1997

Secondary arts teachers' perceptions of integrated arts

Jeanette Giroud

Edith Cowan University

Recommended Citation

This Thesis is posted at Research Online.
https://ro.ecu.edu.au/theses/1726
Edith Cowan University

Copyright Warning

You may print or download ONE copy of this document for the purpose of your own research or study.

The University does not authorize you to copy, communicate or otherwise make available electronically to any other person any copyright material contained on this site.

You are reminded of the following:

- Copyright owners are entitled to take legal action against persons who infringe their copyright.

- A reproduction of material that is protected by copyright may be a copyright infringement. Where the reproduction of such material is done without attribution of authorship, with false attribution of authorship or the authorship is treated in a derogatory manner, this may be a breach of the author’s moral rights contained in Part IX of the Copyright Act 1968 (Cth).

- Courts have the power to impose a wide range of civil and criminal sanctions for infringement of copyright, infringement of moral rights and other offences under the Copyright Act 1968 (Cth). Higher penalties may apply, and higher damages may be awarded, for offences and infringements involving the conversion of material into digital or electronic form.
USE OF THESIS

The Use of Thesis statement is not included in this version of the thesis.
Secondary Arts Teachers' Perceptions of Integrated Arts

by

Jeanette Giroud, B. Ed.

A Thesis Submitted in Partial Fulfilment of the Requirements for the Award of

Master of Education

at the

Faculty of Education, Edith Cowan University, Perth

Date of Submission: July, 1997
Abstract

During the 1980s, research in the arts by Project Zero and Arts Propel revealed that in American schooling the areas of artistic intelligence and artistic education had been neglected. Gardner (1989) proposed a theory of multiple intelligences, suggesting that in addition to the linguistic and logical-mathematical forms, there are a number of distinct forms of intelligence that each individual may possess in varying degrees. The concept of multiple intelligences as opposed to "talent" in an art form offers the opportunity to view arts education in a new light.

The original purpose of Arts Propel was to assess artistic potential in the same way that IQ or SAT instruments are designed to test scholastic potential. What began as an assessment endeavour, became a curricular undertaking and as a result, a number of educational institutions developed integrated arts approaches to arts learning, claiming that where the arts were integrated within the curriculum, higher achievement was recorded.

The National Curriculum's statement on The Arts for Australian Schools (1993) included the five arts forms of dance, drama, media, music and visual arts as "Arts" components and justified this stance by clearly stating that the common statements and profiles accommodated a wide range of approaches. However, the strands of arts experience and learning - Creating, Making and Presenting, Arts Criticism and Aesthetics, and Past and Present Contexts - have the potential to provide a common framework for integration of the various forms. During the course
of this research the strands have already been subject to change and are now known as Expressing, Responding and Reflecting.

During the trialling phase of The Arts' Student Outcome Statements, divisions between the arts forms became apparent. Some of the issues included: attempts by arts teachers to maintain the status quo, strong boundaries between the arts, unequal representation of arts forms in schools and application of Student Outcome Statements Strands to all the arts forms. At the commencement of this research the divisions between the arts forms remained as strong as ever, yet a truly integrative approach has the potential to strengthen the place of arts in schools.

This research documented ten secondary arts teachers' perceptions of integrated arts. The teachers all taught in government schools and each art form was represented by two teachers. The purpose of the research was to record arts teachers' perceptions of integrated arts at a time of rapid curriculum change.

Qualitative methodology using the instrument of semi-structured scheduled interviews was the data gathering process. The interviews were audio-taped and once the data was compiled it was sent to the participants for their approval.

This study found that arts teachers' perceptions of integrated arts were, on the whole, positive. Most teachers believed that an integrated arts approach would give students a deeper understanding of the arts and promote bonding between arts teachers. Teachers felt that the combination of the five arts forms into one learning area (The Arts), provided long overdue recognition of the arts as a significant learning area. Other perceived benefits included the building of strength and support, and the overcoming of isolation that characterised the arts in schools in the past.
It is recommended, as a result of this study, that where possible, the physical location of the arts departments in schools should be considered during the planning stage so that arts areas are not isolated. It is also recommended that media and dance should adopt the changes, so that The Arts area of learning will not be fragmented. This can be achieved through document support which will show dance and media teachers how they can work effectively within an Arts framework. Integrated Arts programs, such as those offered by some of the schools in this study, will provide strong guidelines for future arts consolidation and enrichment in schools.
I certify that this thesis does not, to the best of my knowledge and belief:

(i)  incorporate without acknowledgement any material previously submitted for a degree or diploma in any institution of higher education;

(ii) contain any material previously published or written by another person except where due reference is made in the text; or

(iii) contain any defamatory material.

Signature

5-11-97

Date
Acknowledgements

This study was made possible through the assistance and guidance of several people to whom I express my gratitude.

Mr. Anthony Monk, Chairperson, Department of Education at Edith Cowan University, as my supervisor has lent his tireless support to this study. His constructive criticism and thoroughness have enabled me to progress in a field where availability of literature has been minimal. I thank him for his patience and invaluable advice.

To the reviewers, Associate Professor, Mr. John Williamson and Dr. Michael Harvey, I also express my grateful thanks for offering constructive advice on the size of the study, the conceptualisation of the study, and the research design.

I must also express my appreciation to my colleagues Barbara Denton and Brian Prangnell for their diligent reading and corrections of the final draft.

To the ten secondary arts teachers who took part in this study, I offer my personal thanks. The richness of their experience in the arts was evidenced through the quality of their responses to the research topic. Without these willing participants my research would not have eventuated.

Finally, I wish to thank my son Brett for his patient help, many times coming to my rescue during the typing process. To the rest of my family, I wish to thank them for their patience and understanding.
# Table of Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Abstract</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Declaration</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Acknowledgements</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>List of Tables</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>List of Figures</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendices</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter 1</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Background to the Study</strong></td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Significance of the Study - Issues Arising</strong></td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Purpose of the Study</strong></td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Research Questions</strong></td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Definitions</strong></td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>National Curriculum</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Arts</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Statements and Profiles</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Student Outcome Statements</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Strands</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Perceptions</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Integrated Arts</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter Overview</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Chapter 2

Review of Literature

Responses to the National Curriculum Initiative

The American Arts Education Context

Integrated Arts

Models for Integrated Arts Approaches

The Arts - A Way of Knowing

The Arts in Education

The Arts in Australian Schools

A Need for Change

The Pro-active Response

Chapter 3

Contextual Framework

Gulbenkian Report (UK)

Project Zero, Harvard Graduate School of Education (USA)

The National Curriculum Statement in the Arts (Australia)

Chapter 4

Methodology

Participants

Sampling Technique

Design - Qualitative Descriptive Study
| Triangulation                              | 60 |
| Research Instrument                       | 62 |
| Data Collection                            | 63 |
| Bounding the Data                          | 64 |
| Reliability and Validity                   | 68 |
| Limitations                                | 70 |
| Document Analysis                          | 70 |
| Interview Data                             | 70 |
| Timing                                     | 71 |
| Ethical Considerations                     | 71 |
| Obtaining Consent                          | 71 |
| Data Analysis                              | 72 |

Chapter 5

Presentation of Data: Stage 1

Chapter 6

Presentation of Data: Stage 2

| Analysis of Data - Table 2                  | 109 |
| Analysis of Data - Table 3                  | 112 |
| Analysis of Data - Table 4                  | 114 |
| Analysis of Data - Table 5                  | 117 |
| Analysis of Data - Table 6                  | 119 |
List of Tables

1. Profile of the Participants' Teaching Experience / 77
2. Arts Teachers' Perceptions of the Arts Learning Area / 109
3. Arts Teachers' Understanding of the Term Integrated Arts / 112
4. Arts Teachers' Perceptions of the Relative Benefits and Disadvantages of Integrated Arts When Compared to Single Subject Approaches / 114
5. Arts Teachers' Perceptions of the Potential Benefits and Disadvantages of an Integrated Arts Approach / 117
6. Art Teachers' Perceptions of the Strand/s which would Facilitate an Integrated Arts Approach / 119
List of Figures

1. Conceptual Framework / 66
Appendices

Appendix A  Sample letter to Principals / 145
Appendix B  Statement of Disclosure and Informed Consent / 146
Appendix C  Interview schedule / 147
Appendix D  Sample of letter to participants / 148
CHAPTER 1

Introduction

This is a study involving research on secondary arts teachers perceptions of integrated arts in government schools in Western Australia. It is a study of arts teachers from the five arts forms of dance, drama, media, music and visual art. Two teachers from each of the arts forms have been interviewed. Each of these teachers is either head of department, teacher in charge, or head of the arts faculty within their school and all have had considerable teaching experience. Most, have had some contact with student outcome statements during the trialling phase of The Arts in Western Australia. This chapter discusses the context for curriculum change in Australia and provides a brief background of how the combined arts emerged as one of the eight learning areas known as The Arts.

Background to the Study

The development of a proposal for a national core curriculum is evident in the document Core curriculum for Australian schools (1980) which nominated nine broad learning areas in Australian Schools. Boughton (1993) indicated that this early document was linked to John Dawkins' (Federal Minister for Education) belief in 1988 that education did not meet the needs of industry, hence the need for radical change. Dawkins recommended the development of a national curriculum which was taken up
by the Australian Education Council (AEC) and published in the report *Common and agreed national goals for Australian schooling*. This report identified eight key learning areas: English, Health, Languages other than English (LOTE), Mathematics, Science, Studies of Society, Environment and Technology and The Arts.

In December 1990, the Finn Committee was appointed by the Australian Education Council to establish future directions for post-compulsory education in Australia. The Finn Report recommended: a strongly work-oriented school curriculum, closer links between schools and TAFE, and the introduction of employment-related generic competencies (Boughton, 1993). Previously, in 1989, the Australian Education Council (AEC) and the Ministers of Vocational Education, Employment and Training (MOVEET) established a Committee chaired by Mr. Eric Mayer to investigate the concept of employment-related generic competencies. These were identified as Key Competencies and Profiles and Statements. The Statements set out an agreed National position on the curriculum in each area of learning, outlining what might be taught to achieve the outcomes, while the Profiles show the typical progression in achievement of the outcomes. In the National Curriculum model, The Arts "basket" included widely differing forms of artistic practice which are insulated from each other by clearly defined boundaries. The Arts include: dance, drama, media, music and visual art.
The Significance of the Study - Issues Arising

As outlined in *The Arts - the National Profile*, June 1993, final edited manuscript, the Arts Statements and Profiles were developed in three stages commencing in 1991 and concluding in 1993. Some Australian states have already adopted the National Curriculum guidelines while in Western Australia, trialling and editing is still in process. (until 1997, when The Arts document may be delivered in schools) To assist in the trialling and implementation process, the Affiliation of Arts Educators (WA), (Arts Accord) organised several professional development seminars for teachers in the arts with the initial meeting taking place on August 30, 1994. From this initial meeting, several smaller action research groups emerged to trial the Student Outcome Statements and report back to the committee in an attempt to make the implementation in schools as smooth as possible. However, in the course of the meetings, a number of issues emerged including: curriculum change and its effect on teachers' competency; lack of pre-service and in-service training (especially for generalist teachers in primary school); lack of support from administrative bodies; reductionist trends in arts timetabling; lack of resources and lack of appropriate models to follow. These issues will be dealt with in the literature review.

With a united front, the different disciplines included in the The Arts learning area could strengthen their position in schools in spite of the fact that they are often programmed on the same timetable grid-line. The concurrent timetabling of The Arts can work against students who are multi-talented in the arts. However an integrated approach could also overcome the difficulties faced by such students.
Another change facing some arts teachers is the inclusion of Arts Criticism and Aesthetics, and Past and Present Contexts as organising strands within the student outcome statements. These are now known as: Using Arts Criticism and Understanding the Role of the Arts in Society. While most visual arts teachers acknowledge the significance of these strands, performing arts teachers (dance, drama and music) have tended to concentrate on other areas of arts practice such as skill development and performance.

This research will provide an original contribution to the investigation of how arts teachers feel about the combination of the five arts forms into one learning area - The Arts. No arts teacher wants to see their area diminish in the grab for curriculum time brought about by the conflation of five areas into one. However, arts teachers have already found that in order to streamline The Arts learning area, some schools are replacing two Heads of Department with one in Visual and Performing Arts.

Integrating the arts through shared learning experiences has the potential to raise the status of arts in schools, build a stronger framework and offer support for areas such as dance which often suffer isolation. The inquiry will further our knowledge on how Heads of Arts Departments in schools perceive integration; whether it is perceived as a shared experience across the arts forms or whether it can go deeper by crossing curriculum boundaries such as the sciences, environmental studies, technology and other humanities areas.
Purpose of the Study

This study purposively selected a small number of Western Australian secondary arts teachers who were Heads of Department or Heads of Faculty, to ascertain their attitudes towards integrated arts in the curriculum and their perceptions of the impending changes to arts education. The conflation of the five arts forms into one learning area has meant that all arts teachers must be able to teach and assess in the interrelated strands of Creating, Making and Presenting: Arts Language: Arts Criticism and Aesthetics and Past and Present Contexts. These strands have now under *The Arts Report*, June 1996, been streamlined to two areas of Expressing and Responding, and Reflecting. Expressing includes the sub-strand areas of creating, exploring and developing ideas and using skills, techniques, technologies and processes; whilst Responding and Reflecting includes the sub-strands of using arts criticism and understanding the role of the Arts in society.

By conducting semi-structured interviews with the participants, the researcher aimed to reveal arts teachers' attitudes towards the impending changes and discover how the intentions of the National Curriculum proposal for The Arts will be accepted by teachers of the arts in Western Australian schools. However the main purpose whilst dealing with these issues was to gain insight into some arts teachers' perceptions of integrated arts in a cross-curricula context as well as within the arts forms.
Research Questions

The research questions were directed to ten secondary arts teachers; two in each of the five arts forms of dance, drama, media, music and visual arts as defined in *The national curriculum statement on the Arts for Australian schools (1993)*. The inquiry was intended to ascertain these arts teachers’ perceptions of integrated arts during a time of rapid curriculum change.

The research questions are:

(i) What are arts teachers’ views of the proposal that currently separate visual and performing arts combine in a single learning area - The Arts?

(ii) What do arts teachers understand is the meaning of the term Integrated Arts?

(iii) What are arts teachers’ perceptions of Integrated Arts as an alternative curriculum approach?

(iv) What do arts teachers believe are the potential benefits and/or disadvantages of an Integrated Arts approach?

(v) How might the proposed Arts Strands within the Student Outcome Statements facilitate an Integrated Arts approach?
Definitions

National Curriculum

The National Curriculum in Australia is a result of States, Territories and the Commonwealth collaborating on a major national educational initiative to produce quality education which is comparable at a national level. This reform was linked to ‘nationally agreed’ standards of workplace-based training set up by the National Training Board (NTB). As a result of the widening of this initiative to include all levels of education, John Dawkins, as the Federal Minister for Employment, Education and Training in May 1988 released his paper Strengthening Australia’s Schools which, according to Boughton (1994, p. 33) laid out the Commonwealth’s analysis of the preferred future for school education in Australia including a redefinition of the focus and content of the curriculum. In 1993, the National Curriculum developed statements and profiles in eight broad areas of learning, the Arts being one of them. The Australian Education Council (AEC), made up of the education ministers of the States, Territories and Commonwealth, commissioned the work and approved the final product which resulted in Statements and Profiles being developed.

The Arts

The national curriculum statement in the arts described three broad approaches to defining and understanding the arts. The first identified the arts as a symbol system or a constructed set of meanings. The second approach considered the arts to be aesthetic forms of knowing and expressing which are valued for their capacity to
enhance life. The third approach posited that the arts are embedded in their social and cultural contexts and that they may be viewed as embodying and reflecting their origins. The national statement and profile for the arts have made it clear that there is no one theoretical approach underlying them, however the common experiences and approaches shared by dance, drama, media, music and the visual arts led curriculum developers to place them together, identifying them as one learning area - the Arts.

**Statements and Profiles**

Statements set out an agreed national position on the curriculum in each learning area. They include a definition of the area, an outline of its essential elements, a description of sequential learning for the development of knowledge and skills, and they provide a common framework for curriculum development.

The Profiles are a description of learning outcomes achieved by students in each of the areas of learning. Their purpose is to help teaching and learning, and to provide a common framework for reporting student achievement. Profiles are divided into strands, usually the same as those in the statement.

According to *The Arts - the National Profile*:

The profiles show the typical progression in achievement of the outcomes, while statements outline what might be taught to achieve the outcomes. (p, 3)
Student Outcome Statements

The Student Outcome Statements reflect the knowledge, skills and processes that are considered to be essential for all students in individual learning areas. They provide the curriculum guidelines for teachers to plan a sequence of learning activities, whilst assisting students to make progress based on needs, progress and improvement.

They are also intended to be a focus for school development planning and provide a basis for teachers and schools to monitor and account for their performance.

Strands

Strands are the major organisers of a learning area. The five arts forms of dance, drama, media, music and visual arts have been identified as the arts form strands. The strand organisers identify the roles students play or undertake in the arts as makers, presenters, critics and theorists and have been outlined as (i) Creating, Making and Presenting, (ii) Arts Criticism and Aesthetics, and (iii) Past and Present Contexts.

Perceptions:

As this study is concerned with teachers' perceptions of integrated arts, it is necessary to define what perceptions are in the context of the research. Perceptions are linked to individual experience and the meaning or understanding derived from that experience. Perception may be influenced by factors such as cognitive development, conditioning, socio-cultural background, education and past experience.
Fleming (1968) believed that perception is bi-polar and affected not only by the external situation but by internal states. He explained:

In perceiving, as in learning, the human being is not passive but active, bringing all past images, memories, emotions, and needs as non-sensory or directive factors to the organisation of a present cognitive or perceptive structure. (p. 84)

Fleming (1968) likened the whole process of “perceiving, thinking and recalling”, to one of “confirming or infirming” a hypothesis or expectancy set up by the organism and tried and checked, accepted or rejected, until the hypothesis and incoming stimulus information match sufficiently to give rise to a stable perceptual organisation. Fleming supported his account of perception by referring to the experimental work with human subjects completed by Postman and Bruner under controlled conditions in a laboratory.

