2018

Walter Smith III: A comparison of improvisational techniques on “July” (2014) and “Stablemates” (2009)

Tom Walsh

_Edith Cowan University_

Follow this and additional works at: [https://ro.ecu.edu.au/theses_hons](https://ro.ecu.edu.au/theses_hons)

Part of the Music Commons

**Recommended Citation**


This Thesis is posted at Research Online. [https://ro.ecu.edu.au/theses_hons/1515](https://ro.ecu.edu.au/theses_hons/1515)
You may print or download ONE copy of this document for the purpose of your own research or study.

The University does not authorize you to copy, communicate or otherwise make available electronically to any other person any copyright material contained on this site.

You are reminded of the following:

- Copyright owners are entitled to take legal action against persons who infringe their copyright.

- A reproduction of material that is protected by copyright may be a copyright infringement. Where the reproduction of such material is done without attribution of authorship, with false attribution of authorship or the authorship is treated in a derogatory manner, this may be a breach of the author’s moral rights contained in Part IX of the Copyright Act 1968 (Cth).

- Courts have the power to impose a wide range of civil and criminal sanctions for infringement of copyright, infringement of moral rights and other offences under the Copyright Act 1968 (Cth). Higher penalties may apply, and higher damages may be awarded, for offences and infringements involving the conversion of material into digital or electronic form.
Walter Smith III:
A comparison of improvisational techniques on “July” (2014) and “Stablemates” (2009)

Tom Walsh

Bachelor of Music (Honours)
Western Australian Academy of Performing Arts
Edith Cowan University

2018
COPYRIGHT DECLARATION / USE OF THESIS

The Copyright Declaration and Use of Thesis statement are not included in this version of the thesis.
Abstract

This dissertation compares the improvisational style of notable tenor saxophonist Walter Smith III when performing a jazz standard, as well as an original composition. As with other contemporary artists, there is little to no pre-existing literature discussing Smith despite his frequent collaboration with jazz luminaries such as Terence Blanchard, Eric Harland, Roy Haynes, Jason Moran, and Christian McBride, as well as contemporaries Christian Scott, Ambrose Akinmusire and Kendrick Scott.

The primary aim of this dissertation is to transcribe, examine and compare Smith’s improvisations on July (2014) and Stablemates (2009). The harmonic, melodic and phrasing elements of Smith’s improvisation will be identified and discussed in terms of where and how they are being used. Common elements that comprise his unique improvisational style are examined to determine how their usage differs between these settings in terms of frequency and application. This research process has provided insight into how techniques already familiar to modern improvisers, from their study and practice of standard jazz repertoire, can be applied to the form and foreign harmonic landscapes conceived by contemporary composers.

This investigation found that the phrasing and melodic elements of Smith’s improvisations are consistent in terms of frequency despite being applied in new ways. There is extensive evidence of a harmonic approach on Stablemates, whilst this approach is practically non-existent on July. Careful study of these techniques will inform how these improvisational devices can be used across both standard jazz and foreign harmonic settings, with the aim of improving my own and the performance practice of other modern improvisers.
Acknowledgements

Thanks to my supervisor, Jeremy Greig, for all of his time, support, and guidance throughout this year.

Many thanks also to all my tutors at WAAPA, as well as my fellow postgraduate students for their ongoing friendship and encouragement.

Thanks to Walter Smith III for his incredible music.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Figure</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2.1</td>
<td>Example of motif development annotation</td>
<td>x</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2</td>
<td>Example of harmonic displacement</td>
<td>xi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3</td>
<td>Excerpt from A Chromatic Approach to Jazz Harmony and Melody</td>
<td>xii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.4</td>
<td>Example of scale quality substitution</td>
<td>xii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.5</td>
<td>Example of chromaticism</td>
<td>xiii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.6</td>
<td>Example of pentatonic usage facilitating harmonic generalisation</td>
<td>xiv</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.7</td>
<td>Example of pentatonic substitution</td>
<td>xiv</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.1</td>
<td>Excerpt from Walter Smith’s solo on &quot;July&quot;, Still Casual (2014)</td>
<td>xv</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2</td>
<td>Excerpt from Walter Smith’s solo on &quot;July&quot;, Still Casual (2014)</td>
<td>xvi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3</td>
<td>Excerpt from Walter Smith’s solo on &quot;July&quot;, Still Casual (2014)</td>
<td>xvi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.4</td>
<td>Excerpt from Walter Smith’s solo on &quot;July&quot;, Still Casual (2014)</td>
<td>xvii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.5</td>
<td>Excerpt from Walter Smith’s solo on &quot;July&quot;, Still Casual (2014)</td>
<td>xvii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.1</td>
<td>Excerpt from Walter Smith’s solo on &quot;Stablemates&quot;, Walter Smith III: Live in Paris (2009)</td>
<td>xix</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2</td>
<td>Excerpt from Walter Smith’s solo on &quot;Stablemates&quot;, Walter Smith III: Live in Paris (2009)</td>
<td>xx</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3</td>
<td>Opening phrase of the melody to Stablemates</td>
<td>xx</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.4</td>
<td>Excerpt from Walter Smith’s solo on &quot;Stablemates&quot;, Walter Smith III: Live in Paris (2009)</td>
<td>xxi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.5</td>
<td>Excerpt from Walter Smith’s solo on &quot;Stablemates&quot;, Walter Smith III: Live in Paris (2009)</td>
<td>xx</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.6</td>
<td>Excerpt from Walter Smith’s solo on &quot;Stablemates&quot;, Walter Smith III: Live in Paris (2009)</td>
<td>xxii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.7</td>
<td>Excerpt from Walter Smith’s solo on &quot;Stablemates&quot;, Walter Smith III: Live in Paris (2009)</td>
<td>xxii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.8</td>
<td>Excerpt from Walter Smith’s solo on &quot;Stablemates&quot;, Walter Smith III: Live in Paris (2009)</td>
<td>xxiii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.9</td>
<td>Excerpt from Walter Smith’s solo on &quot;Stablemates&quot;, Walter Smith III: Live in Paris (2009)</td>
<td>xxiv</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.10</td>
<td>Excerpt from Walter Smith’s solo on &quot;Stablemates&quot;, Walter Smith III: Live in Paris (2009)</td>
<td>xxiv</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.11</td>
<td>Excerpt from Walter Smith’s solo on &quot;Stablemates&quot;, Walter Smith III: Live in Paris (2009)</td>
<td>xxv</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Figure 4.12 Excerpt from Walter Smith’s solo on "Stablemates", Walter Smith III: Live in Paris (2009) ......................................................XXV

Figure 4.13 Excerpt from Walter Smith’s solo on "Stablemates", Walter Smith III: Live in Paris (2009) ......................................................XXV

Figure 5.1 Table of device frequency and application ..................................................................................................................XXVII
Introduction

One of the challenges faced by the contemporary jazz musician is found in how to approach improvising over the compositions of modern composers. This thesis examines one possible solution to this dilemma. Walter Smith III’s solo on his composition July is used as a case study and compared to his performance of the jazz standard Stablemates to contextualise findings.

Coker (1980, p. 14) argues that “most or even all of the chords in a given bebop or jazz standard tune are likely to be a ii, V or I chord in one key or another”. These standard harmonic structures, which serve to reinforce tension and release, are less often so explicitly used in modern compositions. Miller (1992, p. 6) speaks to the development of jazz composition style, saying “It is the freeing of the composer from the structure of the tonal system and strict form, song form in particular, that has allowed so many composers of inert abilities to ‘blossom’ to artists with individual expressive merit”. Harmonies used by modern composers are less rooted in function and more sonority based, with song forms often comprised of sections of irregular length, often shifting in metre throughout. This presents a unique challenge when trying to improvise in a fluid and cohesive manner.

