whether they wanted their teacher to continue with Orff-Schulwerk, 29 (18%) did want their teacher to continue with activities in the future. Only 10 (6%) students definitely did not want their teacher to continue with the Orff-Schulwerk approach.

**Summary of student attitude questionnaire data**

Comparing the data highlighted improvement as post-intervention students stated that they:
Liked learning Italian through the music/songs used by their teachers and were happy to go to class; and

Enjoyed the musical activities used as they helped them to learn and remember Italian.

It would appear that the students enjoyed the Orff-Schulwerk approach as a learning tool and responded well to its novelty. This suggests that it has potential as an effective pedagogical tool in teaching Italian to upper primary students. However, data did show that students did not believe the Orff-Schulwerk approach helped them to speak Italian. This may be due to two factors.

1. Student apprehension to singing and novelty.
2. Teachers lacking confidence and skill to conduct different activities that encourage speaking.

Pre-intervention student interview data

Interviews were conducted with 21 students (13% of the student population involved in the research) to gain a deeper understanding of their attitudes towards Music and Italian. The following is a summary of the responses to the 11 questions accompanied by a representative example of student responses.

Question One: How do you think music/songs could be used during Italian lessons?

When asked to consider how they thought music/songs could be used during Italian lessons, student participants (SP) stated to assist memory, learning and to have fun. “Songs and music could be used to help us learn and remember things” (SP-Angela, June/July, 2009).

Question Two: Why might your teacher use music/songs during Italian lessons?

To facilitate engagement, assist memory and learning are examples of what students considered to be reasons why music/songs might be used during Italian lessons “To help most of the kids to learn and if they forget anything they can just go to the song and sing it in their heads and remember it” (SP-Belinda, June/July, 2009).

Question Three: Do you think music/songs help you to learn Italian? Why?

Students considered music/songs helped them to learn Italian as it made learning easier, assisted their memory retention and engaged them in the lesson. “Yes. They help me a lot. Because they get stuck in my head and then I can remember the Italian words more often” (SP-Chiara, June/July, 2009).

Question Four: Does your teacher use music/songs in the classroom? How?

Student responses identified video, DVD, worksheets, blackboard work and CD’s as the most common methods used. “Yeah, some times. She puts it on the stereo and we
Question Five: Do you like it when they do? Why?
Students liked it when teachers used music/songs in their Italian lessons as it made learning Italian easier and it actively engaged them in the lesson. “Yes. Cause it’s easier to understand and get it more and it gets in your head more” (SP-Daniella, June/July, 2009).

Question Six: Do you participate in these activities? Why?
Students liked to participate in musical activities as they were enjoyable and made learning easy. “Yes. Because they are fun and then we get more fluency and I get more confident with my Italian” (SP-Chiara, June/July, 2009).

Question Seven: Do you like Italian? Why?
Student participants considered learning Italian to be fun and believed that learning another language was important in today’s society in communicating and connecting with others. “Yes. Because it’s learning a new language and it will help me communicate with other people in the future” (SP-Aaron, June/July, 2009).

Question Eight: Do you like music? Why?
All students stated that they enjoy music and many learnt a musical instrument as some point in their primary school life. Some also stated that they had strong family backgrounds in music. “Yes, I love music. It’s just that it makes you relax when your upset, any kind of music helps me relax when I’m upset” (SP-Emma, June/July, 2009).

Question Nine: Do you like singing? Why?
Singing was considered fun and enjoyable when done in private. Students considered singing to be an effective means of self-expression however; only three stated that they would sing in front of an audience. “Not in front of people. I’m pretty self-conscious about my voice. If I’m with close friends and family I can sing at the top of my lungs but with people I don’t know very well I don’t feel comfortable singing (SP-Margaret, June/July, 2009).

Question Ten: How do you feel when your teacher uses music/songs in Italian? Why?
Students expressed that they felt engaged, confident and relaxed when their teacher used music/songs in Italian. “It helps me to understand more so I feel good about it. Cause I know that I’ll remember it in the future” (SP-Gillian, June/July, 2009).

Question Eleven: What types of activities do you like doing in Italian? Why?
Speaking, Art, Drama and games are the most popular activities enjoyed by students in Italian lessons. “I like it when she teaches us different things and she asks us stuff about it she asks us lots of questions. Sometimes we play games as ways of
learning “Because it involves, most of the time, getting up and moving around instead of sitting down and writing all day” (SP-Helen, June/July, 2009).

**Summary of the student pre-intervention interview data**

In summary, pre-intervention student interviews revealed that:

- Music/songs helps memory, provides novelty and engages attention on lesson content;
- Traditional methods, such as singing and drills were commonly used by teachers “She puts on the stereo and we sing along with it” (SP – Daniella, June/July, 2009);
- Musical activities are considered enjoyable however, singing was only considered to be an enjoyable when done in private;
- Intercultural understanding and second language learning is considered important;
- Some students have strong ‘intracultural’ links with music “I love music. I play three instruments and everyone in my family is musical” (SP – Emma, June/July, 2009);
- Music helps to lower the affective filter (Krashen, 1982) by promoting confidence and relaxation; and
- Students respond to an interdisciplinary curriculum and appreciate active involvement in lessons.

**Post-intervention student interview data**

Post-intervention student interviews were conducted at the conclusion of the eight-week Orff-Schulwerk intervention period. Due to the absence of three students, only 18 out of 21 (86%) participated. Due to constraints an alternative interview time could not be arranged. The post-intervention interview consisted of only nine questions. Below is a summary of the student responses to each question and an example of student comment.

**Question One: Did you like the music/songs used? Why?**

All students suggested that they liked the music/songs used during the intervention because they considered them to be enjoyable, engaging, and different. They stated that the music/songs used had the right vocabulary and provided scaffolding for their learning. “Yes. Because they were fun to learn and they helped us learn better than just saying the words. We got to use instruments and we got to change the way we say the words and change the patterns” (SP-Gillian, September, 2009).
Question Two: Did you like the musical activities?
All students said that they enjoyed the Orff-Schulwerk activities, believing the active involvement assisted them in learning Italian and remember what they were taught. “Yes. It was fun and everyone got to do stuff. Not just one person. We worked in groups and we got to know each other and stuff” (SP-Glenn, September, 2009).

Question Three: Did you participate in all activities to the best of your ability?
Seventeen (94%) students expressed that they participated in all the activities to the best of their ability because they were actively engaged in the activities. However, timetabling issues and student boredom or fatigue, due to the repetitive nature of the lesson proved to be a constraint. “If I was completely honest I don’t think I did my full. We have Italian at the end of the day...my mind wasn’t on the job” (SP-Margaret, September, 2009).

Question Four: Did the activities and songs help you to learn? How?
The activities and music/songs used during the intervention helped 17 (94%) of the students to learn. They identified repetition assisted their ability to memorise vocabulary and to speak fluently. “Yes. Cause I memorised it better - the phrase that we used in the song” (SP-Angela, September, 2009).

Question Five: How did you feel during Italian lessons this term? Why?
All interviewed students described feelings of happiness and excitement, as they were involved and participating in the lessons. “I felt that it was really fun and exciting and I really wanted to go to Italian. Because - I was enjoying myself and all the different music and sounds instead of having to sit down and work 24/7” (SP-Belinda, September, 2009).

Question Six: Which musical activity did you enjoy the most? Why?
Students preferred musical activities which involved musical instruments and body percussion. Students stated that they enjoyed being actively involved, working with others and making music. “The musical instruments. I liked how we did, we used our body, clicking and then we showed the rest of the class. For once everyone was silent and they were looking at you. It was like performing” (SP-Margaret, September, 2009).

Question Seven: Why do you think your teacher used these different musical activities with you this term?
When asked to consider why their teacher used these different musical activities with them this term students stated to help them learn, to help them remember and to help the teacher teach them. “To help us remember if we got the song stuck in our heads so we can get the words and know them” (SP-Margaret, September, 2009).
**Question Eight: Would you like your teacher to continue doing these types of musical activities in Italian lessons? Why?**

All students expressed a desire for their teacher to continue using the Orff-Schulwerk musical activities during Italian lessons because they enjoyed being actively involved and engaged in the lesson. “Yes, I would because some of the kids in our class can get quite bored and they might not like Italian so much so it makes it more fun for rhythm as well, including others that like Italian” (SP-Isobel, September, 2009).

**Question Nine: Did you learn anything new this term?**

All students replied that they had learnt a lot more vocabulary and they were able to remember more of it. They believed their confidence in their Italian ability improved as a result of being actively involved and engaged in lessons, noting: “I learnt heaps of things this term. I learnt Italian songs, new words, I never knew how to count and now I know how to count” (SP-Emma, September, 2009).

**Other student themes**

Whilst the student interview data provided many positives, two major constraints were also identified.

Firstly, although students enjoyed learning Italian and the Orff-Schulwerk activities they would not admit it to their peers. “I really enjoy it but I didn’t let it show that I enjoyed it because most people in my class don’t enjoy Italian and when I go to say I like Italian they say “Are you serious?” and I say “No, just kidding.” I’m not very good at fitting in so I need to try and fit in and that’s pretty much a way that I can fit in (SP-Julie, September, 2009).

The researcher believes this attitude may be related to those of their parents. The data gathered in the *Attitudes towards the study of Languages in Australian Schools* (McConchie Pty Ltd, 2007) suggests the historical cultural stigma of the prejudice and discrimination of immigrants, which dates back to the ‘White Australia’ policy, has possibly been passed through the generations. This data is presented later in the chapter.


This resistance to singing is a generational spiral in which the proceeding generation follows in the footsteps of the preceding one which encourages children to stop singing at an early age (Ball, 2010; Humphries, n.d., WAOSA, 2001). This also relates to teacher self-efficacy and the ways in which teachers structure their singing
activities. Students expressed dislike of singing; however, they stated that they would be happy to sing as part of a group. Given the students responses below, perhaps teachers need to consider how they ask their students to sing and whether they may feel threatened or vulnerable in that situation. “Not in front of people. I’m pretty self-conscious about my voice. If I’m with close friends and family I can sing at the top of my lungs but with people I don’t know very well I don’t feel comfortable singing” (SP-Margaret, September, 2009). “I don’t really like singing on my own in front of big crowds. I like singing in front of people in a group” (SP-Chiara, September 2009).

Assisting teachers to change their own attitudes towards singing may help students to modify their own. Making teachers aware of the cognitive benefits of singing and providing them with effective strategies may encourage them to develop and strengthen their capabilities (Lowe, 2008). Singing promotes listening, which is an active function, not hearing which is passive. If students are reluctant to sing then skills such as rhythm, pitch discrimination, echoing, imitation and responding are not developed. Ball, (2010) and Schunk (1999, cited in Stansell, 2005) also reaffirm that singing helps prediction skills, promotes active learning, enhances long term memory and develop class solidarity (Pochmursky, 2009; Sting, cited in Pochmursky, 2009).

Summary of the student post-intervention interview data

Results from the data suggested that students were engaged in the Orff-Schulwerk activities and this helped to increase their excitement of Italian. “Yes. Because they were fun to learn and they helped us learn better than just saying the words. We got to use instruments and we got to change the way we say the words and change the patterns” (SP-Gillian, September, 2009). Their responses indicated that the novelty of Orff-Schulwerk activities provided them with an effective stimulus to engage them in learning. According to scientific research, the release of dopamine (attention, working memory, motivation and reward) and norepinephrine (novelty) allows the brain to create a memory of the song which will remain in the students head long after the lesson had concluded (Dunne, 2002; Ianterno & Salerno, cited in Kramer, 2001; Schwartz & Begley, 2003). “Yes. Because I can learn better because every time the teacher asked me a question I just remember the song” (SP-Karen, September, 2009). They also helped the students in retrieving information or vocabulary needed as the song triggered a greater number of neural connections providing them with the scaffolds or supports needed. “Yes. Cause if you need to remember some words you just need to think of a song and it will come into your head” (SP-Lisa, September, 2009). This finding

The data also supports the argument that speech is reliant on rhythm or prosody (Besson & Schon, 2001; Patel & Daniele, 2002; Tagg, 2002). These finding support neuroscientific evidence that presenting content in a novel way triggers neurotransmitters which assists learners in memory, attention and retention of content (Doidge, 2010b; Schwartz & Begley, 2003; Walker, 2010; Willis, 2008). The Orff-Schulwerk approach enabled students, who previously were reluctant or resistant to participating in Italian, achieve success and make progress. Whilst achievement was not ‘formally tested’ it was implied by the teachers and the students. “Yes I did. Because they were fun and they helped me remember things. We got to clap and sing” (SP-Aaron, September, 2009), “One of my lowest ability students completed all his work for the first time during the intervention” (TP – Virginia, September, 2009), “They can remember the things we did they remember the song and all that but I’ll need to test in the next week to see if they can understand and if they can use it in a lesson” (TP-Laura, September, 2009).

Using the Orff-Schulwerk approach when teaching Italian highlights structural and functional similarities between music and language such as rhythm, sounds and sequences (Arom, cited in Besson & Schon, 2001). It supports the evolutionary idea that musical awareness precedes linguistic awareness (Darwin, 1876; Mithen, 2006) as the students were able to repeat the musical rhythms of a linguistic phrase before being able to understand what the words meant, assisting them in acquiring the new language being presented. “Yes I do a lot. It just like um, like songs and every song I like every kind of song Italian, in my own language or in English and I can relate to song. Italian is my third language so, it’s really good” (SP-Emma, September, 2009).

In summary, the student interviews identified three emerging constructs.

1. Engagement.
2. Reinforcement and scaffolding.
3. Increased linguistic understanding.

Appendix LL provides further detail citing themes and examples of responses. It also compares students’ post-intervention findings with the post-intervention findings of the teachers.
Analysis of teacher post-intervention exit interview and focus group responses

At the conclusion of the intervention, the researcher conducted individual exit interviews and a focus group discussion with each of the six teacher participants. Analysis of the collective data gathered identified three emerging interrelated teaching and learning themes and their relevant constructs. These were:

- Reflection on teaching practice and Orff-Schulwerk processes.
- Student learning outcomes using Orff-Schulwerk.
- Analysis of support structures needed in order to use Orff-Schulwerk effectively.

Teacher vignettes are presented and highlight the following data. Summaries of individual teacher experiences gleaned from their exit interview and the focus group located in Appendix MM.

**Emergent Theme and Construct Analysis**

Analysis of all the Action Cycle Three data determined how effective teachers considered the Orff-Schulwerk approach to be in the teaching of Italian to upper primary students and what needs to happen in the future if this approach is to be used effectively by other teachers. The data was categorised into three overarching themes with emerging internal constructs.

**Theme One: Teachers on teaching practice**

Construct 1: Self Reflection on teaching style
Construct 2: Ease of Integration
Construct 3: Relevant and Contemporary
Construct 4: Increases awareness of the cognitive process (cognition)
Construct 5: Teacher Confidence

**Theme Two: Teachers on student learning**

Construct 1: Improved language ability
Construct 2: Provides reinforcement and scaffolding
Construct 3: Increases linguistic understanding
Construct 4: Engage students

**Theme Three: Support structures needed**

Construct 1: Teacher Self-Efficacy
Construct 2: School Level
Construct 3: Systems Level
Theme One: Teachers on teaching practice

Construct 1: Self-reflection on teaching style

All teachers considered the Orff-Schulwerk approach to be a success in their classrooms as it allowed them to reflect on their current practice. The intervention allowed them to consider novel approaches to delivering content and therefore provided an alternative strategy to engage their students. The Orff-Schulwerk approach allowed for consideration of dormant skills “I think that awakened quite a few skills of mine which I think they lie dormant sometimes and then you realise “Oh, I could use that” and bring it into language” (TP-Amelia, September, 2009), lesson structure “The Year 7’s this year... need a very structured programme and environment otherwise they tend to go off the handle a bit you know” (TP-Beatrice, September, 2009), lesson pacing “It made me realise I had to slow things down” (TP-Amelia, September, 2009), effective methods to achieve student outcomes, music as an innate human quality, the structure of the learning environment, good technique for teaching meaningful chunks of text “I found it very satisfying and I found that the kids learnt quite well what I was teaching them through this method” (TP-Sabrina, September, 2009), overcoming and reducing behaviour management issues “I have a lot more kids interested in what was happening” (TP-Virginia, September, 2009) and finding ways to engage all students “I thought it was very successful in a sense that the kids were engaged and they enjoyed what we were doing (TP-Laura, September, 2009).

Construct 2: Ease of integration

Given the limitation of a one off four-hour professional learning opportunity and an eight-week intervention, teachers considered the Orff-Schulwerk approach to be successful as it could be integrated into their normal classroom programmes. Teachers considered the Orff-Schulwerk approach to be useful and relevant, not something extra to be added to an already full curriculum. “I always use song in the classroom this was something that was not new for me but the way we were using it this time was different and yes I think it is something good. It is another tool. I don’t think I’m going to use this all the time but it is something else that I can add to my teaching” (TP-Laura, September, 2009). As it is not a rigid method, teachers considered it fluid and easy to apply, describing it like a ‘tool box’ where they are able to take from it only what they need. “Orff-Schulwerk is like a tool box and the teachers use the tools they need from it” (TP-Virginia, September, 2009).

Teachers stated they were able to use it instinctively without having to have an extensive musical knowledge making the Orff-Schulwerk approach enjoyable to use.
However, they did state that a greater musical knowledge would have been beneficial but not essential. “If you don’t have a musical background but you have a passion for music and you understand the basic components of it. You don’t have to be a music student I don’t think but passionate about music and I can see the benefit of rhythm, beat that coincided with what happens in our language classrooms” (TP-Sabrina, September, 2009).

Teachers considered the ease with which they could fit Orff-Schulwerk activities into their existing programme allowed them to establish cross curricula links into the areas of reading and speaking. They also suggested the approach could be a valuable tool in establishing cross-school links which could benefit all teachers. “I would urge them to experiment and to try it especially if they like to use music in their teaching and I think it can be very versatile and you can be very creative with it. I think it has some good points. Some good positives. I suppose it could go into every learning area of the timetable” (TP-Beatrice, September, 2009). ACARA (2010) strongly supports the establishment of particular cross-curricula links to support students learning. The Arts Shape Paper (2011c) states “Arts subjects have a direct relationship to other subjects” (ACARA, 2011c, p. 19). However, ACARA (2010, 2011) and the APPA (2007) do not acknowledge the potential cross-curricular links of music and its potential benefits on cognition and literacy.

**Construct 3: Relevant and contemporary**

All teachers commented on how refreshing it was to be presented with a strategy that was useful, relevant and contemporary to a Language classroom. “It’s new and it works” (TP-Virginia, September, 2009) and “For too long Languages teachers need to attend professional development that does not relate to them” (TP-Amelia, September, 2009).

Today’s view of curriculum as ‘fact’, needs to progress to a view of curriculum as a ‘lived experience’ (Scarino, 2010). Students need to be able to experience their learning by participating in activities that allow them to ‘do’ and ‘manipulate’ language (Benbridge, 2010). Considering this, participating teachers values the Orff-Schulwerk approach as it allowed them to break away from the traditional way of teaching of ‘teacher talk’ and ‘student listening’. It encouraged the teachers to try a novel and active approach. “Got me clapping and trying instruments” (TP-Amelia, September, 2009).

The rich feedback from teachers and students is consistent with the neuroscientific research discussed in Chapter II, which states that both brain hemispheres need to work as a cohesive and complimentary unit (Asher, 2001; Danesi, 1987; Merzenich, 2009a;
2009b; Patel, 2003; Parsons, Fox & Hodges, 1998 cited in Hodges, 2000; Sperry, 1972; Zatorre, 2005). Teachers can assist neural development by catering for a number of diverse learning styles (Norris, 2010; Scarino, 2010). “I think it’s a fantastic opportunity for all language teachers ... that you’re researching it and I definitely think that it’s a good extra tool for language teachers to use. We get precious few PD’s that are really relevant” (TP-Beatrice, September, 2009).

Construct 4: Increases awareness of the cognitive process

During Action Cycle One and Two, many teachers commented that they used music/song in their Italian classroom however, they didn’t know why. They just knew that the students found it enjoyable and that it helped them to remember. After implementing the Orff-Schulwerk intervention teachers found that they had an increased awareness of how music helped the development of cognitive processes. They became aware that music helped to make connections in the brain as “music provided students with a trigger for the brain’s filing cabinet” (TP-Amelia, September, 2009).

Gantbonton and Segalowiz (1988) state that second language teachers should strive for automaticity of language with their students. The repetitive nature of music/songs allows for practice leading to automation. Children don’t need to understand what the words mean because actions can help them work it out. Musicians such as the Ramones and Eminem support this. Not all their fans worldwide understand the words in their songs however, all sing along, as their songs are simple and repetitive. Music videos also provide visual cues to help the non-native speaker interpret the meaning of the song. The brain uses music/song to learn, encode and preserve information. This suggests that: rhythm, accent structure, assonance and alliteration help do this. It is the qualities which song/music employs which promote cognitive economy to generate correct answers rather than just memorisation (Levitin, 2010).

In their exit interviews and focus group discussion, teachers stated that the Orff-Schulwerk approach was useful in establishing cross-curricular links in reading and writing. Teachers stated that body percussion and movement helped to accelerate the learning process as it made learning easier and provided students with scaffolds for learning. However, rhythm was particularly useful in syllabification and breaking text down into meaningful chunks allowing students to “dissect the soundscape of language” (TP-Amelia, September, 2009.) It also made repetition fun and enjoyable as it provided variation and novelty. “It has the students paying closer attention to the language, linguistics. It makes them pay closer attention and it makes it interesting so that we don’t feel like we’re drilling but, in actual fact we probably are, using a lot of
the language teaching strategies in fun ways so they’re being fooled into learning basically” (TP-Amelia, September, 2009).

**Construct 5: Teacher Confidence**

While all teachers found the Orff-Schulwerk intervention successful and useful in their classroom, all stated that they would have liked more professional learning opportunities to further develop their skills. Lack of professional learning opportunity led to feelings of lack of confidence in their musical ability and limited the activities they used with their students. “I wouldn’t say I’ve enjoyed it 100%, no. Again, because I wasn’t feeling confident with it and because I wasn’t feeling confident I wasn’t happy about doing something. So, that’s the reason why. It was that lack of confidence in implementing this programme (TP-Donatella, September, 2009).

As Orff-Schulwerk was not regular practice for this group of teachers they felt they had inadequate knowledge and felt apprehensive in implementing it, fearing that they “weren’t doing it right” (TP-Amelia, September, 2009). However, the researcher reminded teachers throughout the intervention that their focus was language outcomes, not musical ones. This was a problem for one teacher whose focus during the intervention seemed to focus more on the musical outcomes than linguistic ones.

All teachers commented on their lack of musical education in their pre-service training. This highlighted the issue that teachers are not given the tools, strategies or content knowledge to use music as an effective teaching tool. The combining of the Arts at university will continue to limit these capabilities (DEST, 2005; Russell-Bowie, 2002; Pascoe et al, 2005). “…this is my third year out teaching…this is something we hadn’t done [at university]” (TP-Virginia, September, 2009). These factors appear to limit the second language teacher’s confidence in using songs and music in their classroom.

**Theme Two: Teachers on student learning**

**Construct 1: Improved language ability**

All teachers stated that their students were able to learn meaningful chunks of text and apply the language learned as a result of the Orff-Schulwerk intervention. “Students were over-awed at the amount of language presented to them but then by the conclusion of the intervention the language was just rolling off their tongues” (TP-Virginia, September, 2009). The Orff-Schulwerk activities provided a fun and novel way of drilling vocabulary. Whilst rhythm activities did improve pronunciation and fluency, at times it did cause problems, especially when the music and rhythm was too fast “At one
stage the students were just swallowing their words...then with practice, they got better” (TP – Virginia, September, 2009).

Evidence from the research indicates that the Orff-Schulwerk approach encourages engagement and active participation. Students participate in a complete sensory experience, not just passively sit, listen and repeat. Musical experiences intensify the development of neurons increasing the number of interconnections between brain cells, enhancing the ability to think, learn, reason and create. Participating teachers did indicate that the Orff-Schulwerk approach enhanced student’s ability to think, learn, create, concentrate and retain vocabulary.

The data implies the Orff-Schulwerk approach provided a successful stimulus via novelty, association and demand of task (Schwartz & Begley, 2003) which allowed for learning to occur, attention to be given and memory to be created (Doidge, 2010a; 2010b). The neurotransmitters pertinent to this research were dopamine and norepinephrine as these are the chemicals that respond to attention and novelty. When a stimulus is new it demands attention triggering dopamine and releases norepinephrine, as the brain is responding to the novelty, therefore assisting the brain to remember what is being presented ” (Doidge, 2010a; 2010b; Walker, 2010). “Music provides a trigger to search...for the information until it’s found” (TP-Amelia, September, 2009), “Because it helps me remember Italian things more easily. Because it has the rhythm to it and it kind of makes it easier” (SP-Daniel, September, 2009.)

Construct 2: Provides reinforcement and scaffolding

All teachers commented that the Orff-Schulwerk activities provided reinforcement and scaffolding for students, by allowing them to repeat the vocabulary a number of times without the students becoming bored. Using the rhythm as a scaffold helped students to familiarise themselves with the vocabulary and master it. Teachers commented that students were able to apply language they once struggled with, to remember it and use it naturally.

Teachers stated that it was attention grabbing, as students were interested in the different method being used to drill new language. Students understood the language being used and importantly believed it was fun, new and different. Orff-Schulwerk engaged students of all abilities as the activities allowed them to participate at their own level of understanding and need. Teachers stated that the rhythmic activities of Orff-Schulwerk, “freed up tongues and students were producing language that they wouldn’t normally have produced” (TP-Virginia, September, 2009). They also stated that this
was reinforcing to students as experiencing success encouraged them to learn more and take their language further.

All of these findings appear to support Krashen’s Affective Filter Hypothesis (Krashen, 1982); Total Physical Response, neuroscience, brain switching (Asher, 1984; 2000; 2001) and Multiple Intelligence Theory (Gardner, 1993; 1999). Teachers agreed that music/song varies the energy of the classroom environment making it comfortable and relaxing, resulting in increased level of student engagement. “Enthusiastically, and that’s being honest. Its’ not me going “Here we go” They were really enthusiastic and at times I thought “If you were just a little more lively in the normal classroom I’d probably love ya more” (TP-Amelia, September, 2009).

**Construct 3: Increases linguistic understanding**

Teachers stated that the rhythmic activities of Orff-Schulwerk enabled the students to pay closer attention to the linguistic elements of language, such as the phonology of Italian, which includes syllables, stress and sound/pronunciation. “It’s a tool for dissecting the soundscape of language” (TP-Amelia, September, 2009). This enabled students to break down words and phrases into syllables, making it easier for them to learn and speak Italian.

Exit interviews and focus group discussion data indicated that teachers considered the Orff-Schulwerk approach useful for linguistic reasons as it broke language down into meaningful chunks. It made language clearer to students allowing students to pay closer attention to language and linguistics. Teachers stated that the rhythm focus of the Orff-Schulwerk activities assisted students with repetition, syllabification, pronunciation, articulation, improved language fluency, speaking and the learning of new vocabulary. Orff-Schulwerk activities allowed students to learn and apply language they struggled with: “We would syllabify it. Find the beat, then the rhythm. They would clap it. Then after we got that sorted out, we’d sing it. The syllables helped them to remember how to say the date in the correct order” (TP – Sabrina, September, 2009).

The musical activities provide a structure for students to remember and sequence language. This mirrors Krashen’s hypothesis of i + 1. The pairing of rhythm and words improves the minds ability to remember them and it can determine the success level of learning new linguistic information. Having fun and letting the words come has much more in common with naturalistic communicative language learning than tiresome drills: “When it comes to syllabifying things, breaking them down, making it easier to digest if you like and then the language came easier” (TP-Amelia, September, 2009).

Song texts are useful to introduce native and colloquial language whilst also presenting
cultural phenomena. These elements are employed successfully by artists such as The Ramones and Eminem to enable their music to appeal to a global audience.

Some teachers in the research used commercially produced songs for the intervention period. Others used the meaningful chunks of texts, which they wanted the students to learn as an outcome of the term’s learning programme. Regardless which approach was used, teachers suggested that the students interest in words was elevated as they were paying closer attention to the vocabulary presented. “There were four components to that that I wanted them to get into their heads and yes I found that the rhythm, they caught onto the rhythm…the beat and they were able to go quickly go into it without me intervening much at all. It helped their language acquisition, their language and the structural part in remembering how to put it together as well” (TP-Sabrina, September, 2009).

Teachers stated that they used their chosen text as a word study, looking at similarities and differences between Italian and English words. This is an important element of intercultural awareness. It allows the students to understand, notice and recognise that although different, Italian and English share many commonalities. Similarly, such activities also assisted students understanding of intracultural awareness as they looked closer at their language and culture, and similarities and differences within it.

**Construct 4: Engage students**

Data from Action Cycle One and Two had uncovered that teachers were experiencing difficulty in engaging upper primary students in activities that involved music/song. They found students became disengaged as the repertoire used was not of a contemporary nature and too immature for their students. Accordingly, their students were very reluctant to participate as many of the activities, which they employed, were based upon singing songs.

Upon using the Orff-Schulwerk approach, teachers noticed a change in the engagement of their students in lessons. In-class teacher observations together with student interview data suggested that this was because students found the activities novel, fun and enjoyable. “I felt that it was really fun and exciting and I really wanted to go to Italian. Because I was enjoying myself and all the different music and sounds instead of having to sit down and work 24/7” (SP-Belinda, September, 2009). This appealed to students as it made learning engaging as they were involved and out of their seats. “Well, it was different. It was more involving, like lots of people were like forced
to become involved and do the rhythms. Everyone was involved cause we worked in groups” (SP-Margaret, September, 2009).

In their exit interviews and focus group discussions, the teacher’s stated that the Orff-Schulwerk approach was successful, as its ‘novelty’ engaged students, especially the boys and minimised behaviour problems. Studies in Educating Boys (Lillico, 2000) state that boys need variety, creativity, positivity, purpose, competition, physical activity, responsibility and structure to be engaged. Activities also need to be short and specific. The data suggests that the Orff-Schulwerk approach is affective at engaging boys in learning Italian. “We have a lot of boys and...[they] responded very well and they saw this as playing and they love it and they loved playing and using the instruments” (TP – Laura, September, 2009).

By being actively involved in the lesson student’s demonstrated improved behaviour (especially with the boys and students with learning difficulties) as students were focused. “Yes. Because they were fun! We actually got to say something” (SP-Aaron, September, 2009.) The feeling of not wanting to miss out put peer pressure on students as they wanted to do the right thing “It got everyone involved. They couldn’t just sit there. It would be too obvious” (TP – Sabrina, September, 2009), “Everyone got involved with Italian. We didn’t get anyone slacking off” (SP – Angela, September, 2009). Students displayed improved engagement by being more responsive, getting organised quickly, remembering the vocabulary and a greater attention span “Even my worst students were interested in Italian. They really wanted to do it and produced more work than they had done at any stage in five years” (TP – Virginia, September, 2009), “Everyone got to do stuff, not just one person” (SP – Chiara, September, 2009). Being willing to try and being able to contribute to their learning not only increased work completion rate but each week students left Italian happy “They left happy each week because they were learning something new” (TP – Amelia, September, 2009), “I really wanted to go to Italian” (SP – Glenn, September, 2009). All of this implies in improved student confidence in their abilities “I felt smart” (SP – Daniel, September, 2009), “They helped me with my speaking of Italian” (SP - Gillian, September, 2009), “You couldn’t get the smile off their faces” (TP – Virginia, September, 2009).