The implications for this research are that the participants' understanding and past experience of integrated arts will affect their perception of the importance or otherwise of integration as a learning style. If a participant has no prior experience or knowledge in this area, then the responses will be affected by this lack of participation. If, on the other hand, a participant has experienced an unfortunate encounter with integrated arts as a learning style, then his or her perceptions could be negative to some extent. The fact that the researcher has seen fit to ask questions about integrated arts will also affect the participants' responses to the subject. They may have prepared for the interview by extending their knowledge in this area. This also will have affected their overall perceptions of integrated arts.
Integrated Arts:

There are many definitions that have similar meaning to integrated arts such as inter-disciplinary arts, combined arts, shared arts, connected arts, networked arts. Vena (1992), added fusion, multi-disciplinary, cross-disciplinary and multi-cultural as terms which connote similar meaning to integration. He described an integrated approach as one in which a relationship is established between two fields or areas of study. He quoted:

The arts represent: painting, sculpture, printmaking, crafts, photography, art history, architecture, music, dance, drama and theatre. The core disciplines include: science, mathematics, social studies, language arts and reading. Integration occurs when the individual can personally identify with the subject, and when the individual can expand the information or project in any direction from the original source. Furthermore, the arts experience that is integrated with the core subject areas must be of high quality and must deal with significant art forms. (p. 19)

Chapter Overview

This chapter has provided an overview of the background and significance of the study. Research has shown that in the past, the areas of artistic intelligence and artistic education had been neglected. In Australia, the National Curriculum’s response to this dilemma was to include The Arts as one of the eight key learning areas of the Curriculum. For the first time Australian arts educators had to address the possibility of a combined arts approach as opposed to just music or visual arts having a major share of curriculum time. During the trialling phase of the Student Outcome Statements, many issues became apparent which had the potential to cause division amongst the independent arts forms. Integrating the arts through curriculum
design and practice has the potential to strengthen the focus of arts in school, providing some of the potential disadvantages can be overcome.

In the ensuing chapters a review of contemporary literature on the significance of The Arts as a valuable learning area within the curriculum and the connection of integration in the arts will be discussed.
CHAPTER 2

Review of Literature

In this chapter a review of relevant literature revealed that the following topics are significant to the theoretical background of integrated arts education and practice. The review documents responses to the National Curriculum initiative in Australia and The American Arts Education context and its relevance to the Australian context. Included are models for integrated arts approaches and the argument is raised concerning the value or otherwise of Integrated Arts. This chapter also discusses The Arts as a way of knowing, the place of The Arts in education and the Australian context. Research indicated that there is a need for change.

Responses to the National Curriculum Initiative

The National Curriculum project completed in June 1993 identified The Arts as one of eight areas of study for Australian schools. The arts of dance, drama, media, music and visual arts have been combined to form one learning area. How beneficial will the arts umbrella be for Australian school children and The Arts as a whole? The American National standards for arts education (1994) questioned the benefits of an arts education; should Australian arts teachers fear a National Curriculum?

Hoffa (1994, p.16) indicated that the American national standards for arts education promised to be a revolutionary development in the history of arts education.
Although the standards were called “national” it was proposed that they would continue to be voluntary until formally adopted by local school districts or state education authorities. In response to the American National Standards Report many promising initiatives are being developed, some of which will be discussed later.

In Australia, the five arts areas were traditionally regarded as separate fields of endeavour. The National Curriculum Statement in the Arts claims to provide a common basis for curriculum resource development in all States and Territories by developing a common view of arts learning and teaching in Australian schools. It stated that with a common language for arts teachers to use in curriculum development and in ascribing attainment levels of K-12, that support will be provided for collaborative working approaches in schools and between States and Territories. While the five forms of dance, drama, media, music and visual arts are seen as distinct areas of knowledge and experience, they are combined under one profile. However, it is acknowledged that one art form cannot substitute for experience in any other.

(National Arts Profile, June 1993)

The question must be asked, how integrated are the arts in Western Australian Schools? In some secondary schools, collaborative programs within the Arts Frameworks include areas such as music, drama and visual arts, dance, and even media when they are staging their annual production. Such collaborative ventures focus on creating, making and presenting (now creating, exploring and developing ideas) but the areas of arts criticism and aesthetics and cultural contexts are often ignored.
Boyd (1993) examined the barriers to the implementation of curriculum change concerning the trialling phases of the draft versions of the *National Statement and Profile in the Arts* in several Queensland primary schools during April 1993. Queensland was one of three states that voted to implement the *National Statements and Profiles* immediately. Boyd, (1993, p. 44) noted that “the effective management of educational change relies on the commitment of classroom teachers and the cooperation of a wide variety of professional associations”. She found that many researchers reported identical factors that act either as barriers to change, or as facilitators of change. The factors commonly listed related to the roles performed by principals, consultants and teachers, the level and availability of resources, self-efficacy, and the effects of tensions created by change itself. Boyd (1993) and Boughton (1993) identified similar background problems for the arts. They believed that change is the result of the Federal Government and Industry both seeking to bring schools more closely into line with economic needs.

Boyd (1993) referred to the conflation of the individual arts disciplines of dance, drama, media, music and the visual arts into one of eight key learning areas whereas art and music had previously held separate timetabling and syllabus content slots. She believed this would lead to campaigning by visual arts and music teachers against other arts forms in the competition between elective offerings. Boyd noted the negative aspects of the Federal Government’s push to change the face of post-compulsory education which included a focus on competency based education in which knowledge was defined in terms of skill, and the trivialisation of the visual arts by the identification of readily observable and assessable performance indicators.
Some positive changes included the opportunity for content to be organised in a structured manner, rather than ad-hoc; and that the *National Arts Statements and Profiles* gave the arts a recognised place within the curriculum.

Steers (1991) in a paper which considered the future of The Arts in schools, outlined the British National Curriculum and the Key Stages which make up the Profile and Outcomes. He was concerned for the place of the arts in schools and questioned the use of the term “combined arts” because it seemed to encourage reductionist approaches to arts time-tableing. He cited the authors of *The Arts 5-16* as quoting, “in some schools combined arts courses have led to a net reduction in the time and resources that were previously available to the separate specialist courses. (p. 15)

Steers (1991) explained that references to combined arts may provide school time-tableters and government ministers alike with the obvious temptation to solve problems of the over-pressed National Curriculum by cutting the time allocation and other resources for the arts - especially if they are encouraged to believe they are dealing with a single subject. It seems that the issue of reduction in curriculum time and resources has been identified by arts researchers in the United States and the United Kingdom, as well as in Australia.

The *National Statement on Arts for Australian Schools*, issued in June, 1993 did not group the arts forms together as visual and/or performing arts nor did it specifically outline integrated arts experiences. These were options for systems, schools and teachers to determine. The fact that *The National Profile for the Arts*
stated that The Arts did not provide an underlying theoretical basis will mean that schools will need to adopt their own model of change.

Hoffa (1994), listed the development of the *National Standards for Art Education* as a major landmark in his map of the changes that occurred in American arts education over the last three decades. He pointed out that Barkan’s paper which was presented to the 1965 Penn State Conference proposed education in five arts disciplines and provided the intellectual framework for the Getty Center’s discipline based art education (DBAE) program. This program, in turn, greatly resembled the tripartate structure of the *National Standards for Arts Education*, which was based upon creating and performing, perceiving and analysing, and understanding cultural and historical contexts. The current Australian *National Profile for the Arts* appears to follow the DBAE model.

Mahlmann (cited in Hoffa, 1994, p. 21) was both an “advocate for, and the personification of, interdisciplinary thinking in arts education”. Mahlmann was responsible for the development of the Consortium of National Arts Education Associations. The Consortium’s most accomplished act was to generate and publish the *National Arts Education Accord* which provided the common ground for the various arts bodies to use as the basis for national standards. Similarly, in Western Australia we have seen the temporary formation in 1994 of Arts Accord, Affiliation of Arts Educators (WA) which was funded as part of the National Professional Development Program through the Department of Employment, Education and Training.
In discussing the American initiative for the arts, Hoffa (1994), who served on the Implementation Task Force for the National Standards for Arts Education, queried the evolution of the multiple form (the Arts):

If the history, the traditions, and the ties that bind teachers of the visual arts together are so very unlike those that music teachers depend upon, and if both of them are different from those of dance or theatre educators, how is it that the multiple form - arts education with an s - even came to be? (p. 19)

More specifically, Hoffa asked how their melding together could “ever spawn a document as complex, overarching and perhaps as controversial” (p. 19) as the National Standards for Arts Education? He agreed that there were many different versions of how this progression towards the “arts” came to exist. More to the point, are the questions he asked, as these questions will no doubt be asked by many arts teachers throughout Australia as they view the diminishing market-share or timetable allocations and try to work with new strands with which they are unfamiliar. Hoffa (1994) also indicated that the major problem with implementation is that there must be some kind of organisational entity through which national standards can be implemented in a coordinated manner. He saw problems with in-service and pre-service training of teachers in that much of it, particularly the former, was voluntary. Most university programs placed an emphasis on production and/or performance with relatively less emphasis on arts history, theory and criticism. It would seem that Hoffa’s fears for American arts education in the 1990s are similar to those fears held by many administrators and teachers of the arts in Australian schools.

Ross (1994, p. 28) in his response to the American National Standards and changes in arts education listed several major problems concerning the delivery of arts
packages in schools. Ross discussed the lack of research evidence to support the "standards" movement and was concerned that there is not enough evidence of what actually happens in the classroom. He was concerned about quality teaching with so many changes and also the absence of information about how the arts are to be delivered in schools.

Ross's concerns sound very familiar in the Australian context and even though some professional development is being carried out here in Western Australia, it is only selected schools who are trialling the Profiles and Outcome Statements. There are teachers and schools who are committed to the task and the idea of change, but what will happen should the arts package be delivered in schools across the State? There could be many arts teachers who are looking for an appropriate model to follow.

In the light of Ross' and Hoffa's arguments, it is imperative therefore that arts educators become advocates for their subject areas and at the same time advocate the arts as a whole. A strong, cohesive and united front for the arts in schools would provide a platform for a campaign for fairer timetabling structures and a fairer distribution of resources. Such claims can only be achieved through a strong curriculum framework and it seems that this strength does not come with the Profiles and Statements for the Arts. In many schools, teachers are left to their own devices to solve the problem of arts curriculum delivery.
Project Zero was launched in 1967 by the philosopher Nelson Goodman at Harvard University. It was an interdisciplinary based research project in human symbolic development. One of Project Zero’s major tasks was to develop an understanding of the nature of “cognitive abilities in children, their development in school, family and other settings and their mediation by a variety of symbol systems - language, writing, picturing, gesturing, symbolic play”. (Gardner and Perkins, 1989, p. vii). The project was informed by the disciplines of philosophy, developmental and cognitive psychology, neurology, education and the arts, and the sciences in general. The initial mission was to examine the philosophy and psychology of the arts with the purpose of informing arts education. Over the years, Project Zero’s interests expanded to include other themes such as: children’s responses to television, the early development of symbolic capacities, the nature of intelligence, the development of informal reasoning abilities and the nature of higher order thinking skills, to name a few. The participants in Project Zero shared the belief that the arts which were generally celebrated as the dominion of the emotions, are profoundly cognitive activities (Gardner and Perkins, 1989, p. x).

One of the major developments in Arts education by Project Zero was Gardner’s identification of the intellect as having a number of separate components, or multiple intelligences. Recent research updates on the Internet System - EdWeb: Exploring Technology and School Reform (Carvin, July 1995), described The Theory
of Multiple Intelligences (MI) as "one of the most compelling, yet controversial new approaches to education reform".

Recently, many researchers of arts education have described the arts as a way of knowing and therefore a "type" of intelligence. Gardner (1993a) saw the arts as crossing the boundaries of all the intelligences he listed - not necessarily specific to one domain. This suggests that integration of the arts into the curriculum, especially in primary school, would be beneficial.

Integrated Arts

In order to map the history and development of integrated arts, it is necessary to follow the progress of an individual arts form such as visual art from its early beginnings to current-day practice.

Freyberger, (1985) argued that in times past, art instruction was integrated with other subject matters and that integration provides more meaningful experiences than can be achieved through narrowly defined subjects. Freyberger noted that trends had moved from meeting the needs of an industrialised society to an involvement with cultural refinement which led to educational needs of children. Child-centred programs became the focus and when this occurred, subject matter moved from "adult conceived" interest areas to those rising from the child's own activities and interests in the home and school environment. Art became integrated with all phases of living.

As early as the 1920s, correlation of art with other studies in the elementary curriculum was being explored. Two subject areas often used for correlation with art were history and geography. There was a growing tendency to devaluate the place of skill in production in the
direction of a more favourable balance of skill with imagination, thought and originality. (Freyberger, 1985, p. 7)

Fryberger cited (Winslow, 1939, p. 32) who wrote a book directed entirely about the new trend of integrating the arts on all levels of education. It was his premise that “whenever art has been included as an integral part of the school program, pupil participation and creative expression have been stimulated”.

Almost a decade later, Lowenfeld (1947), in *Creative and Mental Growth*, stated that:

In Art Education integration takes place when the single components that lead to creative experience become an inseparable whole, one in which no single experience remains an isolated factor. (p. 45)

Lowenfeld believed that integration means neither correlation with nor interpretation of other subject matter outside art and said that “this represents the greatest misunderstanding of the meaning of integration”. Lowenfeld explained that in correlation a relationship is established between two fields or areas, whilst integration is concerned with the individual, providing more meaningful experiences than can be achieved through a separate study of narrowly defined subjects.

In Freyberger’s (1985) article she discussed the 1940s and 1950s art education scene in which integration was an important part of so-called progressive school programs. She cited McFee (1961) who was so strong in her feelings about the value of integration as a motivational factor in art expression that she categorised all art activities on the elementary level into three divisions, one of which is called ‘Integrated Arts’.
Integrated experiences were in every progressive art programme, but too often its identity and objectives were submerged to those of the other curriculum areas it served. According to Freyberger, it was at this point that art educators became concerned and fought for a weekly allotment of time, reestablishing programs of merit based upon sequentially planned curricula that focussed on the needs of children in the context of the community in which they functioned. The development of Discipline Based Art Education (DBAE) emerged as a valuable framework for the teaching of Visual Arts in schools.

Greer (1995) is one of the ‘high priests’ of the development of discipline based art education programs and recently he proposed that it is time to pursue discipline-based arts education. Greer (1995) indicated that “advocating discipline-based arts education is a logical stance to gain a place for the arts in general education (Greer’s emphasis). The arts could be presented as separate fields of study that draw basic concepts from shared ideas about disciplines.

One of the best cases that literature presents for integrated approaches in arts education is that many of the forms share common ground in practice and conceptualisation of the curriculum. Allison (1989) considered the role, purpose and content of dance in education and posited that dance and art (visual arts) education share common ground in education. Along with music and drama, dance and art are not given the status of core or essential subjects due to pressure from the back-to-basics movements. Allison (1989, p.20) stated:

In many ways, it is clear that the arts subjects have similar aims and objectives and, given the similarly weak position in the curriculum of all the arts subjects, it would seem to be politically appropriate and educationally responsible for those concerned with the separate arts
subjects to collaborate and cooperate both in formulating the case for the subjects in the curriculum and in developing teaching and learning strategies.

Allison noted that while productive activities (such as dance) are an important form of learning and can act (for some children) as a means of expression, the acquisition of production skills is enhanced by a wider experience of art (such as visual arts), including an understanding of the roles, purposes and functions of art in societies which constitute the artistic heritage. Allison (1989, p. 20) stated that:

The subject specific term ‘art’ can readily be transposed with the term ‘dance’ or ‘drama’ or ‘music’ ... the commonality is multi-dimensional in that each of the arts subjects has a production of performance element, which may or may not be expressive or self-expressive, recognition that the content and form of each is dependent to some degree on an educated perception, whether it be visual, aural, tactile, or kinaesthetic or a combination of all these perceptual modes; the understanding and appreciation of each subject to critical discourse which is dependent upon having access to both a technical vocabulary and critical language and, each has changed and developed in meaning, form and significance throughout history and within different cultures.

The development of perceptual skills, critical abilities and the recognition of the nature of the ways in which art forms are inextricably part of their historical and cultural contexts may have some commonality across all arts forms. As educators in all arts subjects are looking to develop curricula which go beyond the production and performance element, it may well be that much could be achieved by collaboration between them in devising learning experiences which lead to the formation of critical abilities, perceptual skills and understandings of the interaction of all arts with society and culture throughout time.

Vena (1992), indicated that integration is often administratively confused with correlation. He proposed that in many correlation lessons the related subject areas are
often not perceived as being equal in importance in the amount of time spent on each, or the quality of experience in each area. Vena believed that students will more likely value and learn from the main subject which is being used as the vehicle for learning and will be less likely to value the one being used to assist in the learning. Vena also cited the definition given by Lowenfeld (1950) concerning integration:

In total integration the single elements lose their identity and unite to a new entity. In Art(s) Education, integration takes place when the single components which lead to a creative experience become an inseparable whole, one in which no single experience remains an isolated factor. (p. 18)

Whilst Vena (1992) addressed integrated arts education in the primary years, the philosophy behind his reasoning could be applicable for all areas of the school curriculum. He indicated that through the arts we are reminded that we live life holistically and that our total curricula can reflect this reality. He believed that we are able to effect "cognitive connectedness", involvement of the whole child, and meaningful learning by integrating the arts into other core subject matters. However Vena's claims for likening an integrated arts approach to the sampling of a Hershey Chocolate Bar may have further ramifications for arts learning. Sampling may need to be approached with caution because merely "tasting" each arts form may not lead to the richer experience which is usually based on in-depth experience of one art form. Some of Vena's claims may be in need of further development.

Vena (1992) stated that evidence exists (although he did not provide it), that where the arts are in a "marriage partnership" with the rest of the curriculum in the primary school that achievement test scores increase notably. Vena referred to The Open City Project in New York's Barrio which showed that reading scores improved
when the arts were integrated. Similarly, a Project AIR (Arts in Reading) in Attleboro Public School, Massachusetts referred to results indicating that children's reading comprehension scores increased when the arts and reading were integrated. Vena indicated a number of potential benefits of an integrated approach although he was concerned with the integration of the curriculum as a whole, not just the arts.

According to Kindler (1987) who reviewed the rationales of several integrated or multi-arts programs, there is not enough documented evidence to suggest that these approaches have value. Kindler conducted an ERIC search to locate sources of information about integrated arts programs introduced in the United States over the past decade. She cited the results of the various studies as “learning assumptions” and believed that statistical data and analysis were not provided in order for others to verify the claims of various programs.

Kindler (1987), believed that the fundamental assumptions of integrated and multi-arts programs can be summarised as follows:

(a) there is a similarity across the arts; (b) incorporating the arts into other subject matter areas accelerates and facilitates the learning process; (c) the arts promote creativity; and (d) integrated arts programs are more economical than separate instruction in each area. (p. 53)

Kindler posited that integrated and multi-arts programs that have been introduced into primary and secondary schools within the past ten years have been based on one or more of these assumptions.

Models for Integrated Arts Approaches
The paucity of recent literature on integrated arts prompted a search on Internet into the background of integrated arts programs in the United States. Several models were found: The HOT (Higher Order Thinking) Schools program in Connecticut; The Buckman Arts Magnet School, Portland, Oregon; The Wharton Middle Arts Magnet School, Nashville, Tennessee; The College of Creative Arts in Northern California and the Minnesota Center for Arts Education.

The HOT Schools program in Connecticut began in 1994, and was intended to assist six elementary schools committed to educational reform to develop approaches to fully integrate the arts into their curricula and pedagogical repertoire. Schools were required to have at least part-time visual arts and music specialists on site and were also required to provide adequate planning time for art specialists, classroom teachers, and residency artists. The nationally recognised Wolcott School in West Hartford, Connecticut served as a model school for educational reform, driven by a curriculum in which the arts were fully integrated. The program aimed to transform the way students learn in classrooms through the integration of the arts into traditional lessons. By infusing the arts in the school’s core curriculum, students’ higher order thinking skills, such as problem-solving and increased creativity would be developed.

