
Sam Nester

Edith Cowan University

Follow this and additional works at: https://ro.ecu.edu.au/theses_hons

Part of the Music Practice Commons

Recommended Citation

This Thesis is posted at Research Online.
https://ro.ecu.edu.au/theses_hons/1323
Modern Performance Trends In Bach's
Sacred Music

Changing tastes in the performance of Bach's
Weihnachtsoratorium: an exploration of the rhetorical style.

Sam Nester

Western Australian Academy of the Performing Arts
Edith Cowan University

This dissertation is submitted for the degree of Bachelor of Music Honours

2009
Abstract

This dissertation investigates changing tastes in the performance practice of Johann Sebastian Bach's sacred music from the second decade of the Twentieth Century to the present day. In particular I focus on the ‘rhetorical style’, and offer a comparative study of four recordings of Bach's *Weihnachtsoratorium* (Christmas Oratorio) BWV 248 by Harnoncourt (1973), Gardiner (1987), Jacobs (1997), and Suzuki (1998). Though all of these interpretations would be categorised as being in the ‘rhetorical style’, I attempt to show that within this classification there exists a multiplicity of performance approaches.
Declaration

I certify that this thesis does not, to the best of my knowledge and belief:

(i) Incorporate without acknowledgement any material previously submitted for a degree or diploma in any institution of higher education;

(ii) Contain any material previously published or written by another person except where due reference is made in the text;

(iii) Contain any defamatory material.

I grant permission for the Library at Edith Cowan University to make duplicate copies of my thesis as required.

Sam Nester

04/02/2010
Acknowledgements

I wish to thank my supervisor Stewart Smith, the director of classical music at the Western Australian Academy of the Performing Arts. Smith encouraged my study into Bach performance practice and his continued knowledge, insights and patience have proved invaluable to this project. I would also like to thank David Elton my performance tutor here at the academy. It was his inspirational teaching and commitment to education that convinced me to attend the Honours course at WAAPA. I would like to extend my gratitude to all the staff at the academy who assisted me with my studies, and allowed me the grace to continue my commitments outside of the institution throughout 2009.

Above all, I wish to thank my parents, Matthew Nester and Christine Nester, who have supported my studies since the beginning. It is their patience and caring that has encouraged me to achieve my goals.
Table Of Contents

Introduction

1. Chapter One - Performing Bach In The Age Of Recording
   1.1 Twentieth Century Performance Styles
   1.2 Bach the Romantic
   1.3 Bach the Modernist
   1.4 The HIP Bach
   1.5 Record Reviews - The Age of the Gramophone
   1.6 Summary

2. Chapter Two - The Rhetorical Style In Theory
   2.1 Oratory and Its Early Development
   2.2 The Impact of Rhetoric on German Baroque Music
   2.3 Rhetorical Figures
   2.4 Twentieth-Century Interpretation
   2.5 Twentieth-Century Interpretation Under Scrutiny
   2.6 Summary

3. Chapter Three - The Rhetorical Style In Practice: Evaluating Four Recordings Of Bach’s Weihnachtsoratorium
   3.1 An Exploration of the Rhetorical Style
   3.2 Recording; an Art in Itself
   3.3 Instrumentation
   3.4 Ornamentation
   3.5 Continuo
   3.6 Summary

4. Conclusion

5. Bibliography

6. Appendix 1 – A list of Rhetorical Figures Taken from Bartel

7. Appendix 2 – Analysis of Continuo playing in Es Begab Sich Aber Zu Der Zeit
Introduction

The past decade has seen an ever-growing body of scholarship that aims to describe and classify the various performing styles associated with Bach’s music. For sometime now there has been essentially two schools of early-music performance; the symphonic style, and its opposition, the historically-informed style. This attitude has been re-assessed in Bruce Haynes’s most recent book The End of Early Music (2007). According to Haynes, there are three separate and definable schools of performance throughout the Twentieth Century; the romantic, the modern and the historically-informed. This Dissertation goes further and offers an additional subdivision of the historically informed performance style (HIP) by recourse to the analysis and comparison of four recordings, all broadly considered as being historically informed. This dissertation also contextualises historical performance practice through recourse to the aforementioned performance styles.

Chapter one delineates characteristics of these styles by referencing both recent literature in the area and by recourse to the evidence from historical recordings. The remainder of the dissertation focuses on the latest stylistic manifestation, the HIP or the ‘rhetorical’ style. It is argued that the common denominator behind this performance movement is the preoccupation with rhetoric. Chapter two offers a history of rhetoric, with particular reference to German Baroque music at the time of Johann Sebastian Bach, and the concluding chapter of this dissertation focuses on the practical application of these rhetorical principles through a close study of four recordings of Bach’s Weihnachtsoratorium (Christmas Oratorio).
Chapter 1

Performing Bach In The Age Of Recording

1.1 Twentieth-Century Performance Styles

The Twentieth Century, in all facets, saw constant change. Political powers rose and fell, systems of government were re-invented, technology ever-changed and humans pushed the boundaries of their own existence, creating and inventing, all in the pursuit of progress. This constant reforming, ever-changing attitude, this 'Modernist' ideology, was to dominate all aspects of life and art. Thus, twentieth-century composition is characterised by constant change, and each decade brought about new techniques and ideas, with composers from across the globe forming ever-changing and newer styles.¹ Whilst this created endless possibilities, and gave way to new and exciting structures, genres, sounds and roles for music, this attitude also created a widespread self-destructive environment, the effects of which are still evident in the arts world today.²

Compositional style was not the only aspect of music that saw this type of change, the way in which music was being performed and interpreted transformed also. Happily, the period under discussion coincides with the age of sound recording and it is thus possible to document and analyse these shifting performance trends through representative recordings. The music of Bach, and of the Baroque period in general, saw a great shift in approach during this time. A recent attempt to define and classify these styles appears in The End of Early Music by Bruce Haynes (Haynes, 2007). This chapter will build on Haynes, amongst others, to help best describe and define these differing approaches in relation to performing the music of J.S. Bach. It also explores how these approaches progressed and mutated from the second decade of the Twentieth Century to the first decade of the Twenty-First.

¹ Specifically referring to the Modernism movement of the twentieth century composers of John Cage, Pierre Boulez, Karlheinz Stockhausen, and Igor Stravinsky etc.
² The views expressed here on this movement having a detrimental effect on art today can be found by writers including; Albright, Haynes, Badiou, Pleasants, Honegger.
1.2 Bach the Romantic

When we listen to the early phonograph recordings by artists reared in the latter half of the 19th century, we are struck not by the felicities or the gaucheries of their artistry but by how very different the performing premise seems to have been from that to which we are now accustomed—how very high the level of whimsicality and caprice, how very flirtatious and extravagant the range of dynamics... to what a very large extent they must have depended on the visual connection, on the supplemental choreography of movement and gesture. (Gould, 1965, quoted in Payzant, 1978, p.44)

The so-called romantic performance style appears from the very beginning of the Twentieth Century. This style was born out of romantic composition and is associated with the works of the last great romantic composers - Richard Strauss, Gustav Mahler and Richard Wagner etc. It is characterised by fluctuating tempos, portamenti and an unrelenting earnestness (Golomb, 2004, p.40). It is the easiest of performance styles to recognise, as it is now extinct, and no one dares a revival (Haynes, 2007, p.33). Haynes makes the point that 'it differs from other lost traditions in being documented in sound recordings' (Haynes, 2007, p.34).