Data from this research suggests that the Orff-Schulwerk activities catered for the needs and interests of students. Student interview data also suggested that students retained what was taught using this approach. “It’s good to learn Italian through music and it gives you a way to learn it that’s more fun” (SP-Lisa, September, 2009), “I can
Theme Three: Support structures required

Construct 1: Teacher self-efficacy

Of primary importance, were the teachers and the support they needed. Whilst they considered the Orff-Schulwerk intervention to be successful and would recommend it to their colleagues, they did acknowledge that several support structures needed to be put in place to improve their confidence in using the approach.

Teachers stated that the approach required a set of personal attributes and external support. Personal attributes included confidence, an interest in music, willingness for self-improvement, flexibility “Teachers need to give the class time to experiment with the instruments and get it out of their system” (TP – Sabrina, September, 2009), willingness to have a go and try practical things, willingness to collaborate, willingness to take risks “They need to be wanting to have a go” (TP - Beatrice, September, 2009) and be an active advocate for Languages. “Yes, but I feel again they’ve got to be open minded and confident because there will be some teachers who will just say ‘this is rubbish’ because they are not open minded or they might feel they are not confident in using music. I feel like teachers who have got a musical background will really embrace it but people like myself, I didn’t find it as easy, I wasn’t as confident and there’s those teachers who will say, ‘No it’s not for me’”(TP-Donatella, September, 2009).

External supports identified in the data included more professional learning, regular Orff network meetings, modelling and in class mentoring from a Language/Orff-Schulwerk practitioner, workshops and courses. Teachers stated that the development an instructional resource book on how to use the Orff-Schulwerk approach in the Language classroom would be of extreme benefit. Ideally the resource would consist of a manual, instructional DVD and a CD containing examples of Italian songs appropriate to use with Orff-Schulwerk.

As presented in the preceding chapters, only 3% of the total population of primary Italian teachers participated in the research. As well as the reasons afore mentioned others may exist explaining why teachers decided not to participate or to opt out. Reasons for this may include included a lack of personal interest, lack of school support, personal reasons, and teachers feeling threatened by research and reluctant to participate. Lack of confidence, personal time constraints, timetable constraints, curriculum restrictions and fear of failure were other prominent factors. It was also difficult for the researcher and the teachers to arrange mutually convenient times for
interviews and focus group discussions. This was also the result of many of the previously mentioned reasons. Due to these demands and constraints faced by teachers, the researcher found that all teachers, including the ones who participated in the research demonstrated a slow response rate, non-adherence to deadlines, frequent loss of research documents and not reading research documents carefully.

The researcher also noted that research provides teachers with a feeling of vulnerability. Teachers were very reluctant to speak about themselves and their learning, preferring to speak about their students. They displayed reluctance in ‘having a go’ and taking risks themselves however, they encouraged their students to do every day in their classrooms. This can be attributed to their fear of failure in accountability. System level requirements have made them concerned about doing things ‘the wrong way’. The fear of failure could also be a factor in teacher reluctance to regularly self-reflect. Teachers made comments on their weekly feedback sheets about their student responses but not on their experience for that week. It became increasingly apparent that for some teachers the success of lessons is a reflection on how effective they are as a teacher.

Frustration at having to constantly justify their participation in research was another constraint faced by teachers. They expressed that for any other subject area it was a given that professional learning would occur. However, as Language teachers, they continually needed to justify their reasons to the principal and the wider school community. “You have to be very delicate in the way you produce or introduce things to the admin because it doesn’t get the attention that the other learning areas do. So, in another sense it says, this is academic pedagogically sound, We are incorporating over and above teaching strategies that would normally be expected when teaching Italian so how can it be contradictory to development. And I think it puts us as teachers in a different light because it shows that we’re academic. This is part of promoting us as Italian teachers too. Does that make sense? That’s always going to be there and we constantly deal with that” (TP-Amelia, September, 2009).

Construct 2: School level
Teachers identified principals, school structure, staff and parents as supports needed at a school based level.

Principals
During the research there was a perception that many school principals were not valuing the Languages programme, not valuing the role of music in education and felt threatened by having research conducted in their school. “If there’s one thing and it’s
something that we have often discussed, Italian tends to be treated as a sideline attraction. Anything that you do in there gathers attention from the principal or DP [Deputy Principal] to make sure everything was above board” (TP-Amelia, September, 2009).

Primarily, teachers stated that their school principals, needed to become advocates for Languages by supporting the programmes and related research. They believe actions that would demonstrate this would be allocating a classroom to the Languages teacher, appropriate funding allocation and ‘just’ timetabling to ensure that Languages was not always at the end of the day and to ensure that common Duties Other Than Teaching time (D.O.T.T.) could be had with other specialists and the classroom teachers in order to discuss planning and other issues. Also, teachers felt that they were constantly required to justify why they wanted to participate in the study or any type of professional learning, instead of being encouraged to do so by the principal.

These perceptions possibly link to the APPA (2007) belief that the four core subjects of the curriculum should be History, Mathematics, Science and Literacy. Many principals value the traditional subjects, as this is their ‘life-world’ and political priority. This is their background and many do not seem to have contemporary knowledge of how learning occurs in the complex ‘life-worlds’ of today’s students. Further perceptions that principals were not valuing research in Languages and Music education included the principals not passing information to teachers, slow response rate when responding to correspondence and not adhering to research deadlines. This is supported by the Attitudes towards the study of Languages in Australian schools (McConchie Pty Ltd, 2007).

A lack of music specialist in schools also highlighted the issue raised earlier that Music is not valued as a subject by principals and the participating Italian teachers also identified this as a concern.

**School structure**

Too frequently, second language teaching and learning programmes encounter barriers to their success due to poorly structured and over-crowded school timetables (Crystal, 2008a). This was another constraint encountered in this research. It was difficult to find a term to conduct the research, which would cause minimal disruption to the running of the school, teacher programmes and students. Timetables and term planners for each term are over-crowded with: National Assessment Programme Literacy and Numeracy (NAPLAN) testing, sports events, excursions, incursions, assemblies and special events. This made it difficult for teachers to see their
intervention class each week and to synchronise the start of the intervention. Five teachers implemented the intervention for eight weeks and one teacher only for six weeks. “Yes I would perhaps [have preferred] maybe Term One rather than Term Three although I don’t know every term ends up being chaotic. But, in this term we’ve had swimming carnival, sports carnival, parents’ night. It’s been pretty hectic. I just can wait till the end” (TP-Beatrice, September, 2009).

Timetabling also restricted the classes available, as one teacher was unable to conduct the intervention with an upper primary class due to timetable clashes. This resulted in her using a Year Four, middle primary class for the research. Timetable constraints also limited intervention time as teachers commented that they would have liked greater flexibility in the timetable to use the Orff-Schulwerk approach as it was unsettling for the students at the beginning and by the eighth week they felt that they were just getting into in and had to stop “I felt like I had just started to get into it and I would have liked to delve deeper into it” (TP – Sabrina, September, 2009). “They were just getting enthused and starting to get into the groove, more or less and we have to bag it and shelve it for another week. So yeah, time constraint was a big thing” (TP - Amelia, September, 2009). Timetabling could also be considered a student constraint as students stated that they had Italian at the end of the day “didn’t have mind on the job.’ “If I was completely honest I don’t think I did my full. We have Italian at the end of the day... my mind wasn’t on the job.” (SP-Margaret, September, 2009).

Another barrier in the school structure is the fact that many Languages teachers do not have an allocated classroom and hindering the quality of programme delivered “I go from one class to another I really need to take this stuff to the class and all that and sometimes I don’t have enough time to prepare all of these things. It was an interesting situation” (TP-Laura, September, 2009).

Staff attitudes
Teachers stated that the staff at their schools could greater support Languages if they didn’t view the Languages teacher as a D.O.T.T. provider but as an equal. Participating teachers felt their colleagues did not support the Languages programme. One way teachers suggested they could do this was by trying to use the Orff-Schulwerk approach in their own classrooms.

TP-Amelia: If it was any other learning area there wouldn’t have been resistance but it seems that Italian, unfortunately, attracts that and there’s not a lot you can do about it because it’s a culture that’s evident and we’re not going to unlearn people but I think these are some of the conflicts you can come up against even in so far as the general support in the school for Italian. It doesn’t get the focus sport gets. You know what
would be interesting? If you had someone come into the school at the beginning and demonstrate to all the teachers and show them this is what we’re about to be doing in Italian.

**Researcher:** A whole school professional development session?

**TP-Amelia:** Yeah, like part of a staff meeting.

**Researcher:** Why?

**TP-Amelia:** Because it has application in other learning areas, English for example. They’re all teaching English. It takes away some of the mystery of what we are doing here.....in Italian. We are introducing this to the school. Maybe not now at research level, but further down the track. And then the principal can give consent and know what’s going on in there. This obligates them to take notice of what we’re doing. We need to participate in Maths professional development that doesn’t apply to us. This shows them what we are doing and it shows them that it does apply to them too. Give’em a bit of their own medicine.”

**Parent attitudes**

Teachers commented on the difficulties faced when asking parents to support the research. Prior to the intervention, teachers believed that the parents were supportive of the Languages programme. During it they became a little disheartened, with: parents/students failing to return consent forms, student absentees and parents removing students from Italian class for the term. These issues were identified by teachers, suggesting that the wider school community did not value the Italian language programme. This finding is supported by the *Attitudes towards the study of Languages in Australian schools* (McConchie Pty Ltd, 2007). “Some of the parents came to me and said that they didn’t want the kids to have a telephone interview or to be filling in forms. That was something new I didn’t think about that. I thought the parents were going to be positive about the whole idea but it didn’t happen” (TP-Laura, September, 2009).

**Construct 3: Systems level**

Teachers explained that support at a systems level was also required to help reduce the feeling of isolation. “I don’t think it’s something we can work through on our own. I would like to be part of a workshop where I’m taken through what I need to do with the kids. I’d like to become a student and taken through 10 weeks of this Orff-Schulwerk approach” (TP-Beatrice, September, 2009). Teachers suggested that they would like the professional languages associations, both unilingual (Western Australian Association of Teachers of Italian and Italo Australian Welfare and Cultural Centre) and multi-lingual (Modern Languages Teachers Association and Modern Languages Teachers Association of Western Australia) and universities to support and promote the Orff-Schulwerk approach by providing professional learning opportunities. By
providing workshops, post-graduate courses and units in Orff-Schulwerk, the teachers suggested it will help them and other Languages teachers gain confidence in the approach, enhance their musical knowledge, strengthen their skills and deepen their knowledge of interdisciplinary pedagogy. “Like you have a unit…maybe five weeks as I work in five week themes. Get your phrases and someone like you runs it and how you would do it. How we use this whole approach to teach these phrases” (TP-Donatella, September, 2009).

Teachers suggested that pre-service teachers should have Orff-Schulwerk units in their course, as it is a useful learning tool that can be integrated successfully across all learning areas. Teachers commented that the music unit in their pre-service courses were not useful as they feel they do not have the skills or knowledge to use music with confidence to create relevant and appropriate learning experiences which match the needs and abilities of their students. “...this is something very new and fresh.......and it does work” (TP-Virginia, September, 2009). “This philosophy being incorporated [in teaching degrees] at uni level...so that if we were sent to the outback...we could survive” (TP-Amelia, September, 2009).

All findings strongly suggested that professional learning opportunities would improve teacher confidence in utilising the Orff-Schulwerk approach in their classrooms. Teachers suggested that professional associations and tertiary institutions should support this current research.

**Answering Action Cycle Three research questions**

3.1 Do Italian language teachers in Western Australian primary schools consider the Orff-Schulwerk approach to be an effective pedagogical tool when teaching Italian to their upper primary students?

Analysis of the data suggests the teacher’s life-world impacted greatly on its success. However, teachers did consider the Orff-Schulwerk approach effective as it:

- Allowed them to self-reflect on their teaching style and increased their awareness of the cognitive process which students’ progress through when learning;
- Could be easily integrated into what is currently happening in the classroom as it is relevant and contemporary;
- Improved students linguistic ability and understanding as it provided students with reinforcement and scaffolding structures required for success; and
Engaged students and helped to reduce behavioural issues.

3.2 Was the Orff-Schulwerk approach successful in engaging Western Australian upper primary students in the study of Italian as a second language?

Both teachers and students considered the Orff-Schulwerk approach to be successful in engaging students in the study of Italian. Teachers stated that as students were actively involved in the lessons, it:

- Increased student participation rate, enjoyment and they felt excited about learning Italian.
- Assisted students in speaking, memory, learning of vocabulary and building confidence in their own ability.
- Catered for student needs as rhythm, song and movement activities provided scaffolds for learning and the songs learnt had the right vocabulary which they needed.

3.3 What do Italian language teachers in Western Australian primary schools consider to be the essential knowledge or support structures needed for the Orff-Schulwerk approach to be an effective pedagogical tool in their upper primary classrooms?

Teachers identified a number of personal attributes and support structures required for the effective use of Orff-Schulwerk to teach Italian effectively. Action Cycle Three found that teachers considered:

- Intrinsic dedication, efficacy together with external support networks to self-improve would increase their knowledge and confidence to use Orff-Schulwerk effectively; and
- Support at school and systems level was also required if the Orff-Schulwerk approach was to be considered an effective pedagogical tool for the teaching of Italian.

**Action Cycle Three summary**

In summary, data from Action Cycle Three suggests that the Orff-Schulwerk intervention was successful as an effective pedagogical tool for teaching Italian to upper primary students. Teachers considered the Orff-Schulwerk approach easy to integrate into existing programmes, relevant and contemporary, a good tool for self-reflection and for increasing teacher awareness of the learning process. Teachers stated that they found
the Orff-Schulwerk approach successful in engaging students, providing them with reinforcement and scaffolding, and useful in increasing student linguistic understanding and linguistic ability. Student data also suggested that they considered the Orff-Schulwerk approach engaging, useful in the provision of reinforcement and scaffolding and helpful in increasing their linguistic understanding. While teachers stated that they would recommend it to others they also expressed concern at their lack of confidence, musical knowledge and understanding. Teachers identified a number of support structures, which could be put in place to assist teachers in its use.

Conclusion

“A teacher’s work can only begin to make sense in the context of the wider set of economic, social and political forces that are impacting on general society” (Down, 2006, p. 38). The researchers discovered that while teachers of primary Italian in WA were using music/song in their classrooms, most had a limited knowledge of how or why it worked at a cognitive level. Teachers commented that something connects in the brain, however they had little understanding of the neurological benefits and how these connections are made to further enhance learning. Data revealed that teachers believed they lacked the musical skills to enable them to use song effectively in the second language classroom, especially in the upper primary years. Based on the research data, the researcher believed that if teachers were assisted in the use of music/song, by means of a musical intervention this would lead to a greater understanding of the potential of music/song as a pedagogical tool in upper primary classes and ultimately lead to an improvement in second language acquisition amongst upper primary students.

The data from Action Cycle One and Two led the researcher to conclude that there was a need for professional development in the use of music/song as a pedagogical tool for Italian language teachers in WA primary schools. The critical area of need the research has highlighted is that of limited music/song use in the upper primary years. There was a glaring need for a specific support focus in the use of music/song in the upper primary years in order to increase music use, as well as teacher confidence. To address this need, the researcher designed an Orff-Schulwerk intervention, which was implemented by the participating teachers. Data revealed that teachers and students considered the approach to be an effective pedagogical tool in the teaching of Italian in four major areas.

1. Actively engaging students and focusing attention.
2. Improving linguistic understanding.
3. Using novelty to enhance memory and retention.
4. Catering for student needs by providing learning scaffolds therefore increasing confidence and ability.

The researcher has used their personal knowledge and experience to test their intuitive hypothesis that the Orff-Schulwerk approach is a useful tool in the teaching of Italian. Part of the research was to see if others taught like them and if they experienced success. The researcher interpreted the evidence gathered to see if their intuitive hypothesis was supported.

In conclusion, the researcher found that many Italian teachers use music/song as a pedagogical tool but not to the same extent as she does. The researcher’s intuitive hypothesis was supported by both teachers and students as both parties were engaged and responded to the novelty of the Orff-Schulwerk approach. This engagement and novelty helped the cognitive process of learning for both teachers and students. Both parties consider the Orff-Schulwerk approach effective in the teaching and learning of Italian. Teachers and students indicated that they would like to continue using the Orff-Schulwerk approach however data suggests that support structures are needed to prevent student boredom and to increase teacher confidence in and ability to use the approach effectively.

Chapter VI draws together all the research findings and provides contextual conclusions and recommendations for the future.

The songs we learn in childhood can often stay with us for life.
(Dunne, 2002, p. 1)
CHAPTER VI
DISCUSSION, IMPLICATIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

In Japan and Spain and Germany, the universal language is Ramones. I’ve met people who have learnt to speak English using the Ramones. It’s simple repetitive and you can sing along to it, it’s a learning too. (Daniel Rey, cited in True, 2005, p. 284) The Ramones were a punk rock band from Queens, United States of America who ignited punk music across the world. From 1974–1996 they produced music which was a stripped down version of rock and roll. It was simple, speedy, loud and repetitive.

Introduction

Chapter VI responds to the aim of the research outlined in Chapter I. It reviews the research findings discussing them in relation to the research questions. Also discussed are the limitations of this research, the status of Music and Languages education in Australia and Europe as well scientific evidence supporting the view that music and language education enhances neural networks and cognitive functioning.

Chapter VI is presented in three sections. In Section One the research findings will be discussed. In Section Two, the curriculum documents will be analysed and compared to the research findings. In Section Three, future recommendations are proposed and discussed.
SECTION ONE: DISCUSSION OF THE FINDINGS.

Researcher’s Personal Self-reflection

The researcher established the research focus via self-reflection of her own pedagogy, which indicated that music/song can be successfully used to teach Italian. This led to the following questions being asked:

- Are there other Italian teachers in Western Australian primary schools that teach like me?
- Do they share a similar Italo-Australian background?
- Do they have a love of music/song?
- Do they engage interdisciplinary approaches when teaching Italian?
- Is music successful in my Italian room because I am both an Italian and Music specialist?

The research set out to examine whether music/song and the Orff-Schulwerk approach could be effectively used by teachers of primary Italian who were not music specialists. It sought to investigate: The potential of the Orff-Schulwerk approach as a pedagogical tool for the effective teaching of Italian to upper primary students in Western Australian primary schools.

The research was conducted in three connected action cycles

Action Cycle One

The researcher identified and contacted all 215 WA primary teachers of Italian in the 255 schools, which taught Italian as a second language. It involved administering and analysing teacher questionnaires to identify the Italian teachers who used music/song in their classes.

Action Cycle Two

From Action Cycle One, eight teachers were identified and interviewed to further expand on the data revealed in Action Cycle One.

Action Cycle Three

Based upon Action Cycle Two, six teachers then implemented an eight week Orff-Schulwerk intervention involving 164 students across seven WA primary schools.

Understanding the life-worlds of teachers

In order to establish whether the Orff-Schulwerk approach could be effectively used by non-music specialist primary Italian teachers, it was crucial to gather data and
knowledge of their reality, understand how this reality influenced their Orff-Schulwerk experience and for teachers to self-reflect upon their experience. The cycle of reflection was based upon Schon’s (1983) *Model for reflection in action*. Figure 6.1 displays this model and its three stages.

![Figure 6.1: Model for reflection in action (Schon, 1983)](image)

**Action Cycle One: Knowing in action**

**Answering Action Cycle One research questions**

1.1 Do Italian language teachers in Western Australian primary schools use music/song as a pedagogical tool in their classroom?

Action Cycle One findings positively answered the above research question by identifying that 32 (94%) of the responding teachers used music/song as a pedagogical tool in their classroom and 28 (82%) consider music/song a useful pedagogical tool. While none of the responding teachers taught in the same way as the researcher, “I’m not a music teacher like yourself” (*TP*-Ella, June/July, 2008), or had the same degree of confidence, “I’m not sure I have the confidence” (*TP*-Donatella, June/July, 2008) fifteen respondents (40%) did share an Italo-Australian background.

Thirty-two respondents (94%), stated that they enjoyed music/song in their personal lives and 31 respondents (91%) did not play a musical instrument “If I could play an instrument” (*TP*-Grazia, June/July, 2008). In contrast, the researcher is a proficient classical guitarist. Eighteen of the responding teachers (53%) stated that they did some pre-service music training. Importantly, the same number also expressed that
they did not feel confident in teaching/using music in their lessons, “I’m not very good...because musically I don’t feel I’m strong enough. Music was my minor, but you’d never have known” (TP-Donatella, June/July, 2008). This finding implies that there is an interest in music/song amongst teachers. However, they feel their skills and knowledge require further development if they are to use it effectively in the classroom. Laura explains, “I cannot think of anything specifically, but the way I am using music in the class is just my way. Nobody taught me how to do it. It’s something that I figured out” (TP-Laura, June/July, 2008).

1.2 How do Italian language teachers in Western Australian primary schools use music/songs as a pedagogical tool in their classroom?

The questionnaire revealed 27 (79%) teachers frequently used music/song in their classrooms. Thirty-one (91%) utilised music/song more in the junior and middle years, but only one (3%) teacher used music/song with their upper primary students. Teachers reported that they used music/song primarily for didactic purposes and 32 teachers (94%) stated that singing is their preferred teaching strategy. Thirty-two respondents (94%) emphasised that there was a lack of suitable teaching resources for upper primary years and that a specific support focus was needed in the upper primary years.

These findings indicated that the researchers’ interdisciplinary approach of using music/song to teach Italian to upper primary students was most unusual. The researcher employed rhythm based activities incorporating neuroscientific research evidence and inter/intracultural understandings. In contrast the teacher participants preferred pre-recorded music, singing and repetition as their focus.

Action Cycle Two: Reflecting in action

Answering Action Cycle Two research questions

2.1 Why do Italian language teachers in Western Australian primary schools use music/song as a pedagogical tool in their classroom?

All interviewed teachers stated that they used music/song to assist:

- Memorisation as music/song engages students in repetitious drill of new vocabulary, “Just keeps going over and over” (TP-Jane, June/July, 2008);
- Engagement in revision of existing vocabulary, “Reinforce previous language or vocabulary” (TP-Grazia, June/July, 2008);
- Facilitation of intercultural and intracultural discussions, “Give them a bit of an insight into whether the kids over there are the same as the kids over here” (TP-Susan, June/July, 2008);
• Assembly item preparation, “I’ve been using songs during assemblies...because I want the Italian classes to be represented in some way during assemblies and at the end of the year assembly” (TP-Laura, June/July, 2008); and

• Student’s engagement in desk activities, “You can use ...songs for cloze exercises...listening exercises, comprehension... (TP-Susan, June/July, 2008).

Interviews revealed that teachers used music/song primarily for memorisation and enjoyment. Of the 34 responding teachers, 32 indicated that they did use music as a pedagogical tool, none were able to state why other than ‘for fun’, and ‘helping students to remember’ “To engage the children” (TP-Donatella, June/July, 2008). These reflections were spontaneous and based on their intuition. All participants were competent practitioners, however their knowledge was implied and closely connected with implicit values. They could not articulate why they found music/song useful. They just knew music/song worked “Something obviously happens in the brain...helps children to learn things as a pattern, as a rhythm” (TP-Federica, June/July, 2008).

The data also identified three key deficits covering:

1. A limited use of music/song with upper primary,
2. Poor resourcing, and
3. Low teacher confidence.

1. Upper primary music/song deficit:
   This phase identified a deficit in the use of music/song with upper primary students. “I wouldn’t [use music/song]...with my fives’, sixes’ and sevens’. We should do it more [sing] with the kids as they get older and we tend not to and that’s probably a mistake” (TP-Jane, June/July, 2008). Teachers stated that they used music/song primarily with junior and middle years, but rarely with the upper years. “I don’t seem to use music as much with the older grades” (TP-Donatella, June/July, 2008)

2. A lack of resources:
   Teachers considered the resources available to upper primary students inappropriate, being either too easy or too difficult. “I find I do not use them ’cause they are just not suitable” (TP-Donatella, June/July, 2008), “Not a great range of Italian CD’s suited to Australian children learning Italian”(TP-Grazia, June/July, 2008), “The vocabulary is too high or the lyrics too difficult and we cannot use it” (TP-Laura, June/July, 2008). Teachers also stated that the music/song resources available for the
upper primary years were of little use in teaching the themes they were covering at school. “You are just not able to find...appropriate songs for the older age group” (TP-Tarsia, June/July, 2008); “I do find that the ones [resources] from Italy are too difficult... [Resources]...seriously lacking in the middle and upper” (TP-Ella, June/July, 2008), “I want it to fit in with what I’m doing” (TP-Susan, June/July, 2008) “A song that’s going to fit in with whatever theme I’m doing” (TP-Jane, June/July, 2008).

Learning area budgets also limited the resources teachers were able to purchase, therefore limiting their resource acquisitions. One teacher’s budget did not enable her to spend money on Italian music resources that could range from $29.95 upwards. Analysis of these figures showed that in reality this teacher’s budget allocated approximately $1.65 to each student for the entire year. As there are approximately 40 Italian lessons per year, that amount is less than 5c per student, per lesson. At the time of writing the average cost of a ‘cappuccino’ in Perth, Western Australia is $3.50. The average cost of a ‘gelato’ is $4. If Australia is a first world country, why is it providing its teachers with third world resourcing and budgets?

While the researcher acknowledges that the ‘hard’ resources would be of considerable benefit for the time-constrained teacher, she believes that it will do little to alleviate the resource problem. One teacher suggested that a resource be produced with a song for every topic taught in WA primary Italian classes. Not only would the resource be very costly to produce and purchase but what would happen when the teachers exhausted their ‘ideal resource’? The researcher identified 215 primary Italian teachers across WA. There are four terms in a school year. If each teacher taught a different theme each term that would result in 860 different themes being taught throughout the year across WA. Producing a CD resource with 860 songs that could be used across all grades does not seem to be a feasible solution.

Adequate resourcing is one of the challenges in the establishment of ‘effective Languages’ in Australian schools (ACARA, 2011a). The researcher believes that empowering teachers with the skills and knowledge to use music/song confidently in their classroom without having to rely on expressive commercially produced resources would be a positive step towards alleviating this problem. She believes that the Orff-Schulwerk approach may be useful in achieving this.
3. **Low teacher confidence:**

The most compelling finding was that teachers felt they lacked the musical ability and confidence to use music effectively in their classrooms. For many teachers, music meant singing and singing meant music. “I am a very, very bad singer” (TP-Laura, June/July, 2008). Therefore, the underlying opinion was I can’t sing, I don’t know anything about music, therefore I am not musical. This deficit was even more pronounced when confronting the use of music/song in upper primary years.

These findings imply that teachers intuitively know that music/song is a useful pedagogical tool but they are unclear of the neuroscientific benefits underlying it. Their limitations and inhibitions prevent them in making full use of music/song in the classroom which limits their mastery of its potential.

**Action Cycle Three: Reflection on action**

During Action Cycle Three, the six participating teachers implemented an Orff-Schulwerk intervention for 10 minutes in each lesson over a period of eight weeks. However, due to timetabling constraints, Laura conducted the intervention with her Year Four class, and Donatella conducted her intervention for a six-week period.

The intervention was designed to help teachers increase the amount of music/song used with upper primary students, reduce the pressure to find appropriate commercial resources, provide background knowledge into a new method of integrating music/song into their existing programmes and provide self-reflective opportunities. In summary, the participating teachers considered the Orff-Schulwerk approach to be an effective teaching tool “I found it enriching and I’m glad I’ve done it. It’s opened my eyes and awareness to a whole new area of practice and expertise which are there to investigate and hopefully apply” (TP-Beatrice, September, 2009) as well as an effective learning process, “I found it very satisfying and I found that the kids learnt quite well” (TP-Sabrina, September, 2009).

**Answering the Action Cycle Three research questions**

3.1 Do Italian language teachers in Western Australian primary schools consider the Orff-Schulwerk approach to be an effective pedagogical tool when teaching Italian to their upper primary students?

Data analysis identified aspects of the teacher’s life-world, which impacted greatly on their success including: school context demographics (students, class sizes, support available), as well as their personal life-world (family and children). The teachers identified the following nine successful attributes to the Orff-Schulwerk approach:
1. Engagement and active involvement of students. “They really enjoyed it and they were putting their hands up to try...even kids who weren’t engaged in Italian” (TP-Donatella, September, 2009).

2. Reduction of behavioural issues. “The further into it the children became more used to it and the behavioural issues dissipated” (TP-Virginia, September, 2009).

3. Provision of required reinforcement and scaffolding structures for success. “Movements that we were doing actually helped the kids to learn the meanings of the words as well” (TP-Virginia, September, 2009)

4. Improved student language ability. “For the first time ever my class strung more than four words together” (TP-Virginia, September, 2009).

5. Increased student linguistic understanding. “I think it’s a good way to help children to remember and understand ‘meaningful chunks of text’” (TP-Donatella, September, 2009).

6. Ease of integration into current classroom happenings. “I incorporated it into other areas of my curriculum” (TP-Virginia, September, 2009).

7. Increased teacher awareness of student cognitive learning processes. “I’ve learnt that the kids are receptive to music. I think it’s a natural human thing we have. Some boys thought it was daggy...but by the end they were clapping...they knew the whole thing” (TP-Sabrina, September, 2009).

8. Promoting learning that is relevant and contemporary. “It’s fun...and they can create.” (TP-Amelia, September, 2009).

9. Provision of teacher opportunities for self-reflection on their teaching style. “My own personal criticism...is that I’m going too fast and maybe there’s a tendency to skim over the top of things a little too much and this [Orff-Schulwerk approach] has shown me that the development needs to be slowed down so the kids can digest it” (TP-Amelia, September, 2009).

3.2. Was the Orff-Schulwerk approach successful in engaging Western Australian upper primary students in the study of Italian as a second language?

Action Cycle Three found that both teachers and students considered the Orff-Schulwerk approach to be successful in the engagement of Italian as a second language four ways.

1. Active involvement and increased participation. A perception of increased participation was indicated, because the students were actively involved in the
lessons. Teachers indicated that students felt excited learning Italian. This perception was confirmed by the students during their interviews. “We actually got to say something.” (SP-Aaron, September, 2009) and “It was fun and everyone got to do stuff” (SP-Glenn, September, 2009).

2. **Engagement and novelty.** Activities were considered: fun, enjoyable, new and different by teachers and students. “It’s good to learn Italian through music and it gives you a way to learn it that’s more fun” (SP-Lisa, September, 2009).

3. **Cognitive enhancement.** Teachers and students responses indicated the Orff-Schulwerk approach assisted in: speaking, memorisation, learning of vocabulary and development confidence in second language ability. “We clapped out the date. While clapping it I think it. Yeah, it helped me to remember a bit more and it had the clapping so it helped me to remember” (SP-Isobel, September, 2009).

