1993

**Women in leadership program 1993: National conference: Women's voices: Challenging for the future**

Pauline Carroll (Ed.)
You may print or download ONE copy of this document for the purpose of your own research or study.

The University does not authorize you to copy, communicate or otherwise make available electronically to any other person any copyright material contained on this site.

You are reminded of the following:

- Copyright owners are entitled to take legal action against persons who infringe their copyright.

- A reproduction of material that is protected by copyright may be a copyright infringement. Where the reproduction of such material is done without attribution of authorship, with false attribution of authorship or the authorship is treated in a derogatory manner, this may be a breach of the author’s moral rights contained in Part IX of the Copyright Act 1968 (Cth).

- Courts have the power to impose a wide range of civil and criminal sanctions for infringement of copyright, infringement of moral rights and other offences under the Copyright Act 1968 (Cth). Higher penalties may apply, and higher damages may be awarded, for offences and infringements involving the conversion of material into digital or electronic form.
OMEN IN LEADERSHIP PROGRAM 1993

NATIONAL CONFERENCE 1993

Challenging for the Future
National Conference
Women in Leadership Program 1993

Women’s Voices:
Challenging For The Future

Contributions Editor: Pauline Carroll

Edith Cowan University
Library

Edith Cowan University
INTRODUCTION

   Keynote Address
   Dr Patricia Brennan

11. Identity and Diversity: Lessons for Leadership
    Keynote Address
    Mara West

    Keynote Address
    Dr Patti Lather

25. The Wise Project: Encouraging Young Women to Study Engineering and the Physical Sciences
    Anne-Marie Anderson

31. The Agony and the Ecstasy: Forming a Professional Women’s Group
    Meredith Arcus

35. Women’s Educational Leadership in New ‘Hard’ Times
    Jill Blackmore

49. Organisations of the Future: Women as Change Agents
    Dr Wendy Cahill

55. Women and Award Restructuring in Universities
    Jan Currie

69. Experiences in Developing Women in Management
    Birgit Dell’Antonio

75. Transforming an Organisation
    Sue Dixon

79. Is National Service More Important than Community Service?
    Roman Edward-Moon

87. How Wise is Your Vision?
    Fleur Fallon

91. Being Taken Seriously: Women’s Voices
    Rachel Green

93. Using Charisma to Enhance Your Personal Communication and Leadership Style
    Christine Hogan

101. Poppy
    Lekkie Hopkins

105. Working in a Remote Aboriginal Community
    Jane E Lawton

109. Negotiating Your Wages at the Workplace: Potential and Reality for Women
    Susan Lewis and Helen Thomas

125. Women and Corporate Leadership:
    The Transformers or the Transformed
    Dr Susan Long

133. EEO Friendly Organisations
    Catlyne A.E. Margrain

139. Women’s Ways of Working in Academia
    Elaine Martin and Jenni Smith

145. Women in Science and Engineering:
    Why Aren’t There More?
    Anne Mitchell

149. Doing it Right: Aboriginal Terms of Reference and Competency Standards Development
    Wendy Murray and Glenis Grogan

153. Real Consultation or “Just for Noting”: Women and Community Planning
    Carolyn Ozturk

155. Challenging Complicity: The Voice of Professional Women
    Susan Shannon

163. New Roles for Women: More Choices
    Susan Sharpe

169. How Professional Organisations Assist Women in Leadership: The Role of IPSA in Challenging for the Future
    Lynne Shickert

175. Recruitment of Senior Executives in the Western Australian Public Sector: Where are the Women?
    Karen Thomson
181. Women in Uniform: Women and Corporate Culture  
   Lyn Walster

185. Women Never Retire: Women’s Experience of Retirement  
   Pamela Weatherill

191. A Question of Style or Value? Contrasting Perceptions of Women as Educational Leaders  
   Gaby Weiner

197. Women, Advertising and Superannuation: Qualitative Research Findings  
   Margie White

207. Stopping the Ears while Trying to Steal the Bell: Instructional Design Practices in Distance Education and the Post Modern Debate  
   Jane Widdess
Introduction

The Women in Leadership Program is an exciting development initiative that, over a three year period, has had a visible effect on attitudes towards leadership and the role of women in organisations.

As part of the program, through the generous funding support of the Commonwealth Staff Development Fund, the goodwill of staff and the commitment of women examining the leadership challenges facing Australian society today, Edith Cowan University has hosted a National Women in Leadership Conference for the past two years.

This Conference provides an ongoing opportunity for women from varied and diverse roles to contribute to our knowledge and understanding of leadership.

The theme of the 1993 Conference, Women’s Voices: Challenging for the Future, highlights the richness and strength of women in Australian society.

Each contributor to this publication, in her different way, testifies to the power of women’s voices and the substance of the leadership challenge.

The papers have been reproduced in their entirety and, in the main, reflect the style of each individual author. We present them to you with pleasure.

Jacquie Hutchinson
Deputy Director
Division of Human Resource Management
November, 1994
The Power of Voice in Creating an Alternative Vision

Dr Patricia Brennan
Community Consultant

My participation in reforming the role of women was not as an academic or a writer of papers but as very specifically a voice, along with others, breaking the silence largely through the national media on the subjugation of women in the Anglican Church.

When it comes to a religious tradition the use of women's voices to challenge those in orthodox power is full of irony, since to be a woman is to be compelled to silence under the 'magna carta' of women's oppression, specifically written in the New Testament: "I permit no women to speak or have authority over men for she must learn in all silence".

So much of what has been women's religious experience and history, because they were silenced in the official locations of power such as formal theological scholarship and liturgy, rested in the evanescence of speech and like all oral tradition left only faint traces in the recorded culture. As expressed by Adrienne Rich:

These things by women saved are all we have of them.
These scraps turned into patchwork, doll-gowns, clean white rags for staunching blood...
Universe of humble things and without these, no memory no faithfulness, no purpose for the future no honour to the past

Ironically, the same trace records of women survive in the Christian scriptures, recording the misogyny and the patriarchy but also the evidence of women's vital participation in the life of Israel and later in early Christian communities. Even the evidence that they were leaders and teachers. It was the development of these communities into an official church ruled by monarchical bishops that increasingly silenced women.

The solid establishment however of religious language, practice and symbol that was almost exclusively masculine had so powerfully become the norm for Christianity that multiple attempts by women through the ages, wherever they could think to question the authority of orthodox knowledge, were repeatedly crushed. A masculine Godhead was the essence of masculine supremacy and it was reflected in God's locum tenens on earth, the male priest. It was when women finally tackled this office that reform became a newly serious enterprise.

The use of voice in declaring wrong was being done in the church requires not just an idea but fleshed out people, their actual presence, their vulnerability and with it an authoritative claim in a public place that invites retribution.

In the early eighties when the Australian Anglican church was quite indifferent to the reality of women ministers in the Uniting church, but more so to women priests in Anglican churches overseas from 1974 on, it was the decision by a group of Anglican women in Sydney to start a national movement to put the church's sexist practices on notice.

1984 saw the birth of the National Movement for the Ordination of Women. And a struggle that was to consume at least a decade of my life began. While the machinery of a fully financed church administration slowly turned on the minor question of women, our destinies, our phones, our previously private houses, our money and our waking moments were directed towards the thorough critique of a system that till now had procured our silence. It was about to have to hear us or read about us as the popular media offered the chance for Portia to put her case in public.

The drama began to unfold on our television sets in prime time and it was a strange cast. On the one hand a group of university educated women, locating themselves on the streets outside cathedrals like a bunch of feminist urban guerrillas, as a guard of dishonour to long lines of processing patriarchs, bedecked in fine long dresses. From choir boys to patriarchal bishops, they swept into cathedrals that they alone presided in, still unaware of the reform that was about to take place.

In terms of its central theme, religious orthodoxy required the full cooperation of women in a subjugated location and in synod after synod the vote to change that location was lost. Reform reached its most dramatic point in 1987 in an historic General Synod that was summoned to meet in Sydney and decide whether women should be priests or not.
The house of bishops passed it. The house of laity passed it but it was lost in the house of clergy by four votes, two of whom were clergy who supported the ordination of women but opposed the form of the bill. Ironically, the Primate who was the president of the Synod, when the numbers were read out to a hushed synod, turned towards the gallery of silenced women who sat watching their fates being once again decided for them. Perhaps unconscious of the significance of it, he virtually repeated the words of the bible when he said: “Of course the women in the gallery understand that they will have to remain silent at this point”. Of course we didn’t and one of our number announced to the synod that “women would remain priests outside the church until such time as we were ordained”.

That day of ordination came within five years and by the end of 1992 there were 92 Anglican women priests in Australia.

While public interest in the women priest debate was high and remains so now in the catholic system, there is a certain tension between the mandate of feminism and the question of women’s involvement in a faith system that is not only seen as patriarchal but as irrelevant.

Rosi Braidotti is a feminist philosopher currently working in Utrecht, who grew up in Australia in an Italian family. She makes two statements that touch into this.

The first concerns the feminist question. She describes sexual difference as the question that late 20th century Westerners are historically bound to struggle with. (Braidotti: 1993) But when it comes to the second, namely the relevance of religion to the feminist question, she is not so sure. In her view, religious feminists in their redemptive efforts within religion are merely engaging in “regressive nostalgia”. (Braidotti: 1991, p204)

I welcome the opportunity to address both issues since they are for me still inexorably linked. The socialisation of sexual difference is a crucial area to explore and religious legitimisation of such socialisation has played a major part in establishing patriarchal thought as a norm.

A saying that is around among feminists is that there are as many forms of feminism as there are feminists. This is not just a sloppy way of avoiding the ideological disagreements that surround explanations of social phenomena. It also functions as a smoke screen for discrimination within feminism itself. The contemporary feminist movement is still in the process of being articulated.

Betty Friedan in setting the ball rolling in *The Feminine Mystique*, played a part in the whole enterprise but her perspective could only be her own—namely that of a white middle class educated woman. The hierarchy of race and class pervade feminism in Australian society just as it shapes the same racial policy of white supremacy as the USA.

While white well-educated professional women complain of the glass ceiling, where executive women are promoted to a certain level but can’t get the top jobs, their Aboriginal sisters have neither education, skilled jobs nor a roof over the heads of their children. Once we look at one domain of domination we must look at all forms of domination and how they reinforce each other. For Aboriginal women, the issue of rape is overshadowed by police discrimination against Aboriginal men and their deaths in custody, while the inequalities surrounding sexual difference is eclipsed by the more pressing issues of racism and land rights. Such Aboriginal women have played a powerful part in being voices challenging white racist hegemony and creating an alternate vision for their people.

Another issue that has crept into the feminist ethos that I feel must be addressed and not just swept under the carpet in a bid to be supportive of the sisterhood, is the issue of separatism based on a kind of institutionalised anti-maleness. Notwithstanding the transitional need for some women to be therapeutically free of the impact of men on their lives, the active propagation of a separatist male-free lifestyle, is not only a glorification of the feminine beyond its own limitations but is also far from the interests of the vast majority of women. Women’s destinies are caught up in the same enterprise as that of the men who labour alongside of them as sons, lovers, parents, homemakers, partners and husbands. If our voices are voices of hostility to men as men then they can be destructive voices. As Buddha said “Whatever you do, you do to yourself” and if we remove ourselves into exclusive enclaves based on the politics of resentment, we create exodus communities that leave the dominant culture untouched. It will continue to oppress women within it by controlling law, language and money until such time as it is engaged in reform.

Albert O. Hirschman, an economist, wrote a small classic text called *Exit Voice and Loyalty* in which he analysed what he saw as three ways of responding to an unfavourable market situation. You can exit it, you can speak out from within it (voice) or you can comply and hope for change (loyalty). (Hirschman: 1981) When it has come to the church most people either exit or are silently loyal because it is costly to either leave or to speak out on an issue. To be alienated within the belief system from which you draw your identity leaves few illusions about
the conservatising forces within every institution and why protest movements are usually small.

Which takes us back to the criticism by Rosi Braidotti namely that women who linger in patriarchal religion do so as an act of regressive nostalgia. This was put more powerfully by Irina Dunn at the 1991 National Women’s conference. When debating the question ‘Is it worthwhile for women to pour their energies into a feminist reform of Christianity?’ she said “One might as well ask, is it worthwhile for women to pour their energies into a feminist movement within the armed services?” (Dunn: 1990, p205)

It is refreshing to hear feminists prepared to voice what has largely been an unspoken view within feminism that religious faith is basically infantilising for women.

However whether secular or religious, women’s socialisation has generally been to inhibit their maturation to autonomy, the better to serve the sexual and economic needs of men and that has been as true of secular education as it has been of theology.

But as well as challenging an oppressive tradition within religion, women have found a challenging tradition within religion itself of justice and ethics which could play a vital part in creating an alternate vision for the future.

This is not the place for an apologetic for religious beliefs but nor will I disown the validity of a view of the world that gave me voice within reform in the first place. Nor sidestep the profound influence that religion has had in shaping the culture of western thought, positively as well as negatively, something secular feminism tends to ignore, while professing a naive interest in other traditional religions more for their novelty than out of any profound understanding of them. In the end there is no fool proof method of discernment that renders one story more valid than another. The history of reform is a contest between competing stories that explain the way things are and some of those competing stories have been religious.

In his book What is a Story Don Cupitt, Dean of the Philosophy of Religion at Cambridge, describes the current and timeless struggle of religious orthodoxy to fix and control language so that it can continue to be God’s speech. Thus it resists historical change, compasses absolutes and expresses ‘pure Truth’. Such an approach to religion requires language to somehow be superhuman and a heavenly thing and that is basically fundamentalism.

A more literary view of Christianity gives a different kind of hope. For example, Cupitt says we will never have access to a purely historical, pre-fictionalised Jesus. By the time we got to read about him he was already mythologised by a particular vocabulary with its own archetypal pattern, history and interpretation. We need to drop the positivist theory of exegesis as a way of reconnecting us to the original meaning of the text and instead accept what the history of scriptural interpretation itself shows. Namely that until we consider these things for ourselves we will not know what the ideal of a holy life might mean in our own day. We certainly can’t know what it actually meant to people of his day. “We can speculate, we can formulate but we can’t know.” (Cupitt)

This is exactly what happened when women began to take their own contemporary experiences of meaning seriously. When women interested in theology began to address an institution that wrote women out of its life but insisted that they be life to that institution we paid attention to the master narrative and found its ethical content revolutionary, as have many others in this century. For instance when it comes to the ideas we have about Jesus Christ, the central figure of Christianity, Cupitt advocates that the anomalous Jesus can still be a redemptive source.

“We may still have the courage to break away from the standard interpretation of him as an authoritative celibate on a cosmic scale of other-worldliness. Provided we are sufficiently bold in repudiating the old sexist and power-hungry orthodoxy and radically refictionalising Jesus.” (Cupitt) This is precisely what has happened to women as they became the map readers of their own poorly recorded journey through patriarchy. The records of first century travellers were not literally useful for them but were morally and ethically useful. And theologians like Elisabeth Schussler Fiorenza demonstrated that re-examined texts in the Bible revealed evidence, albeit largely fragmented, of real resistance, spiritual autonomy and leadership by women in the early Christian church. Rather than the religious story being a story of the dominant culture it was also a radical text of liberation of a counter culture. The Sermon on the Mount provides an alternative vision that feminism can appropriate. Like the ideology it criticises, feminism can slide into the same rampant self-interest as patriarchy with its concern for power dressing, glass ceilings and pulling up the ladder after one’s own climb. The basis for social liberation may involve service rather than self-promotion. “When I was in prison you visited me, when I was naked you clothed me, when I was hungry you fed me.”

Apart from the rediscovery of the radical social justice claims within religion, feminist theologians have
realised how profoundly the pervasive notion of male divinity has affected female identity. Luce Irigaray is a French psychoanalyst who speaking as one outside religious belief, reinforces the scholarship of religious feminists that male divinity has had a neuroticising effect on the female.

The concept of a male God has allowed men to disavow their debt to the creative role of the female, usurping her as Universal Creator. Because men consciously or unconsciously regard themselves as primarily formed in God’s image they contain women outside the sphere of the divine yet rely on her resources to exist and survive. This absence of identity in women on the other hand may be reflected in the failure of feminism to have a real impact on society. Irigaray says women lack a symbolic location in a society where men possess, create and control the symbolic. She says “women have never loved and wanted themselves. Self-love is not the same as the traditional narcissism that the female displays in her interest in clothes make-up and jewellery.” (Irigaray: 1984, p105) These rituals are attempts by women to give themselves a protective house of which the masculine symbolic deprives them.

The absence of a female symbolic is evidenced in the rituals of exchange in sexuality and the economy where women are still largely the objects of exchange and not the controllers of it. This leads to a particular kind of rivalry among women attempting to engage the culture as subjects of exchange. Such a rivalry continues to perplex and incapacitate reform groups. Leadership by women in theological reform as in all other areas has been dogged by the difficulty of women accepting the leadership of other women.

Revisioning an alternate future holds many challenges. Feminist theology like feminism itself draws on a wide range of different experiences on what it is to be religious and female. It has a continuingly awkward yet crucial relationship with feminism itself in dealing with the question at the centre of theology, namely God.

As women increasingly give voice to a religious imagination that is no longer tethered to male experience, as they begin to image divinity at least as feminine as it is masculine, it will be interesting to see what insights they bring. Will they merely anthropomorphise a female mother in the sky in the place of the Father? Will autonomy offer transformation and relevance to religious belief in this country or will we see a return to the safety of conservative orthodoxy on the one hand and an increasing secularisation of the disillusioned on the other? Braidotti’s suggestion that feminist theologians are merely filling the void left by the death of God with feminist discourse, begs to be addressed, but not here. (Braidotti: 1990, p206)

I prefer to give the last word to Irigaray. When leaving the question of God open to the imagination of the reader, she says;

“God holds no obligations over our needs except to become. No task burdens us except that one: become divine, become perfect, don’t let any part of us be amputated that could be expansive for us.” (Grosz: 1987, p6)

The interest in divinity from outside of orthodox religious belief holds strange promise that the God question may yet outlast all onslaughts against it, for the simple reason that orthodox religion has never owned it. Women have newly discovered this and, no longer amputated from their own experience of life and therefore divinity, may be the charisma that the church needs to recall its own radical origins in love and service.

REFERENCES
Cupitt, D. What is a Story SCM.
Irigaray, L. 1985 The Sex Which is Not One, Ithica, Cornell University Press.
Lessons for Leadership

Identity and Diversity

MARA WEST
WA DEPARTMENT OF TRAINING

In this year, the year for the World’s Indigenous Peoples I would like to acknowledge the Noongar people on whose land we appear today. I extend a warm welcome to all Noongar people attending this Conference.

To set the scene for my paper I would like to read a poem called Right to Be by Eva Johnson.

RIGHT TO BE

Don’t stereotype an image of what you want me to be
I’m a Woman and I’m Black and I need to be free
I’ll give back your sense of values you bestowed upon me
And regain my pride, my culture, and true identity

To the future I will strive and there’s no looking back
I’ll look to other women to support me on my track
I’ll fight as a Woman for the right just to be
The most important contribution to this society

Yes, I’m a Woman and I know that there’s nothing that I lack
I’ll progress with my learning till I finally get the knack
It’s my independent thinking that makes me feel so strong
Our trust in solidarity, simply means we can’t go wrong

I don’t want to be a second hand rose
I don’t want to be your centrefold pose
I’m a Woman and I’m Black and I need to be free
Being up front and powerful is the only way to be

Look at me, I’m an Aborigine. But how can you tell I’m an Aborigine? Is it the colour of my skin, or the clothes that I wear or the way that I speak or is it, as we Aborigines say, you can’t mistake the nose or those skinny legs? How do you know I’m an Aborigine? Well you would ask someone who knows me or you would ask me. There are so may stereotypical images being thrown around it’s hard to keep up with them. Just recently my friend and I went to lunch and we decided we would finish with a cappuccino. When I went to place our order the guy behind the counter asked me what nationality I was. I proudly replied I was Aborigine. “But you can’t be” he said, “you’re too pretty to be an Aborigine”.

Talk about a backhanded compliment! I asked him what he meant as I didn’t know how to take that, as a compliment or a slap in the face. He turned and quickly walked away. So many people see us in so many ways and many perceptions are not so complimentary.

Let me tell you something of myself. I was born in Carnarvon at a time when there were white areas and black areas. At a time when Aboriginal people weren’t recognised as citizens of this country. I was one of eleven children and in my childish innocence didn’t comprehend the racism and total contempt and disrespect the majority of non-Aboriginal people had for Aboriginal people and our culture. Being part of a big family the loving, sharing and caring tended to overshadow the big bad things that existed outside our extended family. I took it for granted that I couldn’t go into those areas designated for “Whites Only”. Years later, when I went nursing, I took two of my nursing friends, who were non-Aboriginal, home with me for holidays and as they were standing talking to one of my brothers, the police came up and asked them why were they consorting with black fellas. And we point the finger at South Africa!

Aboriginal people have been locked in a mindset created by white Anglo-Saxon values. Cook described us as “the most miserable people on earth”, white male anthropologists cannot credit their own women’s intelligence and they certainly don’t recognise Aboriginal women while bureaucracies keep us in our place by referring to us as people of Aboriginal descent and they think this is an improvement on “full-blood” or “half-caste”. I’ve never heard of cases where other people have had to declare they are of Scottish descent or German descent or Swedish descent yet Aboriginal people have to forever reinforce their Aboriginality. We know we are Aboriginal. We don’t have to advertise ourselves and we certainly don’t classify ourselves according to what shade of brown we are.

In Aboriginal Society our credentials are our family ties. When we meet each other very often the greeting is not “how are you, pleased to meet you” but rather “hello, who’s your mob?” and once your lineage is established you are recognised and respected. I guess you could say it’s a true case of “it’s not what you know but who you know”. This placement of people is very important to
Aboriginal people. If a person cannot be "placed" there isn't any need to worry as that person will always be referred to as brother or sister but this is very rare as no matter where the Aboriginal person is in Australia they will always find they are related to someone.

Yet we are not an homogeneous society, we are a nation of peoples with cultures which reflect commonalities yet are very different in other respects. We are always saying "We are our own worst enemy" because we tend to openly express our differences. These divisions tend to weaken us and many non-Aborigines, who are ignorant and misguided, are quick to capitalise on this. We also tend to cut down our tall poppies instead of recognising them and giving them support. We tend to be jealous and envious of their achievements. This, in many ways, is a product of years of policies and dependencies. We have not been allowed to think for ourselves or to make mistakes and learn from them. We have had decisions made for us since first settlement and things were "done for our own good" such as the taking away of our fair skinned people. The damage and disintegration of families is just being recognised by non-Aborigines. Many Aborigines who were separated from their families at birth are now feeling confident to follow their hearts and their basic instincts to trace their families and regain their identity.

The Aboriginal people of Australia have been issued a challenge. The challenge came with the first settlers over 200 years ago. We could survive or we could die out. We rose to that challenge, we did not die out, we survived the humiliation, the degradation, the oppression, the genocidal acts of extreme prejudice and violence. We have survived a dominant culture which is just coming to terms with the fact that Australia does have a black history. Aboriginal people are shrugging off the cloak of anonymity and are standing tall and telling the world that we don't have to go to the mountain because this here is our promised land. The land is our Mother. It nurtures us and sustains us; we came here from the land and we will go back to the land.

The tides of change are upon us. Aboriginal women have taken the bull by the horns and are breaking down the barriers, breaking the vicious cycle of poverty and disempowerment. We are Bosses ourselves. We are sick of programs that don't work being foisted upon us and then getting the blame when it doesn't work. We are conscious of the fact that our position and significance have been overlooked in discussions on Aboriginal Affairs. Aboriginal women have had greater independence and status in our society than non-Aboriginal women have in theirs. Our men can't speak for us and we are certainly not going to let non-Aboriginal men ignore or dominate us. We demand the right to be heard and to make our own decisions.

The creation of the Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander Commission or ATSIC as it is commonly known, has contributed to establishing a forum where women's voices can be heard. A board of twenty commissioners governs ATSIC and of the twenty, four are women including the Chairperson. Also 27% of ATSIC's 762 elected Regional Council members are women. In the words of the Chairperson of ATSIC, Miss Lois O'Donaghue, "better than any Parliament in Australia." This figure hopefully will be increased in the second ATSIC Regional Council election this Saturday, December 4. Aboriginal and Torres Strait Island women have been encouraged to run for election.

So in many ways ATSIC is re-establishing our identities and status. It is recognising women are an important section of the Aboriginal community.

The State Aboriginal Affairs Planning Authority through its Aboriginal Advisory Council has also recognised the needs of women and has set up as a subgroup of the Advisory Council, the Aboriginal Women's Task Force. This further reinforces the recognition of women's needs and aspirations.

It is generally acknowledged that it will be the women who will bring about changes in Aboriginal affairs. Aboriginal women have a resilience that has passed down through the ages. Our mothers and our mothers' mothers have sustained the Aboriginal nation of peoples. They did not give in when the going got tough instead they dug in their heels to ensure our survival.

But while we break down barriers in Aboriginal affairs we still struggle to gain status and recognition in "mainstream society". We are scattered across a whole range of occupations with very few in decision making positions and very few being visible. We not only face bigotry and indifference from non-Aboriginal males but we also face the same from our non-Aboriginal female counterparts. The majority of non-Aboriginal females tend to view us with as much suspicion as their men. So rather than uniting and creating a stronger presence and a stronger voice they either align themselves with their men or take the stance that they have enough problems establishing their own positions and identity. We need to support each other. We need to be tolerant and more understanding of each other's needs as we are a multicultural society and the diversity of cultural backgrounds needs to be recognised, respected and promoted.
When Aboriginal people enter the workforce, and it is especially so with women, we tend to gravitate towards the Aboriginal sections/branches in departments because we feel comfortable with our own. Government departments, especially those such as Homeswest, Social Security, Ministry of Justice etc. need to employ Aboriginal people in up-front positions not only to deal with Aboriginal clients but also the wider community so people can see positive images of Aboriginal people and our culture. It may even dispel some of the stereotypical images of drunks, dirty and unkempt and the biggest myth of all that we live on handouts and at the taxpayers' expense. There is a large number of us who do work and pay taxes like everyone else. There is even a large number of us who work for the dole.

Let me tell you about the Community Development Employment Program or CDEP. This is a program introduced into Aboriginal communities where people actually work for the dole. Nowhere does this happen in other communities where a whole community works for the dole.

This is a mechanism which provides Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islanders an opportunity to plan and have control over their physical, social and cultural needs. The long term goal is self-determination and self reliance.

The scheme began in 1977 to help remote isolated communities develop an alternative other than continued reliance on unemployment benefits.

In 1985, the scheme was expanded to include Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander communities living in rural and urban areas.

Under the scheme, participating communities, organisations or groups forgo individual unemployment benefits for a wages grant paid to the community. Each community decides on its own works program. The program may include projects such as road works, house repairs and maintenance, the production of artefacts and activities in support of traditional lifestyle and culture.

The nature of the scheme means that participants are usually paid as part-time, casual or contract workers.

Does that sound like Aboriginal people are ripping off the system and the taxpayers?

Let us not have our perceptions and our knowledge overshadowed by misinformation and stereotypical images.

I want to take the opportunity to tell you about my main role model: my mother. My mother is one of the greatest women I know. She is a mother, sister, auntie, friend, cook, cleaner, nurse, doctor, gardener, teacher, horticulturist, mechanic, hostess, adviser care giver, answering service. I could go on but it would take the rest of this conference to list her attributes! She is probably no different from any other mother in these respects but she is an Aborigine. She was raised at a time when her grandparents were hitching camels to drays, when there were no roads, no electricity, no recognition, no identity, no rights and certainly no status. When she had my eldest sister she was a housemaid to one of the white squatters. My sister of course was just like any other active child. She chased the ducks, fell in the fish pond, fell into the cactus patch, let all the chooks out and generally did what any fun loving child would do. She had great fun. But the boss's missus didn't like her chooks being let out and her ducks and fish terroised and certainly not the time it took to take the cactus prickles out of my sister's knees, backside, hands and anywhere else they may have stuck. So my mother did the next best thing; she tied my sister to a tree with enough slack in the rope for her to walk and play within a certain radius but away from the ducks, fish, chooks and cactus.

My mother was a servant who cooked, cleaned and cared for a non-Aboriginal family with very little time for herself and her family. To make matters worse my father worked at another station so he wasn't there to give her support and encouragement. At times it must have seemed like he was on the other side of the world. Yet despite past traumas and degradation she bears no malice. She looks on her past experiences as part of her learning. Let us learn and work together.

I would like to close my address by reading one of the late Oodgeroo Noonucal's poems and then quoting the very last paragraph of A Bastard Like Me by Charles Perkins.

A SONG OF HOPE

Look up, my people,
The Dawn is breaking,
The World is waking
To a new bright day,
When none defame us,
No restriction tame us,
Nor colour shame us,
Nor sneer dismay.

Now brood no more
On the years behind you,
The hope assigned you
Shall the past replace,
When a juster justice
Grown wise and stronger
Points the bone no longer
At a darker race.

So long we waited
Bound and frustrated,
Till hate be hated
And caste deposed:
Now light shall guide us,
No goal denied us,
And all doors open
That long were closed.

See plain the promise,
Dark freedom-lover!
Night's nearly over
And though long the climb,
New rights will greet us,
And joy complete us
In our new Dream Time.

To our fathers' fathers
The pain, the sorrow;
To our children's children
The glad tomorrow.

What is the future for blacks and whites in this country?
Shall we have blood? Shall we seek happiness and find it?
Shall we leave a legacy of hate for our children, or shall we
build for them a racially harmonious society? Governments
can legislate for such a society, but we the people must live
it. We as individuals must play our part and be concerned
and involved. Some can play a very active part while others
need only understand. The opportunity is there before us and
the air of optimism must be recreated! We can change things
for the better together. People do not have to suffer unneces-
sarily, blacks or whites. Happiness can come to all people in
their lifetime, regardless of their colour. Surely there must be
some for my people today in our country.

REFERENCES
Kevin Gilbert (ed). Inside Black Australia: Anthology of Aborigi-
BACKGROUND

In January of 1992, I was invited to serve as a "chronicler" for women living with HIV/AIDS. My co-researcher and I have since interviewed 24 women, from September 1992-July 1993, in meetings with Women and AIDS support groups in four major cities in Ohio.

FROM THE RESEARCH PROPOSAL

AIDS is understood in our culture in many ways: "a metaphor for mortality, for human fragility and vulnerability" (Sontag, 1990); a plague; some new kind of scrutiny; "the battleground of moral courage" (Patton, 1991, p. 385); a disease of homosexual men and the Third World and, increasingly, the disadvantaged, especially of poor blacks and Hispanics, and women and children (Treichler, 1988, 1992; Watney, 1989; Alonso and Koreck, 1989). Understanding the cultural significance of the disease, its capacity to alter how we know ourselves and what we can do in the midst of epidemic is what motivates this project. Its particular interest is in the need to advance research by and about women in the AIDS crisis in order to address the relative invisibility of women in AIDS discourses, given that women now account for one-third of the ten million people with the HIV infection worldwide (Corea, 1992). As feminist research, this project also explores what it means to do empirical work in the human sciences in more participatory and collaborative ways (Lather, 1991). This is particularly important in an area where efforts toward "knowing" have often been intrusive and exploitative (Watney, 1990; Crimp, 1991).

The primary objective of this research is to bring to our understanding of HIV/AIDS the words of women as they struggle to make sense of their experiences of the disease, particularly how they negotiate the conflicting messages they receive and construct about the meaning of AIDS. In addition to addressing a gap in the AIDS literature, this inquiry into the ways women with AIDS negotiate making meaning of their lives provides a particularly fertile site for exploring questions of making a "self" in the midst of the overburden of inherited and authoritative meanings. Finally, this inquiry provides a laboratory in which to explore textual possibilities for telling stories that situate my co-researcher and myself not so much as experts "saying what things mean" in terms of "data", but rather as witnesses giving testimony to what is happening to these women.

Theoretically this project is situated in poststructural theories of meaning-making and subject formation (Henriques, 1987; Smith, 1988; Hooks, 1990). For example, the interest in how the participants construct themselves in relation to the categories laid on them, demanded of them as women with HIV/AIDS, assumes subjects both shaped by and resistant to dominant discourses. What is the lived experience of conflicting social meanings? What are the internally persuasive discourses "that speak to deep convictions, investments and desires as they struggle to make meaning of their experience" (Britzman, 1992)? How are available discourses inadequate, burdensome, "empowering"? These are poststructural sorts of questions with their emphasis on language, meaning and power.

Methodologically grounded in qualitative/ethnographic and, particularly, feminist poststructural research in the human sciences, this project enacts an interest in what it means to tell the lives of others, an interest much pursued across poststructural anthropology (Clifford and Marcus, 1986), feminist methodology (Harding, 1991) and critical ethnography (Anderson, 1990). Both within and against conventional notions of social science research, the goal is not so much to represent the researched better as to explore how researchers can "be accountable to people's struggles for self-representation and self-determination" (Visweswaran, 1988, p. 39). Wanting to take the crisis of representation into account, I am particularly interested in what poststructural anthropologist, George Marcus (1993), referred to recently as a move toward evocative portraits, a type of data reporting that "emphasizes a direct exposure to other 'voices'... unassimilated to given concepts, theories, and analytic frames" (13). "We are," he says, in a moment "when the need to chronicle the world seem(s) to outstrip the capacity to theorize it... What we're saying... is kind of old fashioned: that it is possible to present the voices of others in a more or less unmediated way" (14-15).

In sum, in terms of the rationale for the project, there is little qualitative/ethnographic work in AIDS
overall. Most of the research is either out of a medical, epidemiological model (Morse, 1992) or out of a cultural studies inquiry mode, with a focus on the media (e.g., Patton, 1990). Very little brings the voices of PWA's to our understanding of AIDS. Within the little work that does exist on narrative inquiry into the lives of PWA's, women's voices are largely absent. Additionally, this inquiry is situated in efforts toward generative research methodologies that register a possibility and mark a provisional space in which a different science might take form. Hence this project is about science as contested site and the contributions of feminist research to practices of seeking our answers to a different science in inquiry as it is lived. Finally, this study is about being 'invited in' as a feminist qualitative researcher in order to chronicle the stories of these women and get them into broad circulation. Positioned as somewhat of a 'hired hand', a primary interest of mine is to be of use to those who brought me into the project to do a very specific job.

It is anticipated that two books will come out of this study, the first is 'for the women' and co-authored with Chris Smithies. The second text will be aimed at an academic audience and explore the instructive complications of this study in order to generate a theory of situated methodology. The first book is presently titled, A Cloudy Place of Angels: Women Living with HIV/AIDS. The working title for the second book is A Curriculum of Angels: Feminist Practice Toward a Double Science. It is to the first book that I turn in the rest of this paper.

A CLOUDY PLACE OF ANGELS: WOMEN LIVING WITH HIV/AIDS

The perfect act of writing comes not from a power to write, but from an impotence that turns back on itself and in this way comes to itself as a pure act (which Aristotle calls agent intellect). This is why in the Arab tradition agent intellect has the form of an angel whose name is Qalama, Pen, and its place is an unfathomable potentiality. Bartleby, a scribe who does not simply cease writing but "prefers not to," is the extreme image of this angel that writes nothing but its potentiality to not-write. (Agamben, 1993:36-37)

At a conference on social construction at the University of New Hampshire this last June, poststructural anthropologist, Stephen Tyler, spoke in his keynote of "a book that is trying to write me". Only half-jokingly entitling his book, The Unwritable, Tyler outlined the limits of grammar and "the ends of writing" as we attempt to ride out/write out of the crisis of representation. I find myself in a similar situation. Faced with a writing task that feels both urgent and as something about which I want to speak of softly and obliquely, what follows meditates on my present wrestling with the myriad of issues raised by this study, particularly issues involved in writing the research text.

In settling on a textual strategy, I am circling around four models: Cambodia: A Book for People Who Find Television Too Slow, Brian Fawcett (N.Y.: Collier Books, 1989), Jacques Derrida, Geoffrey Bennington (University of Chicago, 1993), Body/Text in Julia Kristeva: Religion, Women, and Psychoanalysis, David Crownfield, editor (Albany, State University of New York Press, 1992), and Women and Men: A Novel, Joseph McElroy (N.Y.: Knopf, 1987). The first two are examples of a split text. In the Fawcett text, the top 2/3 of each page is a series of journalistic stories across 13 topics, with the bottom third, in a smaller font, positioned as the book's continuously running subtext and reference network. Each page, then, is both story and essay, and invites multiple ways of reading.

The Bennington book on Derrida is split into two texts. The top 2/3 is Bennington's intellectual biography of Derrida, "Derridabase", divided into 32 chapters. The bottom third is Derrida's reaction, "Circumfession", a running commentary on Bennington's text, "a sort of internal margin". Derrida's text was designed to escape, to surprise, the systematization of his work proposed by Bennington. Bennington refers to the "hypertext" dimensions of the text that open it to multiple paths of reading (p. 14). Derrida writes of "what is written 'up' there, beside or above me, on me, but also for me, in my favor, toward me and in my place..." (p. 26).

Rather than a text of split pages, the edited collection of essays on Kristeva uses the concept of "Inter-text" (a total of 7, with a Pre-text and Extra-text) at the end of each essay in order to "underscore the polyfocal, open-textured, synergetic character of (Kristeva's) work" (p. xx). The McElroy novel is organized around sedimented layers of realist story-telling, modernist quest for epistemological understanding, and postmodernist interest in the ontological construction of parallel worlds (McHale, 1992). The interchapters are the postmodern or "angelology" sections, "between" spaces, as their titles announce, inserts that get out of hand, growing longer and longer as the 1,000+ page novel progresses until they eventually are longer than the chapters. Somewhat ironically called "breathers", the inter-chapters introduce the novel's chorus, "this
voice which utters the discourse of the ‘breathers,’ which uses the first-person plural pronoun, belongs to—angels” (McHale, 1992:200). Brought ingloriously down to earth in the face of God’s desertion of the world, McElroy’s angels call attention to the plurality of worlds, the blurring of levels, the breaching of ontological boundaries. Deliberately inverting Rilke’s use of angels as aspiration toward the trans-human, these angels aspire to know human limits as they invade, find, speak and construct human consciousness through their angelic discourse, some “we” of “they” where “we fit into a large life that doesn’t much know us but—holds us?” (Ibid:205).

With these models in mind, I present the following (working) table of contents and a couple of pages of text:

A CLOUDY PLACE OF ANGELS
WOMEN LIVING WITH HIV/AIDS

Photos of the research participants à la Walker Evans
Pre-text 1: The Women
Pre-text 2: Why Angels?
Story 1: Leading From the Heart
  -Inter-text 1: Angels: A Sampler
Story 2: If I Didn’t Have HIV I’d Be Dead
  -Inter-text 2: The Angel of History
Story 3: I Don’t Know How to File This Away That This Has Happened to Us
  -Inter-text 3: Angelology
Story 4: We Are the Teachers
  -Inter-text 4: Death Makes Angels of Us All
Story 5: It’s Taken Me Years to Get Here:
  -Inter-text 5: The Work of the Angels
Extra-text: Reading/Writing Ourselves
Running Subtext: Chris and Patti’s Story: Our Learning Hearts

STORY 1
“LEADING FROM THE HEART”
Chris: How has HIV changed your life?
L: I have a whole completely different outlook on life than before I was diagnosed. Some days it’s good and some days it’s bad. I don’t look that far into the future anymore.

I don’t think about retirement. I don’t think about getting old. I want to. I want to see the year 2,000, but I just don’t look that far ahead. I feel cheated. I feel really cheated that there’s a possibility that I’m not going to get to see and do what I would normally.

Chris: What is the worst aspect?
L: Wondering what’s going to happen if I have to quit (work), just going through the bullshit you have to go through: where am I going to land? I like where I am now. It’s taken me a long time to get where I am. I’ve had men that were just absolutely anchors on my butt. Now I’ve finally got to the place where I can enjoy myself and have the things I want, and I know that I don’t get to keep them. I’ll have to go through a lot of government rhetoric and bullshit just to live. C and I have talked about this just the last couple of days, it’s scarry.

Chris: What’s it like to live with such a secret?
L: It’s a double life, it’s an absolute double life. You cannot imagine ever in your whole life what it’s like. Somebody has cancer, you go and tell them you have cancer, it’s oh you poor thing. You say you have AIDS or you’re HIV+ and they can’t jump backwards fast enough or far enough.

Chris: What does that feel like?
L: I think it’s amusing sometimes. You do a lot of: I wonder what they would say if they really knew about me. Oh if you only knew about me, honey; you think you’ve got it bad.

M: When they be talking about it, like me, I work in a place where I’m subject to (germs). I should be more afraid of them than they are of me. I’m so afraid a lot of the time I spray so much lysol and stuff, somebody come in coughing

CHRIS AND PATTI’S STORY: OUR LEARNING HEARTS

This research project on women and HIV/AIDS began in January of 1992. Chris Smithies, a feminist psychologist with four years of experience with AIDS work in Ohio, broached James Pearsol, Director of the East Central AIDS Education and Training Center, about a feminist research partner who could serve as a “chronicler”. Jim arranged a three-way meeting where Patti Lather became quite interested in the fruitfulness of such a study for exploring the implications of poststructuralism for the doing of qualitative inquiry. Hooked on the possibilities afforded by a study of women living with HIV/AIDS, Chris and Patti presented a research opportunity to the women at a women and HIV/AIDS retreat in May of 1992 at a rural convent.
or whatever. I’m the one trying to jump back; I get real tight and scared that I’m going to catch it. But I can’t say anything, somebody come in there with cuts and whatever, I panic. It’s hell trying to be two people. I wish I could go public, I really do. That’s what I told the doctor. I wish I could go public so people would know, hey you? It would release that tight tension inside of hiding, like you’re hiding behind a wall. And if you come out, everybody is going to look at you, that’s how I feel inside.

Chris: If you feel any anger at being cheated, where do you direct the anger?

LL: President Bush.

L: When I get really mad, I get mad at my husband whose philandering gave it to me. But I just get mad in general. Lately I notice I stay mad. That’s one of the problems I have to deal with, I have got to figure out some way to unload this. I got into it with my supervisor the other night... she probably carries Lysol in her purse... she asked me what in the world is wrong with you. And I wanted to tell her. Everybody senses a change in me. I’m sick of it. It gets old. It’s a big burden too; I don’t want this burden anymore. I’ve got enough to deal with, I don’t want to protect anybody else anymore. I think a lot of us feel that way. When we finally all make up our mind to do it, expose ourselves, open the closet door... but I just, you know, I just feel absolutely cheated.

Chris: What keeps you going?

L: I keep thinking tomorrow is going to be different. And when it isn’t different, that’s when it starts getting raggedy. Magic Johnson was hell day.

R: I don’t think about it unless I want to date someone. But now I know someone who died. I wonder how I’d afford AZT. With my insurance, I have to pay first and then be reimbursed.

M: I think about them trying to take my grandson away, especially as rotten as his mother is. On the job, I’ve been going to several doctors so it’s on my record.

In a sneaky way I guess my subconscious really wants to let everyone know so it would be a relief from this strain. I’ve told several of my friends and some at work and they’ve been a crutch for me.

Chris: Then you have to play this game: how do you decide who to trust?

---

NOTES FROM DRIVE TO WOMEN AND AIDS RETREAT, CHRIS AND PATTI, MAY 22, 1992

Chris: I want to do this research because there is so very little psycho-social research on women and AIDS, practically none. There’s so much about these women that inspires me. I thought I would learn about dying, but I’ve learned about living. Personally and professionally, I want to better understand them and I want others to not fear them. Most of what is written is about dying and I want to foreground what incredible examples of living HIV+ folks are. I want to hear them talk about how this has changed them: relations with women, the disease, themselves, the world. This is probably the first time they’ve had intimacy with women outside their families. I want to explore intimacy with women when it’s NOT a physical issue. Also, there are rarely issues around class, race, etc. I’m sick of that shit; I like having that fear them. Most of what is written on and outside the research. I deliberately took neither a tape recorder nor a notepad. It was an immersion experience; it was awkward; the touchy feeling of it was all too much for me sometimes. I had a lot of struggles with voyeurism. I took a lot of walks by myself.

My strongest memory of the retreat is from the closing “sistercelebration” where we were lighting candles for those who had died from AIDS and the Dayton women ended up all crying together in a configuration that looked like the statue of Iwo Jima. I remember a particularly small woman looked huge to me as she circled the group of four with her arms. Some angel image jared in my mind, some image from my own Catholic past and present post-Wiccan spiritual sensibility. Across multiple differences of race, class, age and health, the women seemed angels in their love for one another and in their wanting to be “messengers” to other women about HIV/AIDS. Not too much later, as I puzzled over how to situate myself in relation to the women, the concept of standing with impressed itself upon me, which segueyed into standing with angels and a world opened up.

---

CHRIS AND PATTI’S STORY: OUR LEARNING HEARTS

This research Since that May 1992 retreat, Chris and Patti collected interview data at Women and HIV/AIDS support groups and then met with most of the women so that they could repond to our initial efforts to tell their stories and help us make decisions about the form of the book which we all hoped would address the relative invisibility of women in AIDS discourses. As feminists, both Chris and Patti were interested in exploring what it means to do empirical work in the human sciences in more participatory and collaborative ways. This is particularly important in an area where efforts toward “knowing” have often been intrusive and exploitative.
CHAPTER OUTLINES

Pre-text 1 introduces the women that Chris and I interviewed. Pretext 2 introduces the metaphor of the angel and the organization of the book, including the angel inter-chapters:

- a chapter or set of short chapters that narrate the interview transcripts around particular topics, with titles chosen from the words of the women themselves, e.g., “If I Didn’t Have HIV I’d Be Dead” and “It Took Me All My Life to Get Here”;

- an inter-chapter on angels, beginning with a sampler of the ways angels are re-emerging in contemporary cultural usage (McHale, 1992), synopses of the ways angels are used in the work of Walter Benjamin, Rainer Maria Rilke, and Nietzsche, as well as popular culture, and ending with discussion of the “work” of the angels in this text;

- a subtext: across the bottom of each page, a continuously running commentary by Patti and Chris, the co-researchers, regarding our experiences in telling these women’s stories. Here we will each, in our own voices, give some background for the study and share our efforts to make sense of the “data” and the study and the larger context in which the AIDS crisis is such a cultural marker.

- the extra-text will present a concluding update on the women and their reaction to reading the manuscript, an update and reaction written, whenever possible, by the women themselves and including poems, letters, etc. from some of them.

From the beginning of our working with the women, their vision was of a book marketed like Magic Johnson’s book on AIDS. They wanted to see it at supermarket check-out stands and K-Marts, an easily available reaching out to women struggling to learn how to deal with HIV/AIDS in their lives, be it themselves, someone they love and/or someone with whom they work. Combining this with my gnomic, abstruse ways of knowing has been a source of both energy and paralysis. The angels have become the site of this struggle, and so it is with an exploration of how they help me locate myself in the problematic of the book that I conclude.

A CLOUDY PLACE OF ANGELS

The (working) title comes from an essay on Walter Benjamin’s theory of language. Arguing that the German “word” is like the German ‘cloud’ (wort/wolke), Hamacher (1988) delineates how both are neither the thing itself nor any one nor any lasting form. In reading, texts are clouds where meaning is only in relationship in the dissembling shadow of irony:

No interpretation and no remembrance could clarify this cloudy place, for what is covered by it is nothing that was ever understood and could thus be encountered in memory. It would be that bodily gesture which, associated with death, is just as impossible to understand as death ‘itself’ . . . the cloudy place from which it issues is just that place where doctrine is not (Hamacher, 1988:174).

This passage well captures my dilemma in trying to construct a text that works at multiple levels, a double-coded text that is both broadly accessible and fosters brooding about the issues involved in telling other people’s stories and living in the shadow places of history as loss. The work of the angel is to help me do precisely this: to provide an image that works across multiple layers of meaning. Angelizing is dangerous practice: sentimentalizing, romanticizing, otherwizing, resonant with images of vacant cherubs and/or simpering Christianity. But my search for angels who exceed our categories of angels has yielded rich returns as I struggle to know what I want from and bring to my encounter with these women with/for/to whom I am doing this inquiry.

Excessive angels I have encountered thus far include Benjamin’s angel of history, looking back with horror at the debris of the twentieth century, blown into a future to which s/he has her back turned. Another is Rilke’s “terrifying” angel, a site for exploring both how we deal with feelings that survive the demise of god and whether we can grow into something greater than we could otherwise when mired in dependence on some god. Even Nietzsche’s “Overman” or “Superman” or “Post-human” can serve as an “angel function” (McHale, 1992:202) in positing that it is through the gesture toward something beyond ourselves that “we live out the immensity” of our lives (Martin, 1991:94; see, also, Heller, 1988:114-115).

Rilke called this the “Too Big.” and it is that concept that I am moving toward as I wrestle with how to engage such issues across a broad audience. The “Too Big” is about confronting the central problem of modernity: the loss of transcendence, whether through god or the proletariat or science. It is also about confronting the immensities of the ordinary: of birth, and change and death. Faced with the Too Big, religion often functions as a containment of people’s depth of feeling (Livingstone, 1984:105). Like Tony Kushner in his Pulitzer and Tony Award winning play, Angels in America, it is these available narratives that we turn to when faced with the unbearable.
Struggling against the scandal of the world, the angel works to resituate a notion of the sacred into human space, what Benjamin termed "profane illumination."


And what, I ask, does all of this have to do with the story of where I want to go with the words of the women in this interview study?

As enacted thus far, my angels are about deferral, as Benjamin deferred writing his arcades project over the twelve years of its unfinished completion. Wanting to "awaken the world from the dream of itself" (Benjamin, quoted in Cohen:22), Benjamin practiced dispersal/deferral as a way to get closer to the thing itself, in all its unrepresentability, the real that always eludes us. In my study, angels feel like an escape: "the Us invading, some force altering the curve, invaders in (the) bloodstream. . . bloodstream visitors" (McElroy, 1987:349) at work against an "abstracted heart" (352). What is the less in me at large in them?

While the urgency regulating my project is not the fascism that so terrorized Benjamin's life into an (unnecessary?) suicide, he, too, was moved toward some urgency of rescue of praxis. The currency of Benjamin in contemporary critical theory circles speaks to the post-marxist pressures of this time, this place. His failures are part of his ongoing critical appeal: "not afraid to pose problems in all their difficulty, he sketched gestures of solution where the most precious intellectual moment is perhaps the point where the gesture breaks down" (Cohen, 1993:18). Benjamin's search for the most adequate form of critical thought in a post-Enlightenment world resulted in a play with rhetorical and poetic effects in order "to incite all manner of irrational states: fascination, enchantment, melancholy, frustration, distraction" (Cohen, 1993:252). Perhaps in my dispersal/deferral of bringing the women to direct representation, the angel functions as a displacement device. At a moment where material forces overwhelm the shock defenses, perhaps the angel marks what it is that I, like Benjamin, want to rescue, what I seek "to articulate but cannot produce from within the Enlightenment horizon of (my) thought" (ibid:219).

Now, I'm not at all sure what that means. But I do know that to understand the angel as a critical gesture means that we are not in Kansas anymore. This is no orthodox marxist notion of critical activity, somewhere other as it is to Marxist faith in the illuminating power of rational critique. Benjamin's angel carries forth an epistemological task: surveying the ruins of the twentieth century, we are confronted with the collapse of the real into its representation. As Cohen (1993) notes, this "in no way dispels, indeed it rather exacerbates, the need for concrete material practice", even as we are suspicious of "the mystifying ends to which enchantment can be put" (259). Rejecting sentimentality, devising a supernatural spectacle with hoped-for resonance in the theoretical sphere, the very dangers of Benjamin's angel may signal its usefulness in my search for a multiply-layered way of telling stories which are not mine.

Perhaps this is the work of the angel: a means of approaching what cannot be near in any other way, some widened space to speak beyond our means. If my co-researcher and myself are to not use AIDS to write romantic paths and tell the tired old story of how difficulties are our tutors, we need a metaphor so outrageous that it alerts people to the heavy hand of our presence as interpreters and meaning-makers in the stories we tell. Encouraging readers to question and criticize our authority regarding narration and method, the angel adds another layer by calling attention to how stories get told. Folding both backward and forward,3 the angel moves us toward a multi-layered weaving of method, the politics of interpretation, data, analysis—all embedded in the tale. These women deserve better than sentimental answers. Whether an intentionally ambiguous and multiply-layered textual practice is adequate, I don't know. But a deliberate, precise sentiment that mobilizes the angel to use sentimentality against itself moves us toward a bivalent text, "a questioning text" (McWilliam, 1992:271) that signals tentativeness and partiality.

In The Writing of the Disaster, Maurice Blanchot (1986) speaks of "falling beneath Disastrous necessity" where "(h)e devotes all his energy to not writing, so that, writing, he should write out of failure, in failure's intensity" (p. 11). Writing out of another relation, "when
CONCLUSION

In a recent Rolling Stone interview, Randy Shilts, author of And the Band Played On, revealed that he found out he was HIV positive as he finished writing the book (Wills, 1993). I knew early on that my own HIV status was an important factor in my positioning in this study. I was tested on August 12 of this year and received the results of my negative status on Sept. 8. I will conclude with some segments from my researcher journal about that experience.

Aug 28: I needed to go through the tension of getting the test and, especially, waiting to hear the results. My recent outbreak of swimmers itch exacerbates my tendency to have a particularly virulent case of the itch, judging by people’s reactions. Does this mean I am HIV+? does each boil mean TOXIN? am I a disease bomb? do my blood blisters mean I am an infectious agent?

I will find out the Wednesday of my return. Part of me doesn’t want to know, if I am positive. I want very much to know if I am negative. It means I am “safe” somehow. I wouldn’t have to worry about being around the babies, for example, with my blood blisters bursting. The boils feel like some kind of warning signal. They are so ugly, so obviously filled with toxic substance. I feel a bit like a leper. Is this some of what M felt when she told the story of her mother following her around with a Clorox bottle when she goes to visit?

The most important thing is that I COULD EASILY be positive. If I am not, it is sheer luck. If I am, it, too, is sheer luck. It’s like a poker hand you get dealt.

Sept. 7: My major feelings the night before I find out my test results and see what side of the we/they fence I am to be on: absolute terror quite ameliorated by my longterm record of good health plus my low chance, given my lack of high-risk behaviors. But my life would be changed, so irrevocably changed. My identity would shift over some chasm and the world would be so very different, including the urgency of this project, the perspective I would bring to it. I would be much more like Francisco Ibanez, 1992 in his study of gay men in Vancouver and Chile: one of, studying across, instead of ‘down’ or, as I seem to be doing, ‘up’. Or maybe not. Maybe the angelizing move has something to do with creating equivalences: we are all angels, or all not angels, or all angels not, or all near angels. It blurs up the distinctions, between we/they, researcher/researched, reader/writer.

If I am not positive, my keen sense of lucky: I could so easily be HIV+. I am caught up in history’s net, one way or the other. But I will be grateful and, I promise, I will be CAREFUL, if allowed to escape this time, this 1993, at the end of this first decade of the epidemic.

If I am positive, my major relating is to K’s story about going off for two months: to not have to face it, to have some time of being her old self, her self without HIV, to not have to tell others and, in the telling, become ‘this HIV+ person’. This is about stealing some time from being swallowed up in the identity of an HIV+ person: the stigma, the reduction of one’s identity, the forced encounters with the medical world, the horrors of a wasting death.

Chris will go with me in the morning to find out. Mary will be with me tomorrow night. In 15 or so hours, I
will know. "Who would have thought that we would come to this," as Rex said, when he gave me the news of Randy's deathwatch.

Sept. 11: So I am HIV-. "Negative women," as Chris said to me after I got the results. And jumping up and down with the joy of it. Now I know what she learned from her dream of June 18: the distance between someone who 'helps' and someone who is in it. Three days after getting the results, it already seems distant, even melodramatic, but it feels a marker of our positioning in this study: non HIV+ women telling stories which are not ours. Such a position cannot escape being, to some extent, part of the traditional spectator-narrator, purveying the less fortunate, parading our good will.

I am 'safe', for now. I promise to be good. I can stop worrying that every skin spot, every tiredness is some sign, a situation I hadn't given much thought to until I had the test. I am so grateful. Maybe now I can write.

REFLEXIVE CODA

Confessional writing is not my cup of tea, but I was fairly satisfied that the preceding was useful in moving toward some emotional shape for this work. Then I received Francisco Ibanez-Carrasco's MA thesis in the mail and was brought up short by how symptomatic my 'confessional narrative' is in terms of my limits in the context of this study.

A HIV+ gay man, Ibanez-Carrasco's ethnography of the translations between official safer sex discourse and the lived experience of men who have sex with men positions him as an 'insider' in contrast to my 'outsider' status. His ability to speak "of 'us' rather than 'them'" (9), to speak from and through as well as for, helps me to see my own operative binaries, particularly my reinscription of what he terms "the infamous HIV+/HIV- dichotomy" (21). We all live with HIV labels, he says; be they positive or negative, we are all caught up in this crisis (11). Rather than binaries, he posits an HIV continuum where, culturally speaking, everyone is at risk and we are all involved because sexuality is a collective phenomenon (16).

Yet, too, it is the HIV positive who are "described and prescribed to exhaustion... before we even get to tell our own stories" (11). Given this, what does it mean to position HIV status as a constructed identity? Quoting Treichler on AIDS as "an epidemic of signification", he writes of how "Those of us living with HIV/AIDS twitch in terror every time someone writes a new magazine column, shoots a new video, or gives yet another 'enlightened workshop'" (38). Particularly worried about how the lives of PWA's are "represented only as sad testimonials" (39), his work fleshes out "the intricate architecture of this HIV positive identity" (35). An immigrant to Canada from a servant-class background, he positions his HIV status as something other than "the main accent of my identity" (37).

In part, Ibanez-Carrasco's investment is in "no sad shit, no confessions, no paternalistic shit" (141). He wants to avoid the melodrama of "overplay(ing) too much the HIV positive status" while keeping such constructivist ideas in fruitful tension with the reality of "the fact that gay men are dying all over the place" (144). It is "the burden of signification that goes with 'being HIV positive'" (185) that he is resisting. Much of the literature treats an HIV diagnosis as "a point of clearance (if positive) or death" (185). "Does it really matter if one is HIV negative? I believe the answer is no. There is no sanctuary for immigrants in North America, there is no sanctuary for HIV positives; we become border dwellers" (198). To have to live out the operations of labelling means to be nomads amidst a politics of fear and containment which has evolved into a paternalistic "politics of care" (208) in which we are all accomplices. But, as his final words note, some are paying a much higher price than others.

Randy Shilts plans on not writing any more about AIDS: "To live it and to write about it is just too much" (Wills, 1993). This, perhaps, creates some space for 'outsiders' to be of use. But where is the outside of this pandemic? Who is this we/they? In earlier work I wrote of Irigaray's concept of the "We-you/I" (Game, 1991:88). There is no 'they' in this concept, only some we of us that joins some you/I. When asked about my HIV status, I thought I had learned to say, "I am not yet to my knowledge HIV positive". But my confessional narrative, written on the heels of getting tested, reverted unproblematically to expected binaries. It took the timely arrival of Francisco's work to confront me with my inability to follow my own advice in creating constantly moving subject positions that fix neither subject nor object.

What is to be done with me? How can I protect the research from myself? Francisco's interest in protecting those who offer their tragedies for public scrutiny via negotiated meaning-making provides a model. Having each interview transcript looked at by three participants, he writes of how "their comments and suggestions kept me contained and did not let the poetics of the interpretative writing run afield from the 'realism' of the interview" (119). He uses the term 'orchestrate' to portray his textual moves; the work of the maestro is relational, a team effort (139). He situates his textual moves as
"benign transgressions, . . . 'power-trips,' categories imposed, assumptions invoked, and biased words chosen by this researcher in order to give these interviews a life". These are by no means innocent, but they are, he argues, "the least harmful to the participants, the researcher, and the body politics. Had I not been arrogant at points and decided upon many of these issues of representation I would have drowned myself in some sort of desperate nihilism or relativism." (135). I find these words refreshing in their acknowledgement of the inevitable interpretive weight of a researcher in telling data stories. While our research plan includes having the women read the manuscript and write themselves into the text with their reactions to our storying of their lives, it is we, Chris and I, whose job it is to give form to their words.

ANGEL CODA

As I end this paper so that we might begin this task, I turn yet again to my angels in order to locate myself in the problematic of this text. McElroy (1987) writes "We wanted to hear voices. And then we did, but while the voices were promising and bored down from a cloud of near-angel voices . . . they proved to be a band of tortured archaeologists, or anthropologists anyhow: pros, but tortured by doubts. . . they were sitting on something big . . . " (27). In McElroy, angels are both "the gap between" and "the threshold into which we turn to see the other" (35). We are them, they are us, either more and less: "Who is this 'We'? We have but to ask when lo! it curves piecemeal off breakneck into nowhere, we shouldn't have asked. Was it these angel relations trying to change their lives? Have we learned to breathe together? . . . We have to learn all over again. And isn't this hard when we ourselves are always at the beginning of ourselves?" (16)

What is it I have come to this project to understand? What does it mean to know more than we are able to know, to write toward what we don't understand? What is the "Either/And" (340)? In the laboratory of my thought about this project, "and remembering the larger thing of which the telling was a part while being told by a part of this inquiry a space for outself-growing?"

Try to be successful at not saying all that needs saying, I shall end with a prose poem from McElroy:

Where did we learn to do that?
We were together.
Let's try it without sound.
We already are.
You rippling?

All ripple.

. . .
So we'll go together.
One on one.
Let's be nude.
You already are.

ENDNOTES

1. For work on women and AIDS, see Act Up/NY Women and AIDS Book Group, 1990; Bury et al, 1992; Meredith, 1992.

2. Other possible titles: A Curve of Angels, An Alchemy of Angels, An Ache of Wings (my present favorite, especially if the 1905 Paul Klee etching, The Hero With the Wing, can be used), Standing With/in Angels, Near Angels, A Place of Use of Angels, Interrogating Angels, Troubling Angels, The Homework of Angels, A Workshop of Angels . . .

3. Thanks to Mimi Orner for help with this idea of Book I folding both backward into some past and forward into Book II that is not yet.

REFERENCES


Encouraging Young Women to Study Engineering and the Physical Sciences

ANN-MARIE ANDERSON

INTRODUCTION

In the past, universities were bastions of traditional male values and occupations. Women who dared to darken the portals were too frequently relegated to sitting outside the lecture room door, to non-existent practical facilities, and to little or no recognition from their male colleagues and lecturers. But the few brave women who completed undergraduate studies, or perhaps even postgraduate studies, opened many doors for those of us who were to follow.

In recent years, Australian universities have achieved an approximately equal intake of men and women to their undergraduate courses. However, it does not follow that women are equally represented in all courses. Some areas have more than fifty percent female enrolments (e.g. arts, education, and the life sciences), whereas others have significantly less than 50 percent female enrolments. The chief areas in the latter are engineering and the physical sciences.

As a response to the poor representation of women in these disciplines, the University of Western Australia established the Women in Science and Engineering (WISE) Project in 1989. The project aims at increasing the number of females studying and obtaining degrees in engineering, mathematics, and the physical sciences.

This paper outlines the status of the WISE project in the context of the currently accepted factors influencing the participation of women in these areas. It will become clear, that despite some encouraging progress, especially in engineering, there are still significant challenges to face in the future.

FEMALE PARTICIPATION RATES

The participation rate of women in the physical sciences and engineering is significantly lower than in most other courses. Table 1 shows that in 1989, amongst 259 first year enrolments in Engineering 100, there were just 23 women (8.9%). By 1992, this figure had risen to 60 women out of a total of 346 (17.3%). Mathematics 100 showed a similar increase - 66 out of 399 (16.5%) in 1989 to 112 out of 489 (22.9%) in 1992. However, students enrolled in Engineering 100 are required to study Mathematics 100. So, excluding engineering enrollments from Mathematics 100, shows that in 1989 there were 43 women out of a total of 140 (30.7%). By 1992, this had shown a moderate increase to 52 out of 143 (36.4%).

In the same years, Chemistry 100 enrolments have fallen from 77 out of 173 (44.5%) to 64 out of 167 (38.3%). Others, including Computer Science 100, Geology 100, and Physics 100 have remained fairly steady. Thus the healthy increase observed in Engineering 100 is not evident in the physical sciences. However, female enrolments in a Bachelor of Science degree have risen from 371 out of 779 (47.6%) in 1989 to 420 out of 822 (51.1%) in 1992. Now women account for more than half of first year BSc enrolments. What subjects are they studying?

Female biology enrolments in first year were 50 out of 122 (41.0%) in 1989. By 1992, they were 122 out of 233 (52.4%). Similarly, Botany shows a change from 22 out of 49 (44.9%) to 57 out of 122 (46.7%). Chemistry 120 (mostly intended for those students who do not wish to major in Chemistry) has risen from 117 women out of 275 (42.5%) to 212 women out of 385 (55.1%). Clearly, despite the increased participation of women in science, the life sciences continue to be more attractive than the physical sciences.

Studying first year enrolments only gives half the picture. Trends in graduate statistics must also be examined. Tables 2 and 3 show the Bachelor Pass and Bachelor Honours completion statistics for 1989 through to 1992.

In 1989, 4 women out of a total of 67 completed their Bachelor of Engineering degrees. By 1992, this had risen to 6 out of 58. The Bachelor of Science completions in our target areas dropped from 33 out of 126 to 24 out of 108. This drop might be attributed to the introduction of the combined Science and Engineering degree. This course became available in 1988, and first year enrolment numbers have increased rapidly since that time. Completion of the degree takes five years of full-time study, rather than four for Engineering and three (or four with Honours) for Science. As a result, temporary decreases in degree completion figures are expected whilst this course becomes an established part of the system.

At the Honours level, 4 women out of 52 completed their BE(Hons) in 1989. By 1992 these figures had risen...
to 10 out of 64, with a further 3 out of 5 completing their BSc/BE with Honours. The BSc(Hons) completions in our target areas remained steady at 16 out of 51 in 1989 and 16 out of 63 in 1992. Clearly, the steady progress being made in engineering is not evident in the physical sciences and mathematics.

Finally, Table 4 shows the PhD completions over the 1989 to 1992 period. The number of women completing their doctorates in these areas is very low. Hence, there is a dearth of women able to take up positions as lecturers and consequently, these departments remain, as in the past, areas of male predominance.

FACTORS INHIBITING FEMALE PARTICIPATION

When they have just as much ability as their male counterparts, why do so few girls enter these disciplines? The reasons given for this are many and varied, with researchers spending much time identifying the problems and proposing possible solutions.

In a comprehensive research project, Professor Eileen Byrne identified the following ten factors as possible influences on female participation in science and technology:

1. Same sex role models
2. Mentors
3. Image of science and technology
4. Male and female attitudes
5. Single sex vs. coeducational learning environment
6. Prerequisites and curricular choice
7. Maths as a critical filter
8. Careers education and vocational guidance
9. Women's support networks
10. Affirmative action (intervention strategies).

It should be noted however that the influence of these factors are not consistent for each education level. They are found in varying degree and impact in the transition from school to higher education, the transition from first year undergraduate to final year major (especially with respect to the way the choice of that major is affected by these factors), and from undergraduate to postgraduate studies.

These factors can also be combined to describe typical scenarios inhibiting female participation in science and technology. At high school level for example, many girls do not take the advanced maths and science subjects that are prerequisites for the university level courses in the physical sciences and engineering. This is generally attributed to several factors, including gender bias toward males in maths and science curricula, evidence that boys tend to dominate classroom and teacher time in these subjects, and the lack of a history of experience which girls have in these areas.

At a recent Careers Evening for Year 9 girls, one speaker highlighted the variety of careers in electrical and electronic engineering. A number of the girls attending responded on their questionnaires with comments such as:

"I didn't know that the environment was involved in engineering. It just sounded like machines and motors until now."

Many of our programmes have demonstrated that girls and their parents are not aware of the diversity of careers encompassed by science and engineering. Rather, they are still 'guided' by stereotypical images and so generally are pleasantly surprised to have this variety of options revealed.