Tenor saxophonist Walter Smith III is at the forefront of a younger generation of saxophonists” (Bhatia, 2012). As well as releasing Casually Introducing (W. Smith, III, 2006), Live in Paris (W. Smith, III, 2009), III (W. Smith, III, 2010) and Still Casual (W. Smith, III, 2014), he has been a sideman for jazz luminaries such as Terence Blanchard, Eric Harland, Roy Haynes, Jason Moran, and Christian McBride as well as contemporaries Christian Scott, Ambrose Akinmusire, and Kendrick Scott. Trumpeter and frequent collaborator Ambrose Akinmusire says of Smith’s musical flexibility, “I don’t know that he has any weaknesses. He always, always sounds amazing, and he’s always getting better. He can play any style of music, any composition” (West, 2014). Part of Smith’s success in these various ensembles is his creative approach to navigating the intricate and challenging forms and harmonies presented in the compositions of these artists, as well as his own works.

Smith cites influences such as John Coltrane, Wayne Shorter and Kenny Garrett and while he has certainly studied the history of jazz music, he’s always had a keen focus on the current trajectory of jazz. Smith recalls that in his youth, “for every older record I would buy, I would also get something that was current as well” (Fong, 2011). Smith’s broad perspective on jazz helped him develop an approach that seamlessly blends together the hard driving swing feeling, raw sound and emotive inflection of past saxophone greats with the technical finesse and harmonic sensibilities of players of the current era. Jazz legend Jimmy Heath speaks of Smith’s broad understanding saying, “Walter Smith is a perfect example of what my mentor Dizzy Gillespie said ‘You have to have one foot in the past and one foot in the future’” (W. Smith, III, 2018).
Foremost, Smith has been chosen as the subject for this study because I was immediately drawn to his uniquely personal approach. It became evident through my own listening, that this approach could be applied to any performance setting. The versatility of Smith’s style is further evidenced by his inclusion in a wide variety of contemporary ensembles. Smith’s prolific performance as a sideman has seen him frequently challenged by the foreign harmonic settings devised by these composers, making his playing an ideal candidate for study to improve this aspect of my own playing.

Research Aim
This study identifies and compares the improvisational devices and techniques employed by Walter Smith III in solos improvised on a jazz standard and one of Smith’s original compositions.

The primary research questions arise directly from this aim:

- What are the specific and identifiable improvisational techniques used by Walter Smith III in his improvisations on *July (2014)* and *Stablemates (2009)*?
- How might his approach to using these devices for improvisation differ in terms of frequency and application between an original composition and a jazz standard?

These outcomes are determined through the use of specific musical devices pertaining to phrasing, harmony and melody. These are broken down into individual examples of techniques for analysis, discussion and comparison.

Rationale & Significance
Despite being held in high regard by critics and musicians alike for his output as both a leader and a sideman, there is a striking absence of literature discussing the works or practices of Walter Smith III. This investigation contributes to knowledge regarding both this influential and prevalent contemporary musician and saxophone improvisation through the research conclusions and production of two detailed and accurate transcriptions.

*July* and *Stablemates* have been selected for this study as they are clear and recent examples that display Smith’s distinctive and personal voice as a soloist. *July*, the original composition of Smith’s features the specific harmonic environment I was challenged by and wished to study further, while *Stablemates* is one of the scarce recordings of a jazz standard Smith has done under his own name.

The significance of this research extends beyond that, as Smith has been a profound influence on my own musical development. His virtuosic and idiosyncratic approach to improvisation has informed areas of my own playing that I am keen to develop further. Accordingly, my main goal in undertaking this field of study is to improve my own performance practice when performing in the foreign harmonic landscapes devised by modern composers, and to determine if language from more...
conventional jazz repertoire can be applied to these modern forms. Additionally, this study provides information that may inform jazz musicians involved in performing original music and dealing with the challenges of foreign chord progressions and intricate forms.

Methodology
This study follows an established jazz research paradigm of using musical transcription and analysis to draw conclusions about the subject’s musical tendencies. In this case, the methodology is based on the model used by Luke Minness (2013) in his analysis of the stylings of another notable contemporary saxophonist, Ben Wendel. As part of this investigation:

- Musical transcription of each solo is performed. These are included in appendix ‘B’ and ‘C’
- Individual analysis of each solo through the three major filters of phrasing, harmonic and melodic devices. These are explained in detail in chapter 4 and a full table of usage is found in appendix ‘A’
- Comparison of the techniques regarding:
  1. Measure of frequency
  2. Difference in application

Two musical transcriptions have been completed. The songs chosen are July, from Still Casual (2014) and Stablemates from Live in Paris (2009). The method of transcription used is consistent with that used in jazz music and academic studies relating to it. This is evidenced in theses such as Minness (2013), White (2008) and G.M. Smith (2001)

As Smith composed July and as Stablemates is a common jazz standard, it can be assumed that Smith is intimately familiar with these forms. This ensures that the solos themselves are ones in which unfamiliar chord changes do not burden him, thus facilitating instrumental virtuosity and theoretical complexity.

Firstly, the paper gives a brief biographical outline of Smith’s life and art and then reviews literature related to Smith, and improvisation techniques. Secondly, relevant devices expressed in Smith’s improvisations are investigated and discussed. This investigation outlines several techniques distinctive to Smith’s playing style and reviews their musical outcome post-application. These devices are catalogued as phrasing, harmonic or melodic.

Finally, the paper compiles the devices frequently utilised by Smith to obtain a basic understanding on how each device can be manipulated and applied to jazz improvisation. Each transcription is then individually analysed to investigate the techniques and common phrases. This, in turn, aids the understanding and application of these techniques to new improvisations.
Biographical Info

Walter Smith III (September 24, 1980) was born in Houston, Texas and grew up as part of a musical family getting an early start playing saxophone at age five. Smith’s father, originally from New Orleans, was the band teacher at the elementary school Smith attended, where jazz music formed a part of the everyday curriculum. Growing up, Smith’s favourite players were Kirk Whalum and Gerald Albright before discovering the music of Charlie Parker. It was at Houston’s High School for the Performing and Visual Arts that things began to get more serious for Smith. Surrounded by musicians such as Kendrick Scott, Robert Glasper and Mike Moreno, Smith’s hunger for music grew and he began absorbing the style and language of players such as Kenny Garrett, Branford Marsalis, Joshua Redman and Mark Turner (DeLuke, 2017).

Smith realised early on that music was his calling and he began attending Berklee College of Music on a full tuition scholarship in 1999. It was here that he began to deeply study more of the classic tenor players.

Ornette Coleman became big for me when I was in college. That sound really appealed to me. Eric Dolphy, later on Sam Rivers was very interesting to listen to. Joe Lovano. All those guys. I found similarities in all of them and it was not uncommon for me to be listening to something from the 1930s and then next thing I put on was 2003. That kind of thing. They have such similarities, it was easy for me to find influential things within all of them. (DeLuke, 2017)

After graduating Berklee in 2003, Smith relocated to New York, where after playing a couple of gigs around town, he landed a position in legendary jazz drummer Roy Hayne’s ‘Fountain of Youth’ band.