4. **Scaffolding.** Students and teachers believed their needs were being catered for as: rhythm, song and movement provided scaffolds for learning, and the music/songs taught contained the vocabulary required. “Sometimes the teacher gives us work…it can be boring...But with Italian and music it’s really fun. And you remember heaps of words” (SP-Emma, September, 2009).

These findings support the value of an interdisciplinary approach towards curriculum planning. *The Shape Paper for the National Curriculum* states: “Rather than being self-contained, disciplines are interconnected, dynamic and growing allowing for cross disciplinary learning that broadens and enriches students learning” (ACARA, 2010, p. 17). The literature review revealed that music and language share many similarities such as pitch and rhythm and are composed of sequential events that unfold in time with a specific prosody. Evidence from this research suggested that using the Orff-Schulwerk approach benefited the students in linguistic capabilities as it engages both hemispheres of the brain, encouraging the brain to think as a network and rapidly switch from one hemisphere to another (Asher, 2000; 2001).

Movement allows information received to move rapidly between the two brain hemispheres. This ‘brain switching’ (Asher, 1993, cited in Lake, 2002) of information allows the students to experience and apply the language whilst acquiring it helping with memorisation as the left hemisphere learns the language while the right learns the actions. Evidence suggests that using the Orff-Schulwerk approach in the Language classroom is conducive to language learning as active movement and interaction allows students to make cross hemispherical connections therefore establishing cross hemisphere neurological pathways.
Teachers stated that whilst drills were considered ‘old fashioned’ they were effective in learning. The Orff-Schulwerk approach provided a contemporary way to drill by providing teachers and students with activities that were rhythm based, new and fun. “I’m as old as the dinosaurs and we chanted our times table and they actually sounded a bit like chant you know. So I mean if you want to accompany times table with beating you can I suppose. I can only speak on what I’ve done in LOTE, Italian” (TP-Beatrice, September, 2009).

3.3 What do Italian language teachers in Western Australian primary schools consider to be the essential knowledge or support structures needed for the Orff-Schulwerk approach to be an effective pedagogical tool in their upper primary classrooms?

This research allowed teachers to see the scope of music/song use in second language learning and provided them with the intrinsic motivation to review their pedagogy. Teachers reported that they felt isolated and required external support structures such as professional development, networking opportunities and resources to motivate them and help them to increase their knowledge. During the exit interviews the six teachers indicated that at times they did not feel included in the school community. They felt more like an imposition rather than a valued staff member. Discussions indicated that part of the essential knowledge and support required input from professional associations and educational sectors to provide learning opportunities to inform the primary principals and parents about the importance of Italian as Australia’s second language. In addition principals, teachers and parent-school forums need to be made aware of the importance of research in teaching and learning. However, both teacher participants, as well as the researcher were confronted by a perceived resistance to research in WA primary schools.

Teachers believed a number of support structures were needed if Orff-Schulwerk was to be used to teach Italian effectively and with confidence in WA primary schools by non-music specialist Italian teachers. The following three requirements were identified:

1. **Increased professional learning opportunities** (both at an informal modelling, mentoring and networking level). “Have a unit...maybe five units of work...and someone like you run it and show us how you would do it.” (TP-Donatella, September, 2009) “Then we come back and reported on it all.” (TP-Sabrina, September, 2009) “This is what I’ve done, what else can I learn? What else can
I do? I don’t think it’s healthy to do it in isolation” (TP-Virginia, September, 2009), “I would like to be part of a workshop or course. I’d like to be a student and be taken through ten weeks of the Orff-Schulwerk approach” (TP-Beatrice, September, 2009) and at a formal level where professional associations and tertiary institutions provide formal workshops and courses leading to further accreditation, “…the WAATI Conference is next year and they are looking for presenters…maybe a workshop next year… (TP-Donatella, September, 2009), “As a philosophy at uni level where …can adopt this without any hiccups” (TP-Amelia, September, 2009).

2. Increased resources. “Something like a resource book we could all refer to” (TP-Amelia, September, 2009). And

3. A supportive school structure involving principals, colleagues and parents. “I need a classroom” (TP-Laura, September, 2009).

Implications of the Data on the Current Australian Situation

Currently in Australia (and especially WA), specialist primary teachers of Second Languages (such as Italian) and the Arts (including Music) are in a position of constant marginalisation and being isolated from their colleagues due to contemporary policy development (APPA, 2007; ACARA, 2008; Stone, 2006). The value of the above learning areas are perceived as having little worth when compared to the economic-linked priorities of Literacy and Numeracy (ACARA, 2010; 2008; APPA, 2007; MCEETYA, 2008). Curriculum therefore mirrors the presenting values of society and hegemonic interests (Down, 1993). Primary schools, together with their communities mirror the organisation of their surroundings and therefore the political realities and agenda of power, such as the Commonwealth Government [Rudd, 2007-2010; Gillard, 2010- present]. Stone (2006) says that Federal and State education policy makers have shifted away from the specialist teacher in preference of generalist teachers, resources and learning experiences. Therefore, according to Stone (2006) there are three thematic layers which interplay including:

- National and State agendas;
- Primary school settings; and
- Individual perspectives.
When directly questioned on the ABC’s Q and A programme about the decline of citizenship, Arts and other enrichment programmes in schools to accommodate NAPLAN, Prime Minister Gillard replied:

…you can’t focus on learning if you can’t read and can’t count and you can’t do maths. …to end up a great creative artist you need those foundations skills in the same way you need them to end up a doctor, plumber or shop assistant. …In modern Australia people need to know how to read, write and do maths and that’s what NAPLAN is all about. (Gillard quoted in McEvoy, 2012)

National and State agendas

Languages and Music in education provide a rich contextual and global view into Australian life (ACARA, 2010). However, this research has highlighted the marginalisation of The Arts and Languages across primary schools in WA and the low demand of primary specialist teacher courses at the five tertiary institutions in WA (See Appendix C). Whilst the Classroom First Strategy (2007) claims that effective schools have the interests of their students at heart, the reality is that schools are marginalising not only their curriculum, but by extension the neurological potential of their students (Ball, 2010; Danesi, 1987; Doidge, 2010a, 2010b; Hodges, 2000; Jentsche et al, 2006; Keolsch, et al, 2002; Merzenich, 2009a; 2009b; Patel, 2003a; 2003b; 2008; Peretz & Coltheart, 2003; Roehmann, 1991; Sacks, 2007; Schwartz & Begley, 2003; Willis, 2008; Zatorre, 2000; 2005). According to Gardner (1993; 1999) and Eisner (2002a; 2002b), this is happening because schools’ are focused on accountability, due to pressure from State and Federal policies being shaped by managerial priorities, or new perceptions of trade advantages with new economies. The current shape of the Australian Curriculum appears to reflect hegemonic interests’ not neurological and pedagogic ones.

The educational focus on standardised assessments such as NAPLAN (ACARA, 2008) is what drives current curriculum policy. This political process has led to the APPA (2007) defining the four core essential learning areas for all Australian students as English, Mathematics, Science and History. Participating teachers in this research stated that they had classes cancelled in the previous scholastic term due to NALPAN (ACARA, 2008) testing. These missed classes were not rescheduled. The potential failing of a soon to be introduced National Curriculum, is one that has still not mandated Languages across all states and territories in Australia and recommends nominal time allocations for the Arts and Languages. This delay adds further confusion and inconsistency to the educational rhetoric (ACARA, 2011a; 2011c). Nominal time
allocation together with non-mandatory Languages Education will succeed in further marginalisation of student potential as discussed by Ball (2010) and many others.

**ACARA’S Asia Focus**

The Federal Government Australian Curriculum focus on Asian languages (ACARA, 2008, Rudd, 2007, Gillard, 2012) at one level extends Australia’s multicultural identity into a neighbouring geo-political region, rich in history and cultural diversity. Unfortunately it will do so by diminishing Australia’s curricula capacity to fully engage other important learning area considerations already marginalised by a lack of resources, time and specialist teachers. The ongoing competition within the Australian curriculum quantum creates marginalisation in access to established European Languages, associated historical themes linked with European and broader Western heritage narratives. In addition, this competition also slows down important reconciliation initiatives promoting ancient indigenous narratives, as well, as access to meaningful aesthetic experiences from the Arts.

The Federal Government [Rudd, 2007-2010; Gillard, 2010-present], the Federal Opposition [Abbott, 2009-present] and by extension ACARA states that China is one of Australia’s largest trading partner, and therefore the shift is justified (“Abbott promises,” 2012). Former Prime Minister Paul Keating is another promoting Australia’s commitment to China and the importance of establishing strong links with the new Asian-centred world economy (Hawke, 20011b). Therefore, some of the curriculum ‘trade-offs’ linked to this research project appear to be directly linked to growing significant economic benefits directly associated with China and Asia. However, understanding Western cultural and historical settings continues to be fundamental to understanding globalisation. ACARA is faced with a dilemma of an ongoing issue of curriculum weightings within a post-colonial and post-modern Australia traditionally linked to Anglo and American traditions in epistemology, history, science and technology, the arts, economic and political relationships. Essential considerations include connections to Romance languages such as Italian.

However, given Australia’s position in the Asia Pacific region, it was decided by ACARA that the four major Asian languages of Chinese (Mandarin), Japanese, Indonesian and Korean (recently replaced by Hindi) would be promoted in schools, a decision which adds further pressure to an already crowded curriculum. However there are further demands upon the curriculum quantum if policy is to become reality. If Mandarin is to become the second language of choice, such an initiative will require an extra 2000 hours over a European language in order to attain beginning level fluency.
(Lo Bianco, cited in “Languages boost,” 2011; Lo Bianco, 2011). Such an initiative assumes a capacity to train specialist languages teachers across the nation, or import specialist English speaking teachers with appropriate qualifications from China. If meaningful budgets were to support the rhetoric of policy then hypothetically the Federal Government policy could be seen as accommodating:

- A reduced access to Italian, the second language of Australian since the 1950’s;
- A political challenge to prominent Italo-Australian identities, as well established leadership across the Australian political divide;
- A perceived marginalisation of the role of Italian culture in the high Arts such as opera, visual arts, fashion and design, as well as its cuisine and essential history in the framing of Western culture and contemporary Australian culture linked to classical Roman-British traditions.

From a WA educational perspective, shifting the time allocation in schools by 2000 hours would further marginalise the cognitive, linguistic, aesthetic and emotional domains of students, as resources would be redirected away from the 215 primary Italian teachers in WA. There are approximately 225,000 primary students in WA (DETWA, 2008). Of these one in every 43 students (2%) are studying Italian as a second language. This suggests that the marginalisation of WA’s second language is well established given that 4% of WA’s population claims Italian ancestry (Australian Bureau of Statistics, 2007).

Given the low level of pre-service teacher education in Languages within the five WA universities, it is reasonable to ask how the resourcing of Mandarin together with Hindi, Japanese and Indonesian as second languages would be initiated from a public perspective, let alone competing languages from other interest groups (“Languages blow,” 2012). The following six questions need to be addressed.

1. Are State and Federal Governments going to finance the extra 2000 hours required to support any meaningful learning and teaching of Mandarin?
2. Will the need for extensive resourcing of Mandarin and the other three priority Asian languages be at the cost of other second language and/or arts funding in primary schools across Australia?
3. In WA, which pre-service tertiary institutions are going to modify their pre-service teacher training courses to accommodate the extensive number of WA Mandarin/English and Hindi/English teachers for K-12 Language programs?
4. What will the political cost be in order to deny the established languages of Italian as Australia’s first European language, Cantonese, Greek and the emergence of Arabic?

5. Will all levels of government maintain and resource Indigenous languages of, which there are 99 surviving in WA?

6. What will happen to our National Curriculum funding weighting when the Indian economic and political relationship matures to the same level as China’s?

**Primary school setting**

At the time of writing (2012), primary schools in WA are suffering from problematic curriculum requirements, an over-crowded curriculum, uncertainty about an incumbent Australian Curriculum and lack of clarity about what they are expected to achieve.

*Italian tends to be a sideline attraction. If it was any other learning area there wouldn’t have been resistance. We [Italian teachers] are incorporating over and above teaching strategies that would normally be expected...it puts us, as teachers, in a different light because it shows that we are academic. This is part of promoting us as Italian teachers too. (TP-Amelia, September, 2009)*

In this research the school setting provided further evidence of marginalisation. Participating Italian teachers commented that they would like greater support from their:

- Principals;
- Colleagues; and
- Parents.

In addition to being provided with:

- A classroom;
- Appropriate preparation time;
- ‘Just’ timetabling (not always being allocated the lesson at the end of the day);
- Recognition as a valued staff member;
- Access to relevant second language professional learning opportunities; and
- An adequate budget allocation to facilitate quality language learning activities.
Old prejudices

*The Draft Charter on Primary Schooling* (APPA, 2007) reminds the researcher of the racist historical sentiments, which still hinder the teaching and learning of Languages in Australia. Not only does it ignore neurological evidence that Music and Languages are vital in enabling the brain to work as a network (Doidge, 2010a; 2010b; Merzenich, 2009a; 2009b; Patel, 2003a; 2003b; 2008; Peretz & Coltheart, 2003; Schwartz & Begley, 2003; Willis, 2008), however it denies Australia’s Greco-Roman heritage (Morris, 1973; Kinder, 2008).

The research disclosed that primary teachers of Italian felt they constantly had to prove themselves to the wider school community and justify why Italian was included in the curriculum. There seems to be a perception of an anti-Italian sentiment still connected to the ‘old prejudice’ that the ‘contadini’ and ‘kanakas’ faced on the cane fields in Queensland. Perhaps the ongoing need to justify Italian in WA schools is a reminder of the years of the ‘White Australia’ policy where the importance of Italian culture was dismissed, as exemplified in the success in popular culture of the song “Shuddup you face” (Dolce, 1980).

**Principal perspectives.**

*Anything that you do gathers attention from the Principal...to make sure everything is above board. If it was any other learning area, there wouldn’t have been resistance but it seems that Italian, unfortunately, attracts that. It’s a culture, that’s evident and we are not going about to unlearn people...these are some of the conflicts...it doesn’t get the focus.* (TP-Amelia, September, 2009)

The research findings are consistent with the *Attitudes towards the study of Languages in Australian schools* (McConchie Pty Ltd, 2007), which found that principals considered there to be insufficient time in the timetable for Languages, and that Languages teachers were deemed to be ‘separate to staff’. The 2007 study found that the wider school community believes that the learning of Languages reaps little reward when compared to the learning areas of English and Mathematics. This attitude is consistent with the sentiments expressed by primary teachers of Italian during this research.

During the research process, principals’ attitudes were perceived to be one of the greatest obstacles to promoting the Arts and Languages. Many principals demonstrated reluctance to accommodate research in their schools in the areas of Music and/or Italian. The low response rate by principals provides some evidence towards reinforcing the APPA sentiments that Languages and Arts are not considered important. In addition, it
must be noted that principals often have higher degrees and an interest in research. Whilst, in the context of this research, principal perceptions appear to be a limitation, it is acknowledged they too are part of a greater complexity. The ‘life-world’ of a principal involves complex demands and associated stress. Issues including budgets, staffing, accountability, and management are just a few items on their managerial agenda. These pressures can lead to feelings of negative resistance towards research requests. Perhaps, the APPA and the National Professional Standards for Principals (AITSL, 2011b) can assist principals in shifting the position of research as a priority in primary schools.

Parental prejudices and student attitudes

During the research some parents withdrew their child from Italian lessons for the duration of the research and this caused some irritation amongst teachers and principals. Participating Italian teachers were required to accommodate these students by preparing an alternate programme of work, which was to be completed in another classroom, adding to an already large workload. The teachers also found it difficult to find a cooperative teacher to accommodate the withdrawn students, as other staff members saw research as a disruption to their classroom programmes. Principals also displayed irritation at the situation, as the teachers implied that research was disrupting the smooth running of the school. The perception that principals were not advocates for the research was further strengthened as they accommodated parents’ wishes to remove their child, rather than supporting their Italian teacher and the quest for new pedagogical knowledge.

All this has helped me to see my situation in the school...some of the parents didn’t want their kids to be part of the research at all. I learnt quite a lot about what the parents think and the situation of LOTE [Languages Other Than English] teacher in the school. (TP-Laura, September, 2009)

Often student attitudes arise from attitudes passed onto them by their parents, with one of these being a preference for ‘academic’ subjects (Gordon, 2001). Parents’ failure to return consent forms highlights the little value placed on the research of Music and Languages in the wider school community. Teachers took it upon themselves to phone the 17% of parents who had not returned their consent forms to confirm whether their child was able to participate in the research. Teachers stated that parents did not object to their child participating in the research, they just didn’t think it was important. Again, these findings are consistent with McConchie Pty Ltd (2007) in which 66% of parents
did not see the relevance of learning Languages and unimportant when compared to English or Mathematics.

**The Curriculum Mirrors Society Values**

It would appear that successive State and Federal Government agendas linked to economic rationalisation has led to funding cuts for Music and other Arts programmes (Chamber of Arts & Culture, WA, 2011, “Academy needs cash,” 2012). Teacher training at tertiary institutions, Arts subjects beginning to be omitted from the school curriculum (Eisner, 1991; 2002b; 2004; Lummis, 1986) and non-specialists primary school teachers being expected to teach Music with little support (Russell-Bowie, 1993; 2002; Stone, 2006) adds to the marginalisation. As the five Arts subjects have been integrated, they have become an optional sub-part of the curriculum each is viewed as one-fifth learning area. Given that there are eight learning areas in WA, therefore each Arts area is by default offered one-fortieth of timetabling allocation in WA. This has resulted in the Arts being marginalised throughout the primary school experience.

The research discovered that teachers involved have little confidence in their own musical skills and this hinders their effective use of it as a pedagogical tool. This is not surprising, as non-specialist primary teachers are often not expected to teach music and they are not trained to do it. The result is poor use of music/song as a pedagogical tool and in music/song becoming ‘handmaiden’ (Eisner, 2002) to Italian. This research highlights that participating teachers used music/song as a facilitation tool rather than as an experience connecting two disciplines. Connection of the two disciplines allows for the transference of knowledge, which can be applied to both and to other situations as was presented in the researcher’s personal reflections.

The outcomes from this research are consistent with those of the Australia Council for the Arts (2010). The attitude towards the Arts and Languages among the Australian population is like this only because of the wider populations school experiences. The research identified that only three teachers (9%) played a musical instrument at some level of proficiency. The Australia Council for the Arts (2010) study claimed that only 15% of the Australian population play a musical instrument. Two teachers (6%) indicated that they did not enjoy music and did not participate in any musical activity, therefore supporting the findings of the Australia Council for the Arts (2010) study that identified 7% of the population did not enjoy music. Given that participating teachers have low participation rate in music, how can they be expected to teach or use it effectively in their classrooms? School systems need to provide effective
and consistent professional learning opportunities for their teachers and universities should provide appropriate pre-service training (AITSL, 2011a; 2011b; 2012a; 2012b; 2012c). Munday and Smith (2010) believe that a paradigm shift is required, one that values music learning needs. It this does not occur more of the limited Music learning experiences will be replaced by additional literacy and numeracy programmes.

**Languages in Australia**

Crystal (2008a) believes that there is a popular assumption that foreigners have a gift for learning languages. This is ignorance for many, based on the assumption that ‘the world is English speaking’- so why bother learning a second language? This is confirmed as in 2007, Australian students between the ages of nine and eleven spent 1% of school instructional time on Languages (Absalom, 2008). However, the Australian National Curriculum (ACARA, 2010) espouses it is preparing students towards becoming citizens of a global community. Absalom (2008) challenges this.

> Whatever this ‘compulsory curriculum’ may be, it seems clear that it is causing the crowding of the primary curriculum...Performance in Languages in (upper) primary school is appalling but more significantly, the core curriculum in primary school is overshadowed by other activities. (Absalom, 2008, p. 4)

Effective Languages and Music programmes promote two important areas:

1. Values of respect, identity and acceptance; and
2. Neurological and cognitive development through the release of neuro-chemicals, which respond to novelty, engagement and stimulation, which improves memory and recall.

In summary, it would appear that Australia’s education policies in the above areas are driven by economic ideology rather than neurological research into learning. The Federal Australian Government, ACARA and the APPA all have problems appreciating that Greco-Romano history is the cornerstone of Western global culture.

**The European Situation**

Research identified claims that musical activities develop reading and neuroanatomical abilities, verbal learning and retention, while promoting language ability, creativity, as well as developing supportive learning environments (Asher, 1984; 2001; Benbridge, 2010; Doidge, 2010a; Eisner, 2002b; Merzenich, 2009a; Willis, 2008). Research findings have encouraged many Eurozone and EU countries to incorporate Music into their national curriculum from pre-school to post-secondary
education. The *Arts and cultural education at school in Europe document* (EACEA, 2009) states the main aims of Arts Education in Europe is to enhance the seven key areas including:

1. Artistic skill;
2. Knowledge;
3. Understanding;
4. Appreciation;
5. Cultural heritage and diversity;
6. Individual expression and identity; and,
7. Creativity.

Time allocation for Arts Education across all European schools ranges from 50-100 hours per year at primary school level and Music is compulsory in primary schools. This contrasts with the Australian situation where Music is one-fifth of the Arts curriculum and students receive approximately 100 hours across the band of two years (ACARA, 2010). In Australia, whether Music is taught in schools depends upon principal’s discretion and preferred staffing allocations. Therefore, given the attitudes of Australians, it can be assumed that music will probably not be taught in many schools. Based on the structure of current pre-service courses, where Music is taught it will most likely be by a non-Music specialist. In Europe, the Arts curriculum is delivered by generalist teachers, however, during their pre-service training teachers receive training in Arts pedagogy in at least two Arts subjects (EACEA, 2009).

The Arts curriculum varies across the Eurozone and EU with some teaching each Arts subject individually while the other counties have them integrated. Those countries with an integrated Arts curriculum are: Portugal, Spain, Italy, Greece, Hungary, The Czech Republic, Latvia, Lithuania, Denmark, Netherlands, Belgium, Luxemburg, Ireland, Northern Ireland and Scotland. Countries which teach the Arts subjects individually are; France, Iceland, England, Wales, Norway, Sweden, Finland, Estonia, Poland, Romania, Slovakia, Bulgaria, Germany, Austria, Slovenia and Cyprus. The Education, Audio-visual and Cultural Executive Agency (EACEA, 2008/09) states, that in Italy, there is an integrated Arts approach, consisting of Music, Art and Image. However, music is a compulsory component. One third of all EU countries establish cross-curricular links between the Arts and other learning areas either through educational objectives or subject specific links.
Languages education data across the Eurozone and EU (2008) indicates that 79% of students were studying a second language (EACEA, 2008). Across the Eurozone, all students learn a second language from either Pre-Primary or Year One through to the conclusion of their compulsory education. Upon conclusion of their compulsory education, students would have studied two foreign languages, such as English, French or German. In Italy, English and Italian are compulsory (EACEA, 2008/09). The Australian situation is vastly different, as a formal national Languages education policy does not exist. Currently, the study of Languages is mandated in Queensland, Victoria, Australian Capital Territory and South Australia. In Western Australia, New South Wales, Tasmania and the Northern Territory the study of Languages remains an elective (“A nation lost”, 2011). Whilst the Australian Curriculum specifies the teaching of Languages across Australia it cannot reinforce it until an agreed national Languages policy is written.

*The Melbourne Declaration* “promotes a world-class curriculum and assessment” (MCEETYA, 2008, p. 14). The declaration says:

Australia has developed a high-quality, world-class schooling system, which performs strongly against other countries of the Organisation for Economic Cooperation and Development (OECD). In international benchmarking of educational outcomes for 15 years olds in the 2006 ‘OECD Programme for International Student Assessment’, Australia ranked among the top 10 countries across all three educational domains assessed [Reading, Science and Mathematics]. Over the next decade Australia should aspire to improve outcomes for all young Australians to become second to none amongst the world’s best school systems. (MCEETYA, 2008, p. 5)

Whilst these results underscored by *OECD: PISA* 2009 (Thomson, De Bortoli, Nicholas, Hillman & Buckley, 2009) are to be commended, they do not comment on the remaining four learning areas of the curriculum. The above also presents contextual evidence that the Australian curriculum is lacking balance, especially in respect to the areas of Arts and Languages being considerably behind European countries. It seems improbable that Australia could achieve a world-class schooling system whilst it is impoverishing the internationally acclaimed notion of Multiple Intelligences spectra (Gardner, 1993; 1999). Unlike the Eurozone and EU, Australia must develop a more informed understanding about cognitive research in music as a neural-network enhancer (Asher, 2001; Ball, 2010; Hodges, 2000; Keolsch, et al, 2002; Patel, 2003a; 2003b; 2008; Roehmann, 1991; Sacks, 2007; Schwartz & Begley, 2003; Zatorre, 2000; 2005).
The Interconnectedness of Language and Music

The literature review in Chapter II presented historical evidence of music’s interconnectedness with societies, how music probably preceded speech as a communication process. It also underscored the evolutionary role language and music has played in the development of human cognition.

The ancient Greeks considered music to be a gymnasium for the mind and central in obtaining a well-rounded education. The learning of Music and Languages encourages the brain to work as a complementary unit rather than as two antagonistic hemispheres. Current research in neuroplasticity (Doidge, 2010a; 2010b; Merzenich, 2009a; 2009b) suggests that practicing a new skill under the right conditions, including a positive environment and provision of novelty, can change the billions of brain connections, therefore changing our brain maps and learning pathways.

This research suggests the benefits of an interdisciplinary curriculum in assisting learners to make connections and establish brain pathways that are most effective for their learning. It will enable learners to change existing brain maps to enhance their learning. A curriculum cannot be interdisciplinary without discipline specific expertise in which teachers must be highly skilled. This means that teachers must have an area of specialisation (Toulmin, 1958). In the context of the research the researcher was only able to implement and achieve an interdisciplinary curriculum effectively and confidently in her classroom because she is highly skilled in both disciplines of Music and Italian.

Data gathered in Action Cycle Three provided teacher and student evidence supporting the neurological research and the benefits of an interdisciplinary curriculum. The use of the Orff-Schulwerk approach when teaching Italian to upper primary students successfully:

- Engaged and actively involved students through provision of engaging, stimulation and novel activities, which activated students hearing, and coordination.
- Increased students’ language ability as the repetitive activities allowed students to remember speech sounds and vocabulary.
- Provided reinforcement and scaffolding as activities allowed memory patterns and cognitive cues to be created by the learner.
- Increased linguistic understanding as the activities activated the student’s working memory and higher-level thinking.
- Reduced behavioural issues as concentration on novel tasks increased student engagement therefore reducing behavioural issues.
SECTION TWO: IMPLICATIONS OF THE FINDINGS AND THE AUSTRALIAN CURRICULUM

With respect to the Arts in education: “Western education displays intellectual prejudice…” (Lummis, 1986, p. 8; & Lummis, 2001). Attitudes and past prejudices towards the Arts and Languages continue and these are continually reflected in public opinion and government policy (ACARA, 2010; 2011a; 2011c; McGaw, 1984).

This intellectual prejudice, drastically affects the education children receive, influencing curriculum composition, research funding, and education services and resourcing (Lummis, 1986). The creation of the first graded school in the mid-nineteenth century established assumptions of how the curriculum should be organised (Eisner, 2004). It began a history of prescribed student achievement levels to be attained to enable smooth transitions to occur from one year to another and the current system of mass education is dominated by a preoccupation with standardisation as still demonstrated by (ACARA, 2008), rather than one which invests in the cultivation of variance (Eisner, 2004; Gardner, 1993; 1999).

Through the Curriculum Framework (CCWA, 1998) and now the Australian Curriculum (ACARA, 2008) schools provide learning areas that direct or impose onto students the ‘preferred knowledge’ that is deemed as most valued by society (Eisner, 2004). For example, in WA 28 years ago the McGaw Report (1984) recommended the removal of the Visual Arts from the list of tertiary entrance subjects offered to Year 12 students, because it was deemed not to promote the ‘logical validity’ found in mathematics and the sciences. Chinese, Indonesian and Japanese were not favoured during this period. However, the McGaw Report (1984) recommended that Italian and Music be retained, demonstrating that Music was then a preferred Arts discipline and that European languages were in favour over Asian languages. The Beazley Report (1984) recommended an integrated approach to curriculum design in primary schools, but favoured resource distribution to Mathematics and/or Science rather than Arts areas. It was a period when WA primary school had established arts specialist teachers in Music and Visual Arts (Beazley, 1984; McGaw, 1984).

In 2012, educational administrators (APPA, 2007) and stakeholders (ACARA, 2009; 2010; 2011a; 2011c; MCEETYA, 2008) demonstrate anxieties about school and student performance, as they are aware that poor performance reflects unfavourably on them. These anxieties lead to remedies that reinforce compliance to content, assessment
and outcomes. It is believed that only by establishing uniformity can valid comparisons between schools, states and students be made. It is also believed that deviation from this uniformity compromises the ability to make meaningful educational comparisons (Eisner, 2004). This leads to teachers losing faith in their competence for innovative practice as they feel that they have become a ‘handmaiden’ to a curriculum of tests, outcomes and policy (Eisner, 2004).

At the point of writing, the educational climate in WA is again frustrated by time constraints, curriculum pressures and a crowded curriculum (APPA, 2007). Pragmatism sees a need for primary teachers to become competent professional ‘interdisciplinarians’ if they are to accommodate all learning areas, allowing students to develop deep understandings and to make cross-curricular connections (Eisner, 1991; 2002a; 2002b; 2004; Ellis and Fouts, 1991; Gardner, 1993; 1999; Toulmin, 1972). This level of interdisciplinary competency across eight learning areas in the primary sector would seem ambitious in respect to the findings from this research.

This research intended to inform the practice of Italian language teachers in WA primary schools by demonstrating how music/song can be an effective pedagogical tool and to establish evidence to support the benefits which music has on second language learning and cognitive capacity. However, the research findings underscored that educational stakeholders including: government, ACARA, principals APPA, colleagues and parents also need to be continually professionally informed.

**Educational policy and stakeholders**

With commitment and hard work—from children and young people, their parents, carers and families, from schools, teachers, communities, business and all Australian governments—all young Australians will be provided with the opportunity to reach their full potential. (MCEETYA, 2008, p. 19)


However, here lies the irony of school improvement policies. Whilst on one hand it promotes diversity of intelligences and the diverse forms in which learning can be displayed, it also promotes a policy of converging outcomes and efficiency. This
contradiction in policy complicates schools, classrooms, embeds assumptions about how schools should operate and confuses teachers (Eisner, 2004). This is evident in *The Melbourne Declaration* (MCEETYA, 2008) and *the National Curriculum* (ACARA, 2010). Below, *the Melbourne Declaration* (MCEETYA, 2008), *The Shape of National Curriculum Paper V2.0* (ACARA, 2010), *The Draft Shape Paper: Languages* (ACARA, 2010a) and *Shape of the Australian Curriculum: The Arts* (ACARA, 2011c) will be examined. Highlighted will be the strengths and weaknesses of each document in their abilities towards “improving educational outcomes for all young Australians…” (MCEETYA, 2008, p. 7).