At the University undergraduate level, the problem becomes more complex. Having crossed the hurdles described above, women face new challenges. The lack of mentors (male or female) and same sex role models can be a negative influence for those girls seeking encouragement and guidance in their studies, whilst for others it presents no problem at all. Once again curriculum gender bias is often evident, and the need for support networks is frequently recognised by the female students enrolled in these courses, especially if that support is not available amongst their family and friends.

Finally, at the postgraduate level or in the wider workforce, women in all fields face the problems of combining career with family. This is especially true of postgraduate research in the physical sciences and engineering, where it is very difficult to combine family commitments with the demands of experimental research. As such, very few women complete doctorates in these fields, which has a flow-on effect of limiting the number of female teachers and role models at this level. This remains a significant challenge for the future.

REMEDIES

In order to effect successful change, the intervention strategies and programmes to tackle these problems ideally need to be all encompassing. It is not sufficient to target only one or two of the factors listed in the previous section, because the other factors form a counterbalance negating any positive change caused by the intervention. However, this is indeed the usual approach in the real
world. Financial constraints usually limit the intervention strategies so that only a few factors can be targeted at any one time. As a consequence the ultimate success of the programme may be inhibited. Alternatively, a number of factors can be challenged but on a very small population.

To date, WISE has tackled at least four of the factors. With respect to the total target population, the numbers reached have been quite small. Programmes are primarily aimed at factors 1, 6, 7, and 8 and indirectly at factor 3. The majority of programmes target girls in Years 10, 11, and 12. Career nights, workshops, and school visits encourage girls to study advanced maths and science subjects at TEE level, and then to consider careers in the physical science and engineering fields. Undergraduate students in their first year of study at UWA are invited to social functions to help establish informal support networks. The image of science is indirectly targeted as all speakers and tutors are actively encouraged to show the relevance of their fields to the real world.

Response from participating students, parents, and teachers is an important part of all programmes. Most attendees at WISE functions fill out questionnaires at the completion of the programme. The key points are as follows:

1. Hands-on workshops are very well received, giving girls a chance to try things that they might otherwise miss at school.
2. The chance to meet and hear the experiences of female professionals is very important, giving girls a sense that they too can achieve these goals.
3. The access to information about courses and careers is extremely helpful.

Examination of the response for the last four to five years of operation reveals that all programmes have been assessed by the attendees as successful. Whilst there have been constructive suggestions for change and improvement, the majority of parents, teachers, and most importantly students, have regarded the programmes as being useful, helpful, informative, and enjoyable.

Given this consistently positive reception, why is it that there has been progress in engineering but not in the physical sciences? The success in engineering is probably due to a combination of efforts from WISE, the Engineering Departments at universities, and at a wider level, the Institute of Engineers, encouraging female participation. In other words there is an emphasis on encouraging women into engineering at all levels of the profession, which is beginning to bear fruit.

The physical sciences have not shown the same level of progress, despite consistently increasing levels of female enrolment in Bachelor of Science courses. WISE is at best maintaining the status quo in these fields. This might be due to the fact that the project reaches only a small population of older girls who have possibly established the broad boundaries of their career interests. The programmes are preaching to the converted - those who already have a demonstrated interest and ability in these fields. The effect of WISE is then to reinforce and encourage these girls, rather than attracting any new young women.

**The Future**

From the previous sections, the crucial question must be asked, how does WISE move forward to achieve a more successful link between process and outcome? We have several avenues available to revise our existing strategies.

The first is to move some of the focus of our programmes to younger students. It has already been noted that girls in Years 10, 11, and 12 have partially set the broad boundaries of their interests which is reinforced by their subject choices. Response from many of our programmes has shown that this older age group attend because they have already recognised an interest in these fields. Their purpose in attending is then to find out more information and confirm that interest.

If we move to a younger age group, can we expect a different style of response? Recent experience has suggested that this is the case. On a visit to Katanning Senior High School in August 1993, students were given the opportunity to browse through and select leaflets which described the full range of courses in science and engineering at UWA. Year 10, 11, and 12 students were observed to be selective in their choice of leaflets, only taking those which they had already decided were their areas of interest. On the other hand, Year 8 and 9 students took many more leaflets (some taking one of everything!) because they had not yet decided their main areas of interest. In other words, the older age group used WISE as a source of information but their attitudes to science and engineering were already determined. The younger age group were much more open to suggestions, so that WISE had a role in stimulating their interest in science and engineering.

These observations have been confirmed by a recent Year 9 Careers Evening held at UWA by WISE. The evening was very heavily booked with many students being placed on a waiting list to attend. Those who were able to come responded very positively, indicating that
they found the evening interesting and informative. Typical comments on questionnaires included

"I learnt there can be a lot of fun and enjoyment in science. Unlike my science lessons at school, I thoroughly enjoyed it."

"I never knew what engineering was and I thought it would have been boring. Now I have a different view and it seems quite exciting."

These results have encouraged us to put in place a more comprehensive programme for Year 8 and 9 girls in 1994.

A second avenue for changing strategy is to modify the role of WISE to make it more effective. As we stand now, the project operates in many ways as a lone soldier. Closer active links with a broader cross-section of community groups are now being established. For example, direct contact with teacher groups at both primary and secondary level will allow us to pass on information about careers in science and engineering which can be disseminated to much larger groups of schoolgirls. Similarly, contact with industrial groups or professional organisations could yield collaborative programmes which again achieve our goal of reaching a much larger pool of students.

CONCLUSION

In On the Edge of Discovery: Australian Women in Science, Sue Lewis writes:

"There is a hiatus between the reality of the current practice of science and the vision of what the practice of science could be for our society and environment."

Groups such as WISE stand their best chance of success via collaborative programmes like those described in the previous section. The project’s activity in subject and careers guidance, support network, and counselling is extremely important. These roles must be maintained as they respond to individual and evolving needs of the students. However, at the same time collaboration will lead to a more holistic approach, one which stands a far better chance of real success. It is imperative that scientists, educators, politicians, and the general community become involved in reestablishing the importance of science and engineering in Australia, and thus the relevance of these careers to the bright young men, and more especially women, in our schools. For it is hoped that the increased female participation will change some of the norms in the scientific world, and lead to a group of disciplines where there is gender balance.
### Table 1

First year female enrolment numbers, total enrolment numbers and percentage female enrolments for the years 1989 to 1992 in the major physical science and engineering subjects.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>F</td>
<td>T</td>
<td>%F</td>
<td>F</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chemistry 100</td>
<td>77</td>
<td>173</td>
<td>44.5</td>
<td>88</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Computer Science 100</td>
<td>72</td>
<td>251</td>
<td>28.7</td>
<td>60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Geology 100</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>84</td>
<td>35.7</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mathematics 100</td>
<td>66</td>
<td>399</td>
<td>16.5</td>
<td>78</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mathematics 100/Engineering 100</td>
<td>43</td>
<td>140</td>
<td>30.7</td>
<td>36</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Physics 100</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>55</td>
<td>20.0</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Engineering 100</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>259</td>
<td>8.9</td>
<td>42</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* Geology 100 and Geology 105 combined

### Table 2A

Bachelor of Engineering course completions at the Pass level showing female completions, total completions and percentage female completions for the years 1989 to 1992.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>F</td>
<td>T</td>
<td>%F</td>
<td>F</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Civil Engineering</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>0.0</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Electrical Engineering</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>0.0</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Electronic Engineering</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>19.0</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mechanical Engineering</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>0.0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Environmental Engineering</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0.0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Information Technology</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0.0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Totals</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>67</td>
<td>6.0</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Table 2B

Bachelor of Science course completions at the Pass level showing female completions, total completions and percentage female completions for the years 1989 to 1992.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>F</td>
<td>T</td>
<td>%F</td>
<td>F</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Computer Science</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>25.0</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chemical Physics</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0.0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Geology</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>28.0</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Information Technology</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>27.3</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mathematics</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>22.2</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Organic Chemistry</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>30.0</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Phys and Inorg Chemistry</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>43.8</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chemistry</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>42.1</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Physics</td>
<td>33</td>
<td>126</td>
<td>26.2</td>
<td>32</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

NB All figures exclude fee-paying overseas students, because in the main they are not reached by our school based programmes.
**TABLE 3A**

Bachelor of Engineering course completions at the Honours level showing female completions, total completions and percentage female completions for the years 1989 to 1992.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Bachelor Honours Completions</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>T</td>
<td>%F</td>
<td>F</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Civil Engineering</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>0.0</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Electrical Engineering</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>9.1</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Electronic Engineering</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>15.8</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mechanical Engineering</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>0.0</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Environmental Engineering</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Information Technology</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Totals</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>52</td>
<td>7.7</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**TABLE 3B**

Bachelor of Science course completions at the Honours level showing female completions, total completions and percentage female completions for the years 1989 to 1992.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Bachelor Honours Completions</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>T</td>
<td>%F</td>
<td>F</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Computer Science</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>16.7</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chemical Physics</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0.0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Geology</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>43.8</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Information Technology</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0.0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mathematics</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>22.2</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Organic Chemistry</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>50.0</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Phys and Inorg Chemistry</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>50.0</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chemistry</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Physics</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>20.0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Totals</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>51</td>
<td>31.4</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**TABLE 4**

Doctor of Philosophy course completions at the Pass level showing female completions, total completions and percentage female completions for the years 1989 to 1992.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Bachelor Honours Completions</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>T</td>
<td>%F</td>
<td>F</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Civil Engineering</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0.0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Computer Science</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0.0</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Electrical &amp; Electronic Eng</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0.0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Electrical Engineering</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0.0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Electronic Engineering</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0.0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Geology</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>0.0</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mathematics</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>50.0</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mechanical Engineering</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>33.3</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Organic Chemistry</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>16.7</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Phys and Inorg Chemistry</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>16.7</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Physics</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0.0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Totals</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>18.2</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

NB All figures exclude fee-paying overseas students, because in the main they are not reached by our school based programmes.
In 1992 I instigated the formation of a study group for female dentists in Perth, Western Australia. I had three main reasons for forming the group.

Firstly, in 1989 whilst I was a postgraduate student in the Dental Faculty of the University of Melbourne I noticed that many dentists, both male and female, were members of informal study groups. This complemented their membership of other, more formal Dental study groups, and enhanced the quality of their professional lives.

Secondly, I had many female friends in Perth who were dentists. Women were in the minority when I trained in the late 70's, and students from the different years tended to gravitate towards each other, forming lasting friendships.

The third reason was a personal ambition to see female dentists acquire a higher profile within the dental community of Perth, and in doing so, hopefully generate more opportunities for women in postgraduate education and other areas of the profession. But I knew that any overt political goals or feminist agenda that I might have would destroy the group before it had started. Therefore, I needed a strategy that did not confront, but attracted women to the group.

I gathered a group of 7 friends who are all qualified dentists at a Perth restaurant on January 30th 1992 and formed the committee. It was decided at this first committee meeting to name the group after the first female graduate from the degree course at UWA. We had no idea who this woman would be, and after some detective work it was with great pleasure that we discovered she was Dr Sally Joyston-Bechal who graduated in 1951 with first class honours. First class honours are relatively rare in the dental faculty at UWA and as students we were only aware of the handful of men who had achieved this honour over the years.

Sally worked at the Perth Dental Hospital as a House Surgeon from her graduation until 1954. She was then awarded a Fulbright Scholarship and in 1956 completed her M.S. at the University of Rochester, New York, U.S.A. In 1967 she became a fellow of the Royal Australasian College of Dental Surgeons, and in 1972 completed her Ph.D. at the University of London. Since 1956 Dr Joyston-Bechal has been involved in research and has published widely.

We wrote to Sally and asked her if she would allow us to name the group after her. Sally agreed. I have since met her in London where she is currently the Senior Lecturer (full-time) and Honorary Consultant in the Department of Oral Medicine and Periodontology, at The London Hospital Medical College. Sally is not only a well respected academic, but also a wonderful person.

We then had the task of actually contacting all women dentists in the state of Western Australia and forming the group. It was decided at the first committee meeting to approach approximately 30 female dentists in Perth and test the waters to see if the concept of a female dental group would succeed. The committee donated $20 dollars each to pay for postage, and a letter was sent to these 30 women explaining the aim of the group, and inviting them to the inaugural meeting.

We decided to hold four dinner meetings a year at which a guest speaker would be asked to present a non-dental topic of interest to women. The idea of having non-dental topics initially was to avoid criticism by our male colleagues that they were being excluded from dental presentations. We decided to focus on women speakers for the first two years. These included a plastic surgeon, psychologist, lawyer and media personality. Some members have recently requested dental topics to be presented by the few women dental specialists we have in the state, and we will be including this in our program in the future.

There are many formal dental study groups in Perth that women can and do join, attending meetings with male colleagues. (There is a study group in Perth currently consisting of thirty male dentists. Membership is by invitation only. Sally Joyston-Bechal was a founding member of this group in the 1950’s, but somehow over the years women were not invited to join!).

The first meeting of the Women’s Dental Study Group was held on the 5th of March 1992 at the Royal Freshwater Bay Yacht club. Dr Carmel Goodman, a sports physician, spoke on women’s health and fitness. The concept of the group was accepted, but most of the discussion on the night revolved around how to avoid
offending our male colleagues, and whether in this age of equality it was in fact legal to have such a 'sexist' group. The women certainly did not feel that it was their right to equality; it was in fact legal to have such a 'sexist' group offending our male colleagues, and whether in this age of equality it was in fact legal to have such a 'sexist' group.

We wrote to the President of the WA branch of the Australian Dental Association and received his acceptance and support. The following information was used to promote the group within the dental fraternity in Perth.

"The aim of the group is to provide female dentists with a social forum to maintain friendships and contacts and most importantly, to enrich their professional lives. My intention is that the group be 'everything to everybody'. We hope to encourage new graduates to join so that the group does not develop an 'older' image. We also hope the group will provide an opportunity for retired dentists to stay in contact with their friends. Many graduates do not practice at all, and I am hoping that these women will also attend and enjoy the fellowship. Those women who are not local graduates will be able to use the group to meet many WA colleagues. Any women dentist is welcome to attend the meetings, whether they practise dentistry or not.

Retraining for women who have taken time off to have children is available in the UK and is one of the many issues we hope to address in the future. It is our intention to have close ties and work in harmony with the Australian Dental Association (ADA). The formation of our group last year coincided with the visit to Australia of the first female president of the American Dental Association, Geraldine Morrow. It was reported in the ADA News Bulletin that she had instigated initiatives which "...focus on making the most of an important new development in American Dentistry, a phenomenal increase in the number of women who are entering dental school and preparing for careers in the profession." It is not our intention to create any barriers between men and women in the profession, but to enhance the relationship between women and their chosen profession."

At the first meeting there were two young dentists who refused to believe there was a need for a womens group in this age of equality. I hoped the opinions of these young women reflected their training and work experiences lacking discrimination, rather than them not recognising it. One of these women had graduated in England and had recently arrived in Western Australia. She has since joined the group. The other never will!

A close friend I had invited to join the committee refused on the grounds that she had never been discriminated against and felt she was a Dentist, not specifically a female dentist. Since the birth of her first child, she attends meetings and is now interested in the group. I am convinced that if we wanted to form a sewing circle, no one would have shown the slightest bit of interest in our endeavours. Were we stepping out of our assigned domain, or is the change in itself a threat to both those involved as well as those excluded?

The only other negative reaction of note was from an older woman who asked why we were alienating those men who had supported women dentists in the past. It had not occurred to her to ask why women had needed their special support in the first place. She is now attends regularly.

The agony for me was having to deal with these women or 'unbelievers'. I respected their views, but despaired at their apathy. The ecstasy is seeing all the women assembled together. I always feel incredibly elated when the women gather for a meeting. The feelings I have and reasons for them are difficult to verbalise.

As I have indicated at the time it was known that a similar group operated in Sydney and Brisbane, but we now know that large groups exist in both the UK and the USA. In Perth there are also professional women's groups in Engineering, Law, and Architecture. We no longer actively try to attract members to the group. We have a core of 50 members, but once a year we do send a notice to all female dentists in the state with the dates of our meetings and invite them to attend.

For many years men have been members of groups such as the Masons and Rotary, and have used their membership of these groups to enhance their careers. Thanks to equal opportunity legislation most of these groups have recently been accessible to women. So once again women follow in their male colleagues' footsteps becoming part of their culture developed over many years by men, and deny themselves the right to explore and develop their own uniquely female culture in the professional work place.

There is no doubt that our group has been a success. How long the group continues to exist is another question. The women's Medical study group in Perth has recently discontinued due to falling membership. To avoid this we try and attract young graduates to the group, offering them free membership for the year following graduation.

I studied Dental Science from 1977 - 1981. Women at this time were in the minority and I believe we became
part of a predominantly male workplace culture without consciously realising it. There were not any female academic staff to provide role models for the female students. There were a few female dentists who demonstrated to students. These women were extremely kind and approachable, but they did not have postgraduate qualifications and therefore did not have senior status.

Professional women today are asking themselves how they want to live their professional lives. Most of us are so busy with being carers and coping with careers interrupted by child rearing, that we just don't have time to address this issue. By meeting four times a year with other women who have a similar university background, work pressures and lifestyle, maybe we can begin to answer some of the questions.
It is ironic that in a period of 'economic crisis' and so called crisis in leadership in public life accompanying widescale restructuring of the workplace and education, that women are seen to be a source of new forms of leadership. In a time in which exchange relationships are supplanting social relationships in market oriented education systems, women are now seen to have the capacities necessary for better mediating social relationships because of their capacities for emotional management, and possession of communicative and facilitative skills. In this paper I wish to explore the contradictory ways in which women in leadership are positioned in the new 'hard' times of educational management. I first consider the nature of the post-modern condition and the arguments mounted regarding the need for new organisational forms and new leadership. I then relate this to the Victorian context and self-managing schools. Thirdly, I consider how these inform new ways of thinking about leadership and in turn how women's under-representation in leadership have come to be a 'problem' within this context. Finally, I consider the implications of recent restructuring for women.

Historically, the leadership literature has emphasised leadership as a form of individual action and capacities, ranging from charismatic views of leadership in the 1960's social movements reliant upon personality and mystique to the contingency theories of the 1970's and the notion of leaders as culture builders during the 1980's (e.g. Duignan, 1991). In each leadership was matching specific contexts (organisational, historical) to particular discrete leadership attributes (charismatic leaders) or leadership styles (democratic, authoritarian) or as managing organisational cultures. The wider socio-economic context within which organisations are framed was treated as given (eg in terms of required structures, efficiencies and economies) and unproblematic. This paper is about how context (organisational, local and global) cannot be ignored as macro/micro and global/local distinctions blur. The context of the 1980's has been very much that of restructuring of work. Why has women's under-representation in leadership become an issue in this period?

NEW SCHOOLS FOR NEW HARD TIMES?

The rhetoric of educational restructuring has been premised upon the view that we need new schools (and new organisational forms more generally) to meet the demands of the post-modern condition (Bagguley, et al. 1990). The moves therefore towards self managing schools and devolution of public administration can be seen as manifestations of both the conditions and expression of the post modern tendencies to deregulate both institutions and individuals. John Hinkson, drawing upon culturalist approaches to post modernism, talks about the paradox which typifies arguments about post-modernity - the reference to historical tradition at the same time as to variety and diversity, and of how diversity undermines historical cultural forms. Post modernist thought rejects universals and privileges discourses of difference whilst at the same time the new communications revolution has produced a global village that does not diversify but indeed produces a 'unified space' which integrates all into a world culture and undermines culturally differentiated space by directly linking the global to the local (Hinkson 1991). Heterogeneous forms are therefore held together through this post modern space.

This also has localised, institutional implications. Hinkson argues that the post-modern refers to a general change in the character of social life, but that these can be examined in relatively isolated spheres of institutional practice because the global impacts so significantly upon the local. Any analysis of state educational restructuring or even of a self managing school and the discourse surrounding their introduction is a manifestation of the global at the local level. Indeed, Lyotard's as other post modernists argument is that bureaucracy and the state are noise-impediments to the new communicational possibilities of the information age. Hinkson further suggests that a consequence of this argument is the emphasis on deregulation and in particular the destabilising of modern bureaucratic
The central principle of work facilitated by communication and information technology is yet to be contested. The market was treated as homogeneous and infinite. The assumption here is that workers are capable of better understanding the needs of the customer and therefore should be given the opportunity to be actively involved in decisions about their work organisation. Improved worker satisfaction will arise and workers will be more committed and prepared to change. The emphasis is on good work cultures, participative decision making, horizontal or flat organisations and self-regulation for quality (e.g., performance appraisal, quality circles). It is on professional autonomy, good information and communication systems, and budgetary discretion.

Another but similar argument draws from debates over Fordism/post-Fordism originating from the labour process perspective. New forms of organisation, it is argued, are required as we shift into post-Fordist forms of work practice. Fordism is generally used to describe work organisation originating early in the 20th C when mass production came into being - the central principle of work organisation was the separation of jobs into discrete small and simple tasks, a hierarchical organisation with direct lines of supervision and control, a separation between those who conceived how the task should be done (management) and those who executed the task (worker). The market was treated as homogeneous and infinite. Profit or value added was gained through volume of production. There was built in wastage (20%) due to sabotage, wastefulness, bad production etc.

The assumptions underlying this Fordist work organisation included the belief that most workers needed supervision and lacked capacity for autonomous thinking or interest in a general overview of the organisation, that they were motivated merely by monetary rewards/or coercion, and therefore that organisations had to be organised hierarchically. This is very much the scientific management view of organisations which emphasises vertical pyramid style structures, control, surveillance and output.

The 'new' Post-Fordist image of organisations emphasises consumption not production. The focus is upon meeting specialist and individual consumer needs, i.e., niche marketing. The market is here conceptualised as being finite. Work therefore has to be reorganised in a more flexible way, where those at the workface have to be able to quickly read and adapt to market demands. 'Value adding' comes through better use of human resources i.e., people and technology. Production systems are devolved to semi-autonomous units in which relatively autonomous and multi-skilled workers can take on a diversity of tasks to produce customised products. The market here is also now seen as global as well as local and multifaceted with notions of niche targets within the universalising tendencies of the global market.

The optimistic view of the advocates of post-Fordist scenarios of work restructuring (e.g., Mathews, 1989) is questionable, particularly when it relates to women and equity more generally. First, there is only partial evidence to support the view that work could be described as either Fordist or post-Fordist. Certainly recent labour market data tends to suggest that the outlook is less optimistic and that rather than all workers needing to be upgraded in their skills through retraining to meet the more complex and highly technological workplace, that there is an increased polarisation between the workers who are employed in highly specialist technical or management positions i.e., intellectual labour with full employment benefits, positions largely dominated by white middle class males, and the increasing majority employed in casual labour part time, a trend exacerbated with the reduction in middle income workers, employment largely dominated by women, migrants and youth? (Gregory 1992)

Women indeed have been the source of major growth in employment in part time casual sector for the last few years whereas there has been a significant reduction in full time employment of white males in middle management (Fincher, 1989). This fits more the model of flexible specialisation (Piore and Sabel 1984) which talks about how work is being reorganised in a centre-periphery model (Watkins 1990) which maintain particular sets of power.
and economic relations. Whilst Piore and Sabel recognise the political and social dimensions of work restructuring, they, as most post-Fordist analysts, are gender blind.

Second, restructuring in Australia as in other western democracies, as Belinda Probert argues, is indeed the response to the globalising influences of international capital accumulation (Probert 1993). Fordism was characterised by the social compact between labour and capital post war, the acceptance of state intervention and regulation in the economy, and greater mechanisms to control the international economic order with the rise of the welfare state. Women have benefited and indeed become dependent upon the male-run state in place of individual men. Post Fordist responses have significantly altered these. Probert calls upon the arguments of Castells who suggests that capital uses a variety of strategies to increase profit and weaken labour ranging from shifting production offshore to confrontation with the unions to exploiting less unionised labour sectors (casual, women, migrants). State intervention in turn has shifted from social redistribution, political legitimation and mediation of labour/capital agreements (e.g. national awards) to facilitating political domination and capital accumulation (e.g. enterprise bargaining). Current indications suggest that the impact of this form of deregulation is more likely to favour particular jobs largely dominated by white men with the capacity to negotiate and disadvantage most women in less powerfully situated work locations. So whilst restructuring has taken on different forms in specific national contexts, this seemingly neutral term has significant political and social implications in terms of human costs resulting from moves to regain high profit levels through retrenchment and work restructuring to increase productivity (Castells 1991).

And finally, a major consequence of internationalisation and deregulation is that economies no longer coincide with national boundaries. Indeed, current dominant debates over republicanism could be seen to be attempts to revitalise the notion of the state and nationhood through other than economic means. Indeed, the internationalisation of the discourses of educational restructuring and management has produced a universalising discourse which portrays devolution as a mode of management which is beneficial regardless of national or cultural context (Blackmore 1993). Sassen argues that geographical decentralisation of production and services globally is leading to global cities which are the focus and articulation of these new exchange relationships at both the global and local level (Sassen 1991) Sassen also points out that these communication and information technologies are essential in the geographical decentralisation of production and service, for they are essential to maintain control whilst allowing for the separation between core and periphery for the only truly essential aspects of corporate control is at the centre and control are increasingly through information feedback systems. (Sassen 1991) Again, this is replicated at the organisational level as organisations increasingly devolve to semi-autonomous units at the workface but maintain control through information and communication systems. At the same time, the implications are that whilst such manifestations occur in the private sector, the growth of the global city has led to the accumulation of government and corporate debt, as these growth centres are divorced from their locality and nationality as they are not reliant on either local or national markets.

Indeed, the more the economy becomes interdependent on a global scale, the less can regional and local governments, as they exist today, act upon the basic mechanisms that condition the daily existence of their citizens. The traditional structures of social and political control over the development, work and distribution, have been subverted by the faceless logic and internationalised economy enacted by means of information flows (Castells, 1991, p. 347 ). This argument also signals that global/local interactions have particular social political and cultural ramifications in that social relationships are being supplanted by exchange relationships at the national and local level. This leads to changing relationships between individuals, between individual and the state and for regional societies and local institutions. There are fundamental changes occurring in the relationship between the state and the individual (especially women and ‘other’ disadvantaged groups). With the state’s withdrawal from areas of welfare, education and health, the responsibility for these previously publically funded services is being shifted either onto the individual (user pays) or the family unit (and usually women as primary carers of young, aged, unemployed and sick). Devolution in education is merely one aspect of the dismantling of the public sector and welfare state. Furthermore, in each instance, whether in Sweden, Sri Lanka, Canada, New Zealand, UK and Mexico devolution has been accompanied by a cutback in public funding and privatisation (Blackmore 1993). Governments of all political persuasions have utilised devolution as a mode of administration which enables the reduction of public expenditure (as required due to unparalleled state and national debts resulting from the deregulation and internationalisation of the market during the 1980’s by
'passing the crisis down the line' (Watkins 1992) whilst simultaneously tightening the links between the economy and education through strong policy frames.

In turn, new modes of citizenship develop from these new social relationships (Boli 1989). Boli argues that what was previously education was a service; relationships between citizen and government are now being refugured as an exchange of goods between and individual client or consumer and an industry. This constructs commercial and competitive relationships between individual consumers of education for limited resources. But the language of restructuring is not a language of democratic citizenship. Quite the opposite, it is the language of the market, of individual choice and consumer rights rather than communitarian or social responsibility. Whereas the language of communitarian citizenship recognises social relationships, the language of the market is based upon relationships of contract and exchange. It is a shift in focus from person rights to property rights. Property rights of liberal political theory vests in individuals the power to enter into social relationships on the basis of their economic rights, notions of free contract and voluntary exchange. Person rights are invested in an individual merely on the grounds of their membership of a social collectivity. These require equal treatment of citizens, freedom of expression and movement, equal access to participation in decision making and reciprocity in terms of power and authority (Quoted in Apple, 1991).

Hinkson makes a similar point when he argues that the notion of self alters from one of the unity of the modern self in which information is internalised to the post modern selves or multiplicities of self in which the self relates to information as an externality which creates new images of self. Hence the teacher is best engaged in promoting 'how to learn about learning' and gaining access to the information bank rather than teaching knowledge, the flexible multi skilled student. Terri Seddon discusses the notion of the 'value added teacher' emerging in a recent spate of national reports in Australia (Schools Council: Teacher Quality: an Issues Paper 1989 and more recently the National Project on Teacher Quality) (Seddon 1991). A good teacher is therefore a competent performer according to a given prescription...one who is highly skilled professionally but who is also flexible, a good team worker, cooperative and is aware of the links between industry and education. Likewise, the post modern administrator is engaged in facilitating, communicating and enabling others to better manage their own work practices rather than prescribing what to do and how to do it ie multi skilled administrator who has little substantive knowledge of the field of practice. Substantive issues become reduced to image making and language. Victor Soucek talks about the nature of the post-Fordist school, student and teacher which is implied from this logic of deregulation (Soucek 1992). As Robertson points out whilst the rhetoric calls for flexibility and diversity, the imperative is towards hyper-rationalisation of the teaching and learning process with an emphasis on standardisation and outcomes e.g. competency movement in curriculum and assessment. (Mayer, Finn and Carmichael Reports 1992) (Robertson 1992). In turn these imperatives are framed and informed by global influences and agendas by such international bodies as the OECD and World Bank e.g. OECD Quality of Schools (1990).

The administrative form that restructuring has taken is devolution where the centralising/decentralising tendencies already depicted at the global/local level and facilitated through communication and information systems is replicated at the level of the nation and the state with self managing schools (and indeed within schools with increasing number of subunits in program budgeting being developed). Now middle level management is disappearing and policy as a form of text acts as the mediating (and steering factor) for the state. The case of Victoria is significant in understanding this particular shift.

**Schools of the Future**

In January 1993, the conservative Coalition government in Victoria launched its Schools of the Future Program. In the original document, the Department of School Education claimed that in Schools of the Future parents will be directly able to participate in decisions that affect their children's education; teachers will be recognised as true professionals able to directly determine their own careers and future and with the freedom to exercise their professional skills and judgement in the classroom; principals will become true leaders in their school with the ability to build and lead their teaching teams; communities through the school charter will be able to determine the future destiny of the school, its character and ethos; within guidelines, schools will be able to develop their own curriculum programs and meet individual needs of students and students will be accountable to community for the progress of the schools and the achievements of their students (Schools of the Future, 1993, p. 2)

In the follow up Guidelines for Developing School Charters the argument is that Schools of the Future will "emphasise quality, excellence and choice in education".
Schools of the Future are depicted as being "communities of learners" which have "strong leadership, safe and orderly learning environments, high expectations of all school members and strong community ownership and respect. They are schools where the community seeks to develop solutions to problems using knowledge and resources in new ways. They are schools with a set of defined and agreed expectations which articulate a clear direction of the schools and explicit outcomes for students" (Guidelines for Developing School Charters, 1993, p. 4).

It must be remembered that in Victoria there had been significant moves towards devolved schooling since 1974 under both Liberal and Labor state governments. In particular, the role of the School Council had been critical in developing a strong sense of community and a partnership between parents and teachers in many schools. School based decision making and parental participation were therefore not new (Blackmore 1986; Blackmore 1994).

What was different with the Schools of the Future was that schools were individually being positioned within a market system of public/private education. The relationship between individual schools and the state is defined through the Charter, a document written by the principal, teachers and school council. The Charter is first, the school's statement of purpose, second an 'understanding' between the school council and the Director; and third, an accountability document. It is expected to set 'achievement targets, provide central foci and objective criteria upon which performance is to be judged' (Guidelines for Developing School Charters).

The self-managing school as conceptualised here has several features which relate to my earlier points about the post-modern. First, whilst the argument for introducing self-managing schools has been one of encouraging diversity, choice and individual difference, the result has been one which emphasises standardisation through the use of system-wide information systems (the administrative system in all Victorian schools CASES) and also through accountability mechanisms of school reviews, standardised testing, more closely scrutinised and prepackaged curriculum guidelines and emphasis on student outcomes. Hence the universalising tendencies made possible by new information technologies undermine the post-modern claims of individualism and diversity both amongst schools and students. The cost and inadequacies of the technologies themselves as both administrative and pedagogic devices will be the primary impediment to this tendency attaining its logical conclusion. Second, the shift of control to a small core of managers gaining feedback from schools through information and communication systems (e.g. CASES in Victoria) in a core-periphery model with a small core of policy makers and financial managers (conceivers) and all aspects of the execution of policy, with some local discretion within budgetary constraints, to the schools. This has been the effect of dismantling the regions and deploying all the support services in curriculum and staff development and devolving such issues to schools within a block grant. Increasingly, principals will select staff and negotiate work and wage conditions on an individual basis.

Third, the capacity of each school, whilst arguing that it is servicing the consumer and client, has the greater capacity to divorce itself from its locality and neighbourhood by drawing from a wider range of usually less disadvantaged clientele through the emphasis on image making which equates 'good schools' with strong discipline codes, strict uniform regulations and good examination results. Already the trend (as in the UK and New Zealand) is occurring where some students now bus past certain neighbourhood schools to attend better dressed, more academic and well disciplined school populations down the road (Watkins and Blackmore 1992).

Fourth, Schools of the Future calls upon the greater involvement and ownership of schools by community. But as Terri Seddon points out, there are four versions of community embedded in Schools of the Future. The first is the view of the school community as an aggregate of individual consumers who chose to attend a particular school. The assumption here is that the market and parent choice will determine the better schools. This emphasises the role of the principal as image maker, public voice and entrepreneur, a role which has historically led to the exclusion of women and others of different colour, class and ethnic background particularly in more conservative communities. A second notion of community is that of community as decision makers, in which an elected group of parents together with the principal and some staff will make relevant decisions with regard to the needs and directions of the school population as a whole. This is formalised through the school charter process. A third view of community is that of the neighbourhood, the geographical boundaries of the school, from which business representatives and most likely students are drawn. A fourth view of community which is represented in the Schools of the Future is that of an educational community or community of learners,
one which promotes facilitating learning and extending the school outwards into the adult local community. (Blackmore 1994; Seddon 1994) The emphasis is increasingly upon the market orientation of individual choice and entrepreneurial leadership.

Finally, the focus is upon the school principal as entrepreneurial leader and financial manager rather than educational leader and professional colleague.

There is an increasing differentiation between principals and teachers, and between principals. The current reclassification of principals into many bands within one principal class according to size’, location, type etc of schools

Whilst the management literature argues that new forms of organisation require leaders who are able to cope with chaos, uncertainty and contradiction, to build communities and professional collegiality, to encourage autonomous thinking and action, to facilitate and enable through supplying ideas and resources, the management/ market emphasis in Schools of the Future (as in grant maintained schools in England) has been premised upon traditional modes of management-control, establishing new hierarchies, top down one way accountability to line management whilst making rhetorical gestures as outlined above to professionalism, autonomy, diversity, choice and community. The gestural nature of the public discourse accompanying the Schools of the Future is becoming more obvious as the recent principal contracts become public. In these, principals alone are accountable in line management direct to the centre - they inform community (as represented by School Councils) and teachers rather than collaborate with teachers and parents in meaningful participative decision making. So whereas the most recent management literature for the private sector talks about leaders requiring a broader range of skills which include caring, facilitative, communicative skills, building teams and organisations as learning communities, the focus in current educational management (as in other public sector discourses of restructuring) as played out in policy is on financial, resourcing and human resource management, strong’ leadership and accountability based on ‘hard’ data.

**FLEXIBLE LEADERS?**

The position of the principal has become a key mediator of these new exchange relationships. The Schools of the Future, as with Charters in NZ (Gordon 1991) and the grant maintained schools in England, position the principal ambiguously as being simultaneously responsible to system level demands as part of a centralising tendency of devolved systems through increased accountability measures (curriculum, assessment etc) and their expectations that they address the needs of the client and the market as represented by the Board of Governors. Stephen Ball in his study of self governing schools in England talks about the language of dilemmas principals now confront because of their ambiguous relationships to the state through various policy directives and to the market, through their clients, community and school governors (Ball, 1992). These dilemmas are largely shaped by the tendency towards a managerialist market orientation rather than towards an educative professional orientation. The former indicates how system demands require executive decisions, rapid solutions, one way accountability which are in direct tension with collegial and democratic relationships, professional autonomy, democratic process, team work which many principals see as the preferred way of working. These tensions are already evident in the Charter process.

From an advocacy position, Brian Caldwell, author of popular books on self managing schools, argues that the role of the principal has altered towards strategic leadership and management of change: strategic in use of limited resources to meet the diverse needs of the student clientele and the range of teaching and learning strategies required, in strategic planning and use of limited resources, and explicit contracts. He also talks about cultural leadership as being "now the new way we do things around here" in “self managing schools under market conditions” (Caldwell 1992). He draws from Fullan’s work on educational change in arguing that strategic leadership means keeping abreast of trends and issues, threats and opportunities, nationally and internationally and anticipating their implications; sharing knowledge with others in the school community and encouraging other school leaders; establishing structures and processes which enable schools to set priorities and formulate strategies which take into account likely preferred futures; ensuring the attention of school community is focused upon matters of strategic importance and finally monitoring the implementation of strategies and ongoing review. Such comments seem relatively harmless except for their absences, silences and assumptions. The argument is that these megatrends to decentralisation are occurring worldwide and are therefore a response to a new set of conditions. Therefore, we in Australia should follow a similar path in order to respond to the post modern world. In naturalising the shift in educational relations in this way as the product of
progressivist linear view of history, it normalises the connection between radical reduction in expenditure which inevitably accompanies devolution (also a global pattern) and ignores the ways in which the contextual relations of a centralised-decentralised system of education in fact reduces choice, flexibility, autonomy and discretion for principals and particularly teachers despite its claims of increasing freedom, autonomy, choice and flexibility.

Embedded in the view of this ‘softer’ more humane version of the self managing school being peddled in Victoria is the management by objectives model of Drucker, the father of Management by Objectives. As Stephen Waring points out, Drucker realised the need to find new ways of gaining loyalty of the ‘knowledge workers’ because their work was difficult to routinise and they acted on the basis of a professional ethics and commitment drawn from outside the organisation. Their exercising of initiative and problem solving was therefore both essential and useful to the corporation but also a basis for their lack of control. That is, their dedication was not to the organisation but to professionalism, and their clients. Drucker therefore suggested giving them real responsibility within decentralised structures, so there was a mutual dependence. From this ethics of mutuality a corporate citizen would emerge with corporate ‘virtue’ gained through working towards a shared vision (Waring 1990, pp 88-9). Drucker also leaned towards consensual decision making, but not on democratic grounds. Individuals within the organisation were subcontracted to agree to certain objectives and employees were measured against agreed-upon objectives. This would foster internal self-motivation.

In turn, the managers’ role was to promote the vision to the community and promote the general will; they would serve as integrators and enhance social cohesion. Facilitative, communicative and interpersonal skills therefore were critical to managers as the substantive expertise lay with the workers. Drucker’s MBO was considered by many as being appropriate for new information based organisations which were like hospitals, universities where there needed to be few middle managers and where learning and doing could be brought together. Middle managers merely relayed information and were unproductive and hence planning and doing could be brought closer together. Drucker’s argument therefore assumed a distinct managerial elite upon which he placed great faith in their capacity to learn and lead.

Even within the management literature, MBO and Drucker have been criticised for their essential elitism and assumption that organisational objectives and interests always outweigh individual interests. At no time did Drucker consider the logical possibility of the bureaucracy or organisation withering to be replaced by collective practices and self governance through consensus. Indeed, there was no implicit or genuine democracy advocated, although the term was used. Drucker argued that democracy was inefficient and that the survival of the firm rested solely with the designated command of a single authority. If employees did not consent, their option was to exit! Rather managers underwent ‘sensitivity training’ and became paternalistic leaders who could empathise and understand employees and enlist their co-operation (Waring 1990 p., 98). Others critiqued his work because it assumed the system was self actualising and therapeutic, and that it made for happy and healthy workers. It assumed all workers had that ‘instinct for workmanship’.

The shift is therefore away from what Kerfoot and Knights see as paternalistic masculinity as the dominant discourse of management of the previous decades to strategic masculinity for the post modern organisation. Paternalism seeks to generate trust through the pretence of equality for the purpose of instrumental gain, a trust sustained through a tacit agreement of ‘gentlemanly relations’ in return for the moral rectitude of the employee. It is an ‘economy of power’ (Foucault 1980) in that the dignity of the subordinate is intact at the same time she or he is manipulated, enabling hierarchical interactions to occur as if they are personal. That is what Gramsci would call the hegemony of consent. The submission to paternalism is at one level intimately related to pleasure and desire, it is intimate in that it feigns family imagery, is pleasant and protective at the surface level, but remains essentially coercive and authoritarian. The sexual character of such relations is hidden by the hierarchical relations which distance individuals, in a form of disembodied sexuality, but it also actively constructs sexuality and the ‘politics of the body’ (Hearn et al 1989) ie where sexuality is that range of behaviours and practices ranging from flirtation to sexual acts. Thus the distance itself is part of the desire/pleasure.

By contrast strategic management explicitly attempts to desexualise organisations since all overt and implicit sexuality detracts from business goals by channelling desires and pleasure away from organisational objectives. Whilst bureaucracies tended to segregate sex and emotion and
relegate them to the private, strategic management utilises sexuality through its operation where the strategic goals of the organisation become the objects of pleasure and conquest! "It both emphasises and dem emphasises differential power and status, simultaneously individualising and collectivising the workforce" (Kerfoot and Knights 1993, p. 670). One the one hand flatter organisations encourage collectivity, but career motivations and corporate success live on individual competition. Managerial control indeed centres 'at the heart of the workforce', and workers are indeed the 'managed heart'. Strategic management is therefore associated with a form of masculinity in which everything becomes the object of control, control through reason, logical and rational process, but which is also a rationality of emotion (Kerfoot and Knights 1993). It is dominated by a language of careerism and success, which calls for decisive action, productivism and risk taking and renders sexual bodily presence manifest through physicality, posture, movement and speech (Bologh 1990). In more fluid organisations, strategic masculinity is more insecure and tenuous and hence requires new levels of self-discipline self-control in the pursuit of success. Individuals become subjects who not only seek to dominate others but also themselves ie are 'driven'. There is no safe haven, all resorts to image!

In such a context, women can be admitted into leadership in that strategic management by the individual and of the individual is managed through channelling their sexuality, energies and pleasures into careerism. This turns their previously threatening femaleness to the patriarchy into manageable capacities which can be oriented towards the needs of the organisation. Thus sexuality, emotions and pleasure can also become incorporated into organisational goals through new forms of self governance and self monitoring. The effect is to maintain the desexualisation of organisations, to render gender irrelevant once more., whilst reasserting a new form of masculinist hegemony.

WOMEN'S NEW WAYS OF LEADING?

Within the management literature, Yvonne Due Billing and Mats Alvesson argue that there have been four ways of looking at women and leadership, a consequence they argue, of the historical development of greater female participation in the labour market and the increased focus upon management and leadership in the 1980's. They perceive the new theoretical and practical interest in women and leadership in this time as coming from four perspectives. First, the equal opportunities perspective which sees women's under-representation arising from fundamental social inequality and due to the structural and cultural conditions which favour males. One strand of thought within this perspective is that men and women are fundamentally the same and would achieve the same if given the same conditions and starting point. Another strand argues that women are different because of their socialisation and therefore there is some degree of misfit between women and the current management world. The implication is that women need to change to improve the 'fit'. This argument is still largely drawing from issues of ethics and justice ie women are treated unfairly. This is the perspective which has largely informed Australian Equal Opportunities policy and been largely informed by liberal feminism.

A second, closely aligned and overlapping perspective is the meritocratic perspective which argues that there is a large pool of untapped intellectual capacity out there which could be the source of new energy and ideas in management ie. women's skills and talents are underutilised, an argument largely derived from neoclassical economics and human capital theory and well exemplified in recent government policies encouraging women to enter into nontraditional areas of work. This view is largely based on studies comparing male and female leadership which suggests that women's and men's behaviours as leaders are not different and that they all adopt a range of leadership styles ranging from democratic to authoritarian. This is a more technocratic view premised upon the view that organisations and merit are neutral, and on maximising resources for greater productivity. Gender here is irrelevant, and it assumes a rather androgynous view of identity formation. This is the perspective underlying current initiatives encouraging women into management. The surfeit of 'good leaders' amongst the reduced male ranks in particular professions means management (as unions) must address the feminisation of the workplace. This also is the position in England, where as Ozga (1993) points out, the shortage of skilled labour in management has given rise to opportunities that previous demands for equality and justice could not. The issue is not one of rectifying an injustice or of actually seeking to change management practices or cultures.

A third perspective is the special contribution argument. That is, it is argued that women bring something different into leadership because of their experiences as mothers, wives and community workers. Women here are believed to influence leadership style and make the structure less hierarchical and change workplace climate.
The support for this view comes not only from the increase in the number of women in the workplace and demands for recognition of their values but also from the changing work patterns of males, many of whom now also face part time work. It also derives from psychological theory which sees motivation being derived from other than economic reward. This perspective whilst not being contradictory to either of the others, challenges the gender neutrality of organisations and the individual competitiveness embedded therein. Again, in studies of women in educational administration, this view is reinforced by studies which indicate that women principals are more interested in student and staff welfare, curriculum and interpersonal relationships than finance. (Shakeshaft 1987; Adler 1993)

The fourth radical alternative values perspective argues that there are fundamental differences between the sexes and that, again due to socialisation, women and men take different value positions which are polar, they operate from a different version of rationality of responsibility. This draws theoretically from the work of Gilligan and Chodorow and on women's work cultures, moral and ethical theory. Whilst many of these arguments overlap with the special contributions perspective, this perspective suggests perhaps why many women choose not to enter leadership positions in management and prefer working in areas dealing with people i.e. it is a passive way of rejecting or protesting against a particular male version of career. Evidence that both men and women practice a range of leadership styles from democratic to authoritarian is countered to some extent by the cultural feminist argument that the differences between men's and women's style of leadership may not differ greatly, but that they may frame their leadership within a different world view about issues of morality and relationality, one focusing upon responsibility to others rather than individual rights.

This perspective, Billing and Alvesson argue, means that women will bring a view from the periphery which will be more threatening of existing organisational norms on the one hand, and on the other hand, the act of entering the male world of management will lead to personal conflict and a sense of betrayal to women's values. The fear here is that there will be the co-option of women. This position is taken for example by Kathy Ferguson in her well known book A Feminist Case Against Bureaucracy. The implication is that women should not indeed engage in issues of leadership or power in organisations unless on their own terms, and that feminist discourse whilst it may be subversive can never expect to become dominant as it is co-opted by other more dominant male oriented discourses within bureaucracies (Ferguson 1984). This position largely derives from the negative connotations many feminists associate with power as necessarily being power over, as being corrupting and self interested. This is a limiting view of agency and how it works. Also for feminists working in education, most of whom wish to produce change and promote inclusive notions of equity for all students, this has problems. You cannot select which students come through the door. Also a particular paradox emerges from this position as Billing and Alvesson argue. The notion of a different morality and rationality suggests an even greater need for women to become leaders to promote a different perspective which males are incapable of representing, yet the less likely they are to wish to because of their particular worldview!

Historically, each of these perspectives are quite evident in how women have argued for equity in different contexts. Women attempting to gain equity in the late nineteenth century made claim then that they could bring a different perspective to public life in terms of their superior position as guardians of morality (at least at the level of the personal for certainly males continued to be the guardians of public morality). During the 1960's and 1970's the claim was that women were the same as men, and that only structural impediments and equal opportunities were necessary and that in grounds of individual merit women would achieve the same as men. Now during the 1980's with the multiskilled manager we have the argument that women's feminine skills of nurturance, care, communication and cooperation, affiliation and attachment, intimacy and power and the interpersonal are seen to be necessary strengths for leaders because traditional masculine models which have focused upon hierarchy, functionality, certainty and control are inadequate in post-Fordist workplaces (Grant 1988) i.e special contributions perspective. A new range of leadership behaviours are necessary and women as leaders are seen to be bringing something different into leadership. Anna Yeatman (1992) talks of women being positioned as change agents. As both insiders and outsiders women are being positioned in organisations as doing the work of initiating change in ways that the 'insiders', largely white middle class males cannot. Whilst her view is largely about women positioned in powerful locations within organisations which are themselves powerful (e.g. academics in universities). It is relevant for women principals in the new restructured work situation in considering how to utilise their position with regard to issues of equity for other women.
In a sense all the above positions revisit central debates for feminists. First, they tend to either treat gender as unproblematic or perpetuate the dualisms embedded since the Enlightenment between rational and emotional, objective and subjective, public and private. Theoretically and politically, this does not advance us in practical terms. Second, there is the dangerous implication that women will continue to be portrayed as the emotional managers of the crisis in leadership at the level of middle management, at which time they will confront that glass ceiling; whereas men will continue to move up what Christine Williams calls the glass escalator into the higher levels of executive management where the soft decisions stop and the hard decisions begin (Williams, 1991). Third, there is little concern in the management literature, perhaps understandably so, about how or whether having more women in leadership will improve the work situation of all women workers.

So at the same time, I am suggesting that there is superficially a convergence in the management (largely private enterprise) and feminist literature towards a view that women can offer new forms of leadership skills which are necessary for new forms of organisation. That in itself places feminists working in the field of educational management in a problematic situation as they are seemingly seen to be co-opted or in agreement with the wider ramifications of the restructuring process, its politics and new corporate approaches to management (and all profit seeking objectives of private organisations and the cost-cutting objectives of public sector organisations). But whereas the motivation in the management literature is to increase profit, the motivation of feminists is for greater equity. And, as I have suggested, the notion of corporate strategy and its associated images of entrepreneurial or strategic leadership is no less 'masculinist' than the overt paternalistic modes of management of past decades (Blackmore 1993a). Rather the discourse of masculinism has meant that images of the 'Sensitive New Age Guy' in the media suggests that men are increasingly taking on board the caring and sensitive aspects of relationship. But, as Kerfoot and Knights point out, the evidence suggests that "these new ideas are merely facilitating the conditions within which individual men can come to acquire a few more masculinist 'brownie points' in the struggle to differentiate themselves from other men, and from women" (Kerfoot and Knights 1993, p. 664). Kerfoot and Knights show how historically the shift from bureaucratic paternalistic organisations in which the discourse of masculinity positioned males as protectors of women and 'others' were, as such top down hierarchical organisations became challenged and impacted by the market, leading to different internal discourses and practices in organisations dependent upon written, recorded and calculable forms in new information technologies. Strategic management is still bureaucratic in character but not in structure in that it is a totalising discourse which sees surveillance and recording as central features for feedback and monitoring. It is different in that it integrates both the external and the internal, the global and the local, and addresses the market.

**CONTRADICTIONS FOR FEMINIST LEADERSHIP: LOCAL/GLOBAL TENDENCIES**

There are several aspects I wish to deal with here about the contradictory ways in which women are being positioned in the current restructuring of education. First, the argument for self managing schools has largely been premised on the view that it will facilitate greater flexibility for staffing schools to better meet needs of school program and therefore individual students. This claim needs to be contextualised within the processes by which the teacher labour market is being restructured locally/globally. In Victoria, in a period in which there has been an intensification of control over teachers and increased insecurity, there has been an increase in the number of women as a percentage of the declining teaching force. This means the feminisation of the profession at a time when it is under significant attack and restructuring, a trend which occurred in the USA, in which there was white male flight from the profession during the 1970's and 1980's Much has been written about the historical association between masculinisation and professionalisation of certain occupations (nursing, teaching, librarianship) during the twentieth century, and also how the feminisation of an occupation often leads to de-skilling and de-professionalisation, (eg. Apple 1985).

Furthermore there is a conjuncture between two forms of restructuring: one of reforming the workplace, the other of women's place in the paid workforce. One is premised upon efficiency, the other on equity. In Victoria, therefore, in 1993 the impact of EO Action Plans for Women since 1985 is evident with a small but significant increase in the number of women in primary and secondary principal class positions. What is clearly evident is that EO policies have led more women to apply and that women are more successful than men on gaining appointments. At the same time, the removal of the regions has
displaced the increasingly feminised middle management which results in a centre-periphery model which is highly gendered with males dominating the centre in finance and personnel and women mediating the new level of middle management at principal class level. Similarly, there would appear to be an under-representation of women in the alternative career paths of the Advanced Skills Teacher, although this was argued for on the grounds of suiting women's interests in remaining in the classroom. Is a new glass ceiling merging which may restrict moving from the 'soft' to 'hard' leadership positions?

In Sweden, there is a similar conjuncture between devolving staff selection and recruitment to local communities and EO policies requiring a larger percentage of women principals. Local community authorities now treat education as merely another government service to compete for limited resources. Whilst there has been a significant rise in the number of women in the principal class in Sweden since 1985 due to Affirmative Action legislation which set targets which, if not met, would be mandated, the majority of women in the principal class are deputy principals in large multi-campus K-12 schools or principals in poorer, less prestigious, urban schools. Most have been recruited from the lesser qualified primary and preschool school teacher ranks because they are cheaper!

And finally, the delegation of staffing and individual contracts has a number of concerns. Experiences in Sweden which until recently also had a highly centralised education system and which has currently through act of parliament made staffing the responsibility of communes are also shifting towards individual contracts. The opposition is strong as it is clear from evidence in the tertiary sector that individual contracts led to an increase in the gender gap between male and female average wages within two years (Blackmore 1993). In New Zealand, a study found that whilst women maintained their participation in collective bargaining and indeed improved their conditions of leave they still fared demonstrably worse off with respect to men regarding conditions of work and wage increments. That is, their flexibility was improved thus facilitating their double time in paid and unpaid domestic labour, but did not benefit them financially. (Hammond and Hardbridge 1993) Indeed, a woman's capacity to effectively bargain is exacerbated by the very patriarchal process associated with bargaining process and the unequal patriarchal relationships of the workplace which perceive women as lower paid and therefore less skilled (Bradley 1993).

At the same time that teachers' work is being redefined and restructured, principals are simultaneously being courted, cajoled and coerced into private sector type individual contracts under the belief that devolution and self managing schools will indeed given them more control and flexibility. A possible consequence (and on which evidence is already emerging) is a growing divide, already evident in England, between principals who are becoming more managers and publicists, and teachers, who are relegated only to classroom responsibilities. This gap is exacerbated as head teachers on exceptionally high salaries in larger schools recruit younger, less experienced and cheaper teachers, thus replacing older more experienced staff. Flexibility at the chalkface is therefore reduced rather than increased. (Halpin, et al. 1993).

Second, the rhetorical claim is that schools will be developing teacher professionalism through collegiality. Yet Governments have assumed more Fordist or mass production forms of work organisation with their emphasis on line management, control, narrow measures of success and standardisation of process (curriculum) and product (assessment), all which undermine teacher professionalism and autonomy, rather than post-Fordist work organisation with its emphasis on the customised product for niche markets. As already indicated the dilemmas for management are between demands for executive decision making and professional collegiality. And again, research on women principals indicates a preference for more democratic organisation (Adler 1993; Shakeshaft 1987; State Board of Education 1986). Yet the language of the departmental memos is one of control, informing teachers, restricting their activities to classrooms (making the local administrative committees institutionalised during the 1980's under industrial agreements illegal rather than professional and democratic forms of local decision making).

Third, at the same time that Schools of the Future is appealing to community ownership of schools, 55 schools were unilaterally closed without consultation in December 1992 and their staff were relocated to other schools. Three of these schools have remained open solely through parent action and occupation. Two of the schools took the Kennett government to the Equal Opportunity Commission. Recently the government has forcibly removed parents and students from Richmond Secondary College site. Ironically, each of these schools was serving the specific specialised needs of their neighbourhood and local communities and indeed had well established educational communities who have become politicised and mobilised with parent groups and individual women playing a leadership role in opposition to the schools' closures.
So indeed, what constitutes ‘community’ in the eyes of the current government is highly problematic.

Fourth, the emphasis of community action which is being framed by the actual administrative practices (via memos etc) is one based upon management/market principles. It is one which assumes an exchange relationship between student (or parent) and school rather than a social relationship. The emphasis is on the entrepreneurial or managerialist approach to leadership rather than the professional and educative one given that community is defined largely within the market framework. Again, this is problematic for women, given that the image of leadership is associated with ‘hard nosed’ financial management rather than ‘softer’ educative views of learning and caring environments. Women generally are not seen to fit the entrepreneurial image (although in practice many female principals are extremely successful in this aspect), just as they had not fitted the ‘Rugby League model’ of educational leadership of the past, masculinist images of leadership which mean that local control of staff selection can therefore disadvantage women (Blackmore, 1989).

Finally, the role of the state with respect to equity has altered significantly. Whereas gender equity reform research has clearly indicated the need for ‘strong’ state policy intervention, the establishment of inclusive representation and clear procedures and processes in staff and principal selection panels, and the provision of resources to provide professional development for those involved in personnel appointments, the new model is that staffing and PD is being devolved to schools. In the most recent round of closures and amalgamations in October 1993, schools principals and vice principals have been decided upon by a variety of informal, unmonitored and arbitrary processes. This is again some concern for the future. Gender equity research has clearly indicated that a variety of strategies are required to produce change, with strong top down policies to initiate, legitimise and reinforce school based activity. Attitudes and practices do not change without some leverage from above.

Women are therefore being encouraged to apply to be principals at a time when schools are being shifted into new competitive commercial relationships which tend to be more inequitable. For example, evidence from self-governing schools in the UK and NZ indicate that schools shop for students and indeed market themselves to the community and other schools (in terms of offering facilities, resources and expertise at a price) and seek to attract funding and sponsorship. Principals in English and New Zealand self governing schools spend increasing time on publicity and management rather than professional development and educational policy (Gordon, 1993). They no longer give freely of their time and expertise or share ideas as professional collegiality would assume. Such information exchanges are now viewed as consultancies. Furthermore, schools are accountable only to their student/parent body and not, as part of a public education system, to all students, including the ‘less attractive’ non-achieving clients in their locality. Indeed, the tendency in England is for schools to choose students rather than students choose schools.

NEW IMAGES OF LEADERSHIP: SHIFTING BOUNDARIES

What are the possibilities for women working in a system of self governance based upon market forces? The paternalistic and direct interventionist modes of governance arising from the democratic impulses of the 1970’s and from which women and other disadvantaged groups benefitted through EO policies and AA, are being supplanted by new forms of self-governance. Yeatman argues that these have taken on a market-orientation because of the failure to produce a viable alternative mode of self governance which has more communitarian intent (Yeatman 1992).

What does this mean? First, equality in the market system has been redefined. Whereas previously state intervention sought to actively reduce group oppression and disadvantage, now the state merely guarantees individual choice under the conditions of the free market. Thereby, the individual is again blamed for their failure to succeed, as having made the wrong choices, or of being incapable of making a choice. Systemic factors which disadvantage particular social groups such as girls or women or working class children are more easily ignored. With a global equity fund spread across more schools, the result of block grants to individual schools, students will all be ranked according to an equity index upon which funding will be issued, schools, therefore, will have to develop new and creative ways of identifying, defining and establishing priorities between different equity claims within the school as well as relevant ways of giving an account of how equity is being addressed both to the community and the system.

Second, schools no longer have the support systems at the regional level so new ways of organising with other schools in the neighbourhood in order to maintain curriculum and professional development, as well as current programs for girls under EO, will be required.
Sources of expertise will have to be developed within schools, drawing from teachers and developing new links with other educational institutions (e.g. universities).

Third, the New Zealand experience indicates that the charter itself can become a focus of political struggle because it can be about new forms of state power or about creating communities which are inclusive and equitable (Codd 1990). I would suggest that women’s capacities and experience as educational leaders either as principals or teachers can be a creative force for developing inclusive and equitable communities and building upon past networks and alliances, even within the context of self managing schools.

Indeed, what I am arguing is that we do not necessarily need new schools for new times, for indeed, much has already been learnt about how schools provide good learning environments and how teachers work best for kids. Adapting for the future requires working well with the past. Whilst the contradictions and tensions outlined above will not dissipate, and indeed could exacerbate the differences between individual students, teachers, and schools the principal can as the leaders within a school seek to frame and counter their responses to the top down imperatives by developing a communitarian alternative which will mean not school renewal (on the assumption that there were significant problems with schooling) or reinvention of new pedagogical practices, but building on previous learnings about what constitutes a good learning environment.

Schools and education may be subjected to postmodern forces yet they still contain the paradox of the traditional and difference in terms of a post modern culture (Jameson 1984). Jameson sees the post modern as a field which has different cultural impulses - residual and emergent - which must make their way. Hinkson further suggests that we conceptualise post modernity as an emergent layer of relations which carries the information and image revolution.

Within the terms of the present, the only form of the postmodern we have experienced, these relations dominate and threaten to displace other relations (including those of modernity). Formulated this way, there is a space for a cultural politics of post modernity in a politics where the central questions are about the kind of relations that should dominate our social settings (Hinkson, 1991, p. 34 #183).

Leading in the self managing school therefore will mean working with social relationships. These relationships will focus upon familiar and central educational concepts - placing the interests of students first, equity implications of decisions, prioritising resource allocation, building community, facilitating and encouraging professional collegiality and development - but will be set within a new framework in which schools are being increasingly positioned as semi-autonomous units and having to develop new forms of accountability and information management systems overlayering the system. Unfortunately, much of this may be about image making as much as it will be about education.

REFERENCES


Apple, M (1985) Teaching and ‘women’s work’: a comparative historical and ideological analysis Teachers College Record, 86 (3) pp. 544-73.


Calder, Brian (1992), The Principal as the Leader in a Self Managing School', Journal of Educational Administration.


Jameson, Frederic (1984), 'Postmodernism, or the Cultural logic of Late Capitalism' in Curriculum Discourse as Postmodernist Critical Practice, Geelong, Deakin University Press.


Robertson, Sue (1992), 'The Politics of Teachers' Labour and the Post-Fordist School' The Eighth Comparative Education Society Conference, Prague.


Soucek, Victor (1992), 'Post-Fordist Schools and the new standards of Communicative competence' Eighth Congress of World Council of Comparative Education Societies, Prague.

Waring, Stephen (1990), Tayloration Transformed: scientific management theory since 1945, Chapel Hill, University of North Carolina Press.


FOOTNOTES
1 There is also a shift in the way in which community is being defined as not necessarily being the local neighbourhood. This has other less obvious implications as Ruth Fincher's study of Melbourne class/gender and local labour markets shows (Fincher, 1989). When schools, particularly those which have been the focus of local community as in rural areas, disappear, students travel further, child care facilities are reduced. Again, the responsibility for women to meet these new demands of mobility of children on a daily basis have consequences.

2 I here use the distinction made by Brittan between masculinity, masculinism and patriarchy and synthesised by Kerfoot and Knights (1993) p. 661. Masculinity refers to the features of male behaviour that can change over time; masculinism denotes the ideology that naturalises and justifies men's behaviour over women; and patriarchy is the structure of unequal power relations sustained by this ideology. There are multiple masculinities and these are associated with particular types of work and indeed are reconstituted over time. Masculinity has to be achieved and worked at, so that one can achieve gender identity and be a 'real' man (and therefore a real leader?)

3 The increase is particularly at Vice Principal level so that in 1993 there are to 41% female VPs and 20% largely due to the award agreements of 1990 (Blackmore and Davies 1993). Similarly, there had been a larger increase at Vice Principal level in secondary schools with rise form 11.5% to 23% compared to 10% to 15% in principal positions.

4 Women are still only fairly represented in the primary division at AST 1 and AST 2 levels but are under-represented at AST3 and in all three AST levels in secondary teachers in 1993.

5 Not only were the schools closed largely concentrated in Western and inner working class and more ethnically diverse suburbs but that women were a high proportion of principals in these schools.
ABSTRACT
Rather than creating alternative paradigms for leadership, we ought to look for different models of organisation which will result in appropriate leadership styles. We need to do this, because if we believe that management of the future is about enabling and delegation, the organisation of the future will need to unleash all the energy and imagination of its individual leaders and managers. Therefore, women are going to be crucially important agents of change in the workplace.

Understanding our lives and experience as a story to be told is one very useful way of reflecting on our experience. Moving towards the turn of the century, it is now critical that women continue to reflect their experience in light of the theory that underpins organisational behaviour. By so doing, they will come to new meanings which will inform their future actions.

INTRODUCTION
People who comprise organisations today have a right to expect that their involvement will, among other things, promote their own personal well-being (Warr & Wall, 1975). For this to happen, two interdependent conditions must prevail. Firstly, each must be a member of a cohesive, supportive work group; and secondly, the leadership exercised in that group must be appropriate (Bennis, 1989).

Unfortunately, some leadership styles continue to produce negative outcomes, and many of these approaches to leadership are aptly described as maintenance-orientated. These leaders, misinterpreting their circumstances, respond by attempting to 'improve', to 'shape up', to 'do better', or to 'perfect' current levels of performance within their organisation as it is currently functioning.

At present, the effort to ensure that Australian organisations attain the quality necessary to meet the challenges of the 21st century, is a high national priority. Hence, managers who continue to attempt to maintain the status quo within hierarchical structures by reinforcing existing bureaucratic practices, are literally, counter-productive. Thus, it seems clear that for leaders and managers in the 1990's, maintenance is no longer an option, and that there are new awarenesses, skills, and attitudes required by present and future leaders in organisations, and that these are best contextualised within alternative, operational models.

THE GENDER FACTOR
Some of these leaders are women. Yet, the reality is that the literature on women who occupy leadership and management positions supports the notion that there is a 'glass ceiling' that prevents most women from being appointed to top management positions (Morrison and van Glinow 1990; O'Leary and Ickovics 1992:8), although opinion is divided as to whether there is a distinctly feminine style of leadership.

Whilst researchers are unanimous in their recognition of the danger of stereotypes, there is considerable disagreement as to whether women manage differently. Opinion is divided as to whether there is a distinctively 'feminine' style of leadership. Some writers (Leong 1992; Gilligan 1982) suggest that women have different traits that give them a distinctive management style, others (Snodgrass, 1985) report that these traits relate more specifically to subordinate/superior relations, rather than being gender specific.

The gender-positive perspective recognizes that there are some differences between the modus operandi of females and males as they exercise a leadership role. For example, some studies suggest that, generally, females and males appear to define decision variables in different ways (Gilligan, 1982). This perspective is not gender neutral. It encourages an understanding of difference and tries to understand when, and if, differences matter. Further, this perspective holds that there is value and usefulness in this diversity. "Even though females and males differ along some dimensions, each contributes value" (Leong, 1992:194). According to this perspective, leadership has traditionally been defined from a 'white male' perspective. Now, a gender positive environment may encourage other leadership perspectives.

On the other hand, a large section of the literature (O'Leary and Ickovics: 1992, Sitterly and Duke 1988, Milligan and Genoni, 1993) suggests that the leadership style of women is similar to that of men, the only difference
being the level of opportunity they experience. For example, Snodgrass (1985) explores male/female, superior/subordinate behaviour and argues that “when the superior/subordinate role was crossed with sex in both a teacher/learner and in three business-related tasks, women showed no advantage over men in interpersonal sensitivity. Those in the subordinate role, regardless of sex, were more sensitive to other person’s feelings than were those in the superior role”.

From this Snodgrass concludes that “those who are less powerful have a greater need to be aware of the feelings and reactions of their superiors in order to respond to their needs and to acquire their favour”. (O’Leary and Ickovics, 1992)

Obviously, more research needs to be done in this area, but we can see that the design of many of today’s leadership programs and books are based on the premise that while women may find it more difficult to reach top leadership positions, leadership traits in the organisations of the 90’s are non-gender specific.

ALTERNATIVE MODELS

These leadership traits have not been static over time. Western society has traditionally upheld a strong belief in the formal or legal approach to authority in which all power flows from the top of the organisation downward through a hierarchical structure. However, this century has witnessed rapid change in the nature and complexity of groups, from the family unit to large formal organisations, and this, of course, impinges on all aspects of the functioning of women in leadership positions within an organisation.

This sociological change can be described as a process of decentralisation, and the diffusion of decision-making conventions.