He stressed to me the importance of learning the melody (including lyrics) of the song. He would be specific to the nth degree about where to play and not to play. Every 8th note and quarter note had a serious significance to him. Since that time, I’ve made a point of taking every band leader’s directions as literally as possible and I try to really, really respect their vision for how their music should be played. (Orenstein, 2014)

He also continued his studies in New York, completing a Masters of Music at Manhattan School of Music in 2005. Smith then gained entry to the prestigious Thelonious Monk Jazz Institute where he gained a Graduate Diploma in 2007 (W. Smith, III, 2015). While he was there, Smith studied under the mentorship of jazz royalty Terence Blanchard, Wayne Shorter and Herbie Hancock. Of his time under Blanchard’s wing, Smith said “I can’t put a value on Terence Blanchard’s mentorship during the two years. I learned so much about composition from him and gained so much confidence in every aspect of my musicianship” (Fong, 2011).
After departing Hayne’s group Smith has gone on to be a member of some of the most influential contemporary groups, including Ambrose Akinmusire’s quintet, Christian Scott’s group, the Sean Jones sextet, Terence Blanchard quintet, Eric Harland’s Voyager band, Roy Haynes’ Fountain of Youth band, Jason Moran’s Big Bandwagon, and the Christian McBride Situation (W. Smith, III, 2018). It’s these kinds of musical relationships that continue to inspire Smith to keep extending his own abilities. He speaks particularly highly of trumpeter Akinmusire, saying.

> From the moment I first heard him play up until now, he has been a constant source of inspiration that has pushed me to practice and write, even when I felt like taking days off. I’ve played with him more than anyone else in the past 10 years and I have been astounded every time. (Freeman, 2014)

While still occupied touring and recording both within the United States and abroad, Smith has more recently become focused on music education, taking up a position as a professor at Indiana University. Smith finds the education aspect of his career to be mutually beneficial. As well as passing his knowledge to students, he uses it as a learning tool saying, "It makes me have to really think about the music that I am working on. Ways of approaching composition. Ways of approaching improvisation. Ways of approaching ensemble playing" (DeLuke, 2017). It goes beyond just considering and conceiving of different musical ideas, Smith finds the balance between teaching and performance to be almost symbiotic, saying "I feel like the more I teach, the better I play. And the more I play, the better I teach" (DeLuke, 2017).

Smith is a saxophonist at the forefront of contemporary jazz improvisation. His inclusion in such a large array of ensembles run by contemporary performers and composers has resulted in his exposure to a wide variety of songs that feature the harmonic situation I found personally challenging. The effective, yet personal and identifiable approach he brings to these performances provides a valuable example of how to overcome this challenge.
Chapter 1 - Literature Review

Due to his relatively young age, there is limited available literature discussing the improvisational style of Walter Smith III. Resources describing Smith’s improvisational prowess are extremely scarce, despite his prevalence in contemporary jazz circles. There are however, a myriad of performance and album reviews which are all used in this investigation to provide quotations and descriptions of Smith’s performance style. Past dissertations and existing literature on jazz improvisation provide definitions to enable the discussion and analysis of Smith’s solos. Primary research material for this investigation is sourced from recorded material (audio and notated), including performances by Smith and online interviews. Without the availability of these recordings and interviews, it would be impossible to comprehend the intricacies of Smith’s music.

i. Journal Articles

Articles discussing Smith have only begun to appear in the last decade following the release of his first album, *Casually Introducing (W. Smith, III)* in 2006. Most of these articles feature album reviews with perhaps a small interview segment with Smith offering insight into the process involved in the production of such work, and his career trajectory at the time of the interview.

**Walter Smith: Superior Sequel**

Downbeat Magazine, December 2014

This article discusses Smith’s most recent album *Still Casual (W. Smith, III, 2014)*. The article mostly offers biographical information and insight into Smith’s career at the time, but also contains anecdotes from Smith and frequent collaborator Ambrose Akinmusire. They both offer comment regarding their unique creative relationship and what it’s like performing together, pushing each other to new heights. Michael J West also offers insight into the Development of Smith’s own personal style, saying “He started out as an aggressive, Sonny Rollins-esque player, and he gradually has softened into the thoughtful stylist heard on Still Casual” (West, 2014).

ii. Dissertations

There are no existing academic writings about Smith or his improvisational approach. He is too recent a musical figure to have had research conducted investigating his musical idiosyncrasies. This paper draws upon pre-existing theses that examine other prominent saxophonists and their approach to improvisation.

**Joe Henderson: An Analysis of Harmony in Selected Compositions and Improvisations**

Arthur Lynn White (D.M.A, University of North Carolina, 2008)
White’s dissertation outlines a multitude of harmonic devices used by Joe Henderson in improvisations on his own compositions. Having clearly influenced Smith, if his Jazztimes poll choices are anything to go by (Haga, 2012), Smith has studied and absorbed the harmonic innovations of Henderson. Amongst other devices, this paper examines Henderson’s use of harmonic anticipation and non-chord tones. Both of these elements are present in Smith’s improvisations and form part of the subject of my discussion. (White, 2008)

**Ben Wendel: The Manipulation of sound and ‘shapes’ in the construction of an improvised solo**

Luke Christopher Minness (B.A Hons, Edith Cowan University, 2013)

This dissertation focuses on identifying and defining several idiosyncratic devices that form a distinctive part of saxophonist Ben Wendel’s musical language. Minness transcribes and examines three of Wendel’s improvisations in the areas of harmony, rhythm, and articulation. He then goes on to outline the techniques and their manipulation from a macro perspective and offers consideration to the future development of each device with the influence of Wendel in mind. With the exclusion of articulation, Walter Smith’s improvisations are examined for similar parameters. Additionally, due to the difficulty of examining a contemporary artist such as Wendel, Minness’ paper helped guide and inform the direction and methodology of my research. (Minness, 2013)

**The performance style of Kenny Garrett**

Gene M Smith (D.M.A, University of Miami, 2001)

The paper by Gene Smith is the first scholarly examination of Kenny Garrett’s unique and distinctive performance style. Garrett is cited by Walter Smith as an early influence, “Growing up I listened to a lot of Coltrane, Wayne, Branford, Kenny Garrett” (Fong, 2011). This influence is clearly seen upon an aural examination of both artists’ performance. They both take a careful and measured approach to beginning a solo, preferring to develop a motif than jump in with dense lines and complex rhythms. Components of Garrett’s harmonic vocabulary have been assimilated by Walter Smith, included but not limited to the use of upper structure triads and side slipping. (G. M. Smith, 2001)

**iii. Blog Entries**

Blog entries are the most readily available literature discussing Smith’s style or musical output, often taking the format of a brief and casual interview. Due to this format, these sources are the least reliable in terms of their relevance to this investigation because discussion is frequently steered in a direction this paper is less concerned with. However, there has still been some valuable insight to be gained from careful perusal of these articles.

**Interview: Walter Smith III**
Phil Freeman, 2014

This is one of the longest and most insightful online interviews conducted with Smith. Freeman sheds light on the thought processes behind selecting the personnel featured on Smith’s latest recording, *Still Casual*. Smith also offers his thoughts on what has led to him working so prolifically as a sideman. Smith states that it has been “my ability to interpret music. The majority of what I’ve done professionally has been work as a sideman, and that is all about bringing life into someone’s music while still maintaining your own personality” (Freeman, 2014).