*The Melbourne Declaration*

“Together, all Australian Governments commit to working with all school sectors and the broader community to achieve the educational goals for young Australians” (MCEETYA, 2008, p. 10). This quote introduces *The Melbourne Declaration’s ‘Commitment to Action’* (MCEETYA, 2008, p. 10). Following a selection of these educational goals are presented and discussed in relation to the research.

“Australian Governments commit to working with all school sectors to ensure that schools engage young Australians, parents, carers, families, other educational and training providers, business and the broader community to support students’ progress through schooling, and to provide them with rich learning, personal development and citizenship opportunities.” (MCEETYA, 2008, p. 11)

The researcher questions how this can occur when this research has highlighted barriers to research and a marginalisation of the Arts and Languages in the current curriculum. Multiple Intelligences (Gardner, 1993) are essential to “provide them [students] with rich learning, personal development” (MCEETYA, 2008, p. 11). How can *the Melbourne Declaration* support the use of multiple intelligences (Gardner, 1983) in Australia’s National Curriculum when it is promoting ‘standardisation rather than variance’? (Eisner, 2004)

“Australian Governments commit to working with all school sectors to attract, develop, support and retain a high-quality teaching and school leadership workforce in Australian schools.” (MCEETYA, 2008, p. 12)

This research data has provided some evidence that currently pre-service teacher training in Languages and Arts (Music) in WA is poor. It has highlighted that in the areas of Languages and Music there is inadequate funding, resourcing and teachers feel undervalued by stakeholders within their community.

“Australian Governments commit to supporting the development and strengthening of early childhood education, to provide every child with the opportunity for the best start in life.” (MCEETYA, 2008, p. 12)
The researcher questions how this can occur when Languages are not mandatory in WA. The Australian Curriculum (ACARA, 2010) states that Languages and Arts subject taught in schools are at the discretion of the principal and dependent upon the availability of Arts and Languages specialists. If a principal is not an advocate of the Arts and/or Languages, what happens to these learning areas? Do they form part of what Eisner (2002a) describes as the null curriculum, sending a clear message to students that those learning areas are not considered important and can be omitted from the timetable? Or do principals by default, continue the existing intellectual prejudice and marginalisation of the polysensory subjects (Lummis, 1986; Lummis; 2001). ACARA (2011a) and AITSL (2011b) must hold principals accountable for teacher access to professional learning opportunities and ensure that their professional learning needs are treated with respect, justice and equally (Down, 2006a).

“Australian Governments commit to working with all school sectors to ensure that schools provide programmes that are responsive to students’ developmental and learning needs in the middle years, and which are challenging, engaging and rewarding”. (MCEETYA, 2008, p. 13)

Based on the research findings presented, the researcher poses the following questions. How can this occur with?

- The marginalisation of the Arts and Languages in the curriculum?
- Principal’s ‘perceived fatigue’ as opposition to research?
- The selection of ‘specialist’ programmes to be trusted upon principal discretion with limited appreciation of current research into areas such as neuroscience?
- The Government’s pre-occupation with standardisation, student achievements and outcomes? Or.
- A crowded timetable and curriculum, which does not provide time for teachers and students to develop and make full use of innovative interdisciplinary learning experiences that challenge, engage, reward and build young brains? (Doige, 2010a; 2010b; Schwartz & Begley, 2003)

“Australian Governments commit to working together with all school sectors to ensure world-class curriculum and assessment for Australia at national and local levels”. (MCEETYA, 2008, p. 15)

The researcher questions what happened to “…schools provide programmes that are responsive to students’ developmental and learning needs in the middle years, and which are challenging, engaging and rewarding” (MCEETYA, 2008, p. 13). This discrepancy demonstrates the concept of multiple intelligences (Gardner, 1983), and
neuroplasticity (Doige, 2010a; 2010b; Schwartz & Begley, 2003) is either not supported or fully appreciated by the Australian Curriculum (ACARA, 2010). The aspiration to have a world-class curriculum based on achievement and outcomes is marginalising two learning areas fundamental to personal, cognitive and linguistic development. A possible consideration for ACARA would be to reinstate specialist teachers in primary schools by providing the opportunity for generalist pre-service teachers to lead in a specialised area of curricula interest.

“Australian Governments’ commit to working with all school sectors to:

- ‘Close the gap’ for young Indigenous Australians.
- Provide targeted support to disadvantages students.
- Focus on school improvement in low socioeconomic communities.” (MCEETYA, 2008, p. 16)

With 147 Indigenous languages across Australia and the Torres Strait Islands, 99 of which are in WA alone and 110 critically endangered, (Fryer-Smith, 2000; “WA support,” 2011) the researcher questions how this commitment will this be met, resourced and where will the funding come from given that added time, resourcing and funding will be required to implement Mandarin.

“Australian Governments commit to working with all school sectors to ensure that public reporting:

- Focuses on improving performance and students outcomes.
- Is both locally and nationally relevant.
- Is timely, consistent and comparable.” (MCEETYA, 2008, p. 18)

This sends a clear message that educational focus is on standardised assessment, such as NAPLAN (ACARA, 2008) and reporting as this is what is valued in the globalised world of today that strives for excellence (MCEETYA, 2008). Globalisation, it appears, has little regard for the student, their needs, their learning styles and the work of Eisner (2002a; 2002b; 2004) and Gardner (1993).

The above statement also highlights the rise of political expectation placed upon Australian’s educational sector and the lack of information provided on how these expectations will be achieved and resourced. This is why teachers become frustrated at policy and curriculum, which appears to have double standards and a lack of clarity on how these standards can be achieved. The researcher questions whether the APPA has a more pragmatic approach in their justification for promoting only four core subjects. Perhaps, the APPA has realised the limitations of the resourcing available together with
the tremendous increase in expectations place upon all educational stakeholders and consider it easier to focus efforts on the ‘important subjects’ (APPA, 2007; Hall, 2012).

The Australian Curriculum

The incumbent Australian curriculum is the result of: “…narrowly conceived efforts of governments to control teachers’ work through teacher-proof curricula test driven threats and punitive forms of accountability…” (Down, 2006b, p. 89-90).

Shape of Australian Curriculum Paper v 2.0 (2010)

Twenty-first century learning does not fit neatly into a curriculum solely organised by learning areas or subjects that reflects the disciplines. Increasingly...students need to develop a set of skills, behaviours and dispositions, or general capabilities that apply across subject based content and equip them to be lifelong learners able to operate with confidence in a complex, information-rich, globalised world. (ACARA, 2010, p. 18)

This document states, “education plays a critical role in shaping the lives of the nation’s future citizens” (ACARA, 2010, p. 5) and that the “intellectual, social, personal, and education needs of each student must be addressed” (ACARA, 2010, p. 5). It comments that successful learners play an active role in their learning by planning activities, collaborating, working in teams and communicating ideas, draw upon a range of learning areas and disciplines to reach their potential.

These points appear to be positive in developing knowledgeable future citizens of Australia. However, the researcher questions how they will be achieved when the Arts and Languages are being marginalised by cost cutting, time, ACARA, perceived principal attitudes, curriculum constraints, community prejudice, an Asia focus, the APPA, four core subjects and the constant setback of National Curriculum implementation which is now expected to being in 2013 (“Male teachers,” 2011). Tertiary institutions are no longer able to offer thorough units for the Arts due to staff downsizing. The restriction of the amount of Arts units in pre-service teacher education courses results in a watered down integration of all five Arts subjects (Music, Visual Art, Drama, Media and Dance) into one combined Arts unit.

The Australian Curriculum displays no acknowledgement of Australia’s Anglo-Celtic origins or the role other cultures, other than those of Indigenous Australians, which have contributed so much to what is called Australia. The Asia focus is pulling Australia’s curriculum further away from its English-Irish origins towards one which motivated purely on economics and trade (“A nation lost,” 2011).
The Australian Curriculum (ACARA, 2010, p. 19-20) general capabilities are represented across all learning areas, including:

- Literacy;
- Numeracy;
- Information and Communication Technology competence;
- Critical and creative thinking;
- Ethical behaviour;
- Personal and social competence, and
- Intercultural understanding.

Music and Languages contribute to these capabilities yet they continue to be marginalised. The literature review has provided evidence of how musical skills preceded linguistic ones (Darwin, 1876; Harvey, 2007; Levitin, 2008; Mithen, 2006) and how it enhanced and continues to enhance our linguistic capabilities (Besson and Schon, 2001; Brown, 1991; 2001; Fitch, 2005; Gandini, 2002; Gfeller, 1986; Mithen, 2006; Patel, 2003a; 2003b; 2008; Patel & Daniele, 2002). The literature together with the research data presents evidence on how Languages and the Arts enhances critical thinking, ethical behaviour, personal and social competence and intercultural understanding.

By allowing “school authorities make decisions of time allocations and resources” (ACARA, 2010, p. 9), ACARA is further marginalising the Arts and Languages in schools. In the research data, teachers stated that they had poor budget allocations, were under-resourced and felt that their timetable allocations were inadequate. Evidence provided has highlighted that principals do not value the Arts or Languages. By allowing principals to make these decisions could further add to this marginalisation.

The learning areas within the Australian Curriculum will contain clear expectations of what will be taught in each year of schooling from F-12. The Shape of National Curriculum Paper V 2.0 (2010) clearly states the weekly time allocation to be provided in the school timetable for the four core learning areas of English, Mathematics, Science and History. However, for the Arts and Languages this time allocation is stated as nominal and is represented across combined year bands. This requires principals to configure time required per year and accommodate this into the already crowded curriculum timetable. The researcher completed the process of configuring time allocation per year level and found it frustrating and time consuming. This may result in principals providing these two learning areas the remaining time in
the timetable after the four core subjects and Physical Education have been
accommodated. Allocation of time could also be dependent on principal subject biases.
“Schools will be best placed to determine how this will occur… allocation of time is a
school based decision” (ACARA, 2011c, p. 4). The literature presented and the research
data provides some justification that this may not occur in 75% of schools across WA.

The *Shape of National Curriculum Paper v 2.0 (2010)* allows schools to decide on
how best to deliver the curriculum. “School, teachers determine pedagogy and delivery”
(ACARA, 2010, p. 10); “Schools are able to draw on integrated approaches and use
pedagogical approaches that accounts for the needs and interests of the students, the
school and the community context” (ACARA, 2010, p. 11). The research has
highlighted the negative attitudes of principals, staff and parents towards the Arts
(Music) and Languages. By allowing schools to “determine pedagogy and delivery of
curriculum” (ACARA, 2010, p. 5) ACARA could further enhance the marginalisation
of these areas in WA schools.

Data has highlighted that whilst Languages teachers have the best intentions they
feel they constantly have to justify what they are doing and why they want to participate
in professional learning opportunities to their principals and other staff members. They
feel unsupported by their principals, colleagues and parents in accessing new
pedagogies which will enhance the learning capabilities of their students. The evidence
has also presented that teachers are limited by timetabling constraints and meeting
outcome standards. Therefore, whilst ACARA states “Teachers are able to choose how
best to introduce concepts and processes and how to deepen understanding and
maximise learning of every student” (ACARA, 2010, p. 17) these restrictions do not
allow teachers to do so.

By stating, “jurisdictions, systems and schools are able to implement the National
Curriculum in ways that value teacher’s professional knowledge, reflect local contexts
and consider family culture and community background” (ACARA, 2010, p. 10).
ACARA could be further marginalising the Arts (Music) and Languages as data has
shown that jurisdictions, systems and schools do not value teacher’s professional
knowledge. This research provided principals with the opportunity for their Italian
teachers which would allow them to increase their professional knowledge and assist
them in implementing the National Curriculum in the integrated manner in which it
promotes. Only 34 principals out of 255 allowed their teachers to participate. This later
became eight and finally became seven.
All students should experience well designed and supported Languages programmes, taught by well trained and supported languages teachers, in schools that actively support language teaching. (Lo Bianco, 2009, cited in ACARA, 2011a, p. 64)

The researcher questions whether this can occur with the constant marginalisation of the Arts and Languages.

**Draft Shape Paper: Languages (2011)**

The major rationale for learning Languages is to “provides learners with essential communication skills in the target language, an intercultural capability and an understanding of the role of language and culture in human communication” (ACARA, 2011a, p. 9).

The strength of this document lies in its acknowledgement that learning languages involves operating in at least two linguistic and cultural systems which connect in mutually-informing ways (ACARA, 2011a, p. 17). The act of learning two languages develops the reflective dimension to language learning, drawing student’s attention to how languages work. “Being in two worlds at once allows…a fuller understanding of the conditions shaping one’s identity, and the role of languages and culture in this process. This is a metalinguistic awareness which has benefits for all learners” (ACARA, 2011a, p. 12). This acknowledges neurological evidence which supports the benefits of learning two Languages from a young age (Doidge, 2010b). Another important strength of this document acknowledgement of key themes that need to be addressed to ensure a provision for Languages (ACARA, 2011a). These include:

1. Resource constraints.
2. Ensuring provision of qualified teachers of languages.
4. Providing appropriate time allocations into a crowded curriculum.
5. To collaborate on research.
6. Promote and reward language learning.

**Resource constraints**

ACARA (2011a) and Prime Minister Gillard (“Gillard’s Asia,” 2012) acknowledges that a problem exists with resourcing however provide no solution to help alleviate the problem. Teachers in the research stated problems with resourcing and meagre budgets, which, in one case, amounted to less than 5c per day per student. Whilst ACARA and Government push for an: ‘Asia Focus’ in Languages, they must acknowledge that the resourcing and funding for other Languages must be maintained.
(“Teacher blow,” 2012). What is going to happen to non-Asian languages in the interim? Already, Language academics have had to go ‘off-shore’ to secure funding to run their tertiary programmes, such as UWA and its affiliation with the Cassamarca Foundation.

Ensuring provision of qualified teachers of languages
The Attitudes towards the study of Languages in Australian Schools (McConchie Pty Ltd, 2007) stated that principals consider Languages teachers as “dragons” (p. 588). Principals have stated “difficulties accessing quality Languages teachers” have led them to “discontinuing the Language programme” at their school (DoE WA Principal, personal communication, 2011). Discontinuation is only able to occur as the teaching and learning of Languages in WA is not mandated. At the time of writing the University of Western Australia (UWA) and The University of Notre Dame are the only universities where Italian can be studied with opportunity to become a teacher. UWA is the only university which allows for a combination of Italian and Music studies. ACARA and the Government do not provide a solution to how this provision of qualified teachers of Languages will be met by State Governments via staffing and resourcing (“Labor cuts,” 2012; “Teacher blow”, 2012).

Quality teaching and learning materials
Teachers stated that the current Languages resources available are too difficult or too easy linguistically for second language learners, are costly to buy and difficult to access. The researcher questions how ACARA will provide quality teaching and learning resources to teachers.

Providing appropriate time allocations into a crowded curriculum
Varying perspectives exist on the place Languages should occupy in the curriculum. Teachers and principals have expressed concern over the crowded curriculum as constantly more is required to be accommodated in a normal school day. As one principal commented “What needs to give?” (DETWA principal, Personal communication, 2007). Languages [and the Arts] are not considered essential by the APPA and these are two of the areas which could “give”. Time is also constrained due to NAPLAN and system accountability requirements (ACARA, 2008). With the curriculums Asia focus, schools will have to find an additional 2000 hours as this is what is required to achieve a beginning level of proficiency in Mandarin (Lo Bianco, 2011). The National Curriculum allows for flexible provision in primary years where systems and schools best determine how to organise the indicative hours of study. This
poses a significant risk to primary school students and teachers in WA as Languages are not mandated (ACARA, 2011a). How is this extra time allocation going to be provided?

To collaborate on research
Throughout the research principals were perceived resistant to research by not wanting research to be conducted on their school site, not responded to letters and not passing on information to their Italian teachers. Parents removed students from intervention classes as they saw research as a threat and a possible invasion of privacy. Teachers commented that their colleagues did not support them during the research nor did they display any level of interest. The researcher believes a paradigm shift towards research must occur if collaboration on research is to happen.

Promote and reward language learning
ACARA (2011a, p. 4) states that for Languages programmes to work well they must receive:

- Valued recognition by the school and wider community.
- Appointment of qualified teachers.
- Ongoing professional development and learning support.
- Adequate curriculum and assessment guidance.
- Adequate resources.
- Support.
- Appropriate time allocation (consistent and regular).

These above points are highlighted by the teachers in the research evidence. However, the researcher questions the realities of these acknowledgements coming to fruition if the situation remains in its current state, as for many stakeholders in education “Languages have never been part of their personal or social experience and they may not see the relevance” (ACARAa, 2011, p. 3).

The Shape of the Australian Curriculum: Languages (2011)
In November, 2011 the final Shape of the Australian Curriculum: Languages (ACARA, 2011b) was released. The final document still states that “Languages are at the core of the National Curriculum” (ACARA, 2011b, p.3). The data and literature presented in this research clearly presents a case that this is not so. Whilst not significantly different from the draft document (ACARA, 2011a), the new document does acknowledge that:
• “…in spite of this ongoing policy discussion and research and development work, provision of Languages in schools in Australia…remains fragile” (ACARA, 2011b, p. 5).
• “Capability only in English is not sufficient and a bilingual or plurilingual capability is the norm in most parts of the world” (ACARA, Nov. 2011, p. 6).
• “Australian Curriculum…recognises Australia’s distant and dynamic migration history…These language communities are a valued part of Australia’s diverse economic, linguistic, social, cultural and religious landscape” (ACARA, 2011b, p. 8).
• “The study of classical languages provides learners with a key to the literature, history, thought and culture of the ancient world. A unique feature of the study of classical languages is the opportunity to engage closely with the cultures and societies that are removed in time and place from our own, and is a bridge between the contemporary world and ancient civilisations” (ACARA, 2011b, p. 10).

Importantly, the updated document acknowledges that Language learning is a cognitive process, which develops metacognitive and metalinguistic awareness. This is reinforced in this new document as time on task is clearly stated. From Years F-6 Languages should make up 5% of the total teaching time per year (350 hours). For Years seven and eight, Languages should make up 8% of the total teaching time per year (160 hours) (ACARA, 2011b). Whilst, allocated time remains indicative, 'a should' at the mercy of principal bias and discretion, it is to be commended that a definite percentage has been allocated.

*Shape of the Australian Curriculum: The Arts (2011)*

The Shape of the Australian Curriculum: The Arts (2011) states “An education rich in the Arts maximises opportunities for learners to engage with innovative thinkers and leaders … [such] an education is vital to students’ success as individuals and as members of society…” (ACARA, 2011c, p. 3). For Music, this means that students should be provided opportunities to compose, improvise, arrange, perform, conduct, respond and learn elements of duration (rhythm and tempo), dynamics, form, pitch (melody and harmony) and timbre (sound and texture). Opportunities to apply this knowledge to the voice, body, instruments (natural and manufactured) and to engage with multiple cultures, their traditions and practices (ACARA, 2011c) should also be provided. The research data has demonstrated that the Orff-Schulwerk approach is an
effective pedagogical tool for teaching Italian and it can also assist students in achieving Music outcomes.

In the Arts, visual and critical literacy skills will enable students to access knowledge, make meaning, express thoughts, emotions and ideas, interact with others and participate in a range of communication ideas, using a wide variety of printed, audio, visual and digital materials. (ACARA, 2011c, p. 24)

The above statement from *The Shape of the Australian Curriculum: The Arts* (ACARA, 2011c) together with evidence from the literature review and the research data provide solid evidence that Music and Languages complement each other. However, the document fails to highlight the evolutionary and cognitive links between music and languages, how music helps to improve language literacy and Plato’s ideology that music is ‘gymnasium’ for the mind (Plato, 2004).

Of importance, this document does not acknowledge what the Arts can do for Language. The literature presented in Chapter II, along with the research data acknowledges that music and language share design features (Brown, 2001; Hockett, 1960; 1966; Mithen, 2006), are innate in all humans (Chen-Hafteck, 1997; Cross, 2001; Darwin, 1876; Gandini, 2002; Merker, 2000; Van Riper, 1984), share many structural and functional similarities (Besson & Schon, 2001; Tagg, 2002; Thompson et al, 2012) and that they both benefit neurological development as they are rule based and processed in a similar way in the brain (Harvey, 2007; Patel, 2008; 2003a; 2003b; Thompson et al, 2012). Whilst ACARA does acknowledge, “some Arts subjects have direct relationships to other subjects” (ACARA, 2011c, p. 19) it does so with a very narrow and un-interdisciplinary vision. Below, this is discussed and examples are given.

**Arts and Social Sciences**

“Arts can be integrated into History and Geography as recognisable products and records of all cultures” (ACARA, 2011c, p. 19). This statement highlights ACARA’s view of culture as big “C” culture (Henden, cited in Lottgen, 1997, p.163). That culture is based on artefacts, products and stereotypical things associated with a particular culture and people, for example pasta, the Colosseum and Ferrari cars. It does not acknowledge how music can communicate what Henden (cited in Lottgen, 1997, p. 163) terms as “small c” culture concepts such as the way of life, gestures and beliefs of a country and its people. This is the basis of intercultural learning (Scarino & Crichton, 2007). Music provides links between place and identity (Lomax, 1959) and provides intercultural insight (Le`, 1999). It reflects the language prosody and culture of the composer (Patel, 2009). *The Melbourne Declaration* (MCEETYA, 2008) and the *Shape
Paper: Languages (ACARA, 2011a) both state the importance of global integration, global citizenship and intercultural understandings. Music is a useful tool in teaching history and geography whilst at the same time integrating these “major changes in the world that are placing new demands on Australian education” (MCEETYA, 2008, p. 5).

Arts and English
The APPA considers English to be one of the four core learning areas of the curriculum. This supports their beliefs that English is more important than Music whilst promoting The Melbourne Declaration claim to be a ‘world-class curriculum’ (MCEETYA, 2008, p. 13), which has a strong focus on literacy. However, the research has shown that Music is an extremely powerful tool in teaching Language as musical awareness preceded linguistic awareness (Gfeller, 1986; Mithen, 2006). Speech is heavily dependent on rhythm and pitch (Besson & Schon, 2001; Patel, 2008) as communication is made up of a range of pitches (Harvey, 2007; Lake, 2002). This is evident from infancy as a child’s babble is based on innate rhythms, musical contours, stress and pitch of words rather than their meaning (Harvey, 2007; Gandini, 2002; Mithen, 2006). Neurological research has proven that music and language share neural network and syntactic processes (Jentschke, et al, 2005; Patel, 2008; Zatorre, 2005). It has been proven that singing improves attention and facilitates word segmentation (Schon, Boyer, Moreno, Besson, Peretz & Kolinsky, 2007). Music and spoken language share common features of articulation, perception, phonology, phonotactics, syntax, semantics and prosody including tone, duration, meter, inflexion, intonation, accentuation, rhythm and periodicity (Besson & Schon, 2001; Callan, Kawato, Parsons & Turner, 2007; Harvey, 2007; Tagg, 2002).

ACARA states Drama and Media can be integrated into English, “as the language of drama, media texts and narratives are language based they can be taught as part of English” (ACARA, 2011c, p. 19) however, they do not acknowledge the three remaining subjects. Using the Visual Arts, Dance and Music in Language learning provides great benefits as it attaches a mental representation to the vocabulary being presented therefore enhancing brain switching (Asher, 1984) and capabilities across a number of multiple intelligences (Gardner, 1993, 1999).

Arts and Health/Physical Education
“Dance can be integrated into Health and Physical Education” (ACARA, 2011c, p. 19). The Melbourne Declaration promotes a ‘world-class curriculum’ which will “nurture student wellbeing through health and physical education” (MCEETYA, 2008, p. 13). In the literature review evidence was provided as to how music and movement
can enhance language acquisition. Music assists students with accents, anticipation of text and memory (Palmer & Kelly, 1992). As the body is our first musical instrument it is important that students move and feel the language they are acquiring (Pritikin, 2005). Active participation enhances the brain’s ability to think, learn and create therefore allowing both brain hemispheres to communicate with each other (Asher, 1984; 2000; 2001).
SECTION THREE: FUTURE RECOMMENDATIONS

The most serious impediment to the development of teachers as researchers...is quite simple shortage of time. ...research by teachers is a minority activity...Clearly; much needs to be done to ameliorate the burdens of the teacher prepared to embark on a programme of research and development. (Stenhouse, 1981, p. 111)

The underlying premise to this research is that the Orff-Schulwerk approach has the potential to be an effective pedagogical tool in engaging upper primary students in the study of Italian. The novelty of the approach engages students, promotes cognitive development and helps develop alternate neuro-pathways (Doidge, 2010a, 2010b; Merzenich & Taub, 2008; Merzenich, 2009a; 2009b; Begley and Schwartz, 2003; Patel, 2008; Asher, 2001). However, if the potential of Orff-Schulwerk is to be achieved then support is needed in professional development, resourcing, pre-service and in-service training.

The findings of this research concur with those found in The status of quality of teaching and learning of Science in Australian schools (Goodrum, Hackling & Rennie, 2000), the Attitudes towards the study of Languages in Australian Schools (McConchie Pty Ltd, 2007) and the AITSL documents (2011a; 2011b; 2012b; 2012c) that on-going support, time, funding and resourcing is needed to help teachers develop their new skills and knowledge and that the attitudes towards Languages [and Music] are perceived to be poor. The success of the Australian Academy of Science’s Primary Connections (2005), is centred upon this model. Based on these findings, data evidence, curriculum document interpretations and the current position of Music and Languages education in WA primary schools, the researcher suggests the following four recommendations for the future.

**Recommendation One: It is recommended that appropriate on-going support is provided to help teachers to develop their skills and knowledge.**

Teachers are the most significant factor in improving the quality of teaching and learning (AITSL, 2011a; 2011b; 2012a; 2012b; 2012c; Goodrum, Hackling & Rennie, 2000). Therefore, it is imperative that skilled and qualified teachers are supported and encouraged to remain in the teaching profession (McConchie Pty Ltd, 2007). All participating teachers were solely teachers of primary Italian. None were Music specialists. This is why, whilst they experienced success as well as frustrations. A lack of knowledge and musical skills hindered them. The teachers involved enjoyed music,
considered themselves to be musical and all teachers used music/song in their junior and middle primary Italian classes. However, they did not feel confident or competent enough to use music/song in upper primary Italian lessons. This is a product of generalisation rather than specialisation of disciplines and a lack of pre-service and in-service training in music (Russell-Bowie, 1993, 2002; Stone, 2006). Without the appropriate resourcing and support teachers use of music/song was ‘handmaiden’ (Eisner, 2004) to Italian.

Support is needed to encourage teachers to participate in research opportunities (AITSL, 2011a; 2011b; 2012a; 2012b; 2012c). Throughout the research cycles, the researcher encountered a resistance towards research from stakeholders including principals, teachers and parents. Research was considered an imposition, a threat, an invasion of privacy, something extra to do and time consuming, rather than as an opportunity to develop new skills and knowledge.

Teachers considered themselves incompetent or with an inadequate skill set to participate in research. Many felt they had nothing to contribute. Research must be promoted as a different way to think about teaching. Although often unaware, teachers conduct informal research in their classrooms each day as part of their teaching process. It is what differentiates between a ‘good teacher’ from a ‘responsible educator’ or lead teacher (AITSL, 2011a) who initiates improved teaching and learning. A paradigm shift must occur to break down this resistance from one of fear and resentment to one that acknowledges research as a means of improving teaching practice and student outcomes, as a part of normal professional practice.

**Australian Institute for Teaching and School Leadership**

Absolutely I would love more Orff-Schulwerk PD. It would be an excellent thing. Because it’s something new I think that I would, it’s an action research sort of thing, and it would be great to send us all off with the knowledge that we had from your first PD and then come back and have a debrief session, gather more information together, play with our skills a bit more, cause I’m in the country, and then go back and try to apply things a little different or reinforce what I’ve been doing and then go back and have another talk again about what I’d been doing would actually be very good. But, when you learn a new pedagogy I don’t think it’s healthy to do it in isolation. I think you will actually get it and develop it better...A. through doing it and B. through not just reflection but group reflection. (TP-Virginia, September, 2009)

It is important that bodies such as the Australian Institute for Teaching and School Leadership (AITSL) be engaged to foster support for teachers such as Virginia, remembering AITSL was established to provide national leadership in promoting
excellence in the education profession (AITSL, 2011a; 2011b; 2012a, 2012b, 2012c). Its role being to:

1. Develop and maintain rigorous national professional standards for teaching and school leadership;
2. Implement an agreed system of national accreditation of teachers based on these standards;
3. Foster and drive high quality professional development for teachers and school leaders through professional standards, professional learning and a national approach to the accreditation of pre-service teacher education coursesunder;
4. Take and engage with international research and innovative developments in best practice administer annual national awards for teachers and school leaders;
5. Work collaboratively with government and non-government school systems, key stakeholders including professional associations and education unions, teacher educators, business and school communities, and the Australian Curriculum Assessment and Reporting Authority (ACARA) and Education Services Australia (ESA)
6. Fulfil the role of assessing authority under the Migration Regulations 1994 for the purposes of skilled migration to Australia as a pre-primary, primary or secondary school teacher. (Adapted from AITSL, 2012a; 2012b; 2012c)

*It is recommended through engagement with AITSL that:*

- Professional associations, employers and universities professional learning opportunities be facilitatet on the successful integration of Music and Italian;
- Equity in access to professional learning for all teachers, including teachers of second languages and the Arts be provided;
- Principals create a school environment where excellence for all teachers, including teachers of second languages and the Arts is promoted.
- On-going collegial support to be provided for teachers to engage them in the use of contemporary resources;
- Professional learning and resource development occurs simultaneously;
- Professional learning opportunities for Italian teachers are provided and supported;
- Pre-service teacher training institutions reinstate more music education units for all pre-service teachers;
• Pre-service teacher training institutions and professional associations offer professional development in music education for all practicing teachers;
• Mentoring be provided by experts to teachers of second languages, Music, and other learning areas, who are developing new skills and knowledge; and,
• A paradigm shift, which values and embraces research must be promoted.

**Recommendation Two: It is recommended that appropriate time, funding and resourcing is provided to help teachers to develop their skills and knowledge.**

“Change takes time and resources” (Goodrum, Hackling, & Rennie, 2000, p. 169). It takes a considerable amount of time for teachers to change from their current practice to one which they are unfamiliar with, even if they are supportive of the new concept. Change requires effort, time and resourcing. For change to occur, resources must demonstrate to the teachers how effectively it works, and how benefits them and their students. Stakeholders must support teachers via funding, and resourcing. This will improve morale as teacher’s knowledge and skills improve (McConchie Pty Ltd, 2007).

**It is recommended that through engagement with AITSL that:**
• Teachers of Languages are seen as a valued member of staff and provided with equal professional opportunities as other staff members;
• Teacher networks are established to support all teachers as they learn their new skills;
• Mentors be provided to assist teachers in the acquisition of new skills and guide them through how to use these skills effectively in the classroom;
• Adequate budgets be allocated to the Languages learning area;
• A whole school integrated approach to the teaching of Languages and Music be adopted;
• A leadership resource is developed to assist Italian teachers with the integration of the Orff-Schulwerk approach into their Italian classes;
• Adequate time is allocated by principals to the teaching and learning of Languages and Music; and,
• A paradigm shift which values and embraces research be promoted in the primary school sector.