For example, as education tends not only to affect the society it serves, but also to be affected by that society, the bureaucratic, hierarchical type of educational leadership practice prevalent in the past century is now yielding to a more person-centred and collegial approach.

In an attempt to clarify a central characteristic of current change, the term ‘collegiality’ is often used in an organisational setting to describe the mutual respect colleagues afford each other. However, it has a much deeper philosophical meaning. When applied to structures and practices within an organisation, the collegial principle ensures that all members of the group including leaders, are enabled and encouraged to make their own unique contribution.

Thus, for example, many recent studies of educational leadership examine the concept of ‘leader-as-person’ in terms of leadership styles and the capacity for personal interaction (Greenfield and Blumberg 1982:245). A useful point of departure is to attempt to characterise our own organisation’s orientation as innovative, collegial, bureaucratic or entrepreneurial, and within this context to recognise that the concept of leader-as-person (male or female) is an important element in the quest for quality leadership styles through alternative models.

One of these alternatives focuses on: leaders who are creatively open to new possibilities. This suggests that those women (or men) who choose this approach to leadership, no matter at what level within the organisation, will maximize opportunities to provide a growth-promoting milieu for all members of their organisation. An alternative paradigm such as this, offers an orientation which is person-centred, fosters human resource development, and both encourages and supports creativity and initiative.

Naisbitt and Aburdene (1990:219) affirm: leaders recognise that while capital and technology are important resources, people make or break a company. To harness their power, leaders inspire commitment and empower people by sharing authority.

ADDING VALUE TO OUR ORGANISATION

In order to discover what has to be done so that inhibitions are removed and leaders can be ‘freed up’, there is a need, first of all, to be aware of the fundamental characteristics of organisations which are correctly described as hierarchical. Within such groups of people, the emphasis is most obviously on power, status, rules and task.

Also, procedures within such organisations are somewhat predictable, and the values of conformity and uniformity are all-pervasive. Moreover, practices display rigidity, with little or no evidence of planned change.

The continuing implementation of this model of leadership and management in some organisations (eg universities) during past decades, would appear to have promoted passivity, low levels of motivation and lack of creativity.

Whilst it is acknowledged that many leaders in Australian organisations continue the attempt to move away from a dominantly hierarchical model, the widespread and continuing failure to implement appropriate
alternative models has resulted in many serious dysfunctions. Probably the most pernicious of these is the significant undervaluing of human resource potential within organisations. And this at a time when leaders are becoming acutely conscious of declining financial resources. Not surprisingly, then, there is increasing pressure to change, to restructure, to adopt different approaches. But in what direction?

This paper argues that only those modifications which guarantee top priority to the full exploitation of one key domain will suffice. What key domain? The opportunity for the managers and leaders to unleash the potential inherent in the human resource present within the work group. This human resource is, in fact, value added to the organisation, for the people themselves, the workers, the female as well as male members of the work group, are the organisation’s greatest potential asset.

THE CONCEPT OF ENABLING LEADERSHIP

Within this value-added context, ideally, the leader of the group empowers, or better, enables members to become their best selves, personally and professionally. This challenges the leader to build an accepting, empathic relationship with each and every member of the group, as well as nurturing the relationships between the members themselves. This exercise of collegial leadership first elicits then supports the responsiveness of each member. This kind of informed leadership is indispensable for the well-being of each member and is the indispensable basis for the productive functioning of the group itself.

A clear understanding of the context within which this informed leadership is exercised, is of prime importance. It is essential that the leader understands that ‘the environment is people’ (Greenfield 1992). No longer is it useful to reify the institution, to see the organisation as a thing, as an object, or to be satisfied with this term as useful, social construction of reality. The ‘department’ is not a building, but a group of people. The leader who fosters this group of people into a cohesive team committed to a common purpose, develops a powerful unit of collective performance. Both creativity and initiative will be supported by this leadership style.

When considering leaders’ ability to be open to possibilities, Naisbitt and Aburdene (1990) express the view that openness to change occurs when leaders promote within their organisations the development of collegial structures, which encourage every person to grow, to change, and to respond freely to challenges with courage.

In the past, leaders posed the question: “How can I improve my performance?” The post-industrial leader of the 1990’s continuously seeks an answer to a more exciting question: ‘What is possible?’... and modifies existing structures in such a way as to support the implementation of sequential, creative answers.

Thus, an alternative to earlier models emerges: that organisations are “systems of meaning that can be understood only through the interpretation of meaning” (Greenfield 1984:150). Obviously, this approach is in conflict with the understandings of those who attempt to make sense of organisations within a mechanistic framework, and who reveal their beliefs and values by the use of metaphors which emphasise control, task, conformity, uniformity, efficiency, effectiveness, discipline, role, success, and failure. The alternative collegial perspective however gives rise to other metaphors: people, community, maturation, self-esteem, relationship, respect, empathy, participation, responsibility, experience, pastoral care, responsiveness, mission and vision.

This alternative paradigm opens the way to the enhancement of a culture which promotes the well-being of all the members. Thus, each organisation can usefully be looked at as a specific ‘tribe’ – a unique group of people challenged to be aware of, to prize, and to develop its own culture. It is the task of the leader to engage every member of this tribe in continuing to explore and to modify this culture: that set of shared beliefs, values, assumptions, and shared meanings which give identity and direction to the group.

One way of doing this is to invite collegial leadership, wherever it is exercised within the organisation. This fosters a mutual exploration of needs, goal setting, strategic thinking and operational planning involving all the members of the group. Such a process forms a sound basis for planned change as members are actively involved in strategic planning for the whole group.

LEADERSHIP AND COMMUNICATION OF CHANGE

Moving to alternative paradigms of leadership and management involves work group members in change. In the last decade much has been written on the theory of change - but the reality of change is not always readily accepted. Resistance is expected not only from those who have a vested interest in the status quo, but, importantly, also by those who do not see any direct benefits or advantages for themselves.
Morrish (1979), Dunphy (1990), and Mintzberg (1990) see change as a variable, dependent very much upon the milieu in which it occurs and, even in our own times of rapid contact and communication, it is not something that is easily transferable.

Change forced upon a reluctant or captive participant is likely to be superficial and unstable. Sinclair (1990) describes "defence mechanisms" invoked by people threatened by change, which can become "pathological...individual and organisational sanity is threatened" (1990:6). Such change will result in an act of compliance rather than one of voluntary identification and internalisation.

An alternative to what Sinclair describes as 'change by decree' (1990:14) is the development of the interpersonal communication process. Lowman (1976:19) describes the need to construct relationships from which to change organisations.

"Regardless of the particular modality used in helping organisations and other social systems to change, all such efforts require and work through a relationship between two or more persons."

Much earlier, Argyris (1965) developed a model of how interpersonal competence and innovation are related. He states:
The higher the interpersonal competence of the individual, the greater is:
• the awareness of relevant problems;
• the ability to solve problems;
• the probability that the problem-solving process involved has not been harmed or negatively influenced. (1965:14)

In the light of this developing understanding of the importance of the context of our human development as we move into the 1990's most senior management personnel will realise with Stace (1988) that people effectiveness is the number one challenge facing them for the future, and organisations must place urgent focus on human resource management and development for both women and men.

In practice, members are encouraged to recall, share, reflect upon, and interpret their own personal story. Inevitably, greater awareness of past experiences provides an individual and group context within which to respond creatively to current challenges, and to orient a more focused and assured thrust towards the future. Women's intuition and sensitivity ensure that their personal life stories engender clarity of vision, single-mindedness and sense of purpose. In the exercise of a leadership role, such personal attributes become a precious bonus.

CONCLUSION

It is suggested that through an alternative collegial paradigm of enabling leadership, the leader is encouraged to add value to the organisation by being open to all possibilities and creating new opportunities in both structure and process. As a result, the potential inherent in the feminine and masculine human resource present within the group will be unleashed.

Hence the need to seek out collegial paradigms and to explore the resultant implications at all levels in our organisations today. Leaders in organisations moving towards the year 2000 are challenged to explore leadership which enables – and to lead with courage!

REFERENCES

Milligan & Genoni (1993) A report of an evaluation of the Women in Leadership Program Edith Cowan University, Edith Cowan University, Western Australia.
O'Leary and Ickovics “Cracking the glass ceiling: overcoming isolation and alienation” in Sekaran and Leong (1992) *Womanpower*, Sage; California.


INTRODUCTION

In reviewing the literature on award restructuring, considerable scepticism is expressed concerning the benefits to workers and, in particular, to female workers. This paper investigates, through case studies conducted at Edith Cowan University and Murdoch University, whether award restructuring has indeed been able to achieve improvements in the working lives of female academics. This study looks at the award restructuring process covering the period from August 1989 to September 1993. It began with the negotiations at the Federal level between academic unions and the employer group that lasted from August 1989 to July 1991. After July 1991, negotiations then began at the institutional level and focused on those items that had not been decided at the Federal level. For this paper, I monitored these negotiations from September 1991 to September 1993.

Through the presentation of segments of interviews and responses to surveys on the implementation of award restructuring, the paper probes the question as to whether affirmative action can be used in the award restructuring process and if so, how women might benefit from this process. The main areas of discussion in the paper are tenuring of Level A staff, gaining internal promotion, changing promotion criteria and increasing the role of women unionists in the consultative process. This paper also discusses specific programs awarded by the National Staff Development Fund that have targeted women.

THE RESEARCHER

I began this research with the idea of combining both my interests in feminism and unions. From 1989-1992 I was President of the Murdoch University Academic Staff Association and have been extensively involved with the local association and FAUSA for the past fifteen years. As an active feminist, I convened the inter-university Feminist Discussion Group for ten years, chaired the Women’s Studies Programme Committee for two years, was the union representative on the Equal Opportunity Committee and served on FAUSA’s Affirmative Action Committee.

As a negotiator at one campus where we had monthly meetings with management and weekly contacts with the Industrial Officer and members of the union’s executive committee, I had a feel for the overall process of award restructuring. I was living it daily, especially at the time of the industrial action that lasted from October to December 1990. I also met with female academics during 1992-93 at the union’s Women’s Caucus where we discussed ways of having more influence on the four universities we represented. We exchanged documents and thought particularly about ways in which the promotion procedures could be altered to give women more of an opportunity to gain promotion.

Since I was closely involved in the award restructuring process at Murdoch University, I felt it would be an opportune time to study a process while participating in it. I had a number of close colleagues at Edith Cowan University and my conversations with them suggested that a contrast between the two institutions would make an interesting case study.

CASE STUDY BACKGROUND

Case studies of two universities negotiating the implementation of award restructuring should shed light on what might be achieved for academics within this process. The two universities, Murdoch and Edith Cowan, differ substantially in their philosophies and structures. Murdoch University began teaching with its undergraduate programme in 1975 and was seen to offer an alternative type of tertiary education from that of the traditional university. Its first Vice-Chancellor, Professor Stephen Griew said “there was no excuse for a new university to make the same mistakes as the older universities which had been handicapped by tradition” (Bolton, 1985, p 23). He predicted that all members of the university, including students, would have a say in its administration and he would encourage participatory decision-making rather than control by senior administrators. The structure was also to differ, administration of academic programmes would be based on schools of study rather than on faculties and departments. The university was to encourage interdisciplinary studies and set up “trunk” courses for first year
students which would integrate knowledge across schools and disciplines. The university also encouraged team teaching and other forms of innovative teaching (Bolton, 1985, 14).

Murdoch University was established as a university from its inception. Edith Cowan University, on the other hand, has recently been converted from a college of education to a university and is an amalgamation of four, previously autonomous teachers' colleges. Moses (1989) noted that Australian colleges tend to be more hierarchical and universities tend to be more collegial. An analyses of the differences between two-year colleges and universities in the United States made similar conclusions:

The higher its academic standing, the more an institution resembles a professional guild; further down the hierarchy, colleges take on the characteristics of regular bureaucratic structures, with the 'higher-ups' in charge. (Ladd and Lipset, 1975, 291)

In a survey of academics, Ladd and Lipset also noted that "elite-school professors are generally more critical of existing practices in university governance and more inclined to perceive and object to hierarchical or insufficiently democratic modes of decision-making than their colleagues at lesser places" (Ladd and Lipset, 1975, 264).

The Department of Employment, Education and Training (DEET) in its National Report on Australia's Higher Education Sector (1993) described the management approach of the former colleges of advanced education as follows:

"The structure was highly centralised, with decision-making power concentrated in the central administration and specifically with the Director or Principal. These institutions have become progressively more corporate during the 1980's This is now manifest through strong managerial structures and accountability through a clearly defined hierarchy." (DEET, 1993, 131)

Responses given by staff in interviews at Edith Cowan tend to bear out the observations made by Ladd and Lipset and also those quoted above from DEET when commenting on the governance and control exercised by the former Director of that institution. When discussing promotion, one staff member said, "there is often intervention by the Director." Another said, "the Director says who he doesn't like". The promotion system was also described as a "straight out case of jobs for the boys—or should I say jobs for certain boys". Another made a similar comment: "the system seems easier for men, a buddy-buddy system. This is a male environment, the work environment is geared to men."

In commenting on the position taken by the recently appointed Vice-Chancellor at Edith Cowan, the current President of the Academic Staff Association noted that in terms of working with the association that "he is philosophically capable of living in a pluralist society." The consensus of opinion of staff interviewed was that the new Vice-Chancellor appears to want a totally different relationship to exist between management and staff from that of his predecessor.

To gain the perspective of the administration of both universities on award restructuring in 1993, I carried out interviews on each campus, with the Vice-Chancellors, university personnel officers and industrial officers. To gain the perspective of the union and academic staff members, I carried out interviews with the industrial officers and the presidents of the academic staff associations in 1991 and again in 1993 and with individual staff members (12 at Edith Cowan and 9 at Murdoch) in 1991. I also interviewed the equity officers in 1991 who could be seen as located somewhere between the administration and staff in their perspectives on award restructuring. In an attempt to continue monitoring award restructuring from the national perspective, in 1993 I interviewed the Australian Higher Education Industrial Association's (AHEIA) Chief Industrial Officer, the Federated Australian University Staff Association's (FAUSA) General Secretary, the Award Restructuring Implementation Officer, an Industrial Officer and the Union of Australian College Academics' (UACA) General Secretary and an Industrial Officer. I had interviewed all of the same individuals located in Melbourne in 1991 and in addition, the Executive Director of AHEIA, its President and several other UACA and FAUSA industrial officers involved in the negotiating process at the federal level.

In 1991, I surveyed Level A staff at both institutions about their general conditions of work and then again in 1993 I surveyed a cross-section of women from the four campuses in Western Australia. The purpose of the second survey was to gauge how much female academics knew about the implementation of award restructuring on their campuses and how satisfied they were with the process. Several open-ended questions focused on promotion procedures and affirmative action. The results of this survey are discussed in Appendix 1. I have also compiled results from a survey by FAUSA of 17 universities on their implementation of award restructuring. Three tables of these results are in Appendix 2.
BACKGROUND ON AWARD RESTRUCTURING

Award restructuring was introduced under the August 1988 (Accord IV) and August 1989 (Accord V) National Wages Cases. For the 1988 wage increases unions had to give a commitment to engage in preliminary discussions on award restructuring. For 1989, the Commission had to be satisfied that parties to an award had co-operated positively in a fundamental review of the award and were implementing measures to improve the efficiency of their industries. The structural efficiency principle embodied the idea that changes could be achieved through co-operation and consultation, and that this in turn would facilitate a highly skilled and flexible work force aiding structural adjustment and leading to more fulfilling jobs (ACAC 1988, 6, 10).

The Commission was careful to ensure that both parties would benefit in the process. It promised flexibility, a rationalisation of awards and productivity and efficiency gains to the employers. The employees were to gain from the removal of discriminatory award provisions and the Commission’s commitment to multi-skilling and the development of skill-related career paths for all workers (Roxon, 1991).

WOMEN AND AWARD RESTRUCTURING

Some writers believe that the potential for women in award restructuring is in the reassessment of institutionalised barriers and prohibitive structures which have locked many women into inferior positions within the work force (Roxon, 1991). However, there have been mixed feelings as to whether award restructuring has led to any real tangible benefits for women.

Sue McCreadie, for example, begins an article on “Awarding Women” with this comment: “For many feminist critics, award restructuring, like the industry restructuring which spawned it, is a boys’ game, tailor-made for the metal industry and imposed on the rest of us” (McCreadie, 1989, p 12). Despite these observations, she suggests that it can create a framework for reforming work organisation and if women are drawn into the consultative mechanisms then it can make a difference. She says that it is crucial to involve women workers and shop stewards to shift the balance of power in the workplace from management to workers and from men to women workers, especially in those areas where women dominate the lower levels of an industry.

Val Pratt, Director of the Affirmative Action Agency in Sydney, expressed similar concerns that the award may be to the detriment of women. Neals (1990) reporting on Pratt’s address to a national conference stated that, “fears run counter to enthusiastic claims by the union movement that award restructuring will offer female employees new opportunities for promotion, career paths, training and higher wages” (1990, p 7).

Ballock (1990), in a review article titled “Award Restructuring for Women, Tool of Change or Stagnation?”, is pessimistic about the process. The works reviewed suggest that trends in the restructuring of work are making a mockery of the notion of a career path. These are the increased casualisation, creating more part-time workers who are not deemed to be in need of training which has further enhanced the notion of a work force structure of core and peripheral workers. This has left most women in the peripheral areas of the work force. One study looked at broadening in the Western Australian Public Service which reclassified 251 job classifications into 9 bands. The aim was to create career paths and greater multi-skilling within bands. However, all the low-income workers were banded together in Level 1 without any work value assessment (69% of the workers were women). Reclassifications of jobs at Levels 2 and above took place on the basis of work value assessment but did not include factors such as general human relations, communication and caring skills. The researchers concluded that this broadening exercise reinforced and consolidated job discrimination against women.

Other studies (Brown and Gardner, 1991; Runciman, 1989) suggest similar problems with implementing award restructuring and changing discriminatory practices against women. In examining the Queensland public sector, Brown and Gardner (1991) concluded that “The bottlenecks of the old systems are not easily eliminated in the new” (1991, p9). In the retail trade, Runciman (1989) notes that award restructuring has resulted in increased cost-cutting measures and greater juniorisation of the work force.

Hall (1989) and Burton (1990) try to point out ways of making award restructuring work for women. They identify the pitfalls as well as the areas where changes can be made that may benefit women. Burton quoted a colleague as saying: “Award Restructuring is, in that sense, a crisis for equal opportunities. What we have is a dangerous opportunity to break down barriers and open up careers – or to see the blinds cover the missed window of opportunities for a long time” (p 1).

She went on to say that “with award restructuring, employment structures can be reviewed and redesigned comprehensively. Equally simply, there is a danger that
new structures can incorporate restrictions from the old and impose new barriers and constraints” (Burton, 1990, p 1).

Hall (1989) made a firm connection between award restructuring and equal employment opportunities in her article:

“It is no fortunate accident that getting award restructuring right requires getting it right for women. The requirements for a more skilled and flexible work force go to some of the major employment issues for women—access to and recognition of training, access to career paths, removal of unnecessary rigidities in employment and evaluation of work in terms of the demands of the job and the merits of the workers are crucial for equal employment opportunities, award restructuring and productivity improvement.” (Hall, 1989, p 15).

It is difficult to disentangle how much the restructuring of the economy and other government initiatives have affected workplace change which coincided with award restructuring. This is especially true of universities that entered into negotiating award restructuring at the same time many of Dawkins' White Paper (1988) initiatives were affecting the way universities operated. The amalgamations of universities and colleges of advanced education and the creation of a Unified National System and the introduction of the relative funding model were initiatives that were to have a major impact on universities. The Labor Government's underlying philosophy of economic rationalism and its push for micro-economic reforms was not going to bypass the universities. They were forced to adopt more user pay strategies and pushed toward greater commercialisation of their services by marketing courses overseas and forging research links with industry. Into the thick of these changes, the unions and employers introduced award restructuring.

UNIVERSITY ACADEMICS AND AWARD RESTRUCTURING

On the surface, it appears that academics have benefited from award restructuring in a number of ways. Academics gained salary increases of between 12-20% and the salary scales of former college academics and university academics were united into one salary structure with the right to internal promotion from the lowest grade to the highest. Each grade was given position classification standards which incorporate both different functions and higher levels of merit as an academic progresses up the hierarchy. A Staff Development Fund was provided by the Commonwealth to be administered jointly by the unions and university administrators. There is an assumption that universities will provide more on-the-job training and especially improve staff development for junior academics. Each university has to negotiate staff assessment or staff appraisal schemes and procedures to assess incremental advance. Promotion and probation criteria are to be altered to comply with the new position classification standards. There is to be a reduction in casual staff by increasing tenured to untenured staff to the ratio of 70:30 and 30% of Level A staff are to be tenured. The first step in most universities to negotiate these changes was to set up an award restructuring consultative committee, composed of half union and half management members.

In universities where there was little communication between unions and management, these consultative committees were a step toward greater involvement by staff (at least union executive members) in decision-making within their universities. Mathews (1989) noted that one of the benefits of the Accord was increased democratisation of the work place due to workers' increased control over the labour process. This is possibly one of the benefits that has accrued to academics in award restructuring. However, it may also have led to more adversarial relations between staff and management in some universities.

The real test of award restructuring is not in the salaries gained (important as these were) but in how the various changes are implemented in each university. This study wanted to assess the implementation mechanisms in two universities and determine the extent to which women benefited from some aspects of restructuring. For example, one of the dangers could be that women in part-time positions may lose their teaching hours when jobs are converted to tenured ones and less money is available to hire part-time staff.

POTENTIAL OF USING AFFIRMATIVE ACTION IN AWARD RESTRUCTURING GENERALLY

The equity officers on some campuses (Newcastle and Flinders) were involved directly in the Award Restructuring Implementation Committees set up as joint consultative committees between the unions and administration. However, at Edith Cowan and Murdoch, the equity officers did not sit on this committee. At Edith Cowan, such a committee was not established until 1993 after the new Vice-Chancellor was installed. At Murdoch, a number of working parties were set up to deal with award
restructuring and the regular monthly meetings between the union and the senior executive officers ratified the documents produced by the working parties.

When interviewed in 1991, the equity officers at both institutions were uncertain how much affirmative action could be applied within award restructuring but they felt that it should have a role. The former equity officer at Edith Cowan had difficulty getting notions such as affirmative action raised within the university.

“This is the place where time forgot. Nothing has happened here for decades in the way of equal opportunity.”

Another issue she identified was that “There was no forum for affirmative action within the university.” She also suggested that because the university does not operate in an industrial context, it is more difficult to raise certain issues. “We operate on the basis of personalities. Decisions are made in an ad hoc manner.”

In contrast, Murdoch has been seen as a place where affirmative action has taken root and is more integrated within the policies of the university. Contrary to this image, the university has been slow to appoint women into senior positions and has often had only the token woman on important decision-making committees within the university. Murdoch’s equity officer expressed the situation in this way:

“I believe that this place is seen as a hot bed of radical feminists and that scares the hell out of the men. They, therefore, do not want any more women on staff that are going to cause them trouble. It is a reactionary movement. Probably the administration doesn’t even see gender imbalance in the top positions as a problem.”

When interviewing academics in 1991 about the potential for using affirmative action, some of the same scepticism emerged. As one academic from Edith Cowan said “Affirmative action is a joke. The university produces a fancy document but doesn’t get anything done.”

Despite this kind of negative impression of affirmative action within the university, most academics I interviewed (14 females and 1 male or 68%) felt it could be applied within the award restructuring process. These were some typical responses.

“Of course, affirmative action for academics was well and truly part of the award restructuring process. For example, industrial officers in FAUSA were women and the whole underpinning of award restructuring is a product of the efforts of these women to promote affirmative action, such as giving women a career structure and allowing for promotion.” (Female, Humanities, Murdoch)

“I think there should be affirmative action for women but also and more importantly for ethnic members and Aboriginals. They should gain lecturing positions which are not based on just having higher qualifications but could be based on who the Aboriginal community thinks should be lecturing at this university or in a particular course.” (Male, Youth Studies, ECU)

There were a few (2 males and 1 female or 14%) who said yes affirmative action should be used but then they questioned the kind of policy that might be implemented.

“I am not against it but policy needs to be interpreted in a much more satisfactory manner. I feel it disadvantages people in my position. We are taking the rap for older academics! In saying this, I know that women are disadvantaged—I’m not saying they’re not. The decisions made have tended to disadvantage junior untenured men. The drive to increase the crude overall numbers of women doesn’t help me. I have a PhD but the job market for the last four years has been bad. I’m the wrong age (considered too young) and the wrong gender to get a job.” (Male, Aboriginal Studies, ECU)

“I’m all for equity and equality but I’m not sure about the category ‘all things being equal you should appoint a female’. As a woman, I’d rather compete equally and gain on my own merit.” (Female, Mathematical and Physical Sciences, Murdoch)

There were also a few (3 males and 1 female or 18%) who said they really did not know enough about affirmative action to judge.

“I haven’t considered this enough. I don’t know... it always confuses me. I’ve never really experienced affirmative action in action. It presupposes you can’t distinguish between people when in reality I haven’t experienced this.” (Male, Veterinary Sciences, Murdoch)

“I don’t know enough about it.” (Female, Business, ECU)

IN TENURING OF LEVEL A’S

Both of the equity officers brought up the question of whether the tenuring process should be centralised or devolved to schools. The question at Edith Cowan was whether the tenuring needs to be by faculty and if it were to be devolved to faculties, how it could be monitored. The Murdoch equity officer echoed a similar concern but was clearer in her own mind about the right strategy.

“You would have to allocate the affirmative action quota to each school. Otherwise you would see each
school passing the buck to the next. With devolution there is going to be real trouble. This place is disparate enough without going further down that track. EEO has to be centralised."

Only female academics discussed using affirmative action for the tenuring of academics, mainly at Level A. They all (9 females) were in favour of using some sort of basic criterion, teaching, for this level of tenuring. There such as women only tenuring rounds or having only one merit.

"Nursing staff will always be disadvantaged in the tenure game in the whole of Australia. For example, now at Edith Cowan 26% of Nursing staff are on tenure, while 85% of Education staff are tenured. I would go for a 50:50 ratio rather than a 70:30 one. Staff work harder when they are on contract. They tend to get a bit complacent when tenured." (Female, Nursing, ECU)

"In terms of affirmative action in confirming tenure. I have mixed feelings about the reduction of contract positions and the increase in the percentage of tenure. Contract people bring in new energy and enthusiasm into the institution. Those who have been around a long time have given up, can't cope. They give in to the internal culture of this institution, the constant monitoring by the Vice-Chancellor wears them down." (Female, Nursing, ECU)

They also distinguished between affirmative action and equal opportunity and they tended to prefer the latter, not wanting quotas and preferring to be judged on merit.

"At Level A, there would be a case for clearly defining the criteria and putting more emphasis on teaching. But I probably would go more for EO than for AA. I would then throw it open, define the criteria carefully and then allow the procedures to work. Of course, you could define the criteria to benefit the women and you could give the women training, assertiveness training for presentations and preparation of CV's." (Female, Humanities, Murdoch)

"I think that increased tenure at Level A is good but I think that tenure should be done on the basis of the proportion of females to male, I'm not happy with more women getting tenure, or with all the positions going to women. I support equity as opposed to affirmative action." (Female, Mathematical and Physical Sciences, Murdoch)

No one suggested some of the more radical strategies such as women only tenuring rounds or having only one basic criterion, teaching, for this level of tenuring. There were attempts at other universities to try some of these strategies. The most publicised was the attempt by the University of Southern Queensland (USQ) to have a women-only tenuring round. Their union began with a resolution to seek an affirmative action agreement within the award structure. Part of the resolution read: "It appears that women have been inequitably treated at USQ in the past, particularly in relation to promotion, appointment and the granting of tenure" (Campus Review, March 11-17, 1993, p 3). It was reported in The Australian that the University of Southern Queensland had become the nation's first institution of higher education to introduce an affirmative action tenure round. "For the next year, applications for tenure will be restricted to female academics as part of a drive by the university to address hidden discrimination". The deputy vice-chancellor, Professor Ken Goodwin was very sympathetic to the idea and commented that: "There are social reasons why society ought to recognise that simply to look at men and women equally in terms of age and experience is unfair and unrepresentative, particularly when women take time out from their career to raise a family" (The Australian, July 21, 1993, p 13).

No sooner had these moves toward a female-only tenure round been publicised than the backlash began. And the reaction came, not only from within the University of Southern Queensland but from other campuses as well. A lengthy letter was published in the Campus Review from a male physicist at the University of Tasmania which concluded with: "Rather than accomplishing their stated goals such policies breed resentment and foster the suspicion that promotions made under them were given for reasons other than merit. Such policies also punish all the members of one sex for the past actions of a few of their members" (July 29-Aug 4, 1993, p 8). Only two weeks after the initial publication of the initiative, it was reported that the University of Southern Queensland had shelved the idea because the Vice- Chancellor had received legal advice from the Australian Higher Education Industrial Association that a women-only tenure round would attract the operation of anti-discrimination legislation at a State and Federal level (The Australian, Aug 4, 1993, p 13).

The Academic Staff Association at USQ reacted with a stop-work meeting and the threat of industrial action. The meeting's resolution included a reassertion of support for affirmative action for women in implementing tenure and award restructuring at the university and an authorisation for the university to seek exemptions from the Human Rights and Equal Opportunity Commission and the Anti-Discrimination Committee so that it
would be free to implement a women-only tenure round (The Australian, August 18, 1993, p 29).

The staff also got support for their action from the former minister for the status of women, Senator Margaret Reynolds, who recently visited the campus.

"There is a culture of the old boys' network which still operates and the only way to break down that culture is to discriminate in favour of the old girls if you like. Until we take some creative steps as have been taken in other parts of the world, this culture will prevail and it will be an ongoing battle for women to reach the upper echelons of decision-making or, in this case, academia." (The Australian, August 18, 1993, p 29)

There has not yet been a final decision on whether a female-only round will occur at University of Southern Queensland. The committee that proposed it felt they were putting the university on the map and creating an initiative that would break new ground for universities and affirmative action. However, the Vice-Chancellor feared the repercussions of such an initiative and without consulting the committee, arbitrarily decided that it would not proceed. This angered the staff and they have put on industrial bans. The committee and the unions are still hoping to negotiate with the Vice-Chancellor and seek a compromise on the qualifying period to apply for tenure that may benefit women who have had breaks in their academic service. At this stage, the committee does not feel that a women-only round will see the light of day.

OUTCOMES OF AWARD RESTRUCTURING AND BENEFITS TO WOMEN ACADEMICS

An article in FAUSA Women asserts that award restructuring in Australian higher education institutions has provided women academics with many benefits. The first area noted is in creating a career structure for academics at all levels. It recommended to union negotiators that Level A staff should be eligible to apply for promotion even if they are in a non-continuing position and that applicants should be allowed to nominate weightings in each of the four areas specified, which usually include research, teaching university administration and professional and community contributions. The second area is the agreement that 30% of Level A staff should be in continuing employment. Some universities (eg Macquarie and Flinders) have adopted an approach in which all Level A appointments are ‘convertible’ five year minimum appointments, reviewed during the fourth year to determine whether the position will continue. If it is deemed to be continuing, the individual has the right to apply for tenure. The third area is in the participation of women on the negotiating teams. The article concludes with the comment:

"I ask whether it is just coincidence that universities like Macquarie (where three union women negotiated opposite three management men) and James Cook (where the union team of four had three women on it and the management team none) have seen some of the quickest and most thorough implementation of the award restructuring agreement?" (Matheson, 1993, p 12)

TENURING

The result for tenuring women at three universities in Western Australia, when compared with the percentage of university women tenured across the nation, turns out to be quite impressive. The Department of Employment, Education and Training (1993) reported that university tenured positions for women across the nation to be just 14% in 1991. The differences among institutions in Western Australia indicate that it is more difficult for women to get tenure in the pre-1987 universities (11% at UWA and 18% at Murdoch) than in the newer universities (28% at both Edith Cowan and Curtin). (See Table 1 Appendix 2.)

In 1992, Murdoch University tenured 15 women (or 48%) out of a total of 31 staff at Level A. The results at the University of Western Australia in 1993 were even better in regard to the percentage of women tenured (11 women out of 16 staff or 69% became either tenured immediately with 5 females out of 6 or were designated tenurable within a two year period with 6 females out of 10). Edith Cowan University has not had an official tenuring of Level A round according to the award restructuring procedures but they have had two rounds of tenuring of staff at different levels and of these 9 out of 19 or 47% were women. Two comments from Murdoch staff members attest to the difference this makes in their careers:

"The prospect of getting tenure is quite mind blowing. It takes a lot of the uncertainly away. It really is totally changing my life." (Murdoch Associate Lecturer)

"Award restructuring has improved my potential salary by $10,000 once my PhD is in and awarded. This is something to work for. There is the possibility of tenure at the junior level and a career path." (Murdoch Associate Lecturer)
From the FAUSA Survey on Award Restructuring Implementation (see Table 2, Appendix 2), it can be seen that all the pre-1987 universities which had returned forms in 1993 (17 universities) were either negotiating the tenuring of Level As (one university, NTU) or had completed one round of tenuring Level As. One university, Griffith, had tenured Level As prior to the award restructuring exercise. The situation in some of the universities which had formerly been colleges of advanced education appears to be quite different. There has been greater difficulty in negotiating the tenuring of Level As in those universities but the situation is still unclear as no information has been gathered from those universities nationally.

**PROMOTION**

The promotion procedures have been altered at Murdoch to include weightings which allow areas, such as service in the community and outside experience, to be counted as valid evidence in promotion applications. Staff can also weight teaching more than research although an acceptable standard in each area would have to be achieved to gain promotion. Staff who are untenured are also eligible to apply for promotion if they are in the second period of a renewable contract of three or more years. The results of the 1993 round of promotions are, at the time of writing this paper, not known, but will be reviewed with interest to see if women are given a better chance of gaining promotion by the broadening of the promotion criteria.

The staff and management on the Award Restructuring Implementation Committee at Edith Cowan are still in the process of negotiating their promotion procedures but they should be in place by 1994. This will allow internal promotion for all staff (from Level A to D) for the first time in the university's history.

Of the pre-1987 universities surveyed by FAUSA, all of the universities, except for Tasmania, have negotiated new promotion criteria. The majority (13 out of 17) have negotiated new promotion rounds for Lecturers from Level A to Level B. And a little more than half (9 out of 17) have included weightings for the different criteria in the new procedures. (See Table 3, Appendix 2.)

**TRAINING**

Another positive move toward equality for women has been through the Staff Development Fund which includes in its guidelines a provision for targeting programs for women to increase the goals of equity within the institution. Both Murdoch and Edith Cowan have used this guideline to the advantage of women. At Murdoch a program to give female academics at Level A, a semester's leave to work on their PhD, has enabled ten women to have a concentrated period of time to further progress on their dissertations. Several women have completed their PhDs during their semester's leave. Edith Cowan also funded staff for time release to engage in further studies. In 1992, 9 staff of whom 5 were women in the School of Nursing were granted time release of 3 hours each semester for two semesters and in 1993 a total of 44 staff, 33 of whom were women were granted between 3 and 9 hours time release for a semester. Also, a very successful Women in Leadership Program was run at Edith Cowan during 1992 and 1993 which brought female speakers to the campuses. Conferences were held in each year to investigate ways of increasing female participation in the university's decision making structures and a range of topics were discussed with the aim of empowering women within universities.

**AWARD RESTRUCTURING IMPLEMENTATION COMMITTEES**

At both Murdoch and Edith Cowan, there were at least two women involved on the union side in the negotiations to implement award restructuring. There were no women on the management side of Murdoch and just one at Edith Cowan. According to a comment by one of the union's industrial officers in Western Australia, “the women tend to be more single-minded in their negotiations and appear so reasonable in their demands that they have been able to achieve more than the men who have been involved in negotiations who tend to treat it more as a game where they run the risk of wanting to be seen as good fellows rather than keeping their eyes on the goal” (in personal communication with Kerry Evans, October, 1993).

The story of one woman who negotiated for James Cook University was reported as a case study in *FAUSA Women* (Leveratt, 1993) and demonstrated the importance of having women who had experience of inequity on the committee. Marie-France Mack had been teaching French Literature at James Cook for over twenty years and as a result of award restructuring she was granted tenure and promoted to Lecturer Level B in 1993. When discussions ensued on the Award Restructuring Implementation Committee about situations that were discriminatory, the administration could not get away with saying that cases like that did not happen at James Cook because Marie-France was there to give evidence of what she
experienced and to argue persuasively for the needed changes.

The FAUSA survey shows that women were fairly well represented on the Award Restructuring Implementation Committees. In the category of industrial officers negotiating on behalf of the unions in these committees, about 88 per cent of the industrial officers were women. In other words, in most cases the union industrial officers located in each of the universities were women. Women represented slightly more than a third (or 36.5%) of those negotiating for the union on these committees and slightly more than a fifth (21.2%) of those negotiating for the employers. In many cases this adds up to a situation where women made up about half of the committees but they were generally more evident on the union side of the table than on the management side. (See Table 4, Appendix 2.)

**DISADVANTAGES**

There have not only been benefits for women and staff in general in the award restructuring process. There have also been some disadvantages. The way that salaries were translated across to the new unified salary structure meant that many staff lost several years in their movement up the salary scale and this has meant delays in reaching the top of the scale to apply for promotion. (When a person is at the top of the scale, it is considered to be the appropriate time to apply for promotion, although staff are allowed to apply before reaching the top of a scale.) For some reason, at Murdoch, it appeared that many more women were caught in this translation exercise than men. Perhaps, more men were at the top of the scales. Women, having entered the university in larger proportions more recently, have not had as many years in the system so if they were somewhere in the middle of a range, they often lost about two years' seniority in the translation exercise. Of course, some men were also caught in this same exercise and lost several years on the scale.

Staff at Edith Cowan University entered a major dispute with the administration over reclassifications that were brought about because of the administration's interpretation of the position classification standards and the minimum qualifications that they deemed were necessary at different levels within the scale. In the majority of cases under dispute, the staff were reclassified from Level B to Level A and in some cases, they lost as much as $10,000 in salary. In 1992, sixteen staff members (five withdrew their cases before the hearing) took their cases to a Board of Reference where the union argued their cases. In the process of having their cases heard, many staff felt humiliated by the cross-examination carried out by the university's industrial officer. In the end, most staff lost their cases and felt disappointed with the whole process and even more alienated from the university. Six staff members were reclassified to level B and it so happened that all of these were women.

The employer's group (AHEIA) also managed to introduce staff appraisal for incremental advance. The union negotiated certain conditions which have resulted in a less draconian form of appraisal and a system which should be integrated into a staff development program. This may eventually be of benefit to staff, although any kind of performance appraisal means more form filling and to some extent a loss of autonomy for individual academics. There is the added danger that an autocratic employer could demand unrealistic accounting measures from staff and begin to make the university atmosphere one of a competitive nightmare. Most universities have not yet implemented their staff appraisal programs so it is difficult to comment on the effects to date.

**CONCLUDING COMMENTS**

It appears that award restructuring in these two universities has benefited some women, particularly those at the lower level. A career ladder has been opened to more women. However, at the same time it has become much more competitive to climb the ladder. The culture of universities is changing for both the older and newer universities, not only as a result of award restructuring, but due to the push toward corporate managerialism and leaner, more efficient universities. The restructuring which has emerged from the ideology of economic rationalism imposed on universities by the Labor government in 1988 has meant, among other things, higher teaching loads, retrenchments in some areas, devolution of budgeting within universities with the concomitant development of a layer of middle management and a more powerful senior executive that has become more engaged in strategic planning, the commercialisation and internationalisation of university services and a greater reliance on a user-pays mentality.

With this corporate culture has come a greater emphasis on quality and accountability which is resulting in a more competitive academic environment. Older universities have been nudged into considering teaching to be slightly more important than it has been in the past. It is evident that the culture of promotions and recruitment into universities is slow to change and research publications
still appear to be paramount for getting on within the university. The added criterion of having a research profile for the newer universities has meant that it may become more difficult for women to advance within these universities than it has been in the past. Women now have a foot on the career ladder but the climb to the top appears to be getting ever more treacherous, notwithstanding award restructuring.

If the cultures of universities are going to be more conducive to women climbing the ladder to the top, then women have to become more actively involved in policy-making within their own universities. The gains that have been made in these two Western Australian universities show the importance of having women involved in the negotiations. At the same time, to achieve the desired ends, these women have to be aware of equal opportunity strategies and be willing to take risks in ensuring that some of these strategies become more embedded within university procedures.

REFERENCES


Evans, Kerry (1993) Comments on Women Negotiators, Personal communication as FAUSA Industrial Officer for Murdoch University and University of Western Australia.


Matheson, Leanne (1993) “How has Award Restructuring benefited women?” FAUSA Women, No 1, June, p 12.


APPENDIX I

Survey about Implementation of Award Restructuring in WA Universities in 1993

In September 1993 I surveyed a small (24) group of female academics who had come to a union seminar on Enterprise Bargaining. The staff were from all four campuses (Curtin, Edith Cowan, Murdoch and UWA) and ranged from Level A to Level D. They represented a wide range of disciplines: mathematics, human movement, law, women’s studies, zoology, psychology, applied sciences, education, speech and hearing, social work, politics, literature, microbiology, public administration, communication, business and pathology/genetics. This was clearly not a random or representative sample of staff but it did represent a wide range of staff at the lower levels and from many different schools. I wanted to discover how aware the staff were of the aims of Award Restructuring and how satisfied they were with the accomplishments at their universities.

The majority of staff surveyed were unaware of many of the objectives of Award Restructuring. When they were aware, they were more likely to be dissatisfied with the outcome of the policies. They were more likely to be aware
of Tenuring of Level A staff and changes to the internal promotion system. However, only about half of the staff were satisfied with the tenuring of Level A process and the majority of staff were dissatisfied with the promotion procedures. I asked them to comment on the promotion system with the question “How do you view the promotion system?” and these were a few of their comments.

“Very difficult.”
“Obscure.”
“With suspicion.”

“Reasonable on paper but in practice it is not always the case—your immediate supervisor (Head) is very powerful in influencing the outcome. If your boss does not support your application, you have a minimal chance no matter how good your application is.”

“Still biased towards counting papers. I am beginning to think that is unlikely to change until certain professors retire.”

“There has been an attempt to shift the system to a more equitable balance between research/teaching and administration. But I need proof that the shift is real and that promotions are being made on the basis of teaching and administration in fact and not just in theory.”

“The process is not open enough. Ranking both by School and the University should be available to candidates.”

“My position is an academic one, but it doesn’t function in a ‘standard’ way; therefore, promotion and tenure are difficult, almost impossible issues for me.”

“Not sufficiently supportive of excellence in teaching and insufficiently sensitive to different types of research.”

“With scepticism borne of experience.”

“What promotion system?!”

“No ‘system’!

“As a huge hurdle. That promotions are ‘sponsored’ unevenly across staff; males are actively encouraged while women are assumed to be satisfied.”

“Sloppy to say the least.”

Only about a third of the staff were aware of a change to allow a career path from Levels A to B. These staff were from Murdoch and UWA which indicates the possibility at these two universities that once tenure is granted at Level A, staff can apply for promotion and at Murdoch those on two continuous contracts of three years each can also apply for promotion so a career path is open to most staff at Murdoch from Level A to Level E. Since the tenuring of Level A at Edith Cowan has not been completed and their promotion system has also not been completed, the picture is certainly unclear there and also at Curtin. The same was true of the reduced untenured staff to 30% of total staff. On the whole, staff were satisfied with these procedures where they have occurred or are in the process of occurring.

When it came to staff development policies, two-thirds of the staff were aware that their university had a staff development policy. Of those who were aware, half were satisfied with the policies and half were dissatisfied. Most of those who were satisfied had done a range of courses such as, effective teaching workshops, women in leadership conference, maths education and computer workshops. One also mentioned support for conference attendance. All eight who were dissatisfied said they had received no training (if you do not count study leave as part of training). This demonstrates a slightly different perception of what may be counted as training at different universities. Where travel to conferences is not part of the entitlement of staff, then this is considered training. Where travel to conferences and study leave are considered entitlements, staff are expecting additional types of training to perform their duties and on the whole, suggesting they are not receiving the kind of training they need.

One area which most staff were aware of was development of nomenclature for Level A to Level E. Four staff were unaware and they were all from Curtin which decided not to change the nomenclature and just use Levels A and B. Of those who were aware, only a few were dissatisfied.

Half of the staff were unaware of the staff appraisal policy at their university and half were aware. Of those who were aware, the majority (7 out of 11) were dissatisfied with the policy.

About two-thirds of staff were unaware of whether union observers were included on their promotion or probation committees and about four-fifths were unaware of whether staff had been properly classified on the basis of the Position Classification Standards. The few who were aware (less than six) were generally satisfied with the outcomes of these objectives.

This survey demonstrated a feeling that I have gathered from talking to staff that suggests staff are generally unaware of some of the benefits gained by award restructuring. However, more importantly, it demonstrates the slow pace of implementation on most campuses and the dissatisfaction with many of the outcomes. Staff are not experiencing a lot of positive outcomes from the process, aside from pay rises and the tenuring of Level A staff.
**APPENDIX 2 - TABLE 1**

Women as Proportion of Academic Tenured Staff, by Level and WA Institution, 1991.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>INSTITUTION</th>
<th>Above Lecturer</th>
<th>Senior Lecturer</th>
<th>Lecturer</th>
<th>Below Lecturer*</th>
<th>% of Total Academic Tenured Staff</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Edith Cowan University</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Curtin University of Technology</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>38</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Murdoch University</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>University of Western Australia</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>44</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*In 1991 these positions were not usually tenured (hence the % for Edith Cowan and Murdoch)*


**TABLE 2**

Gender Composition of Award Restructuring Implementation Committees

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>UNIVERSITY</th>
<th>Industrial Officers</th>
<th>Union</th>
<th>Employers</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>NTU</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>MF</td>
<td>MF</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Queensland</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>MFF</td>
<td>MMMFF</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Griffith</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>MMMF</td>
<td>MMMF</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tasmania</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>MMMFFF</td>
<td>MMM</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ANU</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>MF</td>
<td>MMFF</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Adelaide</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>MMM</td>
<td>MMMFF</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Newcastle</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>MF</td>
<td>MMMM (EEO)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Murdoch</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>MF (M-F)</td>
<td>MMMM</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>James Cook</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>MFFF</td>
<td>MMMMF</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>La Trobe</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>MMMMF</td>
<td>MMMM</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sydney</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>MMMM</td>
<td>MMMF</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Melbourne</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>MMMF</td>
<td>MMMF</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNSW</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>MMMMF</td>
<td>MMMM</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Monash</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>MF</td>
<td>MF</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Flinders</td>
<td>FM</td>
<td>MF</td>
<td>MMM (SEC &amp; EEO)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Western Australia</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>(M-F)</td>
<td>MF</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Macquarie</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>FFF (M)</td>
<td>MMM</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| %Female          | 2M 14F              | 40M 23F| 52M 14F       |
|                  | 87.59%              | 36.5%  | 21.2%         |

Source: FAUSA Survey on Award Restructuring Implementation, 1993.
### TABLE 3

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>UNIVERSITY</th>
<th>New Promotion Criteria</th>
<th>Promotion Round from A to B</th>
<th>Weightings</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>NTU</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Queensland</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Griffith</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tasmania</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ANU</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Adelaide</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Newcastle</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Murdoch</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>James Cook</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>(Being negotiated)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>La Trobe</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sydney</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Melbourne</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNSW</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>(Variation)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Monash</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Flinders</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>(Being Negotiated)</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UWA</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Macquarie</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: FAUSA Survey on Award Restructuring Implementation, 1993.

### TABLE 4

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>UNIVERSITY</th>
<th>Tenured Level As</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>NTU</td>
<td>Still Negotiating</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Queensland</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Griffith</td>
<td>Already had tenure of level As</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tasmania</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ANU</td>
<td>Yes (10-15%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Adelaide</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Newcastle</td>
<td>Yes (by advertisement)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Murdoch</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>James Cook</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>La Trobe</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sydney</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Melbourne</td>
<td>Yes (Conversion to tenure of those with 5+ years of service)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNSW</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Monash</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Flinders</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UWA</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Macquarie</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Overall: All universities had some form of tenuring for Level As except for the Northern Territory University which was still negotiating its procedures.

Source: FAUSA Survey on Award Restructuring Implementation, 1993.
Australia needs to develop its women in and for management. Statistically, women are a significant contributor in the workplace. 42% of Australia’s workers are women (see Appendix A); in Germany the figure is 50%. Yet even though women comprise nearly half the Australian workforce, 31% percent are clerks and 24% are sales assistants. It is not that women are incapable of managing. Women have managed families for centuries, have used their common sense when supporting male managers and have achieved recognition in society despite powerful forces that prefer women not to demand, not to question and not to think for themselves.

Clearly, one aim of management and leadership development is to help women gain their rightful place in managing people, projects and politics. Australia needs intervening strategies to help get women out of lower income level positions into more management and leadership positions where they have the chance to shape the future of our society - men, women and children.

Women themselves must take ultimate responsibility for developing their management and leadership opportunities. Government, business and consultants can help, but change will only occur if women who have the desire to be developed work together with women who have the capabilities to develop them.

THE CURTIN UNIVERSITY STRATEGY

The Curtin University Management Development Program

In 1990 Senior Management of Curtin University supported the idea of developing management and leadership in their administrative staff. The Curtin University Management Development Program was conceptualised on the basis that management development is needed for the continual increase of productivity and quality of work life. Moreover, the ageing demographic profile (almost exclusively filled by senior male staff) necessitated the preparation of younger managers to take over. A time frame of between three and seven years was envisaged for management development to show its desired results.

Senior Management selected 19 administrative male and female managers earning between $42,000 and $56,000 pa. A 40% female participation rate was set. This was actually exceeded in 1993 with a 47% participation rate when five female staff from another development program were asked to joined. Appendix B shows the profile of female administrative and clerical staff at Curtin University by classification level, 1990 - 1993.

The Curtin University Women in Academic Leadership Development Program

Another program was designed, this time aimed at academic women. As universities are male dominated power structures, the development needs of academic women are consequently very different. Although women are strongly represented in teaching at associate lecturers and lecturers levels, few women are represented at professorial level. In 1992, at Curtin University, 39% of its academic workforce were females. (Appendix C demonstrates the disproportion of academic women staff at each level compared to male staff.)

A leadership development program with men and women would have reinforced the idea that there are no gender-related issues. No Affirmative Action policy compels the University to promote women rather than men. Merit is the deciding factor, and in the past merit has favoured men.

Therefore, a one-year program was arranged titled Women in Academic Leadership. Its premise was that leadership which is attached to a position is not the only kind of leadership available to women who want to influence others and realise their own visions for an improved future.
The principles of the model for the program were self-development, mutual support, networking and sustained mentor relationships. 16 women academics were proposed by the Deputy Vice-Chancellor. Two women declined the invitation. Reasons for nonacceptance were disagreement with the Affirmative Action concept, and personal reluctance to be standing out amongst peers. The program was tailored to meet the needs of the individuals in the program.

Mostly, the women developed their leadership skills in areas where they already possessed expertise and wanted to increase their confidence in voicing their views and asserting themselves successfully in a male-dominated academic environment.

During 1993, the program continued but, this time, was opened to all academic women by self-nomination. Initially, great interest was shown for the skills seminars in self-empowerment. However, lack of time and lack of support by their supervisors and peers forced many of the 60 women academics to withdraw from the seminar program.

From the gains and experience yielded by these two different models, it was concluded that development in organisations is much more effective if supported by the participant's supervisor.

**Development Models**

**Rationale for Different Models**

Before developing women for management, the question needs to be answered: Should women be developed apart from men or with men? Both models have validity. The development of women in management and leadership can either be hindered or helped if men participate in development sessions. Hindered, because women sometimes hesitate to attend seminars where more men than women are present. Men are openly more competitive in learning. Women feel disadvantaged when additional dimensions, such as joke-telling, business name-dropping or even unsavoury language, enter the learning environment.

Women with family or home responsibilities often need additional skills to balance these. Family responsibilities sometimes place stress on women or interfere with management responsibilities especially when small children are to be taken care of. Men seem to be less effected by the same responsibilities.

Women-only development sessions allow for better opportunities to discuss and address issues crucial for the advancement of women in management, such as how to handle aggression, how to get a hearing at a meeting or how to overcome resistance to different problem solving approaches. During these discussions women are surprised and heartened to discover other women feel the same. This experience has not been evident when developing men. Rarely do men speak of other men having similar thoughts or experiencing like conflicts.

The choice of developing women with or without men is governed by the desired outcome: developing women for work in the organisation is best done with men; whereas women are best developed separate from men if they are to grow as individuals.

**Developing Women and Men Together for Management and Leadership in Organisations**

Developing men and women together is best suited in an environment with strong values for equal employment opportunities. To create a greater understanding for the other gender, the development should ideally extend over a longer period. This allows for several interactions under changing conditions. Learning activities with teams of men and women working together under competitive conditions are well suited to foster respect for individual differences.

There are sound reasons for running management development programs for men and women together. If women are to work with men, they need to be developed with men. Women need to understand the values men hold and mirror these on their own values. Women need to learn, from men and with men, the best strategies for approaching life and business issues. Learning with, and from, men does not mean women must copy the male values, only that they must understand them.

However, women may need to learn how to operate successfully in an environment previously managed only by men. Women need to understand the male ego and acknowledge the difficulties especially young men seem to have with a female supervisor. Additional barriers may have to be crossed if manager-staff relationships are subjected to different cultures, races or languages apart from gender.

**Developing Women without Men for Management and Leadership**

A development model which initially separates women from men works best when its aim is to strengthen women rather than training them for corporate effectiveness only.

Throughout history, men have played games; up until now, their games have been mostly war games, where
strategy was a matter of life and death. Women have seldom participated in wars at the front line. Instead, their role was to nurse and support the warriors with food, clothing, love and children.

The game playing has now moved into offices, meeting and board rooms. It is being played at political gatherings and presented to us in the TV viewing of parliamentary debates. The question is: Should women be developed like men and should women learn the rules of the game, to combat with the same armament and be contented with the same kind of victories? Not necessarily! Women’s socialisation process is different, but equally valuable.

Women view the world differently, more holistically. They want to influence the future, and therefore the present society, with their own values. Loden (1985) worked with men and women to find out whether they differ in their values and styles. She concluded that men value controlling through careful organisation, assertiveness or aggressive behaviour and the ability to think analytically or strategically. By contrast, women value cooperation and the team approach, and practise a lower level of control. Women are intuitive, empathetic and collaborative. Their high standards suit the quality drive. Men and women both make useful contributions to business life and women should not think they need to imitate men.

Differences in values and style call for separate development of the two sexes. Women need a model which develops their strengths and helps to improve their areas of apparent vulnerability. Own experiences have shown that women often fail to build on their strengths because of poor self-confidence, lack of useful networks, and insufficient assertiveness in the face of opposition.

Women are frequently not sufficiently skilled in supporting each other to break new ground for the status of women in management and leadership. Hence their demand to be recognised by men will continue to remain unheeded. Change will scarcely be effected by those who fear being disadvantaged by this change (ie. men).

THE FUTURE OF DEVELOPING WOMEN IN MANAGEMENT

Changes in the work environment will most probably call for “management” to be defined in a new way. For decades, authors of management books have defined management as “Working through others”. That model of management was taken from male-dominated organisations, and written up by mostly male management authors.

Only recently, models of women leaders are being considered in text books. The American cosmetic magnate Mary Kay Ash has become a model of a different leadership style. Ash’s charisma is taken from her femininity. The colour pink is the colour in which the organisational success of selling cosmetics is wrapped. She bases her leadership style on the belief that best results are achieved when employees are dealt with as individuals rather than as subordinates who are expected to simply execute orders (Loden 1985).

With more women moving into management positions, bringing with them their values of cooperation, empathy and lower control, the definition “Working through others” may have to change to “Working together” or “Managing with others”. The female style of management may require more longitudinal research in order to be recognised as being different without being less in value.

The development of managers needs to be built on the belief that women, like men, want careers. For example, 20% of German women want to make a career. The percentage of German men wanting careers is 26% (Fey, 1993).

Men and women in management and leadership positions face several challenges. Both must deal with:

- the challenge of management and leadership issues in our corporate and social world;
- the challenge of “making it”; and
- the challenge of coping with a world where values are changing rapidly.

Women face extra challenges:

- how to combine career and family without burning out;
- how to use personal power to motivate and guide others rather than using positional power to enforce decisions; and finally
- how to sell the idea that women’s management style, whilst being different, is just as successful as that of men.

During his visit to Perth in September 1993, American management author Stephen Robbins predicted that gender would influence managerial effectiveness in the 90’s. Robbins argued that our future would be shaped by organisations without boundaries. Those organisations would require high levels of interpersonal skills. Women, having superior interpersonal skills and showing a more flexible approach to change, could offer better value than men in the organisations of the future.

Klopper (1993) came to a similar conclusion after researching the suitability of female educators for change in southern Africa. She compared the successful style of managing change with the characteristic style of female leadership. She found that women possess natural skills to bring about change successfully. However, Klopper also found women required training in the areas of risk taking,
communication with men, in-depth knowledge of developmental needs of women and working with the “big picture” (see appendix D).

In the future, we need to help more women to cross from the shore of expecting change to the shore of directing change, to move from being agents absorbing change to agents directing change. The river women have to cross is not treacherous, only unknown, and women are strong swimmers in life.

CONCLUSION

Learning from the past, and looking toward the future, society is well advised to take advantage of the total skills and talents available from both men and women. Only then will society have a chance to overcome adversity and reach its maximum potential. Developing management and leadership skills of women, with or without men, needs to be governed by the desired outcomes. The development of women, in and for management and leadership, is no longer a question, it is an imperative with a very high priority.

REFERENCES

Fey, Dr G., Degefest, Stuttgart, Germany, Management Training for Women - Necessity or not?, Workshop conducted during 22nd IFTDO World Conference, Hamburg, Germany, 8/1993.

Klopper, S.M., University of the Orange Free State, RSA, Training Women for the Management of Change, Workshop conducted during 22nd IFTDO World Conference, Hamburg, Germany, 8/1993.


Robbins, S. Management Author, Verbal presentation during seminar at Curtin University of Technology, Perth, West Australia, September 1993.

APPENDIX A

Some Statistics Worth Improving

Women represent about 42 per cent of Australian workforce.

80 per cent of women work in four industries:

- Wholesale and retail trade
- Finance
- Property and business services
- Community Services
- Recreation and personal services

More than 50 per cent of employed women occupy two occupational groups:

- 31 per cent are clerks
- 24 per cent are sales assistants

Source: Women and Work (Women’s Bureau) October 1993

RECOMMENDED READINGS ON THE TOPIC

Aisenberg, N. and Harrington, M. 1988, Women of Academe- Outsiders in the Sacred Grove, USA: The University of Massachusetts Press.


**APPENDIX B**

**FIGURE 8:** % Female Administrative Clerical Staff by Classification Level, 1990 - 1992

**APPENDIX C**

FTE Academic Staff at Curtin University by Gender - 1992

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Classification</th>
<th>1992</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>F</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Professor</strong></td>
<td>3.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Assoc. Professor</strong></td>
<td>10.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Sen. Lecturer</strong></td>
<td>36.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Lecturer</strong></td>
<td>147.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Assoc. Lecturer</strong></td>
<td>77.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Hourly Paid</strong></td>
<td>143.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>TOTAL</strong></td>
<td>417.9</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Percentage Female FTE Academic Staff - 1992

**APPENDIX D**

STUDY RESULTS ON PERFORMANCE OF FEMALE EDUCATIONAL MANAGERS' CHARACTERISTIC STYLE

- **Situation Analysis**
  - Not opposed to change

- **Introduction of change**
  - Informative
  - Persuasive
  - Motivative
  - Considerate

- **Communication**
  - Personal level communication
  - Concern for listener
  - Informal style
  - Frequent
  - Sufficient time
  - Use questions
  - Talking to staff

- **Staff Involvement**
  - Collaborative style
  - Stimulate productive work

- **Support of staff**
  - Good leader
  - In favour of training and supportive
  - Democratic style
  - Sharing power

- **Implementation**
  - Cooperative planning
  - Ample sensitivity to "read" staff's feelings
HISTORICAL BACKGROUND

Mater Dei is located about one hour's drive south-west of Sydney in the fast growing area of Camden. The area was formerly a rural hamlet and has a significant historical background associated with John Macarthur of the wool industry fame. There are a number of National Trust houses in the area as well as a number of tourist attractions. The property, originally known as Wivenhoe, was bought by the Good Samaritan Sisters in 1911 so that they could relocate their girls' orphanage from Manly to the relative safety and seclusion of the country. Through the ensuing years it changed from an orphanage to a boarding school for intellectually disabled girls to a co-educational day school with off-site residential houses which provided an independent living program five days per week.

CONTEXT FOR CHANGE

By 1990 a number of factors were pointing to inevitable changes to the conduct and concept of the school and its residential component:

- The advent of the International Year of the Disabled and its subsequent moves to deinstitutionalisation and integration of students with disabilities from special schools to regular schools.
- The policy that children should be maintained in their homes with their families for as long as possible rather than placement in residential services.
- The fact that religious orders were experiencing significant recruitment declines thereby reducing the number of religious teachers available for staffing their schools and the consequent reliance on the laity.
- In the discipline of Welfare, a move away from a charity base to one of professionalism and dignity for people in receipt of services including the acknowledgment of rights as a matter of social justice.
- At the local level, because of poor judgement and management difficulties, Mater Dei had deteriorated from a leading position in the field of provision for students with an intellectual disability to a state where its ongoing viability was seriously in question. By the end of 1991, staff and Board of Management were in conflict, the parent body was divided, there were negative community perceptions and the Order was questioning the worth of one of its more laudable works.

THE PROCESS OF CHANGE

The Conflict

In accepting the position, it was critical to ensure that the Principal/CEO had the unequivocal support of both the Order and the Board of Management as a number of extremely sensitive issues had to be dealt with and individuals in the organisation had established a practice of eliciting support from Board members and Sisters which had exacerbated an already inflammable situation. This insistence proved to be invaluable over the first two years, in particular as changes and rationalisations were put into place.

Immediate Goal

The major goal for the first year was to establish as much harmony as possible between all the key players in the organisation. The first step was to immediately rationalise the administration area as it had become highly political and epitomised the depth of disharmony and acrimony endemic in the organisation. This was done with overt Board support and working closely with industrial representatives. This action was completed within 8 weeks with industrial support and the following of due process, which then quickly established authority and credibility of the new leadership.

Commissioning a Review

This review, known as the Wolfe Report, was conducted by an outside firm of consultants, the purpose of which was to give the Board a clear mandate for future directions. The review was carried out in very close consultation with the Principal/CEO and also considered the view of staff, parents and Board members. It considered curriculum, policy, management, organisational structure, context and future directions. This review paved the way for ensuing action and whenever resistance occurred, attention was directed to its recommendations which had the imprimatur of the Board.

Professional Development

Through a consultation process involving all staff, a professional program was instituted which was a combination of developmental and specific one-off conferences/seminars. Whenever these initiatives were challenged, individuals were reminded that decisions were reached through a collaborative basis.
Development of a Strategic Plan

It was deemed critical that staff shift their insular views to a broader plane and to begin ‘dreaming dreams’ of what could be possible for Mater Dei. This had a two-fold purpose: to contribute to the development of a future plan to divert attention away from the insularity and incestuous nature of an organisation which had turned in on itself.

IMPLEMENTATION OF CHANGE

As a result of the Wolfe Report and the subsequent development of a strategic plan, a number of initiatives were implemented with particular notice being given to timing and process.

Staff Morale

Affirmative action was taken to openly applaud ‘good practice’ and to introduce the concept of a problem-solving approach. Regular celebrations took place, some planned, some ad hoc. As valued behaviours and practice became clear, staff who found difficulty complying either left or adapted.

Organisational Decision Making

A gradual devolution from the hierarchical approach to a flatter model occurred. This took a great deal of adjusting from individuals who were used to taking all issues directly to the “boss” and required middle management professional development and support.

Redevelopment of a Mater Dei Community

Again, celebrations played a large part in the continuing growth of community. Whole organisation professional and personal development days also played a significant role. However, perhaps the most significant factor was the value placed on each individual member of the community so that he/she felt a worthwhile contributor. This emphasis was based on the work of Thomas Barr Greenfield and his views on organisations.

Redevelopment of Wider Community Links

An energetic campaign was undertaken to re-establish a presence in the ‘outside world’ by:

- Participation in Council initiatives and services, giving presentations to local service clubs, liaising with local politicians, sending information to relevant government bodies.
- Contact with professional bodies relevant to the organisation: the Catholic Education Commission, the local Catholic Education Office, the Department of School Education, the Association of Independent Schools, the Independent Special Schools Heads Association and so on. Included in the contact were responses to particular issues, membership of working parties and advisory committees, attendance at meetings and a number of presentations to conferences mounted by some of the above groups.
- In terms of publicity in the broader sense, a video, an annual report and a number of smaller publications have been produced as well as the appointment of a part-time Development Officer.

Program of ‘Beautification’

If an organisation is to be seen as viable, alive and growing, it must convey an appropriate image. Gardens have been replanted, student facilities have been erected, the reception and administration areas have undergone renovation, and welcoming signage has been erected. This refurbishment program is continuing as funds become available.

Development of a Policy & Procedures Manual

The process used was a collaborative one and included such policies as Occupational Health and Safety, Staffing Recruitment, Professional Development, etc.

Cultural Change

Naturally, any change to an established culture is a long term process, however, by building on much of the valuable work carried out in the past accompanied by the recruitment of a significant number of new staff, a basic change is taking place. The major challenge has been to move out of the welfare/charity model which has traditionally gone hand in hand with disability, and to move into a professional approach. The major changes have been:

- The appointment of qualified staff
- The implementation of policies, procedures and professional development programs
- Development of training programs for volunteers
- The absolute belief in the abilities of young people with disabilities and their inherent dignity. This values them as equals who can make a positive contribution to their society
- Access to mainstream schools and curriculum with ‘integration’ as the underpinning philosophy for all the services but especially the school.

Establishment of New Programs

As a result of a number of “brainstorming” sessions with staff of all the possibilities for development at Mater Dei, a plan was put in place for the establishment of two new services and redirection for an already existing service.
Family Resource Program
A review of the Residential Program was commissioned which clearly contexted a revamped service in current research and trends in residential services for children and young adults, particularly those with intellectual disabilities. The result was clear focus of the service towards the family and family needs. This service is now on the path to becoming much more flexible and adaptable and based on needs. New staff have been recruited and new life has been breathed into a 10 year old service, which was revolutionary in its day but had changed little since its inception.

- Early Intervention Outreach Program
In response to staff suggestions and identified needs expressed by the local Council, a submission was presented for State Government funding to establish this new service in one of the fastest growing areas in NSW. The Bethany Early Intervention Program began in September 1993 with the appointment of a Coordinator, and already a number of families are in receipt of educational programs and therapy services.

Wivenhoe Vocational College
One of the parents’ greatest concerns being expressed was the dearth of post school services for young people with disabilities. The National Heritage building called ‘Wivenhoe’ was vacated by the Sisters and Mater Dei put in a bid to establish a Vocational College with the student population being 70% mainstream, 30% disadvantaged or disabled youth. Hospitality and Tourism was chosen because it is the fastest growing industry in NSW and particularly in the Macarthur area and affords the disabled and disadvantaged a wide range of possible employment options. Carmichael AVC pilot money was granted to set up the initiative. It has slowly progressed over the year and its second year looks forward to significant expansion.

THE ORGANISATION TODAY
Although day to day challenges continue to arise, the organisation has made a significant shift over the past three years. Mater Dei now enjoys positive community perception and credibility as an organisation. It is seen as alive, growing, developing and enjoys outstanding community support. The culture is moving away from that of welfare to a more service oriented basis, although remnants of the charity mentality continue to exist and this will probably continue to be the case for some time to come. The organisation has a flatter structure with middle management taking a much greater part in the decision making.