The Buckman Arts Magnet School in Portland, Oregon is an arts magnet school which serves 530 students in grades kindergarten through to grade five. This school has an arts focus and the founders believed that the arts can be integrated throughout the curriculum to help students gain a better understanding of the world around them.
The Wharton Middle School is the site of Metro Nashville’s Performing and Visual Arts Magnet. The purpose of this centre is to provide students with a broad exposure to the four primary arts areas of music, dance, drama and art. The Arts are also incorporated into the academic classrooms to enhance involvement and learning. The goals of Wharton Middle School are to recognise each child as an unique individual; to provide quality instruction in the academic and arts areas; to stimulate creativity; to prepare the student to become an integral part of society and to utilise an interdisciplinary multicultural approach to teaching and learning.

The College of Creative Arts in Northern California represents unique opportunities for specialised foci, collaboration, interdisciplinary learning, or multidisciplinary pursuits in The Arts. “Academic programs in the college encompass all aspects and forms of the arts, including creative practice, theoretical and critical studies, historical studies, fine arts, applied arts, facilitative practices in the arts and arts education”. In the mission statement outlined on Internet, the College of Creative Arts explained:

A major goal of the college is the education of students who will become significant creators, scholars, educators, and facilitators in creative arts areas, and capable of major contributions in the urban environment as well as nationally and globally.

The College offers undergraduate course majors and minors which provide a broad introduction to various fine arts, design and communication arts disciplines. Amongst many other innovations, the college’s Arts Bridge to College Program provides opportunities for high school students to attend college classes in the arts at low cost.

A comprehensive, residential, tuition-free, public high school offering innovative coursework in six arts areas; dance, music, visual arts, literary arts, theatre,
media arts and an extensive academic studies program is offered by the Minnesota Center for Arts Education. The focus is on Year 11 and 12 students who are selected for admission based on ability in the arts and/or potential growth in an art area. This school is a statewide pilot school for interdisciplinary instruction, innovative teaching, scheduling and assessment practices.

The description of the integrated arts approaches mentioned above establishes the existence of such approaches. However commentary on the effectiveness of these programmes was not available.

The Arts - A Way of Knowing

Pateman (1991) suggested that while the arts have had some place in education, it is only recently that they have been conceived as a family of related disciplines, or what he referred to as a generic community. Because the arts can claim to provide width and balance in the curriculum, they should form an essential component of the curriculum. Pateman, paying tribute to the Gulbenkian Report, suggested that:

The arts represent a fundamental way of knowing to do with the aesthetic and creating fields. They are experienced through the direct use of the senses and engage both feelings and mind. They share a special capability of penetrating to the very core of human existence, having the potential to deal with every facet of life, from the most light-hearted and humorous to the most disturbing and profound. (p. 18)

Pateman’s beliefs have been shared by many arts researchers in the field over the past two decades. Best, (1995) believed that artistic feelings involve
understanding or cognition and that they are expressions of certain kinds of understanding and reasoning. In his book *The Rationality of Feeling*, Best exposed what he believed to be the most crucial issue for the arts in education. He indicated that if “we cannot prove that artistic feeling is itself rational and cognitive, then we have no legitimate case for the arts in education”.

According to Abbs (1989) all the non-linguistic forms of knowing are neglected. The Arts, as Abbs indicated, even with their tangible differences, all belong to the same symbolic community. They share the concerns of appreciation of art and production of art; they assume the same creative process and they are all committed to non-propositional forms of symbolism. The arts are however sharply segregated and ignorant of each other which has weakened them and made them organizationally ineffective (p. 41). Abbs called for a major reconstruction of the curriculum in the U.K. In part, the National Curriculum has attempted to place them together, although the reasons for doing so are pragmatic rather than philosophic in nature.

The Arts in Education

*The Vision for Arts Education in the 21st Century* (1993) was a symposium sponsored by the U.S. Department of Education including the Music Educators National Conference and others. The place of The Arts in the Curriculum was discussed and the question asked: - Why arts education? The response was that:

the arts are necessary because they allow us to think about the higher values of life in a very tangible way. They bring meaning to experience. They help us to reflect. They also help us to project. (p. 17)
These global claims for the arts mentioned in the Gulbenkian Report and the Vision for Arts Education symposium, identified cognition and feeling as important components of arts experience.

Literature and research in the United States of America, Great Britain and Australia indicate that the arts should form an integral part of the whole school curriculum. The National Curriculum initiatives in these countries have combined several arts forms into one area of learning, identifying the arts as having common or distinctive modes of understanding. The Calouste Gulbenkian Foundation (1982) in Great Britain took up the commission to consider the place of the arts as part of the school curriculum in the maintained sector of education and made recommendations concerning The Arts and education. The writers of the Gulbenkian Report were concerned with the fact that education was being shaped by political interest and cost cutting.

The Gulbenkian Report reviewed education, schooling, and the arts and advised that the arts exemplify a distinct area of human experience called the "aesthetic and creative". The Report recommended that all students should be given access to the arts from the position that:

creativity is not a special faculty with which some children are endowed and others are not, but that it is a form of intelligence and as such can be developed and trained like any other mode of thinking. (Robinson, 1982, p. 29)

Abbs (1989) found agreement between the Gulbenkian Report and Gardner's theory of multiple intelligences in that they both demonstrated a dramatic movement from singular to plural forms of reason. Abbs posited that the notion of multiple
intelligences, however provisional and however open to qualification, should compel us to examine the practice of U.K. schools.

Arts in Australian Schools

The Australian National Curriculum initiative with its proposal for the combination of the five arts forms into one area of learning, has lead many arts researchers and educators to be concerned about the possibility of reductionist trends in the timetabling of arts subjects. In addition, primary schools with more than one arts specialist are likely to see some rationalisation in the area.

Boughton (1992) indicated that art education in Australia has been characterised by “practices and principles borrowed from other countries, notably the United Kingdom and the United States”. He saw the reasons for this reliance as:

- the small number of art education scholars, the lack of a research tradition and concomitant post-graduate research programs in the field, significant problems of isolation, and a pattern of highly centralised bureaucratic state education systems. (p. 17)

Boughton believed that in order for the field of arts education to be defined there must be: ongoing philosophical inquiry that continues to inform practice; a recognition that arts education exists as a social construction within a community of participants (Boughton believed that the power to influence its practice is held unequally by different groups); and that there is a need for prescriptive research to understand the nature of existing practice.

Boughton’s (1992) concerns for arts education in Australia were linked to the fact that the framework was designed around the Competency Based Training
movement (CBT) which he saw as politically motivated. He indicated that subject profiling in the arts is now inevitable and he raised concerns about the educational difficulties for the arts. Boughton believed that the subject profiles and statements will be reductionist in nature. He indicated that the qualities which characterise achievement within disciplines are complex as the arts cannot be described by a few sentences at any level.

The *Creative Nation: Commonwealth Cultural Policy (1994)* viewed Arts education as twofold because it was concerned with “the provision of education for practitioners and for audiences”. *Creative Nation* indicated that Arts education can be divided into four areas: schools, professional training, vocational education and training, and parallel education. It stated further that:

- All Australians should have the opportunity of a school education which regards appreciation of the arts and the more traditional areas of learning as equally important.
- Primary and secondary education play a fundamental role in developing a capacity for appreciation of, and participation in, the arts.
- In 1991, the Commonwealth and State Ministers for Education agreed on eight key learning areas for curriculum development to provide a national approach to school curriculum frameworks. As one of the learning areas, the arts is now receiving due recognition as a necessary component of a well-rounded education.

Emery, (1994) in her editorial response to *Creative Nation*, (1994) recognised the report as the first Commonwealth cultural policy in Australia. She indicated that at the launch of the document in Canberra, the then Prime Minister, Mr. Paul Keating, postulated that the investment of $252m in the arts and culture indicated the Government believed that “cultural issues should be at the core of decision-making because all economic and social decisions have a cultural consequence”. However in presenting the views of the *Creative Nation* document, Emery commented on research
conducted by McRae (1994) in which 50 primary schools and 34 secondary schools in Victoria were surveyed. She stated:

In brief, the report indicated that there has been a decline in arts education provision in Victorian state schools over the last few years. For example, while most Victorian primary schools have previously supported primary arts specialist teachers, many schools have now curtailed their arts programs to cope with staffing cuts. (p. 4)

In reviewing what has already happened concerning the Australian art education experience with the introduction of common and agreed goals for arts education under the headings of profiles and statements, one has to question if the fears of several researchers who predicted a reduction in timetabling, (conflation of the five arts forms into one learning area) a reduction in resources and loss of jobs, are well founded.

A Need for Change

Maker, Neilson and Rogers (1995) posited that the cultural and linguistic nature of society has changed and that perceptions of giftedness and beliefs about what abilities should be recognized and developed in schools have also been affected by change. Whilst Maker, Neilson and Rogers recognised this fact, they indicated that standardised testing is still based on the “classic” Stanford Binet test developed in the early 1900s. They cited Callahan and McIntire (1994) as issuing a challenge for public schools to “recognize alternative culturally relevant indicators of outstanding talent that will be translated into effective assessment strategies and programming models for children not from the dominant culture” (p. 7). With that challenge,
Maker, Neilson and Rogers designed a process called DISCOVER for assessing problem solving in multiple intelligences. They believed that the results were exciting because students from such diverse cultural backgrounds as African-American, Anglo-American, Navajo, Tohono O'Odam and Mexican American, made gains equal to, or greater than, students identified by the traditional standardized tests for giftedness. This result should have far-reaching implications for the student in the classroom who is tested in the traditional linguistic and logical-mathematical mode. In designing problem types for an intelligence test based on Gardner's seven intelligences, Maker (1992) and Shriver (1991) developed a range of problem types that allowed many ways for learners to interact with content and demonstrate competence. The DISCOVER problem-solving process which grew out of this model utilised an integrated approach to learning and the results of the case studies are documented in Maker, Neilson and Rogers' (1995) article.

A Pro-active Response

The implications raised by the DISCOVER program are far reaching. If arts educators are to survive the reductionist trends that they see occurring in schools, they should be developing new programs which can be integrated into the core curriculum which ensure their survival in schools and will add an exciting new dimension to educational experience for students.

Brown (1993) suggested that instead of adopting the usual reactive response to change, Australian visual arts educators should become more active by being aware
of government policy. He believed that visual arts educators “need to enter the policy
arena through debate, lobbying or being involved as a powerful interest group”
(p. 39). Rather than being negative about educational change which is inevitable in
the world in which we live, arts educators should be looking at ways of presenting
curriculum which will be innovative, challenging and responsive to the needs of
students.

Chapter Overview

In this chapter the Australian arts education context has been compared to the
British and American approaches to arts education. Australian researchers questioned
the agenda driving the National Curriculum and much debate followed which
documented the fears they had for the combination of the five arts forms into one
learning area - The Arts.

In America, Project Zero helped to establish the belief that the arts are
profoundly cognitive activities. Much of the research conducted has documented
evidence that where the arts are integrated into the core curriculum, learning is
considered to be more effective and higher levels of achievement have been recorded.
Kindler (1992) questioned these early endeavours, suggesting that data and analysis
were required for verification of the results.

However, new initiatives are still being developed in America with many
projects such as the HOT schools program commencing their five year programs in
1994. It will be an important exercise to evaluate the long term effects of these
studies which maintain that integrating the arts into the core curriculum provides a stimulating environment in which students achieve at a higher level.

In any evaluation of the effects of the National Curriculum on arts education in Australia, it is important to consider the belief that the combination of the five arts forms into one Learning Area (The Arts) has raised the status of the arts in schools. Many still believe however that this move has already led to reductionist trends in the timetabling of arts subjects.

Finally, the Creative Nation report caused debate amongst Australian educators and researchers who believed that the aims of the report conflicted with what was actually happening in Australian schools.

In assessing the need for change, the DISCOVER program in America which utilised an integrated approach to learning, developed a new system of testing giftedness and questioned the traditional notion of standardised testing. The program has been described because it provides new initiatives in the field of arts endeavour. Working from an integrated arts framework, The Discover program has claimed success in promoting learning across the curriculum. The American initiatives which have been briefly documented in this chapter all seem to have one element in common and that is integration of the arts or inter-disciplinary thinking in the arts.
The contextual framework for this research is based on the concept that an Integrated Arts approach provides a desirable curriculum design which builds strength and unity for the arts. Significant reports which have affected the way arts are being taught in Great Britain, United States of America and Australia, provide a context for this research.

The Gulbenkian *The Arts in Schools* report (1982) has done much to focus attention on the necessity of the arts in education because the report revealed that the arts - dance, drama, music, visual arts and literature had been given little attention in educational planning at a national level in the United Kingdom. This same problem was evident in the development of arts education in the United States of America in the post sputnik sixties when the focus was on science and mathematics. The initiatives developed by the Getty Institute and the Arts Propel project did much to draw attention to the neglected state of the arts. In Australia during the development of the National Curriculum, the arts were not regarded as essential areas of the school curriculum. In *The Arts in Schools* Report, Robinson (1982) argued that:

> The case for the arts in schools does not amount to special pleading. It derives from the need for a system of education which takes account both of contemporary social circumstances and of the perennial and varied needs of children and young people, for a broad-based curriculum rather than one which is too occupied with academic learning. (p. 3)
The inclusion of the arts as a core area in the school curriculum is seen by various researchers of the major arts projects as being one of "logical and moral necessity" (Robinson, p. 18). In the investigation of the theoretical underpinnings of the arts as an integral part of the school curriculum, it was found that there is agreement about the contribution of the arts to human development and education.

For the purpose of this research it is necessary to limit the theoretical information to several reports focusing on the main ideas presented and the recommendations which have the potential to impact on curriculum design and integration of the arts within the curriculum.

_Gulbenkian Report (UK)_

There are various kinds of thinking and various kinds of intelligence. None of them has a prior or self-evident right to dominate the others in the school curriculum. (Robinson, p. 35)

The Gulbenkian Report drew attention to the possibility of two kinds of thinkers - convergent and divergent. Conventional (convergent) thinking allows children to perform well on the standard IQ tests while divergent thinking was non-conventional and open-ended. Divergent thinkers use ingenuity, inventiveness, unconventionality and have the ability to innovate and to solve problems. The report indicated that timetabling for the arts in secondary school is often inappropriate and opportunities for inter-disciplinary work across the curriculum are too often lost in the divisions of the timetable. The report saw the real value of integration as not only between the arts forms but also between the arts and the rest of the curriculum.
According to Gardner (1989), Project Zero was founded in 1967 by Nelson Goodman who at that time challenged the notion that linguistic and logical symbol systems should have dominance over other expressive and communicative systems. Following attempts such as those made by Peirce (1940), Cassirer (1953-57) and Langer (1942), Goodman formulated a taxonomy of the major symbol systems used by human beings. He described those used in the arts as musical, poetic, gestural and visual-graphic, as well as the modes of symbolisation which they embodied (e.g. representation, expression, metaphor, multiple meanings).

Gardner (1989) believed that no one art form should have priority over the other because each is capable of cognitive learning and experience. He indicated that it is better for a student to be thoroughly grounded in one arts form, rather than have a “smattering” of knowledge across the forms. Gardner pointed out that most people are gifted or not gifted in different domains. Because a child is stronger in some areas than others, s/he has “relative gifts” (i.e. areas of strength within the profile of intelligences).

The National Curriculum Statement in the Arts (Australia)

The history of the progression of Arts education in Australia from the first document Core Curriculum for Australian Schools (June, 1980) to the development
of *The Arts - the National Profile* (June, 1993) has been dealt with in the preceding chapters, particularly Chapter 1.

When defining The Arts area, the national curriculum statement in the arts describes three broad approaches to defining and understanding the arts:

1. Arts forms as symbol systems- constructed sets of meanings
2. aesthetic forms of knowing and expressing
3. arts are embedded in their social and cultural contexts

The national statement and profile for the arts indicated that these three ways of thinking about the arts are not mutually exclusive and do not exhaust all possibilities for curriculum delivery styles. The statement and profile are intended to give teachers scope to emphasise different aspects of the arts and to work within the theoretical frameworks of their choice. (p. 4) However the arts profile developed three strand organisers which were common to all arts forms. As indicated in Chapter 2 of this thesis - Responses to the National Curriculum Initiative - by developing a common view of arts learning and teaching in Australian schools, and combining the five arts forms into one Learning Area, the National Curriculum has unintentionally caused some divisions amongst the various arts forms. Integrated activities have the potential to combine the arts under a cooperative framework which will utilise teachers' expertise and encourage the sharing of resources, both human and physical.

In Western Australia, after the initial trialling phase of The Arts Outcome Statements, the reflective document: *The Arts Report* (1996) by the Education Department of Western Australia under the heading Cross Curriculum Issues, reported on integration as a model to ensure that Student Outcome Statements do not lead to a
fragmentation of the curriculum, but rather offer, in the case of secondary education, a link or connection between learning areas.

The international reports mentioned above drew attention to some of the features which the arts have in common, the importance of the arts in a balanced curriculum, and the need for children to have a solid grounding in at least one arts form. Each of the reports supported an integrated approach to learning in the arts and also cross-curricula integration.
CHAPTER 4

Methodology

This chapter will describe the method used in selection of the participants, provide an outline of the research design and the paradigm in which it is grounded (qualitative research). Semi-structured, scheduled interviews were the means for gathering data and the importance of this method will be elaborated. The triangulation of research data, reliability, validity and ethical considerations will be discussed in order to present the research as an authentic effort to document arts teachers’ perceptions of integrated arts.

Participants

Because time and cost prohibited a larger sample, 10 experienced arts teachers were purposively selected from secondary government schools. They were:

- Dance (n=2)
- Drama (n=2)
- Media (n=2)
- Music (n=2)
- Visual Arts (n=2)
Sampling Technique

Patton (1990, p. 169) indicated:

Perhaps nothing better captures the difference between quantitative and qualitative methods than the different logics that undergird sampling approaches. Qualitative inquiry typically focuses in depth on relatively small samples, even in single cases (n=1), selected purposefully.

Patton advised that the power of purposeful sampling rests in selecting "information-rich" cases which are of central importance to the study. Henry (1990, p. 1) indicated that time and cost prohibit a researcher from collecting data on the entire population or group that is of interest to the study. He advised that in order for the researcher to extend the study findings to the population, the model must be an accurate representation.

For this research a purposive sample of secondary arts specialist teachers was selected from the population of: Teachers in charge of an arts area, heads of an arts department and/or heads of an arts faculty who teach in Western Australian Government Schools. Ten "information rich" cases were selected with each participant an expert in their field. The sample included two teachers from each of the arts forms described by the National Curriculum which make up The Arts: dance, drama, media, music and visual art.

The names of all participants with the exception of Teacher B (dance) were provided to the researcher by Mr. John Williamson of Edith Cowan University. He was able to provide the researcher with the name of only one dance teacher who was head of department in a local secondary school. The researcher contacted a school
which was known to have a strong dance focus and sought permission for an interview.