*Yes. I would get my confidence up...with my younger grades who embrace music so much more readily and then from there, depending on my confidence, I would use it with my upper grades. ...if the kids are responding positively, then I get motivated myself and then I would have tried it with my*
older grades. For me, to try it with my older grades first, for someone who is not very confident, it didn’t quite work for me. It has potential – Yes. (TP-Donatella, September, 2009)

**Recommendation Three:** It is recommended that teacher specialisations be reinstated as opposed to generalisation.

The *Melbourne Declaration* (MCEETYA, 2008) and the *National Curriculum* (ACARA, 2010) assume an integrated/interdisciplinary curriculum can take place as “Twenty-first century learning does not fit into a curriculum solely organised by learning areas or subjects that reflects the disciplines… student need to develop… general capabilities that apply across subject based content” (ACARA, 2010, p. 18).

However, both parties do not acknowledge its potential implementation problems (Irwin, Gouzouasis, Grauer, Leggo & Springgay, 2006). Teachers and students must understand how integration works. Policy makers need to guide teachers towards strong pedagogical practices within the mandated curriculum, which is advocating interdisciplinary study (Irwin, Gouzouasis, Grauer, Leggo & Springgay, 2006). Generalist teachers do not consider themselves to be artists and struggle with the idea of using the Arts. This is due to the fact that a comprehensive pre-service primary teacher specialisation is no longer promoted at universities in WA, or through the national policy level. Policy makers need to consider what can be done to enhance and strengthen teacher instruction in this manner and emphasis should be placed on recruiting and maintaining specialist teachers (Irwin, Gouzouasis, Grauer, Leggo & Springgay, 2006; McConchie Pty Ltd, 2007).

An interdisciplinary curriculum is not a professional skill achieved via ‘osmosis’. It is a process, which is highly complex and requires a high degree of specialised knowledge before ‘generalisation’ can occur (Toulmin, 1972). The goals of the disciplines must be understood and their integrity maintained when being used across learning areas (Toulmin, 1972). If a primary teacher attempts employs an interdisciplinary approach, but does not respect or understand the discipline, then it becomes ‘handmaiden’ to the superior or understood discipline (Eisner, 2004) as the misunderstood discipline becomes a mere ‘tools for facilitation’. If ACARA, the APPA and Federal and State Governments continue to devalue specialists in favour of generalists then this will decrease the demand for teacher training at the university level. This will have a flow-on-effect as university funding will be directed away from rich electives in the Bachelor of Education pre-service awards, or it will diminish and be
offered to traditional learning area priorities such as literacy and numeracy. This leads to: a decrease in research into The Arts and Second Languages in Education; in poorer mentoring and specialist electives opportunities will cease to exist.

*It is recommended that:*

- University pre-service primary Bachelor of Education courses reinstate more Music education units for all pre-service teachers;
- University Faculties/Schools of Education be given greater flexibility in the courses they provide and how they allocate their funding and not be ‘handmaiden’ (Eisner, 2004) to narrow cross-curricular priorities in the Australian Curriculum;
- The Arts be divided into discrete individual subject entities, or aligned within partnerships, not to remain in one bundle of poorly conceived learning areas;
- The ‘in-servicing’ of primary teachers be supported via professional development and resourcing (as per AITSL); and,
- Future Bachelor of Education degrees (Primary) allow for specialisation in across all learning areas.

I felt sometimes that I didn’t have enough knowledge really because I don’t have much knowledge in music and I felt that I need to know a little bit more. (TP-Laura, September, 2009)

**Recommendation Four: It is recommended that stakeholders begin to close the gap between actual and ideal scenarios.**

A gap exists between the intended and the implemented curriculum (Goodrum, Hackling & Rennie, 2000). Whilst the Australian Curriculum clearly states high expectations in its rationales, concepts, goals and outcomes, the data of this research has highlighted that this is not the reality in schools. To ensure that students receive a balanced curriculum the *Attitudes towards the study of Languages in Australian Schools* (McConchie Pty Ltd, 2007) recommends the auditing of schools to monitor equitable learning area representation in the school curriculum and that parents be involved in the change process. Simplifying the curriculum and focusing on generalisation in both teacher training and student education does not respect the brain’s cognitive capacity. Eisner (2002a) encourages us to remember that:

...learning is not only the result of standards, overt and covert curriculum and teacher ability. It is also shaped by the school’s climate: norms, values attitudes and the null curriculum. The null curriculum are the absent learning areas or learning areas taught in a
haphazard way. The null curriculum sends a strong message to students about what is valued in the school culture and society. As long as the Arts [and Languages] are assigned a marginal place in the hierarchy of importance in school, achievement in the arts will play second fiddle to achievement in what is thought of as more cognitive accomplishments. (2002, p. 37)

As long as the Arts [and Languages] are seen as insignificant disciplines in the curriculum (perceived as learning areas which do not require thought) they will not be treated inappropriately and expedient to existing priorities and assessment practices (Eisner, 1987; Lummis, 1986; Lummis, 2001). Both the Arts and Languages promote participation and help to connect individuals both inter and intra culturally. Including these learning areas into the Australian Curriculum as significant and mandated disciplines may lead to sectors of Australian society who are “defensive towards these two learning areas, to become more positive” (Lummis, 1986, p. 48). This would therefore help reach The Goals of the Melbourne Declaration (MCEETYA, 2008) and The Australian Curriculum (ACARA, 2010).

It is recommended that:
- Specific teaching time allocations be clearly stated within the Australian Curriculum documents;
- A paradigm shift which values the Music and Languages must be promoted by educational stakeholders including AITSL, ACARA and APPA;
- Government funding is increased;
- Music and Languages be made mandatory from Pre-primary through to Year twelve;
- A National Languages and Arts policy be written, which mandates these learning areas across all Australian states and territories;
- The diversity of Languages and cultures in Australia be acknowledged, leading to an understanding that different Languages have differing curriculum requirements;
- Principals be advocates for Languages and the Arts; and,
- Research in the areas of Music and Languages be supported.

Yeah, as I said I’d like to go into it a little bit more then I could speak a bit more about it and experience it more myself before I go and tell people about it but I think its initially good to start at an early age with the kids so they’re familiar with the system and familiar with the intervention that you’re proposing. So then they grow up with it and it becomes natural for
them so that by the time they’re in Year Seven it’s just part of them. That’s what I’d like to see. (TP-Sabrina, September, 2009)

Summary

The opportunity to respond to a novel situation with an open-mind allows people to acknowledge their limitations and move on from them. This allows them to demonstrate rationality (Toulmin, 1972). This research is based upon the premise that music/song could be effective tool in teaching Italian to upper primary school students. The Orff-Schulwerk approach was considered successful by the teachers and students involved. The novelty of the approach had a positive impact in their classroom, on learning, attitudes and confidence. Students were engaged, focused and actively involved in the lessons. Students and teachers enjoyed the simple, repetitive activities which helped improve student linguistic understanding, memory and retention as they provided students with learning scaffolds which catered for their needs.

However, whilst the research indicates that the Orff-Schulwerk approach was successful, a number of constraints also emerged from the research. Teachers felt they:

- Lacked confidence in music due to a lack of specialisation;
- Were being marginalised;
- Required more professional learning opportunities;
- Required more time and resourcing; and,
- Required greater on-going support.

These findings were further highlighted in students’ comments. “With some I got pretty bored cause we’d just play it over and over and then it got a bit boring” (SP-Julie, September, 2009).

This research brought forward the interplaying thematic layers hindering specialist programmes, including:

- National and State agendas; (Governments, ACARA, APPA and MCEETYA)
- Primary school setting; (resourcing, budgets, timetabling, classrooms, NAPLAN) and,
- Individual perspectives. (principals, parents, colleagues)

This research makes a series of future recommendations, which could be implemented to improve the success of the Orff-Schulwerk approach as a pedagogical tool for teaching Italian to upper primary students. However, these recommendations...
are framed by the research context, limitations and on the experiences of the teachers and students involved. The recommendations also need to be considered within mandated curriculum requirements. Unless the neurological benefits which novelty, teacher specialisation and an interdisciplinary curriculum can have on student learning is promoted, then Music and Italian [Languages] will continue to be undervalued and considered a curricular time filler or add on (Medina, 1993a; 1993b; Eisner, 2004).

Conclusion

In conclusion, given all the positive findings gathered by this research, together with the concerns within the incumbent curriculum documents, the researcher questions what factors are causing the resentment towards the teaching of Italian (Languages), Music (The Arts) and research? Is it:

1. The APPA and their emphasis on the teaching of Mathematics, English, History and Science?
2. A remaining legacy of the prejudice of the ‘White Australia’ policy, which ended in 1973 that considered Italians to be part of a peasant working class culture who came to Australia to work and make a new life for themselves?
3. The current Rudd (2007-2010)-Gillard (2010-present) Government and Federal Opposition rhetoric and policy which is promoting an Asia focus (Chinese essential trade with Australia) and a failing to acknowledge that since the 1950’s Italian is the most spoken language in Australia, second to English, followed by Greek and Cantonese?
4. A failure to acknowledge that Italy is still one of Australia’s largest trading partners?
5. A lack of knowledge of all educational stakeholders of Australia’s Greco-Roman heritage and its link to Roman-British history and by extension to non-Indigenous Australian culture?
6. A lack of knowledge/awareness of the neuro-scientific evidence, which clearly articulates the cognitive benefits of interdisciplinary use of music and language?
7. A lack of knowledge/appreciation of the role music and languages has played in the evolutionary history of humanity?
8. A lack of understanding of the role music plays in language acquisition?
9. A disconnect, denial, prejudice or ignorance manifesting a legacy amongst principals, politicians, school staff members, parents, educational stakeholders
and the wider community which is preventing them seeing the relevance of Languages and the Arts?

Speech without music leads to language without heart. (Newham, 1993, cited in Lake, 2002, p. 2)
CHAPTER VII
CONCLUSIONS

When you see the possibilities of music, you desire to do something really good for people” (Goodreads, 2012; John Coltrane, 1926-1967) John Coltrane was an American jazz saxophonist and composer. He was a pioneer in the use of modal scales in the jazz genre and of ‘free jazz’. Although there is no formal definition of ‘free jazz’ it was a genre, which promoted the voice of the musician rather than the voice of the composer.

Introduction

If educators and the education system are to prepare students to become active and informed citizens of a globalised twenty-first century then they have the responsibility “to ignite a sense of wonderment in a child’s education” (Cate Blanchett, cited in Hawke, 2011c).

This research arose from the researcher’s personal belief that Music and Languages are essential in today’s curriculum and when used in an integrated manner they can provide a proactive interdisciplinary solution in a crowded curriculum. Therefore, the research was an outcome of the researcher’s teaching and self-reflection of her use of the Orff-Schulwerk approach in her Italian primary classroom as both a Music and Italian specialist? The researcher set out to find out whether it possible for non-music, Italian specialists colleagues to use the Orff-Schulwerk approach effectively in their Italian classrooms? From an initial critical self-reflection of her own teaching practice, further questions arose to direct the design of this mixed methods action research.

Finally, ‘An interdisciplinary intervention: The potential of the Orff-Schulwerk approach as a pedagogical tool for the teaching of Italian to upper primary students in Western Australia’, was established with six research questions:

1. Do Italian teachers in Western Australian primary schools use music/song as a pedagogical tool in their classroom?
2. How do Italian teachers use music/song as a pedagogical tool in their classroom?
3. Why do Italian teachers use music/song as a pedagogical tool in their classroom?
4. Do Italian language teachers in Western Australian primary schools consider the Orff-Schulwerk approach to be an effective pedagogical tool when teaching Italian to their upper primary students?
5. Was the Orff-Schulwerk approach successful in engaging Western Australian upper primary students in the study of Italian as a second language?
6. What do Italian teachers in Western Australian primary schools consider to be the essential knowledge and/or support structures needed for the Orff-Schulwerk approach to be an effective pedagogical tool in their upper primary classrooms?

The Research and New Knowledge

This research invited 215 primary Italian second language teachers, across all educational sectors in WA to participate. The research was conducted in three action cycles phases:

- **Action Cycle One** (gathered data regarding school, teacher and classroom demographics via a mail-out questionnaire).
- **Action Cycle Two** (interviews allowed for deeper investigation and elaboration on Action Cycle One preliminary findings).
- **Action Cycle Three** (responded to the emerging need for an upper primary focus, which was trialled in an eight week Orff-Schulwerk intervention).

The research found that participating teachers considered the Orff-Schulwerk approach to be an engaging and effective pedagogical tool in the teaching of Italian that: allowed for self-reflection on their teaching style and increased their awareness of the cognitive (learning) process; was relevant, contemporary and easily integrated into their existing programmes; improved student’s linguistic ability and understanding via provision of reinforcement and learning scaffolds; engaged students through its novel approach; and increased their confidence in their ability to use music/song.

In addition, the primary students found the Orff-Schulwerk approach: engaging, enjoyable and novel; focused their attention as they were actively involved in the lessons; improved their linguistic understanding and confidence; simple and the repetitive activities helped their learning, memory and retention; and catered for their needs at it provided them with learning scaffolds.

Analysis of Action Cycle Three data disclosed several interdependent factors are required before the Orff-Schulwerk approach is to be effectively used by non-music specialist Italian teachers. These factors required second language teachers to: have a professional desire to self-improve; be advocates for Italian and the Arts (Music); engage in ongoing professional learning opportunities; receive school support from the principal, school structure and policy, teaching colleagues and parents; receive support
at the political level (including; unilingual and multilingual associations, universities and especially ACARA).

Overall, the researcher is pleased with her findings. The research questions were addressed and they confirmed that other primary teachers of Italian, as well as their students, consider the Orff-Schulwerk approach to be an effective pedagogical tool in the teaching and learning Italian.

However, the research findings also implied that this research can be developed further and there were limitations to the research that require open discussion.

The Limitations of this Research

This research emphasised a qualitative dimension, one which employed mixed methods data collection. It was post-positivist in approach as it examined the ‘life-world’ experiences of teachers and students. It aimed to provide findings that were trustworthy, and therefore, credible, transferable, dependable and confirmable.

Care is required when transferring these findings to other contexts and settings. It is acknowledged that there could be inconsistencies associated with transferability of findings as this research focuses on phenomena occurring in specific situations.

The first consideration being while attempting to make the sample of teacher’s representative, it was not possible to include the same number of teachers from each of the educational sectors across both regional and metropolitan Western Australia. From a total population of 215 teachers of primary Italian 16% participated in Action Cycle One. This percentage decreased to 3% for Action Cycle Two and Action Cycle Three involved 3% of the total population. Therefore, it must be acknowledged that only a small sample of teachers participated in the research and the pedagogical practice and the thoughts of the Orff-Schulwerk approach of the 219 (97%) remaining teachers is unknown and thus provides a context for the limitations of this research. In addition, gender is another limitation as only two male teachers (6%) participated in the research. Therefore, given the small number of participants, it is difficult to transfer these results across the entire population of primary Italian teachers, schools and students in WA.

Mirroring this limitation, it was not possible to include the same number of schools from each of the educational sectors across both regional and metropolitan WA. Only 13% of schools participated in Action Cycle One. For Action Cycle Two and Three, this percentage decreased to 3%. It is acknowledged that only a small sample of schools participated in the research.
The previous two limitations explain why the research involved only 164 primary school students who learn Italian in WA. Based on the research sample average class size of 23 students, it is fair to estimate that in WA there are approximately 5865 primary students studying Italian. That represents one forty-third of the entire primary student population in WA which represents less than 3% of this total figure.

The credibility of results is based on the interpretation and triangulation of the information elicited from the teachers and students involved. Therefore, it was crucial to triangulate the findings between all participants across the three action cycles. Coding and identifying constructs and themes allowed for triangulation of the evidence from the research tools employed. Enabling the participants the opportunity to read transcripts of interviews allowed them to evaluate whether the phenomena was being understood from their viewpoint and being represented fairly.

Peer debriefing, audit trails and member checks were employed by the researcher to ensure trustworthiness in dependability and confirming of results. These strategies were used to prevent any potential bias or distortion of results, account for any changes, which may have occurred during the research.

Some of the findings presented were perceptions reflected by the participating teachers and the researcher’s experience when contacting schools. It is acknowledged that no formal material was gathered covering the attitudes of principals, parents and other educational stakeholders.

The use of mail-out and self-administered questionnaires is acknowledged as a limitation. The integrity of the questionnaire may have been compromised as the degree to teachers understood and interpreted the questionnaire items is not known. However, those that completed the questionnaire did not find it difficult to read or understand.

The researcher not being present in the intervention class to observe and/or conduct the intervention or administer questionnaires is also acknowledged as a limitation as the findings presented by a teacher could be subject to bias and subjectivity. It is acknowledged that the researcher not being present in the intervention classrooms and witnessing the intervention taking place, may also be a limiting factor. Due to the distance between schools this was logistically impossible for the researcher to do on their own.

By allowing teachers to administer the pre and post-intervention questionnaires to the students may have compromised the integrity of the questionnaire as it is not known
how the teachers’ administered the questionnaires according to the instructions given or whether the students completed the questionnaires in confidence.

The researcher did not conduct all interviews face-to-face and this is also acknowledged as a limitation. This was due to a number of reasons including: distance between researcher and schools (distance between Perth and the location of some participating teachers and schools ranging from 30-300 km); time constraints (one term, family commitments, timetable restrictions, sports carnivals and yard duty); as well as there was only one primary researcher. This prevented the researcher interpreting further important communicative material from the participants’ body language.

It is acknowledged that student interviews may in some sense have been compromised, as the teachers chose the students to be interviewed. Whilst they were provided with a formula to adhere to (choose the first, seventh, and fourteenth students on their rolls) it is not known if it was actually done. Some students had adults in the room during their interviews. While it is acknowledged that this is a duty of care issue, it may have prevented students from answering truthfully.

The researcher acknowledges that the intervention time frame may have been too short (six-eight weeks in duration with the intervention being used for only ten minutes of each lesson). However, she was conscious of the difficulties involved in all parties reaching agreement on a suitable school term (AITSL, 2012b). Curriculum assessments and pressures such as NAPLAN (ACARA, 2008) needed to be accommodated. Term Three was chosen as, at the time (2009) it was the term with the least disruptions, however, timetabling constraints (sports carnivals, assessments, excursions) were still prominent.

Ideally, the researcher would have preferred the intervention to be used for more than ten minutes per lesson. This sentiment was also shared by the teacher participants. “The intervention could have been a little longer. Ten minutes is probably not enough” (TP-Amelia, September, 2009). However, the researcher was aware of the need for teachers to complete their teaching and learning programmes for the term and ensure that their students reach their learning outcomes. Care was taken by the researcher not to make the intervention too much of an imposition for teachers, but at the same time provide enough time, during a 45 minute lesson, to use a basic Orff-Schulwerk activity effectively.

It is acknowledged that the professional learning delivered may have been too brief (one, four hour intensive professional learning workshop). However, time (family
commitments, teachers relinquishing personal time) of the participants needed to be respected.

While the overall findings did reinforce that the Orff-Schulwerk intervention was successful for affective, cognitive and linguistic reasons, the researcher acknowledges that the evidence collected does not provide the ideal objective and standardised protocols to unequivocally underscore the effectiveness of the approach in improving linguistic student outcomes. Therefore, all findings expressed can only be interpreted by the researcher from the interpretation of both teacher and student perceptions documented.

Despite these limitations the researcher believes that, the research discovered that the Orff-Schulwerk approach was considered to be an effective pedagogical tool for the teaching of Italian to upper primary students in WA. It also indirectly tested a fact from the field of neuroscience, that provision of a novel stimulus engages the students, triggering the neurotransmitters which assist the brain to create a memory, motivating them to learn and activating their working memory (Schwartz & Begley, 2003). Teacher participants considered the Orff-Schulwerk approach effective for improving the affective, cognitive and linguistic abilities of students, in nine ways:

1. Engaging and actively involving students.
2. Reducing behavioural issues.
3. Providing students with reinforcement and scaffolding structures required for success.
4. Improving student language ability.
5. Increasing student linguistic understanding.
6. Ease of integration into the current classroom programme.
7. Increasing teacher awareness of the cognitive process which students’ progress through when learning.
8. Relevant and contemporary.
9. Allowing teachers to self-reflect on their teaching style.

Four commonalities were also identified between teacher and student responses as students reported the Orff-Schulwerk approach successful in:

1. Engaging and actively involving them in Italian lessons.
2. Providing reinforcement to their learning.
3. Providing scaffolding to assist their learning.
4. Improving their linguistic understanding.
However, findings identified seven constraints impacting on the effectiveness of the Orff-Schulwerk approach in upper primary Italian classrooms across WA. These are:

1. Teacher confidence;
2. Teacher attitudes;
3. Staff attitudes,
4. Principal attitudes;
5. School structure
6. Parent attitudes; and
7. Student attitudes.

**Areas for Future Research**

The researcher aims to use her research experiences to provide baseline data for the WA education community on the effectiveness music/song has on language learning, in particular when using the interdisciplinary Orff-Schulwerk intervention approach. Given that little research has been done in this area, there is a need for further longitudinal qualitative and quantitative research to be conducted, so that the findings from this research can be extended to design improved second language learning and teaching strategies with greater transferability and credibility for primary teachers and students of Italian or other languages. Future research questions could include:

Does the Orff-Schulwerk approach increase the student language acquisition rate of:

- Italian across all primary years of schooling?
- Italian with upper primary students?
- Romance languages across all primary years of schooling?
- Romance languages with upper primary students?
- Non-Romance languages across all primary years of schooling?
- Non-Romance languages with upper primary students?
- Mandarin across all primary years of schooling?
- Mandarin with upper primary students?
- Asian languages across all primary years of schooling?
- Asian languages with upper primary students?
- Indigenous languages across all primary years of schooling?
- Indigenous languages with upper primary students?
Given the growing diversity across Australia, and in particular the rapid population growth in WA, especially its important economic links with China, South East Asia and India, more research needs to be initiated into school and community attitudes towards second language acquisition. The following areas require careful unpacking:

**Community attitudes**
- How does the wider Western Australian community perceive the role of European, Asian and other Languages in the school curriculum?
- How does the wider Western Australian community perceive the role of Music in the school curriculum?
- How does the wider Western Australian community perceive the role of research in the field of education?

**School community attitudes**
- How do specific Western Australian primary school communities perceive the role of European, Asian and other Languages in the school curriculum?
- How do specific Western Australian primary school communities perceive the role of Music in the school curriculum?
- How does the wider Western Australian primary school community perceive the role of research in the field of education?

**Parental attitudes**
- How many parents in specific Western Australian primary schools have studied a second language?
- How many parents in specific Western Australian primary schools have studied music?
- How do parents in specific Western Australian primary schools perceive the role of European, Asian and other Languages in the primary school curriculum?
- How do parents in specific Western Australian primary schools perceive the role of Music and Languages in the primary school curriculum?
- How do parents in specific Western Australian primary school community perceive the role of research in the field of education?

**Primary principal attitudes**
- How many principals in specific Western Australian primary schools have studied a Second Language?
● How many principals in specific Western Australian primary schools have studied Music?

● How do principals in specific Western Australian primary schools perceive the role of European, Asian and other Languages in the primary school curriculum?

● How do principals in specific Western Australian primary schools perceive the role of Music and Languages in the primary school curriculum?

● How do principals in specific Western Australian primary school community perceive the role of research in the field of education?

**Primary teacher attitudes**

● How many teachers in specific Western Australian primary schools have studied a Second Language?

● How many teachers in specific Western Australian primary schools have studied Music?

● How do teachers in specific Western Australian primary schools perceive the role of Music and Languages in the primary school curriculum?

● How do teachers in specific Western Australian primary school community perceive the role of research in the field of education?

● What are the personal experiences of teachers of how they were taught Languages at school and/or at a tertiary level?

● What are the personal experiences of teachers of how they were taught Music at school and/or at tertiary a level?

**Conclusion**

To lie in sweat, on familiar sheets  
In brick veneer on financed beds  
In a room of silent hardiflex  
That certain texture, that certain smell  
Brings forth the heavy days  
Brings forth the night-time sweat  
Out on the patio, we’d sit  
And the humidity, we’d breathe  
We’d watch the lightning crack over cane fields  
Laugh and think, this is Australia.  

(Callaghan, 1985, track 2)

“*Sounds of Then (This is Australia)*” is a song sung by Australian band ‘GANGgajang’. It captures the memories of the songwriter growing up in Queensland with its heat, humidity, tropical storms and friendship. The song creates an image that

275
many Australians can relate to as it “creates moods that can be attached to people’s experiences” (Douglas, 2000, p. 2). This vision was depicted so vividly in the song that companies such as Coca Cola and WIN Television used it extensively in their advertising campaigns. It depicted Australians as white, relaxed, rural people who enjoyed spending time at the beach, and Australia as the lucky country. However, as Douglas (2000, p. 2) notes, “… there are no Aboriginal peoples, ‘Asian’ peoples or any other ethnic group presented…Australia is a big, wide-open country populated by fun loving, white, Anglo-Celts… “This is Australia?” (Douglas, 2000, p. 2)

Education is experiencing a phase of significant change. Schools, teachers and students are suffering from problematic curriculum requirements and achievement expectations are unclear. The APPA defined four core essential learning areas for all students. These are English literacy, Mathematics, Science and History. Languages and Music were not considered essential and alarmingly, many principals have stated they would remove them from their school curriculum to ensure students received greater time learning the four core learning areas. This research has argued that this could severely impoverish the education of Australian students. Just as Coca Cola advertising campaigns have marginalised the ‘kanakas’, the ‘contadini’, the Italian labourers and nullified their role in Australian history, so too ACARA, the APPA, MCEETYA and Government policy continue to marginalise Languages and the Arts by making them part of the null curriculum.

Potentially, students in WA could miss out on two essential learning areas in today’s education curriculum, which, as the evidence presented suggests, are enjoyable and provide many social, cognitive and educational benefits. The research has highlighted that the use of novelty when teaching enhances neurological development, and therefore supports neuroscientific research. Educators and administrators cannot justify giving Arts and Language any importance in the curriculum because they are not aware of their inherited prejudicial attitudes towards these areas. As a result they do not know the potential they have and may simultaneously be propagating a neurological and societal bias (Eisner, 1991; 1997; 2002a; 2002b; 2004; Lummis, 1986).

Cross (2001) and Thompson et al (2012) say music and speech are both products of Homosapien biology and interactions. Music is powerful in drawing on existing brain circuits which have been developed for other specialised functions. “Let us remember, that, in the beginning, music was the sole means of communication” (Werner, 1996, p. 32).
This research sought to explore whether teachers of primary Italian considered the Orff-Schulwerk approach to be a potentially effective pedagogical tool for the teaching of Italian to upper primary students in WA. It was discovered that whilst the participating teachers enjoyed music none of them were a trained Music and Italian specialists, none shared a similar background filled with rich childhood experiences in both Music and Italian as the researcher and most significantly, none engaged in true interdisciplinary approaches when using music/song to teach Italian. It can be concluded that the researcher is a unique Italian/Music teacher.

This research is a result of a personal belief held by the researcher who views the teaching of Music and Languages together, as a means of providing interdisciplinary opportunity in a crowded curriculum. Her rich self-reflections demonstrate how music/song can be used in a novel interdisciplinary manner to facilitate the learning of Italian whilst maintaining the integrity of both disciplines. This is what must return if teachers are to meet the goals and outcomes of the incumbent National Curriculum.

It must be noted that at the time of writing, all members and the executive board of ACARA, have backgrounds in one of the following areas; Science, Leadership, Mathematics, Strategic Planning, History, Geography, English, Assessment, Finance and Management. None have a background in The Arts, Music, Languages or Italian. It must also be noted that at the time of writing the current chair of ACARA is Professor Barry McGaw, who has a background in Science and Mathematics, and was the driving force behind the McGaw Report (1984). This could possibly explain why Mathematics, Science, History and English have become the central focus of the National Curriculum. Across the globe minority groups have been victims of those with the prominent voice. Those with the most voice are heard and get represented whilst those with no voice or representation are marginalised and often forgotten. This appears to be what Government agenda and policy, ACARA, APPA and MCEETYA is allowing to happen to the Arts (Music) Languages in the National Curriculum.

It is possible to teach the Arts (Music) [and Italian] in an integrated way as long as the integrity of either is not sacrificed (Eisner, 1987). The researcher has demonstrated in her self-reflections that the Arts and Languages can be integrated and their integrity maintained, as long as the teacher has specialised skills and knowledge in one or more learning areas. Industry and government craves for innovation and creative problem solving (Irwin, Gouzouasis, Grauer, Leggo & Springgay, 2006). Integration done with integrity helps to achieve this.
It is hoped that this research and other future studies in this area will have a positive impact upon the teaching practice of Italian teachers in WA and lead them towards using music/song as an effective and novel pedagogical tool for teaching students rather than as a means for entertaining them. “...The Arts should be taught with the same seriousness of mind as we treat Physics and Mathematics because the same levels of skills are being developed and the same educational ends are being served” (Ryan, 1986, cited in Lummis, 1986, p. 111).

It is also hoped that third parties such as principals, the APPA, governments, ACARA, tertiary institutions and other stakeholders consider the positive effects that Music and Languages have on learning, cognition and in developing future global citizens. Additionally, it is hoped that these third parties will strive to provide novel and effective programmes, within an effective performance and development cycle (AITSL, 2011a; 2011b; 2012b; 2012c) which will provide WA’s teachers and students with the opportunity of a curriculum rich in Music and Languages.

I would teach children music, physics and philosophy, but most importantly music, for in the patterns of music and all the arts are the keys of learning. (Plato, 2004)
Academy needs cash to survive. (2012, June 11). The West Australian, p. 17
Arts funding cuts show apes have taken over. (2010, July 23). The West Australian. p.21.


Australia votes “no” in the republican referendum. (2012, 19th January). Australian Broadcasting Commission archives. Retrieved (03/05/12) from http://www.abc.net.au/archives/80days/stories/2012/01/19/3423918htm?WT.srch=1&WT.mc_id=Corp_Innovation-80Days%7CDay1_AdWords:%2Baustralian%20republic%20referendum_b_g_17136859759_1t1&gclid=CMLI8cSH


282


Department of the Prime Minister and Cabinet Office for the Arts. (2011). *Mitchell review of Private Sector Support for the Arts. Submission by the Chamber of Arts*


Doidge, N. (2010b). The brain that changes itself: Lessons from the frontiers of brain science. Seminar presented on behalf of University of Western Australia Extension, Perth Convention Centre, WA (20/08/10)


286


Library of Congress Catalogue number: 76-155268


Hirst, R., Moginie, J. & Garrett, P. (1987). Beds are burning [Track 1]; The Dead Heart [Track 6]. On *Diesel and Dust*. [CD]. Midnight Oil. CBS Records


292


295


296


Norris, L. (2010, May 8.). Differentiated learning in the classroom: Catering for both ends of the spectrum. Paper presented at the Western Australian Association for Teachers of Italian Conference, Joondalup Resort; Joondalup, WA.


299


300


Unlock the creativity so teens can get ahead. (2011, December 12). The West Australian, p.18.


APPENDICES

Appendix A: The Structure and Function of the Human Brain.