Some problems continue to exist, not the least of which pertain to funding, however the grant success rate is high. A perennial problem continues to be the stigma of disability and vestiges of old perceptions of the organisation. Changing ingrained attitudes takes patience and time. The personal legacy as leader and the driving force behind the transformation has been quite high. Social and family life has been out of balance, minor health complaints have become more evident, all pointing to a high degree of stress. However, in the consolidation phase over the next few years, it is envisaged that a more balanced lifestyle will be possible: indeed, probable.
Is National Service more Important than Community Service?

ROMAN EDWARD-MOON
EDITH COWAN UNIVERSITY, BUNBURY CAMPUS

Legislation establishes and protects the right of an individual (usually a male) to learn to protect and defend his country and the people therein. The community does not provide similar protection for the rights of the individual to participate in the decision making which will frame the lives of the community and the family. Why?

Maybe this can be explained by the perception that Local Government is only concerned with "soft" issues? If that were so, then perhaps it wouldn't have attracted as many men as it has. Rather than being an equity issue within the Local Government sphere, it is traditional hierarchical structures, which are usually patriarchal, that are the main source of imbalance.

Women who dare to enter Local Government are breaking two taboos, the first being the audacity to step outside the servitude of the employers' paternalistic structure. The second taboo, is to actually knock and enter the hallowed halls of a sphere of government.

Women need to have their voices raised in challenge (not conflict) in order to build a better future for all.

Legislation establishes and protects the right of an individual (usually a male) to learn to protect and defend his country and the people therein. If you look at the Defence Act 1903 (reprinted as at 30 November 1991: 69), part X, section 118A (Figure 1), you will read:

(1) An employer shall not prevent any employee and a parent or guardian shall not prevent any son or ward from rendering the personal service required of him under Parts III and IV. Penalty: $200.

(2) An employer shall not in any way penalise or prejudice in his employment any employee for rendering or being liable to render the personal service required of him ... Penalty: $200.

When it comes to provisions for people to attend to civic duties, the State Public Service Award provides for time-off for official council duties, but at the discretion of the departmental chief executive officer (W.A. Department of Local Government, 1992). The relevant words are "discretion of". So military involvement is enshrined in an Act whereas council involvement is covered by an "Administrative Instruction".

To some this may be the way it should be, after all who is going to protect the country against possible aggressors? I used to think that way too, however if you read Marilyn Waring's book, Counting for Nothing (1988) the military establishment is just big business. Marilyn points out that, "Arms expenditure exceeds world spending on health by 28%." She continues, "Military spending in 1983 was over 5% of world output and twenty seven times as large as all the overseas development assistance provided by the OECD countries in that year" (Waring 1988, p. 136). The doubling of the United States' national debt, which was $914 billion in 1980 rising to $1.841 trillion in 1985 was (Waring, 1988, p. 138), due more to the growth in military expenditures than to any other factor.
Here in Australia, the defence spending is “forecast to be 9.3 per cent of Commonwealth outlays for 1991-92 (Year Book Australia 1992, p.140) See Table 1. This spending came to over nine billion. It is nice to see that some effort is being made to spend a proportion of this amount in Australia “reflecting greater local industry involvement and increased self-reliance”. This figure is now eighty-seven per cent whereas before it was seventy-six per cent! So if the world’s governments were providing for the needs of their people properly who would need the war machine?

It doesn’t end there. In order to see why community service, and the work undertaken mainly by women isn’t considered important or worthwhile, we need to look at the system of economics and national accounts and the United Nations System of National Accounts (UNSNA). The latter is the international system of economic measurement (Waring 1988, p.2). Marilyn points out that in the worldwide economic system, the arms race registers death both as manufactured production and “as a ‘desire’ to consume it as a government service. So death by war has a mathematical value. Other death - by poverty, starvation, thirst, homelessness, disease - is not of the same order. It is not even registered as a deficit. These deaths do not enter the market - their “value” is in registering no cost to the market” (p. 140).

The economic system doesn’t even value housewives and mothers caring for children. The concept of “production” relates to labour to produce “surplus value” or in other words profit generating. So women engaged in home duties are not considered to be “working” as far as economic input is concerned, and so are “economically insignificant” (Waring 1988, p. 22). To quantify this further, Marilyn states that, “In the United States in 1980, 52.7 million women participated in voluntary work that was valued at $18 billion. It was not calculated in the national accounts (p. 55).

Reinforcing this system, is the portrayal of war and the military in literature and in films. Tania Modleski (1991, p. 66) in describing the book Man and Woman, War and Peace states, “...even among men with feminist sympathies war is a condition that is felt to endow men with superior truth and insight”. Superior truth and insight in what? Men haven’t learnt anything, they are still willing to play their war games and somehow rid themselves of what they perceive to be the weak aspect of themselves, as Modleski says (p. 65) the “misogynist heart of the warrior mentality...” The movie Top Gun suggest the same thing that is, “that sexual and military conquest are somehow intimately related, and that the relationship has to do with the need to conquer femininity both within and without”.

How do we start to change this? We start to change this, by becoming involved. It is not enough to sit back and think things cannot be changed or that one lone voice will not make a difference. One lone voice with another lone voice and another and another, will have to start making a difference.

As well, we need to recognise our “addiction” to the “white male system” as Anne Wilson Schaef calls (Rohr and Martos, 1992, p. 19). A system she says women have bought into and defend just as strenuously as men do. Simply by recognising that, this male system is not the only thing that exists, that it is not innately superior, that it does not know and understand everything, it may be totally logical, rational and objective, but who wants to be just that?, we as women, as whole beings can see these for what Anne Schaef calls them “four myths”.

Another way we can make a difference is to encourage women to become involved in the three political arenas. Ten states have never elected a woman to either house of Congress, and 1991 was the first year in history that at least one woman served in all state legislatures. “In 1992 women hold only 18% of all seats in state legislatures... There are only two women U.S. Senators. Finally to give this a global perspective, one-third of all world governments have no (sic) women members” (Jones 1992, p. 110). Is it no wonder the world is in a mess? Here in Australia we are slightly better represented. Table 2, shows the breakdown of the numbers of members of parliament. Table 3, shows the proportion of women who were local government members in June 1992 (Women in Australia, ABS. catalogue number 4113.0, p.153).

Neylan and Brasch describe Local Government as being the “epitome of an all-male club” for most of its 152-year history. It is easy to see why this is so if you consider that, Australia’s first woman councillor, Cr Susan Benny was appointed by the Governor to the Brighton Council in South Australia in 1919. The first female West Australian councillor was Cr Elizabeth Clapham, who was elected onto the Town of Cottesloe in the following year (W.A. Dept. Local Government 1992, p. 1). Both of these women were elected some 79 years after local government was established in this country. Do you know what the main reason for this was? Until 1919, it was illegal for women, along with criminals, the insane, bankrupts and the clergy, to become councillors. Figure 2, shows the front page of the Municipal Corporation Act, 1906, stating, “...the principal Act is hereby amended by omitting the words “no female,” in the first line thereof... (W.A. Dept. Local Government 1992, appendix 1).
The figures for the 1980’s are not really that much improved with only 6.2% as women Councillors. This figure tripled between 1980 and 1992 “...this is all the more significant when one considers the increases in the number of women elected to federal and state parliaments during the same period were relatively modest. Indeed, the increase in female representation in local government was more than double the increase in female representation in federal and state parliaments during this period.” Figure 3, Table 4, shows the increase in women members of parliament and local government, expressed as a percentage of total elected members (Neylan and Brasch 1992 Sept.).

(Table 2 Shows the breakdown of the number of women and men members of parliament). (Table 3 Shows the proportion of women who were local government members in June 1992). (Figure 2 Shows the front page of the amendment to the Municipal Corporation Act of 1906). (Figure 3, Table 4 Shows the increase in women members of parliament and local government, expressed as a percentage of total elected members.) (Table 5 & Figure 4 Show women Aldermen/Councillors in local government by state, and the increase between 1980 and 1992 of women in local government).

Table 5 and Figure 4 show omen Aldermen/ Councillors in local government by state, and the increase between 1980 and 1992 of women in local government. Don’t let the last figure fool you, it certainly looks significant, but really total representation in only close to 30% in one state, and nearly 20% in three or four others. This is nowhere near the 51% of females in the population according to the last census.

Why are there so few women in local government? If the recommendations produced in a report by the W.A. Department of Local Government are examined, there are several barriers women face in participating in local government, including the financial costs in running a campaign, isolation from other female councillors, male oriented structures, restrictive community attitudes, family responsibilities and the lack of female role models. The latter is especially the case for women in small rural communities where women are the least represented (W.A. D.L.G. 1992, p. 2).

Interestingly, a comprehensive study by Nicholas Alozie and Lynne Manganaro (1993) on women’s council representation in the United States showed two significant barriers faced by women wanting to participate politically. These are:

1) The socioeconomic status of women, i.e. “the higher women’s socioeconomic status, the more likely women’s political activity and the formation of a women’s voting bloc...” (p. 388).

2) The other common factor is the skyrocketing costs of mounting an effective campaign (p. 389).

The one is very much tied to the other. Here we are fortunate in that campaigning expenses are, according to the Australian Taxation Office, tax deductible. If you are aspiring to run for office, please check with your Accountant first. This of course assumes you are earning money in the first place, and second that you have it freely available to use for this purpose! To put some figures on this, let us look at what is needed to mount a campaign. Firstly, you have to consider that campaigns are becoming very sophisticated, partly because of political parties wishing to win seats on councils, and partly because we live in a world where the electorate judges your ability by what you present to them in election material. So as far as printed matter goes, you will need, a pamphlet outlining your goals and what you hope to achieve, as well as a profile of yourself. Here is an excellent example of election material for an ex-Councillor of Bunbury (Figure 5 and 6). Also don’t forget as women, we are competing with the possible bias in the community toward male candidates.

(Figure 5 Shows the front and back pages of a campaign flyer for a successful candidate) (Figure 6 Shows the inside pages of candidates election flyer).

Beside this flyer, you would also need “How-to-vote” cards. Why? Because the system of voting used by local government is one based on preferences i.e. the voter has to mark in boxes the order of preference of candidates (Dept. Local Government, Councillor’s Guide to Local Government, 1988, p.32). These can be distributed at the polling booth, but also as you door-knock your ward. I haven’t mentioned possible letterheads, postage, press photographs, radio advertising, newspaper advertising, or anything else that would help a prospective candidate across the line. Cost for printing alone could be in the order of $2,000.

Alozie and Manganaro (1993, p. 386), actually examine the size of Councils in determining whether women gain a position. “It is assumed that white males will have a diminished desire to seek less prestigious office thus freeing up opportunities to women. In practical terms, this thesis translates into a (sic) expectation that women will acquire more council positions the larger the council. However, empirical assessments do not demonstrate a significant relationship between prestige,
council size, and women’s representation.” Further they suggest that if a council is large, the number of women is more likely to foster “descriptive tokenism”. In other words there are so few on the council that they cannot hope to have an impact on decision-making. This is not to dismiss their involvement, but it is the beginnings of “eventual empowerment of a political minority”.

So why would a woman want to take on civic responsibilities?

Why would you want to spend hours trying to decipher hundreds of pages of financial budgets (in the case of Bunbury this would include the budget for the Water Board)?

Why would you want to spend hours reading agenda papers?
- Each Committee Week there can be approx. 400 pages to be read in preparation, not to mention site visits for the Health, Building and Town Planning Committee. This is one of three standing committees.

Why would you want to agonise over decisions that will be fair to everyone, only to be accused of favouring some and not others?
- The debate over retail trading hours is one example, traders don’t want extended hours, shoppers and those promoting tourism do.

Why would you want to stand up and support condom vending machines in public toilets only to be accused of promoting a promiscuous society?

Why would you want to make yourself available for telephone calls any hour of the day or night?

Why would you want to place yourself in a position where most of the population thinks you’re only in it to get some financial gain? Lots of people express surprise when I tell them Councillors don’t get paid.

Julia Jones (1992, p. 111) provides the best answer to all of this, and that is, “(that) politics is the business of who gets what, when and how, it is the business of deciding who gets to say what goes. That’s a compelling challenge women must be involved in if change is ever to occur!”

Finally, the issue we need to face is to examine ourselves in management roles, in positions of power. I think women have to be better advocates for themselves and by doing so liberate some of those who have hierarchical conformity institutionalised in their psyche. As Grant (as quoted by Gummer, 1988, p. 114) states, “people in power - who are mostly men - mentor, encourage, and advance people who are most like themselves.” This is the extra problem we have to face, in deciding what style of leadership we need to follow and to bring into the workplace. Grant expands further by saying:

Thus, although organizations (sic) have been successful in creating the ‘she-male’ there are arguably negative consequences for both the individual women concerned and the organizations themselves ...These negative consequences ...are the ones necessary to make organizations more responsive to human needs for a sense of connectedness, community, purpose, affiliation, and nurturance (Gummer, 1990, p. 114).

I must admit this was an aspect I had to deal with on Council. There is no training manual on how to negotiate your way around Council Executive, or your fellow Councillors. The only advise I did receive pointed out the grim reality of trying to persuade eleven other people to support your way of thinking. Lindsay and Pasquali (1993, Mar-Apr. p. 36.) rightly point out this sort of situation “creates a demand for women to act in masculine ways if they are to be perceived as effective”. The realisation I came to was this, to simply be myself, and to be true to myself. Mind you even this caused a problem, with me being told I was flirtatious because I smiled alot! Women should not allow themselves to be “desexualised” nor allow the devaluing of the feminine (Lindsay and Pasquali 1993, Mar-Apr, p 112).

I will leave you with a challenge to recognise who you are, and not to be afraid to step out and use your talent to the best of your ability in whatever situation. Don’t be afraid either of gaining and using “power” for we as women don’t look to domination and the ability to control. We look more at power as the capacity of, and for, the entire community (Gummer 1990, p. 113). So commit yourself to equality for all and as Julia Hughes says, a greater voice in action!

BIBLIOGRAPHY


**TABLE 2**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>No. Women</th>
<th>No. Men</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Senate</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>57</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>House of Reps.</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>138</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NSW Council</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NSW Assembly</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>90</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Victoria Council</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>37</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Victoria Assembly</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>79</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Queensland Assembly</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>79</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SA Council</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SA Assembly</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>43</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WA Council</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WA Assembly</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tasmania Council</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tasmania Assembly</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NT Assembly</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ACT Assembly</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>117</strong></td>
<td><strong>725</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**TABLE 1**


<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>PROGRAM</th>
<th>$'000</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Forces Executive</td>
<td>970,723</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Navy</td>
<td>1,414,819</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Army</td>
<td>1,905,687</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Air Force</td>
<td>1,566,991</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Strategy and Intelligence</td>
<td>179,101</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Acquisition and Logistics</td>
<td>2,347,342</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Budget and Management</td>
<td>466,092</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Science and Technology</td>
<td>215,004</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>9,065,759</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Department of Defence

**TABLE 3**

Women as a % of Local Government Members, June 1992

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>0</th>
<th>5</th>
<th>10</th>
<th>15</th>
<th>20</th>
<th>25</th>
<th>30</th>
<th>35</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Senate</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>57</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>House</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>138</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NSW</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>27</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NSW</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>90</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vic</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>37</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vic</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>79</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Queens</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>79</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SA</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>17</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SA</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>43</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WA</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>30</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WA</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>48</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tas</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>18</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tas</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>28</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NT</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>23</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ACT</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>11</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>117</strong></td>
<td><strong>725</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Office of the Status of Women

1. Although the representation of women in local government is small (20%) women make up a greater proportion of local government representatives than they do parliamentarians.

2. In August 1992, 1 in 8 (102) local councils were headed by women and there were a further 1,328 other women elected to councils.

### Table 4

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>No Women</th>
<th>Total No</th>
<th>% Women</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Commonwealth</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Senate</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>148</td>
<td>6.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>House of Reps</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>76</td>
<td>23.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>224</td>
<td>12.5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| **State Lower Houses** |          |          |         |
| NSW                    | 9        | 99       | 9.0     |
| Victoria               | 9        | 88       | 10.2    |
| Queensland             | 10       | 89       | 11.2    |
| South Australia        | 4        | 47       | 8.5     |
| Western Australia      | 6        | 57       | 10.5    |
| Tasmania               | 7        | 35       | 20.0    |
| Northern Territory     | 2        | 25       | 8.0     |
| ACT                    | 6        | 17       | 35.2    |
| **Sub-Total**          | 53       | 457      | 11.6    |

| **State Upper Houses** |          |          |         |
| NSW                    | 15       | 45       | 33.0    |
| Victoria               | 7        | 44       | 15.9    |
| South Australia        | 4        | 22       | 18.2    |
| Western Australia      | 5        | 34       | 14.7    |
| Tasmania               | 1        | 19       | 5.3     |
| **Sub-Total**          | 32       | 164      | 19.5    |

| **Total State Parliament** | 85 | 621 | 13.7 |

| **Local Government** | 1653 | 8535 | 19.4 |

### Table 5

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>STATE</th>
<th>1980 Women</th>
<th>% Total</th>
<th>1992 (July) Women</th>
<th>% Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>NSW</td>
<td>162</td>
<td>7.8</td>
<td>375</td>
<td>20.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Victoria</td>
<td>160</td>
<td>6.9</td>
<td>434</td>
<td>19.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Queensland</td>
<td>47</td>
<td>3.7</td>
<td>236</td>
<td>19.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>South Australia</td>
<td>88</td>
<td>6.8</td>
<td>225</td>
<td>19.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Western Australia</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>4.3</td>
<td>245</td>
<td>17.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tasmania</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>5.8</td>
<td>70</td>
<td>14.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Northern Territory</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>8.3</td>
<td>68</td>
<td>30.4</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| **Total**           | 550        | 6.2     | 1653             | 19.4   |


### Figure 4

Increase in Women Aldermen/Councillors in Local Government as a % of Total Elected Members

[Graph showing percentage increase in women Aldermen/Councillors in Local Government in each state from 1980 to 1992]

### Figure 3

Increase in Women Members of Parliament and Local Government as a % of Total Elected Members

[Graph showing percentage increase in women members of parliament and local government from 1980 to 1992]

84
Defence Act 1903

shall be increased to an amount not exceeding 25% of the amount of
salvage not applied in accordance with paragraph (1) (a) and the
amount paid to the Commonwealth shall be decreased accordingly.

Apporition of salvage amongst crew members

Where salvage payable in respect of salvage services rendered by a Naval ship is, in accordance with section 117A, to be
apportioned between the Commonwealth and the members of the crew of that ship, the amount of salvage apportioned to the members of the crew:

(a) shall be applied in meeting the claims of the Commonwealth in
conducting the salvage claim on behalf of the members of the crew; and

(b) in the extent that it is not so applied, shall be apportioned
amongst the members of the crew in accordance with the
regulations.

PART X—MISCELLANEOUS

Members and former members may bring actions for money due in
respect of service

A person who is or has been a member of the Defence
Force may recover from the Commonwealth, by action in a court of
competent jurisdiction, money due to the person by the Common
wealth in respect of the person's service as a member of the Defence
Force.

Penalty against assisting forces without authority

Any person who induces or attempt to induce any other
person to enlist or engage to serve in any naval, military or air force
the raising of which has not been authorised by or under this Act or
any other Act shall upon conviction be liable to imprisonment for any
period not exceeding 6 months.

Employer not to prevent employee from serving

An employer shall not prevent any employee and a
parent or guardian shall not prevent any son or ward from rendering
the personal service required of him under Part III and IV.

Penalty: $200.
INTRODUCTION

One of the key capacities relating to being a Strategist and Leader is having a clear vision of the desired future.

Before women can have a voice and participate proactively in building the future, they must have a clear vision of what they want. In addition, that vision must be a wise and ethical one, that is, creating the greatest good for the greatest number, both men and women. Women must know what they want, why they want it, (their purpose or intention), and have an idea of how to get there.

Women can have more positive and sustained influence on change, not through forcing others to change, but through changing the self first from the inside out. Force negates. We can choose our thoughts, and the more we are able to focus on positive thoughts, the more positive are the changes that can be manifested both in our personal and public lives.

Women may have feelings that range from vague discontent to unadulterated anger, and express this to men, and other women. But unless women have an absolutely clear and wise vision, and can communicate that in a clear, calm, assertive, rational, and persistent manner, women will end up with even greater feelings of hostility, resentment and despair.

PROCESS

This workshop uses a facilitator led exercise to assist participants to articulate their vision by projecting themselves into the future. It also reminds them that they have all the wisdom and knowledge they need to move forward in their lives. The process involves both writing and speaking, sharing of visions, with a particular emphasis on “Words of Wisdom and Advice.” Common themes are highlighted and the group articulates a group vision. Discussion focus is on the power of a compelling and wise vision, and creating the habit of positive thinking, and acting positively.

“How wise is your vision?”

By wisdom, I mean having good, sound judgment that is in the best interests of the greatest number in the long term. There is no absolute right or wrong way of doing. Being wise, or ethical, is a personal thing, that comes from the inside, and is not dictated by external moral codes or legislation. It may even be contrary to popular opinion.

How do we know when we are being ethical?

We feel “clean” about our thoughts, or actions and...
know that we are doing what we need to do to enhance our long term survival, and the survival of others. We do not put limits on ourselves or others. If we place no limits on our capabilities to cause big effects, we will gain in confidence and power. If we are not creating, we are destroying. Would you rather be a creator, or a destroyer?

**CREATING A WISE VISION**

It does not necessarily come from left brain logical analysis, fact files and statistics. More often than not, it comes from the creative right brain, when we are in an alert, yet relaxed state. This could happen after a few glasses of wine, in the bath, in the middle of a jog, during a walk along the beach, or in a dream.

As a leader, your vision needs:
- to be simple, clear, and compelling.
- to honour the past and prepare the way for the future.
- to be persistent and you must reinforce it.
- to be based on a clear set of values.
- a flexible strategy and a consistent commitment through adversity.

**THE PROCESS**

The following visualisation exercise was facilitated at the Conference. This exercise helps participants to articulate their vision by projecting themselves into the future. It asks them to consider the future impacts of choices made today. It reminds them that they have the wisdom and knowledge to move forward with their vision.

Participants were guided into a relaxed state and then asked to imagine they were in a time machine that transported them to the future. They found themselves in a room full of people discussing the importance and meaning of work. They had successfully accomplished all they hoped to achieve and were at peace with themselves.

They were asked to speak to inspire and educate the assembled guests, using the following questions as a guide:
- What meaning does your work have for you, your family, co-workers, the community?
- What adversity have you had to overcome? How did you deal with that?
- What legacy have you left for the future generation?
- What words of wisdom and advice do you have?

Participants were then asked to write down their thoughts, discuss this with a partner before sharing with the larger group.

**MOST COMMON THEMES EXPRESSED**

**Vision:** Express Self fully through helping others achieve their potential.

**Wisdom:** Keep focussed on the Vision - create, not destroy.

**Adversity:** Attitude is important - yours and others. The way work is constructed is not appropriate for all, need to explore alternatives.

The chart shows individual responses.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>VISION</th>
<th>ADVERSITY/BARRIERS</th>
<th>WISDOM</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>There for people-supportive impact by being Self.</td>
<td>People</td>
<td>Be open &amp; honest, broad focus</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Web of Life-interconnected, People - Love of Self and others Peace</td>
<td>Emotional damage-abuse; Political &amp; psychological effect</td>
<td>Total acceptance, unconditional Love</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Love, compassion, Ordination</td>
<td>Emotional barriers</td>
<td>To love Self &amp; Others</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Happy, play piano, fit, healthy, travel</td>
<td>Time/ external force</td>
<td>Build church together</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Autonomy, abundance Energy, interconnected</td>
<td>Work</td>
<td>Find Peace with Self Nurture Care of Being</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Courage to speak feelings</td>
<td>Peoples' attitudes-Own &amp; others</td>
<td>Focus on abundance, energy, autonomy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mental stimulation Goals</td>
<td></td>
<td>Life is a continually moving sea.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Drive &amp; attitude</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Time for self renewal Happiness Express Self</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Share, care, respect values.</td>
<td>Work - set up for Men with wives</td>
<td>Control of Self</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Do unto others...... Celebrate Diversity Building together</td>
<td></td>
<td>Not a victim</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Challenge assumptions Soft strength</td>
<td></td>
<td>Cannot control others</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>To bring equity &amp; justice for people who cannot do so for themselves</td>
<td>Power</td>
<td>Share experience</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Aura of light Great contribution To help men and, especially, women, to</td>
<td>Ignorance</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Pain and struggle of day to day life</td>
<td>Focus on Energy, soft strength</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Take each day as it comes.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Embrace the Struggle of Life.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>We can't go through Life without Pain</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

88
VISION

become more fully human-safe & valued.
Status - feeling of worth/contribution
Helping others to achieve their potential & belief in themselves & the authenticity of, a right to have, their dream.
Move away from a work based Society
Do what you believe in, believe in what you do.
Create independent means.

ADVERSITY/ BARRIERS

Work
Work - need to divest paid work in order to do special things.
Work - juggle time - prioritise - let go - costs

WISDOM

Keep going on the Pathway - follow the beacon.
Don’t waste Time - as our Life is only A Second in the Scheme of things.
Find Balance
Create work that is exciting.

SUMMARY

This exercise guided participants to reflect upon, review or create a personal vision that is wise and provides direction in their roles as leaders. The workshop did not allow the development of strategies to achieve these visions - personal and collective.

This is the logical next step. Participants were finally encouraged to:

Use every letter you write
Every conversation you have
Every meeting you attend
To express your fundamental beliefs and dreams
Affirm to others the vision of the world you want
You are a free, immensely powerful source
Of Life and goodness
Affirm it
Spread it
Radiate it
Think night and day about it
And you will see a miracle happen:
True greatness of your own life.

Robert Muller, Former Assistant Secretary General,
United Nations

RECOMMENDED READING

Women's Voices

RACHEL GREEN
COMMUNICATION COUNSELLOR

ABSTRACT

Sounding clear, convincing and competent as a leader requires more than just ideas and words, it also requires a method of expressing those ideas that commands respectful attention. Using a full, clear, confident voice helps provide an image of credible leadership and gives a woman more chance of being listened to and respected. This paper examines the types of voices women use and encourages women to develop more of their vocal potential.

INTRODUCTION

Being taken seriously is a dream that many women in leadership aspire to, but in order to be taken seriously we need to gain respectful attention of the people to whom we are talking. There are two important aspects which influence this: the content of what we actually say, and how we present them in a way which commands respect.

There are three main areas which influence how we present our ideas: our bodies, our voices and speech, and our language structure. Subtle variations in the sounds of our voices, the positions of our bodies and our speaking styles, can make the difference between being taken seriously and being considered irrelevant. We need to have congruence across all these areas so that the sounds of our voices, the way that we stand and sit, and the way that we speak, confirm the validity and value of the content of our ideas, both at home and at work (Glass 1992).

WOMEN'S VOICES

There are many components of voice including volume, pitch, quality, inflections, range and energy, all of which play their part in the vocal images that we present. When these are coupled with speech variables such as speech speed, pausing, diction, emphasis, rhythm and pronunciation they provide a very powerful component of presentation. All of these voice and speech variables can be developed and refined, enabling women to use their full vocal and speech potential, and to develop a wide range of vocal possibilities to meet the various demands of different situations. Few women however are even aware of their own voices nor of the social stereotypes they may be perpetuating.

Until recently many women grew up within a culture which preferred them to be quiet and not speak out, and historically some women have been severely penalised for speaking in public, (Borisoff and Merrill 1992). This has lead women to adopt vocal features which undermine the importance of what they are saying because they are caught in a psychological double bind: they want to appear informed, intelligent and worthwhile, but not aggressive, threatening or unfeminine. In addition, some women understandably choose not to speak out directly and instead they have ended up relying on subtle vocal nuances which allow them to have some power without directly claiming it, leading them to develop the voice of the manipulator, placater, seductress, nice person, or victim. Consequently many women use voices which are not threatening and it's these same voices which are not listened to. Similarly some women who have significant intellectual contributions to make present their ideas in a way which dilutes the strength of what they have to say. They speak with voices which are high pitched, thin, breathy or quiet, giving the impression that they are tentative, very young or weak.

The soft spoken woman's voice does not carry. She threatens no one; she may lack sufficient force and volume to speak up effectively and convincingly. Women who are hampered by the need to sound feminine may adopt a high pitched "little girl" voice, an artificially "sexy" breathy voice or a volume so low as to be barley audible. In any case the "soft spoken" woman is at a marked disadvantage if she attempts to negotiate a contract, persuade a jury, or present a report. (Borisoff and Merrill pg 10).

Some women speak so quietly that they sound as though they do not want to be heard. Frequently I hear in my courses women who are barely audible saying that it would be aggressive to speak any louder. No! we would not necessarily say a man who is easy to hear is aggressive, why should women think that about their own voices? To be heard means that the person listening no longer has to strain to hear and is less likely to dismiss a contribution as irrelevant. Similarly women make comments such as "won't they think I am bossy, or a
know all or unfeminine if I my breathy, soft voice quality and adopt a clear voice?” Their answer is that until women start using confident, clear voices they may be considered hesitant or weak and their thoughts and suggestions disregarded. Women can end up being their own worst enemies by perpetuating the vocal myths that reside within our social fabric.

Why does it matter what our voices are like? The reason is very simple: it matters because both women and men make subconscious character judgements based on people’s voices, people don’t just listen to our ideas, they are influenced by our voices. Ideologically it is nice to think that we are above such rash generalisations, however it is easy to demonstrate that we do make instantaneous judgements on the basis of people’s voices.

At the conference the attendants at the presentation of this paper were asked to very quickly complete the following questions:

- People who speak softly are...
- Women with low pitched voices are...
- Women with breathy voices are...
- A person with a monotonous voice...
- Someone with a clear voice is...

The results of this were typical of all the other people with whom I have conducted this exercise. Firstly everyone very quickly formed concepts about a person based solely on the single statement about her/his voice. Secondly the results for particular categories were often negative, with people who speak softly being considered as whims, sad, worried, afraid, lacking confidence, quiet, thoughtful, passive, weak or timid. Similarly women with breathy voices were judged to be frustrating, boring, shallow, annoying, unfit, trying to be sexy, dopey, manipulative, lightweight, a vacant bimbo, in a hurry, childlike, a sexpot, sleazy or nervous. Consistently however one voice style has been rated as favourable both by the conference participants and attendees at other courses at other courses. Conference participants said that “someone with a clear voice is...” powerful, exciting, commanding, refreshing, articulate, confident, definite, easy to listen to, easy to understand, intelligent, authoritative, good, well organised, and worth listening to, while people at another presentation labelled a person with a clear voice to be: self confident, good, assertive, intelligent, interesting, authoritative, pleasant, easy, sure, refreshing, easy to listen to, vibrant, bright, lucky, strong or nice.

Obviously people who do judge others by their voices and it therefore becomes important for women to discover whether their own voices are stopping them from appearing confident or being taken seriously. In order to be taken seriously we as women will benefit from refining our understanding of our voices and developing our vocal potential to it’s fullest. There are voice coaches, courses and books (Boone 1991) around that can help anyone gain a fuller vocal range and clear, confident vocal usage. It may only be by women gaining professional feedback on their voices that they discover that their voices have been working against them.

**SUMMARY**

If we as women want to be taken seriously and to influence decisions directly in an open, honest and non manipulative way we need to develop voices which sound as though we are confident, clear and competent leaders. Luckily our vocal evolution continues and recent research indicated that Australian women’s voices are becoming deeper, (Russell A, Pemberton C, Penny L. 1993). Continuing our own vocal evolution may make the difference between being given respectful attention or being ignored.

**REFERENCES**


**Using Charisma to Enhance Your Personal Communication and Leadership Style**

CHRISTINE HOGAN
EDITH COWAN UNIVERSITY

**INTRODUCTION**

The ancient Greeks had an unusual view of the communication process. They believed that the God Mercury plucked ideas from the brain of the speaker, implanted the ideas on the end of a spear, and plunged them into the listener's brain. (Described in Robbins, 1991). Luckily we now know more about the communication process, or do we know as much as we think we know? Theories and models about communication are only about half a century old. In one hundred years time it would be interesting to return and see how much more we will have been learnt about a process which may appear superficially simple and yet in reality is so complex. There are some aspects, for example charisma, which continue to tantalise researchers including myself. I wanted to extend my work already in progress regarding the many varieties of power bases at our disposal (Hogan 1992). In this article my aims are to:

- demystify and summarise the changing meaning of the concept of charisma
- describe research which indicates that some charismatic techniques can be learned
- describe some exercises that can enable the reader to develop some charismatic techniques eg centring or presence, clock time and charismatic time
- identify ways in which charismatic techniques may used in our work and home lives
- alert the reader to the possible use and misuse of these techniques.

**WHAT IS CHARISMA?**

The word charisma is mystical for two reasons. Firstly, it is not possible to specifically define it (Conger 1989). For example, Adolf Hitler and John Kennedy were both charismatic leaders, but vastly different personalities with very contrasting behaviours. There is therefore, no precise recipe of personality traits or behaviours for charisma.

Secondly, the history of the word charisma invokes mysticism. The Greeks described it as an extraordinary gift of the gods. Later, in the New Testament it is used meaning the “gift of grace” (Heron 1993). The term was then used to describe prophesy, wisdom and healing bestowed by God (Conger 1989). In the early twentieth century the sociologist, Max Weber described charisma as an “extraordinary quality” which gives some people a unique and magical impact on others. He described two aspects: firstly personal charisma and secondly that which arises from the role of office. The concept has fascinated social scientists ever since and was part of the original ‘trait’ theories of leadership in the 1940’s (Stogdill 1948).

Interest in charisma increased in the 1980’s and 1990’s in the search to distinguish managers from leaders and in the quest to identify what makes a charismatic leader? Conger 1989, Conger and Kanungo 1988 identify characteristic behaviours of charismatic leaders:

- self-confidence in their judgement and ability (however defined)
- ability to develop a vision for a better future (who defines better?)
- skills to articulate the vision
- strong commitment to that vision and ability to take risks and make self sacrifices to realise that vision
- behaviour that is out of the ordinary, novel, unconventional
- radical change agent behaviours rather than caretakers of the status quo
- environmental sensitivity in that they are able to assess the surrounding constraints and resources needed to bring about that change.

Wilner (1968) and Bryman (1992) summarised the personal attributes of charismatic leaders although they both emphasised that there are no physical or psychological traits that were common to all charismatic people:

- a presence (Mao Tse-tung, Mother Theresa)
- presence of mind or composure under stressful or challenging conditions (Gandhi)
- quality of the eyes (Nasser, Mussolini, Werner Erhard, Lenin, Jim Jones, Charles Manson)
- physical beauty/handsomeness (Kwame Nkrumah, Ang San Su Kyi)
- use of voice, words and style of delivery (J.F. Kennedy, Martin Luther King)
- energy, confidence and endurance (Anita Roddick, Bill Clinton, Winston Churchill, Gandhi)
- image of unusual mental attainments (Sukarno, Mussolini)
• bring forth an almost pathological response from some of the women in their audiences (Castro, Hitler, Nkrumah). (Remember also that men have also responded in this way towards both male and female charismatic leaders.)

FIGURE 1: Examples of People Who have been Described as Charismatic

Who do you find charismatic and why?

| Carmen Lawrence in Western Australia |
| Anita Roddick of The Body Shop |
| Mary Kay Ash of Mary Kay Cosmetics |
| Benazir Butto in Pakistan |
| Mother Theresa |
| Golda Meir in Israel |
| Steve Jobs co-director of Apple Computers |
| Bill Gates of Microsoft |
| Margaret Thatcher in UK |
| President Sukarno of Indonesia |
| Nehru and Gandhi in India |
| Aung San, U Nu and Aung San Su Kyi in Burma |
| Dr. Mahatir, Malaysia, Nkrumah in Ghana |
| John F. Kennedy |
| Pierre Trudeau |
| Mikhail Gorbatchev |
| Jan Carlzon of Scandinavian Airlines |
| Richard Branson, ex owner of Virgin records |
| Madonna |
| Marilyn Monroe |
| Twiggy |

Charisma is not the preserve of leaders and/or famous people. My father and some of my teachers were very charismatic people.

Add your own examples of charismatic people. Do not forget to add people you know or have known personally.

CHARISMATIC CENTERING OR PRESENCE

We know that presence is not the only factor in charisma, since imprisoned or exiled leaders still evoke/d support (Aung San Su Kyi, Nelson Mandela, Ayatollah Khomeini, Mahatma Gandhi). It appears, however, to be a useful starting point. Anita Roddick visits her Body Shops around the world regularly. She maintains her presence however, by employing a full time film crew and by sending to all shops monthly news clips of her travels and new products. She also involves her employees in this visual communication newsreel.

John Heron (1987, 1989, 1993) describes charisma in terms of personal power and presence which are set into dynamic interaction with others.

I do not mean by such power the ability to control and dominate others, to be a source of oppression. I mean the very opposite: the ability to be empowered by one's own resources, the wellspring within, and the ability to elicit empowerment in others. (1993 p 33.)

Heron elaborates on his notions of "presence" through physical bearing:

...the person is in conscious command of how he or she is appearing in space and time. This awareness with command is not distracted by any internal emotional agitation, or by what is going on in the external environment. Being present, then is about conscious use of the self in through the various bodily modes that can relate to other people. (1993 p 32-33)

The development of "presence" has also been of interest to people in the theatre. F.M. Alexander, an Australian actor discovered he could improve the functioning of his larynx by controlling his head and neck movements. The head, neck and back relationship became the centre of the Alexander Technique (1969). Athletes also use the technique to enhance concentration before an event. In group work, Heron suggests that it is useful for facilitators to learn about charismatic power in order to use “distress-free authority” with groups: Being charismatic and hierarchical in the early stages of training to enable people to be more autonomous and co-operative, is a basic principle of facilitation. (Heron 1989 p 132).

Alexander (1969), Heron (1989), Hollier et al (1993) and Crum (1987) all point to the idea of presence as stemming from the concept of centering which is based on one of the key concepts of aikido the Japanese martial art developed by Morihei Ueshiba (1989-1969). Ai means harmony and ki means energy, do means the way. Aikido means “the harmonising of energy”. The skill of centering helps us to bring into alignment our body, mind and spirit. When individuals are combining these it is like living in two worlds at once: their “inner space” world and the “outer physical” world. When one person is generating “ki” energy others notice it. When we are all using it the results are even better. According to Hollioer et al it enables us to:

• focus our thoughts
• feel balanced and stable
• embrace rather than resist conflict
• relate to the other person as a partner rather than an opponent
look for the opportunity that the conflict is bringing
• “flow” with the problem rather than against it.
(1993 Aikido p 1IV.3)

When confronted by a person or a problem and your body is unbalanced what kind of reactions do you notice in your mind and body?

**EXERCISE 1: PRESENCE**

**Choosing to be Centred**

The only way to learn about centering is to learn experientially and practise. I have found it useful to try the following techniques at aerobics classes. Yes, this is a very distracting environment, there is a lot of movement and noise, however, I decided that if I can do it there, I should be able to centre in times of conflict and stress. The other advantage to aerobics classes is that there is very large mirror and I can obtain instant feedback on the look or “aura” of my body as compared to other people in the room. The final advantage is that it helps to pass the time.

When starting exercises of this nature it is useful to set your motivation before you begin ie start with a positive intention. State to yourself what you want to get out of the exercise and that you will do your best to achieve what the exercise is designed to do ie start “as if” it is going to happen. Negative energy or limited concentration can actually prevent you from getting the most out of these exercises. (Heron 1993).

In pairs, take it in turns to experience the following exercise. Decide first who will be A and who will be B.

First try the exercise in an uncentred way and then practise being centred.
• Person A stand with legs about a foot apart.
• Person B places one hand gently on the upper chest of Person A and holds the other hand a few inches behind A’s back. Person B starts to increase the pressure slightly on B’s front until A starts to rock back and forth. Swap roles. See Figure 2.

Person A change your body posture in a stance similar to that suggested in yoga and martial arts like aikido and tai chi: knees slightly bent, legs and feet well grounded and slightly apart, arms at wide elbows slightly bent, spine, neck and head aligned, the back elongated and widened. Breathe deeply. Slowly become more aware of your centre of gravity, the “hara”, just below your navel. Say to yourself “I choose to be centred”. Place your fingers on your centre of gravity, a couple of inches below your navel. Let your stomach muscles relax and sense your centring.

• B place your hand gently on the top of B’s chest and try to rock him/her back and forth.

To increase the level of concentration repeat the exercise, but introduce a distracter.
• This time place a finger tip on the centered person’s nose. Allow him/her to concentrate and centre despite this distraction.

Was there a difference when you had a distraction? What happened?

How could you use centering or presence in your work and/or home life?

It is very difficult to stay centered all the time. Indeed it is unlikely that you would want to be in that state for prolonged periods. Hollier et al (1993) suggest a number of triggers to help us remember to centre:
• say the word centre
• notice our breathing
• unlock our jaws
• remind ourselves of centring before walking through the door to an important meeting
• remember to centre when the phone rings, just before we answer it. This provides an opportunity to practise this skills so we become used to centering, and can do so quickly and easily when it’s needed. (Aikido p 1IV.3)

What triggers can you think of?

Heron (1993 p 41-43) describes four levels which form the basis for personal presence and empowerment. See Figure 3.

An up-hierarchy works from below like a tree with roots, a trunk, branches and fruit. The higher levels do not control the lower. The lower levels support and nourish the high levels.

**Level 1 Presence**

The grounding level is that of feeling the fullness of your presence. This feeling is the well-spring of the up-hierarchy, the source out of which all the other stages emerge. (Heron 1993 p 41). This feeling may be very dependent on levels of self esteem. If you are feeling very low and insecure you may need to work harder to obtain this feeling.

**Level 2 Voice**

Allow your voice, timing, emotional tone, physical timbre, rhythm, inflection and emphasis, pauses and silences arise out of level 1. Remember your voice is an integrated part of your body.

**Level 3 Language**

Let the timing and tone of voice and pattern of sound shape the choice of words, what you say, your ideas judgments and opinions that you choose to put forward.
Level 4 Purpose

Let your purpose, intentions and purposes in communicating be released by the cumulative impact of the previous levels.

Exercise 2
Up-Hierarchy of Personal Empowerment

In pairs take it in turn to say, feel and do the following:

- Place your left hand on your abdomen and say “I am present in my belly” and occupy the whole of the lower part of your body. (Keep your left hand on your belly throughout the rest of the exercise as this helps to remind you to stay centred).

- Place your right hand on your chest and say “I am present in my heart” whilst entering the thoracic space and integrating it with the lower part of your body.

- Place your hand on your larynx and say “I am present in my voice” whilst entering your throat and linking it to the rest of your body.

- Place you hand on your forehead and say “I am present in my head” whilst realigning your head next and spine with the larynx, chest and lower body.

- Finally integrate the whole and say “I am present”.

What did you notice in yourself and your partner as you did this exercise?

Clock Time and Charismatic Time

In the up-hierarchy described above, the timing and speed of speech, ie level 2 are dependant on the integrated presence of level 1. For teachers, leaders and facilitators there are two main sorts of speaking time: clock time and charismatic time. The former is rapid speech and is most frequently used. It is the norm in western culture. It means the rapid shooting of words and ideas and is subtly tense. We have so many messages telling us “don’t be late”, “time is money” “don’t waste time” that we have to do some “unlearning” to use charismatic time effectively.

Speech in charismatic time is deep rhythm speech. The use of the voice is imaginatively shaped and moulded out of the speaker’s living presence. It is born out of his or her conscious grounding, being fully here in the space of the world. It is much slower than clock time use of the voice, contains clear rhythmic inflections and the intentional insertion of pauses and silences. A silence is a longer pause pregnant with intention and awareness, entirely free of all urgency or tension.

(Heron 1993 p 49)

See Figure 4.

The essence of charismatic speech is that it is anxiety free. The speaker is totally centred in him/herself and totally living in the present. Intentional, silences and pauses are used. During silences the speaker emits the ki energy from his/her centre. This use of silence is very different to a simple pause in speech.

Speech in charismatic time may be used intermittently for a number of purposes:

- explaining key points
- emphasising issues of moral or ethical importance
- confronting a group about inappropriate behaviour
- giving meaningful positive and or constructive/change feedback.

Recall the “I have a dream” speech delivered by Martin Luther King in 1963 at the Lincoln Memorial in Washington, D.C. to 200,000 civil rights marchers (reproduced in McCroskey 1986). Inflection, silence, pauses, passion and commitment made King’s message meaningful, exhilarating and memorable for generations to come.

Beware of inappropriate use of this technique. Do not overuse charismatic time or your message may appear pedantic, pompous and patronising.

Exercise 3
Using Charismatic Time

In pairs, take it in turn to describe your house in clock time. When you hear the going switch to describing your house in charismatic time. When the going rings again change back to clock time. The listener listens and using hand gestures gives feedback to the speaker to slow down during charismatic time.

What did it feel like to use charismatic time?
What was it like as a listener to hear charismatic time?
How could you use charismatic time at work or home?

Exercise 4
Use of Charismatic Time for Specific Purposes

In groups of four, take it in turns to use charismatic time for a use that it pertinent to you, for example contracting with a group, explaining something, confronting a group or children, giving feedback. When you have finished the exercise, pause and then give positive and constructive feedback to one another.

Exercise 5
Use of Pause
(From Humes 1991 pl61-163)

Never let words come out of your mouth when your eyes are looking down. The “Pause” is powerful. Try this exercise.
Look down and snapshot a snatch/idea
Look up and pause
Deliver the snatch and pause
Look down and take another snapshot
Look up and pause
Deliver another snatch

With a partner, try out the technique on the following:

A shadow has fallen upon the scene (pause)
So lately lighted by the Allied victory (pause)
From Stettin in the Baltic to Trieste in the Adriatic (pause)
An iron curtain has descended across the continent (pause)
An excerpt from Churchill’s iron curtain speech, 1946
in Hanson 1991 p164

Exercise 6
Expanding “ki” or energy from your centre

In pairs, take it in turns to centre and then as you are talking imagine that you are communicating with your whole body to at least eight corners of the room, four in front of you and four behind you.

What did you observe as a speaker and as a listener?

Why is it useful to learn about charismatic skills?

I have been experimenting with charismatic tools for the last six months with varying amounts of success. For example, before and during mass lectures, at meetings, for making speeches at conferences and when facilitating groups. Where possible, I have asked a colleague to watch me and to give feedback on what she observed in me and the audience. On one occasion during a mass lecture when trying to make a point about “enlightened capitalism” I described the story of the marketing of the perfume “Poison” for which $5 million were invested resulting in one purple coloured bottle. I changed to charismatic time when describing the story, paused for what seemed like an eternity (to me) and looked slowly around the many faces staring down at me from the audience of students and said:

Can you think of better ways in which $5 million could be used in our society today?

Again I stopped, there was an unbelievable hush in the audience and suddenly the hair on the back of my head stood out on end and I could feel a slight up welling of tears in my eyes. The point had been made very powerfully and I felt I had the students “in the palm of my hand” a somewhat uncanny feeling.

There are many uses for charismatic techniques in order to:

- add to our array of communication tools and strategies
- enhance the empowerment of others (Heron 1993)
- use “distress-free authority” as a facilitator (Heron 1989)
- manage conflict more positively (Hollier 1993, Crum 1987)
- develop concentration for example for counselling or sporting activities

Identify when these techniques are being used, so that we can make rational decisions regarding our own values and whether to follow transformational exhortations or not. People who have these attributes and skills have managed to make organisational transformations and instil new visions for the future. Not all transformations are either desirable and/or potentially successful!

Frequently our self esteem is related to what other people think of us. When we practise centring techniques we learn to “be” ourselves and “the need for outside approval falls away” (Crum, 1987). We become more authentic. It becomes less necessary to wear masks and/or surround ourselves with the trappings of success at work and sometimes at home. If we achieve this it is easier to obtain happiness, to live for the present rather than always grasping for the future. The western strategy of goal setting is useful, but if they become overriding, continual driving forces we will always be stretching arms out in different directions like an amoeba. At times it is beneficial to stop and just be.

How could you use charismatic skills in your life?

Can charismatic techniques be taught and learnt?

Bennis and Nanus (1985) Kotter (1990) and Tichy and Devanna (1990) do not regard charisma as an important aspect of leadership as they believe it is rare quality that only lucky individuals possess. Studies by Howell and Frost (1989), Langer (1989), Heron (1987, 1989, 1993) however, indicate that these skills can be taught. Teaching does not guarantee success as the success of charismatic techniques also depends on the relationship between leader and followers ie it is an interactional process and of course environmental and cultural factors have to be taken into account.

Langer (1989) describes two laboratory experiments at Harvard Business School. In the first experiment,
actors who were performing in a Shakespearian play were randomly divided into two groups. Those in one group were instructed to play their parts in as novel way as possible, varying within the realm of the character. Those in the other group were asked to perform their parts as consistently with the script as possible. After the play the audience was asked to rate the actors' charisma. Those instructed to perform in a novel way were rated as more charismatic.

In a second setting she gave encyclopaedia sales people similar instructions to the actors. One group was instructed to approach each new prospective client as if he or she were their very first customer. The other group were asked to be as consistent in their approach as possible. The first group were seen as significantly more charismatic than the second and also more knowledgeable about their product even though both groups had similar information to impart.

Some of the so called charismatic personal attributes can be learnt or at least improved. Margaret Thatcher and indeed many public figures are taught how to improve their “media” image: their use of eye contact, body language, voice, tone and style of delivery. In fact some people like Madonna and Michael Jackson become “media creations”.

James Humes (1991) a speech writer for many American presidents wrote books on the language of leadership based on his analysis of Sir Winston Churchill and others. Humes recommends five secrets of the art of sounding like a leader:

- begin strongly
- focus on one theme
- use simple language
- draw a picture in the listener’s mind
- end with an emotion.

Having read his work it is clear that many famous phrases attributed to leaders were in fact probably written by someone else ie plagiarised. For example Kennedy:

“Think not what your country can do for you but what you can do for your country.”

As a result of my reading and experiments on myself I firmly believe that some charismatic techniques can be learnt. At first these techniques may feel peculiar and uncomfortable. Before you read this article you may have been unaware that some of these skills even existed ie you were “unconsciously incompetent”. During the exercises you may have felt awkward or started laughing and been very aware of your incompetence. As you repeated the exercise you may have become more consciously competent. In future like great artists, professionals, athletes you will be able to acquire the quality of centredness and substance without even thinking about it. Before this you may need to go through the following stages:

- unconsciously incompetent
- consciously incompetent
- consciously competent
- unconsciously competent

When should you use charismatic techniques?

People are often uplifted and/or energised by hearing a charismatic leader in the flesh or seeing them on the media (Bryman 1992). The question that arises is: are they empowered in Heron’s sense to achieve their own will or is there unwarranted manipulation to pursue the goals of the speaker? This is presumably dependent on the content of the communication. There is a fine line between good and evil and who defines it? Heron (1993) talks about the unstoppable world wide movement for human rights which began in the seventeenth century. Who defines these rights? The United Nations list has been criticised because it is culturally based. Presumably individual rights and freedoms stop when they override the common good and interfere with the freedoms of others. And yet many individuals have willingly given up their individual freedom to fight for the common good.

What is appealing to me about the writings of Heron (1993), Hollier (1993) Crum (1997) is that they use charismatic principles, not only to develop personal centring and strength, but also as methods of expanding ki or energy to others. They use the techniques described to facilitate groups and solve conflicts ie it is not just for selfish gain or influence. What is ethical behaviour, however, is always debateable. As McCroskey (1986) points out, continued misuse of these kinds of techniques eventually leads to a credibility gap and the speaker no longer has charismatic power with his/her audience. Charisma is interactive and without followers there is no charismatic leadership.

**CONCLUSION**

The purpose of this article was to demystify the concept of charisma. Charisma is not the province only of the gods, leaders or personalities we see on the media. It can be produced by learning skills and techniques like those described above. It involves tapping our own centredness and sources of energy. My goal is to stimulate
your thoughts about charismatic techniques that you may wish to learn and use or teach others.

Without going out of my door
I can know all things in earth
Without looking out of my window
I can know the ways of heaven.
For the further one travels
The less one sees
The sage therefore
Arrives without travelling
Sees all without looking
Does all without doing.
(Lao Tzu)

REFERENCES

VIDEOS

APPENDIX 1

There is a rule
That man is a fool
When he is hot
He wants it cool
When he is cool he wants it hot
Always wanting what he is not.
(Source Unknown)

Someone said it couldn’t be done, but she with a grin replied That maybe it couldn’t but she wouldn’t be the one to give up until she had tried
So she buckled right in with a hint of a grin, if she worried she hid it
So she
slowed down
took a deep breath
centred herself
And as a result
She charismatically tackled the thing that couldn’t be done
And she did it!
(Source unknown)
Figure 2
**Centring Exercise With Partner**
(From Hollier 1993 p Aikido.IV4)

Figure 3
**The Up-hierarchy of Empowerment**
(Heron 1993 p42)

Figure 4
**Speech in Clock Time and in Charismatic Time**
(Heron 1993 p50)
Last year at the Women in Leadership Conference I gave a paper on the Dog Woman in Jeanette Winterson’s novel, Sexing the Cherry. Questions I was grappling with included Who owns power? How do we take power? How does being marginalised make us feel powerless? And, most importantly, how can we reconceive ourselves so that we don’t see ourselves as always on the outside grabbing for something someone else has got? The point I made then was that the most transforming, most subversive, most liberating ways of reconceiving woman have come to me through contemporary women’s fiction.

It’s this - the ways in which contemporary women’s fiction acts as an agent for social change by playing out feminist theoretical understandings - that’s going to be the subject of my paper today.

But of course last year’s conference was specifically about power, and this year’s is about finding a voice. Not surprisingly, this year I’m going to talk about another novel. This time it’s by an Australian author, Drusilla Modjeska, and of course, its title is Poppy.

Poppy is unquestionably my favourite book of all time. I bought my first copy of it in July 1990 at Melbourne airport to read on the plane back to Perth, after a particularly disturbing Women’s Studies conference, where post-modernist tensions were in the air, and the price of women’s politically correct stance was seen by some to be total lack of agency. It took me the next 3 months to read Poppy, and by the time I got to the last page, I wished it had taken me longer: I savoured every bit. My students came to expect weekly updates, and began to regard me with that amused tolerance we reserve for those caught up in some private and inexplicable passion.

Poppy is the story of one woman’s attempt to understand her mother’s life and death, and in so doing, to come to understand her own. It’s a story about love, and life, and laughter and joy, and about grief and pain, madness, betrayal and abandonment. In the process of unravelling the threads of memory, history and imagination to shape the biography of Poppy, Drusilla Modjeska foregrounds the process of storytelling to have Lalage ask:

"Is the drama of Poppy’s life to be found in the way she told it? Or in the way I tell it? Who speaks in whose name? Dimly I begin to understand why my struggle with her is also a struggle with myself, and my own attempt to speak."

The question of voice takes on central significance in feminist terms.

This book makes a profound comment on the intricacies of feminist politics and the development of feminist thought over the last two decades. Lalage, the narrator or storyteller, the daughter of Poppy, is created as a feminist character who has lived through Western feminism of the 70’s and 80’s She is intellectual, well read, middle class, a teacher and a writer - perfectly positioned to reflect and embody the significant shifts and changes in feminist thought in the last two decades: re-evaluations of motherhood; questions of love, sexuality, family relationships, sexual politics, abandonment, betrayal; definitions of madness; the politics of production and reproduction; privileged patriarchal ways of knowing; the invisibility of women and the need to name women’s experience. Most centrally, in terms of this conference, Poppy explores the issue of voice, and of silence.


Patriarchal ways of knowing have given us an either/or: we have voice, or we have voice, or we have silence. One of the magic things Drusilla Modjeska does in Poppy is move beyond such binary oppositions to celebrate the feminine while simultaneously acknowledging and honouring the masculine. This novel’s most empowering statement in feminist terms is that our choice is not voice or silence, but it’s both. Out of the dichotomous pair comes the fruit.

Lalage’s search for a voice with which to tell the story of her mother’s life is paralleled by Poppy’s own search for a voice with which to haul herself out of the silent, unspeakable world she has fallen into. The book hovers and circles around these notions of voice and silence:\n\nWhen searching for reasons Poppy had her breakdown as a young mother, Lalage tells us:
\nOne story is repeated several times and it’s not only for that reason it attracts my attention. In each version the central incident stays the same. Poppy is a child. She is in the back seat of the car. Jack and China (her parents) are in the front. These details don’t change, though the destination and occasion of the journey do.
I was watching them, she wrote, wondering what sort of people they were and where they could have come from. When Jack looked at me in the mirror and asked me why my lips were so thick, I looked at him, and he looked at me. Take your hands away from your face, he said, it only makes it worse. In some accounts the car is caught in traffic, in others there was a storm, in one they were driving through peaceful countryside with the windows closed; but on every occasion, in each account, Poppy is silent.

‘Well’ said Jack, ‘What have you got to say for yourself?’

Silence, she wrote is my only weapon. The curious thing about this story is that whatever else you might say about Poppy, she didn’t have thick lips. On the contrary, she had rather narrow lips that go with the straight slanted features that came from Jack. I wonder what that memory power that was already hers? This is another tricky line of thought to the family.

Winston Churchill was a remarkable man. Poppy didn’t recover by asserting her will, towering over her contemporaries. The power of women is different. Our strength lies in the very weakness of our resistance, Luce Irigaray says. Poppy recovered because there was strength in her, but what it was, or is, eludes me (and drives me on). The best I can do is to say that Poppy recovered because she found her voice. To find a voice. What does it mean when a woman finds her voice? And when she finds it, what then?

One thing that was remarkable about Poppy (unlike Winston Churchill) was her voice. A grainy voice, perfectly pitched, full bodied and without vanity. A voice I can remember way back before I was born when I was still part of her rosy flesh, and her’s was the only breath I had. Her voice is Phoebe’s first memory. “It was coming from a tree,” she says, “high above me in the sky.”

But that’s not what I mean when I say she found her voice. I mean she found a voice that narrates, orders, considers, reconsider’s, backtracks, and gives life to a story, and a story to her life. Maybe like a Zen paradox, the two are the same and the struggle of life is to know what was always there. (p93,94)

It was at Pilsdon that Poppy found her voice, and took her first uncertain steps towards a different future. (p97)

To reinforce the notion that knowledge is constructed out of varying realities. We are given three different perspectives on Poppy’s voice at Pilsdon.

When I asked Percy what Poppy was like at Pilsdon, he said she was always talking... to Gillian, Poppy would tell stories from the cottage, of children who didn’t hear...

When I asked Poppy what Pilsdon meant to her, she said she learned to tell a story there. (p100)

If we focus on voice in this way, we become very quickly aware of the feminist critique of the construction of knowledge. Before launching into an exploration of this novel any further, I want to explore with you some of the central understandings my paper will use. One of the most liberating of these is that knowledge is constructed, not simply there: and that in our patriarchal society, most knowledge rests upon binary oppositions and is constructed according to a masculinist value system which endorses white middle class male experiences and perceptions, and places high value on logic and rationality, on linear thought, on independence and competition, and low value on all the rest, including, particularly, women’s experiences and perceptions, and ways of seeing the world that are borne out of these experiences. At first
in the 1970's the radical feminist response to his injustice was to turn it around and devalue all that was intellectual and rational and separated and individuated; circularity (seen to be feminine) was valued above linearity (seen to be masculine); and so on. But one of the problems of this love affair with all that was womanly was that women were held to be essentially womanly - and to argue this means that you paint women into a corner where they are reduced to behaving in certain ways because their biology dictates that they will. So some expressions of feminist theory have moved on from there to explore other ways of reading and speaking women's experience. Many intellectual traditions have been affected along the way in this debate - but more about that soon.

If we focus on voice, then, we become aware very quickly of the feminist critique of the construction of knowledge, of Decartes and linear thought and logicality, and of the radical feminist celebration of non-linearity, of circularity, where the circle is a symbol of wholeness and womanliness. Feminist thought and theory moves from this fairly earthy and simple celebration of the circular and the non rational, through the very complex and sophisticated analyses of the French post modernist psychoanalytic feminists, who write of phallologocentric thought as opposed to the multifaceted libidinal economy of women's thought. Drusilla Modjeska's writing can be seen to reflect Irigaray's notion that the plural circular aimless vaginal/clitoral libidinal economy of women and the singular, linear and teleological phallic libidinal economy of men is not restricted to sexuality but extends to all forms of human expression. Rather than align discourse with the gendered body in ways which are quite so essentialist, my argument here hinges on Drusilla Modjeska's use of lyric and linear modes of discourse: categories very close to Irigaray's circular and linear. At all levels the notion of duality, of binary opposition ie of good versus evil, man versus woman, sun versus moon, mind versus body, culture versus nature - at all levels the hierarchy of these oppositions is contested.

Derrida tells us that if we could liberate thought from binary oppositions we would find ourselves free to think new thoughts. Cixous believes that we can escape the dichotomous conceptual order within which we've been enclosed and that we can escape the dichotomous conceptual order within which we've been enclosed and that women have the capacity to lead to this movement.

The notion of voice is implicit in all this, because if we have voice/silence as an opposition, it'll be one or the other (ie either you speak with the language that reflects male realities, or you are silent); but the feminist challenge that Drusilla Modjeska takes up is to use both voice and silence, to oscillate and fluctuate from one to the other. Kristeva - that French feminist psychoanalytic post modern theorist - argues that this is what a healthy person does: oscillates between silence and voice, or, in more complex terms, oscillates between the silence of the prelanguage state (which she calls symbolic, where we take on the law, the code, the expression of the father). So - what Kristeva says we must do in finding a voice is move the semiotic to the symbolic and back again - we must acknowledge the mother and the father, the feminine and the masculine, in our psyches. And it's a complex and very nourishing and rewarding playing out of these ideas that Drusilla Modjeska takes her readers through in Poppy.

Lalage searches for a voice with which to tell the story of her mother's life:

I'm tired of the voice that comments, never admitting that what it's striving for is wisdom. It's the voice I learned in the universities asserting itself again, the voice I've lived by, constrained as much as enabled. I have to remind myself that what I am learning from this task, working my way back to Poppy, or forward to her, is that everything is fundamentally related. So if I can't give an account of her experience of faith, argued, explained and ruled off, differentiated from love and from everything else, then the failing is mine, not because I cannot do it, but because I persist in trying. (p291)

The capacity to create new ways of speaking out of either/or is understood in the section called Work, where we read of Ursula le Guin's father tongue and mother tongue.

Father tongue is the name she gives to the public discourse, that we learn, among other things, at university: an excellent dialect: it is the language of thought that seeks to objectivity... But, she warns, it is also a dangerous voice. Its essential gesture... is not reasoning but distancing - making a gap, a space, between the subject or self and the object or other. It is a voice of dichotomy or split. It can be immensely noble and indispensably useful, but when it claims a privileged relationship to reality, it becomes dangerous and potentially destructive. It is the voice that suppresses the mother tongue, the language of stories, inaccurate, unclear, coarse, limited, breaking down dichotomy and refusing splits, a voice of a different responsibility, always expecting an answer. Lalage goes on to ask Was it possible I could find for myself Ursula le Guin's third term: a native tongue, a dialect that accommodates learning with blood and heart, father tongue with mother tongue? (p151)
Poppy’s diary entry of July 1983 reads:

Lalage is caught between too many things. She says that’s what life is: freedom and obligation, love and independence, acceptance and rejection. I tell her fruit comes from the meeting of opposites, male and female. She looks embarrassed, and yet I can’t yet see what it is she wants me to tell her. (p294)

So - the first feminist understanding, then, is that knowledge is constructed. And by implication, if knowledge is constructed, it can be deconstructed, or even reconstructed, so that it can reflect the experiences of women and other marginalised under a patriarchal discourse: if it’s not based on binary oppositions, on either/or, but rather based in a fruitful fluctuation from one to the other, then women too can find a voice. The second central feminist understanding is that everything is related. Perhaps the third feminist understanding I want to point to is that once you recognise that knowledge is constructed, and that everything is related or interconnected, you begin to recognise that this will affect your own notion of who you are.

This story hovers and circles around the central questions Who was Poppy? And who am I? Lalage tells us quite explicitly in the section called Voice: I was engaged in a convoluted and private repetition of that primary struggle each of us first acts out with our mothers, pulled by the desire for a love that draws us back to that first moment before we are held to the mirror and she says look, it’s you, and in that reflection, hers and ours, we see the future. Oscillation; fluctuation. Desire for separation. Desire for return... Did I think I could investigate Poppy’s life without investigating my own? (p102)

In feminist psychoanalytic terms, Poppy’s lifelong search was for reunion with the mother, the great timeless bonding of the pre-oedipal stage. Poppy is trapped inside the cap/space/silence of the semiotic and desire for the mother and rejection of the father and has to break out of this being silenced and move in to a use of the Symbolic - to find a voice - and Lalage, like many women of generation, educated by phallocentric thinking into valuing of the public, the worldly, the external realities over the inner (ie a valuing of the Symbolic and what can be expressed/stated over the Semoitic) must learn to accept the value of both. When Lalage has almost finished her writing of Poppy’s story, we read:

So when I read through what I’ve written, as one does a letter before it’s posted, I realise it is the story of the life I live off the pages of this book that pleases me, the glimpse of a present daily reality I never intended to reveal. Perhaps her last gift is simply that: a way of living and of being which has been made possible by reclaiming her and knowing her, in imagination if not in fact, for by doing that I have finally let her go. (p312)

Thematically, then, we become aware of an intense focus on the gaps and spaces, the invisibilities, the unspeakable experience which Poppy must learn to articulate and Lalage must learn to accept and value. Lalage’s move from the mistrusting of all that is not rational, visible, provable, into a valuing of both the rational and the non-rational, the public and the private, the linear and the circular, reflects, in terms of the debate on the construction of women’s identity, the shift from the androgyny of liberal feminism versus the essentialism of radical feminism, then beyond such biological essentialism via Cixous of Semiotic and the Symbolic of Kristeva’s psychoanalytic discourse.

In dealing thematically and structurally with contemporary feminist psychoanalytic notions of the use of voice and silence, it seems to me that Drusilla Modjeska has created a work which encodes for the reader the Kristeva notion of the oscillation and fluctuation of the desire for separation, desire for return to the timeless union with the mother. Kristeva’s notion that society has to come to terms with what has been marginalised or repressed by culture is played out here. Kristeva’s liberated person is someone able to acknowledge the play of semiotic and symbolic-the continual vacillation between order and disorder. Seen in these Kristeven terms, Drusilla Modjeska’s text becomes a commentary on the process of discovering that in speaking the silence, in imagining the real, in uncovering the invisible, one can rupture the dominant discourse to become both author and subject.

History, memory and imagination merge to create a new apprehension of what it is to Be, as Woman.

Bread for one yen, says the Japanese proverb. For the other yen, white hyacinths. (p12).
MAKING A DECISION

If you are given the opportunity to take a position in a remote location there are certain considerations that you need to make. It is important to have good health and abundant energy. Every skill you have and ones you did not know you had will be used. Many women have multi-skills from running families and juggling careers so this is not a problem.

One skill I have developed, to my surprise, has been rally driving. Each week we have to drive 400km round trip to the Post Office and bank. It was of great consolation to me to read an article in the paper reporting on the London to Sydney Rally held this year. The headlines read “Hell Leg of Rally”. It went on to describe how many drivers lost it on the most difficult stretch of road they had encountered on their race. It was the stretch of road that I have to drive every week in order to do the school’s mail and banking. I sent the clipping to some of the people in the city who thought I was complaining too much about the safety of staff on the roads.

Family and friends must be considered in making this decision. I was lucky to have a supportive partner who was willing to take the position of gardener and school cleaner. It is also an interesting experience for families. My own son spent a year with me after High School working in the community.

At first we found it very difficult to return to the city and try to share the new experiences. It is like returning from travel in an exotic location and finding it difficult to relate to mainstream Australia.