**Every single tree in the forest: Mark Turner as seen by his peers, part two**

Kevin Sun (musicandliterature.com), 2015

This blog post is more of an essay in both size and scope. Sun writes of the prolific influence Mark Turner has had upon the generation of saxophonists to immediately follow him, incorporating statements and anecdotes from many of these saxophonists of which Smith numbers amongst. Smith speaks to Sun of his high regard for Turner’s playing saying “it’s kind of like the sound” (Sun, 2015), referring here to how Turner’s sound and approach has been absorbed by a lineage of saxophone players. Smith goes on to summarise Turner’s monolithic influence on an entire generation of saxophone players by stating that “if they sound like Trane, they’re over forty; if they sound like Mark, they’re under forty (Sun, 2015)”. Additionally, Smith reflects on his formative years in music school and reflects on finding an original voice and escaping the pervasive shadow of Turner’s influence.

> I used to go in the Berklee practice rooms and sit there for hours and learn little things of Mark’s and perfect them,” says Smith, “but then I had to stop because I realized that it wasn’t just me—it was everybody that was doing it. I would go out in the hallway and everyone was working on the same stuff, so intentionally at the time I had to be like, ‘Okay, I have to find something else that’s not so popular right now (Sun, 2015).

This blog post gives the reader a great insight into the early struggles of Smith’s development as well as helping to place Smith in the lineage of saxophonists as one of the preeminent modern players.

**iv. Books**

There is a wealth of literature spanning several decades that discusses the topic of jazz improvisation. This literature discusses the various harmonic and rhythmic options available to improvisers and offers methods for practicing these techniques with the goal of incorporating it into performance practice.
How to improvise: An approach to practicing improvisation

Hal Crook, 1991

Hal Crook’s publication *How to Improvise* (Crook, 1991) offers a comprehensive list and thorough explanation of techniques and devices for jazz improvisation, as well as a practice methodology so that they can be reproduced organically in a live performance setting. The topics discussed range from exercises designed to de-regulate phrasing, to the application of substitute pentatonic scales. This text provides a valuable insight into the improvisational style of Smith as Crook was a lecturer for the duration of his study at the Berklee College of Music and it would be a logical conclusion that Smith studied under Crook and therefore some of his concepts would be ingrained in his playing.

A chromatic approach to jazz harmony and melody

David Liebman, 1994

*A Chromatic Approach To Jazz Harmony and Melody* (Liebman, 1994) is split into two components. The first segment is concerned with detailing Liebman’s specific approach to incorporating chromaticism into improvisation. There are many relevant chapters, such as tension and release, Chord superimposition, diatonic vs. modal and pedal point, which are accompanied by notated examples for possible use of chord superimposition in each of the aforementioned settings. The information presented in these pages serves as a very good cornerstone that is of value when discussing the use of chord superimposition demonstrated in Smith’s improvisation. The next component of the book delves into how to apply the concepts presented in the first chapter, to a context free from harmonic boundaries. Certain sections of this chapter are relevant as well, such as ‘Playing Melodies, Pattern and Variational Techniques’. Most of this second chapter is irrelevant to this investigation though as the improvisations being studied have a very clear harmonic context.
Chapter 2 - Framework for Analysis

This chapter outlines the specific musical devices relevant to Smith’s improvisational style. Each device is defined and explained, with examples provided, demonstrating how these techniques are annotated.

Phrasing

Motif Development

Smith makes frequent use of motifs and their development in his improvisation as a device to break his phrasing away from long, flowing 8th note lines. Hal Crook defines a motif as:

A small, thematic unit of melody roughly between 2 and 8 notes consisting of a single musical idea – generally not longer than 2 bars. A motif’s ending is determined by a brief or sustained period of rest or inactivity which defines the idea and allows time for its effect to be realised (Crook, 1991, p. 81).

Crook additionally prescribes a set of abbreviations to be used in the analysis of motif development exercises. This is adhered to when discussing how Smith shapes and develops his motif-based ideas. See Figure 2.1 for an example of how these abbreviations are utilised. A full list of abbreviations is included below.

![Motif Development Example](image)

*Figure 2.1 Example of motif development annotation*

- OM – Original motif
- MD – Motif development
- VA – Variation
- EX – Extension
- FR – Fragmentation
- FR/EX – Fragmentation/Extension
- EX/FR – Extension/Fragmentation
- R – Rhythm
Harmonic Displacement

Harmonic displacement can refer to either the expansion or contraction of chord duration (Crook, 1991, pp. 133-137). Chord contraction is where the duration of a selected chord is shortened, thereby anticipating the sound of the next chord. Chord expansion is the inverse, whereby chord duration is expanded and the sound of the next chord is delayed.

Smith frequently uses harmonic displacement as a multilayered device to extend the sound and effect of the harmonic and scale substitutions he uses. Instances of harmonic displacement is marked with a bracket as below in Figure 2.2, where we see B7 expanded to be heard over Fm7.

![Figure 2.2 Example of harmonic displacement](image)

Harmonic Substitution

Substitute chords have been used by jazz musicians as a device to “provide more challenging and interesting vertical structures on which to improvise” (Baker, 1969, p. 121). In *A Chromatic Approach to Jazz Harmony and Melody* David Liebman prescribes numerous specific harmonic devices to “serve as source material for melodic lines which will sound chromatic” (Liebman, 1994). Additionally, the framework used by Liebman to identify and discuss these substitutions is clear and concise and is adopted for this investigation. See Figure 2.3 below.
Harmonic substitutions take one of two forms pertaining to Smith’s improvisation. These are tritone substitution or side slipping.

Tritone substitution is defined by Jerry Coker as “the substituting, especially of dominant seventh chords, with a chord of the same type whose root is a tri-tone (diminished fifth or augmented fourth interval, or simply three whole-steps) away from the given chord” (Coker, 1991, p. 81). Liebman extends the applications of the device providing examples of tritone substitution in combination with uneven harmonic rhythm, side slipping, sequence change and chord quality substitution (Liebman, 1994, p. 17).

Side slipping is a specific form of harmonic substitution described by Coker as, “the practice of deliberately leaving the key, momentarily, and returning. Often the side-slip is to a key or chord that is a half-step higher than the given one, and pentatonic scales are often present” (Coker, 1989).

**Scale Quality Substitution**

This technique refers to substituting the normally associated scale for a given chord with another type of scale that is built from the same root note (Liebman, 1994). Liebman elaborates, advocating D phrygian and G lydian as possible scale substitutions for the more sonorous D dorian and G mixolydian. The choice of scale in this situation is entirely up to the musician and the colour they desire in that particular situation. As “the pull of the root remains intact, regardless of the scale colour” (Liebman, 1994).

Smith makes regular use of this technique to colour his lines and melodies. In Figure 2.4 below Smith can be seen clearly playing D phrygian over a D7 altered chord in his solo on *Stablemates*.

![Figure 2.3 Excerpt from A Chromatic Approach to Jazz Harmony and Melody](image-url)

![Figure 2.4 Example of scale quality substitution](image-url)
Melodic

Chromaticism

Smith’s use of chromaticism can be broken down to one of two devices, enclosure and targeting. These devices serve similar functions of targeting an object tone within a line or phrase.