Once the participants had been contacted by telephone and their approval granted, the researcher then faxed a letter to each principal seeking permission to interview the participants. The principals granted their permission by faxing a tear-off slip to the researcher. In each case the participants were willing to take part in the study and therefore this made the task of the researcher relatively easy. However, since the interviews were conducted before and after a term break, the researcher found it necessary to arrange the interviews during teachers DOTT (duties other than teaching) time at school. The participants were very generous in their willingness to assist.

Design - Qualitative Descriptive Study

The phenomena to be investigated were concerned with arts teachers’ perceptions of integrated arts in a time of rapid curriculum change. A qualitative descriptive design was chosen for this study because it dealt with the perceptions of arts teachers from five different arts forms.

Qualitative research allows the participant to speak in his/her own language in a familiar context. The use of rich description and explanation frees the participant from external worries, especially if the research is carried out in his/her own setting. The researcher must be sensitive to the needs of the participant and by placing herself in the participant’s environment she is possibly more at risk than the participant.
Wilson (1977) highlighted the pivotal role played by the researcher in carrying out research:

The qualitative research enterprise depends on the ability of the researcher to make himself a sensitive research instrument by transcending his own perspective and becoming acquainted with the perspectives of those he is studying. (p. 261)

Qualitative research was chosen for this study because it was necessary to be responsive to arts teachers' original interpretation and perceptions of the issue of Integrated Arts.

The researcher believes that the probing questions, which emanated from the need for further understanding, allowed more responsive data to be collected.

Firestone (1993) asserted:

The argument for qualitative research has never been that its claims for generalizability have been particularly strong. Qualitative research is best for understanding the processes that go on in a situation and the beliefs and perceptions of those in it. (p. 22)

It is clear to the researcher that if a general questionnaire had been issued to a larger population, some of the issues which emerged during the interviews would never have been raised because a questionnaire could not have anticipated the range of perceptions from participants from such diverse areas. Soltis (1989) referred to the need to acknowledge and accommodate diverse educational contexts:

the attempt to adopt, create, and use a variety of non-quantitative research methods to describe the rich interpersonal-social-cultural contexts of education more fully than quantitative research can do. (p. 125)

Peshkin (1993) described qualitative research as four categories or stages of inquiry: description, interpretation, verification and evaluation. He indicated that for too long quantitative research has been seen as the only valued method of research.
He drew attention to studies conducted by means of qualitative research methods which focus on people and their stories through use of description. Peshkin believed that interpretation of collected data or description “not only engenders new concepts but also elaborates existing ones” (p. 35). He cited the background to several successful qualitative studies and indicated that “problem finding” is one of the richest of all types of outcomes. Qualitative research allows for this type of outcome as it relies on the personal experience and description of the participant. Open-ended questioning should also allow for some other variables, unknown to the researcher, to be raised by the participants. Validity, as Peshkin indicated, is a general term for testing the validity of claims. He believed that qualitative researchers “are more likely to search for generalizations than to verify them” (p. 26).

Triangulation

Triangulation of the research results occurred through the use of a variety of data sources in the study. The combination of interviews, following up the interviews to clarify the content of transcripts with participants, and document analysis provided cross-data validity checks. Document analysis included consideration of reports, programs, booklets, and rationales from Integrated Arts Programs.

Guba and Lincoln (1977) quoted the work of Denzin (1971) who indicated that triangulation forces the observer to combine multiple data sources, research methods, and theoretical schemes. Guba and Lincoln (1977) considered that:

Problems of authenticity relate to the establishment of bases for trust in the outcomes of naturalistic inquiry. How might the
naturalistic inquirer argue to persuade a methodologically sophisticated peer about the authenticity of his information, the categories he derives and the interpretations he draws? (p. 63)

By triangulating the study, authenticity is confirmed. The categories for questioning derived by the researcher relate specifically to factors which arose from the literature on integrated arts practice. Further triangulation would result if a questionnaire could be developed using the same categories as the interview questions. This could be circulated through a quantitative study consisting of a survey of the total population of arts teachers in Western Australia. It would be interesting to compare the data from a questionnaire to the data gathered through a qualitative method of enquiry. However it was decided that the selected “information rich” cases would provide more than enough valuable data.

A design problem for this particular study was to adequately represent all the arts forms in a relatively small sample. It was difficult to obtain information on teachers of dance as often it is the physical education teacher who is performing a dual role: physical education and dance. Therefore, in some schools dance is not represented in the Visual and Performing Arts department, although this appears to be changing. A larger cross-site study or questionnaire, as previously indicated, would help to alleviate the problem of unequal representation of all arts forms, due to the duality of dance teachers. It could well be the case in the majority of schools that dance is being taught by physical education teachers, if it is taught at all.
Research Instrument - Semi-structured Interviews

The research instrument for the gathering of data for this research was an interview which took approximately fifty minutes of each participant's time. After permission had been granted, the entire interview was audio-taped.

Interviews have an advantage over questionnaires in that the interview was scheduled for a pre-determined date and there was less chance of non-participation. Patton (1987) stated that "the purpose of interviewing is to allow us to enter the other person's perspective (p. 109). As this study related to arts teachers' perceptions of integrated arts in a time of curriculum change, it was important to allow the personal perspective of the interviewee to be revealed.

A questionnaire issued to a stratified random sample has some degree of bias in that the researcher has constructed the factors with the backing of literature and previous research in the field. An interview which is structured but allows for open-ended responses was necessary to focus the responses of the participant. The wording of the questions during the interview allowed for open-ended responses. Patton (1980) defined an interview question as a stimulus designed to generate a response. He stated:

For purposes of qualitative measurement, good questions should, at a minimum, be open-ended, neutral, singular and clear. (Patton, 1980, p. 211)

Two types of open-ended questions were used in the interview: funnel questions and probe questions. Funnel questions are a series starting from a generalised question and progressively narrowing to focus the enquiry (Hook, 1981, p.
Probe questions were also used when it was necessary to ask for more information related to the participant’s previous response.

Data Collection

Once approval had been granted for the project to commence, a Pilot Study was conducted to detect any problems with the interview schedule. Because the number of participants in the study was low, the researcher chose to interview the Head of Department in a special art school who had considerable experience. Feedback from the pilot study assisted in the revision of questions. Minor changes were made to the interview schedule with some questions being deleted or refined.

It was then necessary to obtain consent from the Principals of the schools identified by the purposive sample. This task was time consuming and required follow-up in some cases. Once consent had been given, then the teachers were approached and an interview time was scheduled. The interviews took place over a period of twelve weeks - a frustrating exercise due to holidays and following up of participants. Following up teachers in school time became a challenging exercise. Some teachers were interviewed before the holiday break and some after. This in itself can produce differing responses as by the end of term most teachers are feeling tired and stressed. The advantage of interviewing at the end of term one and beginning of term two rested in the case that most visual and performing arts functions, exhibitions, public performances are conducted at the end of term two or
three. It was anticipated that the level of teacher stress would be minimal; thus ensuring worthwhile responses to the questions.

Teachers were assured of anonymity and all completed an Informed Consent Form. The researcher asked for permission to use an audio-tape recorder so that the interviews could be conducted within a fifty minutes time frame. Conducting interviews at the participant’s school reduced tension and increased reliability of the given data. According to Wilson (1977), the interview itself has its own dynamics and influences on behaviour and therefore it was important to create an environment in which the participant felt at ease. Teachers received a copy of the transcribed interviews in edited form, showing the reduced data which would be used in the research tables. The transcriptions were returned to the researcher if there were any necessary alterations.

Bounding the Data

Hamersley & Atkinson (1983, p. 191) stated that “data in themselves cannot be valid or invalid; what is the issue, are the inferences drawn from them.” Before inferences could be drawn, it was necessary to bound and reduce the data which the researcher had gathered. In relation to the bounding of data Miles and Huberman (1989, p. 27) asked:

Prior to fieldwork, how much shape should a qualitative research design have? Should there be a preexistent conceptual framework? A set of research questions? Some pre-designed devices for collecting data? Does such prior bounding of the study blind the researcher to important features in the site?”
Most researchers would agree that there are two ends to the research continuum. Usually a researcher comes to fieldwork with some focus, however for some researchers, laying out a conceptual framework, would be bounding the data too early. Some researchers believe that the conceptual framework should emerge empirically from the field in the course of the study and that the most important research questions will become clear. Miles and Huberman (1989) stated that highly inductive and loosely designed studies make good sense when researchers have plenty of time but the reality is that most qualitative research lies between these two extremes.

Miles and Huberman's (1989) Conceptual Framework (p. 36) has been used as a model to bound the data collected in this study. The descriptive results are made accessible to other researchers in the field by reducing the information to graphics. Bounding the collection of data helps to bring focus to the study and in the case of arts teachers' perceptions of Integrated Arts, there are many factors which impinge upon each participants' responses. The Conceptual Framework (Figure 1.) represents in diagramatic form the relationship between the main components of the research.
(Figure 1.) Conceptual Framework

**Arts Teachers’ Perceptions of Integrated Arts**

**Factors Identified as Impacting on Integrated Arts teaching**
- Change
- Affect
- Training
- Resources
- Support
- Theoretical Knowledge
- Current Practice
- Adoption of Change
- Perceived Value of Integrated Arts

**Research Methods**

**Document Analysis**
- The Arts - The National Profile
- The Arts - Statements and Profiles
- Student Outcome Statements (Education Department of W. A.)
- The Arts Report (Education Dept. of W. A.)

**Qualitative Method**
- Participant Selection
- Permission from Principals
- Pilot Study
- Scheduled Interviews
- Feedback to Participants
- Compilation of Data

**Research Questions**
- Perceptions of Change
- Perceptions of Integrated Arts
- Integrated Arts as an Approach
- Benefits and Disadvantages
- Perceptions of Strands

**Theoretical Underpinnings**
- Gulbenkian Report
- Project Zero/Arts Propel (USA)
- National Curriculum (Australia)
- The Arts Report (Ed. Dept. of W A)
- Education

**Change Agents**
- National Curriculum
- Australian Education Council
- Finn Report
- Ministers of Vocational and Training (MOVEET)
- Mayer Committee
- Education Department of W A
There are many ways in which the data might be analysed because of the number of arts forms involved. However for the purpose of this study, a comparison of the factors influential in forming arts teachers’ perceptions of integrated arts was undertaken. The interviews were constructed to probe teachers’ perceptions of the issues dealing with:

(1) The National Curriculum initiative of combining the five arts forms into one area - The Arts,

(2) Teachers’ understanding of the term Integrated Arts,

(3) The comparison of Integrated Arts and single subject teaching,

(4) Potential benefits or disadvantages of an Integrated Arts approach,

(5) How might the current learning strands identified in the Profile Statements and Outcomes facilitate an Integrated Arts Approach?

The factors identified through literature research as affecting arts teachers’ perceptions of integrated arts in the curriculum included: change, affect, training, resources, support, theoretical knowledge, current practice, adoption of change and limitations. The identified factors listed above may be quantified when the reduced data is presented through a series of matrices showing a comparison of the participants’ responses. The data presented in the matrices has been approved by the participants as correct and reflects their understanding and perceptions of the questions raised.
Reliability and Validity

Reliability refers to the extent to which the study can be replicated. It is concerned with describing the techniques and methods in enough detail so that the study could be satisfactorily replicated. LeCompte and Goetz (1982) indicated that reliability is dependent on the resolution of both external and internal design problems. They agreed that external reliability addresses the issue of whether independent researchers would discover the same phenomena should the study be replicated; whilst internal reliability refers to the degree which other researchers, working from previously generated constructs would match them with data in the same way as did the original researcher. LeCompte and Goetz (1982) stated:

Establishing the reliability of ethnographic design is complicated by the nature of the data and the research process, by conventions in the presentation of findings, and by traditional modes of training researchers (p. 35).

In this study, the researcher is a visual and performing arts teacher with empathy for the interviewees who are also visual and performing arts teachers. Reliability could be tested, should the study be replicated by a researcher from a different background. This in turn would lead to triangulation of the research design. LeCompte and Goetz (1982) postulated that "because human behaviour is never static, no study can be replicated exactly, regardless of the methods and designs employed" (p. 35). At the time that the researcher interviewed the participants there was a certain amount of industrial unrest which determined the timing of the interviews. Of course, these conditions must also to some extent affect reliability.
The validity of the study is linked to the credibility or truth of the results. To ensure validity, the researcher is obliged to follow some prescriptions and advice concerning the practice of research and the findings should not be based on intuitive data processing. Sadler (1981) suggested that the researcher should not cling to first impressions but rather try to find counter-examples. He suggests also that the researcher should not generalize too early. LeCompte and Goetz (1982) indicated that "even though the problems of reliability threaten the credibility of much ethnographic work, validity may be its major strength" (p. 43). The claim of ethnography to high internal validity is supported by the research design which allows the researcher to spend time with the participants. Informant interviewing may also be phrased more closely to the empirical categories of participants and are therefore less abstract than instruments in other research designs.

The interview approach was chosen over other forms of research as it was felt that when dealing with participants' perceptions, it is important that the data not be misconstrued by the researcher. By allowing for open-ended responses, the researcher's bias may also be minimised because it allows the participant to raise issues from their own perspective, which may be different to that of the researcher. When research is conducted in natural settings, the participants' home ground, it is more likely to generate a valid response than research which is conducted in a contrived setting. The researcher of this project interviewed teachers in their own settings and the responses were natural and within character of the participants. It was interesting to note that at a later date, when drafts of transcripts were sent out to
the participants for their confirmation, some of the “rich” language was lost when one participant decided to make the response more “refined” or acceptable.

Limitations

Document Analysis

The researcher has had difficulty in locating information on integrated arts practice in general. Most American models are still at the trial stage. In Australia there is very little literature concerning integrated arts practice. Therefore a highly refined theoretical framework was not appropriate for the study. The conceptual framework shows the reader the findings through literature, participants’ responses and existing policies and practices which may impact on the concept of integrated arts and its relationship to Arts education in general.

Interview Data

The time-consuming nature of in-depth interviews provided a limitation on the scope of the research and the number of participants who could be interviewed. Another limitation for this project was the fact that there were five arts forms to be surveyed independently which increased the breadth rather than the depth of the study.

The researcher also believes that much of the data gathered concerning dance education was based on the perceptions of other arts teachers. An interesting future study might be based on interviews of a larger number of dance teachers with a purposive sample of five participants trained as dance teachers and five who were
trained as physical education teachers. The researcher raises this issue because the
dance teachers identified by other arts teachers in their schools, did not necessarily
wish to join an arts faculty and were quite happy to remain under the umbrella of
physical education.

Timing

The timing of any research is critical and in the case of this study, as mentioned
previously, the questioning took place before and after school holidays. This made the
implementation of the interviews quite difficult. Most interviews were conducted
during teachers' DOTT time. For a more reliable result it would be better to have the
interviews scheduled over a two week period. There were also limitations due to the
researcher's own work commitments.

Ethical Considerations

Obtaining Consent

Many ethical problems can arise when dealing with human subjects,
particularly in the field of education. Qualitative research cannot be value free. The
researcher and the participants should behave as responsible moral agents and as such
are held ethically accountable. The consequences of harming others in research can be
far-reaching and to this end an assurance of confidentiality and adherence to ethical
codes in general was given to the participants.
Soltis (1989) indicated that it is important to shift the focus from a personal to a professional perspective which should move the researcher from a personal to the communal point of view. Soltis (1989) expressed the view that:

The serious consideration of public ethics forces us to look through the personal and professional perspective to see beyond them to the moral issues of our socially constructed and publicly shared life world. (p. 125)

Once the sample had been selected, the researcher sought permission from the principals of the relevant schools to conduct interviews with arts teachers. Ethical considerations are part of gaining access to schools and individual teachers and it was necessary to gain an understanding of school policies about data access and human subjects (Maruyama and Deno 1992, p. 19). The principals and teachers were given an outline of the study and in each case permission was granted.

Each teacher was assured of anonymity and confidentiality and signed a consent form indicating that the data could be used for research purposes. In cases where teachers made references to other staff or schools, anonymity was maintained. In the presentation of data, teachers have been identified alphabetically.

Data Analysis

Peshkin, (1993) indicated that no research paradigm has monopoly on quality, stressing that none can deliver promising outcomes with certainty. He suggested that the four stages of description, interpretation, verification and evaluation provided some structure “for the feast of possibilities that may result from qualitative research” (p. 23). During the data analysis, the researcher relied upon the descriptions given by
the participants to provide data relating to not only to the questions raised, but also new information that arose in the course of the interviews. This information is what Peshkin refers to as a sub-category of description and links to "processes, relationships, settings and situations, systems and people" (p. 23). A qualitative study allows much more data to emerge which can influence the overall findings of the research. The researcher is able to understand more clearly why a participant answered as they did; such an understanding would not necessarily emerge from a questionnaire which had been posted to participants. This data has been presented through a series of tables showing the varying responses between the participants. In Peshkin's second stage, interpretation, he refers to the work of Harter (1989) who derived three concepts - universal, developmental, and shared, that typify what she calls the "visions" of different types of change agents. The tables and data analysis in this research have attempted to refer to both the viewpoint of the participant (personal) and the wider context, as the participant sees the situation (holistic) - (Question 2). It has also been the intention of the researcher to gain a thorough insight into the participant's views of integrated arts as opposed to single subject teaching (Question 3) by allowing positive and negative responses. This is also the case for Question 4, where the researcher asked for both benefits and disadvantages of an integrated arts approach. It has allowed the participants to express both sides of the argument and in most cases, one point of view emerged more strongly than the alternative. For Peshkin (1993) the interpretive process was invaluable because "Interpretation not only engenders new concepts, but also elaborates existing ones". (p. 26)
Verification is the third stage of Peshkin's descriptive analysis and is referred to as testing the validity of claims. In order for the researcher to ensure that the reduction of data had not unintentionally changed the participants' viewpoints, a matrix was sent to each participant which showed a listed of the questions raised during the interview and the responses shown. Each participant was invited to contact the researcher to correct any misunderstandings. This proved to be a worthwhile exercise because during the process an error had changed one of the participant's responses notably. It was also interesting to note that after reflection, one of the participants refined the nature of their response; not altering meaning, but correcting the response grammatically.

Evaluation, the last of Peshkin's categories, in his own words "covers a vast territory of possibilities" which he confines to "policies, practices, and innovations". He asked the questions:

Have they been implemented? With what impact? What has the process been like? How do they work? For whom do they work? Are there exceptions? (p. 27)

Peshkin (1993) referred particularly to the work of Guba and Lincoln (1989) and Patton (1990) indicating that some of the best literature on qualitative evaluation has been associated with their work. In many cases qualitative evaluation brings to light new information which in many cases was not initially considered by the researcher. This allows for the "continuing search for truth and the tentative answers" that Peshkin found useful in Sellitz's (1959) studies in social research.