Rhythmic freedom and concern for expression characterise this style. Also noticeable is the lack of precision and a certain acceptance of the inevitability of mistakes. Michelle Dulak in an article entitled The Quiet Metamorphosis of ‘Early Music’ characterises this style as ‘heavily inflected, free perhaps ‘sentimentalised” (Dulak, 1993, p.46). She describes the glowing opulent sounds associated with the music of Mahler and his contemporaries. It was Mengelberg3 and his contemporaries that ignored what is known of how Bach himself played, and these individuals in fact attempted to turn him into a contemporary of Wagner (Haynes, 2007, p.35).

3 Willem Mengelberg (1871-1951) a Dutch conductor of the Royal Concertgebouw Orchestra who conducted St. Matthew Passion on Palm Sunday every year from 1899. He is remembered mainly for his Gustav Mahler interpretations. (Ewen, 1978)
Also notable in this style is a strong obsession with melody. In fact, in the Baroque period, it was the *bass* that informed the melody. A common task required of all eighteenth-century music students was to write good top parts over given basses (Butt, 1994, p.226). Thus it was engrained and natural that melodic gesture should mimic and highlight the events occurring in the bass. Contrast this with Wagner's approach: 'what unique importance it is to every musical message, that the melody shall hold us without cease' (Wagner, 1873, p.247).

Thus, early twentieth-century Bach interpreters did not find the system of working from the bass up as immediately obvious due to the then obsession with melody, and the predominant romantic ideology of long legato melodic gestures. Haynes cites an example of this in a recording made by Stokowski in 1957, of Bach's Air from the third orchestral suite, BWV 1068. He states ‘...it is the Bass line that is probably the most interesting part...’ (Haynes, 2007, p.35) however when listening to Stokowski, he highlights the upper part with dynamic nuance and expression, shaping from the top, voicing out of pure intuition, and certainly not from any information revealed through the bass line.

---

4 Leopold Stokowski (1882-1977) was a British born, American conductor who brought orchestras to the international stage with notable performances of Mahler, Stravinsky, Sibelius etc. He recorded many times for both film and record labels with a multitude of composers (Daniel, 1982).
1.3 Bach the Modernist

*A consistent dogma based around objectivism, positivism, geometricism, depersonalisation and the separability of the aesthetic realm from all other aspects of life.* (Taruskin, 1995, p.167)

The modernist performance style was born around the 1930s as a direct reaction to the explicit sentimentality of Romanticism. As such, the traits that define the modern style appear in opposition to almost all aspects that define Romanticism and its associated performance style. In stark contrast to Romanticism's freedom, the modernist performance style represents that of controlled restrictions and a literalism to written scores. It is characterised by strict adherence to rhythmic detail, unyielding tempi and unstressed dissonance (Hill, 1994, p.40). Haynes remarks that, 'Modern style is prudish, the musical equivalent of 'political correctness' (Haynes, 2007, p.49). This mechanical coldness is akin to unrelenting audible mathematics, and has been the principle performing style taught in conservatories the world over from the mid-Twentieth Century to the present day. Haynes makes the rather amusing, but somewhat valid, point that its spirit is summarised by the graffiti found in the bathroom of a conservatory in America reading: 'Chops, but no soul.'

Dorottya Fabian in her book *Bach Performance Practice 1945 – 1975*, refers to recordings dating from 1950s-1970s of the Adagio of Bach's *Brandenburg concerto No. 1*, that:

... strive for a sustained line with hardly any caesuras, breathing, or lifting the bow. Intense tone production, dynamically shaped long phrases, strict metre and rhythm, lack of pulse, playing all notes with equal importance and slurring them all together in a continuous legato characterise most of the versions. (Fabian, 2003, p.165)

She is describing the modern style and lists recordings by musicians including Maazel, Klemperer and Menuhin (amongst fourteen recordings), all of which emulate this Modern style.

---

5 This date can be found in Haynes, p.49 and refers to the period directly following WWI. This is generally accepted to be the time that the Modernist performance attitude permeated. For a further exploration of this, see “Overcoming Romanticism: On the modernisation of 20th century performance practice” In *Music and performance during the Weimar Republic* by Robert Hill 1994 pg. 37-58.
1.4 The HIP Bach

If I am not mistaken, Romanticism is departing with a noisy farewell... Let us not emulate those fashionable hosts, of whom Shakespeare speaks, who take leave negligently of the departing guest. Let us bow down, very low. Romanticism gave us strong emotions and unforgettable ecstasies; it awoke in us unbound ideas and supreme flights of fancy; it flattered our palate with tart and bitter fruit, which seemed so good after an overabundance of sweetness; it brushed our skin with the coarse caress of a wild beast. May all the centuries to come look with full respect and envy upon its grandeur, which is still hovering sovereignly. (Landowska in Restout, 1964, p.54)

Since the 1960s a movement has been developing with the preoccupation of performing the music of earlier periods, with a concern for historical accuracy. A number of titles including ‘early music movement’, ‘authenticity movement’ and the ‘historical performance movement’ amongst others, are used to refer to this trend (Fabian, 2003, p.1). Some of the names that drove this developing fashion in historically informed performances (HIP) include Nikolaus Harnoncourt, Frans Brüggen and Gustav Leonhardt. Their work, though at times varies in ideology of approach, nevertheless advocates the use of period instruments (or replicas thereof), period temperament, and smaller-sized ensembles to create a sound world close to that which is believed to be consistent with seventeenth and eighteenth century performance.

The only thing I can think of that “was current for Monteverdi and will remain for all times” is the style he worked in. Style can jump centuries. It is the only relevant criterion for ascription and for replicating. (Haynes, 2007, p.120)

HIP delves into the discovery of performance traits of earlier centuries including aspects such as instrumentation, temperament, size of choir, phrasing, articulation, ornamentation, inflection, beat hierarchy and all aspects that form the very foundation of this music. There has, however, been much discussion regarding the accuracy of such research.
Whilst there are features of this research that are verifiably historically accurate, such as the size of performance ensembles and the pitch of consort music etc., much of the interpretative style that has been created over the preceding half a century is speculative and cannot be confirmed.

We hear what we believe; we cannot know what it is that they heard (Leech-Wilkinson, 2002, p.223)

Nikolaus Harnoncourt has been at the forefront of the early music movement from the 1960s and makes a valid point on research into this field stating:

Everything achieved up to the present in this area is hypothetical in nature and will remain so forever because this music in its true form has died away once and for all. (Harnoncourt, 1989, p.8)

Whilst many of the theories put forward by music historians are supported with much primary evidence, they tend to remain simply that of theories. Haynes states:

This means accepting that all our research into “how it was really played” – performance practice – amounts to theories that, though plausible, cannot be proven. (Not that they are less interesting or less usable for being unproven!) (Haynes, 2007, p.146)

Hayne's argument above is one of the most compelling realisations of this performance movement. This attitude is accepting of the inability of this research to “prove” particulars in the field of a “dead art”, but also validates it by the way in which it may shape and develop trends in performance through its plausibility and its presentation of ideas.