Chromatic Enclosure

Chromatic enclosure is a melodic device in which an object tone is approached by both the upper and lower neighbouring chromatic tones. The object tone is the eventual note aimed for by the improviser (Coker, 1991, p. 50). This basic form of enclosure can be embellished with the addition of other surrounding chromatic tones to extend the effect of the technique. Additionally, the enclosure is often used in combination with other techniques to create a multilayered approach, for example being used to resolve a side slipping phrase to resolve a line. Object tones are labelled (OT) and the chromatic notes that target them designated with a plus (+). See Figure 2.5 below for example.

![Figure 2.5 Example of chromaticism](image)

Chromatic Targeting

On the linear applications of chromaticism, Jerry Coker says:

> Similar to the principle of the bebop scale, chromatic notes are often the result of a metric problem that results in adding one or more notes to cause the phrase to agree with the number of beats in a bar. (Coker, 1991, p. 81)

Smith frequently employs the use of successive chromatic tones to achieve what is herein referred to as ‘chromatic targeting’. This term describes the metric extension of a line to ensure the object tone falls at a point where it will have maximum effect i.e. beat one. Chromatic Targeting is labelled in the same manner as enclosures.

Pentatonic Scales

The pentatonic scale has been used throughout most of jazz history, forming the vocabulary of notable artists such as Freddie Hubbard, Chick Corea and Joe Farrell (Ricker, 1975). Jerry Bergonzi prefaced his methodology on the subject by saying “most modern players have pentatonics at their command and melodic disposal” (Bergonzi, 1994), and this statement definitely holds true for Smith. While traditionally pentatonic scales are broken up in “patterns in fourths and fifths” (Ricker, 1975) Smith tends to avoid such patterns, preferring to let the pentatonic scale sound be heard and using it in one of the following ways.
Harmonic Generalisation – where one scale is used exclusively over two or more chords in a progression (Coker, 1991, p. 45). Smith frequently uses the pentatonic scale as a device to connect common tones between chords within a progression. Figure 2.6 shows an example of this.

![Figure 2.6 Example of pentatonic usage facilitating harmonic generalisation](image)

Pentatonic Substitution – whereby the major pentatonic can be extracted from conventional 7 note chord scales and used as a source to derive melody for improvisation (Crook, 1991, p. 108). This can result in multiple major pentatonic scales being available options over any given chord ie. C (I), D (II), and G (V) major pentatonic scales are all available options over a Cmaj7 chord due to the nature of the major 3rd and major 7th or the absence of a 7th. Smith uses this to draw attention towards the upper extensions of the harmony, giving his lines more colour. See Figure 2.7 below.

![Figure 2.7 Example of pentatonic substitution](image)
Chapter 3 – July

In this chapter, *July* is examined to distil the harmonic and rhythmic techniques that comprise Smith’s unique musical vocabulary. Key figures and phrases that demonstrate these techniques will be dissected and discussed with excerpts of transcriptions shown. A full table outlining every instance of device usage is found in appendix ‘A’ and the full transcription can be found in appendix ‘B’.

Phrasing

**Motif Soloing and Development**

Smith’s improvisation on *July* is lent a cohesive and considered sound through his establishment and development of numerous motifs. Smith’s primary concern for the majority of his first chorus of improvisation is developing motifs, rather than running lines through *July*’s complex chord changes.

![Figure 3.1 Excerpt from Walter Smith’s solo on “July”, Still Casual (2014)](image)

Beginning in the opening bar of the solo, Smith establishes a short 3 note rhythmic motif, Figure 3.1. Smith then develops this motif upon its second hearing in bar 3. The process by which it’s developed will hereby be referred to as *Variation*, meaning that “the rhythm of a previous motif is repeated (more or less) in its entirety, (more or less) exactly while some or all of the melody changes” (Crook, 1991, p. 87). We see in this instance, Smith retains the first interval of a descending semitone from his original statement, but inverts the direction of the melody from there.

Smith continues to develop this opening motif in bar 4, this time through the fragmentation and expansion of the phrase with new melodic material. While the pitches remain the same (F# and C#) Smith again uses inversion to vary the original motif, playing an ascending perfect 5th as opposed to the descending one heard in bar 3. From here he descends the A# phrygian scale before enclosing ‘A’ the tonic of the Am11 chord he resolves his phrase over. The fragmentation and extension of the motif is a common device for motif development as it incorporates “the melody or melodic curve of only a segment or recognisable portion of a previous idea” (Crook, 1991, p. 88) which is immediately followed with new material.
Figure 3.2 Excerpt from Walter Smith’s solo on “July”, Still Casual (2014)

Figure 3.2 demonstrates Smith’s ability to take a phrase and weave subtle variations in his melodies in order to build and develop it. In bar 10 Smith introduces a new rhythmic motif which is developed with melodic variations each time it is heard. The original motif consists of 8 melodic pitches that are heard over a duration of 5 ½ beats. Each time this two bar phrase is played Smith maintains “the rhythm of the previous motif more or less in its entirety, while some or all of the melody changes” (Crook, 1991, p. 87). Smith makes subtle variations with melodic contour of his line, ascending in bar 12 where the original motif in bar 10 descended. Smith also consistently varies the rhythm in the second bar of his two bar motif as a method of development. He then returns to the rhythm of the original motif but displaces the phrase a beat, beginning the phrase a whole beat earlier, on the upbeat of beat one, rather than the upbeat of beat 2.

Harmonic Displacement

Figure 3.3 Excerpt from Walter Smith’s solo on “July”, Still Casual (2014)

In this passage, chord contraction is being used to anticipate the change of the underlying harmony (Figure 3.3). Bar 42 sees Smith’s line ascend through notes derived from the Eb dorian mode before hitting F# on beat three and, where the line changes direction and the scale choice reflects B melodic minor. Smith descends the lower portion of the scale playing the 5th, 3rd, 2nd and concluding on the tonic, B natural. The strength of this note choice is that the B and D are foreign to Eb dorian but are strong chords tones of Bmin(maj7). Anticipation serves to give some forward momentum to both phrasing and lines, as well as reinforcing strong melodic choices that give clarity to the harmonic progression.
Melodic

Chromaticism

In Figure 3.4 Smith incorporates chromatic tones to augment what would otherwise be a simple pentatonic line. The function of chromaticism in jazz is “often to metrically align a phrase so harmonically important notes are on strong beats” (Boling & Coker, 1993, p. 98). Smith includes Bb as a passing tone between B and A (the tonic and 7th of the Bm chord this occurs on) ensuring that these two chord tones are heard on successive downbeats. Preceding that, In bars 7 and 8, C# is approached by a semitone from both above and below, anticipating the object tone (C#) of an enclosure. Here, the function of the chromaticism is to “displace an expected chord tone causing a syncopated harmonic pattern in a line of equal rhythmic values” (Boling & Coker, 1993, p. 98). This displacement of chord tones results in the harmonic anticipation of Bm generating tension, and then release, as Bm first sounds dissonant against Cm11 but is then resolved when the harmonic progression catches up to Smith’s line.

Pentatonic Scales

In Figure 3.4, Smith uses the A major pentatonic scale as the basis for his line starting in bar 7 which stretches over two chords, Bm and C#m(b6). The A major pentatonic highlights numerous chord extensions over the Bm (7th, 9th, and 11th) and C#m(b6) (b6, 7th, 11th), giving the line harmonic complexity and colour as it goes beyond targeting notes in the chord voicings. This substitution works because Bm and C#m(b6) could be considered the ii and iii chord in the key of A major, and thus are diatonically related as both chords are derived from the same parent key.