In this chapter, the researcher has explained the methodology of data collection for this qualitative research which included the selection of participants from
secondary government schools. The purposive sampling selected “information rich” cases with each arts teacher holding either a teacher-in-charge or head of department status. The qualitative descriptive design, using semi-structured, audio-taped interviews allowed the researcher to question the teachers in their own setting ensuring that “information rich” data was drawn from the participants’ own descriptions. Triangulation of the data was achieved through analysis of supporting documents, reports, programs, and rationales relating to integrated arts as an approach to arts teaching. The Conceptual Framework (p.49) identified the key issues impacting on this research. Reliability, validity and limitations of this research were discussed in this chapter and should a cross-site study be conducted, it would be of value to interview arts teachers who were not heads of department or teachers-in-charge. Data analysis is always driven by the emphasis that the researcher places on the study. It would be challenging to raise a questionnaire which could be analysed using quantitative methods. Some of the language rich responses would be lost but it could be an interesting way of comparing results.

In the process of this research into arts teachers’ perceptions of integrated arts, the researcher has advanced the discussion slightly along the path of understanding as other issues have emerged from the study which are worth investigating. A significant issue to emerge concerned the place of dance and media under The Arts “umbrella”.

The ensuing chapter which outlines arts teachers’ responses to the questions raised, shows some of the reduced data using the “rich” language which Peshkin discussed in his first stage of analysis - description.
CHAPTER 5

Presentation of Data: Stage 1

This chapter provides an overview of information obtained from the ten teachers involved in the research. It gives an insight into their teaching experience, background and training, response to change, current practice and their perceptions of Integrated Arts.

Description and quotations provide the raw data which are presented without interpretive judgements. The purpose of the description is to take the reader into the setting and develop an understanding of the participants' points of view. In Chapter 6 the presentation of data continues with the data presented in a reduced form.

Each participant is teaching in a government school as a secondary subject teacher of one of the arts forms and five have had ten or more years of teaching experience in their arts form. Three are Arts Coordinators who also teach in their field of expertise and seven are Teachers in Charge of an arts form. Only one teacher had not experienced the trialling of Outcome Statements and only one teacher had not experienced the integration of arts across arts forms.

Table 1 (p. 76) shows a profile of the ten arts teachers and their relative teaching experience, exposure to integrated arts, and exposure to outcome statements. This table is presented to enable comparisons to be made between the participants.
Teacher A was originally a physical education teacher who developed dance in her school. Teacher A is now working full-time as a dance teacher but is still “on-side” with the physical education teachers who wanted to keep dance under the jurisdiction of the physical education department. Teacher A indicated that from the moment dance became part of the visual and performing arts faculty, the subject “took off”.

Table 1. Profile of the Participants’ Teaching Experience

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Teacher</th>
<th>Years Teaching</th>
<th>Experience in Arts Form</th>
<th>Exposure to Integrated Arts</th>
<th>Exposure to Outcomes Assessment</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A - Dance</td>
<td>19 years</td>
<td>5 years</td>
<td>Minimal</td>
<td>Trialling</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teacher-in-charge</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B - Dance</td>
<td>6 years</td>
<td>6 years</td>
<td>Nil</td>
<td>Nil</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teacher-in-charge</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C - Drama</td>
<td>4 years</td>
<td>4 years</td>
<td>Minimal</td>
<td>Trialling</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teacher-in-charge</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D - Drama</td>
<td>12 years</td>
<td>9 years</td>
<td>Minimal</td>
<td>Trialling</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teacher-in-charge</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E - Media</td>
<td>10 years</td>
<td>10 years</td>
<td>Minimal</td>
<td>Trialling</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Arts Coordinator</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>F - Media</td>
<td>7 years</td>
<td>7 years</td>
<td>Marginal</td>
<td>Trialling</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teacher-in-charge</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>G - Music</td>
<td>16 years</td>
<td>16 years</td>
<td>Minimal</td>
<td>Trialling</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Arts Coordinator</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>H - Music</td>
<td>14 years</td>
<td>14 years</td>
<td>Minimal</td>
<td>Trialling</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teacher-in-charge</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I - Visual Arts</td>
<td>15 years</td>
<td>15 years</td>
<td>Substantial</td>
<td>Trialling</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Arts Coordinator</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>J - Visual Arts</td>
<td>16 years</td>
<td>16 years</td>
<td>Substantial</td>
<td>Art &amp; Design Outcomes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teacher-in-charge</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
I think it’s wonderful and to me it’s just a very logical way to go. As soon as I came across to performing arts there was this amazing supply of music and there were resources that I could use - and the kids saw it (dance) as an art form, not just recreation.

When asked about the combination of the five arts forms into one learning area - The Arts – Teacher A said of the Western Australian situation:

Well, I hope it affects them (the arts) positively. I think the kids here see dance as an arts form but I am not sure if it is happening across the State. It would be pretty interesting to go through and see how many kids actually do an arts subject right through to year ten. That’s something we (in our school) will hopefully do before next year - I think it’s vital that all students do at least something in an arts area.

Teacher A stated that in their school, arts teachers were privileged because the school was new and the formation of a visual and performing arts department enabled music, drama and dance to develop at the same time. Teacher A indicated that the arts forms each needed the others to give the department status. Teacher A believed that in some schools the situation was not the same with some arts teachers, (particularly music teachers), afraid of losing their position.

Hopefully people will come to their senses - I mean it is jobs. People are having to sell their area. The power of working in united bodies is great in schools.

When asked about understanding of the term integrated arts, Teacher A stated that integrated arts has a twofold purpose. First of all, in a practical way, students see
the arts forms coming together and working across boundaries. Secondly, it is a subtle way of building strength for the faculty.

The kids see that the arts are more than one subject - that there is such a thing as - The Arts. Even in our year eight level we are trying desperately to get the kids onto a rotation where it is actually all on the same grid and they travel from one arts area to another. I think the link comes from the way they write in their journal. We are trying to bring it in so that they have one journal that lasts them through dance, drama, music and visual arts and the same approach is used when analysing a piece of work.

Musical theatre is a unit that is very integrated - they dance, they sing and there is a bit of drama involved as well - so that’s a unit that we’ve got that you would say is integrated. We try to integrate through the media as well. We have students videoing performances.

My big push is that I think primary school should have an integrated arts program. We should be training primary specialists who are arts teachers who may have their area of strength, but they can teach across the board so that kids will come out of primary school with an arts education.

In answer to a question about how an integrated arts approach would compare to the standard style of single subject teaching, Teacher A responded:

I do think there is time when forms have to specialise. You can’t deny that; otherwise you end up with a watered-down approach completely and that’s why I’m putting it back to the primary. Primary school should be integrated and then when they get to secondary school, they do start to specialise.

Teacher A believed that the potential benefits of an integrated arts approach were linked to the fact that students get a better understanding of all the arts forms and they can specialise once they have the basic knowledge. Teacher A saw the benefits of an integrated arts approach as being able to share resources and provide
support so that the faculty is built up. Disadvantages of this type of approach however were linked to timetabling constraints:

Over here at the moment (indicating the classes in progress) we have got drama and visual arts together, but then they go to business education which seems crazy.

and physical resources:

Geographically we are better off than a lot. The problem arises now that art is 50 metres down the path, but in other schools the arts are in all four corners and that geographically doesn't work. The visual art teachers come up and have morning tea with us and that is good. We are trying to do additions that will join the faculty together. I have a lot of heads of department who are just creating faculties come to me for advice on how to build a strong faculty. My first question to them is, where are your arts areas situated?

When asked about dance, Teacher A indicated satisfaction with the way it is going. Teacher A has managed to get two or three boys into the group and feels that this is perhaps because in their faculty they have a high representation of male teachers - three. “The role models are there for the boys to come in and they feel welcome”.

Teacher A sees one of the problems associated with retaining boys in the Arts area is that their peers give them a hard time. Teacher A would like more space for the subject as they have outgrown the area. Teacher A believed that dance has held a low profile in schools because it has been taught “badly”.

I see the products at dance festivals and things and I wonder. What I see is their product does not appear to have come from what they should be learning. My year nines are always doing a very creative, educational type of approach and when I go and see year nines in
other schools doing a bop, I wonder what they have been taught. It is not an arts education to me - so we are in the situation where some people are teaching it as a physical education fitness type of thing. I don’t have fitness as an objective in my program. I believe they will develop fitness during the dance. Sometimes they’ll spend half an hour on the floor with a piece of paper planning - to me that’s an arts education. It’s a hard subject for people to learn without lots of good decent in-servicing and difficult if it’s not being taught in a supportive environment. I didn’t have a budget for dance under physical education until I came over to the performing arts. We had to get our act together so that I could have a budget. The resources are here, not in physical education.

Teacher A stated clearly that dance has a better profile under the umbrella of visual and performing arts not only because resources are more available, but because dance has become more accessible as a subject, especially for boys. Teacher A believes that an integrated arts approach has a place in the secondary school, but it would be better served in the primary school program so that the students come to secondary school with a well-balanced education in the arts. Although most of the students at Teacher A’s school lacked an arts background, arts teachers had made an effort to develop the arts as a cohesive body by using an integrated model. When asked which of the current strands would be most effective for an integrated arts approach, Teacher A stated that the strand of arts criticism and aesthetics would provide a strong link between the arts forms because their school had been involved in the “Stepping Out” program and this has impacted on the area - especially journal writing.

Teacher B was a physical education major who taught dance and health education as well. When asked about the move to combine the five arts forms under
one area of learning - The Arts, Teacher B showed an awareness of some move in that direction but had not heard much about it. When asked how it would affect a teacher of an arts subject, dance, Teacher B said:

In this school we have actually been talking about combining and having a performing arts faculty and I think their object was to offer support. It would be good in that respect but I wouldn’t want to lose my physical education identity either, so there is a push and pull situation.

Upon further questioning it was revealed that teacher B was concerned with the fact that teachers might be required to teach in other arts areas as well. Teacher B indicated a feeling of satisfaction with drama but would not be able to teach visual arts.

When asked about an understanding of integrated arts, Teacher B commented:

I think forming a faculty that would be Performing Arts Faculty would provide support for all areas, rather than dance being on their own. Integration would be when we have a dance concert and theatre arts run the lighting and the visual arts do the props - so it’s a full thing . . . everyone’s there supporting everyone else.

Teacher B indicated that an integrated approach to the arts, rather than a single subject approach would provide a more supportive framework for the school, teachers and the “kids”.

I think you would get - the kids would have a much deeper understanding - the kids love to dance but they don’t like performing and it’s very difficult to get that - whereas if you’ve got them in that arts stream, with that feeling all of the time, that’s performing. In theatre arts here we have the problem that they don’t turn up to rehearsals or they don’t turn up to the concert - but I think if we are all supporting that push and there’s that stream, it would change the focus of the kids and it
would change the focus of the school. All our theatre and everything is fantastic at this school and there's support for it, but I think all together, (arts forms together) the kids would have a completely different feeling for it, a better understanding.

When discussing the benefits of an integrated arts approach, Teacher B felt that resource sharing and support were two benefits. However, the physical layout of the arts areas would disadvantage an integrated arts approach as dance and theatre arts were isolated from each other being located at separate parts of the campus. Timetabling for the arts did not seem to be a problem as each period was eighty minutes in length, allowing an opportunity for extended work across the forms. If anything, Teacher B indicated that if students had dance, theatre and visual arts on the same day, they might become bored and lose their enthusiasm for the subjects.

Teacher B indicated non-participation in any integrated arts activities, other than to provide teacher support to the theatre arts department by helping with supper on performance nights. When asked which strand would lend itself to an integrated arts approach, Teacher B indicated an unfamiliarity with the strands. After the researcher provided an explanation of the areas, Teacher B considered that the strand of creating, making and presenting would best support this method.

I think what I have found with teaching physical education as well as dance is that kids prefer everything practical and they learn a lot more. They are practising their skills in context all the time - like with physical education - you do a lot of skills but get them in a game and they lose all their skills and technique. So I try to get them into whatever's happening as much as possible and I think they learn more by being there. Sometimes they don't actually realise they've learned it and we have to sit down then and say ... “Ahhh right” - they say “I didn’t realise that!” They are so caught up in what they
are doing, but they have learnt it; whereas if you sit them down and do things more verbally I think they lose interest so I think if you get them working first and then take it back a step and say this is what we’ve actually done – “ahhh right” – whereas if you sit them down and say this is what we are doing, let’s study this first and then get onto it, you’ve lost them before they get out to start.

When asked by the researcher to discuss some of the difficulties faced in teaching dance as a subject, Teacher B replied:

When I first started at this school, there was no dance and I worked very, very hard to build it up. Now we have got upper school dance but it is so difficult because there is no money so when I say I want a floor to dance on they go – “ohhhh” – so I’m dancing on concrete - so I’m getting shin splints - the kids are getting shin splints - the room we dance in is pretty inadequate - it’s only about twice the size of this interview room (very small) with one window and some wall fans, so in winter - no matter what time of the year it is - it is quite stuffy. The support for dance is not there - I feel it’s getting worse and worse and worse - when I put on dance concerts - I’m the only teacher there.

When asked if there were any other problems as a teacher of dance, Teacher B indicated that there was a lack of good resources:

In teaching upper school dance, there’s a lot of theory that the kids have to do - and that’s hard to get the kids to do theory too - ‘cause in my belief practical is always best - but we have to do the theory and there’s not a lot of help around and you just go - “OK today we are doing such and such - and it’s a lot of extra work in going to the library, if anything would be in the library. Just trying to build up your own resources from what you know is hard.
Teacher B stated that in the delivery of the new curriculum it will be necessary to provide sufficient resources for teachers of dance so that the areas of criticism and aesthetics could be dealt with adequately.

Clearly Teacher B felt a lack of support due to limited resources and participation in their school, but on the other hand acknowledged that their school saw dance as being a “draw-card” area for the school. Teacher B felt that personal abilities lay more in the practical orientation to dance and less in the knowledge and feeling areas of criticism and aesthetics. Teacher B could see the benefits of an integrated arts approach from the point of view that it would make resources more accessible and provide support for teachers. Teacher B was concerned however, about losing identity as a physical education teacher, should dance come under a visual and performing arts faculty.

Teacher C has been teaching drama since graduating as a teacher, over four years ago. Teacher C also teaches English, although the major teaching area was history. Teacher C has been involved in writing a drama curriculum. When asked about general views on the National Curriculum’s combination of the five arts forms into one learning area - The Arts – Teacher C indicated concern for dance, drama and media as these areas were more likely to suffer in the timetable. However, Teacher C believed that it is good that the arts are being recognized in the wider curriculum framework because so little in the arts has been compulsory in the past.
Teacher C considered that it was not a foregone conclusion that Outcome Statements would go ahead and that the curriculum changes would be ratified. When questioned further about the affects that it might have on the Western Australian situation, Teacher C replied:

I was in school at the time of Unit Curriculum changes and so even just in the years that I have been in school I’ve seen quite significant change, and I think people aren’t ready, or very reticent to move towards change. Certainly in drama, it has really forced people to look at what it is they are teaching - and I think of all the “airy-fairyness” often associated with drama; some people do allow that to happen in their classes - playing games and improvising - or whatever - this is going to take the focus back on to part academic/part practical - and I think that’s the way it needs to be.

Teacher C was very positive about change and how it will affect their school and indicated that their school was already working from Outcomes Based Assessment.

When asked about an understanding of the term integrated arts, Teacher C offered the following:

I think basically it’s about trying to show young people that the arts have something in common - that drama isn’t just about drama, or art isn’t just about art. I suppose any small way of integrating arts into everything we do - I’m working next term with the media teacher - with my drama kids and his media kids - we are going to be making a small video.

On discussing the value of an integrated arts approach compared to single subject teaching, Teacher C explained participation in an integrated program at another school where an integrated project was trialled with 45 students. Teacher C
questioned the value of working with so many students at once, indicating that skills are specific to a particular arts form. Teacher C believed that an integrated arts approach would have some value in that it is getting kids to recognise what is happening in the other arts areas. Teacher C felt that the success of an integrated arts approach is linked to the person/people with whom you are working. "Personalities" can sometimes make it impractical, as can the constraints of the school's physical arrangements. Teacher C indicated that "there are some people who don’t want to be involved in an integrated approach and it would be an unfair expectation to make them participate, especially "first year out" teachers.

Teacher C predicted that if she were to set up an integrated arts program, the focus would be on the strand of creating, making and presenting because:

I think you can put those things into creating, making and presenting. If you are trying to do the job of teaching as well as you can, you always need to look at what works well about this piece? What is the feeling about this? What makes it not interesting for us? When exploring under creating, making and presenting, you can always do the little past and present context bit.

Teacher C had obviously been involved in an integrated arts activity but past experience in working collaboratively with a large group had not been successful. Teacher C was concerned that skills in individual forms were not being developed sufficiently. Teacher C was quite open to the idea of change and expressed support for the combined arts idea, as long as the "smaller" arts forms which were named as dance, drama and media, did not lose their identity.
Teacher D was a social studies teacher before transferring to drama teaching. Teacher D believed that the combination of the five arts forms into one learning area - The Arts - was long overdue. When asked about how the combination would affect the Western Australia situation, Teacher D explained:

I think it will serve to right quite a few wrongs that are in the system at the moment. For instance, apart from the fact that it uses the body, there is no reason for dance ever to have been exempted from performing arts - or for photography ever to have been under manual arts. I think that this has had a big affect on the way that some subjects are taught - which umbrella they come under. It's terrible that dance is taught by physical educationists, not artists. It is not the interest of physical education teachers to know much about aesthetics and the cultural context of dance.

Teacher D saw one of the major problems for her school when facing change was the fact that each of the subjects within the visual and performing arts area was geographically and intellectually isolated.

Drama is at the opposite end of the school to art which isn't good and mostly I find it depends on the particular person. For instance in some schools media might come under the technology area, whereas I find I can work very closely with our media teacher and the way things are moving with drama, I see drama being integrated with film - so I work with them. I don't tend to work with the dance teacher, because I am a dance teacher myself - and the art people, we work together on their art exhibition and they are really great people to work with. But because we are physically isolated we really don't see each other.

Teacher D felt that the impending changes would create a stronger bonding for arts teachers.
The way I see now, towards the end of the twentieth century, we are moving away from individual arts anyway. Arts are more integrated. They are integrated in that we no longer have a dance theatre or music, we have performance and I think that by having an integrated arts curriculum - that's just recognising what's happening in the rest of the world.

When asked about an understanding of the term, integrated arts, Teacher D saw the term as meaning that the arts would be taught separately:

That they still maintain an independence, otherwise they would have a feeling of loss, but that where possible, and where appropriate, arts can be integrated as in theatre students being actors for media students, or art helping to provide a backdrop for a theatre piece. This would be a collaborative project with everyone inputting.

Teacher D saw the benefit of teaching in an integrated arts style as opposed to single subject teaching as it would overcome the isolation that many arts teachers face:

Unless you make a big effort, the teachers are very isolated. I work in a department where everyone is an English teacher or a literature teacher, which has nothing in common with the arts and theatre - so you are quite isolated - whereas I think working with other arts teachers, and I include media in arts. They are all people who are working with students in practical ways and you have a lot more in common with them.

Teacher D indicated that there were no disadvantages in working in an integrated arts approach, only benefits. Teacher D believed that strengths would be built:

The teacher support for each other. Also students would have more opportunity. I notice that students are very limited in their subject choice and so a student might take one arts subject where in fact they've only done so because of timetabling restrictions. Their real interest is in
multiple-arts and by having more collaborative work, then the students can have the chance to experience other forms - having a little time and taste of another form - even though they may not be officially involved in it. They would still get to see the process and be aware of what is going on.