We must understand the genuine musical concerns of Monteverdi and understand how those concerns are reflected in living music. We must attempt as musicians to see with new eyes everything that was current for Monteverdi and to reanimate it, to render it with our feelings, our 20th-century mentality – for certainly we do not wish to return to the 17th century. (Harnoncourt, 1989, p.26)

A total acceptance and belief in these theories can sometimes lead to the overindulgence in ideas that do not necessarily have enough supporting evidence to make them the definitive, plausible attributes of the style. This will be further discussed in the chapter on musical rhetoric.
The Twentieth Century was a time of great change and music was certainly no exception. Compositional style became individualised and experimental, and the way in which musicians approached performance was constantly transforming. Due to the advent of recording in the late Nineteenth Century, these performance traits can be documented and can be examined with relative ease. The following section of this dissertation examines some of these recordings and documents the changing approach to Bach's music across the Twentieth Century.
1.5 Record Reviews – the Age of the *Gramophone*

The *Gramophone* magazine, that undisputed arbiter of present musical taste, has in fact been in print since the 1920s. When examining its back issues chronologically it is clearly evident that performance tastes have changed drastically. The pioneering work of Nikolaus Harnoncourt and Gustav Leonhardt in the 1960s paved the way for what was to be coined Historically Informed Performance (HIP). This approach spawned a new trend in Bach performance that has become the common performance style today. It is interesting to examine the reviews of these recordings and compare them to reviews made much earlier in the century, as they paint a vastly different image of the tastes surrounding this music.

HIP as a movement has taken on a role as a mainstream style of the past 30 years. The reviews of recordings made of the *Christmas Oratorio* that pre-date 1980, differ in concern for aspects of performance with those which post-date this period. In a review of an HMV recording of *Slumber, beloved (Christmas Oratorio)*, from the *Gramophone* magazine December 1949, the critic reviewing under the abbreviation ‘T.H.’ states that the contralto Marjorie Thomas, ‘...phrases and sings her words very well.’ In a similar review of a complete recording of the work, dated August 1952 ‘A.R.’ refers to the trumpet playing with the concern that it is, ‘...not always with perfect intonation’. In December 1993 when comparing a (then) recent recording with that of the earlier Harnoncourt Tölz Boys recording, ‘JF-A’ makes the point that:

...those who know this meditational account will recall that the instrumental playing needs to be tolerated for its technical imperfections, an alien concept in more recent recordings such as this, where Bach’s virtuosic tours de force are tossed off with remarkable nonchalance.

---

6 It is difficult to ascertain the full names of these reviewers as the *Gramophone* website does not allow for a search of reviewers abbreviated names. The names closer to today are known (such as Jonathan Freeman-Attwood, JF-A), however it becomes more difficult to determine the further back the date of the review.
Reviews of the 1980s onward present differing concerns. The aspects of intonation, annunciation and instrumental prowess have become a requisite by now when making recordings, and do not feature as those attributes that categorise particularly high quality recordings.

One review of February 1999 states, 'Schlafe, mein Liebster provides a fine example of this thinking-through of tempo and Affekt.' From December 1984 a review contains, 'The variety, both in colour and in 'affective' expression contained in the Christmas Oratorio is enormous and is well exploited by the artists in this new recording.' In the same article the author writes:

There is no doubt that the influence of the 'period'-instrument revival has had an effect on performances such as this. Vocal and instrumental vibrato is used sparingly and is well controlled; recitatives are stylishly accompanied for the most part and tempos, by and large, are brisker than we would have found in comparable performances a decade ago.

The article refers to a performance by the Lausanne Ensemble and Chamber Orchestra and is realised on modern instruments. The article goes on to discuss period instrument performance and asks the readers if they are, 'broad-minded enough to appreciate outstandingly musical interpretations (regardless of the fact that this performance is not on period instruments).'

When reading a review of a mere five years prior in 1979, comparing two recordings made in 1973 by Harnoncourt and 1976 by Schneider, the attitude toward this now common practice is expressed with substantial difference:

In this new performance directed by Schneider the treble and alto solos are sung by boys, a more-or-less baroque band is employed, and the pitch is half a tone lower than present day concert pitch.

Reviews after this time do not mention baroque pitch and period instrumentation, unless there is the employment of a 'non-standard' continuo instrument. It has become the norm to perform in a style and setting similar to that presented in the early recordings of Harnoncourt and Leonhardt. If instrumentation were to be mentioned in a modern

---

7 This will be further explained in the final chapter of this dissertation outlining the differences in the four HIP recordings used in this research. See the subheading Continuo.
review, it would only be to question the use of modern instrumentation (as seen in the 1984 review above). Period instruments have become expected, and there is no longer a need to 'warn' the listener (as seen in 1979).

It is safe to say that this style is now well-established as the norm. What is interesting to note is the almost overnight success of this practice. It only took the groundbreaking work of a small group involved with Harnoncourt and Leonhardt to change the face of baroque performance practice. This brings into question the rate at which shifting trends in art occur. When considered, this notion is examined as a gradual change, however there are instances of rapid transformation (such as the introduction of the rhetorical style). The disappearance of portamento in orchestral performance is another example of changing taste that seemed to happen without warning. There is no definitive date in which this style was lost, but it appeared to suddenly disappear from orchestral playing during the middle of the Twentieth Century.
1.6 Summary

During the Twentieth Century the factors that determined a high-quality 'tasteful' performance changed as the century progressed. The record reviews in the *Gramophone* magazine chronicle most of this period, and in relation to Bach performance practice the evidence tellingly shows us that successive generations of performers and listeners simply heard different things and valued different things. It is not the purpose of this chapter to make the statement that today's interpretation is better than the preceding interpretations—indeed it would be folly to do so. On the contrary, this chapter simply shows the historical antecedents of the modern 'rhetorical style'. Now that this style can be seen in context, the remainder of this dissertation will concentrate solely on the 'rhetorical style'. Chapter two traces the conceptual underpinnings of the 'rhetorical style', and in doing so also underlines the relationship of classical rhetoric to performing the music of J.S. Bach. Chapter three looks at the application of these principles in four representative recordings of Bach's *Weihnachtsoratorium*. 
Chapter 2

The Rhetorical Style In Theory

2.1 Oratory and the Early Development

I am Music, who with sweet accents can make every restless heart peaceful and inflame the coldest minds, now with anger, now with love. (Monteverdi, the prologue to Orfeo)

Rhetoric is the art of eloquent speech employed by lawyers and statesman and dates from the fifth Century B.C. Later this art not only was embraced by the medieval school men of the early Christian church, it was also adopted by the first universities, and played a significant educational role in the Lutheran schools of Bach’s time. Rhetoric gradually received a set of rules that were outlined by Greek and Roman Philosophers and Rhetoricians. These men – the most prominent being Aristotle, Cicero and Quintilian – taught this new linguistic art in schools and academies (Haynes, 2007, p.165).

It was not until the Lutheran school reforms of the Sixteenth Century that rhetoric took a high priority in Lateinebullen and universities (Bartel, 1996, p.64). It was Phillip Melanchthon\(^8\), who re-introduced this system of learning. His text *Institutiones Rhetoricae* was (as the title suggests) a set of instructions in approach to rhetoric. This created a primary source for others such as Lucas Lossius\(^9\) to write treatises including *Erotemata Dialecticae et Rhetoricae Philippi Melancthonis*, which became a classroom textbook. Cantors of Luther’s time frequently found themselves teaching music as well as Latin. This included both grammar and rhetoric, suggesting an early relationship between the two arts (Butt, 1994, p.10).

---

\(^8\) Philipp Melanchthon (1497-1560), a humanistically inclined associate of Luther who was a driving force behind the school reforms and implementation of rhetoric in education (Bartel, 1997, p.65).