In bars 21 and 22 of Figure 3.5, Smith employs a single pentatonic scale over one of the few V – I cadences in July. The A major pentatonic is played over both the A13sus4 and Dmaj7 chords. The more conventional choice in this harmonic scenario would usually be the I pentatonic, D major as it better targets the extensions of A13sus4, outlining the sus4 rather than the maj3 (Levine, 1995, p.
The use of the V pentatonic in this instance serves to expand the duration of the V chord, rather than just purely target chord tones and extensions, as in previous instances of pentatonic usage. “Expanding chord duration means the soloist extends the duration of a selected chord in a progression by one or more beats into the next chord” (Crook, 1991, p. 136). In this instance, Smith plays entirely through the bar sounding the I chord, delaying the resolution of his phrase by four beats and resolving a bar later by playing the 6th of Bm6 on the downbeat. This multilayered approach serves to give Smith’s melodic line a sense of continuity due to its pentatonic construction, as well as delay the resolution point of the Dmaj7 chord.

Additionally, if we look at bars 24 and 25, shown in Figure 3.5 we see Smith further making use of the V pentatonic over a tonic major chord. In bar 24, Smith ascends through the E major pentatonic scale over the sounding Amaj7 chord. Furthermore of interest is that this scale is used for the duration of the line connecting Amaj7 and Abminb6. The harmonic relationship of E major pentatonic to Abminb6 is the same as that discussed in Figure 4.4, where Smith uses the A major pentatonic to connect Bmin11 and C#minb6. This shows a consistency in Smith’s approach whereby he is frequently using pentatonic scales to connect chord sequences that may otherwise prove challenging to navigate. Additionally, we see him frequently applying these scales in certain harmonic settings i.e minor b6 chords.
Chapter 4 – Stablemates

In this chapter, *Stablemates* is examined to distil the harmonic and rhythmic techniques that comprise Smith’s unique musical vocabulary. Key figures and phrases that demonstrate these techniques will be dissected and discussed with excerpts of transcriptions shown. A full table outlining every instance of device usage is found in appendix ‘A’ and the full transcription can be found in appendix ‘C’.

Phrasing

*Motif Soling and Development*

![Figure 4.1 Excerpt from Walter Smith’s solo on “Stablemates”, Walter Smith III: Live in Paris (2009)](image)

Smith again chooses to establish and develop motifs in the opening of his solo on *Stablemates* and build into his more rhythmically dense phases and intricate lines. He establishes a short 4 note rhythmic motif being on the 2nd upbeat, as shown in bar 7 of Figure 4.1. This is developed immediately upon its repetition in bar 9, being displaced to the 4th upbeat and with the addition of new melodic material, extending the motif out to 6 notes rather than the original 4. Crook’s definition of extension allows the new material to “immediately precede the motif” (Crook, 1991). We see Smith use this form of extension here, adding the C and Bb before his development of the motif. The original rhythm and melodic curve are retained while the melody is transposed to target a G melody note, a common tone between Eb7 and Abmaj7 (3rd of Eb7 and major 7th of Abmaj7).

In bars 10 and 11, the original rhythm of the motif is restated, this time with a new melody and curve. Smith alters the direction and shape of the curve to fit the new underlying harmony. D major triad is arpeggiated over the A-7b5 and D7b9. From here, we return to fragmentation and extension when developing the next statement of the motif. The same rhythmic phrase as bar 9 is used to extend the phrase and a return to the melodic curve to the original motif, descending from the
minor 3rd of Gm7. Bar 14 sees Smith return to a fragmented variation of the original motif, as well as varying the melody. A triadic idea is used again, with B minor triad being superimposed over Bb7.

Figure 4.2 shows the introduction and development of a motif that is itself a fragment of the melody of Stablemates. This technique of referencing and embellishing the original song melody has been used in jazz since its conception. On the topic of thematic improvisation, Sonny Rollins offered the following regarding the development of themes in his now famous solo on Blue 7, “it's like holding the melody up to the light and rotating it, like a jeweller, to create new melodies” (Santoro, 2006). The segment Smith has referenced comes from the opening statement of the melody and can be seen below in Figure 4.3.

The first three notes of the original melody are taken as a fragment and used as the basis for all further motif development in this section. In bar 100, the fragment is heard, with melodic extension
taking place preceding and succeeding. The extension prior in this instance is a sequence of the fragment itself, reinforcing its strength as the original motif. The extension succeeding the fragment is a diminution of the original melody. Diminution is “a form of motif development where all (or most) of the note values of a motif are contracted or decreased by a noticeable amount” (Crook, 1991, p. 103). From the Ab, Smith plays all the note values of the melody as offbeat crotchets, condensing the phrase to eight beats instead of nine. Smith continues to use this fragment of his original idea, developing it using variations on the diminution of the original melody to extend it.

Beginning in bar 105, Smith begins using rhythmic displacement to create more unpredictable phrasing and further develop this motif. In bar 105, he starts the phrase on the third downbeat. Then in bar 107, the motif is played on the second upbeat before being heard for the final time on the first downbeat of bar 109. This displacement is combined with Smith using augmentation to expand the duration of the fragment. Augmentation is “a form of motif development using rhythmic embellishment where all or most of the note values of a motif are expanded or increased” (Crook, 1991, p. 101). This can be seen starting in bar 105 where the second note of the fragment (G) is doubled in value to a crotchet. This idea is taken further still in 107 where the first and second notes (E and G) are both doubled to crotchets, meaning the fragment is now heard over 3 beats rather than the original two.

This reference to the melody, and development of a motif based on it, is effective in providing the solo and the whole performance with a sense of unity. The allusion to the melody highlights the motif development taking place due to the phrase being instantly recognisable, while the simplicity of the melodic fragment (three notes) allows it to be easily manipulated and developed.

Harmonic Displacement

Bar 101 (shown in Figure 4.4) sees Smith contract D7 altered to anticipate Bbm7 three and half beats as the extension of a motif. The pitches Db, Eb and Bb are heard over D7 altered as off beat quarter notes beginning on the upbeat of beat 2. The Db is the most powerful melodic choice in this harmonic scenario as “the proper result is achieved by featuring those notes which are foreign to the original chord or chord scale” (Crook, 1991) and Db is a strong chord tone of Bbm7 (the minor 3rd), and not present in the D altered scale.
Smith employs harmonic displacement again seven bars later in bar 108 (shown in figure Figure 4.5), this time using chord expansion. Ab, E, Db and Bb are heard over Fm7, and while the Ab and Bb are common to both chords, the phrase as a whole reflects the 7th mode of Db melodic minor; the C altered scale more so than F dorian, especially as the phrase starts on E and finishes on Bb, the third and seventh of C7. Smith expands the C7 for the entirety of his two bar phrase and never clearly outlines the Fm7 in this instance.

This shifting of the harmony allows Smith’s motif based ideas and phrasing to develop in a more intuitive way. Smith extends the application of harmonic displacement beyond being a device to incorporate tension. Smith uses it to connect his ideas when developing and extending motifs as he can allow the harmony to be heard where it falls as a natural extension of his motifs rather than feeling obliged to state the harmony.