When asked about experience in integrated arts programs, Teacher D indicated that an involvement many years ago in a Bicentennial performance which included 250 students, choir, orchestra, dance, drama and the art students painted the backdrops. That was a successful fully integrated exercise. Since that time, Teacher D had been involved in musicals which included the forms of music, dance and drama. Teacher D commented that the design of an integrated curriculum around the strands be best served by creating, making and presenting because “it’s a doing thing” and it should come first. The other contextual strands would then follow.

Teacher D had a very enthusiastic and positive approach to drama but felt some frustration due to the fact that the school did not have a visual and performing arts department. Teacher D indicated that the design and technology strand was being built up first and that it would be a long time before there was some cohesiveness in the arts in their school. Drama was still located in the English department and media in the design and technology department. In Teacher D’s school, year eight students are not able to participate in drama because it is a hard subject to get into in year nine because of large numbers, and this has given some prestige to the subject. However Teacher D feels that the fact that Western Australia is the only State in Australia which doesn’t include drama as a TEE subject is a big disadvantage and “quite disgusting”. Because many students have a TEE focus, they are lost from drama on entry to year eleven and twelve.
At the outset, Teacher E (media) stated that their school had just formed a new faculty for visual and performing arts but expressed disappointment that dance had decided to stay with physical education because the teacher has a stronger interest in physical education. Teacher E believed however that it was better to have four committed Arts teachers, than five who could not work together effectively.

When asked about the combination of five arts forms into one learning area - The Arts, Teacher E responded:

Well I'm all for it, obviously, because ... well, media actually sits in four areas but having done some action research if you like, through a professional association, we have found that the majority of media teachers prefer to sit within the arts because The Arts outcome statements don't have to be modified - whereas with the others, we'd have to add on a bit, or take a bit off or rearrange programs. I think research has also shown that those students who do arts also perform better academically.

When asked about how the change might affect Western Australian schools, Teacher E indicated that some subjects such as music and visual arts, may feel that they will lose some curriculum time because in the past they have had a larger share of the timetable.

Teacher E, when asked about an understanding of the term integrated arts, discussed an experience in another school which ran an integrated arts program. Teacher E recalled that three teachers were involved in a team-teaching exercise with 60 year eights. However, Teacher E was not sure that the students learnt much because 60 students were too many to manage effectively. In Teacher E’s current school when activities are integrated the teachers use a theme and several departments work to the theme. It is integrated in that they cross other disciplines such as
photography, manual arts, and food and nutrition. However, Teacher E was concerned about tokenism:

I do worry about the tokenism - yes we are doing the environment (current topic) and no-one knows anything about how the other area operates. We have actually decided that at the end of every course, we will have an exhibition so that people can see what we have been doing.

When asked about how an integrated arts approach might compare to a single subject approach, Teacher E responded that an integrated arts approach is much more exciting for the teachers and the "kids". Teacher E explained that if students can see how things link together and how they can work from one arts form to produce something in another, then the learning is more valuable and develops their understanding of the arts as a whole. Teacher E felt that integration is more suitable at a lower secondary level because once TEE subjects are involved, the skills become more specific to one arts form and there is less opportunity for integration. For Teacher E, another problem for integrated arts approaches concerned arts teachers' competitive instincts:

The main disadvantage of an integrated arts approach is: you could get power struggles, personality-wise; I suppose you would need a similar philosophy otherwise it wouldn't work.

Teacher E reported the fact that the dance teacher did not want to participate in their activities:
I must say that it is probably a lot easier if they are not in it; especially too with timetabling because visual arts and media are on with year eight at the moment. I’d like to program for drama and media to get a share of year eight. It’s much easier to fight for two than three. Without dance we have much more of a chance for some time.

When discussing an arts initiative at a feeder school in their area, Teacher E stated that the arts areas of drama, media, music and visual arts were involved, but not dance.

Dance seems to miss out because of a lack of specialist teachers in dance. Dance is often taught by physical education teachers. It’s like an English teacher teaching media; they are quite different philosophically and the creative side is often missing.

Teacher E, when asked which strand of The Arts would best suit an integrated arts approach, replied:

That depends, because we talked about that in this school. Using arts language which I think is an integral part of everything - if you are teaching visual arts, you’re teaching that language and whatever - so I wouldn’t use that strand because I believe that it is specific to that area - arts criticism and aesthetics is the one which is going to frighten people most, so I would leave that out - I think creating, making and presenting and past and present contexts - depending on what you do - because I have found that most programs that we had in media fitted all of them actually, but if you were trying to show everyone that they weren’t having to create something new and they could present, that would be good.

Teacher E was enthusiastic about The Arts having a recognised place in the curriculum. The concern was clearly for dance, believing that it should be taught from an arts focus, rather than a physical education perspective which excluded criticism and aesthetics. Teacher E was excited about an integrated arts initiative that was
developing (Rock and Roll), through Teacher E’s role as Coordinator of the Arts. It is clear that this initiative needs to be fully documented if progress is to be made in the promotion of integrated arts projects in schools. Since this research has been completed, an account of the preceding venture has been documented and is now available.

When asked about views on the combination of the five arts forms into one area learning - The Arts, Teacher F (media) indicated a concern, that as a media teacher “you could get lost in the art department”. Teacher F believed however that the positive side of media sitting within The Arts area of learning is that it has more credibility as a subject, particularly in his school which is a visual art and technology school. On the whole, Teacher F believed that it was a positive initiative to include media within The Arts framework.

Teacher F understood integrated arts to be: “all the communicative and performing arts - including visual arts as well”. When probed about an understanding of the term integrated arts, Teacher F explained that when introducing advertising as a topic in media, the teacher of photography asked Teacher F to teach photography students about some of the concepts which cross over into their subject. Teacher F also spoke of an exercise in which year eleven students complete a media exercise which develops in the graphics area in the form of a lay-out for the school magazine. In this way, integration was occurring across the arts forms.

When asked how an integrated arts approach might compare to the single subject approach to teaching, Teacher F replied:
I think it's great for the kids because kids have this idea that it's English - English finishes at the end of the period and now we go to maths - and even when these kids leave school they still think everything is separate. They don't realise until some years later that you use all those skills through all those subjects - and what we do is probably just a bit more due to the fact that they are swapping between classes and they realise that something they've done in media is linked, or similar to, what they are learning in art.

Teacher F was quite happy to work collaboratively with other teachers:

I am conscious about the kids and what they get out of it. You can see in traditional subjects how some teachers don't like to collaborate as they wish to protect their own subjects - especially in maths and the sciences.

When asked about the benefits or disadvantages of an integrated arts approach, Teacher F stated that timetabling can prevent some students from participating in subjects they would like to take:

It would be good if you had kids who did two or three arts subjects and have the periods linked so they could cross into each area. You could then work collaboratively over those periods rather than picking up this subject here and then going there.

The participant indicated that in their school physical resources for the Arts were not a problem. Music was still developing but in the other areas, including dance, the resources were very good. Dance and theatre were seen as having a very strong profile in this school. Teacher F reported that their school was in the process of coordinating the visual and performing arts faculty which will include both theatre and dance.
When questioned about experience of integrated arts activities, Teacher F answered that even though the media area didn’t participate in fully integrated activities, graphics and media did work collaboratively on special projects. Teacher F reported that their school often received requests from Industry to produce videos so this allows both the visual arts and the media departments to work together.

If Teacher F was required to choose a strand around which to develop an integrated arts program, Teacher F supported the creating, making and presenting strand. In their school, use had been made of the design, make, appraise approach and this had been most successful.

At Teacher F’s school, visual art and media teachers formed a cooperative team which worked well together. Teacher F did not have much to say about the other arts areas other than to indicate that the profile of these other arts forms was being developed gradually within the school.

Teacher G (music) at the outset of the interview indicated that their school had recognised the importance of the arts and recently had gained the position of Arts Coordinator. When asked about Teacher G’s view of the combination of the five arts forms into one learning area - The Arts – Teacher G responded:

I don’t have any very strong or negative feelings about that. I think it’s fantastic that The Arts have got a guernsey - fullstop - as being an important area of study, and that in itself I think, raises the status of The Arts. I think any involvement with the arts for any child deals with their soul and that it’s the innermost creative side of them and everybody’s got skills and potential and can show it in whatever form. There would be people that would say media should stay with English, but I think it is a creative arts form and I think the more that technology impacts on society it affects us. I haven’t got any strong feelings.
Teacher G indicated however that “the combination (of the arts forms) will affect school’s abilities to be able to cater for all of the subjects.”

There’s no way that in any timetabling system that kids will have exposure to all of those areas - especially in the primary area - and within the secondary there will have to be some specialisation which the students will have to choose on an experiential basis - with what they’ve had experience in. Primary schools will be able to go through the higher level, but in media and dance where there is not that much around in those areas, that’s going to be difficult.

When asked how the combination would affect their school, Teacher G replied:

Well I can’t speak on behalf of the whole school because we work very collaboratively here through a curriculum council, but for example, media is still linked with English and dance is still linked with physical education. Art work on their own and drama and music work under the umbrella of performing arts - but the kids are still given a chance to choose and I’m sure that whatever the guidelines, the system (eventually) works out. The kids have to be able to get a certain level or have experience in a certain number of units; whichever way we are going to package it. But it will always come down to a choice and I guess it will become - hopefully not a “bun fight” situation - we will have to advertise and advocate for our area. It don’t think it’s necessarily going to be a hassle for us to compete with each other in our Arts form because our kids should have exposure to lots of different things.

When asked about an understanding of integrated arts, Teacher G suggested that it is probably what has been used in a number of schools where they are giving exposure to the students in each of the arts forms.

I haven’t had a chance to see the work or see how - I’ve only heard them talk about it - I don’t think that’s the way I would want to go
personally, because I think that you need to maintain the rigour and the integrity of each subject. It's only going to be a scratch on the surface of each of the arts forms if that's how you do it. Now if that's all a school can offer, by all means that's great and the kids have exposure to each of those areas. I would imagine that it would work quite well with lots of facilities but in a lot of schools there aren't enough facilities in each of the arts areas and it's not really ideal.

When probed further, Teacher G revealed that they are actually working on a collaborative program which was incorporating the music, drama and visual arts students with some participation from the dance department.

Our art department is taking care of the posters and we have a dance element in with the music - our dance teachers - our physical education teachers are happy to put their hand up to help with that, but a lot of that will be student generated anyway - the choreography - and I am sure the media department will get onto it in some way. In a sense our school has had quite an important role in integrating the arts forms in a big project like that, but there are other times when the subjects are integrated as well - for example - next term, our drama teacher and our media teacher are collaborating with two classes that are run at the same time next term. That's integration in the true sense, because it's not just scratching the surface - it's actually making something very practical and very relevant to each subject rather than just coming up with notional things at a superficial level.

When questioned about how an integrated arts approach would compare to a single subject approach, Teacher G answered enthusiastically about the idea:

If you've got an arts faculty where everybody's on the same agenda and you've got a superb working relationship between teachers, and unlimited resources, I think it's extremely exciting - especially if you've got a lot of time for good planning, and I know that a lot of people can work under quite difficult situations and work fantastically together - and if the possibility's there and people go for it - I think it's fantastic - I think it's extremely exciting to have integration and collaboration between the staff and enjoy the fruits of the group work and that sort of thing - it's fantastic.
Teacher G saw the potential benefits of an integrated arts approach in that teachers develop an appreciation of each other’s arts form and the disciplines involved in each subject. Teacher G indicated however that the “downside” of it all was deciding into what depth you would go.

And you think, what is going to be the end point - where are we going to take these kids? Are we going to try and get them through to pre-tertiary level? Have the integration by all means, but it is important - at least with some of your kids - not necessarily all - to be able to have that level of specialisation within their chosen field.

When asked about physical resources in their school to cater for the arts, Teacher G indicated that drama was well catered for with a beautiful studio, music is “so-so” with practice rooms and one classroom, art has a good area;

But the area that is not catered for here is dance. We have physical education teachers teaching dance but they usually have to go down to the local hall to do it or get into the gym. This building here has a totally concrete floor and that’s not conducive for physical movement. It would be great if we could have another studio of some description built with a suitable floor for dance that is of sufficient size where you can have a big group of kids working in the arts. But it is all spread around the school at the moment. It is not within one physical facility. If the arts were to be integrated, resourcing would be a problem - how would individual schools solve that? It would be interesting to observe.

When asked how the proposed strands of The Arts could be used to facilitate an integrated arts approach, Teacher G indicated that creating, making and presenting would be the most applicable “because it keeps the students involved in practical work and in developing the skills and using the skills”.
Teacher G is a very experienced music teacher who is involved with integrating arts programs across the arts forms at a production level. The drama and media teachers in the department are making an attempt to cross arts forms boundaries and it would be interesting to follow up this initiative to assess the benefits of an integrated arts approach.

Teacher H, when asked for personal views on the National Curriculum's combination of the five arts forms into one learning area, The Arts, replied:

I think it does make sense because I think we should have as much as possible, an integrated approach in the teaching of those areas because there are so many ways in which areas overlap and we have so many common themes and threads running through all the separate areas - so yes there is a lot of work you can do in combination. I think for the kids overall it gives them a broader perspective of what the arts really mean. Just because you play an instrument or paint a picture, that’s not just where you start or where you should focus all your energies. That’s what we try to do with all our kids, is to give them a broad arts education.

When asked how Teacher H thought it would affect the Western Australian situation, Teacher H advised:

We are going to have to change, there’s no doubt about that - so I think like it or not, we are going to have to go down this road. There are some teachers who will adapt to it really well and there are some who will go down kicking and screaming. Teacher H expressed an understanding of the term integrated arts by stating that it occurs when a faculty takes a decision that none of the arts are going to be taught in isolation.
As I said, there are themes and things common to all the arts areas that overlap and we should be trying to work together in those areas as much as possible so that the kids do get an understanding that the arts aren’t just a set of things that they do in isolation, but that they do work together.

Teacher H indicated that an integrated approach does mean more work for the people who are doing it, when compared to single subject teaching because the planning and preparation is more involved. Teacher H explained that in 1997 they are planning a special program for their year eight students.

At the moment the kids actually spend a certain amount of time in dance, visual arts, drama and with the end result being a major performance at the end of the year. Music, for various reasons has been separate from the other arts, but next year we are going to push to integrate music as well. The kids will get a better understanding of how the arts areas do integrate just using a theme idea when they see it occurring through the work we do. As opposed to single strands sort of stuff, music, drama, separate, I think it’s much easier to teach like that but the kids don’t get anywhere near as much out of it.

Teacher H saw the benefits of an integrated arts approach for students as they would get much more out of it. Teachers would also experience other forms with which they were unfamiliar. The disadvantages included: “you could really get caught up in integrated activities and your own area might suffer, especially if you were not covering your course adequately”.

When asked which strand would best facilitate an integrated arts approach, Teacher H indicated that creating, making and presenting would be the first choice. Teacher H believed however that criticism, aesthetics and past and present contexts would be emphasised during the activity.
Overall Teacher H’s response to the changes were positive indicating the value of an integrated arts approach, particularly at a year eight level. However Teacher H saw the need for specialisation in an arts form so that individual skills could be developed.

Teacher I (visual art) indicated support of the National Curriculum’s combination of the five arts forms into one learning area - The Arts. Teacher I said that it worked well in their school, however:

We haven’t got the whole five; we’ve only got drama, music and visual arts. We are hoping to get media next year. The reason why we haven’t yet is not because they don’t want to come, it’s because they don’t teach lower school - it’s only in the upper school and it’s incorporated in the English area for lower school. So there is a reason there, but drama has moved over and music has come as well. We’ve got a very good team going.

When asked how the combination might affect the Western Australian situation, Teacher I responded:

It depends on the school and it depends on people’s attitudes and outlook as far as it will go. I’ve met a lot of teachers, especially the older sort, where they feel very threatened by it because they feel their jobs will go. Also they’ve got a commitment with numbers, ... media hasn’t got numbers in lower school because it’s incorporated with English. In timetabling somebody’s going to lose and this is what it is; it’s grabbing time on the timetable.

When asked about an understanding of the term integrated arts, Teacher I reported that in their school they are already undertaking an integrated arts program
with year eight students. Music, drama, and visual arts teachers chose the same theme to teach and they were working towards a lunch-time performance where invitations would be issued to the outside community as well as the school community. Teacher I also mentioned that it was their intention next term to work across the curriculum, including other areas such as social studies and Asian studies.

When comparing an integrated arts approach to single subject teaching, Teacher I explained that with an integrated approach all the arts forms were receiving attention, even visual arts which traditionally has a lower profile in this area. However a display of visual arts was to be incorporated into the performance and this was showing a real effort to integrate all areas.

When asked about the benefits or disadvantages of an integrated arts approach, Teacher I responded:

We are benefiting quite nicely here. I think if you have a good team of people who want to work together - they’re young - the music teacher and the drama teacher are both young and very enthusiastic and they want to do that - whereas I think if you have people who are pulling at each other and a power struggle is going on, I think then it would fall on its face, because they would be out there - at each other’s throat in wanting to get into the limelight - and feel threatened too that somebody else is going to take over. We don’t feel threatened at this point in time. Whereas a lot of other schools - I’ve spoken to a few where they may lose their numbers as well and I suppose that there has to be a nice friendly rivalry for getting your numbers and keeping your numbers too. You can still do your P.R. work which you have to do in the classroom about promoting your class and your art - and at the same time the music and drama people have to do their P.R. and work themselves as well. But it can be a very friendly rivalry to keep your numbers up. And I can’t see why we can’t steal every student from every other option area into our three!
When asked if their school has sufficient physical resources to accommodate all the arts forms, Teacher I indicated that all areas are well catered for (drama, music and visual arts).

Teacher I explained that for the integrated arts activity that was being run across the arts forms, they used criticism and aesthetics as the strand to develop. The theme was Aboriginal Art which became the basis for the performance. Once this strand was in place, then the students went through all the areas of creating, making and presenting, using their skills and techniques to bring together their final performances.

First of all we had to decide which area we would look at and we thought the Northern Territory Aborigines in Arnhem Land would be good. We decided on the theme of “Dreamtime” and the kids explored those things. One teacher took them for dots and dash type paintings and explained what the different dots and dashes meant and things like that. Our music teacher did a very similar thing, making sounds on the keyboard with his kids and he worked out songs and researched into what the songs and dreamtime was about and how to put this into words and understand the words they were singing and this was done through past and present contexts.

According to Teacher I, the integrated arts program in this school has done much to stimulate student interest in the arts areas.

Teacher J is an experienced visual arts teacher who has a very strong commitment to the development of other arts forms. When asked about personal views on the National Curriculum’s combination of the five arts forms into one
learning area - The Arts, the response was: "I think it has merit because you can support each other and the students have a broader choice."

Teacher J reported that in their school, visual and performing arts is receiving high priority and now with a new performing arts building, they are able to offer a top course with all the facilities. Music was also being upgraded. The arts teachers work on “big” projects which they stage in community halls with the art department doing the sets. Teacher J explained that the productions are successful because everyone in the arts department gets on well: "We are all friends, we’ve known each other for a long time and we know how to support each other."