\(^9\) Lucas Lossius (1508-1582), a German Lutheran theologian and educator at the time of the reformation who wrote a series of textbooks based on the teachings of Phillip Melancthon. (Leaver, 2007, p.328)
It was through these aforementioned texts that Joachim Burmeister\textsuperscript{10}, the author of the very first *Musica Poetica* treatise in the early Seventeenth Century, would have received his first instruction (Harrison, 1990, p.2). Burmeister’s text provided a detailed approach to musical composition with specific reference to rhetorical terminology and methodology. It has been heralded as ‘the most significant consequence of combining music and rhetoric’ (Eggebrecht, 1968, p.270), which in turn, influenced German composition throughout the Baroque period.

\textsuperscript{10} Joachim Burmeister (1564-1629), a German theorist, teacher and cantor who contributed the most to make rhetoric part of *musica poetica* (Butt 1994, p.47)
2.2 The Impact of Rhetoric on German Baroque Music

During the German Baroque period, musical rhetoric was taught in schools and academies. This art was explained as relating music to 'speech-in-tones'. Even by this stage, the art of oratory and music seemed to develop in parallels. Quintilian,¹¹ in his *Institutio Oratoria*, compares rhetoric and music in terms of delivery. He relates the story of how the famous orator, C. Sempronius Gracchus, placed a musician with a pitch pipe behind him while he spoke so that he could hear the tones on which he should pitch his voice (in Ruhnke, 1955, p.132-133).

The acts of composition and performance were to be in direct comparison to the creation and delivery of verbal oratory. This was with reference to the same four stages: *Inventio* (the creation of appropriate thematic materials); *Dispositio* (formal organisation); *Decoratio* (ornamentation or decoration); and *Pronuntiatio* (delivery or performance) (Golomb, 2004, p.85). As rhetoric was bound to speech, so too was it bound to music. It was intended to both assist in captivating an audience, and also to convey the meaning of its sentiment. This had great implications for the marrying of music and text, whereby music was designed to enhance the emotion of a text and increase its impact on an audience (Haynes, 2007, p.170). Through rhetoric came a perfect device, with a guideline of rules and regulators, specifically for the purpose of portraying an emotion or reflection of the text.

...Baroque musical rhetoric, on the other hand, aims at "moving, unbalancing" the listener, arousing in him "a succession of emotional states" which would render him "more receptive to the seduction of a message" (Herreweghe, 1985, p.27)

---

¹¹ Marcus Fabius Quintilian (c.35-c.100) a Roman rhetorician and well respected teacher, born in Calagurris, Spain, remembered for his *Institutio Oratoria*. 
2.3 Rhetorical Figures

A musical-rhetorical figure was generally regarded as an artful and expressive musical device which digressed from either the simple, unadorned musical idiom or the established rules of counterpoint. (Bartel, 1997, p.84)

The musical rhetorical figures described by theorists such as Burmeister, outlined specific compositional techniques. Many of these figures retained common titles with those in classical linguistic rhetoric. Burmeister’s *gradatio* for example, is defined as a melodic fragment repeated in sequences of ascending seconds; his *syncope* is a suspension; *noema* is a homophonic section within a larger contrapuntal form etc. Included in these figures are instances of dissonance, word painting, repetition, chromaticism, sequence, inversion and cadences, all coined from terms given to the figures of classical rhetoric [such as Walther’s\(^{12}\) *exclamatio*, an ascending leap of a minor sixth (Harrison, 1990, p.7)]. A comprehensive list of these figures can be found in Dietrich Bartel’s *Musica Poetica* along with detailed definition, translation, categorizations and explanations of individual figures and their usage (see appendix 1, a summarised list of figures taken from Bartel). Individual figures will be discussed in further detail in succeeding chapters, with direct reference to musical examples in J.S. Bach’s *Weihnachtsoratorium*.

---

\(^{12}\) J.G. Walther (1684-1748) organist, composer and theorist contributing to the ideals of *Musica Poetica* and compositional technique especially concerned with rhetoric in music. (Butt 1990, p.18-19)
2.4 Twentieth-Century Interpretation

Rhetoric's role as a fundamental in the construction of German Baroque music presented historians and Bach performers in the 1960s with a series of parameters to exploit for historical interpretation.

Composers who were writing with a rhetorically informed education (virtually all German Luthern musicians) would have been using these figures to enhance and shape their music (Bartel, 1997, pg.67). This created a great resource for musicians from the 1960s onward, who were attempting to create a more expressive performance style for J.S. Bach's works. Many wished to move away from the rigidity of much commonplace contemporary Bach performance, whilst still keeping distance from the Romantic styling of such musicians as Willem Mengelberg and Otto Klemperer (discussed in the previous chapter).

Music prior to 1800 speaks, while subsequent music paints. The former must be understood, since anything that is spoken presupposes understanding. The latter affects us by means of moods, which need not be understood, because they should be felt. (Harnoncourt, 1988, p.39)

This theory of interpretation gave rise to an idea of localised, internal swelling of musical gesture, phrase, dynamic and articulation. The idea of long *sostenuto* lines and grand gestures are replaced with more refined shaping, relating closer to the idea of rhetorical figures. This rhetorical performance style focused on the ways in which both text and instrumental lines relate specifically to 'speech-like' mannerisms.

Uri Golomb in his doctoral dissertation *Expression and meaning in Bach performance and reception*, states the three ideologies behind the rhetorical approach. These are based on the classification of figures and how they relate to performance styles of Bach's music. He lists:

A. Rhetoric as speech: Music follows the patterns of speech, and should be articulated accordingly;
B. Rhetoric as semantics: Musical-rhetorical figures applied at the Decoratio stage have direct extra-musical meaning;
C. Rhetoric as structure: Musical works are structured according to the principles of a good oration, as described in classical and Renaissance treatises. (Golomb,
Golomb further discusses these ideologies and their individual traits.

**Rhetoric as Speech** refers to performance inflected with speech-like mannerisms. This has direct implications for articulation, rhythm, dynamics and sonority. Articulation should reflect speech similar to great actors or orators, with clear punctuation and pronunciation. This stands against the idea of long sostenuto lines typically heard in ‘Romantic’ interpretations. Rhetorical interpretations should therefore pay ‘more attention to the details of the phrase (instead of projecting long, uninflected lines)’ (Gustav Leonhardt, in Sherman, 1997, p.196). Rhythm is discussed best in Bernard Sherman’s 1997 book *Inside Early Music: Conversations with Performers*. Gustav Leonhardt states that the Nineteenth Century ‘is for sustained sounds, which are always under tension and always nourished’, whereas Baroque music is ‘more like speaking, which means wave-like, constantly rising then loosening up even within a single sentence’ (in Sherman, 1997, p.196). Dynamics in this sense are reflected in wave-like performances, still retaining a speech-like flavour. However, this does create conflict with the idea of terraced dynamics\(^\text{13}\) (Lawson and Stowell, 1999, p.53-54). With regards to rhetoric’s affect on sonority, it is easy to relate rhetorical interpretations with small-scale speech-like inflections, compared with romanticism’s continuity of intensity in sound.