The human brain is made up of three parts:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>The Forebrain</th>
<th>Function</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Cerebrum/Cortex</td>
<td>Largest section accounting for 5% of the brain's weight is divided into 2 main hemispheres by the Corpus Callosum.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Right Hemisphere</td>
<td>Controls left side movements, receives senses from the left hand side of the body, responsible for spatial perception, detects complex auditory tones, analyses by touch, non-verbal, responsible for pattern recognition</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Left Hemisphere</td>
<td>Controls movement for the right side, receives senses from the right side, processes right visual field, responsible for language, mathematics and speech, contains the Broca's and Wernicke Areas.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Each hemisphere is divided into four lobes

1. **Frontal Lobe**
   - Associated with reasoning, planning, parts of speech, movement, emotion and problem solving.
   - Contains the Broca's Area which is responsible for controlling and producing speech.

2. **Parietal Lobe**
   - Responsible for sensory functions, movement, orientation, recognition and perception of stimuli

3. **Temporal Lobe**
   - Associated with perception and recognition of auditory stimuli, hearing, memory and speech. Contains the Wernicke Area which is the language area responsible for comprehension. It connects the amygdala and the hippocampus.

4. **Occipital Lobe**
   - Associated with visual processing.

**Limbic System**

1. **Thalamus**
   - Located at the centre of the brain. It receives sensory input from all around the body, filters it and passes the filtered parts to the cerebral cortex. Central relay centre for sensory information.

2. **Hypothalamus**
   - Responsible for keeping the body physiologically balanced. I.e., emotion, hunger, body weight, thirst, sleep patterns, blood pressure.

3. **Amygdala**
   - Almond shaped mass located between the temporal lobes and next to the hippocampus. Controls fear and aggression.

4. **Hippocampus**
   - Found underneath the temporal lobe. Responsible for creating and retaining long term memories.

**The Midbrain**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Tectum</th>
<th>Function</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Tegmentum</td>
<td>Directs behavioural and body responses.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Controls motor functions, awareness, attention and regulates some autonomic functions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Hindbrain</td>
<td>Function</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----------------</td>
<td>--------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cerebellum</td>
<td>Co-ordinates movements such as posture, balance and initiates movements.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pons</td>
<td>Link cerebellum to the brain and is responsible for sub-conscious muscle movement.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Medulla</td>
<td>The site of crossing over for the spinal nerves. Responsible for regulating heart rate, breathing and gastrointestinal movement.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Brain Stem</td>
<td>Located at the base of the brain. Connects brain and the spinal cord. Controls sleep, wakefulness, digestion, breathing and heart rate. Performs subconscious body functions.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

(Main parts of the human brain, n.d.)
Appendix B: Tonic-Clonic Seizures.

Prior a tonic-clonic seizure sufferers experience a period known as an aura where they feel lightheaded, uncomfortable and have altered vision and hearing. (MedicinePlus Medical Encyclopedia, 2011) The seizure begins in an isolated area of the brain and quickly spreads to the whole brain. During the tonic phase the sufferer loses consciousness, their muscles tense and they will fall to the ground if standing. Often vocalisation occurs as air is quickly expelled from the lungs. In the clonic phase the sufferers muscles relax and the convulsions start. The eyes roll back and incontinence is also experienced. Biting of the tongue may also be experienced. This is followed by postictal sleep due to the physical and nervous exhaustion endured during the seizure. When the patient awakens they experience confusion and amnesia, which passes as recovery occurs. (MedicinePlus Medical Encyclopaedia, 2011)
Appendix C: Comparisons of Primary Teaching Courses Offered at Universities in Western Australia.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>University</th>
<th>Course</th>
<th>Duration in Years</th>
<th>Core Music/Arts units</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Edith Cowan</td>
<td>BEd (Y41)</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>2nd year, 2nd semester, 3rd year, 1st semester</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Edith Cowan</td>
<td>BEd (K15)</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>1st year, 1st semester, 3rd year, 2nd semester</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Curtin</td>
<td>BEd</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>2nd year, 1st semester</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Murdoch</td>
<td>BEd</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>2nd year, 2nd semester</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Notre Dame</td>
<td>BEd</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3rd year, 2nd semester</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>University of WA</td>
<td>Master of Teaching</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1st year, 1st semester</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(Postgraduate)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

N.B. Optional study units are not included in the table above.
Appendix D: Language Practice Task Using Orff-Schulwerk.

Meaningful chunk of language to be taught:
“Che cosa mangi la mattina a colazione?”

Language Practice Task: The teacher says and repeats the language continuously. The students are invited to join in when they feel comfortable.

Teach meaningful chunk of language by:
- Saying sentence and doing actions (Invite students when they feel comfortable)
- After a few times, ask students what it might mean.
- Once they can say the sentence and do the actions introduce saying the sentence and clapping beat
- Once they can say the sentence and clap the beat introduce saying the sentence and clapping the rhythm
- Once they can say the sentence and clap the rhythm introduce saying the sentence and combining the beat and rhythm simultaneously
- Once they can say the sentence and combine the beat and rhythm introduce saying the sentence and combine the beat and actions
- Once they can say the sentence and combine the beat and actions introduce saying the sentence and transferring rhythm to body percussion
- Once they can say the sentence and transfer the rhythm to body percussion introduce saying the sentence and playing the beat or rhythm on instruments.
Appendix E: Timeline of Research.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Time Frame</th>
<th>Research Task Conducted</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Action Cycle One</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>January/February 2008</td>
<td>Submitted ethics</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>April 2008</td>
<td>Administered pilot to test questionnaire on secondary Italian teachers.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>April 2008</td>
<td>Posted information and consent letters to school principals.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>April 2008</td>
<td>Posted information, consent letters and questionnaires to teachers.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>April – May 2008</td>
<td>Gathered and collated data.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Action Cycle Two</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>May 2008</td>
<td>Via snowball sampling, identified 10% of the teachers from the 225 schools will be invited to participate in the interviews.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>June - July 2008</td>
<td>Conducted interviews and collated data.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>August – October 2008</td>
<td>Transcribed interviews and collated interview data.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Action Cycle Three</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>January/February 2009</td>
<td>Submitted ethics</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>February/March 2009</td>
<td>Trialled PL and data collecting instruments</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>March 2009</td>
<td>Sent letters and consent forms to Principals</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3rd April 2009</td>
<td>Consent forms were to be returned by Principals</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>April/May 2009</td>
<td>Sent letters and consent forms to teachers and parents</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22nd May, 2009</td>
<td>Consent forms were to be returned by teachers and parents</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21st June – 2nd July 2009</td>
<td>Teachers administered pre-intervention questionnaires and researchers conducted pre-intervention student interviews.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20th June 2009</td>
<td>Conducted Orff-Schulwerk Professional Learning</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20th July – 13th September 2009 (Weeks 1-8 of Term 3)</td>
<td>Teachers conducted weekly Orff-Schulwerk intervention and researcher maintained regular weekly email contact and telephone availability</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14th September – 25th September 2009 (Weeks 9 and 10 of Term 3)</td>
<td>Teachers administered post-intervention questionnaires and researcher conducted post-intervention student interviews</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14th September – 20th September 2009</td>
<td>Researcher conducted post-intervention teacher interviews via telephone</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21st September, 2009</td>
<td>Focus group meeting conducted at Edith Cowan University, Mt. Lawley, WA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>September 2009 – November 2012</td>
<td>Preparation of thesis for examination</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Appendix F: Action Cycle One and Two Letter to Research and Planning Unit.

30th May 2008

Research Project – The potential of songs as a pedagogical tool for the effective teaching of Italian in a crowded Western Australian Primary School Curriculum

Attention: The Research and Planning Unit – educational sector

To whom it may concern

My name is Annamaria Paolino and I am a Masters student at Edith Cowan University. I am also the Music, Italian, Health and Physical Education specialist at XXXXX Primary School. I am presently undertaking a study into the use of song as a pedagogical tool in teaching Italian in Western Australian primary schools. I plan to research how Italian teachers are currently using song during their lessons. My aim is to inform practice, refine and improve current pedagogical practice and to see if language teachers see connections between music and languages.

It is my intention to administer a short 10 minute questionnaire to all Italian teachers in primary schools across Western Australia. Participation is voluntary however, I have strongly urged teachers to participate and become an advocate for the survival of these learning areas. In the course of my study I will be collecting information about participants from the questionnaire. Later, I will be conducting interviews with 10% of the study participants. Interview participants will be selected via snowball sampling and expression of interest. Interviews will last approximately 30 minutes. I would like to tape the interviews and provide participating teachers with a summary, which they will able to edit to their satisfaction. Interviews will be scheduled at a mutually convenient time and place, to allow for maximum privacy. If the school is a significant distance away the interview will be conducted by telephone.

Attached to the letter are copies of the questionnaire, the interview questions, letter and consent form to participants, letter and consent form to school principals.

All information collected will be treated with the strictest confidence. No person or school will be mentioned in my thesis by name or in such a way that they may be identified. No other person will have access to any data collected. Participants may withdraw from the study at any time. The educational sector will receive a final copy of my thesis for their records. All data collected will be archived for 5 years at Edith Cowan University.

Upon receiving educational sector principal approval participating schools and Italian teachers will be sent letters and asked to sign a letter of consent.

This project has been approved by the Edith Cowan University Human Research Ethics Committee. If you have any concerns or complaints about the research project and you wish to speak to an independent person, you may contact Kim Gifkins, Research Ethics Officer, Edith Cowan University on 6304 2170, or email research.ethics@ecu.edu.au.

The aim of this project is to investigate and inform current teaching practice. I hope that you will consent to your involvement. I look forward to your anticipate response. For further information, my supervisors or I can be contacted on the addresses below.

Yours sincerely

Annamaria Paolino

G.W. Lummi

G.M. Lowe

annamarp@student.ecu.au

g.lummis@ecu.edu.au

g.lowe@ecu.edu.au
Appendix G: Action Cycle One and Two Letter to Principals.

16th July 2008
Attention: The Principal
Dear Sir/Madam

My name is Annamaria Paolino and I am a Masters student at Edith Cowan University. I am also the Music, Italian, Health and Physical Education specialist at XXXXX Primary School. I am presently undertaking a study into the use of song as a pedagogical tool in teaching Italian in Western Australian primary schools. I plan to research how Italian teachers are currently using song during their lessons. My aim is to inform practice, refine and improve current pedagogical practice and to see if language teachers see connections between music and languages. Your schools participation in this study would be greatly appreciated.

It is my intention to administer a questionnaire to all Italian teachers in primary schools across Western Australia. Participation is voluntary. In the course of my study I will be collecting information about participants from the questionnaire. Later, I will be conducting interviews with 10% of the study participants. Interview participants will be selected via snowball sampling and expression of interest. Interviews will last approximately 30 minutes. I would like to audio tape the interviews and provide your Italian teacher with a summary, which they will able to edit to their satisfaction. Interviews will be scheduled at a mutually convenient time and place, to allow for maximum privacy. If your school is a significant distance away the interview will be conducted by telephone. The questionnaire takes only 10 minutes to complete. Please find a copy of the questionnaire and the interview questions attached to the letter.

All information collected will be treated with the strictest confidence. No person or school will be mentioned in my thesis by name or in such a way that they may be identified. Only the researcher will have access to any data collected. You may withdraw from the study at any time. When received, your teacher’s questionnaire and consent form will be numbered. The consent form will be detached from the questionnaire and placed in a separate box to maintain anonymity. The results will be entered numerically onto a spread sheet. Names of teachers and schools are not to be written on the questionnaires nor on the envelopes. This numerical coding system ensures that data can be re-identified with ease should a participant wish to withdraw from the study. At the conclusion of the study The educational sector will receive a final copy of my thesis for their records. All data collected will be archived for 5 years at Edith Cowan University. At the end of this time frame all data will be destroyed. Hard copies will be shredded and any electronic data will be deleted or wiped over.

If you are willing to have your school and Italian teacher participate in the study, please sign the attached principal’s consent statement and return it in the stamped, self-addressed envelope before Friday, 1st August. Please do not administer the questionnaire to your Italian teacher. When I receive your consent I will send the questionnaire and a separate consent form to your teacher.

Please feel welcome to email me or my supervisors, Dr Geoffrey W. Lummis and Mr Geoffrey M. Lowe to discuss the study. I would be happy to meet with you to discuss any queries which you may have. I believe that proactive studies such as the one I am undertaking are vital to the survival of these two important learning areas. This project has been approved by the Edith Cowan University Human Research Ethics Committee. If you have any concerns or complaints about the research project and you wish to speak to an independent person, you may contact Kim Gifkins, Research Ethics Officer, Edith Cowan University on 6304 2170, or email research.ethics@ecu.edu.au.

Yours sincerely
Annamaria Paolino

Dr G.W. Lummis
(Principal Supervisor)

Dr G.M. Lowe
(Asst. Supervisor)

annamarp@student.ecu.au
g.lummis@ecu.edu.au
g.lowe@ecu.edu.au

315
Appendix H: Action Cycle One and Two Principal Consent Form.

I _________________________(the Principal) have read and understood the information written in the attached letter and I agree for my school to participate in the study.

I understand that:
- I may withdraw the school from the study at any time.
- That the school’s Italian teacher may be asked to participate in an interview at a later stage.
- Should the school’s Italian teacher choose to take part in the interview stage their discussion with the researcher will be audio recorded.
- All data collected will be treated with the strictest confidence.
- The research data collected will be published however, the school nor the teacher will be mentioned in the thesis by name or in such a way that may be identifiable.

Name of principal: ________________________________

Name of school: ______________________________________

School District: _______________________________________

Signed: ___________________ Date: _________________

Researcher:

I have provided information about the research to the above named research participant and believe that he/she understands what is involved.

Name of researcher: Annamaria Paolino

Signed: ___________________ Date: _________________

Name of principal supervisor: Dr G. W. Lummis

Signed: ___________________ Date: _________________

Name of associate supervisor: Dr G. M. Lowe

Signed: ___________________ Date: _________________
Appendix I: Action Cycle One and Two Letter to Teacher Participants.

4th August 2008
Dear Colleague

I am a Masters student at Edith Cowan University. I am also the Music, Italian, Health and Physical Education specialist at XXXXX Primary School and the Music teacher at XXXXXX. I am presently undertaking a study into the use of song as a pedagogical tool in teaching Italian in Western Australian primary schools. I am aware as you are of the current difficulties being experienced in teaching at the moment and the purposed push by the Australian Primary Principals Association to remove these two vital learning areas for the curriculum. I plan to study how Italian teachers are currently using song during their lessons. Your participation in this study would be greatly appreciated.

It is my intention to administer a questionnaire to all Italian teachers in primary schools across Western Australia. Participation is voluntary. In the course of my study I will be collecting information about participants from the questionnaire. Later, I will be conducting interviews with 10% of the study participants. Interview participants will be selected via snowball sampling and expression of interest. If you are interested and would like to participate in this part of the study, please complete the contact details section on the consent form. Interviews will last approximately 30 minutes. I would like to audio tape the interviews and provide you with a summary, which you will able to edit to your satisfaction. Interviews will be scheduled at a mutually convenient time and place, to allow for maximum privacy. If your school is a significant distance away the interview will be conducted by telephone.

The questionnaire takes only 10 minutes to complete and can be returned to me in the stamped, self-addressed envelope enclosed. It would be greatly appreciated if you could please return completed consent forms and questionnaires before Friday, 22nd August.

All information collected will be treated with the strictest confidence. All data collected will be archived for 5 years at Edith Cowan University. At the end of this time frame all data will be destroyed. Hard copies will be shredded and any electronic data will be deleted or wiped over. No person or school will be mentioned in my thesis by name or in such a way that they may be identified. Only the researcher will have access to any data collected. You may withdraw from the study at any time. When received, your questionnaire and consent will be numbered. The consent form will be detached from the questionnaire and placed in a separate box to maintain anonymity. The results will be entered numerically onto a spread sheet. Names of teachers and schools are not to be written on the questionnaires nor on the envelopes. This numerical coding system ensures that data can be re-identified with ease should a participant wish to withdraw from the study.

If you are willing to participate in the study, please sign the attached statement and return it together with the completed questionnaire. Please do not write your name or your schools name on the questionnaire sheets.

Please feel welcome to email me or my supervisors to discuss the study. I would be happy to meet with you to discuss any queries which you may have. I believe that studies such as the one I am undertaking are vital to the survival and advocacy of these two important learning areas.

This project has been approved by the Edith Cowan University Human Research Ethics Committee. If you have any concerns or complaints about the research project and you wish to speak to an independent person, you may contact Kim Gifkins, Research Ethics Officer, Edith Cowan University on 6304 2170, or email research.ethics@ecu.edu.au.

Yours sincerely
Annamaria Paolino
annamarp@student.ecu.edu.au

Dr G. W. Lummis (Principal Supervisor)
g.lummis@ecu.edu.au

Dr G. M. Lowe (Ass. Supervisor)
g.lowe@ecu.edu.au

317
Appendix J: Action Cycle One and Two Consent Form For Teacher Participants.

I ______________________ have read and understood the information written in the attached letter and I agree to participate in the study.

I understand that:

- I may withdraw from the study at any time.
- That I may be asked to participate in an interview at a later stage.
- If I choose to take part in the interview stage my discussion with the researcher will be audio recorded.
- All data collected will be treated with the strictest confidence.
- The research data collected will be published however, I nor the school at which I teach will be mentioned in the thesis by name or in such a way that may be identifiable.

Name of participant: ______________________________________

Name of school/s where you teach Italian: _________________

________________________________________________________

Signed: _________________________ Date: ________________

Researcher:

I have provided information about the research to the above named research participant and believe that he/she understands what is involved.

Name of researcher: Annamaria Paolino

Signed: _________________________ Date: ________________

EXPRESSION OF INTEREST

YES! I would like to participate in the interviews for this study. Please find my contact details below;

NAME __________________________________________

PHONE NUMBER (W) ____________________________

PHONE NUMBER (H) ____________________________

PHONE NUMBER (M) ____________________________

EMAIL _______________________

__________________________________________
Appendix K: Action Cycle One Teacher Questionnaire.

Investigation project: The potential of songs as a pedagogical tool for the effective teaching of Italian in a crowded Western Australian Primary School Curriculum

Questionnaire #__________                            Date ____________________

Teacher Questionnaire

The purpose of this questionnaire is to gather data concerning current practice on how songs are being used by Italian teachers in Western Australia’s primary schools.

If you teach at more than one school, please only complete the questionnaire ONCE. However, please write how many schools you teach at INCLUDING THIS ONE on the line. _______

Please try to answer as truthfully and completely as possible, explaining your answer whenever necessary.

Thank you for your participation.

1. Gender (Please tick):  
   
<p>| | | | | | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Male</td>
<td>Female</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

2. Your age bracket (Please tick):  
   
<p>| | | | | | | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

3. For which sector do you teach? (Please tick more than one if necessary)  
   
<p>| | | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Government</td>
<td>Catholic</td>
<td>Independent</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

4. Is your school an:  
   
<p>| | | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>All boys schools</td>
<td>All girls school</td>
<td>Co-educational school</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

5. Which years do you teach? : (Please tick more than one if necessary)  
   
<p>| | | | | | | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>PP</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

6. Where is your school located? (Please tick)  
   
<p>| | | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>City</td>
<td>Country</td>
<td>Remote</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
7. Do you teach (Please tick)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Classroom</th>
<th>Distance Education</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

8. Do you teach (Please tick)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Full Time</th>
<th>Part Time</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

9. Your years of teaching experience (Please tick)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>1-5</th>
<th>6-10</th>
<th>11-15</th>
<th>16-20</th>
<th>20+</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

10. Do you use music during your Italian lessons? (Please tick)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Yes</th>
<th>No</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

11. With which year level do you use music the most? (Please tick more than one if necessary)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>PP</th>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>4</th>
<th>5</th>
<th>6</th>
<th>7</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

12. What kind of music do you use? (Please tick more than one if necessary)

- Authentic (true Italian music sung by Italian performers)
- Contemporary (Modern)
- Didactic (Songs for teaching purposes)
- Folk (traditional, historical)
- Other (Please describe)

13. Where do you get your music resources from? (Please tick more than one if necessary)

The Language Bookshop
In-text
On line,
Resource library,
Purchase from local CD Store,
Italy,
Other (Please list)
14. Do your students respond positively when you use music during your Italian lessons? (Please tick)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Always</th>
<th>Sometimes</th>
<th>Rarely</th>
<th>Never</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

15. What kinds of activities do you use when you use music during your Italian lessons? (Please tick)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Worksheet</th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Singing</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dancing</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other (Please describe)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

16. Do you use music in your classroom to; (Please tick)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Teach new concepts (Colour, seasons)</th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>To supplement existing knowledge (theme work, revision)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teach cultural aspects (dances, greetings)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other (Please explain)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

17. Do you consider music to be a useful language learning tool? (Please tick)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Yes</th>
<th>Sometimes</th>
<th>No</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

18. Did your pre-service training include music education units? (Please tick)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Yes</th>
<th>No</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

19. Does your school have a music specialist? (Please tick)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Yes</th>
<th>No</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

20. For what purpose do you use music during your Italian lessons? (Please tick)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Motivation</th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Language learning</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Create a relaxed classroom atmosphere</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>To engage the students</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>To teach cultural elements</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other (Please describe)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

21. Do you encourage your students to move and physically respond to the music used during your lesson? (Please tick)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Always</th>
<th>Sometimes</th>
<th>Rarely</th>
<th>Never</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
22. During a school term, how often would you use music during your Italian lessons? (Please tick)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Every lesson</th>
<th>Often</th>
<th>Rarely</th>
<th>Never</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

23. Rate your confidence in your ability to use music in the classroom. (Please tick)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Very Confident</th>
<th>OK</th>
<th>No Confidence</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

24. Do you play or use a musical instrument in the classroom? (Please tick)

| Yes | No |

25. When teaching a song or dance during a lesson, do you; (Please tick more than one if necessary)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Play the CD and children learn via that?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Sing the song yourself and students echo?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Introduce the words first to the students, then the song?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Introduce the words by saying them and clapping the rhythm patterns and then put them to the song?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Introduce actions and rhythms first, then add the words and finally add the music?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other? (Please describe)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

26. Do you enjoy music? (Please tick)

| Yes | No |

27. How did you learn Italian? (Please tick)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Native speaker (Born there)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Learned via my parents/family</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Studied Italian</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other? (Please explain)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

28. If you studied Italian please indicate the highest level you studied at;

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Secondary</th>
<th>Tertiary</th>
<th>TAFE</th>
<th>DETWA Intensive Language Courses</th>
<th>Other</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

322
29. Are you; (Please tick)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Italian born?</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Australian born of Italian background?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Australian born of non - Italian background?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Not Australian born</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Appendix L: Action Cycle Two Teacher Interview Questions.

A. Why might an Italian teacher use songs in the primary classroom?
B. How might songs enhance Italian acquisition in a primary classroom?
C. Are songs important tools in helping primary students learn Italian? Why?
D. How might songs help primary students learn Italian?
E. What criteria might be important when choosing songs for use during primary Italian lessons?
F. Which similar features are shared by both music and Italian? Explain.
G. What type of music resource would increase your use of music/song as a pedagogical tool for teaching Italian?
H. What would help you to use music/song more effectively in the classroom?
I. What musical skills do you feel you could improve or learn to help you to use music/song more effectively in the classroom?
Appendix M: Action Cycle Three Research and Planning Unit Letter.

26th January 2009

Research Project – The potential of the Orff Schulwerk approach as a pedagogical tool for the teaching of Italian to Western Australian Primary upper primary school students

Attention: The Research and Planning Unit – Sector name

To whom it may concern

My name is Annamaria Paolino and I am a PhD student at Edith Cowan University. I am also the Music and Italian specialist at XXXXX Primary School and the Music specialist at the XXXXX. Last year, as a Masters student, I conducted research into the use of song as a pedagogical tool in teaching Italian in Western Australian primary schools. I researched how Italian teachers were currently using song during their lessons. My aim was to gain information on current pedagogical practice and to see if language teachers see connections between music and languages. Due to the success of that study the University has deemed it worthy of an upgrade so I can further develop and enhance my study. This second phase of my study builds upon the data gathered to date and aims to provide primary Italian teachers with a strategy to improve, inform and refine their practice in upper primary classes.

It is my intention to conduct a professional development session with all the Italian teachers who agreed to participate further in my Masters study, of which there are 16. This PD will be on the Orff Schulwerk approach a musical approach, its principles and how to apply them in the language classroom. Upon returning to school, the teacher will be required to use this approach in one of their upper primary classes for a period of 8 weeks. Prior to the intervention taking place the teacher will administer pre-intervention questionnaires to all the students in the intervention class. These questionnaires will be supplied by me. Prior to the intervention I will also conduct interviews with 3 students from the intervention class. These interviews will be approximately 20 minutes long and will be conducted via telephone at a mutually convenient time and place, to allow for maximum privacy. These interviews will be audio recorded. These participants will be selected randomly. I will ask the Italian teacher for the names of the 1st, 7th and 14th student on the class roll. After the intervention has taken place the teacher will administer post-intervention questionnaires to all the students in the intervention class. Post intervention, I will re-interview the 3 students from the intervention class. Again, the interviews will be recorded. During the period of intervention the Italian teacher will receive short weekly telephone calls from me. These telephone conversations will also be recorded. The aim of these is to provide support and guidance to the teacher during the intervention phase. At the conclusion of the intervention the researcher will conduct interviews with the teacher participants. These interviews, of approximately 30 minutes will be audio recorded. The interviews will be conducted via telephone or face to face, depending on distance, at a mutually convenient time and place, to allow for maximum privacy. All interviews will be transcribed by the researcher. Once transcribed the interviews will be forwarded to the teachers and the students, so they can read them and edit, if necessary.

Attached to the letter are copies of the questionnaires, the pre and post interview questions for students, interview questions for teachers, letter and consent forms to teacher participants, school principals, parents of all the participating students, a copy of my police clearance and my working with children documents.

All information collected will be treated with the strictest confidence. No person or school will be mentioned in my thesis by name or in such a way that they may be identified. No other person will have access to any data collected. Participants may withdraw from the study at any time. The sector name will receive a final copy of my thesis for their records. All data collected will be archived for 5 years at Edith Cowan University.
Upon receiving sector name ethics approval participating schools and Italian teachers will be sent letters and be asked to sign the letters of consent.

This project has been approved by the Edith Cowan University Human Research Ethics Committee. If you have any concerns or complaints about the research project and you wish to speak to an independent person, you may contact Kim Gifkins, Research Ethics Officer, Edith Cowan University on 6304 2170, or email research.ethics@ecu.edu.au.

The aim of this project is to inform and enhance current teaching practice. I hope that you will consent to your involvement. I look forward to your anticipated response. For further information, my supervisors or I can be contacted on the addresses below.

Yours sincerely
Annamaria Paolino
annamarp@student.ecu.au

Dr G. W. Lummis
(Principal Supervisor)
g.lummis@ecu.edu.au

Dr G. M. Lowe
(Ass. Supervisor)
g.lowe@ecu.edu.au
Appendix N: Action Cycle Three Principal Letter of Consent.

21st April 2009

Attention: The Principal

Research Project – The potential of the Orff Schulwerk approach as a pedagogical tool for the teaching of Italian to Western Australian Primary upper primary school students

Dear Sir/Madam

My name is Annamaria Paolino and I am a PhD student at Edith Cowan University. I am also the Music and Italian specialist at XXXXX Primary School and the Music specialist at the XXXXXX. Last year, as a Masters student, I conducted research into the use of song as a pedagogical tool in teaching Italian in Western Australian primary schools. I researched how Italian teachers were currently using song during their lessons. My aim was to inform practice, refine and improve current pedagogical practice and to see if language teachers see connections between music and languages. Due to the success of that study the University has deemed it worthy of an upgrade so I can further develop and enhance my study. This second phase of my study builds upon the data gathered to date and aims to provide primary Italian teachers with a strategy to improve, inform and refine their practice in upper primary classes.

It is my intention to conduct a professional development session to all the Italian teachers who agreed to participate further in my Masters study, of which the teacher at your school was one of 16. This PD will be on the Orff Schulwerk approach (a music approach), its principles and how to apply them in the language classroom. Upon returning to school, the teacher will be required to use this approach in one of their upper primary classes for a period of 8 weeks during Term 3. Prior to the intervention taking place the teacher will administer pre-intervention questionnaires to all the students in the intervention class. These questionnaires will be supplied by me. Prior to the intervention I will also conduct interviews with 3 students from the intervention class. These interviews will be approximately 20 minutes long and will be conducted via telephone at a mutually convenient time and place, to allow for maximum privacy. These interviews will be audio recorded. These participants will be selected randomly. I will ask the Italian teacher for the names of the 1st, 7th and 14th student on the class roll. After the intervention has taken place the Italian teacher will administer post-intervention questionnaires to all the students in the intervention class. Post intervention, I will re-interview the 3 students from the intervention class. Again these interviews will be audio recorded. During the period of intervention the Italian teacher will receive short weekly telephone calls from me. The aim of these is to provide support and guidance to the teacher during the intervention phase. At the conclusion of the intervention I will conduct interviews with the teacher participants. These interviews, of approximately 30 minutes will be audio recorded. The interviews will be conducted via telephone or face to face, depending on distance, at a mutually convenient time and place, to allow for maximum privacy. All interviews will be transcribed by the researcher. Once transcribed the interviews will be forwarded to the teachers and students, so they can read them and edit, if necessary.

The student questionnaire takes only 15 minutes to complete. Please find a copy of the questionnaire and the interview questions attached to the letter.

All information collected will be treated with the strictest confidence. No person or school will be mentioned in my thesis by name or in such a way that they may be identified. Only I will have access to any data collected. You may withdraw from the study at any time. When received, your student’s questionnaire and consent form will be numbered. The consent form will be detached from the questionnaire and placed in a separate box to maintain anonymity. The results will be entered numerically onto a spread sheet. Names of teachers, schools and students are not to be written on the questionnaires. This numerical coding system ensures that data can be re-identified with ease should a participant wish to withdraw from the study. To further ensure confidentiality, all participating school, teachers and students involved
in the interviews will receive a pseudonym. At the conclusion of the study sector name will receive a final copy of my thesis for their records. All data collected will be archived for 5 years at Edith Cowan University. At the end of this time frame all data will be destroyed. Hard copies will be shredded and any electronic data will be deleted or wiped over.

For your information I have enclosed the following documents:

- pre and post intervention student questionnaires
- pre and post intervention student interview questions
- post intervention teacher interview questions
- teacher consent form
- parent and student information letter
- parent and student consent form
- receipt of payment for my Application for a Working with Children Check. (As soon as I receive my card I will copy it and forward it to you)

If you are willing to have your school, students and Italian teacher participate in the study, please sign the attached statement and return it in the stamped, self-addressed envelope before the 15th May 2009. **Please do not give the questionnaire to your Italian teacher, administer it to your students or forward any information to parents. When I receive your consent I will send the questionnaire and a separate consent form to your teacher together with consent forms and an information letter for parents of students involved in the study.**

Please feel welcome to email me or my supervisors, Dr Geoffrey W. Lummis and Dr Geoffrey M. Lowe to discuss the study. I would be happy to meet with you to discuss any queries which you may have.

This project has been approved by the Edith Cowan University Human Research Ethics Committee. If you have any concerns or complaints about the research project and you wish to speak to an independent person, you may contact Kim Gifkins, Research Ethics Officer, Edith Cowan University on 6304 2170, or email research.ethics@ecu.edu.au.