Another important characteristics is to have an open mind. Do not set too many expectations. Much of what you read about Aboriginal life is not applicable in general to every community. The two communities in which I have lived were very different and that was within the same general area. Another surprise for many people is that Aboriginal people are very different from one another. They are individuals with independent ideas and experiences as well as shared ideas and experiences. You must be adaptable and flexible to enjoy the experiences you will have in a remote location.

Clarissa Pinkola Estes sums up the characteristics needed in describing one of her archetypes. “She is not afraid of the darkest dark, in fact she can see in the dark. She is not afraid of offal, refuse, decay, stink, blood, cold bones, dying girls or murderous husbands. She can see it, she can take it, she can help.”
DEVELOPING SUPPORT

This can be one of the most difficult aspects of taking a position. I was the first female Principal in the area called the Trans and North Country Area. The first thing I was told by one of my male colleagues was "This is a man's country."

The first administrators' conference I attended, my colleagues treated me as if I would become 'one of the boys'. A group drove together to Kalgoorlie with a full esky of beer. They were very jolly when we arrived at our lodging at the Camp School. Only the male dorms were open and the male toilets. I managed to get some toilets open but spent the night with the snoring boys. Dinner was a group effort but I declined the after dinner visit to the skimpy's bar. From then on I made my own arrangements for conferences and did not join many collegiate gatherings. The consequence of this was I was virtually open but spent the night with the snoring boys. Dinner was a group effort but I declined the after dinner visit to the skimpy's bar. From then on I made my own arrangements for conferences and did not join many collegiate gatherings. The consequence of this was I was virtually on my own for any information or assistance that I required.

Currently, two more women are in acting positions in North Country. One of them has had great difficulty with support of her efforts. The three of us try to give each other support, although several hundred kilometres' distance makes it hard. It is very difficult for women in these positions to find referees that actually know what their workload is like and what abilities they have. Generally you must be super-skilled in everything and do outstanding special projects to get any recognition.

The best way to establish credibility is to do for every required aspect of the job twice as well as anyone else. You must also learn to publicise your accomplishments. I have managed to get the local paper to print some positive stories about the school by providing the story and the photographs to go with it. I have taken on cooperative projects in the area so that other colleagues become aware of my skills.

The major support group that has helped has been the Aboriginal community itself. Without their cooperation and support, adapting to a different culture and lifestyle would have been more difficult.

It is very important to realise that there are some very basic differences between Western and Aboriginal belief systems. These beliefs are general but dominant over Western styles. The implications of these are very hard for us to accept at times as they vary so much from mainstream lives.

Stephen Harris has outlined these very clearly in his book *Two Way Aboriginal Schooling: Education and Cultural Survival* (1990) Aboriginal Studies Press, Canberra. The first difference he states as Religious versus Positivistic Thinking. The Western belief system has made great importance of objective rational proof for everything. In the Aboriginal communities what they believe and feel is more important than what they can prove. This can work both for and against you. You will be judged on how people feel about you, not what you can do. You will be taken for yourself, not qualifications or possessions.

Secondly, in the community everything is related to land, kin and religious ceremony. We tend to compartmentalise drawing distinctions between work, play, home and school. This also has both positive and negative aspects for work. In some ways you will always be related to as the teacher or the Principal. Everything you do or say will be related to your position. It helps to have lots of photographs of your family and friends so that people can get a picture of what your relationships are.

There is also a difference in the concept of time. The people tend to focus on event or cycles. The school imposes a linear time on their cyclic time. The event that draws the two together at our school is the school siren. It is difficult during the winter months to get students to school on time and in the summer they are at school very early. If you change the times of the siren it does not seem to matter, it depends on the sun and the weather.

A difference that has major implications is the value placed on being rather than doing. The emphasis is on maintaining existing circumstances rather than developing or changing them. This is the hardest adaption as it goes against all work ethics and hinders even things that need to be improved. Because of the historic battles with the powers that be some of the situations that the people have adapted to are not positive. For example the diets have changed and created enormous health problems. 65% of the people in our community over 35 years are diabetic. There is a problem with alcohol and all that goes with it.

Being rather than doing also has very positive aspects. You are accepted for existing not accomplishments. The social situations are relaxed and comfortable. People come to be with you not to do things with you.

Harris also says: "In Aboriginal society there is room for creativity and individual differences for example in art, songs and dances but all creative activities are variations on an accepted theme." This has an effect on students who may be outstanding in their achievements. An example would be a recent Community Sports' Carnival held with visiting communities. It looked as if Coonana was going to win and one of the other communities would not have won any
games. Coonana decided to play in order that each community has at least one win and then had a play off where one community won the trophy. It is very difficult for Aboriginal people who obtain outstanding recognition from the mainstream.

"Many remote Aboriginal people appear to view the government very much as a creator, being in the sense that it can cause goods and cash to materialise. The connection between land use and individual effort as a source of government's resources is not perceived." This is another difference that Harris has pointed out. The school comes into the category of creator.

One aspect of working in a position of leadership in an Aboriginal community that has a distinct advantage for women is the contrasting view of authority. Authority is perceived as looking after or nurturing the community. The authority of the school as a whole is derived from the idea of looking after the children of the community.

If you are aware of and keep an open mind to these basic differences it will make it much easier to adapt to your situation. Keep in mind also that some communities have totally rejected all traditional aspects of their lives in favour of fundamental Christian ideas and that the degree of traditional life varies from place to place.

**What Conditions and Support You Can Expect?**

The environment of communities varies. In my experience it is often shocking, at first, to see the conditions of some of the houses and amounts of rubbish strewn about. You will probably have a very decent type house which is essential as a retreat at times. In the community where I now live the people have only had Western-style houses for 6-7 years. The old people still often camp out in wiltja style dwellings. Caring for houses and hygiene in a Western style setting is not generally done. Steve Stewart, who was born and grew up in the community, says that health and hygiene have gone down since the houses have been used because the dwelling before were temporary and moved often so that rubbish did not collect. Plastic bags and disposable nappies have created more problems.

It helps to also enjoy the outdoors. There are many beautiful spots in the desert areas. The people love to go out bush and it is essential that you take a community member with you when first exploring the environment. The situations of the bush make you much more aware of the powers of nature. Some of the most enjoyable times have been when we have gone bush with members of the community to hunt and gather bush tucker.

Different seasons provide different types of food. The red kangaroo is a very sacred animal to Coonana people. It must be hunted and prepared in a very specific way. Breaking this law results in serious penalties. The most important aspect of gaining cultural understanding is to listen and learn. Asking direct questions will result in sometimes very obscure answers as it may be a question that only certain people have a right to answer or you may not be judged as ready to know certain information. There are many reasons why “wobella” are not trusted straight away.

**LEARNING FROM ABORIGINAL WOMEN AND THE COMMUNITY**

The first lesson I learned was to be patient and listen carefully. Often you are told things the significance of which you do not learn until much later. For example we were told in an apparently casual manner that Wongi did not put salt on the red kangaroo. Later on we had some kangaroo that had been properly prepared by the lawmen. We offered it to a guest who seemed a bit wary. We mentioned who had cooked it and that it had no salt. He then ate the kangaroo. He told us then the story of how a lawman once put salt on a kangaroo. He was found dead later.

Traditional law as we have begun to learn is very strict. There is no grey, just black and white. Once you have been taught and break the law, you will be exiled in one way or another. There is always another dimension to what happens. It is underground and very subtle. For white people recognise we are very vulnerable in the environment and not quite as capable or quick. They are physically and emotionally resilient and far superior in many ways.

The links of family have been widely recognised. The strength of these links has been what I credit to the survival of the people. I do not actually know my exact relationship in the community however the community does and acts towards me in this manner. I have the advantage of age. This is not an advantage in the mainstream, but in the communities it is. For example adolescent boys who may be going through the law treat me like an auntie. This is excellent for discipline as the old people remember all disrespect and wrong behaviours that boys show during this time and keep it for when they will go through the law. The aunties or mothers then extract revenge.

Childrearing is far easier in the community. Everyone helps and loves babies. By the time children can walk, they are free and independent. The children are seldom disciplined. They have no responsibilities except coming to school. Affection is freely given and received. The majority of children at school are not being reared by...
their biological parents. Sometimes this is because their parents are alcoholic, in jail or dead. Sometimes it is just because someone wants them. Some women raise 10-12 children only 2 or 3 are their own.

Conclusion

The experience I have had living and working with the Wongi of the Eastern Goldfields has had a profound impact on my life. It is an experience of personal growth because you are bound to meet yourself in the remote regions. It has heightened my awareness of the need for social justice and reconciliation between Aboriginal and mainstream Australia.

Before that reconciliation can take place the people themselves have to have time to reconcile what has happened to them and forgive themselves. They carry many shame-filled secrets. Clarissa Pinkola Estes describes in the chapter “Battle Scars” the heroine who has been forced to do something or trapped into something. She is in some way sworn or shamed into secrecy. She complies for fear of loss of love, or loss of regard, loss of basic subsistence. To seal the secret further, a curse is placed upon the person or persons who would reveal it. This seems to me what has happened to many Aboriginal people. It is only now that the stories of injustice worse, they still continue even now in the supposed age or information and reason.

To really begin to learn you need to step back from your own ego and merge with another reality. The story to the Aboriginal people is one of endurance has hardened and strengthened them. Beginning to understand the rich and varied culture has strengthened me.

It is an experience I would recommend to women with adventurous natures who want to explore their own nature.
Background

The manner in which deregulation is being introduced federally differs from that in New Zealand, for instance, as does the Victorian model differ from the Western Australian model. There are however some common features which include an intention to remove aspects of the centralisation of the wage fixing process and devolve decision making as far as possible down to the workshop level. These changes mean that there will be greater opportunities for individual workers to participate in decisions which affect their working lives, and hence a greater need for workers and managers to be informed about matters which were previously handled by the peak bodies, by unions and employer organisations.

At the same time there is a possibility that poorly informed workers, or those who for some reason cannot fully participate in the process, will be disadvantaged under the new rules. Proponents of deregulation argue that this reform is essential to free up the labour component of our industries, and that greater flexibility will facilitate Australia’s (and New Zealand’s) ability to compete in international markets.

This reform process represents a profound change in the way in which wages and conditions are determined compared with the system which had been in place in Australia since the beginning of the century. The results of the process are yet to be fully realised, but initial indications are that the more vulnerable groups in the labour market will be affected the most. To understand what is currently taking place, it is useful to review the events in wage fixing post wage indexation.

General Trends

The general trends in wage fixing since 1986 at the federal level have been from: federally in Australia and in New Zealand, and at the state level in New South Wales, Tasmania, Victoria and now Western Australia. While the scope, extent and some details of these new legislative frameworks differ, they are all consistent in that they facilitate the introduction of more decentralised, less regulated and more enterprise focused industrial relations.

The recent round of new legislation has been the culmination of a process towards decentralisation and deregulation of the wage fixing system which began in earnest in the second half of the 1980’s. The early debate received a major fillip with the release of Australia Reconstructed, the report of an overseas mission lead by Laurie Carmichael formerly of the Australian Council of Trade Unions (ACTU). This report provided significant intellectual background to the Accord, the agreement between the federal government and the ACTU which was negotiated prior to the election of the first Hawke government.

Although the Accords, now numbering seven, have contained a variety of objectives over the years, one of the fundamental aims has been to provide a bulwark against the wage cost spiral previously experienced, to introduce a number of social justice measures, and to link wage increases to productivity improvements. The existence of the Accord has meant that the federal government and the ACTU have made similar submissions to the National Wage Case hearings. In its turn, the Australian Industrial Relations Commission (AIRC) has accepted many of these arguments, in many cases contrary to the arguments presented by the employers.

Recent National Wage Case hearings have provided parties with a forum to urge the AIRC to adopt wage fixing principles supportive of greater wage fixing deregulation. Although the AIRC is not bound to accept the advice of the industrial relations parties, wage fixing principles developed by the Commission since 1987 have provided avenues for productivity linked wage increases increasingly at the industry and enterprise level.

The decisions of the AIRC are translated into the state arena through the state tribunals. These tribunals normally adopt the substance of the decisions of the AIRC although in recent times the decentralisation of the wage fixing system has been accompanied by a greater tendency by the state tribunals to deviate from the central line.
• a regulated and centralised system towards one which is deregulated and devolved
• a focus on wages and conditions to efficiency, skills development and career paths
• an emphasis on systems level bargaining towards bargaining at the workshop and individual level.

These trends are illustrated in the chronological development over the last seven years, the main steps of which are outlined below:

PRE 1986 WAGE INDEXATION
Prior to 1986, wages were linked to movements in the Consumer Price Index and increases were awarded nationally. An employer’s capacity to pay was not taken into account; increases applied to large and small employers equally i.e all employees covered by awards. The only parties to the negotiations were peak unions, peak employer bodies and the federal government.

1986 RESTRUCTURING AND EFFICIENCY PRINCIPLE
In 1986 the AIRC decision introduced the Restructuring and Efficiency Principle which provided for an initial $10 across-the-board increase to be followed by a second tier 4% increase in exchange for trade offs of equivalent value.

The Restructuring and Efficiency Principle introduced the concept of wage increases linked to measures designed to improve efficiency (or at least reduce costs). Most initiatives were designed to reduce administrative costs and included such items as paying fortnightly instead of weekly, wage and salary payments directly into bank accounts, elimination of wash up time, etc. The amount of the increase was still determined and awarded nationally and negotiations were conducted by peak groups.

1988 STRUCTURAL EFFICIENCY PRINCIPLE
(AWARD RESTRUCTURING)
The Structural Efficiency Principle provided for two pay increases of 3% each. These increases were available on an award by award basis provided the parties demonstrated that they had put in place measures to address structural issues inhibiting efficiency.

In their negotiations, the parties examined work processes and how productivity could be improved. Issues addressed included career paths and training, work and job redesign, simplifying awards, broadbanding of classifications. Other issues such as removing demarcations and multi-skillling were recognised as important contributors to productivity.

The size of the wage increases, however, was still set at the national level. Nevertheless, there was increased scope for enterprise level negotiations.

1992 ENTERPRISE BARGAINING PRINCIPLE
This decision provided the framework for a significant devolution of decision making to the enterprise level. Individual employers and unions are able to apply for productivity based increases based on changed work practices at an individual enterprise. The AIRC’s decision gave no provision for an across-the-board increase nor any indication of the preferred size of a wage increase negotiated under this Principle.

All enterprise bargaining agreements must be signed by the employer and the unions involved at the enterprise thus giving unions a pivotal role in enterprise bargaining. Agreements must be ratified by the relevant industrial relations tribunal. The provisions of the agreement are an add-on to the relevant award and only replace those parts of the award affected by the add-on, the rest of the award remains intact.

1993 REVIEW OF THE WAGE FIXING PRINCIPLES
The review of the wage fixing principles in 1993 led to the introduction of the Enterprise Awards Principle and other changes generally designed to provide greater flexibility to the system. The federal government has also indicated that changes to the legislation will be intended to have the same effect.

1993 WORKPLACE AGREEMENTS ACT
(WA) 1993
This Western Australian legislation is another step in the devolution of wage negotiation to apply in this State. The focus is on individuals and distinct workplaces. Workers will be able to choose whether to stay in the award system or opt for the workplace agreements stream. Employees can bargain with their employer individually or in groups. Unlike the wage fixing principles mentioned above, the legislation does not link wage increases with productivity.

THE LABOUR FORCE
At the same time as the regulatory framework of the industrial relations system has been changing, so has the labour market. As success in enterprise bargaining is likely to be affected by the strength of one’s bargaining position it is useful to have an indication of the relative positions of females and males in the labour force.
Australia has suffered an economic recession from which it is starting to emerge. Western Australia was not as badly affected as the rest of Australia by the recession and is leading the way out of it. Consequently, there are differences in the state and national labour force trends. Some of these reflect long standing differences, for example, the participation rate of women (and men) in the Western Australian labour force has traditionally been higher than the national rate.

The following section provides a brief snapshot of some trends illustrating the position of women in the labour market. The data represent two periods: 1986 to 1993, a longer term period which coincides with the recession and the gradual devolution of the industrial relations system; and 1992 to 1993 which gives a shorter term view of the most recent movements in the labour force. The data is given in Tables 1 and 2 and is depicted pictorially in Graphs 1 to 6. (The source for the data in this section is ABS Cat. No. 6202.0 for the month of September of the given years.)

PARTICIPATION RATE

The participation rate is the proportion working age people in the labour force. It relates to both the employed and those looking for work. It is often used as an indicator of confidence in the labour market.

In Western Australia the female participation rate grew slightly over the period 1986-93 and has been almost static over the past year and was 54.1% in September 1993. For men, the participation rate actually decreased over the period 1986-93 but it has risen again over the past 12 months to 78.2%.

Both nationally and in Western Australia, women’s participation in the labour force has increased at a time when male participation either declined (nationally) or had lower growth (WA).

However, while the gap between the national and State participation rates has narrowed for women, it has increased for men.

UNEMPLOYMENT

The Western Australian female unemployment rate has increased since 1986, but by a lesser amount than for males. However, in the past 12 months, the male rate has fallen from 11.1% to 8.8% whereas the female rate has only fallen from 10.7% to 8.9%. So, from being lower than the male rate in September 1992, the female unemployment rate is now marginally higher than the male.

Nationally, the picture is again different. The female unemployment rate has been consistently lower than the male and has not increased as much over the period 1986-93. However, while the female rate continued to rise over 1992-93, there was a marginal decrease in the male rate.

EMPLOYMENT GROWTH

TOTAL EMPLOYMENT

In Western Australia, the number of women employed during the period increased by nearly 25% from 1986 to 1993. Similarly, men’s employment grew by at a lesser rate but one that was still substantial (20.6%). Over the past 12 months, however, male employment has grown at a higher rate (5.6% compared with 3.7% for women).

Once again the figures for Australia as a whole are markedly different with this difference primarily in male employment. From 1986 to 1993, while female employment growth (20%) was in line with that experienced in Western Australia, male employment grew by only 6.5%.

For the period 1992-93 employment growth at the State level was significantly higher than the national level for both women and men. It should be noted that over the past year the strongest employment growth has been experienced by Western Australian males.

FULL-TIME EMPLOYMENT

Both male and female full-time employment grew strongly in this State from 1986 to 1993, although the rise was greater for males. Over the same period for Australia, the picture was much different. Female full-time employment increased significantly (11.5%) but male full-time employment increased by only 2%.

In the year September 1992 to September 1993, female full-time employment in Western Australia increased only marginally while male full-time employment had a much more significant increase. For women, the rate of increase was less than the national rate, while the Western Australian male rate clearly exceeded the national rate.

PART-TIME EMPLOYMENT

Part-time employment has shown strong growth generally. This represents a fundamental change in the structure of the workforce which has implications for enterprise bargaining.

Since 1986 there has been a 39% increase in female part-time employment in Western Australia. For men, the increase has been a massive 85%. Lower, but still substantial, increases were recorded for the country as a whole (34.4% for women and 70.3% for men). In addition, the
proportion of part-time employees in Western Australia who are female has decreased from 1986 to 1993 (from 80.3% to 75.4%). A similar trend occurred nationally.

In Western Australia, the growth in male part-time employment is now lower than that for women. Nationally, the situation is the reverse, but, for both males and females, part-time employment is growing more quickly in this State than for Australia.

Clearly, while part-time employment continues to be dominated by women, it is becoming more important to men. Whether the increasing trend in male part-time employment is sustained as the economy and the labour market continue to recover is yet to be seen. We may yet see some reversal of this trend with part-time employment becoming more consolidated as a female phenomenon.

SUMMARY OF THE TRENDS

Employment growth overall was stronger in Western Australia than for Australia. However, the biggest differences were in the male labour force figures. Western Australian men maintained their position in the labour force much more successfully than their counterparts elsewhere in the country. While recent employment growth is marginally higher for women than men at the national level, it is significantly higher for men than women in Western Australia. This applies particularly to the full-time workforce.

The relativities between males and females in Western Australia were substantially retained while nationally women improved their position relative to men.

The rate of unemployment in Western Australia is falling faster than the national rate, with the most significant fall being in the male rate.

The proportion of women in full-time employment is significantly lower in Western Australia than across Australia.

IMPLIEDATIONS OF LABOUR FORCE DATA

The Western Australian labour market is structurally different from the national labour force and has behaved differently over the course of the recession and the introduction of labour relations reform legislation.

The relative strengthening of the male labour force places men in a better position than women to exert economic pressure in the bargaining process.

Notwithstanding recent trends, part-time employment is still dominated by women. Part-time employees run a greater risk of being sidelined in enterprise bargaining processes. Furthermore, their priorities are likely to differ somewhat from those of full-time employees. For example, a full-time employee may wish to trade-off part of a pay rise for shorter working hours, whereas a part-time employee, for whom a shorter working week may hold little attraction, may prefer to take the full pay rise.

Western Australia is acknowledged as being a leading state in the economic and employment recovery. Thus, what is happening in this state can be viewed as a precursor to what may happen nationally. This must, however, be tempered by the influences of the different industry structures and labour force patterns in other states. These may result in variations in the overall pattern should the Western Australian experience emerge as a national trend.

AVERAGE WEEKLY EARNINGS
(Data source for this section is ABS Cat. No. 6302.0, May 1993)

Women’s average weekly earnings are substantially lower than men’s. In May 1993, women earned, on average, $406.30 compared with men’s earnings of $612.50. These figures, however, include part-time employment in which women are heavily represented.

Comparing ordinary time earnings for full-time workers there is still a difference of almost $100 per week ($632.90 for men and $533.00 for women). Men also have better access to earnings above ordinary time (e.g. penalties, overtime) so that total earnings for full-time employees show that women earn 80% of full-time males’ total earnings.

The industries which have the highest base rate of full-time earnings and actual earnings are those dominated by men (i.e. mining; electricity, gas and water; transport and storage; and so on). Those industries commonly characterised as being female dominated (i.e. community services, recreation and personal services, and retail) have the lowest earnings. The range, in May 1993, in ordinary full-time earnings was $483.60 per week in retail and $923.10 for mining. Women in the mining industry had the highest earnings for all women, but they represented only 71% of male full-time ordinary time earnings in that industry.

Just Rewards the report of the Inquiry into Sex Discrimination in Overaward Payments found that “on average over the period 1981-1991, full-time adult women workers have received ... 52% of men’s overaward payments ... 22% of men’s overtime earnings and 82% of men’s total earnings”. It is the elements that constitute overaward payments that are most likely to be the focus of enterprise
bargaining for employees, yet the evidence shows that to date women have been markedly less successful than men in obtaining these additional sources of pay.

**TRADE UNION MEMBERSHIP**

In the traditional labour relations system, employees are represented in negotiations and in enforcing awards and agreements by trade unions. However, the majority of employees are not union members. Under the award system, the conditions of the award were applied to both union and non-union members.

From August 1986 to August 1992 the proportion of Western Australian employees who were union members declined from 41% to 37% (see Table 3 and Graph 7). The corresponding figures for the whole of Australia are 46% (1986) and 40% (1992). Interestingly, the decline was greater among males than females, although union membership remains more prevalent among females.

It is widely claimed that for unions to retain their existing membership, and to have any hope of increasing it, they must become more responsive to the needs of their members. Women, and part-time employees, have historically been less unionised than male and full-time workers. If women are to receive the type of representation that they want from unions now may be an opportune time to make their demands known. Unions that rely on their traditional membership base and methods of operation may be vulnerable in a deregulated labour relations system (as happened in New Zealand). Perhaps women should take advantage of this and press for union, as well as labour market, reform.

**NEGOTIATING FOR WAGES AND CONDITIONS: OPTIONS IN WA**

**AWARDS BASED SYSTEM**

The basis of this system is the network of awards. Awards are usually based on industries (eg metal industry) or occupations (eg nurses). For some time it has been possible to create an award for a specific enterprise (eg Hamersley Iron Award). Parties to an award are the union and employer(s) or their representative. These parties can use Section 41 of the Industrial Relations Act to enter into an enterprise agreement to vary some of the conditions of an award. The award still underpins the arrangement.

**ALTERNATIVE STREAM**

The Workplace Agreements Act has introduced another option into the wage fixing system in this State. An agreement can be between the employer and a single employee or collective ie between an employer and two or more employees.

Workplace agreements are separate from awards and industrial relations tribunals. Different rules apply to each stream.

**KEY POINTS OF COMPARISON BETWEEN THE AWARD AND WORKPLACE AGREEMENT STREAMS**

**PARTIES**

Awards/Industrial Agreements - unions and employer(s)/employer organisations.

Workplace Agreements - employees and employers (unions under restricted circumstances).

**COLLECTIVE VERSUS INDIVIDUAL**

Awards/Industrial Agreements - apply to groups of workers and individual or multiple employers.

Workplace Agreements - multiple or individual employees within a workplace and a single employer (an individual employer may be party to multiple agreements).

**DURATION**

Awards - indefinite.

Industrial Agreements - must stipulate a fixed term but there is no limit on how long that term should be. When it expires, the terms and conditions continue until replaced.

Workplace Agreement - must stipulate a fixed term of no more than 5 years. Upon expiry, revert to award.

**VARIATION**

Awards/Industrial Agreements - can apply to the Industrial Relations Commission to vary the terms. Cannot be varied without (WA) IRC involvement.

Workplace Agreements - cannot be varied. Instead, parties have to agree to cancel the existing agreement and negotiate a new agreement to replace it.

**APPLICATION OF MINIMUM CONDITIONS OF EMPLOYMENT ACT**

Awards/Industrial Agreements - where a condition is less than the prescribed minimum, the prescribed minimum condition prevails. Where a condition exceeds the prescribed minimum, the award or industrial agreement prevails.

Workplace Agreements - any provision of an agreement that is below the prescribed minima is not valid and the
legislated minimum prevails. Any provisions that exceed the minima prevail.

**FREEDOM OF ASSOCIATION**

Awards/Industrial Agreements - cannot discriminate on the basis of membership or non-membership of a union.

Workplace Agreements - cannot discriminate on the basis of membership or non-membership of a union.

**BARGAINING AGENTS**

Awards/Industrial Agreements - unions are the bargaining agents for employees.

Workplace Agreements - a person can appoint anyone, including a union, to be their bargaining agent. The other party must recognise and deal with an appointed bargaining agent. Unions are the only bargaining agents with the potential to become a party to an agreement.

**CONFIDENTIALITY**

Awards/Industrial Agreements - not confidential.

Workplace Agreements - confidential in the private sector (ie not open to inspection to a third party; the direct parties themselves can disclose the contents). Not confidential in the public sector.

**PROVISION OF COPIES**

Awards/Industrial Agreements - it is not required that employees be given a copy.

Workplace Agreements - employee(s) must be given their own copy.

**DISPUTE RESOLUTION**

Awards/Industrial Agreements - ready access to the Industrial Relations Commission; (WA) IRC has power to impose compulsory arbitration.

Workplace Agreements - focus on workplace resolution. Agreements required to contain dispute resolution procedures. Access to industrial magistrate if local resolution fails.

**INDUSTRIAL ACTION**

Awards/Industrial Agreements - ambiguity as to legality of industrial action.

Workplace Agreements - limited immunity for industrial action during period of renegotiation of agreement. Applies to both employee(s) and employer.

**LABOUR MARKET DEREGULATION**

Research results

Some form of wage fixing deregulation has been introduced in a number of jurisdictions. The outcomes of these new arrangements are not entirely clear owing to the short period of time which has elapsed and, in some cases, the difficulty in accessing data. Some trends are emerging however, and these are summarised below.

**NEW ZEALAND**

In 1991 New Zealand adopted a strongly deregulated model of labour market bargaining when the *Employment Contracts Act* was passed. The philosophy behind the legislation is based on the principle of freedom of contract, or the notion that individuals should be free to make whatever bargains they please with whomever they please. This philosophical approach assumes that we live in a classless, genderless and ethnically homogeneous society and that the law should be separate from politics, be intrinsically neutral and value free. At any rate, that is the theory.

The aim of the *Employment Contracts Act* is to encourage enterprise and workplace bargaining instead of multi-employer or industry bargaining and to promote the rights of an individual as equal to those of a group of workers.

The processes of the legislation inhibit dissemination of information. There is no requirement to provide a public record of any collective bargains made under the new legislation although an employer who enters into a contract with 20 or more staff is required to send a copy of the contract to the Secretary of Labour. Research on the aggregate effect of the employment contracts must generally rely on primary data collection, ie the parties to the contracts must be contacted individually and asked to provide the information. The accuracy of the data is therefore dependent on the willingness of the parties to provide it. This is in contrast to the Australian system, where decision of both federal and state tribunals (where they still operate) are public documents.

An analysis of data collected in this way is contained in research carried out by Suzanne Hammond and Raymond Harbridge. The research reports on 1101 collective employment contracts covering 187,000 workers and 8,300 employers, representing 31% of the unionised workforce and 17% of the full time workforce as at 15 May 1991. The results show that:

- women are generally covered by the larger contracts (ie those covering more employees)
- women make up more than 60% of the workers covered by the contracts in three industry sectors ( wholesale, retail, hotels, etc; finance; and public, community and social services)
- in the public sector contracts, 70% of employees covered were women; the figure in the private sector was 42%
men were more likely than women not to be represented by a union or other bargaining agent
- payments based on productivity were identified in only 46 contracts and were far more likely to be those covering mainly male employees
- calculation of wage increases was very complex; the best estimate was that the annual wage increase overall was 0.24% (0.37% for males, 0.14% for females) ie the increase for males was three times larger than the increase for females
- some workers received genuinely large increases of around 4%, and these were nearly all men

women workers were more likely than men to be covered by a contract which did not contain a “clock hours” provision thus enabling the worker to be engaged at ordinary rates of pay at any time throughout the week, ie no penalty rates were applicable for night or weekend work
- by statute the minimum leave requirements are 3 weeks annual leave, 11 statutory holidays and at least 5 days “special” leave. A fourth week of annual leave is commonly granted after a period of service. Women were more likely to be covered by contracts which give them earlier access to this fourth week of annual leave
  similarly, contracts covering mainly women contained significantly more days sick leave per annum.

In summary, the effect of the Employment Contracts Act on women seems to be that:
- men are more likely to receive large pay increases and to be eligible for penalty and overtime rates which are being written out of women’s contracts
- men are more likely to receive productivity based payments
  the trade off was that women gained slightly better conditions for some leave entitlements.

WORKPLACE BARGAINING
RESEARCH - AUSTRALIA AT THE FEDERAL LEVEL

A comprehensive survey of workplace bargaining was carried out by the Federal Government for presentation at the 1993 Review of the Wage Fixing Principles. The Workplace Bargaining Survey (WBS) involves 700 workplaces of 20 or more employees (except for Agriculture and Defence) where information on bargaining practices have been gathered for the 12 months to December 1992.

This research is not restricted to enterprise bargaining within the federal award structure or any particular state, rather it provides a picture of the process and results of bargaining at the workplace level, both within and without the formal structures. The data collected covers many matters but only those impacting on equity issues are reported here.

FEMALES

The effect of workplace bargaining on women is important since the difference in male and female wages is particularly marked in overaward payments, and since this component of pay is substantially determined by workplace bargaining. Data from the WBS demonstrated that:
- workplaces with a high percentage of females (75% or more) are less likely than average to be covered by an agreement, in particular a ratified agreement
- 42% of female workers were employed in workplaces not covered by any agreement; for males the equivalent figure was 36%
- as at December 1992 there was a 9% “wage access gap” between males and females ie only 15% of females in workplaces employing 20 or more employees were covered by such an agreement; for males the equivalent figure was 24%. Further analysis indicated that females’ lower access to wage increases was explained by the fact that they were less likely to work at a workplace where such an agreement was negotiated
- productivity grew in 72% of workplaces in which females constituted three quarters or more of employees; it increased in only 65% of workplaces in which females constituted less than half of the workplace; therefore lack of ability to get productivity increases is not the reason for lack of access to pay increases
- existence or otherwise of performance indicators made no significant difference to whether or not a workplace had negotiated a written agreement.

In conclusion then, employees in workplaces with high female employment were, on average, less likely to have the bargaining strength or support to obtain wage increases as workplace change occurred and even if productivity increased.

PART-TIME WORKERS

Many of the experiences of part-time employees are those of women since these two groups overlap significantly. Part-time workers are often casual and therefore have less security of employment and no access to award conditions such as paid annual and sick leave. The WBS findings show that:
• Workplace bargaining may have led to an increase in part-time employment; 16% of workplaces covered by a ratified workplace-negotiated agreement reported increasing the number of part-time employees, 17% had increased the numbers of contractors and 20% had increased the number of casuals.
• Workplaces with a high percentage of part-time workers (20% or more) were less likely to have been affected by negotiations or to be covered by an agreement.
• Even more than females, part-time workers were underrepresented in workplaces covered by a ratified workplace-negotiated agreement.

To a significant degree, part-time workers were excluded from the coverage of workplace-negotiated wage agreements - the access gap in this case was 14%.

The access to workplace bargaining varied significantly by industry; in wholesale/retail, finance, property and business services a greater percentage of part-time than full-time workers were covered; but in recreation and personal service 34% of full-time but only 2% of part-time workers were covered.

Non English Speaking Background Workers

Surprisingly, the survey results showed that the presence of a high proportion of non-English speaking background (NESB) workers did not prevent workplace bargaining. Case study evidence did however, emphasise the fact that the literacy skills of NESB workers had to be taken into account to ensure positive outcomes from the implementation of the agreement, especially when putting in place management techniques such as total quality management and other quality assurance systems.

Comparison Between New South Wales and Federal Enterprise Agreements

The New South Wales approach to enterprise bargaining is similar to that being implemented in Western Australia in that the award system remains intact. There are, however, significant differences. In New South Wales agreements override awards, but, where the agreement is silent, the award applies. In addition, agreements are collective agreements and there are no individual contracts.

A significant difference is that the union does not have to be involved in these enterprise agreements. As well as a union, the parties to an agreement can be a works committee formed to represent employees covered, or at least 65% of enterprise employees in the trades or occupations to be covered in the agreement.

The Industrial Registrar maintains a record of agreements which is open to public inspection. A registered agreement is enforceable under the Industrial Arbitration Act in the same manner as an award. Thus it can be seen that the New South Wales model of enterprise agreements can be seen as a modification of the award system, rather than a replacement for it. (Minimum conditions apply with respect to redundancy and annual, maternity and long service leave.)

A comparison of the New South Wales agreements and those negotiated under the federal system has been made by the Australian Centre for Industrial Relations Research and Teaching 3. Major differences included:
• 50% of agreements in the New South Wales system were negotiated by the union; 100% in the federal system (under the Enterprise Bargaining Principle, federal agreements require union involvement).
• The New South Wales agreements concentrated on more basic issues ie ordinary hours of work, wage rates, etc whereas the federal agreements were more concerned with long term strategies to improve efficiency and contained more detailed information on productivity and efficiency.

Another important trend can be seen in the pre and post 1993 federal agreements which tends to support the argument that the negotiating in the federal system is becoming more sophisticated and focused on genuine productivity workplace issues. Comparing agreements before and after 1993:
• Equal Employment Opportunity issues have been mentioned in 26% (up from 13%) of agreements
• Improved job classification (30% up from 11%)
• Career paths (16% up from 6%)
• Progression based skills (28% up from 12%)
• Employees do a range of tasks (33% up from 18%)
• Change in supervisors’ role (14% up from 5%)
• Annualised wage (23% up from 10%)
• Broadbanding (33% up from 15%)

For the same period, the New South Wales agreements have remained fairly static.

Victoria

There is little hard data from the Victorian system as yet since the new legislation, which abolished all state awards and the Victorian Industrial Relations Commission has not been in operation for long enough as yet. Of all the Australian states the reforms introduced into Victoria most resemble those of New Zealand. There is one vital difference,
however, in that Victorian employees may still have access to award coverage via the federal system. The Commonwealth Government has made certain amendments to the federal Industrial Relations Act to facilitate access to the federal system.

Comments from the Victorian Equal Opportunities Commissioner, Moira Rayner, reported in The West Australian of 5 October 1993 page 27 indicate that the new contracts based system has given rise to a 50% rise in workbased discrimination complaints.

**WHAT ARE EMERGING TRENDS FOR WOMEN UNDER THE NEW WORKPLACE/ENTERPRISE REGIME?**

At the outset it must be stated that the data currently available from the different models of deregulated workplace and enterprise bargaining is inconclusive. Nevertheless, the research reported in this paper does give food for thought and provides scope, the authors believe, to make some predictions as to the trends which may emerge.

**PAY EQUITY GAP**

According to some commentators, unless specific steps to the contrary are taken, the pay equity gap will widen. The data to support this prediction comes from New Zealand since the introduction of the Employment Contracts Act. This trend is confirmed by research which examines pay outcomes with the degree of regulation of the wage fixing system in a variety of international contexts. In general terms, the research shows, the more deregulated the wage fixing system, the greater the gap between men's and women's wages.

The contrary argument is put by Prof Judith Sloan. While a smaller proportion of female workers belong to trade unions than males and more women work in areas which are weakly unionised, Prof Sloan argues that women are also employed in other areas which are very strongly organised, community services, for example, and the public sector. The evidence from the USA where union membership is very low especially in the service sector, Prof Sloan further argues, is that the gender earnings differential has narrowed very significantly over the past decade with women's earnings increasing from just over 60% of men's earnings to 70%. The USA is one of the most deregulated labour markets in the world. (It should be noted that the gender earnings gap in Australia for the same 10 year period has gone from women earning 80% of male earnings to 84%, so Australia is still performing better on this measure that the USA.)

It should also be noted that the movements in the pay equity gap in either country could be influenced by factors other that the degree of deregulation of the wage fixing system such as the recessive economy which both countries have been experiencing.

Another supporter of enterprise bargaining is the New South Wales Minister for Industrial Relations Ms Chikarovski, who is quoted as saying that female workers should exploit enterprise bargaining to improve their maternity leave conditions and gain access to job sharing and “career breaks”.

**PAY INCREASES V BETTER LEAVE ARRANGEMENTS**

In the case of New Zealand, it seems that women may have agreed to accept lower pay increases than male workers in exchange for more flexible leave arrangements probably to help them cope with family responsibilities more easily. A recognition that both men and women have responsibility in regard to family issues would lead to the conclusion that flexibility in leave arrangements should be equally available to all workers. The other aspect of this issue is the fairness of the trade-off, ie does a week's extra annual leave after six years equate with an immediate and ongoing pay increase of a certain percent? A decision to opt for more paid leave is a legitimate decision: the correct bargaining pose is to quantify the value of the benefit and ensure that it is comparable with an alternative wage increase.

**NEGOTIATING FOR PRODUCTIVITY IMPROVEMENTS**

Past experience has demonstrated that the framework of the centralised wage fixing system has contributed to a smaller pay equity gap. In a similar way, the evidence suggests that workplace negotiations which occur in a more structured framework will produce better outcomes for women.

This is illustrated by the comparison between the New South Wales and federal agreements which demonstrated that where there is a requirement to adhere to wage fixing principles, as in the federal sphere, the resulting agreements are far more comprehensive. Thus the federal agreements were more likely to cover matters of great importance for women's careers, such as training, skills development and consultative mechanisms.

The reason for this is simple: the objective of the enterprise bargaining principle is to improve productivity
and remove barriers to efficiency. This objective has led the parties to explore the issues which impact on productivity, one of which is obviously the skills and abilities of employees. Without this imperative of productivity improvement, the New South Wales agreements concentrate more on cost cutting measures such as making alterations to sick leave and annual leave.

**PROMISING STRATEGIES**

**DEREGULATION AND DEVOLUTION**

The most cursory examination of labour relations trends will demonstrate that deregulation is here for the foreseeable future. Requests from women and other disadvantaged groups to reinstate the old structures, so that wages can be centrally determined will not be heeded in the current climate no matter how effective they have been in the past in promoting social justice.

This does not mean, however, that women should advocate or even accept as inevitable, total deregulation. The failure of the policies of market deregulation in Britain and the USA is now being acknowledged. In our own country, the tide of opinion is turning against the total deregulation of financial and industry policy - and it is now generally acknowledged that the so called level playing field does not exist. As an example, the consequences of the deregulation of the banking industry were not all positive.

Despite having negative experiences with deregulation in a number of spheres, there is no indication that there will be a return, in wage fixation at any rate, to the previous degree of regulation. Australia needs to improve its international competitiveness and there is no doubt that some changes in the way people work are essential to achieve this.

An approach which can introduce needed flexibility and promote labour relations practices which aim to create a skilled and well paid labour force is devolution in a regulated framework. The enterprise bargaining principle is an example of this. Decision making has been devolved to the enterprise level, but the parties are asked to operate within an agreed framework.

In Western Australian the structures of the award system have been retained while the workplace agreements stream provides an option for those who want a more deregulated environment. This contrasts with the Victorian and New Zealand approaches where the award stream has been eliminated.

Devolution of decision making within an agreed framework should produce a better outcome for all workers, but particularly women who will inevitably lose if the decisions are made on the basis of industrial muscle and political strength.

**REPRESENTATION**

In the deregulating labour market, the issue of one's bargaining representative becomes more urgent. Ideally, women would be able to represent themselves in any negotiations but this is not always practical or desirable. The best advice which can be offered to women who need to appoint a bargaining agent is to shop around. A good bargaining agent can make a lot of difference. To help in making the choice, it is important to work out what characteristics the agent should have. A good knowledge of the technical issues of the framework in which the bargaining will take place is essential, as is an understanding of the industry and industry conditions. In addition, the agent should be able to communicate with the workers and employer to determine what each party wants and then develop creative options for how an accommodation can be achieved.

**INDIVIDUAL OR COLLECTIVE BARGAINING?**

As a general rule, most female workers will benefit from bargaining as a collective. This is the case in the current award system, where unionised women workers earn more than their non-unionised counterparts. Strength in numbers is likely to be just as valid in the new system.

An exception to this rule may occur where a particular woman has specialised, highly prized skills and abilities and/or she is working largely by herself with little interaction with other workers. In this situation she may feel that it will be to her advantage to negotiate separately. Where a woman decides to negotiate an individual contract it is important to be fully aware of the process and pitfalls (including the possible effect on fellow workers).

**WHAT TO BARGAIN FOR**

This is again an area where women must be well prepared. Issues of importance to women workers will not be raised unless someone puts them on the agenda and bargains hard for them. Past experience has demonstrated that males in bargaining situations may have different priorities from their female counterparts. Women workers must ask themselves what is really important in their working lives - is it access to better training, permanent part-time work, more pay, more flexibility, family leave or a combination of these?
Once a few fundamental priorities are established, the next step could be to examine the prevailing award, if there is one. This examination should give some indication of which issues should be included in the negotiations, and what some negotiating options could be. Workplace agreements in Western Australia are not an addition to the award, they replace any award. Thus the employee is not eligible for any award entitlement which is not included by the agreement except for those matters which are covered by the Minimum Conditions of Employment Act.

MORE PAY OR MORE LEAVE?

In New Zealand, women may have agreed to accept better leave arrangements in exchange for a pay rise. This is a reasonable option provided that the economic value of the better leave arrangements is equivalent to a pay rise and this is an option which the women workers genuinely prefer. The important issue is to ensure that women do not accept a trade-off for something of less worth. Hard nosed bargaining may not feel “feminine” but the bargaining situation is not one for the faint hearted. Proposals should be carefully worked out, and costed, and the negotiators should have a number of alternative strategies worked out to ensure that women workers get a fair and reasonable outcome.

CONCLUSION

There are normally two different types of responses to the question what will happen to women workers in the deregulated system? One school of thought recalls the benefits of the centralised wage fixing system, the equal pay principle and the award system, and argues that the whole notion of wage deregulation should be rejected.

At the other extreme, perhaps, is the school of thought which argues that the new deregulated environment offers great opportunity for women in that they can at last bargain for the wages and conditions that they believe they deserve and are most suited to their particular circumstances.

Both points of view are somewhat naive. The suggestion that the trend in wage deregulation be halted and indeed reversed is to ignore the realities of the Australian industrial relations system. None of the industrial parties support a return to the centralised wage fixing system in its old form. To propose an argument which is so far from current thinking is to doom the proponents to obscurity. As mentioned before, a more realistic position to support is to devolve decision making about wages within a regulated framework.

To suggest that women workers are free to bargain for what they want is also to ignore the position of most women workers. Those workers with the least bargaining power in the deregulated system will be those with fewer skills, part-time and casual, in industries and occupations with little industrial muscle and areas with low unionisation. This describes the position of women workers in the Australian economy.

In the longer term, it is hoped that women will increase their skills, move into the industries and occupations with more clout and become organised. The positive aspect of the enterprise bargaining principle is that career paths, skills acquisition and job redesign are recognised as important strategies to improve organisation efficiency. Provided women workers are included in these strategies, their position in the workforce must improve.

In the shorter term, women workers are faced with a situation of greater deregulation in wage determination. They can improve their ability to bargain in a number of ways. In summary they are:

- organise
- select an appropriate bargaining agent
- ensure that the working conditions which are important to them are included in the bargaining agenda.

This list does not provide a guarantee that the position of women in the workplace will not deteriorate. The evidence does suggest, however, that it will deteriorate without some of these strategies.

FURTHER READINGS

3. Data presented by Ron Callus and John Buchanan at seminar in Perth on 1 October 1993.
### TABLE 1

Labour Force Data Changes September 1986 - September 1993

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>WESTERN AUSTRALIA</th>
<th>F/M</th>
<th>Sept 1986</th>
<th>Sept 1993</th>
<th>% Change</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Participation Rate</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>52.7%</td>
<td>54.1%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>M</td>
<td>78.1%</td>
<td>78.2%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unemployment Rate</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>8.6%</td>
<td>8.9%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>M</td>
<td>7.7%</td>
<td>8.8%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number Employed</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>263,200</td>
<td>328,600</td>
<td>+24.8%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>M</td>
<td>394,000</td>
<td>475,300</td>
<td>+20.6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Full-time Employment</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>151,900</td>
<td>173,900</td>
<td>+14.5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>M</td>
<td>366,700</td>
<td>424,800</td>
<td>+15.8%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Part-time Employment</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>111,300</td>
<td>154,700</td>
<td>+39.0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>M</td>
<td>27,300</td>
<td>50,500</td>
<td>+85.0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Full-time as % Total</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>57.7%</td>
<td>52.9%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>M</td>
<td>93.1%</td>
<td>89.4%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Female as % Part-time</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>80.3%</td>
<td>75.4%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>AUSTRALIA</th>
<th>F/M</th>
<th>Sept 1986</th>
<th>Sept 1993</th>
<th>% Change</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Participation Rate</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>48.9%</td>
<td>52.6%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>M</td>
<td>76.3%</td>
<td>74.1%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unemployment Rate</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>8.9%</td>
<td>10.1%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>M</td>
<td>7.9%</td>
<td>11.1%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number Employed</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>2,770,400</td>
<td>3,331,300</td>
<td>+20.0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>M</td>
<td>4,237,200</td>
<td>4,512,500</td>
<td>+6.5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Full-time Employment</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1,711,200</td>
<td>1,907,800</td>
<td>+11.5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>M</td>
<td>3,955,800</td>
<td>4,033,400</td>
<td>+2.0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Part-time Employment</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>1,059,200</td>
<td>1,423,500</td>
<td>+34.4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>M</td>
<td>281,400</td>
<td>479,100</td>
<td>+70.3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Full-time as % Total</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>61.8%</td>
<td>57.3%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>M</td>
<td>93.4%</td>
<td>89.4%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Female as % Part-time</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>79.0%</td>
<td>74.8%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: ABS Cat No 6203.0
### TABLE 2


<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>WESTERN AUSTRALIA</th>
<th>F/M</th>
<th>Sept 1992</th>
<th>Sept 1993</th>
<th>% Change</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Participation Rate</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>F</td>
<td>54.0%</td>
<td>54.1%</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>M</td>
<td>77.0%</td>
<td>78.2%</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Unemployment Rate</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>F</td>
<td>10.7%</td>
<td>8.9%</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>M</td>
<td>11.1%</td>
<td>8.8%</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Number Employed</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>F</td>
<td>316,800</td>
<td>328,600</td>
<td>+3.7%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>M</td>
<td>450,300</td>
<td>475,300</td>
<td>+5.6%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Full-time Employment</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>F</td>
<td>172,400</td>
<td>173,900</td>
<td>+0.9%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>M</td>
<td>401,700</td>
<td>424,800</td>
<td>+5.8%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Part-time Employment</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>F</td>
<td>144,400</td>
<td>154,700</td>
<td>+7.1%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>M</td>
<td>48,600</td>
<td>50,500</td>
<td>+3.9%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Full-time as % Total</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>F</td>
<td>54.4%</td>
<td>52.9%</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>M</td>
<td>89.2%</td>
<td>89.4%</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Female as % Part-time</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>F</td>
<td>74.8%</td>
<td>75.4%</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th><strong>AUSTRALIA</strong></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Participation Rate</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>F</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Unemployment Rate</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>F</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Number Employed</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>F</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Full-time Employment</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>F</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Part-time Employment</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>F</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Full-time as % Total</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>F</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Female as % Part-time</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>F</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: ABS Cat No 6202.0
*TABLE 3*

**Trade Union Members as a % of Total Employees August 1986 - August 1992**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Western Australia</th>
<th>Aug 1986</th>
<th>Aug 1992</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Membership</td>
<td>41%</td>
<td>37%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Australia</th>
<th>F</th>
<th>M</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Membership</td>
<td>39%</td>
<td>50%</td>
<td>46%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AUSTRALIA</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Industry</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mining</td>
<td>72%</td>
<td></td>
<td>58%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Electricity, Gas, Water</td>
<td>82%</td>
<td></td>
<td>77%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wholesale and Retail</td>
<td>25%</td>
<td></td>
<td>22%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Finance, Property, Business</td>
<td>34%</td>
<td></td>
<td>28%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Public Admin and Defence</td>
<td>60%</td>
<td></td>
<td>61%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Recreation and Personal Services</td>
<td>29%</td>
<td></td>
<td>22%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Occupation</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Managers, Administrators</td>
<td>23%</td>
<td></td>
<td>18%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Professionals</td>
<td>47%</td>
<td></td>
<td>44%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Para-professionals</td>
<td>59%</td>
<td></td>
<td>54%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tradespersons</td>
<td>52%</td>
<td></td>
<td>46%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Clerks</td>
<td>36%</td>
<td></td>
<td>32%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Salespersons, Personal Services</td>
<td>31%</td>
<td></td>
<td>27%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Plant/machinery Operators, Drivers</td>
<td>70%</td>
<td></td>
<td>65%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Labourers</td>
<td>53%</td>
<td></td>
<td>44%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**August 1992**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Part-time and Full-time</th>
<th>F</th>
<th>M</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Part-time</td>
<td>26%</td>
<td>22%</td>
<td>25%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Full-time</td>
<td>41%</td>
<td>46%</td>
<td>44%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>35%</td>
<td>43%</td>
<td>40%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: ABS Cat No 6325.0
Women are increasingly moving into leadership positions in corporate life, perhaps bringing with them new ways of viewing our organisations. This article addresses the issue of whether our organisations will be transformed by this, or whether the predominant discourse or culture in the organisation will transform the women.

To examine this issue, we need first to think about gender differences, particularly as they emerge in modern organisational life. When reporting on difference, the arguments most usually posed state that:

(i) women are psychologically and behaviourally different to men primarily because of biological differences; or,
(ii) the differences arise through differential socialisation; and/or,
(iii) the differences emerge due to differential status, power and authority within organisational life.

Biological differences aside, it is worth knowing whether or not it is primarily the entrenched system of roles typical in our organisations - that is, the (more or less) hierarchical systematisation of management in relation to workers and/or professionals - that creates our organisational men and women (Kantor, 1977a). Or, might this itself be just another symptom of a more generalised cultural difference between the genders. If the latter proves to be the case, then there may be reason to watch with interest the emergence of a critical mass of women in corporate leadership. Because this will allow for the emergence of a more feminine discourse in a place where masculine discourse has predominated.

The idea of discourse requires some explanation: it is one of language and culture. A discourse is a set of symbolic relations. It is the ground from where new ideas, new perceptions and hence new objects emerge. A discourse has power to set the conditions of human relations because it sets down rules for defining terms in language, and behaviours in social contexts. It is not simply a natural language, but a whole process of social legitimation for how a language is used, who uses it, where and when. It implements an interface between language and social behaviour.

An example might help here. A female engineer who is a manager found herself in a totally male work culture. She says, "As the only woman there are advantages and disadvantages ...... everyone automatically assumes that you are intelligent as a woman engineer ....... no-one knew what to expect of you and so there weren't any rules, say about how you dressed and your style of doing things ........ there were times when I wondered if the lack of rules left me more vulnerable, people appeared to believe anything about me" (Roberts, 1992). In this case the male discourse was the only one available and the woman had to find her way in with no rules and no space for any other kind of discourse. She was left feeling isolated and needing to meet the men on their own terms in order to gain acceptance. In fact, she could only be perceived through the perspective of the dominant discourse.

There are few women in top level corporate leadership positions and the position there is not unlike that of our female engineer. Communication and the discourse that it emerges from at this level of leadership tends to be a masculine one. And it is from the top that the legitimisation of culture comes even if our organisations have many subcultures.

What then are the rules of communication in our organisations and how does this relate to how the genders communicate? The following questions emerge: Do men and women speak differently? Is there any basis to the claims that the sexes somehow don't listen to one another but converse at cross purposes? Are there gender based codes for legitimating certain styles of address and conversation? Although these questions are generalised and certainly require closer definition and specification, they do reflect some aspects of our experience as men or women attempting to understand each other. And they do pose the gender difference as a cultural or subcultural phenomenon, allowing us to use anthropological, cultural, historical, linguistic and discourse analysis as tools for exploration.

Let's start with the sort of differences that seem fairly well known. These are best seen in some of the typical, if not stereotypical, ways that men and women respond to
one another. To begin, Rosenthal and Jacobson (1968) pointed out that teachers of both sexes tend to respond more frequently and positively to males in the mixed gender classroom. Explanations of this tend to be framed in terms of the attention seeking and dominant behaviour of boys, who often have higher self esteem, compared with girls. This has led to the recently well promoted idea that girls are better off in single gender schools where they learn to compete intellectually with one another and to gain self esteem, rather than taking a back seat to their male peers (Spender, 1992). Boys on the other hand tend to do better in mixed gender schools, the argument being that the more submissive behaviours of girls tends to tone down the highly aggressive and competitive nature of all boy classroom interactions; an explanation that angers some feminists who believe that girls are being socially “used” to let boys off the hook with respect to their own responsibility for their aggressive behaviours.

Also, consider the research of Maltz and Borker (1982) who take a cultural approach to male-female communication processes. They reviewed several articles about the differences between the 'friendly conversational styles' of American girls and boys, and of men and women. Roughly speaking:

i) females adopt a style of promoting interactive conversation whilst minimising conflict, and,

ii) males adopt a style of promoting competitive jostling in order to gain an audience.

Maltz and Borker believe these styles are learned primarily in the single gender peer groups typically found in the social lives of latency and pre-adolescent age children. Later in life, men and women learn to modify the extreme conversational styles learned in childhood, but they are doing this from a background of marked subcultural differences. This becomes evident in conversational items such as questions which are often viewed differently by men and women. Women learn to use questions as promoters of conversation and as linking mechanisms. Men tend to use them primarily as information seeking devices or as rhetorical modes of promoting their own arguments. Women use “rapport” talk, whilst men tend to use “report” talk (Tannen, 1991). What happens then, when, in mid-conversation, a woman asks a question intending to further develop their relationship and the man, oblivious to this intent, simply answers factually but with no further links? He may think that she doesn’t really want the conversation to continue because he doesn’t build on her question with further associations and questions but ends with a statement of his own position. Does the conversation turn to: “You don’t really want to talk to me!”; “You don’t listen!”? This is of course one major outcome.

Let’s take this into the work place now with adults, who, in addition to what they have learned in the classroom and playground, have had this modified and reinforced by the sexual flirtatious games first learned in kindergarten but explosively developed during adolescence. Such games (even since the advent of feminism) locate females even more strongly in the position of conversational modulators, and males in the position of competitors and audience seekers. These same adults, who have learned to be more polite, restrained and conforming, nonetheless have by now become fairly entrenched in their gender speech modes and practices. They move through organisational life from quite different linguistic positions.

But why do such different discursive cultures emerge for men and women? Gilligan (1988) considers that there are deeply embedded differences in the ways that the genders come to form an image of self and an associated basic moral position. For males, she argues, the self is formed primarily through a growing capacity to develop autonomy, detachment, objectivity and an accompanying sense of moral responsibility for others who are also regarded as autonomous human beings. Reference is made back to the individual and his capacity to make just and impartial judgements. This, Gilligan claims, was the major moral developmental task outlined by psychologists following Piaget and Kohlberg. It was applied equally to girls and boys.

Her own research with girls brought forward the need for us to see such development as a male, rather than a general benchmark. These females seemed to develop quite a different image of self. Rather than being grounded in individuality, the girl develops a self in relation to others. Her self emerges primarily through a growing capacity to develop empathy, attachments, compromises and self transformation. The girl develops a moral sense of response-ability, and, “in this way”, Gilligan (1988) says, “the self is in relationship and the reference for judgement then becomes the relationship.” Her judgements then, will be influenced more by the outcome for the relationship (the system) than by the outcome for autonomous individuals.

An example she gives is illustrative: “Two four year olds - a girl and a boy - were playing together and wanted to play different games. In this version of a common dilemma, the girl said, ‘Let’s play next door neighbours.’
subcultures have existed within organisation hierarchies and sexuality (Schein 1980; Schneider & Shrivastava, 1988) which transforms both of the games into a new game with new roles that neither had previously envisioned.

Gilligan’s work has added a new dimension to the consideration of gender differences. The cultures of the male the female seem to give rise to quite different strategies for self development, moral judgements and group relations.

In the workplace the full complexities of gender relations are masked on the surface by rules of politeness, expressed values of equal opportunity and minimisation of difference, guidelines and penalties for sexual harassment and the general rules of organisational life that structure relations in terms of power, authority, accountability, expertise and organisational experience.

Beneath this we have the gender subcultures of behavioural and linguistic rules that entwine with other submerged cultural assumptions about power, dominance and sexuality (Schein 1980; Schneider & Shrivastava, 1988; Tannen, 1991). Traditionally, when these different subcultures have existed within organisation hierarchies where men tend to have greater authority, the roles emergent from the differences may seemingly complement one another. An example is the case of the directive, competitive male manager and his moderating, supportive secretary. In such hierarchies, however, the gender differences get overloaded with political significance and the power/authority relation is predominant. It is then difficult to tease out just what relational effects are due to power and status differences, and what are due to gender. In fact, the issue of authority or legitimated power has been so enmeshed with gender that it is difficult for us to think of female leaders/authorities without either considering them as “masculinised” or “neuroticised” (Long, 1992), or to consider that there is really a male in charge, de-facto.

This difficulty may be understood in terms of relations between a dominant culture (in this case the male culture) and the culture that is submerged by this dominance. Such inter-cultural relations may range between friendly coexistence, as in multi-culturalist societies, through hostile separateness, as in Occupation, to a situation where the peoples of the submerged culture are abused and the culture deteriorates, as in Colonisation. Fanon (1963) describes the French colonisation of Algeria and the consequent loss of identity and sometimes sanity of the Algerian people. The French came to regard the Algerians as intellectually, morally and emotionally inferior, and Fanon demonstrates how the process of colonisation brought about behaviours in the Algerians that on the surface seemed to support such judgements. One can only reflect on the way that women have also been judged in these ways throughout history.

Even where the cultural relations are those of friendly coexistence, the dominant culture requests or demands that people of the submerged culture play a role within its cultural rules. In the dominant male culture women are to play a role - perhaps that of the ‘other half’, or man’s shadow; his anima or his fantasy. Women may play this role, or they may even strive to take the males’ position in that culture and are hence perceived as masculinised. In this sense they are subject to the ‘conceptual trap’ of patriarchy. Such a trap equates the universal with maleness.

On the other hand, the submerged culture is left to its own devices mostly out of the consciousness of those of the dominant culture. In this case, there is the submerged female culture, played out in relative isolation, hidden and somewhat illegitimate.

At a recent gender relations experiential working conference held in Melbourne, Australia (August 1992) for managers, members attempted to understand gender issues at work in the context of an all female staff who were the authority figures. Exploring below the surface led to the formulation of several hypotheses about female leadership and its effects both on women and men. In this situation, when in single gender member groups many of the men found themselves able to move away from their more competitive and aggressive posturing toward a more sharing interpersonal style. They did however, tend to compete for the attention of the more powerful females (whether these were females with authority or females with other sources of power). Many of the women, by contrast, felt abandoned by the staff and less able to relate to one another in supportive ways. They were more able to be supportive toward the men in mixed groups, and some seemed keenly to miss the presence of males in authority. Without male authority figures, the women had to turn from their roles within the male culture and face the possibility of their own competitiveness and relatedness with each other and to deal with this. This was extremely difficult as they had few tools for so doing.
On the whole the female authority was felt to be freeing, sometimes abandoning, on the surface at times weak, yet strongly present and hungered for. The images that emerged were at first of nuns (asexual or with sublimated sexuality and thus less threatening, yet powerful!), then of mothers (both good and bad) and finally figures of more primitive power, mystery and seductiveness (eg., the image of the Medusa was present in the final follow-up plenary, some six weeks after the conference proper). With such images around, it is not surprising that the type of leadership traditionally offered by males is invoked to master the situation. The father is felt to be missing, and in his absence there is a threat of being overwhelmed by forces not really understood. And we don't really understand the culture of women because it is submerged and regarded as not legitimate in the wider scheme of things by men and women.

The discourse of modern corporations has worked to form new objects. These are the objects of, eg., managerial hierarchies and of shareholders. The discourse talks of motivation, remuneration and superannuation; profits and losses; and, legitimates management training, the authority of the C.E.O. and the rules of corporate takeovers. It may be enlightening to think of your manager as a product of corporate discourse, especially when he/she has just delegated (a discursive strategy) a mammoth task (a discursive object) to you (a modern victim of corporate discourse!).

The interesting question, then, lies around whether men and women have their own gender discourses. Do they not only converse differently, have different linguistic subcultures and different images of authority, but also create their own organisational objects in different ways? For example, does the term manager mean quite a different thing to a man and to a woman? In feminine discourse a manager may not be a distinctive individualised role but a function arising out of working relations between people, who may be called managers or subordinate (perhaps male terms in themselves). If this is so, then in our organisations a feminine leadership within a feminine discourse may place us in a less defined, more vulnerable state. It may mean a leadership that does not direct others, but one that invites others to explore the emergence of something new through a working relationship that lets go of past definitions and certainties, like the new game of "pirate next door" created by Gilligan's 4-year old subject. Kantor (1977a) examines the development of a management "class" that forms as an organisational defence against uncertainty. Through managerial orderliness, chaos might be averted! Although she sees this as primarily a class structure which engages men and women differentially, in the present analysis it may be seen as a defence emergent from male discourse. Females may have quite different organisational defences.

Because, it produces its own objects, its own concepts, its own strategies for development and usage and has its own authority, a discourse does provide for a social bond through its use and its products. This all links those who enter the discourse in defined social relations. If our organisations and institutions have historically developed from traditional patriarcal modes of organisation, then this is the discourse that males are encouraged to enter as agents from their beginnings, with females being predominantly the recipients of the discourse - the other for the male. However, throughout their education and work lives, many women, through the overt cultural practices of seeking equality, tend to take up the position of agent in this discourse also. They may have to prove themselves able to do this, as many men also may have to, particularly men from minority groups, and they may have to do so with persistence and through showing great expertise. Yet the discourse is essentially masculine if not male. As women move into leadership must they be transformed to fit this masculine discourse?

Interestingly, the legislation of the early to mid-eighties to provide the possibility of equal opportunity and freedom from sexual harassment, which has enabled women to move more fully toward taking up agency or authority within this discourse, has simply provided an easier access for women to take up agency within the male discourse. It may be that a lot more has to be done in this direction, but maybe also the direction itself does not take women toward an understanding of what might be the feminine discourse, nor aid them in assuming agency in such a discourse at work.

The other possibility is that our organisations themselves become transformed and that feminine discourse and leadership styles may find a place.

In 1969 Lacan introduced the idea of "four discourses" which he believes are central to understanding relations between the human subject, as described in his version of psychoanalytic theory, and the social order (Lacan, 1992). Now, we can say, following Lacan, that a discourse has an agent by whom it is enunciated or spoken, and another to whom it is addressed. Any person or subject may take up the position of agent in the discourse, provided that they are legitimated by the discourse as agent (Rodriguez, 1992; Grigg, 1992).
When discourse is engaged there is a product and underlying the discourse is a truth. The truth of the discourse is not always self-evident, but it is basic to it and drives the agent in the discursive act. We could say the agent suffers the truth of the discourse he or she engages in. We may see the truth of the modern corporate discourse, a version of a discourse which Lacan names the Discourse of the Master as lying in the split or disharmonious nature of the human subject. Disharmonious because the culture that we enter as children requires the subjugation of 'natural' desire to the Law. In becoming civilised, we become alienated from our nature and hence, divided. (In analytic theory this is seen as the process of the oedipus complex, occurring in the face of the law derived from the incest taboo. This law centres around the importance of the father and the phallic function, at least in phallocentric, patriarchal cultures).

Lacan regards the Discourse of the Master as the central discourse of, at least Western, if not of all cultures. He is influenced also by Hegel’s view of the Master/Slave dialectic. The agent of this discourse is the Master who engages through interdicts and commands. He addresses the slave (other) who does his will. The product of the discourse is the labour of the slave and the pleasure of the master. The surplus product is acquired by the master; his is a psychology of acquisitiveness, appropriation and ownership. The discourse legitimates and empowers ownership, first of others and then of material goods. In fact the discourse creates a world filled with material objects: insurance companies that sell products rather than rendering services; workers who are remunerated according to productivity rather than because of their skills (as in the older idea of the artisan). But with production comes the loss of the slave’s freedom. This is an essential other for the master. The truth of the discourse is, ironically, that the master is driven by his own disharmony and his own lack of self-knowledge. As agent of this discourse he is split off from his own natural desire and comes to serve his false acquisitions. This is recognised in the myths of King Midas and tales of Mammon, as well as in the theories of Marx, the tenets of Christianity and the modern myth of the workaholic corporate high flyers.

I am describing the discourse of the master in terms of the masculine gender. Controversial or not, this seems to describe the discourse, of phallocentric, patriarchal cultures. This is so, notwithstanding that many masters are benign, even loving, and, notwithstanding that women may be agents in this discourse also, enslaving men and (perhaps mostly) women. Fanon (1963) did point out how in colonised cultures the members of what I have called the submerged culture aggressed more against each other than against members of the dominant culture.

Lacan (1992) names also the Discourse of the Hysteric, presupposing the discourse of the master. The agent here is the disharmonious divided subject. She addresses herself to the Master, her other, in order to evoke a response. She questions the master, as other, about her estranged desire. She tries to know who she is through engaging him, so that he as ‘expert’ might tell her nature. Here, quite obviously I am using the female gender in my description, although the agent of this discourse may be a man and he may address a woman. Still, one is reminded of the research quoted earlier in this paper where the woman was seen to use questions to evoke responses and to engage dialogue more than to command attention (as the master does).

In this discourse, the product or outcome is knowledge of the self. The divided, estranged subject comes to know his or her nature through the eyes of others. So with this product comes a loss. It is the loss of her own desire which recedes more fully as the subject comes more and more to live out what the other desires, to be what the other wants her to be. The truth of the discourse, according to Lacan, is that in the discourse of the hysteric, the idea of woman is a (masculine) fantasy. She is what the other wants her to be. To find her own desire, the subject must move out of the discourse, no longer its agent. For within the discourse both genders are subjected to definition from the outside alone. This is the position of the member of the submerged culture who attempts to find herself through the rules imposed by the dominant culture.