\(^{13}\) Dynamic markings occur only sporadically in music of the Baroque period. The erroneous 20th-century concept of ‘terrace dynamics’ was based on an overly literal interpretation of the scanty dynamic performance terms of the time. Such graduated dynamics of register were more or less peculiar to the harpsichord and organ, which during the Baroque period gave way to continuo instruments capable of more nuanced dynamics. The organ too expanded its dynamic range with the invention of the swell-box in 1676 by Thomas Mace.” (Matthias Thieme, Grove)
Rhetoric as Semantics relates to a system of affections (Affektenlehrе) and of meaningful musical figures (Figurenlehrе). The theory of rhetoric as semantics refers to composers of the Seventeenth and Eighteenth Centuries employing these figures to specifically possess expression and meaning. This theory began in the late Nineteenth-Century with Hermann Kretzschmar, and this body of work continued with writers including that of Hans-Heinrich Unger and Arnold Schmitz, both of whom made more specific references to rhetorical figures (Golomb, 2004, p.87).

Rhetoric as Structure is based on the use of Dispositio, which appears in some Baroque treatises on musical composition. This premise relates the formal structure of a work to the same structure of classical oratory. This is summarised in the text Musica Poetica, by Dietrich Bartel as following:

1. Exordium (introduction);
2. Narratio (presenting the issue);
3. Propositio (presenting the speaker's thesis);
4. Confirmatio (presenting the main arguments supporting the thesis);
5. Confutatio (refutation of opposing arguments);
6. Peroratio/Conclusio (conclusion). (Bartel, 1997, p.68)
2.5 Twentieth-Century Interpretation Under Scrutiny

*What Windows is to computers, Rhetoric was to Baroque and Renaissance musicians; it was their operating system...* (Haynes, 2007, p.165-166)

During the 1960s and consequent decades, rhetoric became a fashionable approach for both performing musicians and historians alike. However, this fashion has been more closely examined in recent years and is beginning to be questioned by many musicologists and Bach historians. It is through the research of such figures as John Butt, Peter Williams and Bruce Haynes that many are now starting to question the validity of claims including 'rhetoric as semantics'. This further questions the true strength that rhetoric holds in understanding the trappings of the repertories of Bach and other German Baroque composers. One very important point to be considered is that figures (*Figurenlehre*) in most Baroque treatises on musical composition are concerned with musical techniques including; chromaticism, repetition, inversion etc. and not that of extra-musical affection (Golomb, 2004, p.88).

Peter Williams in his book *The Organ Music of J.S. Bach: A Background* goes to lengths at describing and annotating the rhetorical nature of Bach’s music. He questions the studies into events and musical ‘figures of speech’ by modern historians, as outlined by the rules of rhetoric from Quintilian. He makes the point that:

> A player who understands the idea of rhetorical rest will be more aware of what the piece’s notation tells him; he will thus pause ‘rhetorically’. Labelling it tmesis has as much relevance, neither more nor less, as labelling words in a line of blank verse simile or metaphor etc; the poet as a principle they belong to no particular period or culture. (Williams, 1984, p.70-71)

He is questioning the precedent of this research by suggesting that the necessity of these labels gives no more connection or deeper understanding of the music.

This leads to another very valid point, being the labels and terms associated with such musical techniques as *Figurenlehre* are created and coined by historians and musicologists looking to find ways of comprehensive analysis. Bruce Haynes in his text *The End of Early Music* states:
From the early years of the twentieth century, starting with Albert Schweitzer, German music historians gradually developed a systematic theory of Affections, an Affektenlehre or Doctrine of the Affections. (Haynes, 2007, p.167)

It is the historians who create this doctrine and extra-musical meaning, not the writings of J.S. Bach. Williams backs this statement by expressing:

Indeed, the two problems with any approach from the more recent studies of Affekte, rhetoric and symbolism are (first) that commentators in this area have often drawn conclusions at variance with each other depending on the way wider fashions developed, and (secondly) that any interpretations taken beyond a certain point are by nature speculative and very often serve only to express the commentator's enthusiasm for the piece concerned. (Williams, 1984, p.66)

It is easy to become trapped by these studies, however certain considerations need to be addressed. The idea that Bach and his contemporaries related all aspects of the proposed affections and extra-musical meanings of Figurenlehre in their works certainly needs to be questioned.
2.6 Summary

The idea of using rhetoric as a key approach to the music of German Baroque composers was re-invented by scholars in the 1960s. It is based around the writings of Burmeister and his contemporaries from the Seventeenth-Century, whose treatises on musical composition relate to classical oratory.

In its most direct translation, rhetoric as speech informs articulation and inflection, which, in turn can create flexible, expressive performances. Rhetoric as structure outlines the relationship of composition to the structure of classical oratory, and rhetoric as semantics attempted to create a performance style based on a system of Affektenlehre, the theory of which came under fire, as the ideas it implies are not entirely historical.

Of these, rhetoric as speech is arguably the least controversial and the most influential, and has been accepted by those authors who reject the rhetoric as semantics theories (Rifkin, in Sherman 1997: 387-388).
Chapter 3
The Rhetorical Style In Practice: Evaluating Four Recordings Of Bach's Weihnachtsoratorium.

3.1 An Exploration of the Rhetorical Style

The recordings\textsuperscript{14} forming the focal point for this research consist of differing ensembles, conductors and approaches and span twenty-five years of performance. Though these recordings are all categorised as being in the rhetorical (or HIP) style, all are significantly different. Differences include the voice types employed, tempo, ornamentation and treatment of continuo lines etc. In the previous chapter, rhetoric was discussed with reference to its historical meaning, both in oratory and music as well as being a device of twentieth-century Baroque performance interpretation. In this chapter these ideologies will be used to analyse and compare the aforementioned recordings.

\textsuperscript{14}The recordings are as follows: Harnoncourt (1973), Gardiner (1987), Jacobs (1997), and Suzuki's (1998) interpretation of the \textit{Christmas Oratorio}. 
3.2 Recording; an Art in Itself

An aspect to remember when comparing any recordings is the difference in recording techniques and technicians used to create the product. When listening to each of these recordings, it is immediately noticeable how vastly different they sound in terms of acoustic, distance, microphone placement and mix. These differing qualities change the total sound and balance. The number of microphones used and their placement effects how the listener will perceive the quality of certain performers, and will make a drastic change to the balance of the overall product. If particular attention is not paid to this, than internal voices and shaping can be lost, effecting the entire sound of the work. The process of recording is a delicate art and requires much care to capture all the subtle aspects of a performance.

Another consideration is the schools of instrumental performance. It is common discussion amongst symphony musicians across the world that a performer in a symphony orchestra in the United States of America plays differently to a musician of the same instrument in Germany or Britain. Using different equipment and stylistic approaches, modern orchestral performance can differ somewhat from country to country. The same is now true for Baroque performance. British Baroque trumpet players for example (playing on the Gardiner recording) generally use instruments with four vents\(^\text{15}\) whereas many central European players use trumpets with three vents. The materials the instruments are made from and the non-historical vices used to make the instruments easier for the modern player varies between country and player. This immediately has repercussions when examining recordings, as the opening "Jauchzet, Frohlocket!" heralding trumpet calls are going to have different sounds due to their particular continental trends.