Harmonic Substitution

In the first bar of Figure 4.6, Smith’s line moves clearly outside the sounding harmony. This technique is called side slipping and is typically used to “add tension into lines built on static harmonies” (Boling & Coker, 1993, p. 100). It’s employed here over a ii V I with Emaj7 being implied over Fm7.
In the first ‘A’ of the next chorus we see Smith implement an identical side slipping idea over the same turnaround when it occurs in the second ‘A’ section. In bar 50 of Figure 4.7, Smith slips a semitone below the tonic, again superimposing E major over Fm7. In fact, this instance of side slipping is almost a verbatim repetition of the first instance. Beginning in bar 49, Smith again chromatically targets the E on beat one of bar 50, then the entire phrase over Fm7 is identical save for the last note which is ‘A’ in this instance rather than ‘A#’.

Smith immediately continues this side slipping idea in the successive bar. In bar 51, Smith begins by descending the upper tetrachord of Bb7, contracting its duration. Ebmaj7 is then anticipated with a side slip, with Smith playing a semitone below and outlining D major.

Figure 4.8 shows Smith weaving substitute chord changes amongst the original harmony on the ‘B’ section. Smith employs tritone substitution in bar 95, implying F#maj7 over C7. Then side slipping is used in bar 96 with Cmaj7 being substituted over Bmaj7. Also of note is that in addition to the harmonic substitution, scale quality substitution is used, with every substitute chord being of major 7 quality. The way the substitute chords are integrated amongst the original harmony helps achieve an ebb and flow in the chromaticism of the line, moving between ‘inside’ and ‘outside’ sounds.
Scale Quality Substitution

Figure 4.9 Excerpt from Walter Smith’s solo on “Stablemates”, Walter Smith III: Live in Paris (2009)

Figure 4.9 sees Smith substitute Bb half-whole scale over Bbm7. Smith begins in bar 80, by outlining a diminished 7th arpeggio beginning on C#, leading to a D on beat three. He then plays a diminished triad off Bb before extending the use of Bb half-whole over to the succeeding Eb7 chord. There he plays D and B, before hitting A and descending chromatically to outline Eb7. The placement of D on beat three of bar 80 and beat one of bar 81, reinforce the tension of this scale choice as it is extremely dissonant, being the major 3rd on Bbm7 and the major 7th on Eb7. This is quite a logical application of scale quality substitution as the implied dominant chord resolves downward by a perfect 5th (Bbm7 – Eb7), providing a release for tension generated by the device.

Melodic

Chromaticism

Figure 4.10 Excerpt from Walter Smith’s solo on “Stablemates”, Walter Smith III: Live in Paris (2009)

In bar 35 of Figure 4.10, Smith incorporates numerous chromatic techniques to construct a line that weaves horizontally through the harmony rather than spelling it out in a vertical manner. Smith briefly adopts a more intervallic, chromatic approach. Commencing on beat one over a C7 chord, we see a sequence of chromatically descending tones starting on Bb. Then, upon arriving at Ab (the #5 of C7) he descends the chromatic scale to target E natural on beat one of the next bar. This extensive use of chromaticism serves to alter the contour of the line and incorporate more of a sense of flow than what is achieved when Smith playing in a more vertical, harmonically oriented style.
Bar 128 of Figure 4.11 shows Smith embellish an enclosure with additionally surrounding chromatic tones. D and Gb immediately precede the D# and F that enclose the object tone, E in this line. This inclusion of additional chromatic tones serves to extend the duration of the technique, delaying the arrival of the expected object tone while ensuring it still falls at a metrically desirable point within the bar.

Furthermore, in bar 129, we see Smith incorporate successive instances of chromatic targeting, thereby introducing two object tones into one instance of chromaticism. Smith first ascends chromatically targeting Gb on beat 3, the major 3rd of D7. From here the line changes direction, descending through to bar 130 and targeting Cb on beat two, the b7 of Db7. These object tones are strong melodic choices, being guide tones (3rd or 7th) of the chords they are heard over. This helps ground Smith’s abundant use of chromaticism within the underlying harmony. Additionally, the use of successive targeting serves to vary the curve of Smith’s melodic line, making it less predictable.

**Pentatonic Scales**

In bar 78 of Figure 4.12, the V major pentatonic (Bb) is substituted over ii-V-I in Eb major. Smith, by playing Bb, G D over the ii-V, before ascending Bb major pentatonic from the tonic to the 6th, then descending back to the tonic over the duration of one bar of Ebmaj7. In this instance, Smith uses pentatonic substitution as a pure substitution to target upper extensions of the harmony, giving his line more colour.
Similar to the pentatonic scale in function and application, hexatonics were emergent on *Stablemates*. Hexatonics are six note scales formed from two triads that don’t share any common tones (Bergonzi, 2006). They’ve been included under pentatonics as they will be discussed by the same parameters. In Figure 4.13, Smith ascends a hexatonic scale comprised of a B major and C# major triad. This begins over Ab7 where the hexatonic choice would seem to suggest more of a dorian sound if it were heard in full. Continuing in the next bar, the C#/B hexatonic is heard in full over A7, where this choice becomes even more dissonant. Finally, over D7, Smith continues the descending contour of the line but omits F from the hexatonic, forming a B major pentatonic. This choice is again a perplexing one as these two tonalities are seemingly unrelated. On the subject of this apparent tonal ambiguity, Gary Campbell offers the following words in the preface to his method book discussing triad pairs (hexatonics).

The structure and ‘tensile strength’ of triads give the melodic line an independent internal logic. The ‘stand alone’ sound is oftentimes enough to make a strong, effective melodic statement regardless of how it is (or isn’t) relating to the harmony over which it is being used (Campbell, 2001).

It can be inferred, in this instance, that Smith is completely disregarding the underlying harmony and relying on the internal logic and inherent strength of triads to reinforce his melodic statement.
Chapter 5 – Comparison

There are three main points of comparison to be considered. These are the three points that comprise the framework for analysis, melody, harmony and phrasing. They are broken down into individual techniques below and represented in Figure 5.1. A full table detailing exact occurrences of the devices can be found in appendix ‘A’.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Devices</th>
<th>July</th>
<th>Stablemates</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Frequency</td>
<td>Frequency</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Motif Development</td>
<td>Extensive</td>
<td>Minimal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Harmonic Displacement</td>
<td>Minimal</td>
<td>Minimal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Harmonic Substitution</td>
<td>Never</td>
<td>Minimal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Scale Quality Substitution</td>
<td>Never</td>
<td>Extensive</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chromatic Enclosure</td>
<td>Minimal</td>
<td>Extensive</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ChromaticTargeting</td>
<td>Minimal</td>
<td>Extensive</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pentatonic Scales</td>
<td>Extensive</td>
<td>Extensive</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Figure 5.1 Table of device frequency and application*

**Phrasing**

Motif development is clearly a key concern for Smith, as both solos begin with the establishment and development of a motivic idea. Motifs are used extensively on *July*, where Smith commences his solo with simple motifs that are rhythmically repeated and developed through melodic variations, with long periods of rest between each development. In contrast, the solo on *Stablemates* sees Smith use motifs minimally, and develop them in a more rhythmic fashion. Smith frequently extends fragments of his original motif statements, developing them with the addition of new material. Motifs are frequently displaced as another method of development, often crossing the bar line and serving to delineate Smith’s phrasing.

Harmonic displacement is used minimally throughout both *Stablemates* and *July*. On *Stablemates* it is used as a multilayered device in combination with the displacement of a motif, substitution of a chord or a side slip. There are also instances where it is used purely to generate forward momentum in the solo. However, in the solo on *July*, harmonic displacement is only ever applied in this way. It’s never combined with other techniques, primarily because of the minimal application of harmonic devices and the fact that motifs aren’t being displaced as a method of development.
Harmony

Smith’s use of harmonic devices on *July* is seemingly non-existent. For the duration of the solo Smith outlines the changes in a logical and clear manner, with scale and melodic choices that reflect and are consonant with the harmonic progression.