Lacan offers the Discourse of the Analyst and the Discourse of the University as the other two in his significant four discourses. Briefly, they are as follows: The discourse of the university has impersonal knowledge in the place of the agent. In this way all is subjected to requirements of understanding, logic and reason. When someone enters this discourse in the place of the agent he or she is speaking from the position of impersonal knowledge to the desiring other who wishes to learn. The product, however, of such knowledge is the divided subject, because the underlying truth of the discourse is that it is a cover for the blind authority of the Master’s discourse. All seemingly objective knowledge is ultimately in the service of the Master’s ideology, good or bad as this may be. This discourse legitimates and rationalises the social, political and cultural practices surrounding it. So, the subject is divided from his or her desire by the
cultural practices of the Master. This also is the discourse of bureaucracy.

The discourse of the analyst, on the other hand, has the analyst in the place of the agent. From this place, the analyst creates in the other (the analysand) the desire to know and construct the significant meanings of his or her life. The work of analysis produces knowledge of a different kind to that produced in the university, or in the hysterical or in the Master's discourse. It is a knowledge of the subject and his or her important meanings. It is produced rather than being pre-existent. The underlying truth is the unconscious desire of the subject which in the discourse becomes integrated back into the subject's total life.

Having named these discourses, how can we use the work of Lacan to further our understanding of the discourses of the genders? As mentioned earlier, if the discourse of the Master and the derivative discourse of the University which are basic to our culture, are also the bases of traditional patriarchal modes of organisation, then this is the discourse that males are encouraged to enter as agents from their beginnings, with females (firstly mother and then others) being predominantly in the place of other; that is, being the recipients of the discourse. The very nature of the male's identification with other males requires him to move away from an identification with the mother and hence to stand in opposition to her (Chodorow, 1978).

Following Lacan and several feminist writers the discourse of the Hysteric provides the predominant agency for the female. Here she (the female as agent) takes up the place of the enquirer who promotes and activates the other’s knowledge of herself. In psychoanalytic terms the precursor of the discourse is an enquiry into the mother’s or female’s body; this being the initial provocation to developing knowledge of any sort. What is at stake in this discourse is possession of the female body. The discourse invites the other to its appropriation. Clearly it has been well appropriated by the advertisers. And, we cannot help being reminded here of the central issue of abortion in the feminist debates and the slogans about women wanting to take control of their own bodies rather than give them over to the establishment - the doctors and the medical establishment in general.

A parallel in the workplace is around the issue of sexual harassment. Recent work with a large sample of schoolgirls has highlighted the way in which this issue is felt to be important and part of a whole cultural approach. For example teasing about their bodies by boys and male teachers was felt as harassment (Spender, 1992). Do we think of teasing as a natural part of social life or is it a result of the operation of the opposing yet linked discourses of the Master and the Hysteric? Of course males may suffer the same from the other if and when they enter the discourse of the Hysteric as agents.

But it is from the discourse of the Hysteric that one may enter the discourse of the Analyst. The hystericalised subject is the other that analysis is able to address. It is not surprising that women are often more amenable to psychological and ‘soft’ interpretations of events, whilst men tend to retain their position in ‘harder’ approaches. Girls tend to focus on relationships, boys on mechanics. On the whole, women are more often than men, positioned to receive labels such as “not being able to cope with conflict”, or, “not being able to make the hard decisions”. They also tend to be seen as “more understanding”, “more open and approachable”; God help them when they’re not! Then they’re “hard, uncaring bitches!” But, men are also “hystericalised”; men also suffer anxiety, indecisiveness and ambivalence. They may in fact be caring, open and soft. However the discourses of the genders rarely allow for this. Registration at the level of the symbolic discourse outweighs many actual interpersonal relations.

However, if the Discourse of the Analyst, is entered via the ‘hystericalisation’ of the other, then it may be important that in our organisations we pay more attention to the discourse of the Hysteric, how we enter it, and how we work from it toward a discourse that allows for a fuller understanding of our relations to our social worlds. A social world not based on Master/Slave relations, but on an openness for us each to find our freedoms, our own bodies and our own desire. This may require organisations to move away from the predominant Master’s discourse toward others.

Even with the above, we are still left with the question of a submerged feminine discourse not named nor explored by Lacan. It may be one where agency is transformed by relations with the other as Gilligan argues. This in itself is unsettling, more so because we may feel that in our organisations a feminine leadership within such a discourse may place us in a less defined, more vulnerable state. It may mean a leadership that does not direct others, but one that invites others to explore the emergence of something new through a working relationship that lets go of past definitions and certainties. Men and women need together to explore this territory of a new discourse. Not to replace those already
with us, but to transform them for the work we need to do together.

In drawing this to an end it is worth noting some practical considerations to guide those wishing to promote the development of more feminine ways of leading and managing (Cargill & Long, 1992). Developing and maintaining such ways requires efforts at the whole organisation level, or at least through substantially sized groups within an organisation, to develop what might be considered a critical mass.

**NORMALISE STRENGTHS OF FEMININE LEADERSHIP THROUGH NETWORKS AND BY USING FEMALE ROLE MODELS**

It is important to consider the particular strengths of feminine leadership which derive from feminine culture. These may involve different ways of communicating, of defining morality and of assuming authority. These strengths, instead of being submerged or seen only as ‘soft’ alternatives, should be normalised and seen as an important part of experience. Indeed, they are a part of experience in women’s culture, and children of both genders are exposed to this culture and to these styles. It is only in their de-legitimation in our organisational life that they become submerged or signified as less powerful or effective. To reverse this de-legitimation the women in organisations (and it will be the women predominantly, but with the help of men) need to support and promote female role models in leadership positions and together legitimate and normalise the strengths of their feminine culture. This cannot be done in isolation.

**SHIFT THE DOMINANT CULTURE THROUGH PROMOTING COHORTS OF WOMEN RATHER THAN PROMOTING INDIVIDUALS PIECEMEAL AND THROUGH CLEAR DELEGATION TO WOMEN**

To normalise feminine strengths in leadership requires that the dominant organisational culture is changed. As stated above, this cannot be done by women in isolation. Promoting women singly and in isolation subjects them to the pressure of a dominant traditional male culture and cuts them off from the needed networking and support potentially available from other women at similar organisational levels and in similar roles. This was seen in the example of the female engineer discussed earlier. It may be argued that it is not possible to promote several women at once. However, it is possible for organisations to strategically plan to promote women over a period of time where each is able to draw on support from a legitimised plan and where women are able to plan career paths that do not have a “glass ceiling” effect built in.

**SHIFT STEREOTYPED DIVISION OF EMOTIONAL ROLES OF THE GENDERS**

Both women and men collude in living with the traditional emotional roles of the genders. Women are likely to introject and contain an emotional or ‘hystericised’ position, whilst men tend to move away from this and to take up the rational or pseudo-rational position (Kantor, 1977b). This is a simple way of saying that the genders readily take up agency in their traditional discourses. And, it becomes a mutual protection racket in the face of anxieties. Shifts in this structuring can only come with efforts to provide an organisational environment where men can safely explore their ‘feminine’ side and women their ‘masculine’ side; and where the hidden feminine discourse can emerge.

It seems that men and women do move from and through different linguistic cultures and it will only be when men and women share power that our corporations will be able to use the diversity that this implies

**REFERENCES**


Roberts, P. "Personal Perspectives of Women in Non-Traditional Areas" in *Beyond Beginnings: Women's Education, Employment and Training Symposium Papers*, National Centre for Women, Swinburne University, Melbourne.


WORD PICTURE

Picture if you can, that you are starting work with a new organisation. It's your first day and you are keen to do well to use the knowledge and skills gained from your studies and from your other experiences. The foyer is bare and you make your way up the lifts to a reception counter. The counter has a range of signs telling you what you are not allowed to do and a bell to ring. Eventually someone comes to deal with you and you wait. The person doing your induction is casual and not very interested. You eventually see your manager who is glad you have arrived, there is a lot to do, and he is rushing to a meeting. He gives you lots of things to read and explains some of the conditions of service and what your job is about. You ask about training. You ask about training and he says that you were selected because of your skills and knowledge and that there aren't alot of funds for courses but go and talk to the training manager. You ask about Co-workers and other women at your level and he doesn't seem to understand the question and you decide to leave it. You have lots of other questions and want to discuss some of your ideas but he is clearly in a hurry. Someone else escorts you to your workplace and does some basic introductions. There are alot of women doing clerical work and working at computers and in the reception areas. Most of the men are wearing suits and ties and seem to be busy and wandering around to meetings or talking and joking. It is interesting trying to make sense of their workplace, strange cartoons and you flinch at some calendars, although not very big ones, of girls in the latest swimsuits. The women have dried flowers on their desks or travel pictures but you notice one girl with a male nude photo on her desk. Sitting in your work station trying to read the department's annual report, you listen to the conversations around you - women talking about their children and boyfriends, men joking about going to the pub at lunchtime and planning their weekends. You notice there is an Asian girl near you but she isn’t joining in. Your concentration slips and you start to wonder about your future here, how you are going to get your enthusiasm and creativity going, you really wanted to do some interesting things here ....

Have You Experienced Something Similar To This? Can You Relate To This Picture?

Again picture yourself in another new organisation on your first day, keen to do well and keen to use the knowledge and skills gained from your studies and from your other experiences. The foyer is empty but decorated with some stunning aboriginal prints and a plaque commenting on the Year of Indigenous people. The reception counter has a person who is friendly and efficient, the only signs are the area's mission statements and values, which you only have time to read quickly but which sounds great, appealing to your own values regarding service and people. An introduction package has been prepared and the person explaining it to you is careful to make sure you understand and can ask questions. The manager is waiting for you, is glad you have arrived, there is alot to do. Although he gives you lots to read, he explains what it is in the books and leaflets, why they are important and what he feels you should become familiar with in the books and leaflets, why they are important and what he feels you should become familiar with first. He explains the area’s comprehensive development program, how your job relates to others and who your co-workers are. He also gives you details and people to contact regarding the women’s network, for women at your level and explains how your input would be valued there because the network is working on a project which is part of the business plan. He checks if you have any questions and asks about your thoughts on one area of your duties. He really sounds like he’s listening and, so, although you often find it hard to put your ideas into words, realise that he is enthusiastic about what you've said and encourages you to develop it further. He escorts you to your work area and introduces you to a range of co-workers before rushing off to a meeting, however he makes an appointment to see you again tomorrow. You can’t put your finger on why the area looks nice, perhaps it’s the plants or some of the paintings. People seem friendly, men and women doing a range of jobs, dressed smartly but casually, a number of people are obviously from other countries and some laughter is coming from a group of men and women talking to a woman with a baby who seems to be visiting. Your work stations has a small
vase of flowers on it and is well set up. The papers you
have been given to read are easy enough to follow but you
find yourself starting to write down some of your ideas
planning for how you could make another idea work. The
Asian woman and the Aboriginal man near you ask if you
would like to go to lunch as they will show you the
canteen. You hadn't realised it was lunch time, the time
has flown and you've only barely started.....

Have You Experienced Something Similar To
This? Can You Relate To This Picture?

BASIS FOR RESEARCH

My interest in trying to put my finger on what made
a work environment EEO-friendly came from experiences
somewhat alike this. I've experienced nearly all of the
things above, although not usually in the same organisa-
tion. I've worked in a number of places as an EEO adviser
or co-ordinator in the Australian Public Service and each
time, I was struck by the contrasts.

Whenever I had trouble explaining what EEO was
about, why it was important and what were some of the
things needing doing, I realised that particular organisa-
tion also had trouble with a whole range of human
resource management practices - poor selection practices,
haphazard training, little regard for internal service to its
own staff as clients. The needs of the individual came a
poor second to the needs of the organisation. Turnover
was often high, especially among women or people from
other countries and this justified their views that it was
inappropriate to spend too much money on training
them. Individual rights to decorate workplaces however
they wanted to were seen as frowned on and anyone who
didn't go along with this was effectively dealt with: subtle
and blatant put downs.

In contrast, organisations who were genuinely trying
to grapple with EEO issues, willing to listen, spend time
and effort on EEO management plans and activities also
were working on excellent HRM practices - full merit
selections, comprehensive training programs based on
career development needs, performance discussion
programs, support for the EEO target group members,
encouragement for people to understand the basis behind
the EEO initiatives and a recognition of the balance
between individual needs and organisational needs.

Apart from the obvious work environment - pictures/
posters etc, I could tell, as soon as I started talking to the
HRM manager about work practices, whether I was going
to have any problems with my EEO messages. This then
formed the basis for my research as part of my master of
Psychology (Organisational) program at Curtin University.
I wanted to see if it was possible to measure in some way
this concept of what made an organisation "EEO-
friendly" or "EEO-unfriendly" and to look at the effects
this might have, especially on women.

METHODOLOGY

The way I went about this was a questionnaire to a
3% random sample of staff employed under the WA
Public Service Act in 1990. I received a response rate of
78% through working in with a project of the then Skills
Resource Management Unit in the Dept. of Premier and
Cabinet - their assistance is gratefully acknowledged.

I wanted to look at how different personal aspects
affected the results so I spent some time looking at
individual differences and how I could use the results.
Factors I examined included:
• Sex
• NESB (Defined as people whose first language was not
English and who stated they were from an ethnic back-
ground)
• Disabilities (People with long term significant disability)
• Aboriginality
• Age
• Marital Status

SAMPLE CHARACTERISTICS

My sample is fairly typical of any public service group.

TARGET GROUPS

The proportion of males to females was 55% to 45%.

![% of EEO TG Members in Sample](image-url)
**Age**

There are significantly more young women (under 30) in the sample than young men. Over 30, there are significantly more men than women. The reasons for this are not clear but may include the fact that men are joining the public service later than women or are progressing faster. Similarly, women may be leaving early for family responsibilities.

**Marital Status**

Significantly more men were married and more women were single. This is consistent with above data on age, but again, the reasons have not been explored.

**Level**

Women predominate in the lower levels, consistent with trends in the Public Sector and the workforce generally. Details are below:

- Dramatic effect at level 2 for women - Overall 45% of sample were female but are heavily represented at levels 1 (78%) and 2 (63%), then around 30% for levels 3, 4, 5 and then very small numbers at the higher levels.
- For NESB, it is different. Although represented across the levels to level 5, at the higher levels, there are few represented. There was no difference between men and women here.
- People with disabilities were across all levels, so it appears that they occur at all levels, all ages, all ethnic backgrounds, both men and women.

- Only one aboriginal person was in the sample and therefore this was not characteristic and could not be used.
- Young people (under 30) predominate at lower levels, again, consistent with other data.

So, in summary, we have a picture of a public service, consistent with other states and Australia overall, where women and people from NESB are at the lower levels and very few at the higher levels, and these women at the lower levels are younger than men and less likely to be married. The men are at higher levels from earliest age and more likely to be married.

Because the major factor in the results I achieved was the Sex difference this paper concentrates mostly on that factor. I can’t assume that the dynamics of discrimination work the same way for all people. Further studies are needed to clarify the impact of other aspects of disadvantage in the workplace (ethnicity and language, disability, aboriginality, age, family responsibilities), as we know that disadvantage occurs here too.

**Outcome Measures**

It had long seemed to me that work and effort was a reciprocal arrangement between the worker and the organisation.

So the first measure I used was called Perceived Organisational Support (POS) developed by Eisenberger and others. It measures how supported a person feels in their organisation. By supported is meant that the person forms an overall opinion of how they are valued, how their contribution is acknowledged, how the organisation cares about their wellbeing and future opportunities. This then affects their attitudes and decisions back to the organisation about the extent of their involvement and motivation towards that organisation. Feelings of low support are associated with absenteeism and high turnover among other things and high support is linked with, for example, diligence, commitment, performance and creativity.

I felt that women and other EEO target group members would experience POS differently, especially in an “EEO-unfriendly” organisation. And this was indeed the case - more of this in a moment.

I also asked questions about Organisational Commitment. By this I mean how people feel about their organisation in specific ways, based on the work of Cook & Wall as well as Allen & Meyers:

1. Identification: - pride in the organisation, taking on board it’s goals and values
2. Involvement: - willingness to invest personal effort as a member of the organisation, for the organisation's sake
3. Loyalty: - affection for and attachment to the organisation; a sense of belongingness, a wish to stay

High commitment to an organisation is found where people feel they have a range of things including: challenging jobs; receptive managers; dependable organisations, good feedback, opportunities to participate, fair and equitable work practices and a feeling of support and personal competence.

**EEO FRIENDLY**

So - how can you measure EEO-friendly? I wanted to measure all sorts of HRM practices but in the end, reason prevailed and I figured that the best information is going to come from people in the organisations themselves. I developed 3 measures, based on items in typical EEO surveys (eg Office of the Director of Equal Opportunity in Public Employment, NSW, 1990):

1. The Occurrence of Discriminatory Behaviours - the extent to which a range of discriminatory, offensive, unwelcome comments and behaviours occur. People were asked to rate the frequency of occurrence on a 5 point scale. It included such things as pictures, cartoons or comments about race/ethnicity, or with sexual connotations, men’s or women’s roles, put downs about career opportunities and more.
2. The Acceptance of Discriminatory Behaviours - the extent to which the organisation condones, tolerates or discourages the behaviours in the previous list
3. Opportunities Climate - the extent to which the respondents felt that their organisation provided opportunities in 2 areas:
   - to use skills, undertake challenges and development to get the most out of the job.
   - to undertake activities which will lead to other desired work and experiences.

My definition of EEO-friendly is related to an organisation where there is a low occurrence of discriminatory behaviours, if these behaviours should occur, respondents were able to perceive them as not tolerated or acceptable and there was a good opportunities climate. Conversely, if the respondents perceived that there is a high occurrence of discriminatory behaviours. These are somehow acceptable and the overall opportunities climate is perceived as poor, then the description of “EEO-unfriendly” is applied.

**RESULTS**

Overall, there was no statistically significant relationship between whether a person was male/female, NESB, a person with a disability or their age, and with the extent the person felt supported or unsupported by their organisation. The exception was LEVEL - i.e. the higher the level, the more likely people were to report a high degree of organisational support.

**COMMITMENT**

As above, except younger people and those at lower levels reported less commitment to their organisations than older people and those at higher levels.

**EEO - FRIENDLY**

There was a highly significant relationship between a person’s sex, age or level and their reporting of their organisation as EEO-friendly or unfriendly - i.e. women, young people and those at lower levels (mostly women) were much more likely to report their organisation as unfriendly, (74% of EEO Target Group members). Conversely, men, older people and those at higher levels were much more likely to perceive their organisation as EEO-friendly (71%) and only 7% of non EEO TARGET GROUP members rated their organisation as unfriendly.

This makes sense in my view. From my experience this, helps to explain why it is so difficult sometimes to have EEO initiatives taken seriously and implemented. The decision-makers in organisations, mostly older, at higher levels and mostly male, don’t appear to perceive the discriminatory behaviours, may not realise how their inaction is perceived as condoning or tolerating the behaviours and don’t appreciate how women and others experience the glass ceiling. Complaints, if they do occur, often come from women, younger, and at lower levels where there is likely to be difficulty gaining credence. It may also imply that there are genuinely fewer discriminatory behaviours occurring or acceptable at the higher levels.

---

=EEO - FRIENDLY=  
No. in “EEO-Friendly” Organisation

---

=EEO - FRIENDLY=  
There was a highly significant relationship between a person’s sex, age or level and their reporting of their organisation as EEO-friendly or unfriendly - i.e. women, young people and those at lower levels (mostly women) were much more likely to report their organisation as unfriendly, (74% of EEO Target Group members). Conversely, men, older people and those at higher levels were much more likely to perceive their organisation as EEO-friendly (71%) and only 7% of non EEO TARGET GROUP members rated their organisation as unfriendly.

This makes sense in my view. From my experience this, helps to explain why it is so difficult sometimes to have EEO initiatives taken seriously and implemented. The decision-makers in organisations, mostly older, at higher levels and mostly male, don’t appear to perceive the discriminatory behaviours, may not realise how their inaction is perceived as condoning or tolerating the behaviours and don’t appreciate how women and others experience the glass ceiling. Complaints, if they do occur, often come from women, younger, and at lower levels where there is likely to be difficulty gaining credence. It may also imply that there are genuinely fewer discriminatory behaviours occurring or acceptable at the higher levels.

---
OUTCOMES

So what does it matter if your organisation is EEO-friendly?

Well, for one, your staff won’t feel very supported, and in turn, give commitment back to the organisation. In general, the more EEO-friendly your organisation is, the more likely that people will feel supported and will feel like becoming involved, putting in effort and feeling pride and loyalty towards it - with benefits for productivity and turnover and many other indicators. Statistically, this was a highly significant relationship.

What this means to me is that:

If you are a woman (and especially a young woman at a lower level) and you perceive your environment is discriminatory in some way, that these behaviours are condoned or acceptable and you don’t feel that you really have many opportunities, to advance yourself or undertake more interesting and challenging work, then, you won’t feel very supported. That is, you feel the organisation doesn’t care much about you and therefore you won’t care much about what happens to it! And even though there are men who feel the same way, it will affect you more as a woman. The men won’t feel as unsupported and won’t feel as uncommitted as you.

SUMMARY OF IMPLICATIONS

WOMEN IN ORGANISATIONS

Significantly more likely to:
• perceive discriminatory behaviours in their work environment
• feel that the organisation considers this acceptable and condones it
• feel they have less opportunities for career development and access to rewarding work

And as a result are significantly less likely to:
• feel a sense of organisational support
• commitment towards that organisation

We have come full circle to our young, female new starters. I believe that the implications for managers are clear. Despite the fact that they may genuinely believe that their environment is EEO-friendly most (74%) of their EEO target group members are likely to rate their organisation as EEO-unfriendly. Women are especially likely to feel intimidated and, given the fewer numbers of women at the higher levels, have diminished views of their opportunities. The high commitment that organisations require to achieve outstanding productivity and excellence will not be achievable, from both men and women in an unfriendly environment.

Striving for excellence, quality improvements, service orientation and a learning organisation requires people to feel valued, supported and willing to commit themselves. This is a voluntary act, an emotional one and can’t be enforced, legislated for or pushed in any way. The only way it can be achieved is if managers create a working environment that is genuinely free from unjustified discrimination, genuinely values its people, genuinely listens to people at all levels, all ages, all backgrounds and unleashes and harnesses the creativity and individuality.
that all have the potential to contribute. The efforts to fit in with an EEO-unfriendly environment comes at a cost - withdrawal of the willingness to make efforts and commitments beyond those necessary to survive in the organisation.

In his speech to the RIPAA conference last year called Turning the Corner, the then Taxation Commissioner Trevor Boucher, outlined what he considered were successes in the Australian Taxation Office, where he was able to link the results from staff surveys which showed positive improvements in the way staff felt about their work and their managers, to those offices where their productivity improvement indicators had also improved.

When it comes to people, as with just about anything else, you only get back what you put in. Words are not enough, managers are judged by their actions, not their intentions. Policies and procedures, no matter how well intentioned, appropriate and sincerely communicated are not sufficient if, at the level of the day-to-day workplace, both men and women, EEO target group members and nonmembers are actually still experiencing behaviours that are offensive or intimidatory.

Managers need an open mind, to create an environment where EEO target-group members feel they can express themselves, and the challenge is to provide a forum for people to participate in strategies that would overcome discrimination.

I believe that if more managers understood the role of commitment and how to foster this through valuing and respecting people from all backgrounds, all levels, then both EEO target group members and nonmembers - the whole organisation - will benefit as a result.

REFERENCES
INTRODUCTION

Three years ago, as part of an A.R.C. funded project, forty academic staff were interviewed by development unit staff about their university work. They were asked how they approached and undertook their research and scholarship and their teaching and administrative duties.

The last five years have not been an easy time for universities. Most of these interviews gave a picture of individuals and departments reeling under the stresses of amalgamation and vastly increased workloads. There was a consensus that academic life was no longer the deeply rewarding profession it had once been and there was much disillusion, despondency and despair. Thirteen of the interviewees were women: it seemed from an initial analysis that although many of these women had to face just as many, and in some cases, more threats and demands as their male colleagues, their responses were different.

First, men were much more likely to blame the organisation and forces outside of themselves for the problems they faced. They were more inclined to deny that it was ever their fault and to see themselves as badly done by and blameless. Women, on the other hand, were more likely to accept what had happened and to try to understand rather than to blame. They tended to see their actions as being part of the problem. For example, they often reasoned that if they had worked harder in a particular area, or positioned themselves differently, or understood the environment better, then they would have been in an improved, or at least a different position.

Second, although women were usually deeply affected by the changes, they were more likely to see their way through new and difficult situations and to find ways of proceeding which would lead to satisfactory conclusions. Generally, they were more optimistic about their future and the future of their department.

Third, women often looked beyond their place of work for support, satisfaction and resolution. Their identities and egos were not so tied up with their work as were those of the men. Family was usually important to them, but beyond this, they talked of personal development and acquiring new skills in a wider sphere.

Fourth, women were much more likely to pay attention to the plight of other staff within the organisation, both academic and non-academic, and students also. They had more of a genuine interest in and concern for those around them.

The questions that were asked in this study were not designed to gain feedback about gender differences in working methods. In addition, the sample of female academic staff, typically reflecting the way they are represented in the academic workforce, was heavily biased towards the lower end of the academic ladder. However, the findings did appear to have surface validity and warranted further investigation. Consequently, another study, of thirty academic women, was commenced. Both male and female staff were also asked questions about the way women academics work: this was part of another investigation that was looking at the experiences of recently appointed academic staff.

In the first part of the study data was collected from 27 men and thirteen women; in the second part of the investigation there were thirty women, plus a further ten men and five women from the recently appointed academic staff survey. In total, there were 85 interviews: 37 from men and 48 from women.

These interviews were mainly from universities in Melbourne, but from a range of different types of university: two traditional universities, a technological university and a new university. Over half of the interviews of women came from the technological university. The concern initially was to understand women's ways of working and the support they required on home-ground. Interviewees were selected on the basis of gender, position within the organisation and discipline area. The broad categories of humanities/social science, science/engineering and business/law were used. Major differences were found between men and women within the same broad discipline bands. These differences were significantly more marked than those between discipline areas and somewhat more marked than differences between level of appointment.

It is these gender differences that are discussed in this paper. The investigation wanted to know:

• Are some ways of working typically associated with women?
• What do these ways of working look like?
What do women see as the strengths and the problems of working in these ways?
What do men see as the benefits and the problems of working with women?

Analyses of interviews and a study of existing literature on academic work and women in the workforce contributed to the development of four dimensions relevant to working in a university as an academic member of staff. The dimensions were:

- Confident - uncertain
- Open to new ideas - unmoved by new ideas
- Consultative - autocratic
- Single-minded - readily side-tracked

Taking the level of academic position and the discipline area into account, it was found that women typically clustered at one end of all of these dimensions and that men clustered at the other end.

Confident - Uncertain of Own Ability

Women at all levels and in all disciplines were more likely to lack confidence and be uncertain of their own ability than the men who were interviewed. The following quotes are typical. All of these come from academic women of senior lecturer level or above:

- I've always felt grateful when I've got jobs. I've always thought there must be someone else better than me. (Senior Lecturer)
- I never expected to get this far, actually. I guess I was in the right place at the right time. (Associate Professor)
- I never feel that what I have to say is of any real importance until it's said by someone else. (Senior Lecturer)

Open to New Ideas - Unmoved by New Ideas

Both women and men, again at all levels and in all three disciplines, saw academic women as being particularly open to new ideas. The following quote illustrates this:

- I think I'm a lot more tolerant of new ideas than most of my male colleagues. I mean, I don't think I suffer fools gladly, but I think I listen to what other people say. I try to see where they are coming from and work it through.

Consultative - Autocratic

Women were seen to be more consultative than male colleagues by over 75% of the male sample and over 80% of the female sample:

- I try to make a point of asking the advice of colleagues and particularly, of the more junior staff. It makes for good relations, but more than that, you actually learn a lot that way.

Single Minded - Readily Side-Tracking

Single-mindedness, as opposed to being readily side-tracked, was seen by men and women to be both a strength and a weakness. Men readily agreed that they were more single-minded than their female colleagues and both men and women saw women as being more readily sidetracked:

- I admire the ability of (senior female colleague) to deal with so much at once...I do feel that taking all that on means that she doesn't produce the quality research she might otherwise produce.

Women saw their work habits as quite different from those of their male colleagues:

- I am able to juggle a lot of things at once and I see it as a strength in my life as a mother and a manager and as a weakness in my life as a scholar. The thing I have noted about my male colleagues is that they are able to stay focused on one thing for days, for weeks in some cases. That way, you get your research done and your papers written. I am lucky to get a couple of hours at a time on anything and I know that the way I work invites interruptions.

Views on the Strengths and Problems of Working in These Characteristically Female Ways

Almost all the men and women interviewed believed that the ways in which women typically worked benefited the academic environment and individuals within it. In particular, there was comment on the extent to which...
female colleagues often encouraged team-work and social activities and also engaged in and encouraged debriefing following stressful or demanding teaching sessions or meetings. Women were effective in creating a supportive intellectual and social environment.

This is interesting in the light of existing research on academic environments, both at school and at tertiary level (Mortimore, 1988; Foster, 1989; Ramsden, 1991; Louis, 1993), which indicated that: effective academic environments are characterised by, amongst other things, teamwork and high levels of inter-colleague collaboration. Such environments facilitate a more reflective approach to teaching and more productive research.

This suggests a firm relationship between environment and productivity, although neither men nor women in this study acknowledged such a connection, or the conclusion that women appear more likely to create a productive environment. The collaboration and support so often provided by female colleagues was seen as pleasant, but unrelated to the main business of the department.

THE LANGUAGE OF RESPONSE

ACADEMIC WORK AS METAPHOR

The metaphors embedded within the descriptions of departmental business, careers and roles is in itself illuminating. In particular, it is interesting to note the difference between men's and women's use of metaphor in this context.

The majority of men used metaphors of war and confrontation when talking about their academic work and their own careers. Women sometimes used similar metaphors, but more typically, they used the notion of a journey as the fundamental metaphor, both for descriptions of academic roles and of career paths.

Men talked about:
- academic work being a battle
- having to fight to get a position accepted
- certain views being entrenched in the department
- hitting the target
- getting targets lined up
- achieving a victory
- having to retreat to a more comfortable position
- finding neutral territory.

Women talked about:
- the path being travelled
- the route followed by the department
- individuals, departments or universities sometimes going off track
- being lost
- Making significant inroads
- Being well on the way
- Having covered a lot of ground
- Discovering much along the way.

Interestingly, when men talked of women's contributions, they, too, often used the travel metaphor:
- She has come a long way
- This one has been a bit of a long haul for her
- She has made us think about where we want to go
- She keeps us on track
- There's a sense of knowing where you're going
- We feel we're all in this boat together.

Likewise, women were most likely to adopt the war metaphors when they talked about their male colleagues, or male dominated bureaucracies:
- There is a very entrenched position
- I can't get a truce between them
- There's much opposition to this point of view
- They have a lot of ammunition.

The common sense notion of metaphor is that it is a rhetorical flourish, a matter of extraordinary, rather than ordinary, language. Studies of language use indicate that this is not the case. These studies emphasise that our ordinary conceptual system, in terms of how we both think and act, is fundamentally metaphorical in nature. Reality itself is defined by the metaphors we use; the culture takes on a certain reality through the use of particular metaphors. Therefore, for women, academic life is not just talked about in terms of being a journey; rather, through the way it is defined it becomes a journey. Likewise, for men, academic life becomes war because of the way it is defined.

VIEWS ABOUT WOMEN'S AMBITIONS AS ACADEMICS

The Men

Most male interviewees believed that women in their departments were fulfilled and rewarded in what they did and that women often made the department a more social and cohesive place, both for students and for staff. There was also a dominant belief that the majority of women were not particularly ambitious and that they often did not get satisfaction from the career goals more typically pursued by men:

I don't believe that [female colleague's name] is interested in pushing for a career as such. She gets a lot out of her children and her family and when push comes to shove, I know she'd put them first.

I think [female colleague's name] is more interested in the students and the interpersonal side of things. She's
fantastic at getting us together as a department...I'm not sure she has real academic career ambitions.

This point of view was found in almost three quarters of the men interviewed. Many men acknowledged that women did not all conform to this norm; rather, these other women, who did not usually have heavy family commitments, were frequently characterised as being particularly, indeed, aggressively, ambitious and career-conscious.

The Women

The women endorsed the perception that they were committed to their families, usually adding that dividing themselves between academic careers and family commitments was a great strain. They typically agreed that they found a great deal of satisfaction from the interpersonal aspects of academic work, from working with students and with colleagues. But they did not endorse the views of the male sample that this was all they hoped for from their academic careers: they did want recognition and promotion for their achievements.

The study suggests four different positions adopted by the women interviewees:

- That they were satisfied with the predominantly teaching and support role that they occupied in their department.
- That they were resentful and frustrated at being frequently cast in a marginal support role.
- That they saw no difference in the academic role they played and that played by their male colleagues.
- That they saw the role they filled as marginalised, though they believed it to be central. They consciously chose this role over other alternatives.

The first three of these positions have been well documented. In this paper they will be dealt with briefly, with the greater emphasis being given to developing further the fourth position. This is not well established, but has significant implications for understanding and rewarding the way women work in academic environments.

Satisfied with Supportive Role

Typically, these women had returned to work after having a family, or after having moved with a spouse. They were often employed in positions which were of less status than those they had left before having children or moving location. They saw their present jobs as a way of getting back into the workforce and regaining contact with their subject areas. They appeared grateful for having the opportunity to do this.

Resentful at Being Marginalised

This category represented the largest group of women interviewed. In a number of cases, women voiced their dissatisfaction later in the interview. Their initial public face was one of partial satisfaction, but they quickly revealed degrees of dissatisfaction and even resentment.

A number of these women prefaced their concerns with declarations of loyalty to their male colleagues. They felt as though, in complaining, they were betraying people whom they saw as having helped them initially, but whom they now felt, at times, worked against them.

They talked of sharing ideas, developing initiatives and writing up papers, which were subsequently taken over by male colleagues. At one level, they felt that they should not object, because without the support of the powerful men, they would not be there at all. At another level, they saw that the treatment they received was not the way that men typically worked with other men. They did not know how to change their own behaviour and to confront their male colleagues with their dissatisfaction. They did not even know if it was reasonable to do this.

Treated in a Similar Manner to Male Colleagues

The majority of women in this category, which was only a small percentage, had not had significant breaks in their careers (of three months or more). Some of them had families, but had returned to work as soon as possible and while they felt it was harder for them to cope with family and career, they did not believe that they were disadvantaged at work because they were women.

Consciously Choosing a Marginalised Role

A number of women described the roles they played as team builders and mentors as marginal to the main business of the department. This role was one they, nevertheless, adopted consciously:

I do this because I believe it to be important. At one level it is important to me, but at another level I believe it to be important for the group as a whole that someone does this...I know it is generally not seen to be important but I see the need and realise I can make a significant contribution.

Sometimes, women had dropped more mainstream academic work, such as research, to concentrate on these activities. Sometimes they had chosen to limit the amount
CONCLUSION AND DISCUSSION

There are two points to make in conclusion. The first is that it is a sad indictment of university systems and the academic way of life that qualities such as team building and colleague collaboration, which are known to be related to the development of effective, productive and efficient academic environments, are allowed to go unrewarded when they are demonstrated by women in non-leadership positions.

These qualities are, of course, rewarded when demonstrated by those in leadership positions. Paradoxically, often the women who appear most likely to demonstrate these qualities appear least likely to have worked through the system and be in those leadership roles. Clearly, this is an issue to be brought to the attention of those negotiating systems of academic promotion and reward.

The final concluding remark relates to the long debated feminist issue of equality or difference. When the two notions are paired dichotomously, there appears to be an impossible choice: difference appears unattainable when equality is the aim and alternatively, if difference becomes the most salient, then equality appears antithetical. One view (for example, Scott, 1988), is that the paradox is a false one. It is perfectly reasonable to think of equality and difference, rather than equality or difference and this should, and indeed, has been the way contemporary western society has worked.

When workplace practice in our universities is examined, it seems, at first sight, that women are granted equal status as employees. In addition, they are given compensation to allow for their differences so that they have maternity leave, flexible working hours and child-care: all the things that allow them to continue their roles as child raisers and home makers, but that also prevent them from being taken too seriously in the male-defined workplace.

It could be suggested, however, in an echo of other writers, (e.g. Elshtain, 1992) that at the heart of the matter it is not a debate about equality and difference, but about equality and subordination. If both sexes worked as fully equal academics within the universities, then academic life would be rewarding and rewarded for both men and women. This is not the case. It appears that there is a group of activities, which partly relate to teaching but also to creating and managing a cohesive and intellectually stimulating working environment, that women enjoy doing, and do extremely well, yet often, with no formal recognition or reward.

Motherhood and homemaking no longer fill and take the lives of western women. Women are consequently allowed into the workplace, where their efforts to make it a better place are welcomed, but regarded as ancillary to the main business of the organisation. Thus, women are becoming in the workplace what they have traditionally been in the home: the workers, organisers, carers and managers, without prestige and without power. In this case, it seems they lack the power to guide our universities on the collaborative journeys of their visions, away from the combative tendencies of male-dominated academia. Instead, they are left to patch up the casualties, both in human terms and in terms of aborted projects, which result from conflict.

REFERENCES


The major impetus for this essay originated with a talk by Dr. Dale Spender in 1992 in which she discussed some aspects of gender differences in education at the primary and secondary levels. At the primary level, she spoke of the way children attract the teacher's attention; that boys were more effective at this and consequently, no matter how aware a teacher may be, it was almost impossible to give equal amounts of attention to girls and boys in the classroom. Evans (1990) studied aspects of girls' and boys' behaviour in the primary school and found that this difference was in part due to the students, but also partly due to the teachers' attitudes and reactions to girls and boys. Clarricoates (quoted in Thomas, 1990) also found that teachers tended to gear their teaching to suit the boys, because they were more likely to be disruptive. An inescapable conclusion is that the boys were rewarded for breaking the rules while the girls were punished for abiding by them!

In secondary science and mathematics, girls were observed to consistently achieve less well than boys in co-educational classes, yet in girl-only classes their achievements were equivalent to boys. Further, when previously co-educational classes were divided into single-sex classes, the girls' achievements improved and, in some cases, the boys' achievements actually deteriorated. This last observation was explained by the fact that girls in the classroom provided a moderating influence on the boys' behaviour allowing the boys to be more focussed, but at the expense of the girls' own learning! When questioned about the success of the single-sex classrooms, the girls responded very positively; the boys said it was a failure (Spender, 1992). Several studies reviewed by Thomas (1990) support these observations that particularly for science subjects, girls achieve better in single-sex classrooms.

I wished to see whether there were equivalent studies in higher (post-secondary) education; what they found and what (if any) recommendations were made. Initial searching of the literature showed that researchers were very active in this field and the rise of feminist scholarship had brought to many educators' awareness the biased nature of the education system. I narrowed down my field of enquires to tertiary science education since, as long as I could remember, I had heard the catch-phrase "girls don't do science". I wanted know why women didn't do science; was it explainable in terms of intrinsic differences between the sexes or was the system so biased that men were more likely to succeed? Finally, I wanted to see if the problems (if any) were remediable and what I could do as an academic to improve the situation for women in science.

In considering why women didn't do science, I looked firstly at why women drop-out of undergraduate science programmes. Hegarty-Hazel (1990) observed that there is cascading loss in education level; women become fewer at each level and stage. There are numerous studies in this area; Wolfensperger (1993) captured many of the problems in her study of student difficulties in science in a large Dutch university. In her research she analysed the essay responses of a group of women to the following question "What obstacles did you experience in your studies in science and how have you dealt with them?" She then classified the results into three levels of observation and analysis, essentially individual conduct, education practice and institutional systems of education and science. In the first level, she observed that students were overwhelmed with the alternatives available (not only academic pursuits) and that several had not really thought about the choices they had made. A related problem is the lack of adequate career guidance for both female and male students. Hegarty-Hazel (1990) reviews several surveys of vocational guidance in both Australia and the then EEC. All reports found such guidance to be inadequate in both quality and quantity and outdated. Several of Wolfensperger's students also found difficulties in managing academic and non-academic aspects of student life. An interesting study by Stage (1989) found that this may well be a greater problem for female students. She found that for female students social integration significantly and positively affected academic integration, while the reverse was true for male students; the effect of academic integration on social integration was significant and positive. While it may be difficult to address the implications of Stage's research, it is possible to assist students when they have to choose programmes and units.
by providing more substantial and informed career guidance. The current trend to make degree courses more flexible may backfire if students are not given adequate guidance when structuring their own programmes.

The next level of observation in Wolffensperger's study was educational practice. Generally students found that relationships between teachers and students were distant. Teachers were unapproachable and interaction with lecturers was often impossible because of the nature of mass lectures. Not only was this distance felt in the teaching, but it seemed to be a part of scientific inquiry. One student complained:

"Last summer I did an assignment which I was really enthusiastic about. The teacher's criticism was that I hadn't distanced myself enough from the topic; it was not scientific." (Wolffensperger, 1993; p43)

Seymour (1992) suggested that the consciousness rising efforts of the women's movement may have inadvertently worked against girls when they went to college. High school mathematics and science teachers were encouraged to identify promising female students and provide them with additional attention and support. This had the desired effect of improving grades and preparedness to continue in science, however students performed for their teachers and so were demoralised by the aloofness of the academic staff in university with considerable negative impact on the student.

The university was also seen as a degree factory, unsympathetic and business-like. Moreover, most of the academic staff were male and hence the decision about what was to be learnt was from a male perspective. The university education was seen as a set of activities where the academics made knowledge available to the ignorant student who endeavoured to master it. Female students often felt alienated by this process because there was so little interaction, students were not encouraged to show initiative. These same problems were outlined by both female and male students in a study by Seymour (1992). More specifically Seymour looked at students' perception of the quality in teaching in science, mathematics and engineering (SME) and found there were gender differences. When asked for descriptions of good teaching female students preferred approachable, nice, friendly, interested patient staff who were prepared to listen; male students preferred staff who explained well, were entertaining, were fun to listen to and who gave good advice. Greater problems were perceived in relation to way female and male students were treated by academics. Several students felt they were first seen as a girl/woman and secondly as a student. Teachers made use of preconceptions about women and in some cases this intruded on the way students were assessed. There are a number of disturbing studies that support this perception. A study of honours' results quoted by Baldwin (1990) revealed that in an arts faculty in Wales, between 1977 and 1981 men more often received first or upper seconds than women. However when the faculty changed to a system of anonymous marking, the results showed a reversal. Three studies quoted by Thomas (1990) also support the contention that markers may be biased against girls/women when marking their work. Finally female students despaired the model of competition so common in their courses and found that the difference in the number of teachers of their sex resulted in misunderstanding of questions and referral to male students, rather than consideration, leaving female students feeling stupid or alienated by the learning process.

At the institutional level Wolffensperger's students had difficulties with the systems of education and science that they characterised as unfocussed and internally inconsistent, with too much emphasis placed on "rote-learning and working towards a vague goal". They experienced only limited satisfaction with their performance and questioned the system of knowledge generation in science; as one student put it:

"I think the way in which science approaches things, nature and society from above, with the pretension of objectivity and freedom from values is wrong. Science is biased and therefore it bypasses essential things, such as approaching something with your feelings." (Wolffensperger, 1993; p46)

The imbalance in numbers of female and male academic staff both reflects problems in the retention of women in science and is seen as a problem by female students. This means that there is a lack of same-sex role models for female students, a factor pointed out by several groups as contributing to gradual decline in numbers as you move up the education and academic scales (Seymour, 1992; Hegarty-Hazel, 1990).

Hegarty-Hazel (1990) looked more specifically at the issue of retaining women in higher education, particularly science and technology and identified several factors likely to affect the recruitment and retention of women in these fields, namely careers advice, attitudes, images, aspirations, single-sex or co-educational schooling, role models, discrimination and harassment. Two of the three areas she chose to consider in depth have already been discussed (careers advice, single-sex or co-educational
schooling), the third (role models and mentors) has been discussed by other writers (Koritz, 1992; Waxman, 1992) as potentially influencing the way women see science and science education. A role model is seen as someone students could identify with, whose knowledge, skills or career path might be emulated. The presence of role models, particularly same-sex role models was seen as crucially important in retaining women in science; several successful programmes of role modelling or mentoring were quoted to support this notion. That most teaching staff, particularly senior staff, are male means women miss out on this strong positive influence.

Koritz (1992) sums up the problems for women in science, noting that for many reasons "the climate is still chilly for women mathematicians, scientists and engineers." She suggests we should be challenging all our students with more exciting questions, rather than loading them with facts that they are expected to simply regurgitate. Our stereotype of the female scientist as an unattractive spinster should be challenged in mentoring and role model programmes and the different approaches of men and women to the way they do science and learn science must be addressed. Specifically, a less competitive, more cooperative approach to both learning and discovering might reduce the alienation many women currently feel. The structure of work time might be changed to allow women and men more time for their families, with less positive emphasis on the image of the scientist as someone who works until late into the night. Siebert (1992) suggests we also need to take special care to link science with societal issues, with discussions on both the positive and negative impacts of technology as an application of science.

The overwhelming conclusion from these studies is that science as a male dominated endeavour is missing out on a diversity of talent and approach and that science education needs to be overhauled from primary level, right through to tertiary level; that the quality of teaching needs to be improved at all levels. Gender issues need to be addressed at all levels of teaching. Perhaps more easily achieved is the raising of awareness in staff of the different requirements of learning of women and men and the need for establishing mentoring schemes for all students.

There is however a need to change the way we are addressing the issues. Feminists have been writing about these issues for 500 odd years. Clearly society would benefit from an injection of thought, at a public and policy level, from women. But we are writing about the same issues, still noting that the situation for women in science, particularly at the decision-making levels, is frustrating, uncomfortable and sometimes difficult (Guillemin, 1993). It need not be any of these things if women had equal participation in decision-making. More representation needs to be made to schools and universities, and more programmes for change need to be developed and implemented: Programmes that explore attitudes and expectations of children and adults and programmes that examine the way we guide the production of knowledge and develop the resultant technology through teaching methods and funding of research and development. The situation will remain bleak until we (women) cause change.

REFERENCES
Stage FK (1989). Reciprocal effects between the academic and social integration of college students' research in Higher Education vol 30 no 5:517.
Wolfensperger (1993). “Science is a truly male world. The interconnectedness of knowledge, gender and power within university education” Gender and Education vol 5 no 1:37.
INTRODUCTION

The paper proposes to answer 3 questions:
1. Are there benefits of competency based training?
2. What are the issues surrounding competency standards development that may affect people outside the mainstream work culture, in this case Aboriginal people and women?
3. What does Aboriginal Terms of Reference Competency Standards Project have to do with all of this?

Glenis will explain the Aboriginal Terms of Reference, its origin and application in Aboriginal communities and the education and training system.

I will be drawing comparisons between women and Aboriginal people in relation to competency standards and competency based training. The parallels between them are centred around women’s and Aboriginals’ distance from the culture which defines the format for competency standards development. The issues which arise are a product of the history and culture of training in Australia.

ARE THERE BENEFITS OF COMPETENCY BASED TRAINING?

First a little background. Laurie Carmichael, in his role as Chair of the Employment Skills Formation Council, helped produce the report often called the Carmichael Report, and more formally called the Australian Vocational Certificate Training System which among other things advocates National Standards across Australia. (Students involved in entry level training pilots are known as articulated Lauries or Carmichael kids.)

National standards based on competency will allow:
• greater articulation between skill areas;
• transferability of skills recognition between States;
• broader based training options and multi-skilling.

These three points alone demonstrate some of the benefits of having Competency Standards in place supported by competency based training.

Competency based training has the following potential benefits:
• the reduction or removal of seniority based systems;
• the removal of time based training;
• the potential for recognition of a broader range of competencies, including those traditionally possessed by women;
• reduction of competition through criterion referencing
• the formalised recognition of prior learning;
• possible demystification of the notion of skill;
• increased opportunities for training.

THE REMOVAL OF TIME BASED TRAINING AND SENIORITY BASED SYSTEMS

Both of these criteria allocate training credentials or promotional opportunities according to the length of service.

In the case of promotional opportunities the skills of the individual may or may not reflect the skills required to perform the job. If competency standards are associated with the position then promotional opportunities are more likely to be based on merit and demonstrated skills.

Time based training requires that individuals complete a set amount of training time in order to gain the credential irrespective of the skills that the individual may possess before commencing the course and irrespective of the time that the individual may require to achieve competency in the tasks. This is discriminatory:
• towards those who have acquired some level of skills elsewhere and need less time to train,
• towards those who have not had the opportunity to gain the base level of skills to start, for example girls without metalwork in their school curriculum wishing to enter a trade in metalwork.

THE POTENTIAL FOR RECOGNITION OF A BROADER RANGE OF COMPETENCIES INCLUDING THOSE TRADITIONALLY POSSESSED BY WOMEN

Many occupations usually held by women, for example cleaning, childcare, administrative support use domestic experience as a qualification and are considered unskilled.

Yet there is considerable evidence to show that the classification of ‘women’s work’ as unskilled has little to do with the actual skills and training required. It is a culturally and
politically constructed category linked to those with the most power in society.

This can also be applied to occupations held by Aboriginal people. Occupations such as Aboriginal liaison in a High School require an Aboriginal person. The skills and knowledge involved in working with Aboriginal people in a culturally appropriate way are seen as an attribute rather than a skill and the skills are not necessarily identified and valued.

By developing competency standards for these occupations, women’s work or Aboriginal specific skills audits will need to be undertaken and training developed to reflect the actual level of skill required. It provides a means of recognising a broader range of competencies and skills.

**The Reduction of Competition through Criterion Referencing**

Criterion referencing simply means that achievement is measured against a set standard. The student does not compete against others in order to achieve a good result. In norm referencing the outcomes of a course are measured against a normal curve thereby giving 10% of students a very good mark, 10% a very low mark, approximately 40% of students a middle mark and the other 40% split between medium high and medium low. This is very competitive in that students have to get better marks than a percentage of others in order to achieve a good result.

Norm referencing disadvantages Aboriginals, women or others who are characterised as uncompetitive. While criterion referencing enables everyone to achieve well provided that the standard is reached. Support and cooperation can become integral to this type of training.

**Formalised Recognition of Prior Learning**

Recognition of prior learning requires that a standard level of skills and knowledge be documented in order for credit to be given. Credit can take the form of:
- exemption from units in a course,
- exemption from whole sections of a course,
- recognition that a qualification standard has been achieved and that the relevant qualification can be issued;
- entry to particular occupations.

Without competency standards and competency based training this recognition cannot be formalised.

**Demystification of the Notion of Skill**

Currently “skilled” is a classification that is applied to occupations for which trade training has traditionally been a prerequisite. This classification has an historical, political and cultural context. The term has been applied exclusively to occupations that derive from “guilds” and occupations left out of the category are not necessarily less skilled but belong to a different historical, political and cultural context.

The conduct of skills audits, the development of competency standards and its application to the Australian Standards Framework will:
- increase the range of skills that are recognised as skilled as opposed to unskilled;
- improve knowledge of how the term skilled applies to occupations;
- lead to an increase in the number of people who are prepared to view themselves as skilled.

Increasing the number of people who view themselves as skilled is central to the demystification of the notion of skill and applies in particular to people whose skills were previously considered to be attributes, for example Aboriginal contact/support/ liaison roles.

**Increased Opportunities for Training**

The development of competency standards and associated competency based training for all occupations will increase:
- the perceived skills basis of many occupations;
- the recognised need for training in order to achieve the standards required;
- the documentation of outcomes against which training opportunities can be developed.

**Competency Based Training Issues for Aboriginals/Women**

The benefits of competency based training and competency standards development as outlined above has lead many people (particularly those close to the training reform agenda) to promote competency as the equal opportunity saviour. However there is significant concern that the implementation of the new system will preserve and entrench inequities of the status quo. This would be an outcome caused by omission rather than action.

Inequities would be entrenched if a lack of equal opportunity focus and attention to the methodology prevailed in the following areas:
- measurement of skills levels
- task skills emphasis

Both of these issues are the product of bias in our socio-cultural recognition of what constitutes skillful work.
MEASUREMENT OF SKILL LEVELS

The Australian Standards Framework is an hierarchical model against which all skills/occupations are able to be placed and allocated a notional level of skill. It places professional degree occupations at the top level (level 8), trade skills occupations at a middle level (level 4) and service/support occupations at the low levels (usually level 2). The use of the framework itself needs to be questioned because of its potential to reproduce inequitable measurement systems.

At the bottom of the hierarchy are occupations which include caring, supporting, interpersonal communication, multiple task management, as well as simple repetitive tasks. In the context of this paper it can be seen that:

Women’s work traditionally cares for, serves, communicates, supports, manages multiple tasks and prioritises in time.

The roles undertaken by Aboriginal liaison workers, child care workers, community coordinators, etc also have communication and interpersonal skills, caring and supportive roles and multiple task management as identifiable characteristics of the occupations. Furthermore the Aboriginal worker is expected to bring to the job valid Aboriginal ways of working, which as already mentioned are not recognised as skills but attributes of being Aboriginal.

NON DISCRIMINATORY ANALYSIS AND MEASUREMENT OF LEVEL OF SKILLS

1. Careful analysis of the skills involved. This includes recognition of skills as:
   - Technical skills - usually perceived as machine or equipment related skills but should also include caring skills - looking after needs of others, and manual dexterity skills.
   - Organising and coordinating skills often seen as managerial skills but present in many secretarial, clerical, service occupations.
   - Communication and interpersonal skills these have often been viewed as attributes and are particularly important in many occupations held by women and more recently in Aboriginal community worker and liaison occupations.

2. Establishing criteria of competency that are determined by:
   - the skills that are relevant to the work process;
   - the best organisation or grouping of skills to achieve a job that promotes satisfaction and a career path opportunity

3. A review of the descriptors for determining level of skills under the Australian Standards Framework.

   For example two of the key descriptors for recognising increased skills level are:
   - the level of discretion, autonomy and freedom to act increases and broadens, and is related to a wider span of activity
   - the range of contingencies to be dealt with and the complexity of work, as well as the extent of judgements made about it, increase and broaden.

   However these two descriptors could apply to all levels of caring, coordinating, community based occupations and are not necessarily good descriptors of increasing competency in these areas of work.

   Furthermore the National Training Board does not view communication and interpersonal skills as reliable discriminators in the ASF levels, because they appear across so many occupations. Clearly this is cultural bias and double jeopardy. If the components of the jobs do not fit into the ASF framework and key skills are not viewed as discriminators for identifying levels of skill, then these occupations run the risk of staying “unskilled” (ie associated with ASF levels 1 and 2) in spite of the actual skills required.

TASK SKILLS EMPHASIS

The National Training Board requirement that performance criteria be developed for each unit of competency may lead to an emphasis on task skills analysis as task skills are by far the easiest to develop performance criteria.

I have already indicated the range of skills that need to be considered for equitable skills analysis and valid competency standards development. A further consideration is the role of attitudes, values and processes. The National Training Board recommends that if values and attitudes are to be included in competency standards they should be outcomes based. Equally the process is not necessarily viewed as part of the outcome yet in many occupations the process is equally as important as the outcome. Examples of this would be in child care or consultation in Aboriginal communities.

It is apparent that pilots need to be developed which challenge assumptions about:
   - the role of values attitudes and processes in competency standards development and training;
   - the role of communication and interpersonal skills as descriptors for the ASF framework;
   - the need for more than one cultural perspective in competency standards development and training.
ABORIGINAL TERMS OF REFERENCE COMPETENCY STANDARDS PROJECT

Given that the potential benefits and the characteristics of the historical and cultural bias have been identified, what can be done to ensure that competency standards development works to the benefit of Aboriginal people, women and others outside traditional mainstream work cultures?

The Mayer Committee failed to successfully confront the issue of cultural difference as a component of work when they decided that cultural understanding would not be a strand of competency. The reason was that descriptors of competency in cultural understanding could not be identified. This was clearly a case where the measurement system was not sufficiently for the task.

It was a fortunate day that Brenda Cameron of the WA Aboriginal Education Consultative Group (WA AECG) visited SESDA to introduce herself the WA AECG and Aboriginal Terms of Reference. Very simply Aboriginal Terms of Reference is an account of Aboriginal ways of working. (Glenis will explain Aboriginal Terms of Reference in greater detail) From this point the concept was introduced to the SESDA /IETC network via a workshop and a working group was formed to determine whether Aboriginal Terms of Reference could be applied to competency standards development.

PROJECT DEVELOPMENT

Against the backdrop of the cultural biases inherent in skills recognition, Aboriginal Terms of Reference offered the means to address some of the issues outlined in section 3 above and create a precedent for:

- culturally appropriate development of competency standards;
- culturally specific skills to be included in mainstream competency standards development;
- Aboriginal specific skills to be recognised as skills rather than attributes;
- the broad inclusion of cultural knowledge and skills in occupational standards;

Executive Officers from the Social and Community Services IETC, the Education and Childrens Services IETC, more recently the Public Sector IETC, staff including Glenis Grogan from Curtin Centre for Aboriginal Studies, staff from Marrmooditj, and myself from SESDA worked to design a project which would pilot the use of Aboriginal Terms of Reference in competency standards development.

This process took almost a year with opposition coming from many established quarters and sometimes from people who could not see why cultural bias in competency standards would be a problem even if it existed.

Once the project outline had been agreed then appropriate industrial parties, Aboriginal employers and employee representatives, were lobbied to form a Steering Committee. The principle role of the Committee was to ensure aboriginal direction. All parties involved worked over the next eight months to generate sufficient interest from agencies to fund the project.

PROJECT AIMS AND OUTCOME

The project aims to: Ensure that the development of competency standards incorporates recognition of Aboriginal culture both in the task description of occupations relevant to Aboriginal people and in the methodology which establishes competency standards for these occupations.

The project will have the following outcomes:

1. The development of competency standards using appropriate methodology for Aboriginal Court Officers employed by the Aboriginal Legal Service and Aboriginal Field Officers employed by the Department for Community Development.
2. A piloted methodology for the development of competency standards within Aboriginal Terms of Reference.
3. The subsequent development of a National project to trial the piloted methodology at a National level across a range of occupations that are either held by Aboriginal people or provide services to Aboriginal people.

It is anticipated that the outcomes of the National project will establish a process for the recognition of Aboriginal culture as a component of competency standards across a variety of occupations.

Secondly it is anticipated that the project will establish a precedent for the recognition and inclusion of culturally appropriate skills and knowledge within competency descriptors and within the Australian Standards Framework.

The inclusion of culturally appropriate skills and knowledge will challenge assumptions about:

- the role of values attitudes and processes in competency standards development and training;
- the role of communication and interpersonal skills as descriptors for the ASF framework;
- the need for more than one cultural perspective in competency standards development and training.
Women and Community Planning

CAROLYN OZTURK
COMMUNITY ARCHITECT AND PLANNER

Carolyn is an architect and has been working in the fields of Social (or Community) Impact Assessment and Social (or Community) Planning for over 20 years.

She is National Convenor of the inter disciplinary group which has been formed under the auspices of the Royal Australian Institute of Architects, and is committed to user involvement and consultation at all levels of Planning and Design.

Carolyn’s recent Community consultation and planning projects included those for:
- Department of Transport
- The metropolitan Transport Strategy Group
- Main Roads Western Australia
- Shire of Swan
- Department of Planning and Urban Development in conjunction with the Perth City Council
- Ellenbrook Management Pty Ltd
- Town and Country

The majority of the above commissions have included some particularly sensitive components.

WOMEN AND COMMUNITY PLANNING

A Chinese proverb states:

“Tell me, I’ll forget; show me I may remember.
But involve me and I’ll understand.”

WHO SHOULD BE INVOLVED?

The community to whom a proposal or policy pertains are obvious “targets”. But what about the decision or policy makers themselves?

Desk Top Studies have become very fashionable. Sometimes a Social Impact Study brief to the consultant will stipulate “no consultation with the existing Community”.

Whatever information is required, it will, it is felt, all be already known to various relevant Government or Local Government agencies. The closest the actual consultation may get to the Community is a meeting with a local Councillor.

The reason for going out to the Community in instances where that does occur, is usually in order to inform them about a forthcoming proposal or decision which has already been taken. Sometimes a limited array of choices is offered - route A, B or C of a proposal road reserve for example.

But how often does the process seek to meaningfully involve all parties? To what extent is the process ever “turned around” and used to inform policy makers or developers of the community’s actual preferences?

The answer is, unfortunately, rarely ever.

Is the cost of comprehensive community involvement too great, making it a generally unaffordable “extra”? Not really. A detailed Visual Preference Survey can be undertaken across a broad section of the community for just a few thousand dollars.

WHAT MIGHT SUCH A SURVEY SHOW?

In the survey undertaken at the 1993 Perth Royal Show for the Metropolitan Transport Strategy Group, the outcomes raised the questions of just how in touch were the decision makers?

States Shopping Centres policy, for example, by implication encourages the concentration of a large number of shops in a Regional Centre type of facility.

Indeed retail trading figures show a greater preference for this style of complex when compared with turnover figures for the Central City. (This is hardly surprising, since the main population centres are concentrated around the Regional nodes - and shoppers have few alternative locations.)

However, consumers themselves, particularly those under 45, indicate a marked preference for the inner suburban style Main Street Shopping Centre ...... when presented with the choice.

WHY CONSULT WITH THE USERS THEMSELVES?

1. If properly involved, those consulted will provide a considerable amount of very valuable and constructive material.
2. The proponents themselves can learn a great deal - and solve a few remaining niggling problems in the process.
3. Both the proposals themselves and, if applicable, the community's objections to them, are then much better understood by both parties.
4. The sense of suspicion is diminished - on all sides.
5. A better product is achieved - usually in a shorter space of time.
6. Where an independent consultant is engaged to conduct or lead the process, the Community acknowledge and appreciate the added impartiality shown by the proponent.

SO, HOW TO INVOLVE ALL THE PARTIES

• Participatory displays: These are comprehensive exercises and would typically include workshop facilities, detailed comments sheets and visual preference surveys.
• Planning for Real: In these hands on exercises, participants work both individually and as a group to put forward and discuss all possible alternatives - at the same time prioritising the outcomes where appropriate.
  The emphasis is on the process not the person, and inter personal conflicts are therefore removed.
• One-on-One Door-to-Door Surveys. These may be undertaken in order to gather background material.
  It is helpful if the eventual specific consultation process addresses the actual concerns/needs/wishes of a community.

CONCLUSION

The options for genuine consultation are numerous. In fact each different circumstance requires a different approach. Set formulae cannot be imposed, at least not if meaningful outcomes are the desired end product.

The all-round rewards are, however, considerable - and directly proportional to the degree to which the process seeks to involve all parties.
INTRODUCTION
Throughout their babyhood, kindergarten and primary schooling to a consolidation in high school girls are, through a range of cultural artifices, introduced to the powerful constructions of gender stereotypes which contribute to the separation of their "sex role and sex character." (Connell, 1987, p.16)

By the time they reach University, the area in which I have the greatest interest and possibly the greatest opportunity to challenge the existing and conventional paradigms for professional education their quietness, passivity and separation of the expectations of home and school from their 'breaking out' in their leisure time have been "adopted as a strategy of apparent retreat" (Woods and Hammersley, p.3) from the dominant culture of boys.

For a long time whilst Universities enrolled very few women in professional courses such as architecture, the odd female enrolment was not an occasion for a consideration of gendered aspects of the curriculum or the teaching. The low number of practising women made hardly a dent in the nature of practice and had little "voice" in the academy. The arrival of many women into professional courses has caused changes as the courses either actively resist, undertake, or actively promote change related to achieving equity for all participants in their tertiary education.

THE CULTURE OF ARCHITECTURE
My research is concerned with the ability of architectural education to promote change and the means by which these changes, which are avowedly present in all Higher Education, are promoted in a professional education which is male dominated.

In order to research this field, for three years I have been carrying out an ethnographic study looking at architecture students' learning embedded in the dominant culture of a profession which has strong links with the patriarchy and a long male tradition of actively excluding non-conformity through certain regulatory procedures, which I argue, have sought to keep in place an outmoded habitus of the profession (Churchman, 1992) "constructed historically as a form of masculinity: emotionally flat, centred on a specialised skill, insistent on professional esteem and technically based dominance over other workers, and requiring for its highest (specialist) development the complete freedom from childcare and domestic work provided by having wives and maids to do it." (Connell, 1987, p.181)

What can be argued is that many beginning University students, and here I am talking about the 81 % of 16-18 year olds who are enrolling in their first year of architecture at the School I am studying (1993 figures) exhibit a learning style which I would name as learning dependency. The desirable learning orientation for a tertiary student is as an independent learner, seeking rather to construct their own knowledge linked back to their prior learning and forward to their own areas of specialisation and fields of interest than to validate the teachers' knowledge through the assessment process.

FREIRIAN EDUCATION
The South American liberationist educator Paulo Freire has encapsulated the qualities of the education which produces learning dependency in his famous 'banking' metaphor in which he describes traditional education in banking-style classrooms where knowledge as a gift bestowed by the 'master' for the future, uncritical use of the student 'receptor'. (Freire, 1979, pp.58,60 cited by Shor in McLaren and Leonard, 1993, p.26)

Freire has counterposed to the 'banking method' "'problem-posing education' where "people (men: sic) develop their power to perceive critically the way they exist in the world with which and in which they find themselves; they come to see the world not as a static reality but as a reality in the process of transformation." (Aronowitz in McLaren and Leonard, 1993, p.11)

What is wrong with being a dependent learner?

LEARNING DEPENDENCE
I claim that learning dependency posits itself on a stance of passivity and dependence in general. This gives rise to questions about the agency of the student in her own education - her ability to shape her own meanings, to develop her own interests and to "develop the impatience and vivacity which characterize search and invention."
Freirian educators, posit that in their critical pedagogy “students experience education as something they do, not as something done to them”: that is they are actively engaged in their education. (Shor in McLaren and Leonard, 1993, p.27)

In Schools of Architecture where only 7% of the academics Australia-wide are women, and 6.5% of Registered Architects are women, what dependence further implies is dependence on men: as teachers, as professional role models, as the providers of the vast majority of the built form and textual examples studied at University, and eventually as their employers and would-be mentors.

Is learning dependence, and the stance of dependence on men in particular, forced by the dynamic of the low number of practising and academic women in architecture, a problem? Yes, and no.

Yes, because women have strongly gendered learning characteristics which derive from learnt behaviours. In Women’s Ways of Knowing (Belenky et al, 1987) women’s learning is characterised “more by co-operation than by competition”. If women are always in a position of dependency on men their gendered learning characteristics are possibly underplayed, given no outlet, and undervalued in the academy and particularly in the workplace. These environments, if structured by men, for men, are likely to foreground other models than the co-operative democracy favoured by women - models usually involving a considerable notion of hierarchy, control and competition. This is problematic as women daily struggle to make their contribution within an environment which is structured unfavourably for their gendered learning characteristics.

Ingleton’s (1993) work throws light upon “the struggle”. She reports that “women’s success gained at the expense of another’s failure generates considerable anxiety about competitive behaviour.” (p.43) A further insight is that this is not because “fear of success is due to fear of loss of femininity; rather, the emotional cost of success through competition is too great for most women to sustain.” (Ingleton,p.43) She reports that: “Chodorow (1974) states that women are more oriented towards fostering and preserving relationships than towards winning” and that this is “supported by Lever’s description (1976) of differences between girls’ and boys’ play: girls subordinate the continuation of the game to the continuation of relationships.” (p.43)

Connell (1987) questions Chodorow’s assumptions about a unitary model of sexual characteristics underlaying her argument (p.167) and reports that Maccoby and Jacklin (1976), in The Psychology of Sex Difference (p.169) found that there was a consistent significant difference between men and women in studies of the traits “verbal ability, visual/spatial ability, mathematical ability and aggressiveness” but no significant difference in “rather more of the traits: sociability, suggestibility, self-esteem, types of learning, cognitive styles, achievement motivation, sensory modality.” The authors concluded no consistent pattern on another range of traits: “tactile sensitivity, timidity, activity level, competitiveness, dominance, compliance, nurturance.” However, Connell concluded that “Recent research has not shown that Maccoby and Jacklin systematically underestimated sex differences” (p.170) and that “Both femininity and masculinity vary, and understanding their variety is central to the psychology of gender.” (p.171)

GENDERED CHARACTERISTICS OF ARCHITECTURAL PRACTICE

There is a strong link, I claim, between the desirable, and gendered characteristic of co-operation in contrast with the more aggressive notion of competition and the attributes required in this decade for leadership in excellent architectural practice.