When asked for interpretation of integrated arts, Teacher J explained:

Well I always assumed that you work on common projects - perhaps not all the time - but a lot of the time - you share common facilities - you’ve got computers - in our place in this school, manual arts has been included in our group so they’ll have to realise that we need access to the computers - so even though they’re on the other side of the building here, they’re actually pinching a couple of what was music offices and they are going to have that set up with computers. I would argue that with the integration, we should have access to the computers and be able to work them into our program.

Teacher J was indicating some of the problems with resource sharing that can occur. Teacher J then went on to explain some of the difficulties with the setting up of department heads, indicating that in their school it was likely to be a manual arts teacher as head of The Arts: "That’s the only grey area I see - one person in charge or head of areas they don’t even know about! It’s not gonna work!"

Teacher J believed that an integrated arts approach would have the positive benefit of offering students greater choice. Teacher J indicated that it would also
make one aware of other staff “because if you work with teachers in other areas, it makes you more aware of what they do”.

I tell my students that art is everywhere - it’s the clothes you wear, the furniture you sit on, the books you read, and so this helps within the confines of the school. It helps them to understand where it can go as far as the TAFE pathways - There are some big areas which push TAFE pathways as most of our students go to TAFE so we can make them aware of the subjects they need for course entry. You can look at getting the kids to combine the arts by saying - hey, you take media, you take art and drama and you can get into any one of these areas at TAFE.

However, Teacher J stated that timetabling was a problem in any school, often preventing collaborative efforts. Teacher J reported that their team came up with some wonderful ideas which could not be put into practice because of timetabling constraints. However when asked about physical resources, Teacher J explained that the facilities at their school were very good. The upgrade that was taking place included the provision of a new performing arts building in close proximity to visual arts. The local community and the school had chosen this option.

The researcher queried the place of dance in the school and Teacher J replied that dance still operated under the physical education department however the dance teacher’s support mostly comes from the manual arts department.

Teacher J was very definite in the choice of the strands to use in implementation of an integrated arts approach, advising that creating, making and presenting was the best vehicle because:

If you do too much research and too much theory, you lose the kids. You only have limited time and the aesthetic and critical understandings can be taught in the context of creating, making and presenting.
Teacher J's enthusiasm for an integrated arts approach was obvious to the researcher and it was clear that Teacher J had many years of experience in this regard. Their arts initiatives had crossed the arts forms with many successful productions resulting.

Summary

In this chapter the information obtained from the interviews with ten arts teachers has been presented in the form of selected quotations which adequately represent the teachers' perceptions. In the next chapter the aim is to describe and develop the main items which emerged from the interviews and to compare the responses across arts forms (data reduction).
Chapter 6

Presentation of Data: Stage 2

The following tables, showing arts teachers' perceptions of each of the five research questions, have been included so that the reduced data can be displayed clearly. In all cases the information has been derived from the "rich" language of the interviewees, taken directly from the transcribed interviews. The tables present information which may be used for qualitative comparisons. At the end of each table there will be a brief commentary which captures the essence of what has been presented. Each research question is represented.

- Table 2. - Question 1 - What are your views on the National Curriculum's combination of the five arts forms into one learning area - The Arts?
- Table 3. - Question 2 - What is your understanding of the term Integrated Arts?
- Table 4. - Question 3 - How does an Integrated Arts approach compare to single subject teaching?
- Table 5. - Question 4 - What are the potential benefits and/or disadvantages of an Integrated Arts approach?
- Table 6. - Question 5 - Which of the current strands would you use to facilitate an Integrated Arts approach?
Table 2. Arts Teacher's Perceptions of the Arts Learning Area

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Perceptions of Positive Features</th>
<th>Dance</th>
<th>Drama</th>
<th>Media</th>
<th>Music</th>
<th>Visual Art</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The Arts - A united front</td>
<td>•</td>
<td>•</td>
<td>•</td>
<td>•</td>
<td>•</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Enhanced status</td>
<td>•</td>
<td>•</td>
<td>•</td>
<td>•</td>
<td>•</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Arts - An up to date notion</td>
<td>•</td>
<td>•</td>
<td>•</td>
<td>•</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>New Outcomes based approach leads to accountability</td>
<td>•</td>
<td>•</td>
<td>•</td>
<td>•</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>All students must participate in at least one Arts form</td>
<td>•</td>
<td>•</td>
<td>•</td>
<td>•</td>
<td>•</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Resources can be shared</td>
<td>•</td>
<td>•</td>
<td></td>
<td>•</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>More choice of arts subjects</td>
<td>•</td>
<td>•</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Perceptions of Negative Features</th>
<th>Dance</th>
<th>Drama</th>
<th>Media</th>
<th>Music</th>
<th>Visual Art</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>More training will be required</td>
<td>•</td>
<td>•</td>
<td>•</td>
<td>•</td>
<td>•</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Weak Arts - dance, drama &amp; media</td>
<td>•</td>
<td>•</td>
<td>•</td>
<td>•</td>
<td>•</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Geographical isolation</td>
<td>•</td>
<td>•</td>
<td></td>
<td>•</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Personal conflicts</td>
<td>•</td>
<td>•</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>•</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Departmental location of media &amp; dance</td>
<td>•</td>
<td>•</td>
<td>•</td>
<td>•</td>
<td>•</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Loss of jobs</td>
<td>•</td>
<td>•</td>
<td>•</td>
<td>•</td>
<td>•</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lack of resources</td>
<td>•</td>
<td>•</td>
<td>•</td>
<td>•</td>
<td>•</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Analysis of Data - Table 2.

Question 1 - What are your views on the National Curriculum's combination of the five arts forms into one learning area - The Arts?
Teachers' positive responses to impending change were verified by the fact that all teachers recognised that it was an important move to create an Arts faculty. It was seen as providing a good support for all arts teachers. Resources could be shared more effectively. Media teachers believed that their subject would have more status if attached to the Arts faculty. One teacher agreed that dance had improved, along with physical resources, once they had joined the Arts faculty. Three teachers, music, drama and visual arts, all agreed that now they would need to put more effort into criticism and aesthetics and they saw this as a positive move, considering it a neglected area, especially in lower secondary. Several teachers acknowledged that integrating the arts gives students a broader perspective of what the arts mean and also a wider choice in elective offerings. One music teacher indicated that there are many overlapping themes and threads that run through the separate areas and combining the arts under one faculty or learning area should help students recognise the connections. The overall feeling of most teachers was that it raises the status of The Arts when all faculties come together as a recognised learning area. As one teacher said, "Arts should not be at the bottom of the curriculum list - 'A' is for Arts!"

On the other hand, the negative attitudes raised in response to Question 1 were related to geographical isolation of arts areas, teachers having to "sell" their area to keep it viable, more in-service and training would be required and timetabling may prevent some students for opting for all the arts areas in which they would wish to participate. However the largest issue that was forthcoming was related to individual arts teachers, particularly dance and media, wanting to stay with physical education and English departments. These were the perceptions of the teachers interviewed as
they gave examples of what was happening in their own schools where dance and media were "opting out" from joining the Arts faculties. One teacher of drama indicated that drama, media and dance are the weakest of the five forms and that they may miss out in the spread or range of timetabling. Several teachers raised concerns for primary school teachers indicating that they would require much more in-servicing to run an "integrated arts" program which they saw as being more relevant at the primary school level. One teacher of music saw the outcomes based assessment as a little unrealistic in the areas of aesthetics and criticism and believed it is difficult for students to understand these concepts. Several teachers indicated that teachers are afraid of change and will need support to help them realise that they are not taking on a huge amount of extra work. One teacher indicated that teachers' personalities or egos in a combined faculty could cause problems, especially if the head of department does not know the other areas well. Other teachers also indicated that there could be power struggles as a result of a combined faculty structure.
Table 3. Arts Teachers' Understanding of the Term Integrated Arts

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>TEACHERS</th>
<th>Dance</th>
<th>Drama</th>
<th>Media</th>
<th>Music</th>
<th>Visual Art</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A faculty of Integrated Arts</td>
<td>•</td>
<td>•</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>•</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Common teaching approaches</td>
<td>•</td>
<td>•</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>•</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Working collaboratively on a performance with more than one Arts form participating</td>
<td>•</td>
<td>•</td>
<td>•</td>
<td>•</td>
<td>•</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Team Teaching</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>•</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Exposure to each of the Arts forms</td>
<td></td>
<td>•</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Integrating the Arts across the curriculum with other disciplines</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>•</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sharing common facilities</td>
<td>•</td>
<td></td>
<td>•</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>More relevant to primary school and lower secondary</td>
<td>•</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Analysis of Data - Table 3.

Question 2 - What is your understanding of the term Integrated Arts?

From a holistic viewpoint, most arts teachers saw integrated arts as forming a faculty of arts or a combination of the five arts forms into one learning area. They saw it also as working across boundaries on performances and participating in common teaching approaches. This could mean using the same theme with each arts form teaching the theme from its own perspective, or it could mean team teaching. Most of the teachers interpreted integrated arts as working on collaborative projects. One teacher showed concern for primary school teachers indicating that one teacher needs
to be able to teach across the forms whereas in secondary areas more collaborative teaching should occur. Teacher H (music) saw integrated arts as an indicator that none of the arts would be taught in isolation. Teacher H maintained that cooperative teaching gives students a broader understanding of the arts. Teacher I was the only one who indicated that integrated arts could mean crossing the curriculum into other learning areas, although Teacher E indicated that in their school other areas wanted to support the thematic approach.

From a personal point of view, teachers agreed that it was a very practical way of working on school performances. Integration would help resourcing problems through the sharing of facilities and equipment and it was also thought that students see the connections when a common journal is used for all the activities across the arts forms.

On the issue of skills development and the relationship between work within specific arts forms, Teacher C (drama), indicated that skills needed to be specific to an arts form. Teacher G (music), insisted that the rigour and integrity of each subject must be maintained. Teacher F (media), noted that most students who take one arts form, tend to take another and therefore integration of the arts helps them to make relevant links in their understanding of the arts in general. However Teacher D (drama), felt that if the individual arts do not maintain their independence, there would be a feeling of loss. Teachers C and E who had experienced integration through team teaching large groups of students, questioned the benefits of such a large scale effort and wondered how much learning of specific skills had occurred. Another factor
raised by Teacher J was that in order for an integrated approach to work, staff need to be on friendly terms with each other and share common goals.

Table 4. Arts Teachers' Perceptions of the Relative Benefits and Disadvantages of Integrated Arts When Compared with Single Subject Approaches

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>TEACHERS</th>
<th>Dance A</th>
<th>Drama B</th>
<th>Media C</th>
<th>Music D</th>
<th>Visual Art E</th>
<th>F</th>
<th>G</th>
<th>H</th>
<th>I</th>
<th>J</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>BENEFITS</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Promotes a deeper understanding of The Arts</td>
<td>✗</td>
<td>✗</td>
<td>✗</td>
<td>✗</td>
<td>✗</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Promotes excitement and motivation for students and teachers</td>
<td>✗</td>
<td>✗</td>
<td>✗</td>
<td>✗</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Promotes a stronger bonding for Arts teachers as they have more in common</td>
<td>✗</td>
<td>✗</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>✗</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Students experience a wider range of Arts</td>
<td>✗</td>
<td>✗</td>
<td>✗</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>It reflects what is happening in the rest of the World</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teachers are less isolated and experience more support</td>
<td>✗</td>
<td>✗</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>DISADVANTAGES</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Timetabling is more complex</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Integration is better at a primary and lower secondary school level</td>
<td>✗</td>
<td>✗</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lack of resources can prevent integration</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Personalities can be a problem</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Some teachers don't like to collaborate</td>
<td>✗</td>
<td>✗</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Arts forms need to specialise, otherwise a watered-down approach will occur</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Physical isolation can prevent integration</td>
<td>✗</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Planning requires more time</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Loss of identity could occur with integrated arts</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Question 3 - How does an integrated arts approach compare to single subject teaching?

Teachers identified some positive features of integrated arts approaches when comparing integrated arts to single subject teaching approaches. The main ideas which surfaced from this question included; (i) it is more exciting for both teachers and students to be involved in integrated arts projects; (ii) teachers are not as isolated, and (iii) students have more opportunity to see other arts forms in action and participate in the programs. Teacher H believed that there are many themes and common ideas which overlap in the arts and students have a better understanding of how the arts work together. Teacher A explained that arts experiences should be integrated in primary school and when students go to high school, they should then specialise in one arts area. Teacher C (drama), indicated that there are some opportunities for integration at a lower secondary level. Teacher D, drama, indicated that teachers would be less isolated, within a faculty of arts giving them more opportunity to work together and receive support from teachers with similar interests. Teacher I (visual arts), believed that integration would give more focus to some arts forms which in the past have held a lower profile.

The negative issues which were raised included; (i) physical isolation, (ii) lack of specialisation resulting in a watered-down approach, and (iii) a fear that some teachers would not wish to participate. The inflexibility of timetabling was also seen
to be a problem for integration of the arts. Teacher C (drama), considered that arts teachers' personalities could be a problem because some people prefer to work in isolation although it would depend on individual teachers and the school ethos. Teacher B (dance), stated that it would be good for the arts to integrate but personally would not want to lose a physical education identity. Teacher H (music), explained that it does mean more work for the teachers involved in this type of approach because more planning and preparation is required. Teacher I, indicated that it would be feasible for lower school but questioned the suitability of integration at a TEE level. Most teachers agreed that what is needed is a good working relationship with other teachers and an arts faculty where every arts form has a place.
Table 5. Arts Teachers' Perceptions of the Potential Benefits and Disadvantages of an Integrated Arts approach

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>TEACHERS</th>
<th>Dance</th>
<th>Drama</th>
<th>Media</th>
<th>Music</th>
<th>Visual Art</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>E</td>
<td>F</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>I</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>J</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**BENEFITS**
- Better understanding of all Arts forms
- Support for each other
- Working together is motivational and exciting
- Resource sharing

**DISADVANTAGES**
- Preparation takes more time
- Timetabling can prevent collaboration
- Loss of identity could occur
- Some people don't wish to participate
- Skills need to be specific to your Arts form
- Power struggles and clashing personalities
- Dance and media have not joined the Arts faculty
- Specialisation needs to occur at some level

Analysis of Data - Table 5.

Question 4 - What are the potential benefits and/or disadvantages of an Integrated Arts approach?
As this question was similar in nature to Question 3, it was a way of checking consistency in the findings as the benefits and disadvantages which were seen to exist in an integrated arts approach were similar to the issues raised when comparing an integrated approach to single subject teaching.

Most teachers indicated that resource sharing and support for each other was a positive benefit of an integrated arts approach. Some teachers said that an integrated arts approach would allow students to experience multi-arts or work across arts forms towards a better understanding of The Arts. Integration was seen to benefit both teachers and students in that it builds support, engenders creativity and it helps teachers to appreciate other arts forms.

The negative issues which were raised were also similar to those raised in Question 3. To some extent, timetabling was seen to prevent collaboration although most teachers indicated that it was more possible at a lower school level. Teacher B (dance), once again stressed that the physical education identity might become lost by becoming part of an arts faculty. Several teachers stated that dance or media had not wished to join the arts faculty. Teacher C (drama), believed that skills needed to be specific to an arts form. Both music teachers indicated that integration has benefits, however specific skills still need to be taught and at some stage, students need to specialise so that they can develop these skills. As mentioned previously, some teachers indicated that collaboration can only work if all agree, and that due to power struggles, agreement is not always possible. Another factor which also arose in Question 3 and 4 as a disadvantage of an integrated arts approach, was the amount of preparation and organisation that would need to go into the programming of such an
enterprise. When discussing integration across the curriculum, Teacher F (media), posited that some teachers of traditional subjects such as maths and the sciences do not wish to participate in collaborative activities as they wish to protect their own areas. Resource sharing, for some teachers, was also seen to be a disadvantage as most arts areas indicated previously that they are still in need of facilities for their own areas.

### Table 6. Art Teachers' Perceptions of the Strand/s which would Facilitate an Integrated Arts Approach

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>TEACHER</th>
<th>Strand/s</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A DANCE</td>
<td>Arts criticism and aesthetics</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B DANCE</td>
<td>Creating, making and presenting</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C DRAMA</td>
<td>Creating, making and presenting</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D DRAMA</td>
<td>Creating, making and presenting</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E MEDIA</td>
<td>Creating, making and presenting &amp; Past and present contexts</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>F MEDIA</td>
<td>Design, make, appraise – Create, make, present</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>G MUSIC</td>
<td>Creating, making and presenting</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>H MUSIC</td>
<td>Creating, making and presenting</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I VISUAL ART</td>
<td>Criticism and aesthetics &amp; Past and present contexts</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>J VISUAL ART</td>
<td>Creating, making and presenting</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Question 5 - Which of the current strands would you use to facilitate an Integrated Arts approach?

The popular choice was obviously creating making and presenting as the strand with which most teachers would feel at ease. Most acknowledged that they would need to spend more time developing arts criticism and aesthetics and past and present contexts.

Those teachers who were already working on collaborative projects or integration of arts forms seemed to be willing to experiment with the other strands. Teacher A (dance), explained that because their school is participating in the Stepping Out program, it seems a natural course to follow because students frequently express how they feel and what they think about arts performance. Teacher E (media), explained a preference for past and present contexts because their students were involved in an integrated project with the topic of Rock and Roll as the theme to be explored and that past and present contexts was the best vehicle for this development. Teacher E stated that creating, making and presenting were important also, especially for media teachers who were used to the design, make and appraise approach. Teacher I (visual arts), was using the strands of arts criticism and aesthetics and past and present contexts in an integrated arts activity relating to the theme of Aboriginal Art. The year eight classes were involved in a workshop which included drama, music and visual arts. The school and local communities were invited to the lunch-time
performances which were to be held over a period of three days. Teacher I was eager to share the details of the program and advised that they were fortunate because each of the teachers was young, enthusiastic and worked well with other teachers. This was the key feature of the program design. Teacher I reported that at this point dance was still located with the physical education department, however they were hoping that dance would join the arts faculty in the near future. The Arts teachers were already planning their activity for the next term which will cover the topic of Asia.

Conclusion

In this chapter it was confirmed by teachers' positive responses to the National Curriculum changes, that it was an important move to create an Arts faculty because it was seen as providing good support for Arts teachers. However, geographical isolation often prevented this from being effective.

An issue which presented clearly in the presentation of teachers' views was that of media and dance forms wishing to remain in English and physical education departments. Some teachers were concerned about power struggles which could occur as the result of a combined faculty.

Most teachers interpreted integrated arts as forming an Arts faculty, or as working together on a performance or collaborative project. They saw integrated arts approaches as exciting for teachers and students alike and it was felt that Arts teachers were less isolated; whilst students had the opportunity to see other Arts forms in action.
There was a fear of the possibility of a "watered-down" approach due to lack of specialisation in any one Arts form. A good working relationship amongst participating teachers was seen to be an important feature for a successful integrated arts approach.
CHAPTER 7
Findings and Recommendations

Explanation and Interpretation of Data

Change

Most of the arts teacher involved in the study had been exposed to change as far as their arts area was concerned. They were aware of outcomes based assessment, having been involved in the trialling at some time, or were already using an outcomes-based approach through subjects such as Art and Design. The only teacher with little experience and knowledge of the new frameworks was Teacher B (dance). Teacher B had heard of some shift towards the combination of the arts forms but did not know much about it.