\(^{15}\) Around 1960, Otto Steinkopf devised a system of three vent holes for a natural trumpet built by the maker Helmut Finke that rendered the eleventh and thirteenth partials in tune. Although vent holes made the natural trumpet somewhat easier to play, they altered the sound slightly.
3.3 Instrumentation

It is interesting to note that whilst all four recordings are of the *Christmas Oratorio*, each displays vast differences with regard to the treatment of the vocal parts. One obvious and tremendous difference in texture and colour is the choice of the voices employed to sing the soprano and alto lines. In Harnoncourt's 1973 recording he uses boys to sing the soprano and alto solo parts, as well as a chorus made up entirely of treble boys and men from the Tölzer Knabenchor. In Gardiner's 1987 recording he uses female singers for both soprano and alto, whilst both Jacobs in 1997 and Suzuki in 1998 use a female soprano alongside a male countertenor to sing the solo alto line.

What seems to be a misconception of HIP is the sole concern with the physical attributes of early music performance. Whilst period instruments and lower pitch seem to be commonplace, these are but mere side comments to what is most important about rhetorical, historically informed performance. The HIP movement is concerned with respecting the ideas and devices composers of past periods used to set and communicate their works to their audience. What is of little concern (at least now) is the use of period instruments etc., and it is a fallacy to believe that to be historically informed one must use gut strings and 'pitch down'!

As a side comment, Harnoncourt and his contemporaries working in the early years of this movement can perhaps be validated for (initially) demanding 'period' instrumentation. When suggesting a revival of early practices in music, it may be seen that (at the time) it was important to recreate a sound that had not been heard in hundreds of years. Would anyone have listened if Leonhardt had suggested little to no vibrato, use of *messa di voce* and rhetorical, small scale swelling to say the Vienna Philharmonic, at a time when Stravinsky's music was new and the technicolour trappings of Mahler and Strauss were still rampant in the world of orchestral performance?
As HIP now appears to be strongly implemented in modern performances of Bach's music\textsuperscript{16}, it is time to acknowledge the significance the movement represents in ideology and not its initial, physical appearance.

\textsuperscript{16} Refer to chapter 2 \textit{Rhetorical Style in Practice}. 
3.4 Ornamentation

One device employed in the attempt of a rhetorical performance style is *decoratio*\(^{17}\) (or ornamentation). As a rhetorical approach is designed to come closest to music as speech, and act as a representation of an inner, non-linguistic emotional palette, the use of devices such as *Messa di Voce* are obvious traits to employ. Agricola describes this device,

Mezza di voce; the practice of strengthening and then weakening sustained longer notes can be applied to every kind of singing. For here is a fundamental rule of good taste, that each note not matter how short its duration, must be given with increasing and decreasing strength; this can be compared exceedingly well with the so-called beauty-line in bodies and paintings (see Hogarth’s Anatomy of Beauty). (Agricola, 1757, p.48 – translated in Butt, 1994, p.88)

The use of such a device can be found in treatises from the early part of the Seventeenth-Century. It appears by writers in both vocal and instrumental performance, including that of Praetorius (1619), Fantini (1638), Marpurg (1763), Hiller (1774) etc. It is evident that this device (discussed in the earliest parts of the Baroque period) has a close association with a rhetorical performance style. It is thus important to consider when attempting to approach this music in an historically informed setting.

This device is evident most heavily in John Elliot Gardiner’s recording, with an obvious consciousness in both vocal and instrumental lines. This ebb and flow, mimicking of phrases amongst the ensemble creates a sensible, emotive performance that adheres to the doctrine of rhetorical performance as outlined in the primary sources of the Seventeenth-Century. Although Gardiner appears to display an awareness of this device in his interpretation, it is not so widespread amongst the other three recordings. All three other performances do not exhibit recognition of this method, at least on a conscious level. Suzuki comes second to Gardiner in this regard, however there is not a cohesive awareness throughout the ensemble. It is evident that the countertenor; Yoshikazu Mera of the Bach Colloquium Japan recording, conducted by Massaki Suzuki is concerned with this simple ornament, and on all occasions displays *Messa di Voce* during held notes.

---

\(^{17}\) Refer to previous chapter *The Rhetorical Style in Theory.*
What is surprising however, is the lack of a subsequent copying in the instrumental lines throughout the work. For example the Chorus; *Herrscher des Himmels, erhörre das Lallen*, which both opens and closes the third part of the work reveals a lack of consideration and care across the ensemble on this internal phrasing device. When listening to Suzuki, it is noticeable that the opening melody, ending with an A (on D major) in the trumpet line stays stagnant and does not shape.

Figure 1

This is heightened when the orchestral melody returns in the thirty-third bar, this time with the chorus singing amongst the texture. Once again, at bar forty-four the trumpet sustains an A for five bars and does not display any shaping of the note. The concern here, is the sopranos that sing beneath this line, do, in fact, use *Messa di Voce* to shape the phrase *mit Psalmen erhöht*.

Figure 2

18 Refer to figure 2
This example may appear as though the author is turning a seemingly simple, interpretative choice into an unnecessary grand proportion. However, this example could be seen in a similar light to a recording of a symphony orchestra, where the musicians change articulation mid-phrase. It would drastically change the expression and meaning behind the music. The Suzuki recording has been labelled historically informed and rhetorical, but has not given consideration to such internal phrasing, and appears misplaced and uncharacteristic of the style. Its appeal is still great and displays some very attractive attributes, however the title historically informed should perhaps be reassessed. After all how can one be historically informed?

In Hanoncourt’s early recording of 1973 there is also no concern for this and appears plain and stagnant throughout. In Jacobs, the trumpet uses a continuous crescendo at the end of the first orchestral melody, with a rather intrusive vibrato over the last two bars. Gardiner and his musicians on the other hand seem to be aware, and both the trumpet and chorus shape accordingly, copying each other and giving a sense of uninterrupted flow to the work.
3.5 Continuo

The continuo playing across all recordings differs greatly. The use of instrumentation and chordal realisation varies significantly. In the Evangelist recitative *Es Begab Sich Aber Zu Der Zeit* for example, the continuo group accompanying the voice consists of different instruments and approaches to realisation. In the early Harnoncourt recording the organ accompanies alone, whilst the Suzuki and Gardiner recordings use both Organ and Cello and Jacobs employs the Organ, Cello and rarely heard Lute\(^\text{19}\).

A commonality in HIP performances of recitatives is the inconsistency of note lengths sung, compared with those written. This is due to the nature of recitatives in displaying characteristics closer to speech than to the singing voice. This is described in Johann Gottfried Walther’s *Lexikon* of 1732, and states:

> One writes down the vocal part in a correct measure, one has... the freedom to alter the value of the notes, making them longer or shorter... in order to express the affect. (Walther, 1732/1952, p.515)

It is thus not surprising that continuo playing differs from the written part. Laurence Dreyfus in his book *Bach's Continuo Group* explains this by stating:

> [Continuo players]...sometimes had to “telescope” cadences - preempting the singer in order to hurry toward a dramatic cadence, which also entailed disregarding the literal notation of their part. (Dreyfus, 1987, p.72)

This is easily recognisable in the varying lengths of bass notes played by the organ and cello etc. The bass line being played appears much shorter than is notated. This convention of short accompaniment in secco recitatives is again described in Dreyfus:

---

\(^{19}\) In Dreyfus (1987) he states, in a chapter on the string instruments of the continuo group that, “in Bach’s works the lute makes an appearances only in two pieces: the St. John Passion and the *Trauer-Ode*, both works of special dimension”. (p. 170). However, Dreyfus goes on to describe the connection between Bach and the lute and describes its plausibility in the continuo section, even when absent from the score.
In this kind of recitative, accompanied only by the continuo, composers notated a succession of tied whole and half notes, which according to several eighteenth-century writers, were not sustained. Instead, the bass players played quarter notes followed by rests until the next change of harmony. (Dreyfus, 1987, p. 72-73)\(^{20}\)

---

Refer to figure 2

---

\(^{20}\) Refer to figure 2
These aspects of performance practice are immediately going to create notable differences in performances of the *Christmas Oratorio*. Interpretation on this scale will differ greatly from one performance to the next. The idea of schools of playing should be mentioned yet again, as continuo playing, and therefore teaching continuo differs between nations.