The architectural profession has changed markedly over twenty years - it is no longer the norm for one name or star architect to design and superintend the construction of a building, acting at the same time as the head of the team of consultants and the manager of the building process. The picture developed by writers on the current structure of leading practices (Cuff, 1989; Coxe, 1989; Scott Brown, 1990) reveals that excellent buildings are designed by co-operative team approach where the team may have a leader who may make autocratic decisions but where there are strongly developed intra-team tasks, cross checking, and devolvement of key tasks “to senior associates and project directors” (Scott Brown, 1990). In short the maintenance of relationships within the team is critical to the execution of excellent buildings.

This claim can be illustrated with some detailed and interesting insights from women in architecture into the qualities that make the team work.

Jaquelin Robertson, a panellist in Architectural Record’s 1991 Education Roundtable (Kliment, 1991) reports that:
"Best on teams are those with the most design confidence. Those without it get very nervous because they're worried their contribution will get lost in the mix. They are also the most combative. Good people are relaxed about working with other people." AR, July 1991 p.189

Denise Scott Brown, a practitioner, in her now widely reported essay in Architecture: A Place for Women (Berkeley, 1989) says that:

"As in all firms, our ideas are translated and added to by our co-workers, particularly our associates of long standing. Principals and assistants may alternate in the role of creator and critic. The star system, which sees the firm as a pyramid with a designer on top, has little to do with today's complex relations in architecture and construction. But, as sexism defined me as a scribe, typist, and photographer to my husband, (Robert Venturi), so the star system defines our associates as 'second bananas' and our staff as pencils." AD 60:1-2:90

Anne Vytlacil (1989) makes pertinent observations about the conflict created for women "between the professional and personal self-image. Social standards of feminine behaviour must be reconciled with the expression of ego necessary for the development of personal creativity." Her essay The Studio Experience differences for Women Students in Architecture: A Place for Women (Berkeley, 1989) concludes that:

"Compared with the individualistic and competitive academic view of architecture, women's tendency to approach design issues with greater flexibility and greater aesthetic tolerance for social implications seems clearly more appropriate to contemporary practice. The responsiveness and design accommodation that may be perceived as liabilities in the traditional studio may become advantages when applied to the practical realities of the profession.... Paradoxically, the use of their (women's) particular ability to adapt and accommodate may offer women precisely the competitive edge needed for success in a field constantly subject to change." AD 60:1-2:90

The other side of the argument is that the dependence is not a problem because women may need to conform to the dominant culture in order to survive. Scott Brown reveals that she wrote her strident essay Room at the Top? Sexism and the Star System in Architecture (Berkeley, 1989) in 1975 which she:

"...decided not to publish at the time, because I judged that strong sentiments on feminism in the world of architecture would ensure my ideas a hostile reception, which could hurt my career and the prospects of my firm." AD 60:1-2:90

Some of my own colleagues are unwilling to support the importance of my research outcomes about disadvantage for students resultant from gender or cultural bias or professional 'colonisation' by men because occasionally a female student exhibits a competitive, assertive stance. One present final year student Rhianna could not possibly be described as being quiet - she is very assertive and is not oppressed by the dominant male hierarchy. She actively rebels against it and pulls her fellow students along with her. Some colleagues claim that my 'in principle' arguments have no weight at all because one student fails to exhibit the oppression of her peers!

My considered response is that first, methodologically, the exception has never proved the rule in any scientific paradigm so it is the more questionable to use this rationale in the decidedly non-scientific paradigm of critical ethnographic research; and secondly that after six years in a learning environment students can be expected to have adopted some of the characteristics of the dominant culture which is male if that is necessary for their success in terms established by men.

Denise Scott Brown comments on the same phenomenon in architectural critics:

"Young women critics, as they enter the fray, become as macho as the men and for the same reasons - to survive and win in the competitive world of critics." AD 60:1-2:90

Complicity in the Learning Environment

Is Rhianna complicit in assisting the maintenance of the status quo in her learning environment by adopting the male stance? There are arguments for and against her complicity.

Yes, she has been complicit because she could refuse to participate in the competitive learning which is a feature of the culture of architecture schools all over the world - but in so doing would risk the outcome she is so close to achieving as a sixth year student - namely her well earned degree. There is, I believe, a strategic and achievement learning orientation in any final year student no matter how strong their independent and intrinsic learning orientation!

Lewis (1992) said that there are risks attendant on speaking out "... especially in professional schools, where students' aspirations for future employment often govern their willingness to challenge the existing status quo, (there are) pressures to conform to the dominant social text (which are) shared by lesbians and heterosexual women alike." (p.175)
No, she has fought complicity because by seeking changes to the system to make the learning environment more equitable she has 'taken on' the hierarchy with a view to interrupting the prevailing social order.

She is behaving in a way which is consistent with the expectations of the literature on gender: whilst her actions on behalf of the year were driven partly by self-interest (she is after all in the significant minority group of 25% women in the year) nevertheless her requests also empowered some of the least able students in the year who were powerless in their voicelessness, and also supported her classmates in bids aiming to maintain relationships and build the team.

**Complicity in the Architectural Profession**

Rhianna and her classmates will graduate, the product of a school which was avowedly gender affirmative and gender inclusive; a school which has, through the challenge of project and problem based learning, and peer review, weaned her from high school learning dependency to a mature, independent learning style where she takes responsibility for her own outcomes through reliance on her professional self-judgement which is a combination of theoretical knowledge and technical expertise.

She has adopted some of the 'norms' of her chosen profession in order to achieve well by their standards, which could be seen as a form of complicity. Whilst she rails inwardly against the standards of the profession, outwardly her persona is as one of the most positive, professional presenters of her own, and her team's work in critiques - an example of adopting the 'competitive edge' so necessary to win jobs and clients and initially to convince an employer to take her on in a recession. As she said to me: “If anyone in this year can get a job, I can”.

Magda Lewis (1992, p.183) said, in contrasting ‘speaking out’ with ‘silence taken as assent’ that women know that “over and over again culture tells her that men abandon women who speak too loudly, or who are too present”. She said: “For women in professional schools specifically, compliance with particular displays of femininity can mean the difference between having and not having a job.” (p.183)

Rhianna’s education in her School of Architecture has been based on the profession valuing her skills, knowledges and attributes and actively engaging her trained and independent mind. The School seeks to graduate students who are equipped to take their place under supervision in practice.

Scott Brown reflects on the different paths of men, and women graduates in the north American situation:

“...although school is a not a nondiscriminatory environment, it is probably the least discriminatory one they (women) will encounter in their careers. By the same token the early years in practice bring little differentiation between men and women, it is as they advance that difficulties arise, when firms shy away from entrusting high level responsibility to women. On seeing their male colleagues draw out in front of them, women who lack a feminist awareness are likely to feel that their failure to achieve is their own fault.” AD 60:1-2:90

Unless Rhianna is already politically attuned to the systemic discrimination against women in architecture, and has understood this from a feminist stance, she is in for a shock.

**Architectural Employment Prospects**

In Australia women graduates are disadvantaged in comparison with their male peers. (Olley, 1990) They find it harder to get a job as an architect, and having found one, are likely to work on projects of lower value, and projects which are restricted to domestic, low value commercial and institutional types instead of working on the whole range of projects. (Olley, 1990). Women will be much more likely to be in the ‘not working’ category (3-19%) than their male peers (1-3%) (RAIA, 1992, p.11); if they are employed in the profession their average income bracket is $15,000 less per annum than their male peers (RAIA, 1992, p.11); if they work part-time they will be in the company of far more women than men (Olley, 1990); and if they seek to have that part-time work experience contribute to the two years minimum experience which must be acquired under the direct supervision of a registered architect prior to sitting for their professional registration examinations they will find that the part-time work is admitted only on a discretionary basis (Architects Board of South Australia, 1991; Shannon, 1993).

If they leave the profession for any reason, but particularly for family reasons, before passing their registration examinations they will find that the part-time work is admitted only on a discretionary basis (Architects Board of South Australia, 1991; Shannon, 1993).

If they leave the profession for any reason, but particularly for family reasons, before passing their registration examinations, and having several more years experience after registration to concretise their position in the profession, they will find it almost impossible to re-enter the profession except in a supporting role which does not require registration as there are no profession
sponsored re-entry schemes available in Australia (Shannon, 1993). In leaving the profession before they have gained the requisite experience in order to continue to practise as a registered architect are women graduates complicit in their own eventual outcomes? Or statistically is 'nature' set against them - the mean natural age for birth of the first child in South Australia at 27.7 years (ABS, 1993) is exactly the same age as the average age for candidates for the architectural registration examinations. As Magda Lewis (1992) humorously quotes Duchen:

"The tailoring of desire to the logic of politics is not always possible or acceptable." (p.182)

Given the dichotomy, for women, of their inward, and outward values clashing in the struggle to achieve in a traditional School of Architecture which promotes a competitive model of achievement, who would jeopardise six years of tertiary study by not completing their registration examinations and thereby being entitled to practise as an architect? The answer is most women: 11.8% of the 'eligible' female graduates from the three previous years compared with 25.2% of the 'eligible' male graduates were successful candidates in 1991.

My point here is that women, for many reasons are rejecting their chosen career even after graduation. It may be an active rejection in favour of other options in the work-place or a more passive rejection as a result of inability to find pertinent work experience and the obstacles to women with family responsibilities in particular put in place by the restrictions of the profession.

What role has the mature professional woman to play in the acculturization of female graduates into the profession? How can she assist younger women to assert their rightful place in their chosen profession without the lingering doubts they carry from their early socialisation, their education, and their active complicity in keeping themselves out?

First and foremost I contend that role modelling is the most powerful teacher. For a graduate at the entry point to a profession her apprenticeship in the profession is just beginning. She has so much to learn about the demeanour, the unwritten standards and codes, and the power of collegiality. She will not learn these things in a text book and nor in exactly the same way from a male colleague. She will learn the women's ways of knowing, the ability of women to be absolutely professional and emotional at the same time and that others join her in the struggle to comprehend "contradictory practices in order to secure their own survival." (Lewis, 1992, p.188)

These knowledges are imparted informally and are the powerful lessons which only mentorship can advance. Men have long recognised the informal path to professional acculturisation which mentorship has offered in terms of acculturising younger men into the dominant characteristics of the profession. There are formal paths for mentorship established in some professions and informal situations in others from which I contend women are, perhaps unwittingly due to their sports or bar locations, excluded.

Thirdly, I believe that women of some professional standing can ease the passage for commencing professionals by setting the standards for gender affirmative and gender inclusive behaviour. It is daunting for a beginning professional to have to deal with a workplace which carries an undercurrent of sexual innuendo as well as perform up to her professional ability. If she complains she is labelled as different and humorless. If she doesn't complain and her acquiescence is confused with assent she may risk rumour and innuendo as well as her job. It is essential that women of some professional standing in the firm are inflexibly rigid in promoting amongst all staff the highest standards for ethical personal behaviour.

Fourthly, I believe that active professional women should be deeply reflective about the extent to which they foster and encourage younger professional women as opposed to putting in place a glass ceiling more indestructible than any put in place by a man. Professional women can be so active in empowering other, often younger, women that clearly there comes a point when some fear for their own position. In regard to this situation Gore (1992) has insightful commentary when she proposes that power does not reside, cannot be given away and therefore is never given up. Instead she argues for the Foucaultian notion of power as circulating; always creating subjectivity and agency in individuals who "are the vehicles of power, not its points of application". (Foucault, 1980, p.98 cited in Gore, 1992, p.58)

Women architects can be empowered, through a range of social, and educational changes, to achieve their own goals but these are very long term aims for structural social change. The promotion of a co-operative, collaborative workplace without a hierarchical management structure would revitalise many existing firms of architects. One such architectural practice comprising all women, Cunningham and Keddie, in Melbourne, which has completely flexible work practices to accommodate the family responsibilities of their staff of some thirteen, was last year named the Small Business of the Year in
Victoria. Excellent practice can look different from the practice to which we are accustomed and attract significant accolades.

Lastly, in agitating for structural changes to their profession to remove the obstacles to full participation for women I believe professional women can be particularly proactive in their contribution to their profession. The practices which women in management positions could engage in I have mentioned; the equal value for part-time work and flexible job sharing; re-entry skilling and mentoring programmes; and adoption of co-operative democratic management styles.

The most valuable contribution professional women can make is to inculcate in the next generation of women that they can do it: not just get into University; not just graduate from University; not just get a professional job; but that they will achieve their own lofty goals and will be represented at every level of management in numbers commensurate with their 52% makeup of the population.

This is, however, a simplistic and determinist notion in a consideration of complicity as a "partnership in evil action" (Concise Oxford Dictionary, 6th edition, 1976). The implication here is of knowing consent to professional subjugation. A consideration of the notion of power in the construction of complicity is worthwhile to argue that the subjugation is not a knowing partnership but the result of a power imbalance which sees professional women compliantly yielding to expressed or unexposed power.

POWER IN THE CONSTRUCTION OF COMPLICITY

Foucault exposed the "operations of power at the micro-level" in arguing that it "was at these local sites that the practices of power were perfected; that it is because of this that power can have its global effects" (Epston and White, 1992, p.137).

In particular, through his discussion of the Panopticon, a circular prison with the jailer at the centre in which surveillance and scrutiny had to be constantly presumed therefore resulting in a type of self-policing by the inmates, Foucault invites the consideration of the self-policing nature of many of our activities. It is a short step, I claim, from self-policing to complicity in self-subjugation.

Epston and White (1992) make this proposition about Foucault’s writings and the nature of self-participation in subjugation:

"This analysis of power... suggests that many aspects of our individual modes of behaviour that we assume to be an expression of our free will, or that we assume to be always transgressive, are not yet what they might at first appear. In fact, this analysis would suggest that many of our modes of behaviour reflect our collaboration in the control or the policing of our own lives, as well as the lives of others; our collusion in the specification of lives according to the dominant knowledges of the cultures." (p.139, my italics)

Women may be unable to cast off the shackles of patriarchy, of gendered roles and of systemised oppression in the workforce as claimed by Connell (1987), where “face-to-face relations are strongly conditioned by the general power situation between employers and employees.” He defines a taxonomy of sex-role compliant (‘emphasized femininity’) and sex role resistant or non-compliant forms of femininity where women are not complicit in their orientation to accommodating the interests and desires of men “within the global subordination of women”. My argument about Rhianna and her subtle, complex motives for compliance and non-compliance are supported by a further taxonomic differentiation of “complex strategic combinations of compliance, resistance and co-operation.” (p.184)

He argues that, from a male stance, whilst there is notable individual distancing from the cultural oppression of women, there are various reasons for the male complicity in sustaining patriarchic hegemony, but that the major reason is that “most men benefit from the subordination of women”. (p.185, my italics)

Women, Foucault argues, actively collaborate in maintaining their own subjectivity. (Foucault, 1980) They think they are being transformed, not by the effects of power “but instead as the effect of something like fulfilment, of liberation.” (Epston and White, 1992, p.139)

Ingleton described the same notion when she said that “in choosing out of the profession, women are choosing even more powerfully into something else. In choosing out women are selecting the other dominant models; by acknowledging that there are choices women make to keep their self esteem intact by selecting out of competitiveness.” (pers. comment 25-10-199_)

If transformation is the goal, self-knowledge is the tool, and the building bricks are role-modelling, mentorship, gender affirmative stances, empowering strategies and the removal of structural obstacles to full participation for women in the profession. Complicity can be cast as the enemy. Transformation may be built one brick at a time - the desired-for outcome is a profession where graduates are employed on the basis of their knowledge and attributes and not their sex.
The editor of Progressive Architecture in reviewing *Architecture: A Place for Women* (Berkeley, 1989) says that a profession which "subscribes to the 'mystique of the expert' whose identity is determined by subjective, male dominated standards" ... and which stresses "total commitment", to the exclusion of the family concerns, a commitment women are not expected to maintain" creates for itself an ironic situation in which the very attributes architects display in relation to their clients ("they are sensitive, artistically creative, and malleable") are "typically female attributes". (Doubllet, 1989, p.7)

It is therefore necessary, I would claim, as we move forward into the educational environment of the 1990's which will see equal numbers of men and women enrolling in architecture courses, to promote new teaching paradigms which will enable women to confidently assert their attributes and transform the profession.

REFERENCES


Royal Australian Institute of Architects (1992) 1990 Profile of the Architectural Profession Canberra: RAIA.


Vylacil, Anne *Architecture: A Place for Women The Studio Experience Differences for Women Students Architectural Design* 60:1:2-90.

Woods, Peter and Hammersley, Martyn (1993)(eds.) *Gender and Ethnicity in Schools.*
INTRODUCTION

To begin this paper I would like to read from Jane Austen:

"A woman who spent her days sitting nicely dressed on a sofa doing some long piece of needlework, of little use and no beauty, thinking more of her pug than her children, Lady Bertram sank back into one corner of the sofa, a picture of health, wealth, ease and tranquillity". (Mansfield Park 1814).

What a long way we have come from this point of idleness and emptiness which was one of the roles that women played for so long, kept away from the action, the point of power and decision making. The role of nurturer, care giver, dependent, invisible, naive and concerned with perfection and people pleasing.

Now we have made it into the 1990's. Liberated, thanks to our sisters of the 1960's and 70's. Yes and also to our mothers and our grandmothers who must have passed on that desire for liberation. Yes, here we are independent women, able to work, have a family, career and financial independence.

We have different roles to play and we have more choices We have the choice to do so many different things and fulfil so many roles. With this choice goes responsibility for self. Sometimes this responsibility is heavy and women are not always sure of the next step to take or the next path to follow. We have our liberation but often, we don't have the map to find our way to wherever it is we want to go.

Today in this paper I would like to look at what stops women from moving upwards and from rejoicing in their hard earned freedom. What holds us back, stopping us from realising our full potential? How can we make the most of our new roles and our numerous choices? How can we follow our own path so that we can feel satisfied and fulfilled as human beings?

I will talk about the fears women have - the fear of failure and the fear of success, the fear of not being seen as feminine or the fear of what will happen if they are too competitive. I will talk about how women learn to hide their light under a bushel because of the socialisation process that starts as children. I will talk about women learning to have the confidence to promote themselves and become visible and about women learning the rules so they can play to win.

"Nothing has been as damaging to women" - wrote Gerda Lerner in the 1983 issue of the Women's Studies Quarterly, "as 5000 years of systematic deprivation from access to knowledge and from participation in the formation of philosophies which explain the world to us and from the religions which shape our emotions and values". (Chemin, 1985, p. 32).

From this point of deprivation, how quickly women have moved into the corporate world and the right to equal opportunity. They have exchanged home-makers' uniforms for business suits and shoulder pads, shopping bags for brief cases and the ever present stress and strain of wondering if they are doing it right, if they are matching up and whether by competing they are still keeping their femininity, their niceness and their earning image.

In her book The Hungry Self Kim Chemin writes that men are expected to match their fathers in having successful careers or even to do better than their fathers. Women, on the other hand, who do not replicate their mothers' lives of full-time nurturers and care givers, who instead go into a full-time career, are saying that the sacrifice of their mothers is of less importance and so invalidates all that has been given to them by their mothers. (Chemin, 1985, p. 51)

She also tells of the son who is so proud to show his mother that he has surpassed her in his learning and can now move on to dominance, superiority and his place in the world with confidence. The daughter, on the other hand, realizing that she is moving ahead of her mother, surpassing her in her learning tries hard not to show it. She will, in fact, under-play her achievements so that others will not be affected or threatened. She is doing what she has always been taught to do and that is to think and worry about others before herself, submerge her abilities and her intelligence so that others might shine. (Chemin, 1985, p. 55)

If she then goes on to marry someone who does not match her intelligence then she must conceal even further her potential in order to build him up and display his value. The movie Thelma and Louise is a good
example of this. Thelma is married to a man who requires her to behave in the most helpless and irresponsible way in order for him to look good. It is only when she moves away from him that she reveals her true abilities. She emerges as a strong, thinking woman, no longer caught up in being the hapless female.

The term gender panic (Dowling, 1981) is the hidden fear a woman has of independence. If she shows what she can really do or how competent she really is, she loses her femininity. She becomes a threat to others and so loses her chance for relationships and even marriage. She believes that men will not find her as attractive if she is too smart or too competitive.

Is this the legacy that stops women from moving higher?

THE FEARS WOMEN HAVE

1. FEAR OF FAILURE

How much easier it is for a woman not to try too hard or to develop too much, blaming the limitations on the situation or other people but never on herself. By staying in the limited space that women have allocated themselves or been allocated, they cannot fail. Men are so often the risk takers, while women prefer to sit on the sidelines, watching and admiring, but often reluctant to participate actively.

Why is that men whose marriages fail, often can’t cope and lose the ambition and drive to succeed. Women in the same situation often go on to great achievement as they realize it is up to themselves, that they can devote more time and energy to themselves, to being successful and their own development. Succeed and no longer worry about stepping on a partner’s ego.

2. FEAR OF SUCCESS

With success comes responsibility of a different kind. The hard issues, making major decisions, not always being perfect, being seen as tough and even hard. These doubts and fears confine women, limit them, restrict them from developing into what they are capable of being.

What do we need to know and to do then so that our talents are not kept hidden and shrouded in traditional beliefs?

Research shows that many gifted women did not seem to be able to pursue success as men did. The more ability they had the more anxious they became, which led them to lose the will to succeed. Women feel that doing well professionally would jeopardise their relationships with men. This contrasted strongly with 90 percent of the men who were eager about the possibility of developing brilliant careers. (Christie, 1986. p 76)

Women need to have confidence in themselves. This means, believing not only in their skills and abilities but also believing in their own value. I speak from experience as I used to see myself making room for others at the expense of my own needs, my own ambitions, believing that the other person was more deserving. The other person has grabbed the opportunity and there I am left with conflicting emotions which are firstly - have I given away something important, should I have fought for it? And, secondly, it doesn’t matter because my person pleasing image is still intact, is even enhanced a little because of my seemingly, generous, non-competitive nature that has again revealed itself, much to my annoyance.

I can not condemn those people who have grabbed the opportunity and who I might add can just as often be women as men. I have tried to learn from the experience. While I believe there is a place for everyone I cannot martyr myself and give my place away as socialization has taught me to do. Taught me as a woman that I should put myself and my needs, second to others.

3. FEAR OF VISIBILITY AND SELF PROMOTION

Women need to make themselves visible and by this I mean self promotion - setting a strategy to get recognized, be known, acknowledge what they are and what they have achieved. Stop! Does this mean women should brag? The answer to this I found recently in one of those little inspirational books

“If you’ve done it, it ain’t bragging.”

A women’s place is not out the back of the meeting making sure the tea is made and the biscuits are ready. Yet a shyness, a reluctance to be part of the meeting to stand up and be heard often pushes women to hide themselves away, being useful but invisible. When you are invisible it is safe. No one will demand that you extend yourself, notice you or expect you to change. As a consequence you have less chance of failing. There is a certain terror speaking out and speaking up. Firstly outspoken women may be labelled loud. Strong women with opinions are labelled pushy or worse still, if they try to direct they become bossy. Men will then complain that their mother or their wife is in the office and the last thing a man wants is his mother or his wife running the office he is in.
Let others know what you can do, your achievements. Don’t leave them buried away. Bring them out, mention them and benefit from them. No one else is going to mention them for you.

Forget about staying in the background - Speak up. Know your worth and value. Be confident and brave enough to stand out. Possibly this will mean taking the flack, being called terrible names not least unfeminine as we are attacked at the very core of our identity.

We need to develop a tough skin and be even more determined in wanting to move out of our allocated space and to move beyond the glass ceiling.

4. **FEAR OF CHANGE**

When others see that you are changing, they may be threatened or fearful, wanting you to be the same person you have always been. This is the emotional blackmail that has stopped women. If we change we may not be as caring, as self sacrificing and therefore we may lose a familiar role that has at least made us feel important. If we lose this, what have we got to replace it? The fear of change is there holding us back, stopping us from moving onwards or upwards.

5. **FEAR OF ASKING FOR WHAT WE WANT**

I used to say, and this was a couple of years ago now, that I wouldn’t be so presumptuous as to actually ask for opportunity, or volunteer for it. Why was this? Was it because it would be too hard, stretch my capacity and force me to take on more responsibility. I would very happily accept it if and when it was offered to me but ask - that was almost crass, quite unfeminine. I was lucky because opportunity did come my way and I was pleased to show what I could with it. Behind this however was this sense of gratitude that I had owner. Not once did I think that maybe I was chosen, especially picked and so it was Thank you Thank you Thank you like a dog getting a bone from its owner. Not once did I think that maybe I was chosen because of my abilities, experience, knowledge or skill let alone intelligence. That it was right that I be chosen, that I deserved to be chosen.

I didn’t believe, that if I wanted to be considered for something I should speak up and ask for it, and give good and valid reasons why I should get it. I didn’t realize that if it meant that I had to compete for it then I should be prepared to put a case forward and fight for it.

I now believe that asking for opportunity makes women know their worth, know that they are not being manipulated or seen as the token woman which may be happening when opportunity is just presented to you because you are the shining star or the flavor to the month.

We have to have the desire to compete and to demand and to fight for what we want in the workforce.

**HAVING THE RIGHT ATTITUDE**

The right attitude is an important attribute in finding our place in our new roles. A woman’s attitude can still be too caught up in the role of nurturer and care giver. We can’t help ourselves. We have been taught to be like this and it is difficult to change an attitude that stems from centuries of taking second place. It is also this conditioning that makes women play, the role of mediator, keeping the peace and stopping conflict. Women have the attitude that it is their role to keep harmony, not to speak out or cause too much conflict and so remain where they are best appreciated and that is in second place.

Women often do the work that shows only when it is not done and she only gets encouragement when she pleases others and not so much when she pleases herself. (Price, 1984. p 99)

Change this attitude and believe that you will still be of value.

**WHAT DO WOMEN NEED TO DO?**

Women need to start talking, asking, criticising, complaining, discussing and analysing. When she lets her voice be heard about things that really concern her it will become stronger and stronger. (Price, 1984. p. 66)

I was reading an article the other day by Lynne Spender about women in America wearing Reeboks and Doc Martens to work and the complaints they received from management who thought the Doc Martens weren’t attractive and that the Reeboks which were replaced by other shoes, were cluttering up the office. I was so amazed when I read this, that I almost didn’t believe it. Yet I know I have been readily told off by my brother because something I am wearing is not very feminine.

In the past, my other brother was happy for me to achieve and boasted to his mates that his sister could do so without having to resort to all that feminism stuff.

Now that I actually mention what I believe in, in front of his friends, he feels embarrassed because I have left myself wide open to be ridiculed by his mates and that makes him vulnerable to their teasing.

If I don’t get his unconditional support and he is my brother how can I even expect it from an ambitious male who wants the same job or position that I want?

The message here is that if I don’t keep my role - the familiar, the expected, the demanded - then I am open to attack and attack they will. It is up to me to know the rules, be thick skinned and make it to where I want to go.
But I want to change my role. I want to enjoy what education has given me and what I believe I am entitled to and that is being part of a world that values and recognises my contribution in the work force as capable, competent and successful. I want to play to win and be successful without guilt.

**HOW TO WIN ONE WAY IS THROUGH AWARENESS**

The natural inclination for women is to avoid the hard stuff, to stay away from the politics and just get on with the job. No conflict, always harmonious and never appear threatening or demanding.

Many people, men and women alike bristle when they run into office politics.

They feel disgust as though they’re shocked to see that it exists. They try to back off from politics, frequently feeling rather smug if they’re not tainted by it. These people don’t get very far. (Douglas, 1983, p. 82)

To succeed women need to know how the decision makers think and women need to know what the rules are. Even if the rules are not rules of our making, we need to know how they work and make them work for us. There are reasons why people do succeed and being aware allows you to develop the same skills. Arm yourself with that awareness.

Play to win.

**THE TRADITIONAL APPROACH VERSUS THE PROFESSIONAL APPROACH**

Women have traditionally been timid and cultivated, demure rather than brash. Their socialisation has also made them see politeness and respect as important in their interaction with people. Women often believe, that people in authority deserve even more of this respect. With this comes that irritating gratitude for that opportunity or that job. We fail to recognise our value or our accomplishments. We fail to accept that we are truly equal. We prefer to respect others and see ourselves as insignificant in comparison. In reality other people’s accomplishments or how they are seen is often only as a result of very good self promotion.

Douglas (1983) has coined a phrase “healthy disrespect”. This allows for respect for people as human beings and for real achievement. It also allows us to see that we may put someone on a pedestal, evaluating them, without recognising that they too have human weaknesses and failings and are no more valuable than ourselves.

She goes on to say that women often put men on a pedestal believing that men always do things better, especially better than they could do and so look up to them, bowing to their superior strength, power and intelligence. (Douglas, 1983, p83).

What we need to have is confidence, knowing that women also have something to offer and respect ourselves for that. We need to say - this is who I am - and to say it without apology. People who demand respect get respect.

Women seem to inhibit themselves more than men and often don’t exercise the rights they do have and this is where the conflict arises between traditional roles and the professional roles that women are now expected to play. In their new roles, women must resist being pigeon-holed into menial or dead-end jobs with little true authority or responsibility. Women should not let themselves be ignored or passed over simply because they fear what others will think and have a lack of belief or confidence in themselves as women. (Price, 1984, p. 65)

Price goes on to say that parents may tend to have limited expectations for their daughters. This lack of a defined role, outside of motherhood has created a vacuum for women. It is like performing in a play with no lines, limited action and little direction. Women struggle with this lack of direction and definition, often not supported in the quest for study or work that takes them out of the less challenging jobs. (Price, 1984, p99)

The support may not come from the male sector because it may mean changes on the home front that could disrupt comfortable lifestyles.

Support also may not come from the female sector as you move outside of the boundaries that other women live within into areas with which they are not familiar. Areas that may take you away from that nutureing and caring role that makes you a sister to other women.

Once again it seems that the female identity is questioned and that women cannot want, let alone have success and power and still keep their femininity. It is no wonder that they say it is lonely at the top.

And for a women even lonelier.

No wonder that sometimes it all seems too hard, too much of a struggle. Sometimes it might seem easier not to have to compete or to climb or to fight outside in the professional world. It is easier to succumb to staying at home or in unrewarding and unchallenging jobs because family, spouse or society will be kinder to you if you do or because the effort and the strain is almost too difficult and it is just easier to keep the peace and the status quo.
Can I end this paper in such a defeated way? Definitely not! Women have so much to offer and can achieve so much if they are prepared to stand up and be counted, speak out and so bring about positive changes that will gradually gain acceptance and recognition of the value they have to offer and the new roles women have to play.

REFERENCES


The Role of IPSA in Challenging for the Future

LYNNE SCHICKERT
INSTITUTE OF PROFESSIONAL SECRETARIES (WA)

Walk into any organisation these days and you will find secretaries making their mark on the business world. Secretaries were once an invisible element in the management team but over the past decade rapid changes have taken place. Gone is the old manual typewriter, today's secretaries have adapted to the word-processor and have taken on the challenges of data-bases, spreadsheet and desktop publishing programs to enhance their document production. The modern executive requires a dynamic assistant who is decisive, organised, efficient and people-oriented. This has redefined the role of today's secretary and recognition is now taking place that the secretary can and does make a valuable contribution to the overall process of management in both small and large organisations.

Increasingly, Australian business is recognising that excellence and quality are the keys to improving our international competitiveness. As the only Australia-wide organisation for secretaries, the Institute of Professional Secretaries (Australia) (IPSA) is well-placed to promote and encourage the attainment of the high standards and qualifications required of today's secretaries and to develop the leadership qualities needed at all secretarial levels. IPSA provides opportunities for professional development by organising local seminars and interstate conferences, in order to ensure that today's secretaries are fully trained and up-to-date with technological changes. Affiliation and liaison with secretarial organisations in over 40 countries around the world ensures that IPSA remains in a position to keep members informed on global developments.

Monthly meetings with speakers on topics of interest to secretaries provide a strong networking component to IPSA, as well as the production of regular newsletters. Recognition of IPSA's standing in the business community is evidenced by strong support and sponsorship for functions such as Secretaries' Day Breakfasts and annual Secretary of the Year Award.

Committed to enhancing the status of secretaries, the Institute of Professional Secretaries (Australia) is a strong, energetic organisation which provides a leadership role for women in today's social, political and organisational life in Australia.

On behalf of the Institute of Professional Secretaries of Australia, I have taken the opportunity of this conference to highlight the mechanisms by which IPSA guides and assists today's secretaries and administrative officers in fulfilling their leadership aspirations.

You will all agree that today's secretary is not just someone who sits and types and does the filing. Secretaries have come a long way from the old Underwood manual typewriter, from carbon paper copies and disguising typing errors with an eraser. Today's secretary is riding on the wave of a revolution in office technology, with the backup of copying and fax machines, and the biggest advance of all - the computer with its word-processing, spreadsheet and data base programs. And today's executive needs a dynamic assistant who is decisive, organised, efficient and people oriented - and ambitious as well!

Increasingly, Australian business is recognising that excellence and quality are the keys to improving our international competitiveness. As the only Australia-wide organisation for secretaries, IPSA is well-placed to promote and encourage the attainment of the high standards and qualifications required of today's secretaries as they assist in this drive towards business excellence.

For those who have not heard of IPSA, I will provide a brief overview of the Institute's history and an outline of its operations. I will also explore the changing office scene and how this reflects the changes in the career opportunities for today's secretary.
IPSA

Members across Australia are celebrating the 30th Anniversary of the Institute of Professional Secretaries (Australia) this year. The institute began with just 12 secretaries in the late 1950's who formed an Association for secretaries in Australia, along the lines of similar organisations in America and England.

In 1963 the Institute for Private Secretaries (Australia) was formed in Melbourne. Interest quickly spread to the other States, with an interim committee forming here in Western Australia in 1973. In 1983 the Institute changed its name to the current title and during that year held the first Australian Convention for Professional Secretaries in Melbourne, with national and international delegates attending. Members in Western Australia took up the challenge of hosting the third conference in 1990, and just recently, some 350 delegates attended the fourth IPSA Australian Convention which was held at the Royal Pines Resort on the Gold Coast - a magnificent location, and as you would expect from professional secretaries, the conference was an event which was extremely well organised and very stimulating. As we are all aware, the networking and interaction at a conference is as important as the content of the papers given, and the friendships gained add another dimension to our lives. Delegates attended from all States and Territories in Australia, from New Zealand, Japan, Bangladesh, South Africa and the United States of America. This participation occurred through IPSA maintaining affiliations and liaisons with over 40 secretarial organisations around the world, which ensures that IPSA is in a position to keep members informed on global developments.

AIMS AND OBJECTIVES

The aims and objectives of this strong and energetic organisation are to:

• Elevate, promote and develop the role of the professional secretary at all levels.
• Promote and encourage the attainment of high standards by professional secretaries and to establish qualifications for them.
• Promote and facilitate the worldwide interchange of information, ideas and developments relating to secretarial practice and procedure.
• Establish seminars and training programs for professional secretaries and those wishing to enter the career.

As illustrated by these aims and objectives, IPSA is highly committed to education and training, and one of the major functions in Western Australia each year is a professional development seminar which provides members with a stimulating look at current technological changes and other issues relating to our work practices and well-being. It is not necessary to be an IPSA member to attend these seminars and they are structured to comply with training guarantee levy requirements.

Another aspect of IPSA's educational focus is the DiplPSA which has been designed for study by IPSA members and is becoming a sought-after qualification. Local employers are now listing the DiplPSA as a desirable requisite in their employment advertisements and recruitment agencies are being asked by their staff to be placed with companies supporting IPSA. This is positive affirmation that IPSA activities are of benefit to secretaries and to the community as a whole. A further commitment by IPSA has been representation on the Administration, Clerical and Finance Industry and Education Training Council Sub-Committee, where input has assured accreditation of secretarial work practices.

IPSA's commitment to education and training is further illustrated by the six awards are presented each year to the top secretarial students in the various certificate or diploma courses studied at local TAFE colleges and at Edith Cowan University.

As usual, with all professional associations, IPSA has several layers of committee structure. The Institute is governed by a National Executive Committee with the State Presidents representing each Division. IPSA (WA) operates with a Committee of Management of 12 members including eight members who act as Convenors of special programs such as the Secretary's Day Breakfast function, the Secretary of the year Award, Newsletter Editor, Meeting Program and Professional Development and membership Convenor. In 1991 I was awarded the prestigious IPSA Secretary of the year Award - and I might add here that the award was won this year by Maureen Eaton of Edith Cowan University. As a result of this award I have been asked to highlight the functions of the Institute by speaking at various functions such as Rotary luncheons, in-house and external staff training sessions and now finally, here at this conference.

Through activities such as these, and efforts from all members of IPSA, continual promotion of the Institute takes place and membership growth has been steady, notwithstanding the economic recession we had to have!

As we all realise, networking is a very valuable tool in today's busy world and it is a major management strategy that women are only now becoming comfortable with.
using. With today’s sad state of the economy and high unemployment figures, it is recognised that only 20% of available positions in the workforce are ever advertised. The other 80% are usually filled by networking. Rather a sobering thought, with regard to the young job seekers, who have not yet built up that network of contacts to move within. IPSA has a strong networking component, and the range of interests and experiences of members from all the major companies and government agencies in Western Australia can be of great assistance when making contact for business or other reasons.

Divisions and Branches of IPSA hold a general meeting once a month and this assists with networking interaction, and notification of these meetings is sent to members via a monthly newsletter. A guest speaker is arranged for each monthly meeting to keep members up-to-date in relevant areas of our profession. A recent speaker was Wendy Newman, Manager of the Staff Training and Development Branch here at Edith Cowan University who highlighted current training practices and staff development procedures being undertaken at the University. As a result of these speakers, members take back to their workplace ideas and strategies to assist in office reform and productivity, together with other areas of general interest such as health and community issues.

General meetings also provide a setting which enables members to feel comfortable with public speaking. At the commencement of the evening, members are asked to introduce themselves and highlight a particular interest or issue relevant to them. This is a very good strategy for introducing new members into the larger group.

Producing the newsletter too, embellishes the report writing and desk top publishing skills of the newsletter editor. As you all know, participation on any committee provides a learning curve and becomes a personal development experience for the member, and so it is with IPSA. The organisational and interpersonal skills we use in our workplace are expanded as members promote the activities of the Institute and the importance of the role of today’s secretary.

OTHER ACTIVITIES

Beside the Professional Development activities of the Institute, two other major functions take place every year which celebrate the importance of the secretary in today’s workplace: the Secretary of the year Award and the Secretaries’ Day Breakfast, both of which require a considerable amount of organisational skill and liaison with the wider community.

The Secretary of the year Award recognises the high levels which our professional secretaries have attained, and the high esteem in which this award is held by the business community is reflected in the very generous level of sponsorship given each year. The process of choosing the IPSA Secretary of the year Award does not include a skills test as it is recognised that the secretaries being nominated by their executives have already demonstrated their competencies in that direction. The employment history and statement by the nominee’s executive is considered and then all nominees are interviewed by an independent judging panel. The Finale Dinner to introduce the six finalists and announce the winner and runner-up is always well attended, and the organisation of the whole event is a challenge to the subcommittee.

The Secretaries’ Day Breakfast is another well-attended function - some 450 secretaries and executives celebrate the importance of this day each year. Arrangement of this function too enhances the organisational, time-management and interpersonal skills of subcommittee members.

With members either involved in organising or attending this range of activities, it is clear that IPSA is a highly motivated and fully committed professional body, which recognises that the secretarial role is not just a job but a career with an increasingly professional image and that education and training are the keys to business excellence and increased productivity.

I would now like to highlight some of the changes which have taken place in the role of a secretary and what challenges face secretaries as they move towards the twenty first century. Whilst most people acknowledge the constant presence of change, very few appreciate the accelerating rate of change, and even less have any idea of how to handle it. As a professional body, IPSA recognised the importance of providing the strategies for meeting the challenges for the future.

ROLE OF TODAY’S SECRETARY

There is no doubt that today’s secretaries are making their mark on the business world and recognition is increasing that the secretary can and does make a valuable contribution to the overall process of management in both small and large organisations. Advanced office technology has released today’s secretary from the mundane chores which governed the office routine up until only recently. Today’s secretary is able to absorb knowledge from Chief Executive Officers, being at their elbow for much of the day.
You have heard many wisecracks about secretaries being efficient and everyone has seen the cartoons with the secretary depicted as God and the miracles which must be available on demand. The reality is that in many situations, this humour is all too lifelike and executives only produce the ‘miracles’ on time, whether they be documents, reports or their plane tickets! Increasingly, secretaries are casting aside their traditional role of the ‘invisible’ assistant and are now taking on the role of what could be called a manager’s manager. In this role, a secretary takes the initiative where necessary to ensure the smooth functioning of the office environment, manages multiple priorities and makes decisions in the absence of the company executive. Today’s secretary often represents the CEO at in-house meetings and interprets and summarises reports and other statistical data. Today’s secretarial role now places more emphasis on joint management with the secretary and executive forming a ‘team’ to achieve both office efficiency and organisational goals.

So, what qualities are required of an efficient secretary? A competent secretary needs to be flexible and adaptable, she needs to display initiative and absolute confidentiality, she should be scrupulously honest and responsible, supportive and loyal in every respect, and she should have a good deal of tact and diplomacy. She will also have a high standard of organisational skills, a high level of technical skill including the ability to use a computer, excellent interpersonal skills both within the working environment and the larger community.

**Professional Status**

It has only been in the last few years that the professional status of secretaries has been formally recognised and as a result, it has been a slow process to reverse the previous ‘invisibility’ and the image of being ‘just a typist’ and to have the secretarial role accepted as providing a professional career structure. When speaking of secretaries, the use of the word ‘she’ has been deliberate. Notwithstanding the trickle of males now finding their way into the profession as a result of the advances in technology, it is still an undeniable fact that the majority of secretarial support staff are women.

**Technology**

As we look at the changes in today’s offices, it must be agreed that the advance in Technology has been the most significant factor in this change. Most of us, whether we are secretaries or not, are now comfortable with computers. Computers allow us to become involved in word processing, database management, spread sheets and desktop publishing. However, with the rapidity of new software packages coming on to the market, it is very important that technical skills are kept up-to-date. We find therefore that it becomes necessary to keep knowledge and skills up-to-date by attending training sessions or seminars, both in work time and in our own time, and, as mentioned previously, IPSA provides many avenues for this type of professional development for secretarial staff.

Technically we have come a long way since my first days as a secretary. I started work at an insurance office where client records were kept on cards in boxes and hand-entered with either blue, green, purple or red biro and these all had to be manually balanced at the end of each week. Policy records were kept on cards too, with banks and banks of drawers around the walls filled with these cards. If you had the misfortune to drop a box, you spent a day filing them in order again! Proposals were sent off to Head Office each night and there was an almighty rush at the end of the month to process as many proposals as we possibly could, so that the agents would have a nice monthly statement to look forward to. Claims took from one to two weeks to process, as documents were sent back and forward to Head Office in the mail, and there was none of the instant screen display to advise a client as now happens. This all makes me sound quite ancient, but it really was not that long ago. The company I worked for was one of the first organisations in Australia to install a computer to keep track of its operations - something that at that time probably took up several floors of a building. The current model is probably no bigger than a washing machine.

Statistics indicate that information processing is currently increasing at an enormous rate. By the Year 2000 - only 73 months away - there will be 60 times more information available than was available in 1990, and there will be more technological changes taking place in the next 10 years than in the last 60. Another statistic of note is that some cars these days have more computer power than did the Lunar landing module in 1969. So, computer technology certainly plays a large role in our lives today and will continue to do so, both in the workplace and the home environment.

Another aspect of change in the workplace in general, is that 40 years ago a person could survive with the skills acquired as a youth throughout his/her entire working life. Nowadays technical skills are out of date within about five years, so retraining and updating is a constant need.
In looking to the future, we see a change occurring with the movement of executive secretaries into the management area, taking with them their management, organisational, interpersonal and leadership skills. It is forecast that with the leaner style of management being practiced currently by all large organisations, competent secretaries are taking on a stronger supervisory or management role as middle-level management is trimmed. With the range of skills which secretaries possess and the management strategies which are already practiced in their day-to-day activities, it is clear that secretaries have always been a vital part of the management structure within an organisation and their strengths and resources are now being recognised and utilised. IPSA, too, recognises the movement of secretaries into other career pathways and provides encouragement and support with lectures, workshops and seminars on a wide range of subjects.

The changes taking place are very exciting together with the challenges they bring. Today's environment now offers more flexibility and many more career-structures for those women who want to take up these challenges and pursue a successful career.

Balance

We are all aware that women still form the mainstay of the secretarial support in our organisations (about 98%, although the number of men in the secretarial profession has doubled in the last 5 years). It should be recognised that, like all other women in the workforce, secretaries must maintain a balance in their lives.

This notion of balance very important. As secretaries take on the challenges of this decade and move towards a more active role in the management team, they must take care to thrive as they do so, rather than become stressed by the workload as so often can happen. And, when considering this notion of balance, it must be emphasised that self-care or self-nurturance is a particularly important aspect which women in general and secretaries in particular, often overlook.

Executives have their needs focused upon with stress management and time management seminars. However, secretaries are often both career women and mothers who tend the needs of two quite separate areas and they very often neglect this area of their lives.

Conclusion

It is very evident that the role of the secretary has changed over the years and that the office routine will continue to change as the business community moves towards the 21st century. It is important that secretaries see themselves as a vital element of this changing environment and use their many resources to enrich their professional status and career opportunities.

The secretarial role is a critical function in any organisation, but it can be a stepping stone to other careers as indicated by the following two examples: The Second New Zealand Executives' Secretaries' Conference in 1991 was opened by Dame Catherine Tizard, Governor General of New Zealand. She had started out in life as a secretary, at forty took office as Mayor of Auckland, and now represents the Queen in New Zealand. One of the Northern Territory participants at the recent Australian Conference has just opened her own Art Gallery specialising in Aboriginal Art. The skills of organising, planning and co-ordinating which we use every day in our role as a secretary are the basic building blocks for any future career pathway. It would appear that a secretarial background is a very definite career advantage.

The Institute of Professional Secretaries (Australia) is effective in assisting the secretarial community with professional development, fellowship and networking advantages. The enhancement of leadership skills is provided through interaction on the Committee of Management structure and through the various promotional activities undertaken to highlight the importance of the secretary in today's organisational, social, and political life in Australia. Every minute in every working day, a secretary's voice is being heard. IPSA's role is to ensure that the voice being heard is confident and knowledgeable.

Today has been my personal challenge, to have my voice heard on behalf of the secretaries of Western Australia, and I thank you for your interest. And, as I conclude my view of the secretarial world and the challenges it faces in the next century, I would like to leave you with a work picture which reflects the experiences of secretaries:

S skilled
E educated
C competent
R responsible
E enthusiastic
T trustworthy
A articulate
R reliable
I industrious
E energetic
S "super women"!

173
Recruitment of Senior Executives in the Western Australian Public Sector: Where are the Women?

KAREN THOMSON

ABSTRACT

The low proportion of women in senior management positions is the focus of attention in developed countries across the world. Organisations striving to improve productivity and effectiveness have recognised that women represent an under-utilised human resource. In Australia structural barriers preventing the career advancement of women have, in general, been identified and removed. Attention is now focusing on indirect and systemic discrimination, which can contribute to the 'glass ceiling', that may occur within an organisation. One area of concern is the recruitment and selection procedures used to appoint management personnel. This study presents the findings of an equity evaluation of the 1992 selection reports for the recruitment of Senior Executives in the Western Australian public sector. Equal employment opportunity issues are raised and discussed and suggestions for improvement presented.

INTRODUCTION

Study of the available literature suggests that organisational bias and systemic discrimination presents a significant barrier to women. Many common misconceptions and beliefs about women's appropriateness for and commitment to their careers prevail which are detrimental to women. These attitudes and beliefs can influence recruitment and selection decisions.

To explore this possibility in the Western Australian Public Sector, the selection reports for the selection and appointment of Chief Executive and Senior Executive Officers for 1992 were analysed. The aim if the analysis was to identify issues of concern in the selection of women.

The paper presents details of the study, and a summary of suggestions for further consideration and development.

METHODOLOGY, SCOPE AND LIMITATIONS

This study is based on the analysis and evaluation of 42 selection reports for Chief Executive and Senior Executive Officer appointments submitted to the Western Australian Public Service Commission during 1992. The approach taken to evaluate the selection reports was essentially formative. The reports were read to identify issues and extract baseline data. The research methodology relies on the researcher to identify issues of significance as they present themselves. The aim of the analysis was to identify any possible issues of concern in the selection process with respect to equal employment opportunity. Particular attention was given to possible barriers to the participation and selection of women.

SELECTION REPORTS

The reports submitted to the Public Service Commission vary considerably in quality. Some reports offer scant evidence of the decision making process involved, whilst others detail the selection process extensively. In one instance guidelines for the selection panel members and the expected format of the report were included. The subsequent report was comprehensive.

The selection reports provided information on the gender of the applicants interviewed and those assessed as suitable for appointment.

Summary Statistics (42 reports)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Male</th>
<th>Female</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Number of Applications</td>
<td>873</td>
<td>69</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Proportion of Applications</td>
<td>93%</td>
<td>7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Proportion Interviewed</td>
<td>27%</td>
<td>41%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>[237/873]</td>
<td>[28/69]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Proportion Interviewed and assessed as suitable</td>
<td>41%</td>
<td>43%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>[96/237]</td>
<td>[28/69]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appointments (52 reports) as a proportion of suitable applicants</td>
<td>87%</td>
<td>13%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>[45/52]</td>
<td>[7/52]</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Fifty two appointments were made to SES and CEO positions during 1992. Of these 45 men were appointed and 7 women. It should be noted that in general women were selected for positions in Health and Education (5 of the 7 appointments during 1992 (71%).

The available statistics (extracted from 42 reports) illustrate that few women apply for senior positions in the public service. This in part reflects the high proportion of applicants from within the public sector where the pool of senior women remains low (Public Service statistics as at June 30 1993 show 13.4% of level 7 positions are held by women and 11.8% of level 8 positions).

The proportion of female applicants interviewed (47%) is significantly higher than that of men (27%). One explanation, supported by anecdotal evidence, is that women only apply for positions where they believe: they are particularly well suited; meet all the selection criteria; and have a reasonable chance of attaining the position. This is in contrast to men who reportedly apply for positions in order to develop their job application and interview techniques. Another is a genuine attempt by selection panels to interview merit-worthy women when they are applicants.

Overall, the purpose of the reporting process appeared confused. This lack of common understanding is reflected in the varied quality of the reports and the amount of information contained in them. Communicating the purpose and content of the selection reports to the selection panels is worthy of attention.

**Selection Criteria**

**The Criteria**

In the current procedure the selection criteria are outlined in two categories, essential and desirable. Guidelines are available which aim to ensure that all criteria are equitable and job specific. To be selected for interview applicants are expected to demonstrate, through their written application, that they meet all the criteria. Selection reports, in general, included a copy of the job description form which details the selection criteria.

In evaluating the reports a number of inequitable practices were noticeable. Examples include essential criteria that did not appear related to the ability to manage a large organisation but focused on specific technical or scientific knowledge. This assumes specialist knowledge is necessary to undertake the role of a senior executive.

**Determining Competence**

The measures used to determine competence against the selection criteria are a major cause for concern. These measures were often value laden, subjective and although the comments relate to both men and women, when combined with stereotypical assumptions can be particularly discriminatory of women. Unjustified causal relationships were assumed and irrelevant value judgments were made.

**Questionable Casual Relationships Evident in the Selection Reports**

Common Assumptions

Nervousness at interview is a direct indicator or poor communication skills

"...His initial nervousness suggested some weakness in the area of communication."

The managerial style of women equates to an inability to ‘kick butts’

"...Her referee confirmed that she is a very capable person but was not convinced that in certain circumstances she would take awkward decisions."

Age and current status is an indicator of maturity

Length of service equated to leadership qualities

"...whilst he exhibited some qualities which indicated he may be capable of undertaking this position, it was felt he lacked merit in relation to some of the other applicants, having only taken up his present position in May 1991."

Four years experience in a senior management position was considered insufficient as “substantial experience in a senior management role”.

"... She obviously has characteristics and judgement skills which will allow her to develop over time. Unfortunately her career progression has been limited."

After an excellent report the following summary comment:

"Ms X has limited senior management experience and several shortcomings in her management approach."

Inclusion of the criteria “number of years service in SES positions”.

Negotiation skills are equated with assertiveness demonstrated at interview

In terms of negotiation skills the panel had “some reservations about whether Mr X would be sufficiently assertive".
VALUE JUDGEMENTS EXTRACTED FROM THE SELECTION REPORTS

Examples of comments extracted from selection reports:

"...further he did not convince us that he really wanted the job."

"...[the panel queried] whether his management style was appropriate for the operational culture of the organisation."

"...he did not inspire confidence as a leader."

"...he presented as a rather over confident and he gave the panel members the impression that he could be insensitive to the problems of coming in as CEO."

"...X is an extremely intelligent man."

"...her style is to keep everyone happy."

"...He appeared to be a good, tough forceful negotiator..."

"...nervous throughout the interview, she nevertheless maintained her poise"

"...the panel gained the impression that she was reluctant to delegate with a consequential lack of attention to strategic matters."

"...the panel considered Mr X to be a highly intelligent and sophisticated applicant..."

"...he lacked enthusiasm and flair - used to eliminate an applicant!"

"Ms X was confident and well presented."

PANEL COMPOSITION

Panel composition remains predominantly male and one assumes, give panel membership is generally comprised from within the public sector, white Anglo Saxon. In no instance did the female representation on a panel outnumber the male. Some panels had no female members at all or only one woman out of four or five panel members. The issue of tokenism with respect to female representation appears worthy of further investigation.

The balance of power and the relationships between panel members, though difficult to judge from the selection reports, presented itself as an issue. In some instances the views of a particular panel member appeared more noteworthy that those of other members. This may indicate that some panel members exert a disproportionate degree of influence.

USE OF REFEREES

General comments on the use of referees is limited due to the varying quality of the selection reports.

However, there is some indication that referees were used somewhat arbitrarily. For example, different numbers of referees were contacted for applicant's assessed as suitable. This was usually in the circumstances where a panel member was also an applicants' referee. In this situation the guidelines suggest that another referee should be requested and called to ensure all applicants are treated equitably.

REASONS FOR FAILURE

INTERNAL APPLICANTS/CAREER PUBLIC SERVANTS

As identified in The Representation of Women in Management, internal applicants are, in general, favoured by the selection process. This may be discriminatory of external applicants and requires serious consideration in terms of the merit principle, which is based on drawing applicants from as wide a field as possible. For women within the public service the tendency to appoint internal applicants seems particularly problematic. Two factors are likely to contribute significantly to this phenomenon, they are: opportunities to ‘Action positions and thus acquire the relevant skills and strategic knowledge; and the history of a career public service where long term service to a department is considered a favourable attribute. Women are not in a position to compete equitably on these criteria.

Part discriminatory practice included a requirement that women resign from positions upon marriage, therefore the opportunity to acquire extended periods of service was denied. Secondly, women often assume the primary responsibility for family commitments, which is reflected in their career profiles as time out of the paid workforce. The skills and competencies acquired during these periods are generally not acknowledged or valued. This ‘broken service’ is reflected in the relatively low numbers of women in level 7 and 8 positions. Therefore, the number of women identified as able to ‘Act’ in management positions is limited.

LIMITED CAREER DEVELOPMENT

There is no evidence whatsoever that life experiences outside of paid work is valued. Emphasis on unbroken career development and length of service in the paid workforce as an important and valued indicator was common. In effect, without a substantial attitudinal change, female applicants will remain disadvantaged on this criteria.
THE MANAGERIAL STYLE OF WOMEN

Women appear to be placed in a 'no win' situation at times. Their people management skills are both questioned and applauded, particularly their conciliatory approach to problem solving. It appears this is often interpreted as an inability to make hard decisions when necessary.

"...the panel had serious reservations in relation to her people management skills." In direct contrast to an earlier comment which stated, "...the panel felt that this (her experience in managing change) was a particular strength, particularly in the manner in which Ms X approached the complex problems of restructuring and handled the associated problems."

ISSUES AND OBSERVATIONS
THE SELECTION PROCESS

Analysis of the Selection Reports indicated there is cause in the selection process for Public Service Senior Executive positions.

There is a tendency to equate equitable recruitment and selection processes with the provision of detailed, prescriptive and lengthy criteria, the inclusion of a female panel member and written reporting procedures. An outcome of this has been the extended time period needed to process job applicants and appointments. This has been the focus of much criticism from a number of sources. The limited evaluation undertaken in this report indicated that the emphasis on the process is insufficient. Fundamental assumptions and values are evident that are not only gender stereotypical but appear to favour particular personal characteristics or 'type'.

'The Type' - Characteristics Of A Successful Applicant
Authoritative but not brash.
Long period of service on the Public Service.
Unbroken career.
Strategically aware with an ability to plan.
An ability to delegate.
An ability to make 'hard decisions'.
Outstanding 'leadership qualities'.
In contrast the attributes of the 'modern manager' advocated by current organisational theories incorporate any characteristics that much of the literature identifies as traditionally female strengths.

Characteristics of the Modern Manager
And effective team builder.
Listens to the views of others.
Conciliatory but able to make firm decisions.

Intuitive.
Communicator.
Leads by ideas.
Facilitator.

The recognition of the need for the 'modern manager' is not evident in the preferred characteristics highlighted in the selection reports.

At times the current process appeared arbitrary. In extreme instances panel members raised the issue with the commission.

'...the process employed was somewhat unstructured and relatively informal.'

In this case a second panel was convened which in turn interviewed an applicant that did not meet all the selection criteria identified for the position.

The suggestion that the current selection process is equitable, based on 'merit' and provides the most effective process to determine 'the best person for the job' should be reviewed. Analysis of alternative selection procedures may provide a recruitment and selection process that is both less prescriptive, more cost effective and equitable.

IMPROVING THE CURRENT SELECTION PROCESS
THE SELECTION CRITERIA

As previously highlighted, the selection criteria have the potential to be used inequitably, especially when desirable criteria become essential or extra arbitrary criteria are included. This undermines the energy and effort spent on ensuring trained staff develop equitable selection criteria.

Guidelines on the development and use of equitable selection criteria for SES and CEO appointments are available. Whilst these may be reappraised, reviewed and modified to ensure equal employment opportunity issues are covered comprehensively, they are rendered redundant without either an effective monitoring process and/or implementation strategy.

Two strategies are suggested that may reduce the instances of inappropriate value judgements and causal relationships evident in determining competence against selection criteria.

1. Accreditation of panel members.

Establishing a register of people who have undertaken training in equitable selection procedures and are available for appointment to selection panels. This training should
include an awareness and acknowledgement of the value systems brought to bear in the selection process.

2. Trained Recruitment Officers.

A team of trained individuals could be established who are appointed to a selection panel to provide expertise on equity issues in the selection process.

It is not anticipated that all panel members would require training provided the experience and input of the acknowledged 'experts' is valued and not undermined.

PANEL COMPOSITION

More detailed scrutiny of the composition of selection panels for the appointments of Senior Executive and CEO's would be informative. Questions requiring further consideration include:

• Are the power relationships between panel members acknowledged and dealt with?
• Is there a need for a community representative in some instances? For example, an aboriginal representative on panels to appoint executives to correctional institutions.
• How can the representation of women on selection panels be improved?
• Given the small proportion of women in the Senior Executive Service there are fewer senior women available for appointment to selection panels. The implications in terms of the extra workload require consideration.

USE OF REFEREES

Current guidelines on selection and recruitment procedures make recommendations on the appropriate use of referees. However there is some indication that these guidelines are not translated into practice. An increased awareness and implementation of equal employment opportunity principles should assist in overcoming this problem. It may be necessary to re-evaluate the use of referees and the obtaining of referee responses to ensure an equitable yet pragmatic approach.

INCREASING THE PARTICIPATION AND REPRESENTATION OF WOMEN IN THE SES

Increasing the participation and representation of women at the level of senior executive and chief executive level of the public sector is fraught with difficulties. The implications of previous direct discrimination affecting the recruitment, selection and career progression of women remain to be addressed. Issues of indirect and systemic discrimination, identified in organisational research, have yet to be acknowledged and understood by a majority of people. Further, any of the strategies developed to overcome these problems are likely to be controversial as they will challenge individual value systems and an organisational culture established over a significant period of time.

The complexity of this issue does not mean that it is simply too difficult to address. Examples exist of large organisations which have accepted responsibility for improving the participation of women in senior management positions and implemented successful programs. These include Argyle Diamond Mines, Western Australia and the Bank of Montreal, Canada.

To improve the participation and representation of women in the senior executive service in Western Australia three issues require simultaneous consideration.

• increasing the number of women who apply for senior positions;
• increasing the number of female appointments; and
• analysing the retention rate of women appointed to senior positions.

BIBLIOGRAPHY


Women and Corporate Culture

LYN WALSTER

While women face many challenges when working in corporate environments, the increased number of women in management positions is encouraging. This discussion paper provides an overview of some relevant statistics on the participation of women in business, the barriers facing them in achieving their personal and business goals, and suggests ways to overcome these barriers.

WHERE ARE WOMEN IN THE WORKFORCE?

According to recent statistics (See Table 1) more than 50% of employed women are found in two occupational groups; clerks and salespersons/personal service workers.

TABLE 1: EMPLOYED PERSONS AGED 15 YEARS AND OVER: OCCUPATION

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Women</th>
<th>Men</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>-------</td>
<td>-----</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Managers and Administrators</td>
<td>6.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Professionals</td>
<td>11.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Para-Professionals</td>
<td>6.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tradespersons</td>
<td>4.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Clerks</td>
<td>32.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Salespersons and Personal Service workers</td>
<td>22.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Plant and machine operators, and drivers</td>
<td>3.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Labourers and related workers</td>
<td>13.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>2,716</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


WHAT ABOUT WOMEN IN CORPORATIONS?

The challenges facing women in corporate environments is determined by their roles and responsibilities in that business. Support staff face different issues than managers, professionals and industry business people, and face entirely different operating and cultural environments. As shown in Table 1, the statistics indicate that 20.6% of employed women are in managerial, administrative and professional positions. The continued growth of women achieving positions such as these is encouraging.
WHAT IS THE FUTURE FOR WOMEN IN THE WORKFORCE?

Increasing Participation of Women

This relates particularly to women in the >25 year age groups. In the 25-34 age group the increase is expected to be from 65.7% in 1990 to 85% in 2005. See Technical Note, 1992-2005 Labour Force Projections, Australia, ABS Cat no. 6260.0, p.15.

Dual Career Families

In 1992 45% of married couple families had both partners employed and only 29% of married couple families only had one partner employed, who was usually the husband. See Labour Force Status and Other Characteristics of Families, Australia ABS Cat. No. 6224.0, June 1992.

Women Are More Likely to Reduce Their Working Hours

In order to care for children and the elderly, women are seeking to work part-time, obtain flexible jobs, rostered days off, subsidised or company provided child care etc.

• Even with the need for reduced working hours women are still seeking rewarding careers.

WHAT ARE SOME OF THE BARRIERS FACING WOMEN IN TODAY'S CORPORATE ENVIRONMENT?

Lack of Acceptance

The popular views of working women indicate that to be fully accepted, you have to be “wonder woman”, “barbie” or even better, both.

Being Viewed as a Woman First and an Employee Second

This is further exacerbated by the stereotype of what a woman is, does and should do.

Stereotyping

Where our success is often being compared with the traditional role of women, the special skills we offer are overlooked in preference to a superficial evaluation of us, and where our qualities are viewed as a weakness, rather than a strength.

Conservative Management

Attitudes relating to where a woman’s place really is and where they should “sit” in the organisation, and how any shift from that attitude could be viewed by others as a lack of control and rationality.

Little Familiarity with How a Male Dominated Environment Works

The old school tie and everything that goes with it is still alive and strong.

General Lack of Financial Skills

For many reasons women participate in creative, supportive, organisational and people-oriented corporate roles. As such their training and exposure to the financial aspects of business is limited.

“Queen Bee” Syndrome

Women are often not supportive of each other in corporate environments, particularly if they’ve made it to the executive tier and are guarding their position.

Double Standards

The evidence of what is ok for the boys, still shows it’s not always to same for the girls!

Drinking with the Boys

While men do the majority of their bonding, idea generation, brain storming and joint decision making over more than a few beers, women who partake are often viewed in a derogatory way.

Having to be so Much Better All the Time

The common case facing women. To succeed you have to be infallible. To be infallible you have to put in more effort, time and commitment to cover all angles.

Men Think About Sex More Than Women Do

This popular view stems from the throw away comments men make when working with women, and the flirtation they constantly initiate. It is less evident in the public service.

AND THE MANAGEMENT LEVEL BONUS BARRIERS...

Attitudes of Male Subordinates

Some men just hate working for a woman. They may view it as a slur on their own success.

Attitudes of Female Subordinates

Some women just hate working for a woman.

The Plateau

The point you reach when your advancement within and beyond the management tier has stopped.
Dilemma of Career versus Family
The agony of making the choice and all the repercussions of the choice you make. (Refer also to Enterprising Women by Dr Leonie V.Still Allen & Unwin 1990.)

WAYS TO OVERCOME THE BARRIERS FACING WOMEN IN CORPORATE ENVIRONMENTS

• Recognise that failings are human.
• Don't hide lack of expertise.
• Reject differentials in salaries and opportunities.
• Overcome any fear of confrontation and tackle the issues head-on.
• Take on risks, new methods and best practices.
• Venture into unexplored ground, but arm yourself with as much research, information and support as you can.
• Assert your views and achievements, while not overlooking the opinions of others.
• Expect reward for your effort and provide it to others for theirs.
• Believe your opinions are valid, but know when to let go of them.
• Learn the games both men (and women) play.
• Recognise the subtleties of discrimination and speak out against what you experience or see.
• Grab a sense of humour and know when it is called for
• Utilise the strengths of your femininity and individuality; ie. be a sounding board, juggler, empathetic listener, organiser....whatever.
• Recognise that intangible is as important as the tangible output - develop a way of recording these achievements as well.
• Recognise affection is not always out of place as long as you feel comfortable with the way it's delivered
• Understand that we are not an androgynous society - men and women are different and bring different strengths to the team - learn how to make the most of it.
• Self employment is always an alternative to the corporate environment and one which many women have been very successful.
Women's Experience of Retirement

PAMELA WEATHERILL

INTRODUCTION

Retirement is a time when, as the predominant survivors in old age, women can rise to meet new challenges in their lives, and continue to contribute in a valuable way to our society. Younger women need to consider what retirement means to them, and to begin to pro-actively prepare for this life transition, which is effectively the window to old age. It is important that discussion is raised regarding retirement to ensure women do not enter this stage passively and feeling devalued, yet both feminist and gerontological literature largely ignore women's expectations and experiences of retirement.

The recent change to the pensionable age for women in the Federal Budget highlights the importance of retirement planning and education for women. Retirement is a major life transition period, which affects women differently to men because we experience our life's work so differently. Inadequate or unrealistic financial and personal planning has reduced many women's ability to fully enjoy this stage of their lives. One of the problems facing women is defining what retirement actually means to us, so we can adequately address planning for it!

DEFINING RETIREMENT FOR WOMEN

The concept of retiring from one's field of work is not new. It existed in pre-industrial societies in the form of parents handing their farms or businesses to children who would in turn look after their aged parents. However, retirement in terms of mass removal of the aged from paid employment, is a more recent phenomenon (Graebner 1980, Crandall 1980, and Fennell, Phillipson and Evers 1988).

Today, retirement in both our daily language and in the sociological and gerontological literature, broadly refers to the cessation of paid employment and possibly the provision of an alternative form of financial support. McCallum (1985, p. 9) for example states that "Australians define themselves as retired when they finish paid work and receive the age pension".