In contrast to this, the solo on *Stablemates* features extensive use of harmonic substitution and scale quality substitution. ‘Side slipping’ is used to incorporate tension and move outside the sounding harmony. Smith uses side slipping in two different settings, firstly over the tonic I chord, but also the ii minor chord that precedes it as part of a ii V I. in both instances Smith slips a semitone below the root of the chord.

Melody

On both *July* and *Stablemates*, Smith makes extensive use of the major pentatonic scale. On *July* it is used to target specific chord extensions, such as the b6 by playing the A major pentatonic over C#minb6. However, this approach is exclusively multilayered, with Smith also applying that pentatonic over the preceding or succeeding chord. This harmonic generalisation allows Smith to be more creative melodically, as he isn’t considering each chord individually. It also assists in giving his solo a sense of cohesiveness, as he is applying the same melodic material to different harmonic contexts. In contrast, Smith’s application of pentatonics on *Stablemates* sees them used only over a single chord. Here they are used both as a substitution to target chord extension, and as a source of consonant melodic material to outline a chord.

The use of chromaticism differs vastly between Smith’s two solos. *Stablemates* sees Smith use both chromatic enclosure and chromatic targeting extensively, often incorporating both techniques simultaneously into his eighth note lines. Chromatic targeting is often extended by up to 7 consecutive notes before the object tone is arrived at. Chromatic enclosures are used frequently and often incorporate additional chromatic embellishments or rhythmic variations. Contrary to this the use of chromaticism on *July* is minimal and there are few instances of targeting or enclosure. Both devices are used briefly and when implemented, are not embellished like in *July*. Additionally, once Smith begins playing more consecutive line based ideas in the second chorus he basically avoids chromaticism altogether, preferring to play more modal and scalic ideas.
Conclusion

This investigation has concluded that the devices idiosyncratic to Walter Smith III’s unique style are, motif development, harmonic displacement, harmonic substitution, scale quality substitution, pentatonic scale use and chromaticism. This has been determined through the careful analysis of two musical transcriptions, *July* and *Stablemates*. Smith’s approach to phrasing is consistent, choosing to commence both solos by developing motifs. Melodic considerations show similar consistencies, with pentatonic scales forming an extensive part of Smith’s vocabulary on both songs. However, the application of chromaticism is far more frequent on *Stablemates*, due to the familiarity of it’s typical jazz progressions and their association with typical bebop devices. The most significant difference is found in the harmonic approach to each improvisation. There is no evidence found of any harmonic devices being implemented on *July*, while *Stablemates* features extensive use of side slipping, tritone substitution and scale quality substitution.

This investigation has given me a substantial amount to consider regarding my own playing. As evidenced on *Stablemates*, Smith’s thorough exploration and mastery over these devices is enough to inspire and inform additional personal investigation into their application and manipulation. Whilst the calm and considered approach demonstrated on *July* is a clear reflection of maturity and playing to best serve the musical situation. Smith’s clear outlining of the harmony and melodic creativity show that restraint and clarity can be the best approach when dealing with foreign harmonic environments.

Given the limited scope for this investigation there is plenty of room for further study in the field. A more in-depth study into Smith’s style could determine whether these findings are consistent across other performances of jazz standards and original compositions. Additionally, a more global study could be conducted to determine whether Smith’s approach to either of these settings has changed over time. The link between devices applied to jazz standards and original compositions could be explored further, with analysis of other musicians improvising on the same or similar songs being conducted.

Walter Smith III is a critically acclaimed, yet under studied contemporary saxophonist. The work he has produced under his own name, as well as his prolific work as a sideman has been a great inspiration to me and I’m glad to have had this opportunity to gain a deeper understanding of his approach. I am sure the information gathered from this study will be as inspiring and informative to others as it has been to me.
Reference List


Smith, W., III. (2010). *III: Criss Cross Jazz*.

Smith, W., III. (2014). *Still Casual*: Audio & Video Labs, Inc.

Smith, W., III. (2015). Walter Smith III

Associate Professor of Music.


Sun, K. (2015). Every single tree in the forest: Mark Turner as seen by his peers, part one.


## Appendix

### Appendix A – Complete table of device usage and frequency

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Devices</th>
<th>July</th>
<th>Stablemates</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Major Examples</td>
<td>Other Examples</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Motif Development</td>
<td>Figure 5.1, 5.2</td>
<td>18-19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Harmonic Displacement</td>
<td>Figure 5.3, 5.4</td>
<td>Bar 45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Harmonic Substitution</td>
<td>None</td>
<td>None</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Scale Quality Substitution</td>
<td>None</td>
<td>None</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chromatic Enclosure</td>
<td>Figure 5.4</td>
<td>Bar 47-48, 55</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chromatic Targeting</td>
<td>Figure 5.4</td>
<td>None</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pentatonic Scales</td>
<td>Figure 5.4, 5.5</td>
<td>Bar 56-57</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Appendix B – Transcription of July

July

Walter Smith III
Transcribed by Tom Walsh
Appendix C – Transcription of Stablemates

Stablemates

Benny Golson
Transcribed by Tom Walsh
Appendix D – Lead sheet for July

July Lead Sheet

Cm
Cm\n
Bm
Bm(\n
Am\nCm\nBm
Cm\n
Bm\nBm\nFm\n
Bm\nFm\nAbm\nBm\n
Bm\nBm\nBm\nA13\n
Dm\nBm\nAmaj\nAm\n
Fm\nFm\nFm\nGm(\n
Am\nFm\nGm\n
xxxix
Appendix E – Lead sheet for Stablemates

Stablemates

Benny Golson

Med. Swing

\[ j = 162 \]

\[ A \] \[ F^\#_{mi} \] \[ B^7 \] \[ F_{mi} \] \[ B^7 \] \[ E_{b\text{MA}}^7 \]

\[ D^{(163)} \] \[ B^7_{mi} \]

\[ A^7_{\text{MA}} \] \[ A_{mi}^{(163)} \] \[ D^7 \] \[ G_{mi}^7 \] \[ C^7(4\text{3}) \]

(Latin)

\[ F_{mi}^7 \] \[ B^7_{mi}^{(163)} \] \[ E_{b\text{MA}}^7 \]

(Swing)

\[ G_{mi}^7 \] \[ A^7_{b\text{13}} \] \[ A^7_{(163)} \] \[ D^7 \]

(trp w/ ten 8va b.)

\[ D^7 \] \[ C^7 \] \[ B^7 \] \[ B^7 \]

\[ D^7 \] \[ D^7 \] \[ G_{mi}^7 \] \[ C^7 \]

\[ F^7_{\text{mi}} \] \[ B^7 \] \[ B^7 \]

\[ E_{b7}^7 \] \[ A^7_{\text{MA}} \] \[ A_{mi}^{(163)} \] \[ D^7 \] \[ G_{mi}^7 \] \[ C^7(4\text{3}) \]

\[ C^7(4\text{3}) \]

(Latin)

\[ F_{mi}^7 \] \[ B^7_{mi}^{(163)} \] \[ B^7 \] \[ E_{b\text{MA}}^7 \] \[ D^{(163)} \] \[ B^7_{mi} \]

Chords in parentheses at B are used for solos. Solos swing, no breaks.