Yours sincerely

Annamaria Paolino                              Dr G. W. Lummis             Dr G. M. Lowe
annamarp@student.ecu.au                         (Principal Supervisor)     (Ass. Supervisor)
g.lummis@ecu.edu.au                             g.lowe@ecu.edu.au
Appendix O: Action Cycle Three Principal Consent Form.

I _________________________ have read and understood the information written in the attached letter and I agree for my school to participate in the study.

I understand that:

- I may withdraw the school from the study at any time.
- That the school’s Italian teacher will be asked to participate in a PD session.
- That the school’s Italian teacher will be required to implement an intervention in 1 senior Italian class.
- Should the school’s Italian teacher choose to take part in the project they will participate in regular interviews with the researcher which will be audio recorded.
- All data collected will be treated with the strictest confidence.
- The research data collected will be published however, the school nor the teacher will be mentioned in the thesis by name or in such a way that may be identifiable.

Name of principal: ________________________________

Name of school: ________________________________

Signed: __________________________ Date: ______________

Researcher:

I have provided information about the research to the above named research participant and believe that he/she understands what is involved.

Name of researcher: Annamaria Paolino

Signed: __________________________ Date: ______________

Name of principal supervisor: Dr G. W. Lummis

Signed: __________________________ Date: ______________

Name of associate supervisor: Dr G. M. Lowe

Signed: __________________________ Date: ______________
Appendix P: Action Cycle Three Letter to Teacher Participants.

21\textsuperscript{st} April 2009

Research Project – The potential of the Orff Schulwerk approach as a pedagogical tool for the teaching of Italian to Western Australian Primary upper primary school students

Dear Colleague

My name is Annamaria Paolino and I am a PhD student at Edith Cowan University. I am also the Music and Italian specialist at XXXXX Primary School and the Music specialist at the XXXXX. Last year, as a Masters student, I conducted research into the use of song as a pedagogical tool in teaching Italian in Western Australian primary schools. I researched how Italian teachers were currently using song during their lessons. My aim was to inform practice, refine and improve current pedagogical practice and to see if language teachers see connections between music and languages. Due to the success of that study the University has deemed it worthy of an upgrade so I can further develop and enhance my study. This second phase of my study builds upon the data gathered to date and aims to provide primary Italian teachers with a strategy to improve, inform and refine their practice in upper primary classes.

It is my intention to conduct a professional development session with all the Italian teachers who agreed to participate further in my Masters study, of which you were one of 16. This PD will be on the Orff Schulwerk (a musical approach) approach, its principles and how to apply them in the classroom. The PD will be conducted on Saturday 20\textsuperscript{th} June 2009 and will run form 9am – 1pm approximately, with lunch, stationary and morning tea provided. Upon returning to school, you will be required to use this approach in one of your upper primary classes for a period of 8 weeks during Term 3. Prior to the intervention taking place you will be asked to administer pre-intervention questionnaires to all the students in the intervention class. These questionnaires will be supplied by me. Prior to the intervention I will also conduct interviews with 3 students form the intervention class. These interviews will be approximately 20 minutes long and will be conducted via telephone at a mutually convenient time and place, to allow for maximum privacy. These interviews will be audio recorded. These participants will be selected randomly by me. I will ask you for the names of the 1\textsuperscript{st}, 7\textsuperscript{th} and 14\textsuperscript{th} student on the class roll. After the intervention has taken place you will be asked to administer post-intervention questionnaires to all the students in the intervention class. Post intervention, I will re-interview the 3 students from the intervention class. Again, these interviews will be audio recorded. During the period of intervention you will receive short weekly telephone calls from me. These also will be audio recorded. The aim of these is to provide support and guidance to you during the intervention phase. At the conclusion of the intervention I will interview you. These interviews, of approximately 30 minutes will be audio recorded. The interviews will be conducted via telephone or face to face, depending on distance, at a mutually convenient time and place, to allow for maximum privacy. All the interviews will be transcribed by me. Once transcribed the interviews will be forwarded to the teachers and students, so they can read them and edited, if necessary.

The student questionnaire takes only 15 minutes to complete and can be returned to me in the stamped, self-addressed envelope enclosed. It would be greatly appreciated if you could please return your completed consent form before Friday 5\textsuperscript{th} June 2009 and the signed student/parent consent forms before Friday, 19\textsuperscript{th} June. Pre intervention questionnaires will need to be completed and returned to me before Friday, 1\textsuperscript{st} July. Post intervention questionnaires will need to be completed and returned to me by Friday, 25\textsuperscript{th} September.

All information collected will be treated with the strictest confidence. All data collected will be archived for 5 years at Edith Cowan University. At the end of this time frame all data will be destroyed. Hard copies will be shredded and any electronic data will be deleted or wiped over. No person or school will be mentioned in my thesis by name or in such a way that they may be identified. Only I will have access to any data collected. You may withdraw from the study at any time. When received, your student questionnaires questionnaire and consent forms
will be numbered. The consent form will be detached from the questionnaire and placed in a separate box to maintain anonymity. The results will be entered numerically onto a spread sheet. Names of teachers, schools and students are not to be written on the questionnaires. This numerical coding system ensures that data can be re-identified with ease should a participant wish to withdraw from the study.

If you are willing to participate in the study, please sign the attached statement and return it in the envelope provided.

Please feel welcome to email me or my supervisors to discuss the study. I would be happy to meet with you to discuss any queries which you may have.

This project has been approved by the Edith Cowan University Human Research Ethics Committee. If you have any concerns or complaints about the research project and you wish to speak to an independent person, you may contact Kim Gifkins, Research Ethics Officer, Edith Cowan University on 6304 2170, or email research.ethics@ecu.edu.au.

Yours sincerely

Annamaria Paolino
annamarp@student.ecu.au

Dr G. W. Lummis
(g.lummis@ecu.edu.au)
(Principal Supervisor)

Dr G. M. Lowe
(g.lowe@ecu.edu.au)
(Asst. Supervisor)
Appendix Q: Action Cycle Three Consent form for Teacher Participants.

I _________________________ have read and understood the information written in the attached letter and I agree to participate in the study.

I understand that:

- I may withdraw from the study at any time.
- That I will receive weekly telephone calls from the researcher which will be audio recorded.
- All data collected will be treated with the strictest confidence.
- The research data collected will be published however, I nor the school at which I teach will be mentioned in the thesis by name or in such a way that may be identifiable.
- I am required to attend a PD session and administer data collecting instruments on behalf of the researcher.
- I am required to implement the Orff-Schulwerk approach for a period of 8 weeks.

Name of participant: __________________________________________

Signed: ______________________  Date: ______________________

Researcher:

I have provided information about the research to the above named research participant and believe that he/she understands what is involved.

Name of researcher: Annamaria Paolino

Signed: ______________________  Date: ______________________
Appendix R: Action Cycle Three Letter To Parents/Guardians and Students.

11th March 2009

Research Project – The potential of the Orff Schulwerk approach as a pedagogical tool for the teaching of Italian to Western Australian Primary upper primary school students

Dear Parents

My name is Annamaria Paolino and I am a PhD student at Edith Cowan University. Last year, as a Masters student, I conducted research into the use of song as a pedagogical tool in teaching Italian in Western Australian primary schools. I researched how Italian teachers were currently using song during their lessons. My aim was to gain information on current pedagogical practice and to see if language teachers see connections between music and languages. Due to the success of that study the University has deemed it worthy of an upgrade so I can further develop and enhance my study. This second phase of my study builds upon the data gathered to date and aims to provide primary Italian teachers with a strategy to improve, inform and refine their practice in upper primary classes.

During Term 3 of 2009 the Italian teacher at your school will be trialling a new teaching innovation in your child’s Italian class for a period of 8 weeks. Prior to the intervention taking place the teacher will administer pre-intervention questionnaires to all the students in the intervention class. These questionnaires will be supplied by me. Prior to the intervention I will also conduct interviews with 3 students from the intervention class. These interviews will be approximately 20 minutes long and will be conducted via telephone at a mutually convenient time and place, to allow for maximum privacy. These interviews will be audio recorded. These participants will be selected randomly. I will ask the Italian teacher for the names of the 1st, 7th and 14th student on the class roll. After the intervention has taken place the teacher will administer post-intervention questionnaires to all the students in the intervention class. Post intervention, I will re-interview the 3 students from the intervention class. Again, the interviews will be via telephone and recorded. Telephone interviews will be conducted during school hours at a convenient time for the student and the school.

Attached to the letter is a consent form for parent/caregivers as well as a letter and consent form for your child. Please read it and discuss it with your child. If you would like to participate in the project please sign and date the forms attached and return them both to your Italian teacher before Friday, 22nd May 2009. Please note, if you do not wish your child to participate in the study or if you do not want them to participate in the interview section of the study please indicate this on the form.

All information collected will be treated with the strictest confidence. No person or school will be mentioned in my thesis by name or in such a way that they may be identified. No other person will have access to any data collected. Participants may withdraw from the study at any time. All data collected will be archived for 5 years at Edith Cowan University.

This project has been approved by the Edith Cowan University Human Research Ethics Committee and has been endorsed by your school’s Principal and Italian teacher. If you have any concerns or complaints about the research project and you wish to speak to an independent person, you may contact Kim Gifkins, Research Ethics Officer, Edith Cowan University on 6304 2170, or email research.ethics@ecu.edu.au.

The aim of this project is to inform and enhance current teaching practice. I hope that you will consent to your involvement. I look forward to your anticipated response.

Yours sincerely

Annamaria Paolino                              Dr G. W. Lummis             Dr G. M. Lowe
annamarp@student.ecu.au                      g.lummis@ecu.edu.au        g.lowe@ecu.edu.au

(Principal Supervisor)       (Ass. Supervisor)
Appendix S: Action Cycle Three Consent Form for Parents/Caregivers and Students

Student:
- I have received information about this research project.
- I understand the purpose of this project and my involvement in it.
- I understand that I may withdraw from the project at any stage.
- I understand that I may be asked to participate in telephone interviews.
- I understand that these interviews may be audio recorded.
- I understand that I will not be identified and my personal comments/thoughts will remain confidential.

Name of Student: ________________________________________
Signed: ___________________ Date: ________________________

Parent/Caregiver:
- I have received information about this research project.
- I understand that my child may not directly benefit by taking part in the research.
- I understand that while information gained in the study may be published, my child or I will not be identified by name and all individual information will remain confidential.
- I understand that my child may be asked to participate in telephone interviews.
- I understand that these telephone interviews will be audio recorded.
- I understand that I can withdraw my child from the study at any stage up until the end of the collection of data.
- I understand that there will be no payment for my child taking part in the study.

I give/do not give consent for my child to participate in the study.

Name of Parent/Caregiver: ________________________________________
Signed: ___________________ Date: ________________________

I give/do not give consent for my child to participate in the interview section of the study.

Name of Parent/Caregiver: ________________________________________
Signed: ___________________ Date: ________________________

Researcher:
I have provided information about the research to the research participant and believe that he/she understands what is involved.
Researcher’s signature and date: ________________________________
Appendix T: Action Cycle Three Student Attitude Questionnaire

Pre-Intervention.

1. How old are you? (Please tick)

| 11 | 12 | 13 |

2. Are you M or F? (Please tick)

| Male | Female |

3. How long have you been at your school? (Please tick)

| 1 year | 2 years | 3 years | 4 years | 5 years | 6 years | 7 years | 8 years |

4. How long have you been learning Italian? (Please tick)

| <1 year | 1 year | 2 years | 3 years | 4 years | 5 years | 6 years | 7 years | 8 years | > 8 years |

5. Do you like learning Italian? (Please tick)

| Yes | Sometimes | No |

6. Do you think you are good at Italian? (Please tick)

| Yes | OK | No |

7. What do you enjoy the most about learning Italian? (Please tick more than one if you need to)

| Speaking | Reading | Writing | Listening | Culture | Other |

Other (please write):______________________________

8. What do you enjoy the least about learning Italian? (Please tick more than one if you need to)

| Speaking | Reading | Writing | Listening | Culture | Other |

Other (please write):______________________________

9. Does your teacher use music/songs during Italian lessons? (Please tick)

| Yes | Sometimes | No |
10. Do you like to when your teacher uses music/songs in Italian? (Please tick)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Yes</th>
<th>Sometimes</th>
<th>No</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

11. Do you enjoy activities where music/songs is used? (Please tick)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Yes</th>
<th>Sometimes</th>
<th>No</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

12. What do you think about the music/songs your teacher uses in Italian class? (Please tick)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>I like them</th>
<th>They are Ok</th>
<th>I don’t like them</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

13. What do you think about the activities that your teacher does using music/songs? (Please tick)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>I like them</th>
<th>They are Ok</th>
<th>I don’t like them</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

14. Do songs help you to learn Italian? (Please tick)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Yes</th>
<th>Sometimes</th>
<th>No</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

15. Do songs help you to remember Italian? (Please tick)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Yes</th>
<th>Sometimes</th>
<th>No</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

16. Do songs help you to speak Italian? (Please tick)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Yes</th>
<th>Sometimes</th>
<th>No</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

17. Do you enjoy singing? (Please tick)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Yes</th>
<th>Sometimes</th>
<th>No</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

18. Do you like music? (Please tick)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Yes</th>
<th>No</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

19. Are your parents Italian? (Please tick)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Yes</th>
<th>No</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
20. Where were you born? (Please tick)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Other</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Australia</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

If other, please write where you were born: _____________________

21. Can you speak another language fluently? (Please tick)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Yes</th>
<th>No</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

22. How do you like to learn? (Please tick more than one if you need to)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Watching</th>
<th>Writing</th>
<th>Reading</th>
<th>Drawing</th>
<th>Doing</th>
<th>Discussing</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

23. Do you play a musical instrument? (Please tick)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Yes</th>
<th>No</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

24. Have you learnt another language other than Italian? (Please tick)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Yes</th>
<th>No</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

If yes, please write the language you learnt: _____________________

25. Do you think it is important to learn another language? (Please tick)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Yes</th>
<th>No</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

26. How do you feel in Italian class? (Please tick)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Good</th>
<th>OK</th>
<th>Bad</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

27. Are you happy to go to Italian? (Please tick)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Yes</th>
<th>Sometimes</th>
<th>No</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

28. Why do you think your teacher uses music/songs during Italian lessons? (Please tick more than one if you need to)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>To help us learn</th>
<th>To help us remember</th>
<th>For fun</th>
<th>To teach us about Italy</th>
<th>To use up time</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

337
29. Do you like to; (Please tick)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Work by yourself</th>
<th>Work with others</th>
<th>Mix of both</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

30. Do you like: (Please tick more than one if you need to)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Maths</th>
<th>English</th>
<th>S &amp; E</th>
<th>T &amp; E</th>
<th>Art</th>
<th>Science</th>
<th>Health &amp; PE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

338
Appendix U: Action Cycle Three Student Telephone Interview Record Sheet

Pre-Intervention

Name: ___________ School: ___________ Date: ___________

Hello ____________ and thank you for being part of my research. My name is Annamaria and I am a PhD student at Edith Cowan University. In this interview I will be asking you questions about music, songs and Italian. I would really appreciate your honest opinions as they are really valuable to my research.

Can you please answer ‘yes or no’ to the following questions;

- Have you signed the consent form?
- Is there an adult present in the room with you?
- You are a student at ____________?
- The date is ________?
- The time is ________?
- Do you have any questions?
- I am recording this interview. Is that ok?

| 1. How do you think music/songs could be used during Italian lessons? |
| 2. Why might music/songs be used during Italian lessons? |
| 3. Do you think music/songs help you learn Italian? Why? |
| 4. Does your teacher use music/songs in the classroom? How? |
| 5. Do you like it when they do this? Why? |
| 6. Do you participate in these activities? Why? |
| 7. Do you like Italian? Why? |
| 8. Do you like music? Why? |
| 9. Do you like singing? Why? |
| 10. How do you feel when your teacher uses music/songs Italian? Why? |
| 11. What types of activities do you like doing in Italian? Why? |
Appendix V: Action Cycle Three Student Attitude Questionnaire.

Post-Intervention

1. Did you like learning Italian this term? (Please tick)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Yes</th>
<th>Sometimes</th>
<th>No</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

2. What did you enjoy the most about learning Italian this term? (Please tick more than one if you need to)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Speaking</th>
<th>Reading</th>
<th>Writing</th>
<th>Listening</th>
<th>Culture</th>
<th>Music</th>
<th>Other</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

Other (please write): ____________________________________________

3. What did you enjoy the least about learning Italian this term? (Please tick more than one if you need to)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Speaking</th>
<th>Reading</th>
<th>Writing</th>
<th>Listening</th>
<th>Culture</th>
<th>Music</th>
<th>Other</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

Other (please write): ____________________________________________

4. Did your teacher use music/songs during Italian lessons this term? (Please tick)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Yes</th>
<th>Sometimes</th>
<th>No</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

5. Did you like to when your teacher uses music/songs in Italian this term? (Please tick)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Yes</th>
<th>Sometimes</th>
<th>No</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

6. Did you enjoy activities where music/songs is used this term? (Please tick)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Yes</th>
<th>Sometimes</th>
<th>No</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

7. What did you think about the songs your teacher uses in Italian class this term? (Please tick)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>I liked them</th>
<th>They were Ok</th>
<th>I didn’t like them</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

8. What did you think about the activities that your teacher does using songs and music this term? (Please tick)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>I liked them</th>
<th>They were Ok</th>
<th>I didn’t like them</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

9. Did the songs help you to learn Italian this term? (Please tick)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Yes</th>
<th>Sometimes</th>
<th>No</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

10. Did the songs help you to remember Italian this term? (Please tick)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Yes</th>
<th>Sometimes</th>
<th>No</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
11. Did the songs help you to speak Italian this term? (Please tick)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Yes</th>
<th>Sometimes</th>
<th>No</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

12. Did you enjoy singing this term? (Please tick)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Yes</th>
<th>Sometimes</th>
<th>No</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

13. Did you like music used this term? (Please tick)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Yes</th>
<th>No</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

14. Did you play a musical instrument in Italian this term? (Please tick)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Yes</th>
<th>No</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

15. How do you feel in Italian class this term? (Please tick)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Good</th>
<th>OK</th>
<th>Bad</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

16. Were you happy to go to Italian this term? (Please tick)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Yes</th>
<th>Sometimes</th>
<th>No</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

19. Would you like your Italian teacher to continue doing these types of musical activities during Italian lessons? (Please tick)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Yes</th>
<th>Unsure</th>
<th>No</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

20. Which musical activities did you enjoy the most in Italian this term? (Please tick more than one if you need to)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Singing</th>
<th>Clapping</th>
<th>Moving</th>
<th>Saying</th>
<th>Playing</th>
<th>Creating</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
Appendix W: Action Cycle Three Student Telephone Interview Record Sheet

Post-Intervention.

Name: ____________ School: ______________ Date: ____________

Hello __________ and thank you for being part of my research. I interviewed you at the beginning of this term and I asked you about your thoughts about Music and Italian. Today, I have some more questions to ask you about that. Please be honest as your opinions are very valuable to my research. Can you please answer ‘yes’ or ‘no’ to the following questions.

1. Is there an adult in the room with you?
2. The date is ________?
3. The time is ________?
4. I am recording this interview, is that OK with you?
5. Do you have any questions?

1. Did you like the music/songs used? Why?
2. Did you like the musical activities? Why?
3. Did you participate in all the activities to the best of your ability?
4. Did these activities and songs help you to learn? How?
5. How did you feel during Italian lessons this term? Why?
6. Which musical activity did you enjoy the most? Why?
7. Why do you think your teacher used these different musical activities with you this term?
8. Would you like your teacher to continue doing these types of musical activities? Why?
9. Anything else to add? Share? Did you learn anything new?
Appendix X: Action Cycle Three Teacher Weekly Intervention Evaluation Form.

Name: ___________ School: _______________ Date: ___________
Week _____ of intervention

1. Were you able to conduct your Italian lesson this week?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Yes</th>
<th>No</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

Comment:

2. Were you able to conduct the intervention?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Yes</th>
<th>No</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

Comment:

3. How do you think it went?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Good</th>
<th>Ok</th>
<th>Poor</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

Comment:

4. How did your students respond?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Well</th>
<th>Ok</th>
<th>Poor</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

Comment:

5. Do you have any positives to share?

Comment:

6. Do you have any concerns?

Comment:

Name: _____________________ School: ____________________
Time: _________ Date: ___________

1. How successful do you think the Orff Schulwerk intervention was?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Extremely Successful</th>
<th>Successful</th>
<th>Ok</th>
<th>Limited Success</th>
<th>Not Successful</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

Comment:

2. Did it help you when using songs in the classroom?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Strongly Agree</th>
<th>Agree</th>
<th>Ok</th>
<th>Disagree</th>
<th>Strongly Disagree</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

Comment:

3. How did your students respond?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Positively</th>
<th>Ok</th>
<th>Not very positive</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

Comment:

4. Do you think you will continue to use this approach in your teaching?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Yes</th>
<th>Maybe</th>
<th>No</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

Comment:

5. Would you recommend it to others?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Strongly Recommend</th>
<th>Recommend</th>
<th>Maybe</th>
<th>Wouldn’t recommend</th>
<th>Strongly Not Recommend</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

Comment:

6. Have you enjoyed the research experience? Comment:
7. Did you enjoy the Orff-Schulwerk experience? Comment:
8. Did you find the PD helpful to help you to understand the Orff-Schulwerk approach? Comment:
9. Did the PD help you to implement the intervention? Comment:
10. Did the PD help you with your planning? Comment:
11. Do you think a musical background is essential to the Orff-Schulwerk approach? Comment:
12. Do you think that more Orff-Schulwerk PD would have helped you? Comment:
13. Would you like more Orff-Schulwerk PD? Comment:
14. Do you feel like you have learnt something new? Comment:
15. Was the weekly feedback form helpful in your self-reflection? Comment:
16. What did you discover from your self-reflection? Comment:
17. Do you think you had enough support? Comment:
18. What could I have done more? Comment:
19. How could the intervention be improved? Comment:
20. Would you participate in another research project? Comment:
21. Did you find the whole process time consuming? Comment:
22. Did it cut into your lesson time a lot? Were you still able to cover your curriculum? Comment:

Further comments/ anything to add?
Appendix Z: Action Cycle Three Letter to Teacher Participants
Providing Information Regarding Orff-Schulwerk Professional Learning.

22nd May 2009

Dear Colleague

Thank you for your interest and for participating in this study. Please read all attached documents carefully, noting return dates.

In your package you should have the following:

- A letter to you explaining the study.
- A consent form for you to sign
- A letter to parent/guardians
- A consent form for parents and students to sign
- A pre-intervention questionnaire
- A post-intervention questionnaire.
- A small envelope(for your consent form)
- 2 A4 sized envelopes (for the return of pre and post questionnaires)

I aim for this to be an enjoyable experience which provides you with a useful strategy to use in your classrooms. Please note that this intervention is to be part of what you are doing in the classroom. It should not be an extra. I will explain this further at the PD together with all administrative procedures.

For those who are travelling from the country, please keep your fuel receipts and a count of the kilometres you have travelled (round trip). All stationary, morning tea and lunch will be provided.

Prior to the PD you will need to;

- Return your consent form to me before the 5th June 2009
- Send home the parent information letter and consent form to all students in the class which you will be conducting the Orff-Schulwerk intervention.
- Collect the signed consent forms from the students before the 19th June 2009.
- Select the 1st, 7th and 14th students on the class roll from the class which you will be using in the study.

Please bring the following items with you to the PD on Saturday, 20th June 2009:

- Signed parent/student consent forms (these should be returned to you before Friday, 19th June)
- The names of the 1st, 7th and 14th students on the class roll from the class which you will be using in the study.
- A song, poem, filastroccha that you will be using in Term 3.

The PD is being conducted at;
Edith Cowan University, Mt. Lawley Campus.
Bradford Street, Mt. Lawley
Room: KK 15.123 (Building 15 Room 123) Conference Room
Time: 9am – 1pm

Please do not hesitate to call me or email me on the following contacts if you have any questions or concerns; Mobile: XXXXX Email: annamarp@student.ecu.au
I look forward to meeting you all on Saturday, 20th June 2009

Kind Regards
Annamaria Paolino

What do I need to know? What do I need to do?

- **Beat** – steady pulse of the music
- **Rhythm** – long and short sounds in music
- **Ostinato** – repeated melodic or rhythmic phrase
- **Syllables** – natural rhythm of words
- **Anacrusis** – unstressed syllable
- **Pentatonic Scale** – 5 note scale. Used because students can play any notes and it still sounds musical. Use the notes C, D, E, G, A
- **THE BEAT ALWAYS FALLS ON THE STRESS OF THE WORD**

Elements of Orff-Schulwerk

1. **Say** – Say and experiment with the words/language to ‘feel’ the language.
   - ie: Phonemic Awareness Activity
2. **Clap** – Say and experiment with the beat and rhythm of the words to ‘feel’ the language.
   - Ie: Clapping Activity: clap words. How many beats; Clap phrases; Rhythm patterns; Teacher claps rhythm. Students keep beat; Students clap rhythm. Teacher keeps beat; Divide students into 2 groups. 1 keeps beat. The other keeps rhythm; Students keep beat in feet while keeping rhythm in hands.
3. **Sing** – Helps with articulation, pronunciation, stress and phonemic awareness. Don’t be afraid to sing. WE CAN ALL DO IT!
4. **Move** – Invent actions (teacher or students). Encourage students to sing as they move. If actions are difficult to match with words, use pictures.
5. **Play** – With words, with instruments (Tuned and un tuned) and on the body
6. **Create** – Allow students to create; own rhythm patterns, match words with rhythms, find other words or phrases that match rhythm, own pentatonic tunes, movements.

NOT A METHOD. NO SET ORDER. DON’T NEED TO DO ALL IN EACH LESSON!

Date: 20th June 2009

I am interested in gaining your feedback regarding this PL. Please complete this evaluation form and place it in the box. *N.B. This is a confidential survey. No names will be recorded or known.*

1. Please indicate with a tick, the level of agreement that most accurately reflects your opinion about this PD.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Strongly Agree</th>
<th>Agree</th>
<th>Neither agree or disagree</th>
<th>Disagree</th>
<th>Strongly Disagree</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The PL provided me with necessary background knowledge.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The PL provided me with the necessary skills I require.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The content was interesting.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The content was relevant to my needs.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The specific PL objectives were achieved.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The atmosphere was conducive to learning.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I learnt some new skills/knowledge today.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I am glad I decided to participate.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

2. How do you feel about the difficulty level of this PL. (Please tick)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Too difficult</th>
<th>Difficult</th>
<th>Just Right</th>
<th>Easy</th>
<th>Too Easy</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

348
3. Please indicate with a tick, the level of agreement that most accurately reflects your opinion of the facilitator.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Strongly Agree</th>
<th>Agree</th>
<th>Neither agree or disagree</th>
<th>Disagree</th>
<th>Strongly Disagree</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Very knowledgeable about the subject</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Well prepared</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Motivated me to learn</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Helpful</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Paced the content well</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

4. How do you rate the materials used. (Please tick)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Strongly Agree</th>
<th>Agree</th>
<th>Neither agree or disagree</th>
<th>Disagree</th>
<th>Strongly Disagree</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Clear</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Easy to follow</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Useful</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Good for future reference</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

5. How satisfied were you with your experiences during the completion of this PL. (Please tick)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Very Unsatisfied</th>
<th>Satisfied</th>
<th>Neither</th>
<th>Satisfied</th>
<th>Very Satisfied</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

6. What did you like about this PL?

7. What didn’t you like about this PL?

8. Any other comments?
Appendix CC: Action Cycle Three: Letter to Principal - Focus Group.

7th September 2009
Attention: The Principal

Research Project – The potential of the Orff Schulwerk approach as a pedagogical tool for the teaching of Italian to Western Australian Primary upper primary school students

Dear Sir/Madam

My name is Annamaria Paolino and I am a PhD student at Edith Cowan University. I am currently conducting research in your school together with your Italian teacher into the use of the Orff-Schulwerk approach (a song/music approach) as a pedagogical tool in teaching Italian in Western Australian primary schools. My aim is to inform practice, refine and improve current pedagogical practice and to see if language teachers see connections between music and languages.

As part of my data collection I intend to conduct a focus group professional development session with all the Italian teachers who participated in the research project. The aim of this meeting is to allow teachers to reflect upon, share their experiences and network in a collegial forum. Your support in my research is greatly appreciated. By allowing your Italian teacher to participate in the focus group meeting will further enhance your support.

When: Monday, 21st September 2009
Where: Edith Cowan University, Mt. Lawley Campus
Kurongkurl Katitjin
Building 15
Room 15.123
Time: 9.30 – 11.30am
Cost: Relief to be paid by the school
Facilitator: Annamaria Paolino

Please complete the form below and return it in the self-addressed, stamped envelope enclosed before Friday, 18th September, 2009.

Please feel welcome to email me or my supervisors, Dr Geoffrey W. Lummis and Dr Geoffrey M. Lowe to discuss the study. I would be happy to meet with you to discuss any queries which you may have.

This project has been approved by the Edith Cowan University Human Research Ethics Committee. If you have any concerns or complaints about the research project and you wish to speak to an independent person, you may contact Kim Gifkins, Research Ethics Officer, Edith Cowan University on 6304 2170, or email research.ethics@ecu.edu.au.

Finally, thank you again for supporting my research.

Yours sincerely

Annamaria Paolino                              Dr G. W. Lummis             Dr G. M. Lowe
annamarp@student.ecu.au                        (Principal Supervisor)         (Ass. Supervisor)
g.lummis@ecu.edu.au                         g.lowe@ecu.edu.au
Appendix DD: Action Cycle Three Focus Group Consent Form for Principals.

I _________________________ have read and understood the information written in the attached letter.

I agree for the Italian teacher at my school _________________________ (name of teacher) to participate in the focus group meeting.

I understand that it is the schools responsibility is to pay relief on this day and not that of Edith Cowan University.

Name of principal: ________________________________

Name of school: ___________________________________

Signed: ___________________  Date: ________________

Researcher:

I have provided information about the research to the above named research participant and believe that he/she understands what is involved.

Name of researcher: Annamaria Paolino

Signed: ___________________  Date: ________________

Name of principal supervisor: Dr G. W. Lummis

Signed: ___________________  Date: ________________

Name of associate supervisor: Dr G. M. Lowe

Signed: ___________________  Date: ________________
Appendix EE: Action Cycle Three Focus Group Questions.

1. What did you think about your research experience?
2. How do you feel now that it is over?
3. Did you learn something new about how to use music/song in Italian lessons?
4. What was it and how did you apply it?
5. Which Orff-Schulwerk element did you try?
6. What do you think about Orff-Schulwerk approach as a pedagogical tool for teaching Italian to upper primary students?
7. What do you think are some positives of the Orff-Schulwerk approach in an Italian classroom?
8. What do you think are some negatives of the Orff-Schulwerk approach in an Italian classroom?
9. Do you think it is effective in helping teachers and students achieve educational outcomes in Italian?
10. Do you think you will incorporate Orff-Schulwerk as part of your teaching/learning programme?
11. Where to from here? What would you like to see more of? What would you like to see happen?
12. Any other questions/comments?
Appendix FF: Action Cycle Three Focus Group Meeting Reflection Sheet.