All teachers were positive about the move by the National Curriculum towards one learning area, The Arts. Such a move was seen as long overdue recognition of the arts. Other perceived benefits included the building of strength and support, and the overcoming of isolation that in the past, characterised the arts in schools. The participants agreed that it makes teachers more accountable for what they are teaching and gives students a broader choice.

The finding that the arts teachers were positive about the changes that were taking place may be due to the fact that they all occupied leadership positions within their arts form. Whether this willingness to embrace change is shared by teachers not involved in the decision-making process is yet to be determined.
Affect

The Arts teachers did have some reservations about The Arts as a whole and were clearly concerned with the fact that many arts faculties are fragmented because of geographic location within the school. Two schools were overcoming this problem by redesigning and relocating of the arts faculties. Most teachers showed concern that dance and media were still outside of the arts faculty within their schools. Teacher C (drama), indicated that by combining the arts the weaker subjects such as drama, media and dance were likely to miss out. However Teacher E (media), indicated that it would more likely be music and visual arts who would lose ground in the restructuring in schools. Teacher E believed that the combination of The Arts gave focus to the other forms that had previously held a lower profile. Two teachers, dance and visual arts, felt that it might be necessary to “sell” the area more aggressively or become strong advocates for individual arts forms. Teacher B (dance), stressed that with the change, there may be a loss of physical education identity. Teacher H felt that some teachers will not adapt readily to change and that they will “go down the path kicking and screaming”. Generally, however, the teachers who were a part of this study were all positive to the idea of combination of the five arts forms and could see positive benefits from such a merger.

Training

Most arts teachers agreed that in-service and training would be required to ensure that change occurs smoothly. One or two participants gave the case of the introduction of Unit Curriculum and felt that it had happened too quickly. However
most agreed, that the impending changes are not really going to alter what teachers are already doing, other than to make them more aware of some areas of teaching which have been neglected in the past. The neglected areas were identified as criticism and aesthetics and past and present contexts.

It was found that there did seem to be concern for primary specialists. Teacher A (dance), believed that in primary school, students should have an integrated arts experience. Teacher A indicated that most primary school teachers are already doing this, but they will need in-servicing to show them where everything fits.

Resources

Five of the ten teachers indicated that teachers will need resources, back-up and training if the changes are to occur. As indicated under the heading Affect, two schools were making an effort to improve the physical location of the arts areas and these appeared to be schools with a strong arts emphasis. Teacher D (drama), in the interview indicated that drama is located within the English department and art is at the other end of the school. Teacher D does work with the other arts forms, especially media, but finds collaboration difficult because of the physical and professional isolation. Teacher D also indicated that English teachers have “nothing in common with theatre and arts”. Teacher D was clearly frustrated with the setting in their school and would like to work with the art department believing that drama has much in common with art and media.

Both dance teachers indicated that the resources for dance were very poor. They were both working on concrete floors and this affects performance and even
causes injury to dancers, as indicated by teacher B in the interview. Teacher G (music), identified dance as being one arts form in their school which seemed to be missing out. Teacher G indicated that it is taught by the physical education department and they are using community facilities (a local hall). Teacher G believed that an extra performance area in their school, with a floor which could be used by dance teachers would greatly enhance their resources because all teachers could use the area. Teacher H (music), stated that in their school they are currently pushing to get another performing arts/dance area soon that would have a wooden floor.

Teacher J (visual art), reported that in their school they have opted for an upgrading of resources for the arts rather than going towards technology which a lot of other schools were doing. The parents and community had input into this choice.

The interviews have revealed that for the combination of arts forms to be effective, schools will need to look at the physical location of each of the arts areas. It makes sense to share resources and it seems that most of the arts forms are ready and willing to do this.

It was interesting to note that most teachers referred to physical resources, rather than program documents. One teacher mentioned that The Arts are far more advanced in outcomes based education than other areas.

Support

The participants in the study felt that the combination of five arts forms to form one learning area would have a positive affect because they would be provided with more support. Most teachers referred to this in the course of the interviews.
The perception that arts teachers were isolated in school communities was mentioned by teachers from schools with strong visual and performing arts faculties as well as by those teachers from schools where the arts have a lower profile. In low arts profile schools, art teachers were often attached to other departments such as: English, physical education and design and technology. All teachers stated that they would like to be a part of an arts faculty, however Teacher B (dance), mentioned that a reluctance to lose the physical education identity. Even so, Teacher B saw a combined faculty as being a positive move. Many of the teachers interviewed raised the issue of dance and media still belonging to other faculties.

The arts teachers in the study are ready for a combined faculty of arts as they believe it will give them more support and overcome the feeling of isolation. Teacher A (dance), indicated that dance didn’t even have a budget until they joined the arts faculty.

Theoretical Knowledge

The Student Outcome Statements were intended to establish a curriculum framework for the learning areas. Under The Arts Outcomes three inter-related strands were developed. These were Creating, Making and Presenting - Arts Criticism and Aesthetics - Past and Present Contexts. In the context of Unit Curriculum, it has always been understood that when teaching about the arts to students, the aesthetic, historical, and cultural contexts should be studied. However teachers who have been trialling the Outcome Statements have reported that having these understandings
identified as strands of learning has helped them to become more accountable. They found that they are now attending to these strands more effectively during the course of teaching. Teacher H (music), stated that “aesthetics is difficult for kids to grasp” and the Outcomes might be unrealistic in the areas of aesthetics and criticism “you can’t put an old head on young shoulders!” It is clear from the choices that teachers have made in Question 5, that Creating, Making and Presenting is an area that is regarded as easier to teach. Most teachers however acknowledged that they would need to pay more attention to the other strands.

Current Practice

Teachers who taught with a Creating, Making, Presenting focus felt that Aesthetics and Criticism and Past and Present Contexts were dealt with briefly in the programs they were teaching. However it was noted that teachers who were involved in a collaborative program or integrated arts program used a theme to focus on Aesthetics and Criticism and/or Past and Present Contexts. This suggests that experience of an integrated arts approach encourages teachers to seek a theoretical basis for action.

Adoption of Change

During the trialling phase of the Outcome Statements, the participants were more aware of all the strands and were adopting the curriculum changes quite readily. However, the area of concern was that where previously separate departments were
combining to form one Arts faculty, some heads of department were facing a loss of position.

Perceived Value of Integrated Arts

As indicated in Chapter 1. (pp 18-21) dealing with the definition of Integrated Arts and teachers’ perceptions, teachers must have some prior knowledge in the field in order to place a value on the idea of integration. This study revealed that most of the participants saw arts integration as working across a few arts forms and did not give consideration to the notion of the arts working across the curriculum. The participants had not participated in any program where the arts were integrated with, for example, the sciences or humanities.

Understanding of the term Integrated Arts

Most teachers saw integrated arts as a combined faculty (i.e. an organisational entity), or working collaboratively on a performance within the arts disciplines. They saw it as a chance to work together with other arts forms using a common theme to promote learning in a positive manner. They agreed that the arts should not be taught in isolation so that students could have the opportunity for a broader arts exposure and training. Teachers also referred to the sharing of resources and facilities. Only one teacher saw it as the opportunity to cross the curriculum into other learning areas such as Science, Studies of Environment and Society or Technology and Enterprise.
Another teacher indicated that some other departments had shown interest in the theme that the Arts faculty was planning for the next term.

Integrated Arts Compared to Single Subject Teaching

When comparing Integrated Arts to single subject teaching, most teachers reported that an integrated arts approach would give students a deeper understanding of The Arts. They believed that it promotes a bonding between arts teachers and prevents isolation. Teacher H (music), mentioned that there are common themes and ideas which overlap in The Arts and they should not be taught in isolation. Two teachers commented that it is more exciting and motivational for students and teachers to be involved with this type of program.

The negative aspects of integrated arts approaches were listed as being timetabling restrictions, fear of a watered-down approach, personality clashes, physical isolation and more time needed for planning.

Benefits and/or Disadvantages of an Integrated Arts Approach.

As the benefits and disadvantages of an Integrated Arts approach were found to be very similar to the findings in Question 3, the findings were confirmed. The most obvious benefits were; the support for each other (teachers) that comes from an integrated approach, students have more opportunity to experience other arts forms, and it’s more motivational and exciting for teachers and students. The disadvantages
were seen to be timetabling constraints which can prevent collaborative activities, some people are not willing participants, dance is still located within the physical education department and media is still with English in many schools. Some teachers were concerned that specific skills in individual arts areas might suffer.

From all indications it seemed that arts teachers saw the advantages of an Integrated Arts approach as being more beneficial to a lower secondary or primary school level where TEE students would not suffer. Some teachers were concerned that students would not develop all the skills that were necessary if the approach was watered-down. However they all agreed that unity and variety were the benefits of integration.
CHAPTER 8

Implications and Recommendations

Since this study was completed, the Education Department of Western Australia has issued *The Arts Report* which is a report of the Student Outcome Statements Trial 1994-1995.

Under the heading Implications of Implementation, the report stated:

The outcome statement documents structure facilitates an integrated curriculum through the representation of learning area ‘big ideas’ and the inclusion of process strands, some of which involve similar processes. (p. 75)

The report gave examples of secondary teachers who have made attempts to integrate cross-curriculum approaches. The triangulation of data collected in this research is supported by the fact that most of the findings link very strongly to the findings in *The Arts Report*.

The trial teachers demonstrated that integration can be modelled in a number of ways. It can consist of collaborative planning, integrated projects around a common theme or unit of work, and a totally integrated model based on the whole child’s needs and development. (p. 77)

The recommendation from *The Arts Report* on integration is that:

Models of effective integration across learning areas continue to be provided. (p. 77)

The implications for this study - Arts Teachers’ Perceptions of Integrated Arts - are that most teachers believe that the combination of the arts forms, which teachers consider to be integration, will build unity and strength for the Arts. Working across the arts forms on collaborative projects gives attention and focus to a theme that could
also cross the curriculum into other learning areas. As previously indicated, most of
the teachers in this study did not see integration as integrating The Arts across the
other seven learning areas; they saw it more as an integration of the arts forms. It is
hoped that examples or models of effective integration can be provided as indicated in
*The Arts Report*.

It was clear from this study that dance and media are still finding their way
along the road to The Arts. *The Arts Report* has also indicated (p. 107) that support
for these areas will be given priority and support packages (print and other) will be
made available to these teachers and schools. This study also identified the fact that
primary school teachers would need to be given support so that lower secondary
students will have an arts background. This has been considered in *The Arts Report*
and the recommendations have been made for two support packages which cover all
of The Arts in primary school. (p. 107)

Another issue which was identified in the course of this study was linked to the
fact that even though teachers of the arts saw integration as a positive way to go, they
were concerned that there is a need for specialisation in each of the arts forms. This
problem was also identified through *The Arts Report* which has recommended that as
well as integrated arts activities, that time be also allocated for specialisation at a
secondary level.

On the whole it would seem that integration of The Arts has value in that it is
backed by literature, teachers' statements in this study, and investigation by the
Education Department, evidenced in *The Arts Report*. 

133
Arts teachers' perceptions of integrated arts show that it brings unity and variety to an arts program and builds strength and support for The Arts in schools. However the recommendations which need to be made based on this study are that:

1. Where possible the physical location of the arts departments in schools should be considered during planning so that the areas are not isolated from each other. This will allow for more resource sharing.

2. That media and dance should as soon as possible adopt the changes recommended so that The Arts will not be fragmented.

3. That document support is given to all arts areas to show teachers how to design effective programs that will enhance learning and bring attention to The Arts in schools.

4. That document support be given to dance and media to show both areas how they can work effectively within an Arts framework.

5. That strong models of integrated arts activities be provided as resource back-up for teachers and schools.
Conclusion

When the researcher began this qualitative investigation, there was very little available literature on integrated arts practice apart from the major reports shown in this study. Much research in the field has focussed on integration at a primary school level, rather than secondary school level.

An Arts Accord (1995), document provided an account of a teacher’s successful integrated arts activities at a South West Senior High School. This school, whilst trialling the Outcome Statements decided to run an integrated arts program across the four arts learning areas of music, visual arts, media and drama. The teachers at the school believed that integration would consolidate the students’ learning of concepts and establish strong connections between the arts forms and allow more flexibility. A program was constructed which involved 48 Year 8 students. Students were required to cross over at least three arts areas with a focus on one. This culminated in an integrated performance at the end of the year. The Student Outcome Statements gave teachers the opportunity to consider what they were doing with a view to improving student learning. The extra benefits which came out of the program were, the collegiality that developed, the support given to each staff member and the enjoyment experienced.

The area that is not addressed as openly in literature is that of integration of the arts across the curriculum, not just The Arts. Vena (1992) commented with reference to the primary school context that:

Indeed if test scores are taken as valid measures, the arts have demonstrated that, when they are combined with other subjects, motivation, attitude, comprehension, and the visual perception of children improve. (p. 18)
Vena believed that the Arts can clearly inspire and energise a learning environment. He posited that The Arts should remain unique disciplines in their own right but reminded us that:

Through the arts, we live life holistically, and that in fact, our total curricula, can reflect this reality. By integrating the arts into other core subject matters, we are able to effect cognitive connectedness, involvement of the whole child and meaningful learning. (p. 23)

Arts teachers interviewed in this study have also indicated the value of an integrated arts experience, particularly in lower secondary and primary school levels. However, like most other researchers and writers in the field they agree that the integrity of each arts area must be maintained. Gardner (1992) would support the development of knowledge and skills in each child’s preferred artistic domain. As Gardner noted, most children are gifted or not in a particular domain.

Admur, (1993) when speaking of the role of art in education, sums up the argument of whether to integrate or not with these words:

Art study is enriched by the wealth of comparative material other subjects provide. This approach to integration relates materials in ways that are accessible to different learning styles. It elicits use of higher order thinking skills, and encourages cross-cultural and multi-cultural perspectives. For these reasons it would clearly enhance educational opportunities for secondary students. It may be implemented without abandoning the structure of separate subject areas or the wealth of expertise which specialised teachers bring to them. Rather integration may be accomplished, without radically altering the departmental and course structures in place in most secondary schools, by coordinating separate courses to parallel and mutually reinforce one another. (p. 19)
References


Core Curriculum for Australian Schools, June 1980, Canberra, Australia: Curriculum Development Centre.


National Statement on Education and The Arts, issued by N.A.A.E. (National Affiliation of Arts Educators)


The Arts- the National Profile, Final edited manuscript- June 1993, Carlton, Australia: Curriculum Corporation.


Appendix A - Letter to Principals

Dear Sir/Madam

I am conducting a research activity which will investigate the background to integrated arts activities and practice in Western Australian Schools.

My research thesis is entitled ‘Arts’ Teachers Perceptions of Integrated Arts’. It is my intention to research the views held by arts teachers about the proposed introduction of The Arts as a combined learning area, identified by the National Curriculum. My focus is on integrated arts as a learning approach in the secondary school.

I am seeking permission to conduct a scheduled interview with a dance (or other) teacher in your school. I have already approached (teacher’s name) to check (his/her) availability in this regard. The interview should take approximately 40 to 50 minutes. Confidentiality and anonymity of the participant and school will be guaranteed.

If your permission is granted for this interview, would you please complete and fax the attached note to me within the next few days. Please feel free to phone me for further information, if required.

Thanking you for your assistance in this regard.

Yours faithfully,

Jeanette Giroud (Mrs)

To: Jeanette Giroud
Fax: ____________

I, ____________ Principal of ______________ give permission for ______________ to participate in a scheduled interview, date to be decided. I understand that complete confidentiality and anonymity of both teacher and school will be guaranteed.

Signed: __________________________ Dated: ___________________
Appendix B - Statement of Disclosure and Informed Consent

This study aims to collect data for a Master of Education Thesis about arts teachers' perceptions of the concept of integrated arts as a curriculum approach. I am also trying to find out how arts teachers feel about the future of their subject at a time of rapid curriculum change. I will be seeking the views of Secondary Arts teachers who teach in Western Australian, Government schools.

I anticipate that an interview of no more than 60 minutes will be required. Transcriptions of the interviews will be available if desired and you will be invited to approve the first edited draft. You will not be obliged to read transcripts unless you choose to do so.

This study will provide much needed information on teachers' attitudes to integrated arts.

You can withdraw from the study at any time without prejudice and in this event, all data will be destroyed or returned to you.

Any questions concerning the project entitled:

Arts Teachers' Perceptions of Integrated Arts

can be directed to Jeanette Giroud (Principal Investigator) of 6 Leicester Square, Alexander Heights W A 6064 on: 342 8215 (Telephone)

I ______________(the participant) have read the information above and any questions I have asked have been answered to my satisfaction. I agree to participate in this activity, realising I may withdraw at any time.

I agree that the research data gathered for this study may be published provided I am not identifiable.

Participant ___________________________ Date __________

Investigator ___________________________ Date __________
Appendix C - Interview Schedule

(Relating to Arts Teachers’ Perceptions of Integrated Arts in Western Australian, Government Schools)

Sex: _______________ Number of years teaching: __________
Teaching Area: __________________________

- Is your school participating in the trialling of Outcome Statements?
- Have you participated in any workshops discussing the trialling of the Outcome Statements?
- What are your views on the National Curriculum’s combination of the five arts forms into one learning area - The Arts?

PROBE: How does this affect the Western Australian situation?
       How does this affect your school?
       How does this affect you as a teacher of an arts subject?
       Do you believe teachers will need more training/in-servicing?

- What is your understanding of the term Integrated Arts?

PROBE: Are you familiar with other similar approaches such as interdisciplinary/collaborative/combined/shared?

- How do you believe an Integrated Arts approach would compare to the standard type of single subject teaching?

PROBE: Does timetabling of Arts subjects prevent collaboration?
       Does your school have sufficient physical resources?
       Would your school support an Integrated Arts approach?
       Have you participated in Integrated Arts activities?

- How could the proposed Arts strands of (1) Creating, making and presenting, (2) Using arts language, (3) Arts criticism and aesthetics, and (4) Past and present contexts, be used to facilitate an Integrated Arts approach?

PROBE: Are there any areas/strands which would integrate more readily than others?

Appendix D - Letter to Participants
Dear __________________________

You will recall on (date) I visited your school to conduct a recorded interview in connection with my Thesis concerning 'Arts Teachers' Perceptions of Integrated Arts'.

I have now organised the data from the various interviews into a transcript for presentation as part of the study.

I would be pleased if you would review the information which I will be presenting which will remain anonymous. If you disagree with the statements contained therein, would you please clarify or alter them and return the outline to me so that I can make the necessary amendments.

If you do not return the report I will assume that the information is accurate. As I will be out of Australia over the next eight weeks, I would appreciate any corrected information to be forwarded to the above address.

I wish to thank you once again for your participation in this study and in due course my Thesis will be available for perusal.

Yours sincerely,

Jeanette Giroud (Mrs)