One of the most striking inconsistencies between score and performance is the realisation of chords that appear between two bass notes. Figures were sometimes placed part way through a bass note and underline the harmonic shift in the vocal line. If the practice of short accompaniment is correct, this would mean that the bass would not be playing, and brings forth the question of how to treat such chords? Should these be realised by the right hand alone? Peter Williams in his book *Basso Continuo* states that,

It was a guide to the director-accompanist, like the figures Corelli put above notes expressly marked tasto solo. If the composer did for some reason want the chords held on the organ, he must write tenuto, according to Türk (Williams, 1969, p.238)

There is scepticism about whether these chords should be played at the whim of the musicians or not at all. Schools of teaching differ on this particular matter of style and all four recordings differ in the treatment of these chords\(^\text{21}\).

\(^{21}\) Refer to appendix 2 for an analysis of continuo playing in *Es Begab Sich Aber Zu Der Zeit* across all four recordings. This highlights the treatment of chords at the harmonic shift in vocal line, mid bar.
3.6 Summary

The Harnoncourt, Gardiner, Jacobs and Suzuki recordings of *Weihnachtsoratorium*, which have all been grouped under the heading of HIP, display differing traits in performance. Although it has been argued in this chapter that these recordings are linked by there labelling, it has also been shown that within this title of historically informed performance there exists a multiplicity of styles. All four recordings are vastly different and display differing qualities including; the voice types employed, tempo, ornamentation and treatment of continuo lines. It is interesting to note that these differences can be divided into two separate camps, that of the historically plausible and that simply conceived as today’s taste dictates.

What is evident is that there are many differences that affect the historical accuracy of these performances, and yet are still being classified as ‘Historically Informed’. What is being seen, is not so much historically informed seventeenth and eighteenth-century performance practice, but that which is historically informed for today and for today’s audience.
Conclusion

The past decade has seen an ever-growing body of scholarship that aims to describe and classify the various performing styles associated with Bach’s music. Bruce Haynes’s most recent book *The End of Early Music* (2007) considers three separate and definable schools of performance throughout the Twentieth Century. Referred to as the Romantic, Modern and Historically Informed performance styles, these can be mapped in a linear progression across the Twentieth Century.

It can be considered that today’s commonly practiced performance style is HIP. This approach relies heavily on research into rhetoric and its role in German Baroque music. There has been much contention over the validity of such research and aspects of interpretation are currently being questioned. Further to this is the appreciation of many differences amongst performances within the label of HIP. These appear as schools of instrumental playing, recording techniques, interpretation of primary sources and historical limitations. It is thus that the author comes to the conclusion that the idea of historically informed performance is not so much a slavish reconstruction of the past (and it is debatable if this is indeed possible at all) but an attempt at relaying the message of early composers for a contemporary audience. To once again quote Harnoncourt,

We must understand the genuine musical concerns of Monteverdi and understand how those concerns are reflected in living music. We must attempt as musicians to see with new eyes everything that was current for Monteverdi and to reanimate it, to render it with our feelings, our 20th [21st] -century mentality – for certainly we do not wish to return to the 17th century. (Harnoncourt, 1989, p.26).
Bibliography


Eggebrecht, Heinrich. 1968. *Studien zur musikalischen Terminologie.* Mainz, Wiesbaden


Ithaca and London: Cornell University Press.


Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.


**Appendix 1**

*Abruptio*: a sudden and unexpected break in a musical composition.

*Accentus, Superjectio*: a preceding or succeeding upper or lower neighboring note, usually added to the written note by the performer.

*Acciaccatura*: an additional, dissonant note added to a chord, which is released immediately after its execution.

*Anabasis, Ascensus*: an ascending musical passage which expresses ascending or exalted images or affections.

*Anadiplosis, Reduplicatio*: (1) a repetition of a *mimesis*; (2) a repetition of the ending of one phrase at the beginning of the following one.

*Analepsis*: a repetition of a *noema* at the same pitch.

*Anaphora, Repetitio*: (1) a repeating bass line; ground bass; (2) a repetition of the opening phrase or motive in a number of successive passages; (3) a general repetition.

*Anaploce*: a repetition of a *noema*, particularly between choirs in a polychoral composition.

*Anticipatio, Praesumptio*: an additional upper or lower neighboring note following a principal note, prematurely introducing a note belonging to the subsequent harmony or chord.

*Antimetabole*: see Hypallage

*Antistaechon*: a substituted dissonance for an expected consonance, usually the result of the melody remaining on the same pitch while the bass implies harmonic changes.

*Antistrope*: see Hypallage

*Antithesis, Antitheton, Contrapositum*: a musical expression of opposing affections, harmonies, or thematic material.

*Apocope*: an omitted or shortened final note in one voice of a composition.

*Aposiopesis*: a rest in one or all voices of a composition; a general pause.

*Apolomia*: an enharmonic rewriting of a semitone.

*Ascensus*: see Anabasis

*Assimilatio, Homoiosis*: a musical representation of the text’s imagery.

*Asyndeton*: an omission of the appropriate conjunctions in a text.

*Auxesis, Incrementum*: successive repetitions of a musical passage which rise by step.

*Bombus, Bombi, Bombilans*: four identical notes in rapid succession.

*Cadentia Duriuscula*: a dissonance in the pre-penultimate harmony of a cadence.
Catabasis, Descensus: a descending musical passage which expresses descending, lowly, or negative images or affections.

Catachresis: see Faux Bourdon
Celeritas: see Transitus
Cercar della nota: see Subsumptio
Circulatio, Circulo, Kyklosis: a series of usually eight notes in a circular or sine wave formation.

Climax, Gradatio: (1) a sequence of notes in one voice repeated either at a higher or lower pitch; (2) two voices moving in ascending or descending parallel motion; (3) a gradual increase or rise in sound and pitch, creating a growth in intensity.

Coloratura: see Variatio
Commissura: see Transitus
Complexio, Complexus, Symploce: a musical passage which repeats its opening phrase at its conclusion.

Congeries, Synathroismus: an accumulation of alternating perfect and imperfect consonances, such as root-position and first-inversion triads.

Consonantiae Improperiae: false consonances, such as certain fourths, diminished or augmented fifths, augmented seconds, and diminished sevenths.

Contrapositio: see Antithesis
Corta: a three-note figure in which one note's duration equals the sum of the other two.

Deminutio: see Transitus

Descensus: see Catabasis
Diabasis: see Metabasis

Diminutio, Meiosis: (1) various elaborations of longer notes through subdivision into notes of lesser duration; (2) a restatement of thematic material in proportionally shorter note values.

Distributio: a musical-rhetorical process in which individual motifs or phrases of a theme or section of a composition are developed before proceeding to the following material.

Dubitatio: an intentionally ambiguous rhythmic or harmonic progression.

Ecphonesis: see Exclamatio

Ellipsis, Synecdoche: (1) an omission of an expected consonance; (2) an abrupt interruption in the music.