Name: ____________________

Monday, 21st September, 2009

1. What did you think about your research experience?

2. How do you feel now that it is over?

3. Did you learn something new about how to use music/song in Italian lessons?

4. What was it and how did you apply it?

5. Which Orff-Schulwerk element did you try?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Element</th>
<th>Yes/No</th>
<th>How? What did you do?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Saying</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Clapping</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Singing</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Moving</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Playing</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Creating</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

6. What do you think about Orff approach as a pedagogical tool for teaching Italian to upper primary students?

7. What do you think are some positives of the Orff approach in an Italian classroom?

8. What do you think are some negatives of the Orff approach in an Italian classroom?

9. Do you think it is effective in helping teachers and students achieve educational outcomes in Italian?

10. Do you think you will incorporate Orff as part of your teaching/learning programme?

11. Where to from here? What would you like to see more of? What would you like to see happen? What resources would be or are necessary?

12. Any other questions/comments:
Appendix GG: Action Cycle One Teacher Questionnaire Construct One Questionnaire Frequency Table.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Construct 1: School Demographics</th>
<th>Number of respondents (Total: 34)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Face to face lesson delivery</td>
<td>34 (100%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Co-educational</td>
<td>32 (94%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Have a music specialist</td>
<td>28 (82%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>City location</td>
<td>26 (76%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Government sector</td>
<td>22 (65%)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Appendix HH: Action Cycle One Teacher Questionnaire Construct Two Questionnaire Frequency Table.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Common themes</th>
<th>Number of respondents (Total: 34)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Female</td>
<td>32 (94%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teach all primary grades</td>
<td>31 (91%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Consider music a useful pedagogical tool</td>
<td>28 (82%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Work part-time work fraction</td>
<td>18 (56%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Aged between 21-25 years of age</td>
<td>2 (6%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Aged between 26-30 years of age</td>
<td>1 (3%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Aged between 31-35 years of age</td>
<td>3 (9%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Aged between 36-40 years of age</td>
<td>6 (18%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Aged between 41-45 years of age</td>
<td>4 (12%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Aged between 46-50 years of age</td>
<td>11 (33%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Aged between 51-55 years of age</td>
<td>3 (9%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Aged between 55+ years of age</td>
<td>4 (12%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1-5 years teaching experience</td>
<td>7 (21%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6-10 years teaching experience</td>
<td>7 (21%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11-15 years teaching experience</td>
<td>7 (21%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16-20 years teaching experience</td>
<td>4 (12%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20+ years teaching experience</td>
<td>9 (27%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Full time work fraction</td>
<td>14 (41%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Part time work fraction</td>
<td>19 (56%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Enjoy music in their personal lives</td>
<td>32 (94%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Don’t play a musical instrument</td>
<td>31 (91%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Not confident using music in Italian class</td>
<td>18 (53%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Completed pre-service music units</td>
<td>18 (53%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Studied Italian at a tertiary level</td>
<td>15 (40%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Studied Italian at some level</td>
<td>11 (33%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Have Italo-Australian background</td>
<td>15 (40%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Purchase resources</td>
<td>34 (100%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Borrowed resources</td>
<td>34 (100%)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Appendix II: Action Cycle One Teacher Questionnaire Construct Three Questionnaire Frequency Table.

1. **Construct 3: Classroom Demographics**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Common themes</th>
<th>Number of respondents (Total: 34)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Use music as a pedagogical tool</td>
<td>32 (94%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use music sometimes during lessons</td>
<td>27 (79%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use music with junior primary classes</td>
<td>13 (30%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use music with junior and middle primary classes</td>
<td>9 (26%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use music with all primary classes</td>
<td>6 (18%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use music with upper primary classes</td>
<td>1 (3%)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

2. **Construct 3: Classroom Demographics - Utilisation**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Common themes – Pedagogy</th>
<th>Number of respondents (Total: 34)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Didactic purposes</td>
<td>31 (91%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teach new concepts</td>
<td>28 (82%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Supplement existing knowledge</td>
<td>30 (88%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Facilitate language learning</td>
<td>30 (88%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Engage students</td>
<td>30 (88%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teach cultural elements</td>
<td>30 (88%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Motivation</td>
<td>28 (82%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Created a relaxed classroom atmosphere</td>
<td>22 (65%)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Common themes – Activities/Strategies</th>
<th>Number of respondents (Total: 34)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Singing</td>
<td>32 (94%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sing and echo</td>
<td>26 (76%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teach vocabulary then song</td>
<td>24 (71%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use CD player</td>
<td>23 (68%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dancing</td>
<td>23 (68%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Worksheets</td>
<td>23 (68%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of gestures</td>
<td>14 (41%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Clap rhythms</td>
<td>12 (35%)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Construct 1 - Why teachers use music/songs?

- Engage the children.
- Practice phrases and meaningful chunks of text.
- I think it’s a great way to teach.
- To reinforce previous language by repetition.
- Keeping the children either amused or occupied.
- Tie it into your theme it helps them to practice what they are doing and then use it.
- They’re fun.
- When kids learn through songs they remember.
- There’s no pressure.
- You don’t have to perform.
- Teaching new things, new subjects, new topics.
- Good for the kids that weren’t so involved in other activities.
- They enhance the learning of the children.
- It raises their interest and encourages involvement.
- It generally just seems to work well.
- Enhances their learning and my programme.
- It captures their attention and facilitates learning.
- Focus on what I want them to learn.
- Music is rhythmic and it helps children to learn things as a pattern, as a rhythm.
- Something obviously happens in the brain that just helps in terms of language acquisition helps to spark something.
- I think it does take away some of those inhibitions.
- Music might help the just to acquire and retain that little bit more language.
- To change the atmosphere of the classroom, there not just coming in and being bamboozled by pieces of paper.

### Construct 2 – How are teachers using music/songs?

- Actions to the words.
- With the junior primary.
- I don’t seem to use music as much with the older grades.
- I’ve used it either to teach vocabulary or use it to teach meaningful chunks of text and phrases.
- I have had the kids sing to the instrumental backing.
- Cloze exercises, gap filling type things.
- It gives them a bit of an insight into whether kids over there are the same as kids over here.
- I let them listen to the song.
- doing the actions and they were singing along.
We actually made a little spider and put the spider on a drainpipe.  
I do it’s just background music as they’re working and listening.  
I wouldn’t even play it with my 5, 6, 7’s.  
To drill in different ways.  
I try and find songs that are around to fit in with my theme.  
I aim to teach 2 songs per year form year.  
I do use more song with the pp.  
Because we have a music teacher and a performing arts teacher at the school, I tend not to teach Italian songs.  
We get up and move around, it’s just not sitting when I use the music.  
If I want to teach certain kinds of vocabulary.  
We try to repeat and mimic the song and sing along.  
The way I am using the music in the class is just my way nobody taught me how to do it. It’s something that I figured out.  
I’ve been using songs also during the assemblies because I want the Italian classes to be represented during assemblies/end of the year, when the parents are present in the school.

| **Construct 3 – Criteria** | **They have to be repetitive.**  
|                           | **If there is a particular phrase that’s already in there, that’s important.**  
|                           | **Simple and appropriate language that is easily understood.**  
|                           | **I want it to fit in with what I’m doing, mostly I go by topics.**  
|                           | **I prefer songs that actually have whole language.**  
|                           | **I don’t mind if the language is quite difficult so long as, because kids will actually get their tongues around it.**  
|                           | **I choose a song that’s going to fit in with my theme.**  
|                           | **It’s got to be able to grab them and for them to enjoy the music.**  
|                           | **It’s got to be clear for the kids to understand what they are saying.**  
|                           | **I try to choose a catchy tune that they are going to be engaged in.**  
|                           | **Repetitive and rhythmic nature.**  
|                           | **Simple as possible.**  
|                           | **Short phrases.**  
|                           | **A happy tune and easy to remember.**  
|                           | **Find the words I want to teach.** |

| **Construct 4 – Resources** | **I don’t have enough of them. I’d love to have more songs.**  
|                           | **There never seems to be enough on music.**  
|                           | **I find the language is too difficult.**  

358
So anything which is too complicated, I steer away from.

I think at the moment there’s about two CDs that I use.

There’s not be a great range of Italian CD’s suited to Australian children learning Italian.

The ones I have access to are extremely difficult.

Specifically designed for students learning a second language as opposed to native speakers.

Not much authentic stuff.

There’s some that don’t necessarily use whole language.

If you can’t find something then you’ve got to make it up.

I’d like a bigger collection of little children’s songs.

You have to be careful, current songs don’t necessarily have nice words.

I have only what I’ve managed to collect on CD’s or scab from people.

When I go class to class, half the time I found it much harder because you’ve got to find the CD machine.

Sometimes it’s hard to get CD’s particular for teaching kids.

The copy is so old that you think it’s not good for good listening let alone good teaching.

CD’s would be the best.

CD’s with worksheets, flashcards and a teacher’s guide probably it would be even better.

I’ve got a few resources at the moment the latest one is quite good but its still more geared towards the little ones.

You are just not able to find available the like more app songs for the older group. From 5-7 or 6-7’s in particular.

Resources are limited.

I guess that’s another issue cause sometimes the language can be a little bit complex and the words, they change, they shorten words in some songs so that can be, that can also be an issue.

Perhaps a CD or 2 with a range of themes and within that theme perhaps selected songs for junior and upper.

It would be great if we had the time.

I think it has to be something produced here I guess produced with the intent of teaching it to Australian students.

Seriously lacking in the middle and upper.

The music specialist.

Musically I don’t feel I’m strong enough.

I did study it at teachers college a few years ago. It was my minor but you’d never have known.

I’m not sure I have got the confidence to do that.

I don’t know how you could improve those musical skills.
- If I could play an instrument.
- If I were to walk in with a guitar, we’d get heaps done.
- If I could actually read music then I’d know what the tune sounded like without having my brain go into overload.
- Music is not a strong point.
- I like singing.
- Having a PD or activities on saying this is what you do with these songs, try these sort of things with these songs. And then everyone shares what they’ve done for themselves.
- It’s good to get together good to get together to talk about things.
- I can play the keyboard a little bit but that doesn’t mean that I use it. Most of the time I just sing and the children join in. I might use a tambourine or learning the guitar or basics of the guitar would probably enhance how it sounds.
- Probably maybe if I could play an instrument because I would have a greater knowledge I guess of melody rhythm, beat and all those things.
- TPR. I find it really doesn’t come naturally for me to do that I think if you had a music background it would.
- If I had the ability. I’m not a music teacher, like yourself.
- When I network with others I’m forever asking what songs have you taught and this and that but I haven’t come across anything.
- My lack of music understanding, I want to keep it simple too.
- I can find middle c on a piano and that’s about it.
- I am not a musician and I don’t know how to play an instrument. I am a very, very bad singer.
- I don’t know how to teach dancing but I love dancing.
- I could learn a little bit more about how to use music in the classroom.
- Do some PD about music that I never learn and learn something from other teachers.
- I think that there are probably other people that are using different ways and it would be nice to start sharing you know and learning from others.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Construct 6 – Student Responses to music/song</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Kids then were able to remember those phrases easier.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>More engaged with it and enjoyed it.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The simpler words they are easy for the children to sing.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The kids sang quite happily.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I think some kids are quite visual and need to see the words whereas others prefer the audible, they want to hear it.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Every kid gets a turn.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>They suddenly discover that they are using it.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
It doesn’t actually occur to them that they are learning Italian or anything in particular.
They love it.
Kids pick that up quickly.
They relate to them.
Some kids like it and some kids don’t.
Sometimes inspires discussion….
They love that sort of stuff.
They sort of frown.
They love doing musical things.
That makes life a bit easier cause they are quite used to singing.
It helps them to remember certain concepts.
Keeping them interested.
Tend to learn more than they would by reading it or writing it.
Remember what’s happened and they’ll be able to tell me.
Immediately you can see kids bobbing up and down.
Amazing how much difference it makes.
Taking it quite seriously.
It makes them comfortable.
The minute you put music on eyes widened, they love and they learn the songs, they mimic, they copy an they learn the songs.
I find particularly the junior kids as the year 1,’s 2’s 3’s. Year 4 beginning to slow down they are still willing to listen but not so much to participate, in my opinion. And them as we get further down the track Year 5’s 6’s and 7’s once again more listening to it but they are afraid to open their mouths and sing in many cases.
I find that they do turn off if anything is too difficult.
They really get engaged in their work.
They start using the language it’s easier for them to start using the language and because they have to listen and repeat I think it helps them to, to understand to start talking and also understanding what other people are saying.
They are repeating and they remember the words after they remember the songs they can connect.
They get engaged in that and they remember also the movement help them to remember the meaning.
They mimic all that they remember the words.
Yeah. They love it.
The kids dance.

I think so because they say that Italian is a very musical language and it probably links itself to singing it as well.
There’s a lot of rhythm in the Italian language so it lends itself
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Italian</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>When I use music in Italian I don’t actually think about the musical characteristics of the song.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I can’t image using music in science or maths. So if you are going to combine the two, I think that music and Italian would go very well together.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I would say the rhythm is probably the biggest thing as there seems to be more rhythm in Italian.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I think it’s really interesting tying in music and Italian together.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I think music in a sense, is a language in itself isn’t it?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I think they are both language in a manner of speaking.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The skill in both would be acquiring a language so I think that there is definitely a similarity in that respect.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>That’s the beautiful thing about the Italian language the word “treno” actually sounds like train.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>We actually sing it as we speak.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>You sing it don’t you when you speak and to me it , it whenever I teach, and it’s one of the reasons I love teaching Italian, because you come in and you virtually sing you know.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I think that Italian is a musical language.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
# Appendix KK: Action Cycle Three Pre and Post Intervention Student Attitude Questionnaire Analysis: Item Comparison Table

## KEY

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Construct 1 items</th>
<th>Construct 2 items</th>
<th>Construct 3 items</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## Pre Intervention Items | Frequency of Responses Total /164 | Post Intervention Items | Frequency of Responses Total /161 |
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>5. Do you like learning Italian?</td>
<td>Yes = 29 Sometimes = 71 No = 58</td>
<td>2. Did you like learning Italian this term?</td>
<td>Yes = 24 Sometimes = 91 No = 33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. What do you enjoy the most about learning Italian?</td>
<td>Culture = 41 Listening = 20 Combination of activities = 30</td>
<td>3. What did you enjoy the most about learning Italian this term?</td>
<td>Music = 29 Speaking = 11 Combination of activities = 42</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. What do you enjoy the least about learning Italian?</td>
<td>Writing = 32 Reading = 27 Combination of activities = 60</td>
<td>4. What did you enjoy the least about learning Italian this term?</td>
<td>Writing = 31 Speaking = 15 Combination of activities = 42</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9. Does your teacher use music/songs during Italian lessons?</td>
<td>Yes = 14 Sometimes = 133 No = 17</td>
<td>5. Did your teacher use music/songs during Italian lessons this term?</td>
<td>Yes = 89 Sometimes = 56 No = 4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10. Do you like to when your teacher uses music/songs in Italian?</td>
<td>Yes = 41 Sometimes = 70 No = 51</td>
<td>6. Did you like to when your teacher uses music/songs in Italian this term?</td>
<td>Yes = 52 Sometimes = 65 No =29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11. Do you enjoy activities where music/songs are used?</td>
<td>Yes = 42 Sometimes = 63 No =50</td>
<td>7. Did you enjoy the musical activities where music/songs are used this term?</td>
<td>Yes = 50 Sometimes = 64 No =36</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12. What do you think about the music/songs your teacher uses in Italian class?</td>
<td>Like them = 18 OK = 78 Don’t like them= 60</td>
<td>8. What did you think about the music/songs your teacher used in Italian class this term?</td>
<td>Like them = 22 OK = 86 Don’t like them= 40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13. What do you think about the activities that your teacher does using music/songs?</td>
<td>Like them = 18 OK = 97 Don’t like them= 48</td>
<td>9. What did you think about the activities that your teacher did using music/songs this term?</td>
<td>Like them = 27 OK = 79 Don’t like them= 43</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14. Do songs help you to learn Italian?</td>
<td>Yes = 26 Sometimes = 74 No =58</td>
<td>10. Did the musical activities help you to learn Italian this term?</td>
<td>Yes = 42 Sometimes = 64 No = 43</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Question</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Sometimes</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-----</td>
<td>-----------</td>
<td>-----</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15. Do songs help you to remember Italian?</td>
<td>48</td>
<td>63</td>
<td>51</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16. Do songs help you to speak Italian?</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>83</td>
<td>46</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11. Did the musical activities help you to remember Italian this term?</td>
<td>45</td>
<td>71</td>
<td>35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12. Did the musical activities help you to speak Italian this term?</td>
<td>43</td>
<td>55</td>
<td>51</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>26. How do you feel in Italian class?</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>98</td>
<td>38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>27. Are you happy to go to Italian?</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>71</td>
<td>60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16. How do you feel in Italian class this term?</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>96</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17. Were you happy to go to Italian this term?</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>79</td>
<td>46</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Appendix LL: Action Cycle Three Construct Comparison Table

Students v Teachers Interview Responses.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Constructs</th>
<th>Themes from Responses</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| 1. Engaging (Students) | • Active involvement.  
• Fun and enjoyable activities.  
• New and Different.  
• Catered for their needs.  
• Increased participation rate.  
• Excited about and enjoyed Italian. |
| 4. Engage students (Teachers)  
**Theme 2: Teachers on student’s learning** | • Students remembered and were responsive.  
• Got organised quicker.  
• Willing to try and to contribute which led to an increase in confidence.  
• Greater attention span and work completion rate.  
• Improved behavior.  
• Engaged boys.  
• Students left the room happy each week.  
• Engaged all students of all ability levels.  
• Fun, enjoyable activities made learning contemporary.  
• Children are receptive to music.  
• Peer pressure to be involved. Those that didn’t stood out.  
• Students are actively involved.  
• Orff-Schulwerk focuses attention of disengaged students.  
• Inclusivity; students didn’t want to miss out on activities. |
| 2. Reinforcement and scaffolding (Students) | • Provided scaffolds: Rhythm, song and movement.  
• Improved confidence.  
• Rhythm, song and movement improved memory and assisted learning.  
• Creating tunes to meaningful chunks of text assisted vocabulary retention. |
| 1. Reinforcement and scaffolding (Teachers)  
**Theme 2: Teachers on student's learning** | • Provides reinforcement for students.  
• Allows for repetition which is fun and interesting.  
• Helps to improve student confidence as it allows them to learn, become familiar. Master and then move on to something new (ZPD).  
• It facilitates the process of learning.  
• Allows students to apply language they once struggled with, remember it and use it naturally.  
• Rhythm and gestures help students learn words.  
• Provides students with a scaffold which learning can be hung on. |
| 3. Increased linguistic understanding (Students) | • Activities assisted memory retention.  
• Songs had the right vocabulary.  
• Activities assisted students in speaking and remembering.  
• Students considered that there is more than one way to speak a language. |
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Constructs</th>
<th>Themes from Responses</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>3: Increases linguistic understanding (Teachers)</td>
<td>- Breaking down words, phrases into syllables makes it easier for the students to learn.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Theme 2: Teachers on student’s learning</strong></td>
<td>- Allows students to pay closer attention to the linguistics of language.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Helps language acquisition as it provides structure to remember and sequence.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Improves students’ language skills.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Speaking a lot more.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

366

Amelia.
Amelia taught part-time in a government school in the metropolitan area which had a music specialist on staff. She is aged between 46-50 years of age, had between 11-15 years teaching experience and came from an Italo-Australian heritage. As part of her programme Amelia used the Orff-Schulwerk approach together with a simple Italian chant to help her students with revision.

Amelia’s students were very enthusiastic and motivated. They contributed several ideas of their own and had to be urged out for the next class. Her students enjoyed the intervention and became more inventive with their approach to ‘Orff’ and Amelia was ‘amazed at what the kids come up with on their own.’ Amelia taught in a musical school. Parents at the school were quite supportive of the extra-curricular activities at the school. Many students learnt musical instruments so music was already part of their life-world. Amelia believes that the Orff-Schulwerk approach appealed to them because of that reason.

Amelia believed that the Orff-Schulwerk approach helped the students to pay closer attention to the Italian language and increased their linguistic awareness. It made Italian interesting so the students didn’t feel like they were drilling vocabulary, even though, she believed, in actual fact that is what was happening. Amelia found Orff-Schulwerk activities were effective for students when it came to syllabifying words, “breaking them down; making it easier to digest if you like and then the language came easier” (TP-Amelia, September, 2009) and found that using a lot of the language teaching strategies in a fun way “fooled the students into learning Italian” (TP-Amelia, September, 2009).

Amelia commented on how students were leaving the Italian classroom happy every week as they were learning something new. Music could be heard all around the school and it promoted Italian in the school because all of a sudden there was ‘noise’ coming from the Italian room. Some of the students were very creative using raps and rounds to help them remember vocabulary being taught. Amelia noticed that the reluctant students became obvious if they didn’t contribute in class activities using the Orff-Schulwerk approach. She found that Orff-Schulwerk was effective in getting students engaged, paying attention and working as a team. This helped to engage the reluctant students as they couldn’t just sit there and do nothing as it looked too obvious.

Amelia enjoyed participating in the research and believed that it “awakened quite a few skills of mine which I think they lie dormant sometimes and then you realise “Oh, I could use that” and bring it into language” (Amelia, teacher participant, September, 2009) This teacher considered the intervention successful stating, “If I could have given that class an entire hour each week I think we could have really got stuck into it and developed it even further” (TP-Amelia, September, 2009)

Beatrice.
Beatrice taught full-time in a government school in the metropolitan area which had a music specialist on staff. She was 55+ years of age, had between 11-15 years teaching experience and came from non-Australian heritage. As part of her programme Beatrice was teaching the students the Italian National Anthem. She used the Orff-Schulwerk approach to help her students learn; vocabulary, phrasing and correct pronunciation of words. First, she introduced the vocabulary to the students by getting them to clap the rhythm of the words used in the anthem. This was done by using the Orff-Schulwerk echo clapping technique. Then she got the students to say the words in the phrases while keeping the beat of the anthem. Beatrice believed that with greater versatility and confidence she could have relaxed and enjoyed it better.

The class with which Beatrice conducted the intervention with was challenging behaviorally and needed a very structured programme and environment otherwise they tended to go “off the handle” (TP-Beatrice, September, 2009). Considering that and the teacher’s opinion that she is not a rhythm person but “I’m a melody person” (Beatrice, teacher participant, September, 2009) her students still responded positively. “I love music but I’m a melody person
more than a rhythm person and I really need to think about the rhythm myself to fit in with the words and the rhythm of the language” (TP-Beatrice, September, 2009). Beatrice discovered that the students were more serious about keeping to the rhythm and were quite keen to be singing the words as well as keeping the beat. She found her students were more responsive in the lesson and got themselves organised quickly. While she acknowledged that the students did not take it seriously at first, as they were noisier than usual and lacked self-discipline, as this was something new and exciting for them. Throughout the intervention period she found that the students worked with more confidence as did she. Beatrice considered the intervention to be successful and considered the Orff-Schulwerk experience to be a worthwhile one.

**Donatella.**

Donatella taught part-time in an independent school in the metropolitan area which had a music specialist on staff. Donatella was between 46-50 years of age, had between 11-15 years teaching experience and came from an Italo-Australian heritage. Due to timetabling constraints and difficulties encountered in gaining parental consent, Donatella started the intervention two weeks after the other teachers. This resulted in her conducting a six week rather than an eight week intervention. Donatella used the Orff-Schulwerk approach to help her teach vocabulary associated with her theme of ‘Transport’. Initially, she felt that her students would not respond positively. However, she discovered that the class responded better than she expected. The only concern she raised was as she felt limited in her skills and confidence to explore the Orff-Schulwerk activities further and try other techniques with multiple groups, such as rhythm and keeping the beat teacher three felt that her students sometimes became bored with the clapping activities. The students were engaged, responsive, happy and enthused. She found that by getting the students to create very simple melodies which the whole class could sing was an interesting and enjoyable way to encourage participation and risk taking. Even the students who weren’t engaged in Italian were willing to participate.

Due to her lack of confidence Donatella did not find the Orff-Schulwerk experience to be an enjoyable one. The Orff-Schulwerk approach did help her use song/music in the classroom but she believed that with greater confidence it would have been better. While she always used to think that she was reasonably musical, during the research she felt like she wasn’t and lost confidence in her music ability.

**Laura.**

Laura taught part-time in a government school in the metropolitan area which did not have a music specialist on staff. Laura was between 46-50 years of age, had between 11-15 years teaching experience and was not Australian born. Laura was unable to conduct the intervention with an upper primary class due to timetabling constraints at her school. Therefore, she conducted the intervention with a middle primary class, as this was the only class available. Laura stated that students responded very well and they seemed to enjoy the experience and enthusiastically looked forward to the next lesson. Even though most of the students joined in, there were some that misbehaved more than in a normal lesson and a few of them did not like being part of the experience. At one point Laura thought the intervention was very successful in a sense that the students were engaged and they enjoyed what we were doing. But, after she realised that there were eight or ten students that really didn’t like what they were doing. “The school also doesn’t have a school music programme and so using music is new for some of them and some of the kids they don’t like using music in the classroom. Kids responded very well and they saw this as playing and they love it and they loved playing and using the instruments. It was something new for me” (TP-Laura, September, 2009).

Whilst she enjoyed the Orff-Schulwerk experience Laura felt sometimes she didn’t have enough knowledge in music and felt she needed to know a little bit more but “I like using it and I enjoy using this approach” (TP-Laura, September, 2009).

The approach helped her use music and song in different ways, as she always uses song in the classroom. “While this was something that was not new but the way we were using it this time was different” (Laura, teacher participant, September, 2009). She believes it to be another teaching tool which will enhance her repertoire of teaching strategies. “I don’t think I’m going
to use this all the time but it is something else that I can add to my teaching” (TP-Laura, September, 2009).

**Sabrina.**

Sabrina taught full-time in a government school in the metropolitan area which had a music specialist on staff. She was between 41-45 years of age, had between 20+ years teaching experience and came from an Italo-Australian heritage. Sabrina enjoyed “implementing and trialing new things in the classroom that will assist in language learning, provide a structure to vocabulary or to a phrase in order to get it into the children’s heads. As you know the only Italian language they hear is through the Italian teacher, within our classroom.” (TP- Sabrina, September, 2009). This teacher used the Orff-Schulwerk echo clapping activity to revise the basic skill of saying the date, which was a daily class requirement. The students responded positively to the intervention and by the end of the intervention she noticed that the students had mastered this basic classroom requirement. “I found it very satisfying and I found that the kids learnt quite well what I was teaching them through this method” (TP-Sabrina, September, 2009).

Sabrina found that the clapping activities in the Orff-Schulwerk approach encouraged the students to join in with a greater degree of confidence stating that her students seemed excited and positive. It encouraged all students to be actively engaged in the lesson and do what everyone else was doing. If they didn’t participate with the rest of the class it would be seen as though they were being left out and missing out.

One issue that Sabrina raised was that the students displayed a low level of self-discipline and couldn’t control themselves within the freedom of the “Orff” classroom. She acknowledged that this was a result of the enthusiasm and the interest of trying something new. One suggestion Sabrina put forward was that teachers who adopt this approach in their classrooms, needed to provide their students with time to allow them to participate in hands on experimentation” (Sabrina, teacher participant, September, 2009). She believed that if the approach was to engage students successfully then they needed to “get their curiosity out of their system first” (TP-Sabrina, September, 2009).

**Virginia.**

Virginia worked full-time however, taught part-time in two government schools in regional Western Australia. Both schools had a music specialist on staff. Virginia was between 36-40 years of age, had between 1-5 years teaching experience and came from an Italo-Australian heritage. Virginia enjoyed the Orff-Schulwerk experience and found the Orff-Schulwerk approach of greater benefit that any other teaching strategy she had been presented with at university.

Virginia used a significant town event as the stimulus to her theme. Knowing her resources were limited, she researched suitable songs, materials and resources on the internet. Her students had been learning another language for a number of years when the language at the school was changed to Italian. This resulted in some reluctance from the students and has led to a degree of student disengagement and misbehaviour. As boys were producing the most disruptive behaviour, Virginia decided to find material that was contemporary and engaging for boys as well as one which fitted in with her theme. Using YouTube she found an Italian rap, which she hoped would be appealing to her students. Virginia believed that the rhythm activities helped give the text some substance as the students found reading and repeating chunks of text easier to do so with rhythm rather than just copying the teacher.

Virginia stated that the students enjoyed the choice of song/music and were really happy to continue it for the entire lesson. She found that the enthusiasm from the Orff-Schulwerk activities did not flow on into other tasks as the students weren’t as engaged with their letter writing which followed afterwards. Body percussion worked really well for Virginia. Students were able to both read the text and keep the rhythm. Even a student that had previously
removed himself from the room, became actively involved for the first time. This is something that the teacher wished to pursue, continue to use and build upon.

Virginia considered the Orff-Schulwerk approach an excellent way in engaging her disruptive boys and promoting language learning. “I noticed the boys in particular were far more engaged than they had been. I don’t know whether it was the choice of music or not but it was positive.” She stated that a boy who was considered to be the worst in the class was engaged and remained in the class for the entire lesson and did everything that was asked of him. This she stated was, “a first” (TP-Virginia, September, 2009). Having the intervention at the end of the lesson was an incentive as the students really wanted to do it and produced more work than they had at any stage in five years. “For the first time ever, my class was able to repeat phrases which contained more than four new words together without there being any problems with pronunciation or loss of place” (TP-Virginia, September, 2009).

Virginia reported how a low ability student completed his work for the first time, in an intervention lesson. He was determined to have things finished and not miss out on doing therap. Also, the normally worst behaved student displayed a positive behaviour change. His teacher spoke to Virginia the next day, asking how he was and when she said “perfect, wonderful, amazing, completed all his work” (TP-Virginia, September, 2009). His classroom teacher clarified that both were talking about the same student. “Learning this has captured their imagination and it is so very pleasing. We have one student at this school who has an educational assistant (EA) permanently attached to him. His behaviour has to be constantly monitored and reported on. He has medication about ten minutes before the lesson. It was the shortest time he has ever been away from my class. He ran back down the veranda, slammed the door open, sat down and was ready to go almost before he left. He was determined not to miss any of the intervention lessons. He has never done this for any of my lessons before” (TP-Virginia, September, 2009).

Initially, Virginia found that her students struggled a little with fitting the language to the beat. “They had beautiful pronunciations, that then had to be swallowed a little to fit in. It was great to see them really concentrating on words and trying really hard to get it right” (Virginia, teacher participant, September, 2009). However, later she reported “The children found beat activities very easy to do and it helped that I had broken up the text into ‘beat phrases’. The students went from all looking slightly overwhelmed at the amount of speaking involved to every child participating, with smiles on their faces” (TP-Virginia, September, 2009).

“All the students were excited and pleased to be doing something real and contemporary. They were all smiling, behaved and engaged. Behaviour management was no longer a concern and all of the students wanted to learn” (TP-Virginia, September, 2009).