It is important that we define what we mean by retirement.

"...the definition that researchers give to retirement is important since the parameters of the definition will be inclusive and exclusive of certain types of groups." (Crandall 1980, p. 343)

As a twentieth century mass phenomenon, retirement has been largely experienced and researched in male terms (Fennel et al 1988, Crandall 1980, DeViney and O'Rand 1988) and thus contains a male bias which permeates discussions on retirement and retirement planning. This has far reaching implications for women who experience work differently to men and will therefore also experience retirement differently.

Women reach retirement after many years reinforcement as marginalised citizens exposed not only to sexism, but now also ageism.

So when do women retire? "Women never really retire because they never really work, according to men" (Rowland 1988, p. 95), yet the cry of many women is that "Women never retire because a woman's work is never done"! What is highlighted here is the gap between what women and men traditionally perceive as work. Retirement as cessation of work as it is defined by the individual, expands our concept of retirement and includes women's experience of work.

WHEN DO WOMEN RETIRE?

Consider the concept that many women retire from "work" when they re-enter the paid workforce after a period of child rearing or divorce. It changes how we perceive retirement, when we actively think about what we consider our work. Does the employment of a housekeeper / child minder actually retire a mother from her work? There is a dearth of discussion amongst women and in the literature on what constitutes retirement for...
women. The following are four possible situations for women to consider in the process of promoting discussion on retirement.

**Situation One**

One view of retirement is a German study by feminists Voges and Pongratz (1988) which views leaving paid work for men as an equivalent life change to ceasing housework for many women. This study examines the move to a residential care facility as the time when this occurs for women.

*"When discussing 'retirement' of older women, we will use the expression to describe the termination of most household activities resulting from a move to a home for the aged"* (Voges and Pongratz 1988 p. 66).

This view of retirement for women raises some interesting issues. One which is raised in the study is that this definition removes the status of retirement as being linked to age (Voges and Pongratz 1988 p. 65). While the male retirement from work is largely set at a particular age, the move to a residential setting is usually much later and impelled by social or health conditions. Even more importantly, this often does not occur at all.

Another issue raised is that of spouse support. For many women the move to a residential setting is made as a widow so they do not have emotional support of a spouse. These same women had the opportunity to actively support their husbands’ retirement from work.

**Situation Two**

The Voges and Pongratz literature review discusses a view by Bengston, Kasshau and Ragan which stated that; “retirement is easier for an older woman because she has effectively retired once before from her primary family role as a mother and thus by age 65 has already negotiated one more or less successful transition” (Cited in Voges and Pongratz 1988 p. 65).

Thus we have a second definition of retirement for women, being when children leave home. This is disputed (Voges and Pongratz 1988, Douglas-Smith 1982) on the grounds that women continue running the household and often pick up responsibilities in care of grandchildren and volunteer work in communities. The decrease in work load is seen by Voges and Pongratz (1988 p. 65) to;

*"refer to a change in the material function of housework, not its social function”* (Cited in Voges and Pongratz 1988 p. 65).

This social function being the one which is more closely related to self-identity and work. It should be noted that using this definition for retirement ignores the experience of women without children.

This definition was used by Ronald Davies MLA at a Retirement Seminar in 1973;

*“in some cases, the wife is virtually retired twenty years before her husband - in the sense that what she regards as her task - the raising of the family - has been achieved”* (in Morland and Blanchard 1973, p. 15).

There is no sense of respect for the continuing support provided by many women both to their families and in the community after their children leave home. There is the assumption that this child rearing is totally the work of the “wife”, and that this is what she sees as her task. In reality she was forced to take it on by many social and political pressures, and according to this definition, forced into retirement once the children leave home.

**Situation Three**

A less overt definition, quite pervasive in some studies of “retired couples”, is that of self-definition. There is some strength in this definition as it gives women some control over their own life-span continuum. This is the method used by the Australian Bureau of Statistics (ABS) in their census and many gerontological studies follow suit, particularly with respect to women.

The 1992 ABS Report on Retirement and Retirement Intentions (Catalogue # 6238.0), uses this format in its study and describes retirement as “Ceased full-time work aged 45 or more and did not intend to work full time or look for full-time work in the future” (P. 27). This led to women leaving work to get married or raise children and not intending to return to the public workforce to be considered “early retirees”. Thirty-nine percent of retirees in the ABS Retirement Report were early retirees (aged 45 and under), and women made up ninety-three percent of these.

There is a concern that this “self-definition” may be forced on some women, as Crandall (1980, p. 355) suggests by older husbands wanting “their (younger) wives with them for companionship and travel”. It is the fact that many women will make this definition when their husband retires which is also a concern, particularly when examining the time use of retired couples by Bittman (1991, p. 52) who found;

*“it is clear that wives in retired couples bestow a disproportionate amount of unpaid labour upon their husbands”*.

A study by Crawford (Cited in Fennell et al 1988, p. 102) “showed that retirement of husbands is also at least as much of a significant life event for their wives”
For some of these women, they do not consider themselves retired when their husband's do due to continued domestic and caring roles. They are still completing their life's work.

**Situation Four**

A fourth situation potentially indicating retirement for women is when they are no longer in the paid workforce and have no husband or children dependent on them. This could refer to divorce, widowhood or older single women and is supported once again by the Bittman (1991 p. 54) time-use study which states;

"Whereas women increased their domestic burdens upon marriage, these burdens are diminished for women retired and alone" and

"Retired women living alone enjoy a greater amount of leisure ... than women at any other stage of the life course, regardless of age."

With marriage comes women's work in the private sphere and with widowhood or divorce comes their retirement.

**WHICH DEFINITION?**

Self definition is the most empowering of the definitions of retirement for women. An issue with self definition is that women generally are not in a strong enough position to socially define retirement for themselves, without the influences of the males in their personal lives and the large patriarchy surrounding them.

The point-of-view offered by time-use studies is very valuable. While the commodity of leisure time is often equated with retirement, the period in a woman's life when she enjoys most leisure is then reasonably defined as her retirement. Ironically the unequal division of leisure is in favour of males in this period, according to the Bittman (1991 p. 51) time-use study;

"Indeed the highest average leisure time of any life course stage, regardless of gender, is found among retired husbands."

**HOW DO WOMEN EXPERIENCE RETIREMENT?**

Women's exit from paid work is fraught with similar difficulties as men's in terms of self identity and work. For some women there is the added concern that their opportunity to participate in the public work sphere did not allow them the time to develop their careers fully (Hatch 1992, p. 67). Crandall (1980, p. 355) cites an interesting study by Fox which found that;

"women who retire from jobs, careers, and occupations appear to have as many problems as do men. It has been found, however, that working women appear to have higher morale after retirement than women who have never worked"

Retirement will become more of an issue for women as their participation in the paid workforce increases (Erdner and Guy 1990, p. 129).

Women retire from paid work to join other women in the private work sphere. A study by Zuzanek and Box (1988, p. 156) indicates that women over sixty-five spend more time in housework than their husbands even though the men almost doubled their pre-retirement time spent in housework. The Bittman time use study (1991, p. 50) showed that:

"When compared with their pre-retirement equivalents, women in retired couples double the time they spend preparing food; increase cleaning time by a third; and spent a quarter as long again on laundry, ironing and clothes care".

Is there a pattern emerging when we read studies such as one by Quiroutte and Gold (1992, p. 266) which showed;

"that with age, men do become more dependant on their wives for nurturance and have fewer other sources of social support, thus reinforcing wives' care-giving role"?

This pattern is reinforced by Douglas-Smith (1982, p. 27) who added that providing child care for grandchildren was also largely the woman's domain. Further exploration of time-use of older women adds issues such as the time spent caring for older parents and the work of women as volunteers in the community. Retirement appears then to reflect the traditional sexual division of labour of women's lifetime.

Women enter retirement "with fewer financial resources, and less preparation for retirement" than men (McDonald and Waner cited in McPherson 1990, p. 401) due to their different workforce experience. There are a number of factors which have reduced women's pre-retirement income, which in turn prevents adequate preparation for retirement in the form of superannuation, savings or assets. Factors include the current cohort of retired women's experience that they had to resign from the public service upon marriage (McCallum 1990, p. 62). Other factors are: the overall lower wage of women (sixty-one percent of that of men, (Women in Australia 1993, p. 179)), their high participation rate as part-time staff and their interrupted workforce patterns (Women in Australia 1993 p. 186). Other women suffer economically
through divorce and subsequent custody of children (Smith and Moen 1988, p. 521).

**Retirement Planning**

The tendency of women not to plan for retirement can be seen in the low percentage of full-time women workers who contributed to superannuation schemes in 1988 (46.8 percent Women in Australia 1993, p. 189). This number rose to 77 percent of women with the compulsory superannuation levy, however the lower disposable income of women still restricts their contributions. The dependency of women is indicated by the “one in five women with superannuation cover (who) still expected to be dependent on someone else’s income, most likely their husband’s” (Women in Australia 1993, p.192).

The current cohort of older women lived with the societal expectation that women would be financially dependent on men. This dependency places many women only “one husband away from poverty” (Logue 1991, p. 663) via either widowhood or divorce. For women with a spouse “there is no compulsion for a male superannuate to share his superannuation benefit with a previous wife or with a de facto wife or even with a current legal wife” (Owen 1984, p. 363).

Individual factors preventing women from planning effectively for retirement include; math anxiety (McKenna and Nickols 1988 p. 154), women’s conservative nature in risk taking (McKenna and Nickols 1988 p. 154), not being educated in complex superannuation matters (Matilla 1990, p. 42), and a tendency to focus on short term needs (McCallum 1990, p. 62 and Matilla 1990 p. 40). There are other psychological factors which affect some women such as fear of ageing.

The financial status of women has a powerful impact on the lifestyle of the retirement years and often includes an impact on their potential for good health and mobility and prevention of social isolation. However money alone will not ensure good mental and physical health or social networks. Planning for retirement is not limited to financial planning. It needs to be approached holistically and include plans for future health and social needs as well. A recent evaluation of the WA Retirement Education Service indicated that women were an at-risk group requiring targeting for holistic retirement education (Weatherill 1993, p. 7).

**The Way Forward**

Retirement is a life stage experienced by women in varying ways. It is the final period in our life-span, and one which we can have some control over if we make the effort to plan for it and encourage other women to do the same. For the busy women of the 1990’s it is often difficult to consider finding time to spend in contemplation for a period of time often seems far away. Yet this is the key to taking charge to ensure women lead the way in retirement. Women are after all the survivors of old age. Women deserve to retire and to retire well.

**Bibliography**


Australian Bureau of Statistics Catalogue # 6238.0.


Contrasting Perceptions of Women as Educational Leaders

A QUESTION OF STYLE OR VALUE?

GABY WEINER
SOUTH BANK UNIVERSITY

BACKGROUND

In an interview marking the first anniversary of the UK Opportunity 2000 initiative established in 1991 in the UK to encourage employers to meet measurable targets for increasing opportunities for women, Gillian Shephard, the then Employment Secretary noted that women were still only 3% of university managers, 15% of medical consultants, and 4% of senior business managers (Milne, 1992). Significantly and contradictorily, however, there is also substantial evidence emerging that, when they are appointed, women are more effective as managers (Summers, 1993).

The under-representation of women at senior management levels is not the main issue of this paper. However, it is important to note that women in educational management are still a comparative rarity at least in the UK. In this paper I want to explore the debate on gender and management/leadership style. (I use the terms management and leadership interchangeably, though I appreciate that they can have different meanings in the Australian context). Do men and women exhibit different qualities in their approaches to management and leadership issues? Or is approach more dictated by the values held by the individual manager, specific institutional ethos or other social or psychological factors? This paper examines these questions by drawing on the data of two recent UK studies with which I have been involved.

THE LIFE HISTORY PROJECT

The first is a 1990, European Commission funded study: Action Research on Equal Opportunities Race and Gender: Individual and Corporate Strategies in Educational Institutions which used a 'life history' approach to elicit views of leadership issues from 40 'minority' managers (white women and black men and women) in a range of educational institutions (reported in Powney & Weiner, 1991). Briefly, the main themes and topics emerging from the project were:

a) Leadership Style: Five broad patterns of response to questions on management style were identified, four of which concurred with definitions in the literature and the fifth which cut across the other four. These were:
- flat, democratic, participative, collaborative, teamworking etc. leadership
- firm, directive, prepared to assume leadership role etc.
- includes elements of both 'democratic' and 'leadership' management styles.
- no clear management style identifiable. Self Doubters self-critical, sets high standards but doubts achievability.

b) Institutional Profile: Despite variations in institutional practices, there was evidence of good practice in terms of equity in a minority of organisations, comparatively greater progress having been made by smaller, lower status, educational institutions such as schools, and TAFE colleges with the 'new' universities (expolytechnics) appearing to be moving faster on equality issues than the universities. A continuum of equal opportunities was identified thus:
- Equity is a significant part of the ethos of the institution and is reflected in power structures.
- A genuine commitment towards good equity practice.
- Commitment to the process of working towards equity.
- 'Lip-service' towards equity issues.
- No evidence of any real interest in equity issues.

c) Racism and Sexism. Racism and, to a lesser extent, sexism disappointingly seemed as endemic in education as elsewhere. Interviewees had many horror stories to tell of various discriminatory practices against themselves. However, the characteristics of racism (and sexism) are now likely to be less explicit than before the 1975 Sex Discrimination Act and the 1976 Race Relations Act.

d) Under-representation. There was substantial evidence of under-representation among non-white staff
in most educational institutions, particularly in the funding agencies, quangos, and in educational administration generally. On the other hand, though relatively few in number compared with their male counterparts, white women were more identifiable in senior hierarchies.

e) Career Trajectories. Four different career trajectories were identified: ‘deliberate career’, ‘drifter’, ‘opportunistic’ and ‘irrepressible’. Particularly important for black managers was the part that equal opportunities ‘activism’ had played in their career development.

THE EQUITY AND STAFFING PROJECT

The second project on which this paper is based uses case studies to examine how equity policies in colleges and universities with a high profile in equity issues are perceived and implemented. At the time of writing, the patterns the research team are finding are depressingly familiar: a predominance of staffing structures with exclusively (white) male chief executives, senior management including some women but few black staff, women more likely to have main responsibilities and posts for equity issues rather than being in the key ‘power’ positions of senior management. Moreover, those women (black or white) who have achieved senior positions express feelings of invisibility and isolation, hostility from (male) subordinates and sometimes from colleagues, patronising behaviour from their bosses, overload and overwork, and continually being viewed as the abnormal ‘other’ or just simply not ‘one of the boys’. At the same time, there seems to be a continual need to revise and update policy initiatives, intimations of a backlash waiting to be unleashed and problems arising from the multiple positioning of staff members in relation to equality issues often simultaneously supportive and resistant.

Instigated by government policy orientated towards the market, the case study institutions have also experienced during the time of the project a period of unprecedented amalgamations, important changes in status, institutional name-changes, internal restructuring and reorganisation, resultant relocation of work and office space and so on. Thus, while the project has been welcomed by those working in the institutions involved, equity as a policy issue is viewed as on the move down rather than up the policy agenda (Farish et al, 1994, in preparation).

Issues raised by the two projects have revolved, in particular, around perceptions by educational managers that leadership styles or approaches differ according to gender (or membership of other social groupings) and also in relation to individual value systems and the values promoted by institutional cultures. Further, for (some) women managers, their positioning as ‘keepers’ of equity policies has been an additional source of tension and responsibility. People at this conference will, no doubt, be familiar with the literature on gender and management/leadership style. Nevertheless, I include a brief overview of the UK literature as a backdrop to the two research studies before exploring how debates concerning ‘leadership style’ can be reassessed and reconceptualised.

- Gendered Leadership Styles. In the UK, management is commonly conceptualised as ‘masculine’, concerned with the ‘male’ qualities of functionality, rationality and instrumentality. Thus, the promotion of managerialism (rather than professional leadership) in education has, according to Al Khalifa (1989), made women more wary of taking senior posts, since they are less likely to want to associate themselves with management’s male stereotype. However, according to Barsoux (1987), a new concept of management appeared in the 1980’s one that is accessible and supportive rather than distant and directive, and consensual rather than encouraging conflict and confrontation. This approach is more likely to be adopted by women who tend to be more democratic and friendly, more open to change and have a greater ability to work collaboratively (Marshall, 1985), though they sometimes display discomfort in wielding power over others (Woo, 1985).

Within this discourse, women’s management style has been conceptualised as different from men. Thus, Erickson (1985) reports that women develop leadership styles which are neither “masculine” nor “feminine” but “androgyne” that is self rather than culturally defined. And Rimmer and Davies (1985) identify five types of female leadership style in education: “crusader confident”, “idealistic”, “ambitious”, “diffident” and “disillusioned”.

A common finding of research on women leaders is that where women achieve senior status, they experience feelings of high visibility, often being required to make a token presence on senior committees (Bangar & McDermott, 1989). They also tend to feel isolated and lonely, frequently perceiving their workplace as male dominated, hostile and contradictory (Marshall, 1987, Weiner, 1993).

- Managers and Equality. One feature of the spread of equal opportunity policies has been that women are more likely to be allocated responsibility for equality issues or as Yeatman (1993) terms it in the context of universities,
‘tagged as equity change agents’ (p. 23). Thus, life is made more difficult for women as university managers because they are often likely to become targets for those wishing to resist change, and also by their very interest in equality issues, rendered peripheral to the most prestigious elements of academia.

To be a professor of Women’s Studies; to be the only woman Dean of a country’s Law Schools, where this Law School is identified with the University’s bicultural and gender equity objectives and seen to be pioneering a ‘law in context’ approach; to be a Pro-ViceChancellor responsible for foreign students, student welfare and equal opportunity is also to be on the outer rim of academia. (Yeatman, 1993, p. 23) By allocating women such gendered responsibilities in organisations generally, it is argued that male managers both distance themselves from equity agendas and fail to lend active strategic support in anticipating men’s potential resistance to sex equality in organisations (Cockburn, 1990).

In terms of specific forms of leadership which enhance the possibilities of an ethos of “social justice”, Grundy (1993) draws on Habermas’s theory of “knowledge constitutive interests” to offer three categories of educational leadership: “technical”, “practical” and incorporating “emancipatory practice”. She argues that good management (whether by men or women) needs to be primarily educative such that ‘the action of the educational leader who works in an emancipatory way is more educational than managerial’ (p. 173). Additionally, Blackmore (1989, p. 94) argues for the feminist re-construction of the concept of leadership.

This would include a view of power which is multidimensional and multidirectional. Leadership looks to empower others rather than have power over others... Leadership is concerned with communitarian and collective activities and values. Thus the process of leading is both educative and conducive to democratic process, and, one would hope, consistent with education.

**ISSUES RAISED BY THE PROJECTS**

Both projects identify clear patterns of gender inequality in educational management, particularly in the poor representation of women and minority groups in senior management and the endemic nature of racism and sexism in educational institutions paralleling the literature themes identified in the previous section of the paper. However, where they challenge other research findings is in the claims that women as women have distinctive leadership approaches.

- **Democracy: Empowering or Threatening?** As we have seen, the ‘life history’ study established the existence of five broad patterns of response to questions on management style currently existing in a range of UK educational institution. Four of these “democratic”, “leadership”, “midway”, “diffuse” concurred with definitions in the literature (see above) and the fifth “self doubting” cut across the other four. However, evidence was also found of differences in management style between women. For example, the black, female managers in the study seemed less comfortable with the flatter, management styles preferred by their black male and white female peers, and were also less likely than their white female counterparts, to articulate doubts and self criticism about the strategies they had so far adopted. The reasons why are self evident in this account from a black female principal of a secondary school.

  E.G. believes that a good manager needs to be firm but fair. Her style may at times deny democracy. She believes that democracy has caused powerful managers to be destroyed and she guards against that by observing, listening and developing effective strategies for change. E.G. directs, steers and takes responsibilities for her actions...E.G states that she works with hidden goals in order to avoid sabotage and as a strategy for dealing with resistance.

  Another black senior manager of a college (O), although advocating consultative and democratic approaches was also aware of the dangers of such approaches: is aware that there are some staff who deliberately set out to undermine her using subtle strategies such as questioning every decision she makes, preferring to consult white managers about areas of work which directly come under her brief. Even in these situations O. maintains her professionalism by going through correct procedures to confront these members of staff.

  Further there was greater similarity in perceived leadership style between the white women and the black men. For example a black male principal of a secondary school explains his leadership perspective thus:

  K...sees himself as certainly not autocratic and describes his management style as consultative and democratic and believes in team work. He believes in leading by example.

  This seems very similar to that of a white female head of a regional Youth Service.

  She has therefore created a flat, deliberately democratic structure in order partly to control herself and partly to enable other people to do what they want and for the organisation to benefit from other people’s ideas.
Pointers as to why black women might find ‘open’ leadership styles particularly difficult are confirmed in the Equity and Staffing project. For example, a white female exDean portrayed the experiences of the first black woman professor appointed in the university as follows:

I then appointed M... she was the first black woman head of department and the first black woman professor. She had come through a difficult time herself as you can imagine, to get where she was... she had great difficulties in her department, because there was a group of staff... that did not support her and gave her a difficult time beyond belief.

In fact, one black male college senior manager suggested that there is necessarily a difference between white and black leadership styles.

He believes that in some ways there has to be a difference. A black manager managing both black and white staff has particular difficulties. His experience is that white staff are continually watching how he manages black staff and black staff watching how he manages white staff and both watching how he manages both sets of staff. For white managers this dynamic does not necessarily exist in the same way.

And some women who consciously try to develop more collaborative and empowering leadership styles find that to do so is almost impossible. Thus the same exDean quoted above recounts her early experiences of management as follows:

One (head of department) had a very objectionable chauvinistic point of view he was a bully. He was very difficult. To give you an example. The first week I arrived we had a Faculty management team meeting. He sat at the other end of a large table and bashed his fist on the table, the table lifted in the air and he shouted and bawled at me saying I was not managing appropriately. I must have tried every possible way of working (with) and managing this person. I tried everything from participation to collaboration.

- Awareness of Equity Issues. What is also interesting in the life history project was that all the black managers had been politicised by their experiences of racism (and also sexism in the case of the black women). For example, a black female principal of a secondary school reported experiencing racism and sexism in the course of promotion, characterised by stereotypical lower expectations of her potential as a young black woman with three children. Another black female school principal ‘feels quite angry about the way she has been treated. As a black woman she feels that racism and sexism are closely intertwined’. One response to this apparently relentless racist challenge to the professionalism of black educational leaders has been to work more within the black community. Thus, a black principal of a secondary school expressed his growing commitment thus:

I could no longer justify to myself being black and living in a white world. Having lived almost as a white person my colour was in some ways almost bizarre in the sense I was black and everyone else was white.

And another black female manager, this time of a college and very visible in the white culture, reported an increasingly strong commitment to recruiting more black staff to senior positions.

This ‘politicisation’ seems not to be as marked in the case of the white women managers. Although several admitted feminist leanings, a white female head of a women’s adult college found ‘feminist nonhierarchical practice... difficult to hold on to’. At least half of the white women managers in the life history project expressed little interest in or awareness of women’s issues. This, incidentally, has led to much confusion from them about why women were so poorly represented at senior levels and thus, how this might be changed. Some were clearly anti-feminist as in the case of a white, female Pro-Vice Chancellor who revealed her perspective on the nature of women’s and men’s work thus:

“Her research team is nearly all women but she doesn’t know why this should be so... She feels that her area of work takes a great deal of patience for which girls are particularly suited whereas the area of work she has been developing more recently is high tech and there she has a predominantly male team ‘all boys’... She feels that this might be inherent: ‘there are differences in the sexes’.”

As to her own achievements and her approach to leadership issues, femininity rather than feminism is her preference:

She said that being female had, if anything, worked to her advantage.”

- Personal Values and Leadership Style. Both projects suggested that it is value position rather than gender that, to some extent, dictates leadership approach (in addition to the other factors mentioned above). This is best pointed up in the interviews with white women managers. Those women that held a social justice and/or feminist perspective favoured more consciously egalitarian leadership styles and management practices. Thus a
white female principal of a girls' secondary school informed by equity issues around multiculturalism, gender and special need "assumes that everyone wants to be involved and participate in decision-making" and a female principal of a small inner city primary school to whom 'political awareness (including the influence of feminism) has been late in coming, believes in staff working in a team and rarely makes a decision on her own'. A white, female local education authority director, adopting a consciously feminist approach, deliberately nurtures and has a tendency which she identifies to provide stronger support and encouragement to young women because she is aware of the obstacles in the path of their career promotion.

However, she also suggested that there may be gender stereotyping of perception of leadership style.

She "genuinely believes that a woman provides a much more balanced approach than a man in the same position using the same style"... She feels that men with a style similar to her own would implement it more rigorously and would be seen to be "hardnosed and ruthless".

A feminist principal of a primary school wants to empower her colleagues but "on my own terms".

She works hard and expects others to do as well... A. hopes that she is not authoritarian "although there comes a point when you don't have a lot of choice". She tries to be fairly open.

In contrast, two very senior women in universities, one a pro-Vice Chancellor and the other a college administrator, appear to have developed consciously 'feminine' human relations management approaches such that the first "does enjoy gossip because she loves people" and the second has developed a "chatty style. I do a lot of chatting to people"... Her 'chatty' style of management means that J. obtains views and gets things done through verbal interaction usually with subsequent written confirmation where action is required.

Significantly, both these women who see social and academic differences between men and women as "inherent" and "individual", refer to the role that "feminine charm" has played in their ability to manage. To quote each again:

She (the Pro-Vice Chancellor) said that being female had, if anything, worked to her advantage, "if you are an attractive lady and you know how to use that sensibly". The college administrator said she now uses any weapon including female charm and, if necessary, accepts the assumption that someone might make on the phone that she is a secretary if any of these strategies would be useful. Most of the white female managers in the life history project appeared, however, to have a perspective on management roughly midway between feminist and what I would term essentialist. They seemed to recognise that their positioning as women at senior levels is problematic but lacked the consciousness or theoretical understandings to challenge it. Thus a white female deputy director of an 'new' university (expolytechnic) who saw her style as open though with a tendency to authoritarianism, does not want to be a "quasiman - I'm different and proud of it". At the same time there is nothing wrong with using the devices men use... She feels the importance of trying to make changes in structures and behaviours that pose these dilemmas for women so that those coming afterwards have an easier time. Similarly, a senior manager in a local authority recognised that she has been co-opted into the institutional ethos. "Perhaps I have worked in a man's world for so long now that I have adopted men's meeting styles, men's whatever and can use them successfully...so don't actually understand how disabling they are".

A white female professor of education, likewise, saw her management style as not particularly "feminine": Although S. does not think her management style is distinctively female, she nevertheless suggested to her male managers in her previous job, that they should temper their style with some TLC (tender loving care). S. tries to do this and to maintain friendly, informal relations with most staff though (is) clear to indicate that when she says something, she means it. What can be drawn from such interview data is to some extent limited. Any differences in how understanding of equity issues actually affect management practices needs to be researched more thoroughly, possibly through observation or ethnographic study.

- Women as 'Gatekeepers' of Equity. In the main, data from the two projects have supported claims that women are more likely than men to have responsibilities for equity issues. However, there is also some indication from the data, that black managers (male and female) tend also to have similar patterns of responsibility, often for both race and gender. Thus a black male college deputy suggested that such responsibilities further compromise his status: For H. there is the added factor of him having the role of EOP (equity) monitor and keeping his mind at all times on the race dimensions in his work... He feels he is constantly being watched to see whether or not he can manage. It is also clear that some of the 'high flying' white women managers deliberately steered their
careers away from 'women's issues' which they perceived as lowering their status in the competitive academic institutional ethos.

**SUGGESTIONS AND CONCLUSIONS**

The hope has been in this paper that I have pointed to some problems with the widely held hypothesis that women as women have particularly appropriate 'soft' leadership approaches. I suggest instead, drawing on admittedly limited data, that leadership style is dependant on some (or all?) of the following factors: value position of the manager; ethos of the institution; specific conceptions of femininities (and masculinities) held by managers; endemic patterns of inequality, under-representation and prejudice. I further suggest that genuine empowerment of colleagues as defined by Blackmore (1989) and Grundy (1993) is only possible where an educational manager or leader has a commitment to challenging inequality (perhaps also a consciousness derived from having experienced prejudice and discrimination) and some awareness of the structural and interpersonal factors which contribute to or minimise patterns and experiences of inequality.

**REFERENCES**


Milne S., (1992), 'Minister attacks slow progress for women', *Guardian* 18 November.


The female market has been described as a moving target (Bartos 1982), elusive (Free 1985) and a growing force (Kreinik 1976) indicating the phenomenal changes that have taken place in this segment during the last several decades. This paper will examine the changing roles of women in society and how these changes have influenced the development of advertising strategies targeted to various segments of the female market.

Personal superannuation companies must segment the working female population taking into account the changing values, attitudes and demographics in this market. Qualitative research in the form of indepth interviews were undertaken to identify key consumer behaviour motivations for working women in the personal superannuation market. Print advertisements from recent issues of women’s magazines were also shown to respondents to gauge their response to the presenter in the advertisement.

One key finding from the qualitative research is the difference in perspective between women employed in low-occupational-status occupations and women employed in high-occupational-status occupations in terms of financial planning. It was found that women employed in high-occupational-status occupations tended to be more financially aware, having more specific financial plans for their retirement. They believed women should be financially independent, and want security independent of their husbands.

Whereas, women employed in the low-occupational-status occupations tended to live for today and had not planned for their future retirement to any great extent. The younger women live from payday to payday, whereas the older women were relying on their husband’s superannuation or the government pension in their retirement.

This paper will examine the results of recent qualitative research aimed at identifying key consumer behaviour motivations for working women when planning for their future wellbeing.

The aim of this research was to identify appropriate advertising appeals and presenter characteristics for personal superannuation advertising targeted to demographic segments of working women. With increasing numbers of women in the workforce, personal superannuation companies must recognize the inevitable expansion of this segment of the market, and develop appropriate advertising appeals tailored to the different demographic segments of working women.

DEFINITION OF KEY TERMS

Personal Superannuation Fund - a superannuation plan not tied to your place of employment, to which you make contributions over the course of your working life. These plans are based on a person purchasing a superannuation policy from a registered superannuation company. The benefits derived will be dependent upon the amount and period of time your money is invested, and the investment performance of the fund manager. A distinction is made between personal superannuation and employer sponsored superannuation schemes. The latter usually provides benefits based on a formula linked to length of service and final salary (Personal Superannuation Planning, Prudential, Portfolio, July/August, 1991).

INTRODUCTION

During the last several decades, the economic and social status of women has changed dramatically, with women becoming more financially independent. Consequently, women have become a growing and viable target market for financial services, including retirement planning in the form of personal superannuation. This paper will examine the changing roles of women in our society and the impact of these changes on the development of advertising strategies for personal superannuation targeted to the working woman.

The paper will examine the results of qualitative research which examined the key consumer behaviour characteristics of low- and high-occupational-status working women in the personal superannuation market.

WOMEN AS A TARGET MARKET

Bartos (1982) has aptly referred to working women as the moving target highlighting the difficulty in developing marketing strategies targeted to a demographic segment.
whose characteristics are continually changing. The women's market is no longer as static or as stereotypical as in the past, creating a major challenge for marketers who must regroup the market into more meaningful segments.

Traditionally, the stereotypical housewife described by Free (1985, p. 33) as the darling of the mass marketing boom was the focal point of marketing strategies targeted to women. However, the housewife stereotype has been replaced by a proliferation of consumer segments in the female market. Marketers must recognize the diversity within each segment of the market and be careful not to assume that all women within a particular segment are similar. Take for example, working women, who are diverse in terms of their needs, spending power and lifestyles. A career woman whose income added to her husband's will have a different spending power and lifestyle to a female head of household with a young family or a young secretary living with her parents (Bartos 1982).

Bartos (1977) urges marketers to recognize the realities of the women's market by examining a combination of old and new demographic facts, as well as changing attitude and value systems. Practical-minded marketers must challenge the underlying assumptions of how markets are defined and bring their marketing procedures in line with reality. A thorough evaluation of the consumer behaviour characteristics of the women's market is a critical first step in any marketing program targeted to women. This in turn will aid with the development of marketing strategies reflecting the diversity of different lifestyle groups within this segment of the market.

THE CHANGING ROLES OF WOMEN

One of the most profound changes in the women's market during the past two decades has been a marked increase in the participation rate of women in the formal labour market, with women moving from a primarily nurturing and homemaking role to women as wage-earners (Stern 1988(b). Bartos (1982) has described the dramatic rise in the number of women in the workforce in recent years as the quiet revolution, being a symptom of a more fundamental change in women's self-perceptions. Working women are no longer an exception, with the majority of women either in part-time or full-time employment. The increasing number of women participating in the workforce has been particularly pronounced amongst married women.

Increasing workforce participation rates has affected the concept of the traditional family, where the husband is regarded as the primary income earner, with the wife staying at home (Ross-Smith and Walker 1990). With more Australian women entering the workforce, dual career families have become commonplace. A woman's role has changed from being primarily an economic consumer to being both producer and consumer (Stern 1988(b).

McCall (1977) developed the term workwife to describe the dual roles of women who are combining two major societal roles of being mother/housewife with employment outside the house. According to McCall, combining these roles has changed the nature of the traditional family unit due to the power that working women exert in the marketplace. Any change in women's purchasing behaviour will have significant influence on the household as a whole. Families with two income earners have increased spending power, contributing heavily to the rapidly growing affluent market (Engel, Blackwell & Miniard 1986).

MOTIVATIONS FOR WORK

The assumption that women work only out of economic necessity has also been challenged in the literature, with the vast majority of women stating that they were working because they wanted to, not because it was necessary. Some psychologists describe this phenomenon as a search for self-fulfilment, while others focused on the decline of the stereotype of a perfect mother as the new feminine ideal role model. Social stimulation, a sense of accomplishment and self-development, as well as a yearning for an identity independent of the role allotted to the family structure, were the major reasons stated by women as being positive attractions of work outside the home (Farrar 1984, Free 1985).

Women's changing aspirations are described by Bartos (1989) as a contributing factor in women's increased involvement in higher education. The traditional goal of women was to become a wife and mother, however, younger women are now seeking to combine marriage, career and children.

Bartos (1989) has conducted comprehensive research in the women's market in the United States, developing a categorisation scheme for non-working and working women based on their attitudes towards work. In her research, Bartos analysed the consumer behaviour patterns, attitudes and values of both working and non-working women. When Bartos asked housewives if they ever planned to enter the paid workforce, approximately half the housewives indicated that they planned to work within the next year, within the next five years, or "some-time". Working women were asked whether their work is
"just-a-job" or a career. This was not a matter of defining their jobs, but how they felt about their work. The responses from both the working and non-working women were used as a basis of segmenting women into four groups according to their career orientations:

**Stay-at-home housewives** - include the oldest and least educated women, endorsing the traditional roles of wife and mother;

**Plan-to-work housewives** - these women are generally younger and better educated. They are devoted to their children, however they look forward to entering the workforce as a means of personal satisfaction and economic reward;

**Just-a-job working women** - includes women who are financially motivated to work and also gain social satisfaction from interacting with others in the workforce;

**Career women** - these women are the best educated and most affluent group, gaining from their work a sense of achievement and personal accomplishment.

Detailed analysis of the characteristics of these four groups, including their attitudes and values on work and non-work related issues, found the stay-at-home housewives were out of step with the other three segments. Although plan-to-work housewives were defined as "full-time home makers", their attitudes and values were far closer to those of working women rather than non-working women. Differences were also found between just-a-job working women and career oriented women, which in part, were a reflection of the fact that career women were the better educated, taking a non-traditional perspective on many issues.

In Australia, Clemenger Advertising and Reark Research (1984) examined both the conventional working and non-working woman, similar to the categories used by Bartos (1982). According to their report, career oriented women tend to be younger, better educated and to belong to higher income households. These women work for independence, enjoyment and for enhancement of their career. The majority of career oriented women are married (64 percent) and have children (56 percent). On the other hand, income oriented women are older and tend to have teenage children. This segment is somewhat less educated and has been in the workforce for a longer period, when compared to career oriented women.

**WOMEN AS A SEGMENT FOR FINANCIAL SERVICES**

Women are becoming more financially aware and becoming more actively involved in financial decision making. They are now requiring more information about finance, money management and business. They have become actively involved in the purchase of financial products including insurance, credit and bank cards, chequeing and savings accounts, shares and retirement planning (Stern 1987).

Women as market for financial services has been the focus of a recent Australian study undertaken by Mattingly and Partners (1993). The report states that the woman of today takes financial matters seriously, values financial independence and feel confident in their decision making abilities. The research found that the majority of women (71 percent) stated that they have different and special financial needs when compared with men. According to the report, the financial needs of women are often not recognized by the historically male focused commercial world (1993, p. 20).

The report also stated that women are requiring greater flexibility and empathy by financial service providers to cater for their various life cycle changes such as marriage, entering and leaving the workforce for children, or divorce. As well, women are particularly conscious of the risks inherent in their lives and are strongly motivated by concerns about protection for the future. Women want to be taken seriously in financial matters. They feel that their needs, views and uncertainties are frequently not taken seriously in major financial decisions, resulting in resentment and a lack of trust of towards the financial institution. (Mattingly and Partners 1993).

**WOMEN AND SUPERANNUATION**

In recent years, the coverage rates of the female labour force by superannuation has increased dramatically to 87.5 percent of the female labour force compared with about 80 percent for men. However, at any one time, approximately 52 percent of women of working age are in paid employment, compared with 74 percent of men. Consequently, actual rates of coverage of the total female population by superannuation are much lower. It is assumed that these coverage rates will improve with increased participation rates of women in the labour force and as their access to superannuation is legislated (Rosenman 1993).

The Australian population aged 60 and over is predominantly female. The percentage of women among the oldest cohorts continues to increase due to the higher death rates and lower life expectancies of men. Examination of the population projections into the future suggest
that these trends are unlikely to change into the next century. One implication of these demographic trends is that women are particularly likely to have an extended period over which they will have to manage their retirement incomes. This has implications for retirement income planning both from the individual and societal viewpoint (Rosenman and Winocur 1989, Rosenman 1991).

Qualitative research undertaken in the female superannuation market in Australia has highlighted the strength of the perception that women believe that financial independence is imperative. Other issues revealed include: security through financial independence is important; financial independence is extremely important to women from all spheres; women did not want to be financially reliant on anybody; women did not see marriage as being synonymous with wealth or security; and there is an undercurrent fear of female poverty (Casey and Dwyer, 1991).

Casey and Dwyer (1991) found that specific segments of the female superannuation market believing financial autonomy to be particularly important were: a) women over thirty who have come to the realisation that the number of earning years is reducing; and b) single women including those who have been divorced, separated, widowed or never married, with the emphasis on those that have children.

Melendi (1991) states that women are discovering the harsh realities of facing their retirement without a partner and without adequate retirement planning. One third of all marriages end in divorce, with women having limited access to their partner’s superannuation. The majority of lone parents in Australia are women supporting one or two children. Women comprise the majority of the aged population and with the majority living alone for the last years of their lives with no access to other incomes other than social security. There is also an increasing number of women who will never marry, providing for their future retirement during their working life (Australian Bureau of Statistics Social Indicators, 1992).

Despite these obvious demographic and social trends, financial service providers have long neglected to develop marketing strategies specifically for women and their retirement planning. Melendi (1991) suggests that women, whether they are single parents, career women or part of a dual income family, are enthusiastic prospects for retirement planning strategies. Women are becoming more realistic with regard to their financial future and are yearning to protect themselves from an impoverished retirement.

ADVERTISING FOR WOMEN

During the past decade, researchers have been suggesting that traditional stereotyped roles no longer reflect the roles of women in modern society and have become increasingly less effective as an advertising tool. Critics contend that women’s roles are changing, but that advertisers are not keeping pace with these changes or portraying women realistically in advertisements (Courtney and Whipple 1984, Debevec and Iyer 1986).

Advertising and marketing are the most effective when they are relevant to their target audience. Bartos (1989) states that women want to be treated with respect, they resent condescension, and do not necessarily want to be defined only in terms of their family roles.

According to Bartos (1989), advertising practitioners have a knee-jerk reaction to criticisms regarding role portrayal of women, claiming that the critics are not representative of the “real consumer”. In reality, the best educated and most sophisticated consumer is the career woman, who is sceptical about business in general and advertising in particular. Yet for many marketers, it is this segment of women that represent the most desirable prospects for many products and services.

Mattingly and Partners (1993) examined women’s views towards financial services advertising and found that women were generally critical and dismissive towards advertising undertaken by financial institutions. In many cases they saw current advertising as a confirmation of the inherent bias of the institution against them, indicating how out of touch with their needs they were. Statements made by respondents during the qualitative research were indicative of this:

“Don’t give us those yuppie career minded women in ads. It’s a con”

“It’s not the 60’s anymore”

“They don’t have to have business women in them. Have someone like me”

According to Leigh, Rethans and Whitney (1987) advertisers must examine the relationship between role portrayal in the advertisement and the target audiences expectation. Advertisers need to understand their target audiences in terms of these expectations, and develop their advertising appeals accordingly. When targeting women, personal superannuation advertisers must avoid offending potential customers when identifying the most appropriate appeals for their financial products.
RESULTS OF QUALITATIVE RESEARCH

Qualitative research in the form of indepth interviews was undertaken to identify the major consumer behaviour motivations for working women in the personal superannuation market.

A sample of 30 women currently in the paid workforce were interviewed. Prior to conducting the in-depth interviews, the female market was segmented according to the woman's stage in the family life cycle. When studying the female market, Bartos (1989) recommends marketers combine the two key demographic variables of marriage and parenthood, with the following life cycle groups being identified:

1. Unmarried working women with no children;
2. Unmarried working women with at least one child;
3. Married working women with no children;
4. Married working women with at least one child.

These segments were crossed with the woman's occupational category according to the classification scheme used by Schaninger and Allen (1981). These categories included: non working wife (NWW), low-occupational-status working wife (LSW) and high-occupational-status working wife (HSW). The qualitative research focused on the latter two categories.

This classification scheme is based on the seven occupational categories of the Hollingshead Index of Social Position (Hollingshead and Redlich 1985, Reynolds and Wells 1977 in Schaninger and Allen 1981). High-occupational-status women were employed in the top three white-collar categories: managerial, professional, administrative and semi-professional. Examples include, doctors, accountants, engineers, teachers, nurses and professional sales. Low-occupational-status women are those women employed in the lower four categories, for example, secretarial, clerical, technicians, retail sales, as well as blue collar and service workers.

The results of the qualitative research (which are exploratory only) will be discussed according to the segments described by Bartos (1989), and, within these from a low- and high-occupational-status perspective.

UNMARRIED WORKING WOMEN, NO CHILDREN

Low-Occupational-Status Women
This group of women were aged from 19 to 23 and were employed in service occupations, including a receptionist, waitress, telemarketer and a shop assistant.

Overall, the low-occupational-status women in this segment had no financial goals and were living from day to day, or on a payday to payday basis. This group of women had not taken much interest in personal superannuation and felt that personal superannuation was not an issue for young people. None of the respondents had personal superannuation. However, two were contributing small amounts to their employer sponsored scheme.

High-Occupational-Status Women
This group of women ranged in age from 21 to 25, tended to have higher educational qualifications, including two women who owned their own businesses. This group believed in financial independence for women and wanted to be financially secure in the future. They were aware that there may not always be a male to support them.

This group did not understand much about personal superannuation and were concerned about fees, flexibility and not being able to use the money until the age of 55.

Commonalities in Segment
Both low- and high-occupational-status women in this group felt that sales representatives for personal superannuation were “pushy”. They also believed that they would probably have to work in the formal labour force for most of their lives.

UNMARRIED WORKING WOMEN CHILDREN

Low-Occupational-Status Women
Women in this segment were in their early 30's and were either divorced or separated, with teenage and pre-teenage dependents.

These women expressed concern about the ability to afford personal superannuation. Their main priority was to secure their future with the purchase of a home, using their money in the short-term for survival reasons. They felt putting money aside for personal superannuation at this stage was premature. However, it was expressed that personal superannuation would be ideal in the future when they wished to invest elsewhere.

High-Occupational-Status Women
Most of the women in this group were divorced, with one woman who had never married. Ages ranged from 33 to 56 years, with each respondent having one dependent child. These women were employed in government positions and felt that their current government-sponsored schemes were very good. It was felt that private personal superannuation schemes could not compete with...
their work superannuation. Two women were contributing to their schemes, however they were not sure how much the scheme would be worth when they retire.

This segment of women were sceptical towards personal superannuation companies and stated that the sales representatives were "pushy". The older women in this segment felt that advertisements that targeted women who were single (and down and out) were insulting to a woman's intelligence.

Commonalities in Segment

Women in this segment tended not to have personal superannuation. Overall the priority for these women was to own their own home.

Married Working Women, No Children

Low-Occupational-Status Women

Women in this segment ranged in age from 19 to 42 years, employed in general office work including a bookkeeper, secretary and administrative officer.

Overall this segment did not know much about personal superannuation. Their priority was to pay off their present home. They were not impressed by the selling methods employed by insurance companies, including pressure and scare tactics.

High-Occupational-Status Women

Respondents in this segment ranged in age from 28 to 35 years. All women in this segment had personal superannuation; however, two of these were self-employed.

These women were focussed on real estate as an investment, stating that personal superannuation is only one part of retirement planning. Respondents believed that personal superannuation was not explained in terms that people can understand. Other issues include the need for a solid financial institution and the importance of a personal relationship with the sales representative. Women in this segment were married to men who either had employer-sponsored or personal superannuation.

Commonalities in Segment

Both segments believed there would not be a government pension when they retire. They expressed the need to have money for retirement over and above the pension.

Married Working Women, Children

Low-Occupational-Status Women

Women in this segment were aged between 38 and 58 and employed in blue collar positions such as cleaners and domestics, as well as clerical workers such as a cashier, a loans assistant and clerk.

Most of these women stated they were relying on their husband's superannuation. Despite the older ages of some of the women in this segment, they had not thought much about retirement and had not planned for their future in a big way. Some women were not sure of what superannuation they had at work, with only one woman with a personal superannuation policy. This group also felt that the government will support people less and less in the future during their old age.

High-Occupational-Status Women

This group of women ranged in age from 36 to 48 years, employed in a variety of occupations including bank manager, nurse educator, credit controller and small business owner.

These women were more likely to have specific financial plans, which included the acquisition of real estate. All women either had employers-sponsored superannuation and were either contributing to that plan, or had a personal superannuation policy. Their husbands also had personal or employers-sponsored superannuation.

There was variation in the amount of emphasis placed on superannuation and its role in their retirement plans. One woman wanted financial security independent of her husband and had two personal superannuation policies in place. Another woman had specific goals relating to the purchase of investment properties, believing that personal superannuation did not give her the control she wanted with her money. It was felt that personal superannuation was subject to considerable government intervention, through changes in tax structures and rulings, and was therefore not a good long-term investment.

Commonalities in Segment

A comment made by both groups pertained to the fact that women do not know enough about personal superannuation.

Self Employed Women

Of the 30 women interviewed during the qualitative research, six (6) were self-employed, in either real estate, hairdressing and beauty therapy businesses, landscaping design and a small business owner.

Most of these women had personal superannuation policies in place. Motivations for purchasing these policies include:
"tax advantage, plus a little bit for me later on"
"it's a safety net to know at 55 or 60 you have got x dollars"
"government started putting heavies on employers to pay
employee contributions and there were tax benefits for self-
employed people"
"once the flavour of the month ... at the time I was looking for
a tax advantage"
"my own theory that superannuation is OK, it's fixed, but
there are certainly other ways to make your money work for
you"
"when you're self-employed you have to work until your 60 ...
no one is going to give you a redundancy cheque to finish at
50 or 60"
"I've got five staff, I'm putting money into their super each
week and I just felt that by the time I'm 55 I should have some
money coming in from there too"

One of the key motivations for self-employed women
to purchase personal superannuation was for the tax
advantage. These women had purchased these policies as
part of their overall investment plan, with their main
priority being real estate. The income to be gained from
their personal superannuation policy was considered
primarily as a bonus, above their other investments.
Some felt personal superannuation was over-rated as an
investment option because of the lack of accessibility to
the funds until they were 55 years, complicated by the
fact that the government has been changing the regula-
tions and tax structures regularly.

COMPARISON OF LOW- AND HIGH-OCCUPATIONAL-STATUS WOMEN

Appendix A outlines the results of the qualitative
research for both low- and high-occupational-status
women in each of the four life cycle segments.

One key finding from the qualitative research is the
difference in perspective between women in low-occupa-
tional-status and women in high-occupational-status
categories in terms of financial planning. It was found that
women employed in high-occupational-status occupations
tended to be more financially aware, having more specific
financial plans for their retirement. They believed women
should be financially independent, and wanted security
independent of their husband.

Women in the low-occupational-status category tended to
live for today and had not planned for their future retirement
to any great extent. The younger women live from payday to
payday, whereas the older women were relying on their
husband's superannuation or the government pension for
income in their retirement.

GENERAL FINDINGS

Some general findings from the qualitative research
include:
• personal superannuation was considered only one
part of retirement planning.
• Government intervention and rule changing with
personal superannuation has contributed to uncertainty
in the market.
• There was a need for women to know more about
personal superannuation.
• Older women are sceptical about insurance compa-
nies in general.
• Personal superannuation needs to be explained in
terms people can understand.
• Relationships in personal selling are considered
important.
• Pushy sales people are resented.
• It was felt there was a strong possibility that there
would not be a pension in the future.

CONCLUSION

The aim of this research is to identify key consumer
behaviour motivations for working women in the personal
superannuation market. The results of this research will
be used in the development of print advertisements
targeted to working women for personal superannuation.

With increasing numbers of women the workforce,
personal superannuation companies must recognize the
inevitable expansion of this demographic segment and
develop appropriate advertising appeals tailored to the
different demographic segments of working women.
Advertisers who recognize the importance of this segment
will be in a better position to develop effective advertising
campaigns using appropriate advertising appeals and
presenters.
APPENDIX A

RESULTS OF QUALITATIVE RESEARCH

UNMARRIED WORKING WOMEN, NO CHILDREN

LSW
- No financial goals.
- Living for today.
- Never taken interest in personal superannuation.
- Scary to think of future.
- Does not think there will be a pension.
- Have not looked at where they want to be at 55.

HSW
- Believes in financial independence for women.
- Wants to be secure in the future.
- Believes there will not always be a man there.
- Concerns about fees and flexibility.

UNMARRIED WORKING WOMEN, CHILDREN

LSW
- Focus on short-term survival.
- Wants to use their money to buy a house.
- Premature to put money aside for personal superannuation.
- Personal superannuation ideal later for diversification.

HSW
- Relying on government sponsored superannuation schemes.
- Sceptical towards personal superannuation companies.
- Ads targeting women as single (down and out) insulting a woman's intelligence.

MARRIED WORKING WOMEN, NO CHILDREN

LSW
- Paying off home.
- Has not thought much about personal superannuation.
- Companies use pressure and scare tactics.
- No government pension in future.

HSW
- Husband has personal super or employee sponsored super.
- Personal superannuation only one part of retirement planning.
- Focus on real estate.
- Need for a solid institution and to be explained in terms people can understand.

MARRIED WORKING WOMEN, CHILDREN

LSW
- Sceptical towards personal superannuation.
- Relying on husband's super.
- Have not thought about retirement in a big way.
- Less and less government support in future.

HSW
- Have specific financial plans.
- Real estate a priority.
- Wants financial security independent of husband.
- Government keeps changing rules for superannuation.
- Believe women don't know enough about personal superannuation.

REFERENCES
Kreinin, D. 1976, 'Women: A growing force to be reckoned with in advertising financial services', Broadcasting, 19 April.

Mattingly and Partners 1993, 'When I've made our minds up. A study of women's importance in household decision making', Mattingly and Partners, Brian Sweeney and Associates (Aust) Pty. Ltd. and ACP Publishing Pty. Ltd.


In his paper 'Instructional Design and Course Teams: A Twisted Narrative' Patrick Palmer pin-points linguistics as the starting point in improving performance in course teams because what most teams mostly do, in fact, is talk. But in this 'talk' several different fields of discourse are being simultaneously employed, some knowingly, some not and herein lies the problem; ironically enough since course teams are all in some way specialists in language and education. By introducing meta-narrative into the discourse of instructional design I think Palmer has done us a great favour. However, as is the nature of the postmodernist debate he has, by raising these questions prompted further questions, which I, as a worker in Distance Education am compelled to address. First, the question of categories is raised: as Minh-ha has written: Despite our desperate, eternal attempt to separate, contain and mend, categories always leak. Of all the layers that form the open (never finite) totality of "I", which is to be filtered out as superfluous, fake, corrupt, and which is to be called pure, true, real, genuine, original, authentic?... Authenticity as a need to rely on an 'undisputed origin,' is prey to an obsessive fear: that of losing a connection.... The real, nothing else than a code of representation, does not (cannot) coincide with the lived or the performed.... A realistic identification with such a code has, therefore, no reality whatsoever: it is like "stopping the ear while trying to steal the bell" (Chinese saying). (Trinh T. Minh-ha, 1989, 95).

I perceive a real attempt by some instructional designers to make just this false connection to a code of reality which they claim as authentic and which they assume to be universal. By failing to acknowledge that all knowledge is mediated and that language itself is not and cannot be an exact and accurate description of reality instructional designers of the behaviourist and positivist school are stopping their ears while trying to steal the bell.

**INSTRUCTIONAL DESIGN DISCOURSE AND GENDER**

As Palmer rightly asserts it is language that has the power to hold a door open for the transmission of knowledge or to close it. Our systems of human thought depend upon it and issues of power and control both reside in language and are transmitted through it. It is easy to miss the distinction between sexism in language and sexism projected on to language by systems of linguistic analysis. It is through the meta-linguistic practice of talking about language that issues of class race and gender can most easily be lost, subsumed into a universalist discourse that is blind to these issues. Feminist linguistics offers sharp criticism both of our every day discourses and of linguistic analysis itself. There are two theoretical questions raised here: What makes sexist language problematic? What can be done about it? Let me begin by inserting gender into Palmer’s list of Meta-narratives that he identifies as being among the many stories those of us on course teams tell ourselves:

**Meta-narrative #1**

I am a mature and responsible adult male/female, able to relate to and co-operate with a range of other professionals (mostly male) in a meaningful and productive way.

**Meta-narrative #2**

I have professional educational (gendered?) knowledge and expertise, which academics (mostly male) don’t have and am able to inform course teams through this knowledge and expertise.

**Meta-narrative #3**

I am a pleasant and accommodating male/female and have no issues about power and control.

**Meta-narrative #4**

I as a gendered subject can work with you, also a gendered subject so let’s concentrate on the students (mostly female in DE) and produce the best learning materials for them.

Immediately it becomes apparent that our use of the subjective forces us to opt for gender, and this choice has.

---

**Stopping the Ears While Trying to Steal the Bell**

**Instructional Design Practices in Distance Education and the Post Modern Debate**

**JANE WIDDESS**

**EDITH COWAN UNIVERSITY**
buried in it a whole series of hidden hierarchies which at first appear to be simple binary oppositions. It also raises questions of power and control outside and beyond those suggested in M#3, and it is these issues that need to be considered now.

The Gender Neutral Definition of Sexism as Embodied in Instructional Design

Historically most classroom teachers have been women but most instructors in industry and the military have been men. Most of our child care and child rearing has historically been undertaken by women, leaving men free to become captains of industry or at least cogs, and military leaders, or at least cannon fodder. It comes as no surprise to find that as education becomes subject to the demands of late capitalist production (high tech, not low tech, market driven not needs driven, subject to the fall in the rate of profit and economic determinism) that distance education as a product (not as a project) is being led by principles of educational and economic determinism. Many distance educators would agree that the battle between the positivist behaviourists such as Skinner, and the structuralists, such as Chomsky is all over, but the new challenge of the continental theorists such as Barthes, Foucault and Derrida is still to be taken up in our thinking about Distance Education, most particularly the issues of power and control that are laid bare when and where gender neutral language is employed. In these models men and women no longer exist, only persons appear. This usage is at first sight a more accurate usage than the old generic masculine pronoun which was held to include women automatically. It also acknowledges the western ideal that ‘we are all individuals’ and as such are all equally oppressed by restrictive sex role definitions. Narrow role definitions are restrictive, but they are not equally oppressive. Sexism is a system in which women and men are not simply defined by their difference: sexism works to the disadvantage of most women and to the advantage of men, there is difference but more to the point, there is unequal treatment.

The adoption of a gender neutral terminology may, at times, mask this social fact. Students rely on those of us who disseminate factual information to ensure as far as we can what we tell them is as accurate as research and the conscientious use of language can make it. Students also know that for the most part there are still two genders and these are now known as men and persons. I would not disagree that in following the linguistic prescriptions of instructional design even the most unimaginative writer is now able to ‘eliminate gross bias without gross inelegance’ (Cameron) simply by reference to lists of alternatives such as ‘persons’ for ‘men’ and ‘staffing’ for ‘manpower’, and for that alone we should be grateful, but there is a tendency for instructional designers to believe that by simply retouching the surface make-up of the text, by linguistic reform, so to speak, the problem of sexism in language is thereby addressed. By focusing on the word and not on its meaning, (the more easily if the belief persists that the word holds an unproblematic mirror up to reality) these instructors seem to think that real change has occurred. The limitations of this application of instructional design principles in practice have been discussed by many linguistic theorists (Spender, Cameron) so I will not elaborate the point further. Suffice it to say that more current views see language as fluid, polysemic and context dependent and this view, coupled with the understanding that language isolated and distanced from its social constructions becomes a bloodless, computer screen gray, mere words on a screen empty of the significance of social force or meaning, is in complete opposition to this very impersonal, asocial language that we are currently being exhorted to espouse.

Binary Oppositions and Metaphorical Gender

Jack Rosenthal (Cameron 82) conducted a ‘thought experiment’ in which people were presented with the following pairs of words and asked to give them gender:

- Knife/fork
- Ford/Chevrolet
- Salt/pepper
- Vanilla/chocolate

The results were surprisingly uniform in their agreement that knife, Ford, pepper and chocolate were masculine (m) and fork, Chevrolet, salt and vanilla were not. Therefore they must be feminine (f). Cameron makes the following three observations:

- Since all the words refer to ungendered objects or substances, concepts of ‘masculine and feminine’ are infinitely detachable from anything having to do with ‘real’ sexual difference.
- The classification does not seem to obey any single, logical principle. Rosenthal speculates that pepper and chocolate may be classed as masculine because they are stronger flavours than their contrastive pair; that Chevrolet sounds ‘French’ because of its open vowel
ending and knife has connotations of aggression and is therefore more masculine than fork. But simply by adding more pairs more and more different dimensions are called in to offer explanations, suggesting that the concepts of \( m \) and \( f \) operate conceptually at a highly abstract level, subsuming a number of lower-level more obvious contrasts like strong: weak and active: passive.

- The attribution of gender is relational: it depends on the contrast between the two terms and not on the terms themselves. If the question is posed as: Is salt \( m \) or \( f \)? there is no clear answer. The question only makes sense if we are asked to compare salt with pepper. Further, if one part of the pair is changed, the gender may also change. If people are asked to evaluate spoon and fork, then many will opt for fork as feminine, in relationship to spoon. If fork is feminine in relation to knife yet masculine in relation to spoon, clearly there is nothing inherently masculine or feminine, even at an abstract or nonliteral level in the words themselves. Saussure has long established that signs are defined not by their essence but by their difference, a point taken up by the continental theorists to good effect. In looking at binary oppositions we are in fact looking at hidden hierarchies; in every case one side of the binary is privileged over the other.

**INSTRUCTIONAL DESIGN AND THE MATERIALITY OF LANGUAGE**

Kristeva identifies two stages in the relation between the speaking subject and language, the first, early stage of myth and legend, when language was used but not analysed, and the current assertion that language can be grasped as an object of knowledge in itself through the study of linguistics which enables us to understand not only the laws of language’s own functioning but also all that concerns the social realm; how language works in social discourse. This latter conception of language as the ‘key’ not only to humankind but also to social history marks Kristeva’s second epistemological stage: Linguistics teaches not only about languages but also about the vast realm of human actions that make up social practice.

Considering man as language and putting language in the place of man constitutes the demystifying gesture par excellence. It introduces science into the complex and imprecise zone of human activities where ideologies and religions are (usually) established. Linguistics turns out to be the lever of this demystification; it posits language as an object of science, and teaches us the laws of its functioning. (Kristeva, 1989, 4).

According to Kristeva when we say language we say at the same time demarcation, signification and communication and in this sense all human practices are a kind of language, or encoded meaning system, including the practices of instructional design and distance education. Some models of instructional design have fallen headlong into the trap of affirming that language is merely the instrument of thought. From this it follows that by clarifying the language of a learning package (take the push for Plain English as an example) the true meaning is somehow expressed more efficiently and effectively, much as one might squeeze the juice from a grape, to use Simone de Beauvoir’s metaphor. In fact it might illustrate the point I am trying to make of the error in some instructional design thinking to quote directly from de Beauvoir as she writes about her childhood experiences with language:

> As I had failed in my efforts to think without language...I assumed that this was an exact equivalent of reality; I was encouraged in this misconception by the grown-ups, whom I took to be the sole depositories of absolute truth: when they defined a thing, they expressed its substance in the sense in which one expresses the juice from a fruit. So that I could conceive of no gap into which error might fall between the word and its object; that is why I submitted uncritically to the Word, without examining its meaning, even when circumstances inclined me to doubt its truth. (Simone de Beauvoir, 1963,17).

These two errors, first that language is independent of thought, and second and opposing, that language expresses reality perfectly, leaving no room for arguments about meaning are both equally naive. de Beauvoir subsequently learnt that language is both more and less flexible than these theories imply: its meaning can be guaranteed neither by reference to the speaking subject’s own private experience, like the search for authenticity outlined by Minh-ha in my introduction, nor by invoking some fixed, authoritative reality or essence outside the discourse. When words fail us, as they so often do, we have only other words to fall back on to clarify our position as speaking subjects, in short the representation of experience through language is partial in every sense of that term (Cameron, 1992, 190).

If meaning is complex, plural and ultimately open-ended we cannot simply assume that our meaning, the meaning we intend to convey is the one that is ultimately received. Communication is by definition not individual but social. The social norms which regulate and control public behaviour form the context for the linguistic or
communicative act and it is the normative social practices regulating what will be accepted as good writing for distance education that allow for the possibility for elite power and control over language in that discourse. This normative vision of the signifying operation cannot study the multiplicity of signifying practices without relegating some of them to a pathology to be suppressed. Edward Sapir, the linguist, has noted that it would be inaccurate to confuse language with conceptual thought, as now sometimes happens in models of instructional design. Language, he claims, is above all an ‘extra-rational’ function, falling outside the subject’s reason through its materiality and the practices of difference and system that it is subject to. Some ways of talking or writing can acquire prestige while others are disparaged; some definitions of the world are favoured over others, some ideas are met with blank incomprehension or made to look ridiculous, while others can be made to look ‘natural’ ‘commonsense’ and ‘true’. (Cameron, 1992, p196).

While language, then, is a practice realised in social communication and by means of it, it constitutes a material reality that while at the same time being part of the material world (ontology) acts as our link with what is not language, that is with the outside be it nature, society or even the distance education student that exists without language even if it cannot be named without it. This (often female) student, isolated, often not communicating in real time, is the ideal candidate for experiences of alienation and lack of communication and it is our challenging task to surmount these barriers with the best possible communicative materials for study.

THE MATERIALITY OF LANGUAGE

If we refuse to allow ourselves to think of language as an ideal system, closed in upon itself (as the formalists would have it) with an existence somehow outside ourselves and our societies (the liberal idealist view) and if we also refuse to allow ourselves to think of language as a mere copy (mimesis) of a regulated world that somehow exists without it (the realistic attitude) then we are in a position to speak of a ‘materiality’ of language. Words have not simply fallen from the sky, sprinkled down by God, nor have they merely evolved in direct imitation of the object they set out to signify. The relationship of language to the material is both basic and yet still strongly contested in the teachings of the liberal idealists since it raises questions of power and authority that are often better avoided in the interests of growth and stability in the status quo.

Palmer’s article Instructional Design and course teams: a twisted narrative selects some of the totalising fictions that can be currently identified in the discourse of instructional design teams. Totalising fictions, that is, complete stories with beginnings, middles and ends, with no loose ends to the plot, function by ironing out and ignoring or denying awkward discontinuities and differences. Cracks that become too large to be ignored or papered over can, if left unanswered become yawning chasms between team members (most instructional designers operate in teams of some kind). Far from ‘going away if we ignore it’ these differences can grow to unmanageable proportions if they are located in our understandings of language and cognition and not aired.

QUESTIONS OF POWER

The educator Alison Lee notes that post-structuralism offers a theorisation of power while at the same time avoiding the trap of a too-neat analysis of it, the notion that “the story is too pretty to be true” (Foucault, 1980, p209). It acknowledges uncertainty and a shifting or disappearing centre as strongly as the older education paradigms assert their methodological truths and certainties. The practice of discourse analysis, and the critical reading practice known as ‘deconstruction’ are central to a theoretically informed approach to distance education. When setting up a course to be offered in the distance mode we are interested participants in the selection of the course, not cool consumers selecting from the supermarket freezer. A fundamental principle is at stake here as what we collect data for at the same time determines what data we collect. If we collect in the belief that a different reality is possible we will focus on the marginal, changeable aspects of the data, all those facts that do not fit the dominant model. (Gebhardt, cited in Lather, 1988, p576). Feminist deconstructivist work in distance education is immediately, then at odds with the “too good to be true” narratives constructed by instructional design, a discourse that is inextricably entwined with the debate over the new technologies and their place in distance education in the future. From Foucault we learn that knowledge is best understood as forms of discourse and a system of interpretive analysis which privileges history and power in the production of the present. Narratives in distance education and instructional design can only be properly understood through a knowledge of their histories and the manifestations of institutional and governmental power that have shaped
them. Feminist deconstruction is most commonly found in a variety of disciplines, from literary theory to cultural studies and from art to architecture. The feminist and post-colonial project is a familiar one within these fields of academic discourse. These projects are less familiar in education and its offshoot instructional design, however, which still maintains a rational and ideal structure of knowledge to be possible, truth to exist as a single unity, universals and founding principles to rest unchallenged and dominant notions of rationality to be the norm. That this results in a predominantly white, male, ruling-class world view being imposed on all comers is seen as a reflection of reality unmediated by language; 'its simply the way things are.' The fact that in global terms it is evidently not the way things are at all is ignored or brushed aside as irrelevant or irrational.

Lee offers the following reasons for valuing a deconstructivist approach in educational research:
• Because it takes social complexity seriously and attempts to work with it rather than reduce and marginalise it; that is, it addresses practice;
• Because it refuses the opposition between the individual and the social and has ways of investigating the relation between them;
• Because it theorises power and allows an explicitly politically informed research practice.

Patti Lather puts it like this:

“I envisage an altogether different approach to doing empirical inquiry which advocates the creation of a more hesitant and partial scholarship capable of helping us to tell a better story in a world marked by the elusiveness with which it greets our efforts to know it.” (Lather, 1991, 15).

(my emphasis).

CONCLUSION

There is still a struggle being waged in Australia as to which direction distance education is to travel. Factors of distance, isolation and scarcity of resources have allowed an attitude of pioneer spirit and ‘going it alone’ often in competition with other institutions to infuse our practice, sometimes at cost to ourselves. Failure to enter into the current theoretical debates and to inform our instructional design practice not only with the latest technology but also with current theoretical developments in epistemology and linguistics, in education and learning could cost us dearly as the new technology can do no more than the operators can make it, and the operators are ourselves.

REFERENCES


Irigaray, Luce (1985) This sex which is not one, trans. by C.O Porter with C. Burke. Cornell University Press


Palmer, Patrick (1993). Instructional design and course teams: a twisted narrative. In Distance Education Futures, Selected papers from the 11th Biennial Forum of ASPESA. Ed. Ted Nunan.