Emphasis: a musical passage which heightens or emphasizes the meaning of the text through various means.

Epanadiplosis, Reduplicatio: a restatement of the opening of a passage or phrase at its close.

Epanalepsis, Resumptio: (1) a frequent repetition of an expression; (2) a restatement of the opening of a passage at its close.

Epanodos, Regressio, Reditus: a retrograde repetition of a phrase.

Epiphora, Epistrophe: a repetition of the conclusion of one passage at the end.
of subsequent passages.

Epizeuxis: an immediate and emphatic repetition of a word, note, motif, or phrase.

Ethophonia: see Mimesis

Exclamatio, Ecphronesis: a musical exclamation, frequently associated with an exclamation in the text.

Extensio: a prolongation of a dissonance.

Faux Bourdon, Cacachresis, Simul Procedentia: a musical passage characterized by successive sixth-chord progressions.

Fuga: (1) a compositional device in which a principal voice is imitated by subsequent voices; (2) a musical passage which employs fuga to vividly express chasing or fleeing.

Gradatio: see Climax

Groppo: a four-note motif in arch formation with a common first and third note.

Heterolepsis: an intrusion of one voice into the range of another.

Homoiopoton, Homoioteleuton: (1) a general pause in all voices (aposiopesis), either interrupting the composition (homoiopoton) or following a cadence (homoioteleuton); (2) similar endings of a number of subsequent passages.

Homoiosis: see Assimilatio

Hypallage: an inversion of the fugal theme.

Hyperbaton: a transfer of notes or phrases from their normal placement to a different location.

Hyperbole/Hypobole, Licentia: a transgression of the range or ambitus of a modus.

Hypotyposis: a vivid musical representation of images found in the accompanying text.

Imitatio: see Mimesis

Inchoatio Imperfecta: an omission of the opening consonance in the melody which is supplied by the basso continuo realization.

Incrementum: see Auxesis

Interrogatio: a musical question rendered variously through pauses, a rise at the end of the phrase or melody, or through imperfect or phrygian cadences.

Kyklosis: see Circulatio

Licentia: see Hyperbole, Parrhesia

Ligatura: see Syncopatio

Longinqua Distantia: a distance between two neighboring voices of a composition in excess of a twelfth.

Manubrium: see Paragoge

Messanza: a series of four notes of short duration, moving either by step or by leap.

Metabasis, Transgressio: a crossing of one voice by another.

Metalepsis, Transumptio: a fuga with a two-part subject, the parts alternating in the composition.
Mimesis, Ethophonia, Imitatio: (1) a repetition of a noema at a different pitch; (2) an approximate rather than strict imitation of a subject at different pitches.

Misticanza: see Messanza

Mora: a rising resolution of a syncopatio when a falling one is expected.

Multiplicatio: a subdivision of a longer dissonant note into two or more notes.

Mutatio Toni: an irregular alteration of the mode.

Noema: a homophonic passage within a contrapuntal texture.

Palilogia: a repetition of a theme, either at different pitches in various voices or on the same pitch in the same voice.

Paragoge, Manubrium, Supplementum: a cadenza or coda added over a pedal point at the end of a composition.

Parenbole, Interjectio: a supplementary voice in a fugue which fills in the harmony by proceeding parallel to one of the fugue’s regular voices.

Parenthesis: a musical representation of parentheses in the associated text.

Paronomasia: a repetition of a musical passage with certain additions or alterations for the sake of greater emphasis.

Parrhesia, Licentia: an insertion of a dissonance, such as a cross relation or tritone, on a weak beat.

Passaggio: see Variatio

Passus Durusculus: a chromatically altered ascending or descending melodic line.

Pathopoeia: a musical passage which seeks to arouse a passionate affection through chromaticism or by some other means.

Pausa: a pause or rest in a musical composition.

Pleonasmus: (1) a prolongation of passing dissonances through suspensions; (2) four-part harmonized chant, falsobordone.

Polyptoton: a repetition of a melodic passage at different pitches.

Polysyndeton: an immediate repetition of an emphasis (accentus) in the same voice.

Prolepsis: see Anticipatio

Prolongatio: a passing dissonance or suspension of longer duration than the preceding consonance.

Prosopopoeia: see Hypotyposis, Mimesis, Pathopoeia

Quaesitio Notae: see Subsumptio

Quasi Transitus: see Transitus

Reduplicatio: see Anadiplosis, Epanadiplosis

Resumptio: see Epanalepsis

Repercussio: (1) a modified interval in a tonal fugal answer; (2) a tonal, inverted, or other modified fugal answer.

Repetitio: see Anaphora

Retardatio: (1) a suspension which is prolonged or which resolves by rising; (2) a delayed rather than anticipatory suspension.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Term</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Reticentia</td>
<td>see Aposiopesis; an accelerated trill in dotted rhythm, used to embellish a tenuta or a note of extended duration.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ribattuta</td>
<td>a four-note figuration consisting of three consonant leaps.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Salvi Composti</td>
<td>a note of extended duration.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Salto Semplice</td>
<td>a consonant leap.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Saltus Duriusculus</td>
<td>a dissonant leap.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Schematoides</td>
<td>a figure which restructures a previous passage either through changing text underlay or through durational augmentation or diminution.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sectio</td>
<td>see Tmesis</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sexta Superflua</td>
<td>see Consonantiae Improprae</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Simul Procedentia</td>
<td>see Faux Bourdon</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stenasmus</td>
<td>see Suspiratio</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Subsumptio, Quaesitio Notae (Cercar della nota)</td>
<td>various additions of lower neighboring notes.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Superjectio</td>
<td>see Accentus</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Supplementum</td>
<td>see Paragoge</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Suspensio</td>
<td>a delayed introduction of a composition’s principal thematic material.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Suspiratio, Stenasmus</td>
<td>the musical expression of a sigh through a rest.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Symblema</td>
<td>see Transitus</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Symplece</td>
<td>see Complexio</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Synaeresis</td>
<td>(1) a suspension or syncopation; (2) a placement of two syllables per note, or two notes per syllable.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Synarthroismus</td>
<td>see Congeries</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Syncopatio, Ligatura</td>
<td>a suspension, with or without a resulting dissonance.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Synonymia</td>
<td>a repetition of a musical idea in an altered or modified form.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tenuta</td>
<td>see Ribattuta</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tertia Deficiens</td>
<td>see Consonantiae Improprae</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tirata</td>
<td>a rapid scalar passage spanning a fourth to an octave or more.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tmesis, Sectio</td>
<td>a sudden interruption or fragmentation of the melody through rests.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transgressio</td>
<td>see Metabasis</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transitus, Celeritas, Commissura, Deminutio, Symblema</td>
<td>a dissonant or passing note between two consonant ones, either on the strong or the weak beat.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transumptio</td>
<td>see Metalepsis</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tremolo, Trillo</td>
<td>(1) an instrumental or vocal trembling on one note, resulting in a wavering pitch or vibrato; (2) a rapid reiteration of one note; (3) a rapid alternation of two adjacent notes; a trill.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Variatio, Coloratura, Diminutio, Passaggio</td>
<td>an ornamentation of a melodic passage with a variety of embellishments.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Appendix 2

Evangelist.

RECITATIVO.

Fugotto,

Organo e Continuo.

Es begab sich aber zu der Zeit, dass ein Gebot von dem Kaiser Augusto ausgegang, dass alle...